

Reviews

Baldassarri, Stefano U., and Daniela **Pagliara**, eds, and David **Marsh**, trans., *Giannozzo Manetti, Against the Jews and the Gentiles, Books I–IV* (The I Tatti Renaissance Library), Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 2017; hardback; pp. xix, 487; R.R.P. US\$29.95, £19.95, €21.00; ISBN 9780674974975.

Since its inception in 2001, the I Tatti Renaissance Library series has contributed to the recovery of the ‘lost’ library of the Italian Renaissance. ‘Lost library’ is how Christopher Celenza described the numerous Latin works that are still in manuscript form, waiting to be edited, translated, and published in modern editions. Through its aims, the I Tatti Renaissance Library acknowledges that there are also Greek, Hebrew, and Arabic texts awaiting philological recovery and intellectual discovery. Giannozzo Manetti (1396–1459) is one of a handful of notable cases of Italian humanists engaging with Greek, Latin, Hebrew, and Florentine vernacular in his versatile career as orator, translator, author, and secretary. In the last fifteen years, scholars such as Stefano Baldassarri, Francesco Bausi, Paul Botley, Annet den Haan, Brian Maxson, and Daniela Pagliara have shed much light on Manetti’s work and his ability to survey, syncretize, and rewrite ancient and medieval sources in elegant and eloquent neo-Latin.

This new edition and translation of *Adversos Iudaeos et Gentiles* (*Against the Jews and the Gentiles*)’ first four books builds on other editions of Manetti’s work published in the I Tatti series: *Biographical Writings* (2003) and *A Translator’s Defense* (2016). We must also mention, just off the press, *On Human Worth and Excellence* (2019). *Against the Jews and the Gentiles* reveals Manetti’s ability to translate, analyse, and explain religious texts: the New Testament, Psalter, and Christian poems by Juvencus (fourth century) and Sedulus (fifth century) among ancient classics such as Cicero. As Baldassarri has recently shown in a 2013 article, *Against the Jews and the Gentiles* was, at least for its first four books, an opportunity for Manetti to revisit his translations of the New Testament and Psalter (both dedicated to Pope Nicholas V) and explain more clearly relevant passages from the Gospels.

Although Manetti’s books I–IV reference and augment earlier works, David Marsh makes it clear in the introduction that there is a significant proportion of original material in Book I of Manetti’s encyclopaedic text. In Book I, Manetti the compiler and translator reviews several works on Jewish history and culture and avoids the common accusation that the Jews were responsible for the death of Jesus. In the words of Marsh, ‘Manetti preferred praise to blame’ (p. xiv). This is done by dividing the history of Jews into ‘before’ and ‘after Moses’. Before Moses, the ‘Hebrews [...] alone turned to the true and devout worship of almighty

God' (p. 49). After Moses, Hebrews became the Jews, named after Judah, and God 'scourged them for their wicked acts, until the sacrosanct seed of Mary came to mankind' (pp. 119–21).

This edition has been curated impeccably by Baldassarri, Marsh, and Pagliara. It represents an essential contribution to furthering our understanding of biblical humanism before Erasmus and before the Reformation. The English translation is a close rendering of Manetti's text. Infelicitously, Marsh describes his translation as 'faithful' to Manetti's prose (p. xvi). The strength of Marsh's translation might instead be better described in words that reflect almost thirty years of translation studies that have debunked faithful translation as a concept as well as practice: dynamically or directionally equivalent. Curiously, the 'faithfulness' concept remains a frequent presence in the I Tatti Renaissance Library series in spite of scholarship moving away from the notion. For such a valiant and worthy project, one aimed at recovering the lost library of Renaissance Italy, alignment with the greater complexity of translation would be a welcome turn: a complexity that quattrocento humanists understood very well.

ANDREA RIZZI, *The University of Melbourne*

Baumgarten, Elisheva, Ruth Mazo **Karras**, and Katelyn **Mesler**, eds, *Entangled Histories: Knowledge, Authority, and Jewish Culture in the Thirteenth Century* (Jewish Culture and Contexts), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016; cloth; pp. 368; 25 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$69.95, £60.00; ISBN 9780812248685.

This volume explores the long thirteenth century in terms of Jewish communities and the tension between their engagement and isolation in European and Near Eastern cultural contexts. Organized by the themes of intellectual exchange, religious and secular authority, and texts and translations, each chapter in this collection presents a case study that broadens the historian's perspective on the medieval period. Jewish cultural productions—and renderings of Jews in Christian and Muslim constructs—are evidence of real and imagined 'entanglements' between the separate religious communities.

The first section of the book includes chapters on different modes of European intellectual communication and religious practice, due to the convergence of Jewish, Christian, and Islamic influences in the Middle Ages. Mordechai Z. Cohen's analysis of Nahmanides's hermeneutics delineates the variety of philosophical approaches to 'scriptural multivalence' (p. 56) that influenced the art of interpretation in both Islamic and Christian Spain. The range of applications of Jewish religious texts available in the Parisian book trade is the focus of Judah Galinsky's chapter. From accessible study for the lay person to material for preachers' sermons, it is clear that French Jewish halakhic literature appealed to a much broader audience in Paris than it did in less cosmopolitan European Jewish communities. Also engaged with medieval French society was Rabbeinu Tam, whose correspondence with the Count of Champagne evidences the extent of the

integration of the Jewish intellectual elite in French court culture, according to the research of Avraham Reiner.

Further entanglements between Jews and Christians are explored in the second section of the book, under the broad theme of secular and religious authority. Piero Capelli's biography of Nicholas Donin, the instigator of the 1240 Paris trial of the Talmud, highlights the social and theological challenges posed by this thirteenth-century convert from Judaism. Donin's intimate knowledge of rabbinic Judaism, along with his fervent new commitment to Christianity, testifies to the close proximity of Jewish and Christian realms in medieval Europe. Rebecca Winer's chapter on Latin notaries also showcases this proximity, albeit in the very secular context of Jews utilizing Spanish notaries, rather than those of their own communities. Hebrew notations on these Christian records reveal the practical reasons for this custom: to legitimize official Jewish transactions in the unfamiliar lexis of Latin, rather than be subjected to the additional taxes and regulations that were placed upon such Hebrew professional services.

The final section on texts and translations offers insights into the multilingualism of medieval Jewish communities, and the ongoing affinity for Arabic language, philosophy, medicine, and science. The translation and distribution of Maimonidean and other texts from Arabic to Hebrew for broad consumption enabled dialogue between Jews of otherwise disparate backgrounds, as explored in the chapters by Yossef Schwartz and S. J. Pearce. Elisabeth Hollender lends scholarship to this same phenomenon by considering the transmission and shared use of an Andalusian-Hebrew poem by Judah ben Samuel ha-Levi in Sephardic and Ashkenazic communities.

Other chapters in this volume cover a very broad spectrum of case studies of thirteenth-century Jews in Europe and the Near East. The analysis by Kati Ihnat and Katelyn Mesler of wax figurines as part of medieval folk culture is fascinating, as the votives embodied Christian fears and fantasies of Jewish sorcery and host desecrations. Supernatural themes also emerge in Ephraim Kanarfogel's comparison of Sephardic and Ashkenazi perspectives on marriage and matchmaking, where Ashkenazi *shadkhanim* were often expected to draw on their valuable, and expensive, powers of divination in order to arrange the most impeccable matches. Luke Yarbrough's analysis of religious minorities in Egyptian madrasas and Uri Shachar's treatment of crusading rhetoric on spiritual pollution expand the scope of this book to include appreciated Near Eastern narratives. In sum, the contributors to *Entangled Histories* have each helped to expand the reader's understanding of the long thirteenth century in all of its religious and social complexities, enforcing the notion that the lives of medieval Jews, Christians, and Muslims were intertwined in ways that we have not yet considered.

REBECCA WARTELL, *Monash University & University of Colorado*

Beal, Jane, and Mark Bradshaw **Busbee**, *Approaches to Teaching the Middle English Pearl* (Approaches to Teaching World Literature), New York, The Modern Language Association of America, 2018; paperback; pp. 262; 5 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$24.00; ISBN 9781603292924.

Approaches to Teaching the Middle English Pearl is a multi-author volume seeking to aid teachers in their instruction of *Pearl*, especially at the undergraduate level. This book fills a much-needed role for educators by consolidating over a hundred years of scholarship and translation concerning *Pearl*. The book is comprised of two sections: ‘Materials’, which gives information and locations for sources, translations, and background material helpful for any educator in providing the necessary framework for the *Pearl*; and ‘Approaches’, which is further broken down into historical, literary and theoretical, comparative, and specific classroom contexts.

The ‘Materials’ section of the book is written by one of the editors, Jane Beal, and provides a great deal of information and resources in print and digital format. One of the most helpful sections provided in the book is an exhaustive list of facsimiles, dual-facing editions, and translations to aid instructors in determining the best text for their students. Beal does an excellent job of introducing each of the modern translations and discussing how they relate and engage in other *Pearl* texts. Additionally, there are lists of many other helpful sources one might want from dissertations to multimedia resources. Beal additionally provides summaries of dating the manuscript, authorship, sources and analogues, and *Pearl*’s place within Christian contemplative devotion. Though a smaller section of the book, it is replete with useful resources for building a syllabus.

Next, the ‘Approaches’ section provides a breadth of methods for instructors to consider in their approach to teaching *Pearl*. Perhaps because the belief is that instructors will look only at their desired approach there is a fair amount of overlap in some articles’ introductions. This section’s organization is superb, however, in facilitating quick access to an instructor’s preferred approach. For instructors looking to teach *Pearl* in a survey course, the comparative approaches chapter, especially, provides excellent ways to connect and consider *Pearl* through other texts. Whether instructors are looking to utilize a common interest in Tolkien to draw students in to the *Pearl* or use *Pearl* to begin instruction in Middle English, there are excellent chapters on how to effectively implement it in a classroom. John M. Bower’s chapter, ‘Teaching *Pearl* when teaching Tolkien’, was particularly helpful in discussing the inspiration for Lothlorien from *Pearl*. This was an interesting approach instead of the traditionally linked texts like *Beowulf* or *Völuspá*. Additionally, the ‘Specific Classroom Contexts’ division gives many unique methods for aiding students in approaching *Pearl*. Whether engaging in the difficulty of translating texts, performing *Pearl*, or addressing genre and gender, this section covers a broad scope.

This book contains nineteen articles, each containing a different approach to teaching the *Pearl*, bookended by an exhaustive resource list at the beginning

and study questions at the end. There are also five black and white plates—four with *Pearl* illuminations and one *incipit* folio. The weakest aspect of this book is the repetition of summary of the *Pearl*'s plot and some tonal differences between the articles, but there is an immense amount of content perfect for any instructor preparing to teach *Pearl*, these minor quibbles aside. While this book is designed for quick reference, there is a lot to be gained for anyone's understanding of *Pearl* and many different ways to continue making this text accessible to students who are new to it or to Middle English.

ROBERT CUTRER, *University of Sydney*

Blanton, Virginia, **Veronica O'Mara**, and **Patricia Stoop**, eds, *Nuns' Literacies in Medieval Europe: The Antwerp Dialogue* (Medieval Women: Texts and Contexts, 28), Turnhout, Brepols, 2017; cloth; pp. lxvi, 502; 21 b/w illustrations, 2 colour plates; R.R.P. €125; ISBN 9782503554112.

This collection of nineteen essays emerged from the Antwerp conference on Nuns' Literacies in Medieval Europe held in 2013. Preceded by collections of papers given at Hull in 2011 and Kansas in 2012, this final volume is the longest in a series of the same name constituting an ambitious attempt to showcase recent scholarly research on medieval nuns from right across Europe, including the British Isles, and extending from Catalonia up to Scandinavia and down to Hungary. The term 'nun' here includes religious under vows, tertiaries, and even secular canonesses, and the term 'medieval' is equally generous, extending from the eighth to the sixteenth and late seventeenth centuries.

The introduction follows the convention of providing summaries of the papers and also addresses retrospectively ten far-reaching questions about pan-European nuns and their literacies—their relationship to books, to Latin, and to the vernaculars. It eschews, however, any '*grand récit*' (p. lxiii), preferring the metaphor of a jigsaw puzzle, some of whose pieces are missing or currently hidden. This initial orientation is particularly useful, as not all readers will approach the individual papers (somewhat arbitrarily distributed among four sections entitled 'Rules and Learning', 'Literacy and Visualization', 'Translating and Rewriting', and 'Exchange and Networks') with equal curiosity or enthusiasm. But where else would the average Anglophone medievalist be able to read about Hungarian nuns and their role in developing vernacular literature (Viktória Hedvig Deák), or the reading of Catalan nuns (Blanca Gari), or the enviable life of the secular canonesses of Sainte-Waudru, who enjoyed all the advantages of convent life with none of the disadvantages (a private income, no vows, a residence requirement of only a few months of the year, and plenty of books) (Anne Jenny-Clark)?

Given the preponderance of medievalists who specialize in England, such potential readers should be aware that post-Conquest English nuns do not compare favourably with their continental sisters. They would make a poor showing indeed here were it not for the Syon Birgittines studied by Ann Hutchison, Mary Erler, and Veronica O'Mara. O'Mara writes on the Birgittine scribe she has now identified

as Mary Nevel (though can one really claim as ‘medieval’ a nun whose entire life took place in the sixteenth century?) but unfortunately ignores earlier work on London, Lambeth Palace Library, MS 3600, and some of the other English Birgittine material is getting a little dog-eared through repetition. Mary Erler’s paper, however, on the transmission of images between Flemish and English Birgittine houses, stands out for its elegant coherence. Cate Gunn’s contribution on the Anglo-Norman translation of Edmund of Abingdon’s *Speculum* addressed to ‘sisters’, extracts from which are found in Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, MS McClean 123, which belonged to an English nunnery, somewhat salvages the reputations of English nuns. But they pale into insignificance beside the nuns of Florence, some of whom ran a printing press and worked as compositors (Melissa Moreton), and the religious women of Germany and the Low Countries, who feature in at least half the papers.

In a book concerned in part with nuns’ Latin literacy, however, it is disturbing to find some rather strange Latin. A religious order called ‘*pauperibus monialibus reclusis*’ (p. 28) seems improbable, while there seems to be words missing from Latin quotations on p. 27 and 28, and throughout that chapter we find unsettling variations in the use of *forma/formae/formam vivendi*. Sometimes it is not clear whether the problem is the medieval nuns’ or the modern scholar’s: the Latin quotations on p. 137, footnotes 33 and 34, could be interesting evidence of a Catalan nun’s idiosyncratic use of that language, though no comment is made, while in Plate 1, repeated on pp. 152 and 159, we can see that ‘*sancta trinitatis*’ can be blamed on the Birgittine scribe Sister Christina Hansdotter Brask (she apparently also miswrote ‘*salutationes*’ as ‘*sabutaciones*’ in Figure 4, p. 155). But the captions ‘*Septem psalmi paenitentialis*’ (Figure 2, p. 151) and ‘*Horae Sancta Anna*’ (Figure 3, p. 153) look like modern errors. One hopes the other European languages have survived in better shape.

Nonetheless, we should still welcome this book that contains a huge amount of information, much of it new, at least to Anglophones, about an area too long neglected. Only a generation ago, there was little for English-speaking students and scholars to read on nuns. Now we have an *embarras de richesse*, and our access has been thoughtfully facilitated by separate indices of manuscripts and religious houses, as well as of texts and people. These will prove invaluable to those working in an area that still has much to give.

ALEXANDRA BARRATT, *University of Waikato*

Blud, Victoria, *The Unspeakable, Gender and Sexuality in Medieval Literature, 1000–1400* (Gender in the Middle Ages, 12), Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2017; hardback; pp. 222; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843844686.

The first thing I must specify in order to properly assess this book is that the punctuation of the title is crucial. This is not a book about gender and sexuality that has been titled ‘The Unspeakable’. Rather, it is a book that follows connections between distinct but interrelated conceptual domains: the study of that which

cannot be articulated meeting the domains of gender and sexuality studies. The ‘Unspeakable’, as Victoria Blud defines it, is not limited to the obscene—indeed, perhaps I am not her target audience, because in introducing the concept she writes as if the reader will be more likely to associate unspeakability with the ineffable divine than with the history of sexuality. Blud also draws on psychoanalytic theory for perspectives on speaking and unspeaking, naming and namelessness. A key common understanding shared by all the fields from which Blud draws is that things that cannot be spoken of tend to generate ‘an abundance of discourse’ (p. 1), and it is the unspeakable as productive matrix to which the analyses offered in this book attend.

The Unspeakable, Gender and Sexuality in Medieval Europe is presented in four chapters, each of which addresses and links major texts from disparate periods and/or languages, and offers readings of them in dialogue with both contemporary theory and philosophy. All offer novel perspectives through their intertextual readings, but the most striking are the first chapter’s juxtaposition of the Old English life of *Mary of Egypt* with the early Middle English anchoritic manual *Ancrene Wisse*, and the third chapter’s reading of *Bisclavret* against *Wulf and Eadwacer* to draw out shared resonances related to gender, exile, and the relationship between the outcast and the social order that casts him or her out. Only one chapter addresses texts from a single narrative tradition: Chapter 4, which is the only chapter to draw its two key texts from the same language, reads Chaucer’s and Gower’s respective treatments of the Philomela narrative in relation to their Latin and French sources. This chapter offers the book’s most straightforward argument, contending that in Gower’s version in particular, the creative, ‘multiple, mutable, inventive, inscriptive’ (p. 172) voice of Philomela—embroiderer and singing nightingale—displaces the monovocal authority of Tereus.

If the book’s first strength is its creation of fruitful intertextual readings between texts not often placed in conversation with each other, the second is its opening up of lines of communication between medieval literatures and continental philosophy and theory. Blud’s reading of Philomela, for instance, uses the feminist writings of Hélène Cixous, particularly her conceptions of *écriture féminine*, to frame Philomela’s glossectomy and her subsequent claiming of powerful forms of wordless speech. Chapter 3 approaches gender and exile in both *Bisclavret* and *Wulf and Eadwacer* through the figure of the wolf and the links in early medieval Germanic cultures between a wolf’s head and a condemned exile. Here Blud draws on both Giorgio Agamben’s studies on exile in *Homo Sacer* (Stanford University Press, 1998), engaging with *Bisclavret* as werewolf and outlaw, and on the work of Julia Kristeva, whose theoretical writing has been used by feminist Anglo-Saxonists to read the enigmatic text of *Wulf and Eadwacer*. Blud applies to *Bisclavret* a Kristevan reading in conversation with existing work on *Wulf and Eadwacer*, and to *Wulf and Eadwacer* a reading steeped in Agamben’s analyses of exile and outlawry. The end result is a striking intertextual argument for the links between womanhood and exile—the woman and the exile, and above

all the woman exile, are both placed outside of the dominant structures of power and yet subject to them, but are depended on by the system itself to cooperate with their exclusion.

Blud synthesizes her theoretical tools in straightforward prose, making clear her methodologies as she proceeds. *The Unspeakable, Gender and Sexuality* is thus accessible to medievalists with limited background in gender and sexuality studies, and should also provide a fruitful avenue for contemporary gender scholars to approach medieval texts. What does seem to be lacking is similar interface between the medieval literary domains of Blud's texts and the medieval historical and philosophical work on the ineffable and the apophatic to which she makes frequent reference. She states early on that the unspeakable 'queers' (p. 11) the apophatic and the divine, but this thread is not followed up in the book. It seems Blud anticipated an audience well-versed in these fields: she provides a thorough historiography of medieval gender and sexuality with which to frame her literary texts, but offers more limited context with which scholars of gender and sexuality might interpret her references to the unspeakable in the context of apophatic theology.

In her conclusion, Blud describes her work in this book as 'listening for the unspeakable' (p. 176), a seeking out of missing links. Her readings, having caught the echoes of the unspeakable, proceed to ask what the unspeakable *does*, both within individual texts and between them. As such, while the book provides few simple answers, it opens up a range of possibilities, connections, and methods for seeking elusive traces in medieval texts. It will be of use to scholars of gender and sexuality, and is likely generative for many others as well.

AMY BROWN, *Port Stephens, New South Wales*

Bouley, Bradford A., *Pious Postmortems: Anatomy, Sanctity and the Catholic Church in Early Modern Europe*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2017; hardback pp. 224; R.R.P. US\$55.00; ISBN 9780812249576.

During the canonization process for Teresa of Avila in 1583, local church officials in Alba exhumed her body and found upon opening the tomb that 'Teresa's body remained completely "incorrupt"' (p. 58), after nine months of interment. This seemingly miraculous preservation of Teresa's corpse was attested to by physician Ludovico Vasquez, who sought to find 'natural explanations' for her incorruption, even visiting her body during 'very hot days' to see if it would decay (p. 59). It did not, and Vasquez reported to church officials that Teresa's bodily preservation 'could only be a miracle' (p. 59). This fascinating case of incorruption is just one of many discussed in Bradford Bouley's *Pious Postmortems*, a study of the relationships between anatomy, medicine, the miraculous, and the Catholic Church in early modern Europe. Bouley investigates the specific place that anatomy had in the canonization processes established by the Catholic Church throughout the

early modern period, and demonstrates the increasing importance anatomical evidence had in the deeming of people as saintly.

Beginning with Chapter 1, Bouley summarizes the medieval and early modern canonization practices of the Catholic Church, as well as the state of medicine and anatomy at this time. Chapter 2 then goes on to demonstrate the increasing significance of anatomical evidence and medical authority in these processes. Bouley describes how irregular anatomies became key signs of saintliness (pp. 50–57), and convincingly argues that it was the cases of Filippo Neri and Teresa of Avila in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries that encouraged church officials to adopt anatomical proof in canonization investigations (pp. 57–69).

The subsequent chapter further explores the role of medicine in these processes, focusing on the practices of the *medici* in their examinations of incorrupt corpses, and detailing the empirical methods they employed to test the intactness of the bodies in question. Bouley then offers a summary of the importance of incorruption, which, while informative and useful, would have served the reader better in the introduction or earlier chapters (pp. 72–75). Regardless, the remainder of the chapter astutely demonstrates the tensions and pressures that medical examiners faced in their reporting on incorrupt bodies: pressure from local church officials who wanted an outcome one way or another; local politicians or royalty with vast money spent on patronage of the canonization process; mobs of worshippers intent on the saintliness of the body being declared; or the physician's own moral dilemmas about declaring a miracle where a body showed signs of decay (pp. 75–88).

Chapter 4 analyses the place of asceticism in early modern canonization processes, and while this is an interesting discussion, it lacks the coherent argumentation of earlier chapters, and at times feels repetitive, a reiteration of the points made and demonstrated through the evidence in previous chapters. However, the final chapter is an exciting and original exploration of the gendered aspects of the canonization process, and anatomical examinations by medical authorities. Bouley persuasively contends that the post-mortems of potentially saintly female bodies functioned to reify gender hierarchies of the Church: 'the posthumous medical examination reasserted a woman's feminine and sexual natures, thus drawing a clear line between male and female saints' (p. 111). This sexualisation of female corpses is fascinating, and the discussion regarding the sexual gaze of the medical examiners could have been elaborated further (pp. 122–26). And while Bouley's exploration of the gender dynamics of the canonization process is insightful, the discussion of gender fluidity, or gender switching, is overdrawn and not convincing. Much has been written about the texts that Bouley draws on—the work on marvels by Michel de Montaigne and Ambroise Paré (p. 120–21)—yet Bouley does not engage with this literature: see for example Stephen Greenblatt, *Shakespearean Negotiations* (California University Press, 1988) and Karin Sellberg, 'Queer (Mis)Representations of Early Modern Sexual Monsters', in *Sex, Knowledge, and Receptions of the Past*, edited by Kate Fisher and Rebecca

Langlands (Oxford University Press, 2015). Bouley's uncritical use of these texts as evidence to support the claim that holy women transformed into the masculine gender is problematic, particularly because such literature has demonstrated that Montaigne's and Paré's descriptions cannot be taken as representative views of early modern gender.

Notwithstanding, this book is a fascinating and well-researched study, and a great addition to the historiography on early modern anatomy and the Catholic Church. It is particularly interesting for historians of medicine, as a timely addition to recent studies about the imbrication of early modern religion and science, and medico-legal-theological practices.

PAIGE DONAGHY, *University of Queensland*

Cambridge, Eric, and Jane **Hawkes**, eds, *Crossing Boundaries: Interdisciplinary Approaches to the Art, Material Culture, Language and Literature of the Early Medieval World*, Oxford and Philadelphia, Oxbow Books, 2017; hardback; pp. 320; 131 colour and b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9781785703072.

It is timely to review a book with this title when the 2019 ANZAMEMS Conference theme was 'Categories, Boundaries, Horizons', giving rise to a number of sessions or papers that incorporated the thematic phrase 'crossing boundaries'. The book is a collection of essays in honour of Professor Richard Bailey on the occasion of his eightieth birthday, and he is pictured in the frontispiece displaying his OBE on the occasion of its award. There is no need for customary caveats about *Festschriften* so far as this book is concerned. It presents twenty-seven essays of extremely high standard by scholars emerging, established, and in several cases retired, as we might expect of Richard Bailey's contemporaries. Sadly, one of those contributors, Ian Doyle, died in 2018.

The first section of the book presents six essays under the heading 'New Perspectives on Insular Sculpture and Art'. Claire Stancliffe reconsiders the audience, intention, and originator of the Ruthwell Cross. Rosemary Cramp discusses a number of hitherto unpublished cross heads with prominent bosses, suggesting that they are part of an eighth- to ninth-century style whose initial impetus came from Lindisfarne. Elizabeth Coatsworth discusses depictions of martyrdom in Anglo-Saxon art and literature, and Nancy Edwards crucifixion iconography in the early medieval sculpture of Wales.

Part 2 is on objects and meanings. Here we find reports on objects newly found by metal detectorists, and re-examinations of more familiar ones. Leslie Webster discusses a Mercian sword-pommel from the Beckley area, Oxfordshire; James Graham-Campbell a Scandinavian gold lozenge brooch from near Attelborough in Norfolk, and John Hines a Scandinavian rune-inscribed lead spindle-whorl from Saltfleetby in Lincolnshire, whose inscription incorporates reference to the heathen gods Óðinn and Heimdallr, together with another identity 'Palfir'. Éamonn Ó Carragáin argues that the biblical and liturgical phrase *in medio*

duorum animalium cognosceris provides an interpretive key to the Santa Sabina crucifixion panel. Catherine Karkov discusses the unusual depiction of the Trinity at the beginning of the Harley Psalter, relating to spiritual themes relevant to the Canterbury community. Jane Hawkes examines the Cuthbert coffin, showing how Cuthbert's body itself is at the centre of the salvific program of iconography that encloses him on all sides. Helen Gittos examines the lead plaques from Bury St Edmunds as evidence for local liturgical practice.

Part 3, 'Settlements, Sites and Structures', includes papers by Caroline Patterson on the Viking burials of Cumwhitton and Carlisle; Paul Everson and David Stocker on the early sculpture from St John's, Chester; Lorna Watts on Whitby; Christopher Morris on inscribed stones from Orkney; David Parsons on a lost apsidal building at Brixworth, and Eric Cambridge on the design of Durham Cathedral. Deirdre O'Sullivan investigates modern concepts of a 'Viking World' and the realities of such a world as can be discerned from the evidence of Scandinavian settlement in Cumbria.

Part 4, 'Constructing Meanings', turns from Anglo-Saxon material culture to texts and linguistic matters. Colm O'Brien examines Bede's rhetorical and thematic strategies in constructing his account of Edwin's dream in the *Historia ecclesiastica*; Gale Owen-Crocker examines the *Beowulf*-poet's allusive technique for informing the audience of the visual appearance of the interiors of Hrothgar's halls. Ian Doyle edits and discusses a particularly interesting version of a miracle of St Hilda found in Durham University Library Cosin MS V.iv.9. Lindsay Allason-Jones and David Heslop examine the boundary clauses of an early twelfth-century charter of Bishop Ranulph Flambard of Durham, which were cited in legal dispute some six centuries later. John Frankis provides an overview of Anglo-Saxon manuscripts containing texts or parts of texts involving other vernaculars. Hermann Moisl reconsiders the puzzle of the Merovingian king referred to as Flodubuir in the Irish *Annals of Ulster*, and proposes a new identification, namely Clovis II. Finally, Diana Whaley takes the reader on a toponymic field-walk in a small area of Northumberland around Embleton, Dunstanburgh and Craster, revealing the rich variety of minor names yet to be documented fully in forthcoming volumes of the English Place-Name Society.

The book is rounded off with a detailed bibliography of Richard Bailey's publications. Throughout it is richly illustrated with figures and plates, including many in colour. Each section is provided with a critical introduction by the editors, and a good index is provided. The editing has been carried out to a very high standard, as is fitting for a collection of excellent essays that make such a significant contribution to Anglo-Saxon studies.

GREG WAITE, *University of Otago*

Carroll, Shiloh, *Medievalism in A Song of Ice & Fire & Game of Thrones* (Medievalism, 12), Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2018; hardback; pp. vi, 205; R.R.P. \$39.95, £30.00; ISBN 9781843844846.

Shiloh Carroll's book *Medievalism in A Song of Ice & Fire & Game of Thrones* explores George R. R. Martin's high fantasy series *A Song of Ice and Fire*, and to a lesser extent its HBO television adaptation, *Game of Thrones*, examining both Martin's and HBO's approaches to the Middle Ages. Carroll's introduction establishes Martin as a neo-medievalist author who, like J. R. R. Tolkien before him, creates 'a version of the Middle Ages' (p. 6). Unlike Tolkien, however, Martin rejects 'the utopian, atavistic view of the Middle Ages' (p. 7), and instead strives to represent an 'authentic' medieval world in his work. Essentially, Carroll argues that Martin's central conceit is a 'purposeful avoidance of the tropes of medieval romance, medievalist romance, and fantasy literature' (p. 21). However, his construction of Westeros is 'inspired by history, not bound to it' (p. 19) and, subsequently, reveals more about his own beliefs 'about the historical Middle Ages and the human condition than it does about the Middle Ages themselves' (p. 20).

In Chapter 1, Carroll explores the relationship of Martin's works to medieval romances, noting *A Song of Ice and Fire* follows a similar structure of interlacing plots, primacy of the nobility's viewpoint, anxiety about identity, and inclusion of the figure of a fair unknown. At the same time as replicating themes, structures, and motifs from medieval literature, Carroll argues that part of Martin's mission is to subvert the tropes of fantasy—many of which have been borrowed 'from Victorian understanding of medieval chivalric romance' (p. 37).

In Chapter 2's examination of Martin's treatment of gender, Carroll considers Westeros's culture of toxic masculinity. Undercutting the tropes of medieval romance that inspired Martin's medievalist world, in Westeros chivalric ideals are not rewarded, but mask violence, aggression, and inherent misogyny. This toxic masculinity, Carroll argues, victimizes both those men who do not engage with or replicate this type of masculinity (Samwell Tarly, Bran Stark, and Tyrion Lannister are offered as examples) and women alike. In particular Martin's use of both the 'exceptional woman' (for example Brienne Tarth), and 'monstrous woman' (such as Cersei) tropes, which are deeply entrenched in the popular imagination, highlights his sometimes homogenous cultural view of the Middle Ages.

In Chapter 3 Carroll investigates Martin's approach to masculine, feminine, and queer sexualities, and argues that like in Malory's Arthurian tales, Martin uses transgressive sexualities to 'illustrate the problems in Westeros' (p. 86). Carroll analyses how sexual violence and the threat of violence is ever-present in Westeros, and argues that Martin's portrayal of rape in his novels has some parallels with medieval chivalric romance. Carroll critiques Martin's attempts to defend his use of sexual violence in his novels by his arguing for realism: the world of Westeros is one of his own making and thus its inclusion ultimately reflects the type of brutal medievalism he espouses more than any reality from the

Middle Ages. As such, Carroll views Martin's portrayals of sex and sexuality as largely a combination of the medievalist and the modern.

In Chapter 4, Carroll considers race and imperialism, particularly in relation to Daenerys Targaryen and the history of Westeros. While the centre of action in Martin's novels is clearly identifiable as 'Western—European and English' (p. 109), Carroll offers some analysis of Martin's depictions of worlds beyond Westeros. In an example of Martin's imperialist depiction of the Middle Ages, Carroll notes that there are no point-of-view characters from the novels' eastern cultures. Instead, Martin problematically engages in the 'white man's burden' trope, and positions one of the central protagonists Daenerys as an idealized white saviour who frees the slaves of Essos. Thus, Martin fails to allow these non-white cultures to speak (and act) for themselves.

Chapter 5 examines adaptation and fandom, and looks at changes made in the adaptation of the book series to screen in the HBO series *Game of Thrones* (and the choices behind them), and subsequent fan receptions. Carroll focuses on declarations by both Martin and *Game of Thrones*'s showrunners David Benioff and Daniel Brett Weiss about realism and authenticity. Carroll argues that their comments heavily contribute to foster the idea, among the fandom, that both novels and television series are somehow inspired by real and medieval events and themes, yet 'Westeros is a fantasy world and not beholden to any aspects of the historical Middle Ages' (p. 148). Carroll is highly critical of the television series's faux chivalry, its glorification of toxic masculinity, rape and casual (female) nudity, and problematic displays of disability and trauma. The result of attempts at focusing on authenticity and realism is that both the novels and the television series reinforce rather than interrogate stereotypical notions about the Middle Ages as 'dirty, violent, brutal, and sexually deviant' (p. 181), something Carroll sees as 'unfortunate' (p. 181).

Carroll's book is a useful addition to scholarship on the *Game of Thrones* phenomenon and how Martin's medievalism is conceived on the page and then adapted and popularized for twenty-first century audiences, and to medievalism and the fantasy genre more generally.

MARINA GERZIĆ, *The University of Western Australia*

Cruse, Mark, ed., *Performance and Theatricality in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance* (Arizona Studies in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance, 41) Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. xiii, 207; 23 b/w illustrations, 1 b/w table; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503579870.

The ten essays of this volume range in focus from the performative aspect of late medieval confession and penitence to early eighteenth-century polemical Russian drama intended to bolster the reform of the Russian Orthodox Church. This wide and eclectic range is loosely held together by the individual essays' collective dealing with the volume's overarching themes of drama's engagement with religion and faith, the performative aspects of individual and communal piety,

and the relationship between spectator and spectacle. This last is explored not only in relation to drama and theatrical performance but also takes into account medieval visual imagery, specifically manuscript illuminations, and what clues or insights these may offer into medieval performance. Lofton Durham, writing on the mid-fifteenth-century Paris, BnF, MS fr. 12601 illustrations of the *Istoire de la Destruction de Troie la Grant*, helpfully includes several images within the essay text, as does Catherine Schulz McFarland, writing on sixteenth-century Pieter Bruegel's *The Dirty Bride* and *The Masquerade of Valentine and Orson*. Claire Sponsler's examination of the late fifteenth-century *Beauchamp Pageant* does not, which is a pity; some visual evidence to support her argument would have been helpful.

The editor's introduction is rather short and less detailed than might be expected. It takes the form of brief summaries of the individual chapter topics rather than a coherent and sustained overview of the volume as a whole and how the essays relate to this and to each other. Mark Cruse limits himself to observing that the 'volume is intended as a contribution to the increasingly cross-cultural and globally orientated study of theatre and performance in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance' (p. ix) before rather blandly suggesting that 'underlying all of these essays is the understanding that performance seeks to shape reality' (p. ix).

The essays are arranged by the chronology of their subject matter, moving forwards from the thirteenth century. Marisa Galvez's discussion of 'performative modes of intersubjectivity' (p. 1) opens, focusing on 'the outward manifestation of contrition' (p. ix) and the corresponding 'spectacle of penitence' (p. ix) in *Le Chevalier au barisiel* and *Fornication imitée*. This is followed by Candace Hull Taylor's exploration of the Prudence figure's role as expositor in *Sawles Warde* and the *Tale of Melibee*. Both these works are non-dramatic, and the intended audiences of the two texts 'could not be more different' (p. 17), but Hull Taylor argues that 'Prudence's performativity in each reveals both the didactic and affective promise, as well as the allegorical limitations, of her depiction in medieval literature' (p. 17).

Jenna Soleo-Shanks offers an intriguing exploration of Siena's fifteenth-century Saint Catherine plays, persuasively suggesting that the play performance chronicled in a 1446 account and ostensibly depicting St Catherine of Alexandria was instead probably a 'thinly veiled memorial' (p. x) to Catherine Benicasa or St Catherine of Siena. As she was not canonized until 1461, Catherine of Siena could not at this time be publicly revered as a saint, but—Soleo-Shanks argues—this play allowed 'a celebration of shared civic identity and history' (p. 54) as well as the 'legitimiz[ation of] the city's political goals' (p. 36).

The two essays following this are Durham's and Sponsler's work on imagery, illustrations, and how these may (or may not) be useful in trying to determine 'certain kinds of performance configurations and practices' (p. 55), a question which Durham notes 'is neither new nor settled' (p. 55). Interrupted by Albrecht Classen's vigorous and rather entertaining study of gender relationships in German

Shrove plays and verse narratives, the discussion of imagery continues with the essay by Schultz McFarland. The two Bruegel prints discussed are both ‘depictions of broad farces performed at Carnival and other festivals’ (p. 135), so this essay links with Classen’s immediately preceding it. However, where Classen explores how ‘efforts to establish social control within the framework of marriage were [...] given a meaningful, though playful, image through theatrical performance’ (p. 133), Schultz McFarland examines how Bruegel’s work embodies his ‘pointed, but veiled, criticisms of the political and religious upheavals’ (p. 135) of the mid-sixteenth-century Spanish Netherlands.

The volume is concluded by essays on early modern drama in Bavaria, Spain, and Russia. William Bradford Smith investigates ‘the role of Jesuit theater in articulating and shaping the ambitions of Maximilian I’ (p. xii) and how such drama portrayed the discord between Catholics and Protestants. Ivy Howell Walter explores the musical interludes of *La discordia en los casados* and how these ‘highlight the central themes of the play, cite classical intertexts, foreshadow, create a sense of foreboding, and underscore the play’s didactic message’ (p. xiii). J. Eugene Clay’s essay on how the works of Dimitrii, the Metropolitan of Rostov, ‘pioneered new forms of [Russian] theater and of religious education’ (p. xiii) rounds out a volume of work that is solidly satisfying without being spectacularly innovative or challenging.

ELEANOR BLOOMFIELD, *University of Auckland*

Downes, Stephanie, Sally **Holloway**, and Sarah **Randles**, eds, *Feeling Things: Objects and Emotions through History* (Emotions in History), Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018; hardback; pp. 272; 31 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9780198802648.

Some things matter: families put them pride of place on the mantelpiece or stored in the attic, too valuable to dispose of but not quite of use in the everyday. Some of these items make it into art galleries, museums, and archives, particularly if they are considered to hold some sort of value. Why humans hold onto particular objects as heritage, and how they relate to the everyday objects that shape our lives, is a topic of increasing interest, not least for post-humanists, seeking to redraw where agency lies, and those in material studies, interested in how the physical world helps produce our experience. Emotions are part of this story, but where does emotion lie? In the human and their imaginative engagement with the material world, or in the object, ‘sticky with emotion’ as Sara Ahmed might say, travelling over time as part of an artefact’s meaning? *Feeling Things* is a timely contribution to this debate, bringing perspectives from the history of emotions to medieval and early modern objects.

An edited collection, this substantial volume combines an introduction and methodological survey with eleven chapters, and a reflective conclusion. The book is divided into three thematic sections: ‘Potent things’, which explores ‘sacred’ objects (those that pertain to the spiritual world or connect a user to the divine);

‘Binding things’, where objects come to hold the emotions of their producers/users; and ‘Moving things’, that seeks to explore how the emotions of objects are shaped through movement across space and time. The set of essays is beautifully curated, and each chapter reflects not only on a different type of object but often different theories for their interpretation, and impressively different human relations with them. The ‘binding things’ section, for example, explores touch, reading, and handling of books, the physicality of the writing process, including its tears and ink blots, artificial limbs as a remaking of the masculine body, and encapsulation of maternal love in made objects for foundlings. Emotion here is not just what is ‘felt’ abstractly (if feeling can ever be abstract) but the ways that feeling is manifested in and through physical engagements with the material world, and how that feeling then becomes part of what an object is and means. In a similar manner, each of the essays in the final section explores, if never quite resolves, the ways that moving across time—perhaps surviving as an object—brings the multiple emotional layers of an object to the present. In contrast, the potent objects of Section 1 are marked by an attentiveness to their materiality—to glittering surfaces, gold and gilt, carvings in relief, or soft fabrics. It is an approach almost antiquarian in its pursuit of detail, but one that requires the reader to think more seriously about why texture, tone, and materiality matter.

The theorization of emotion and objects in the book reflects larger thinking in the field, and a methodological essay offers an intelligent survey of current work, which is brought out in later essays. Thus we encounter object-orientated ontology—the ‘vitality of things’, thing theory, objects as agentic components of emotional communities, affect theory, embodiment, affective economies, affective fields, Jane Bennett, Sara Ahmed, Bruno Latour, and more. The popularity of theories of affect, rather than those of emotion, is suggestive of the need or desire to capture the emotions of objects with a recourse to substance but not to language. It is a decision—a necessity—that puts this collection at a contradistinction to a history of emotions that has tended to focus on words as a critical juncture in the production of meaning. But as a book largely written by historians (rather than, say, scholars of literary studies where affect has been so prominent), affect is grounded by an attention to materiality, in much the way as others’ works attend to words. As such, it is perhaps not a collection that offers a distinct new method for engaging with objects and emotions, but it raises intelligent questions about those that we do use, and, when read in full, constantly challenges the reader to consider yet another perspective on what thinking with materiality might do for the emotions scholar. It is interesting as a whole, but it is also a collection that has produced some essays of remarkable quality, a pleasure to read.

KATIE BARCLAY, *University of Adelaide*

Falkeid, Unn, and Aileen A. **Feng**, eds, *Rethinking Gaspara Stampa in the Canon of Renaissance Poetry* (Women and Gender in the Early Modern World), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 236; 7 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472427069.

Rethinking Gaspara Stampa in the Canon of Renaissance Poetry, edited by Unn Falkeid and Aileen A. Feng, establishes a broad foundation for the study of the poetry of Gaspara Stampa (1523?–1554). This meticulously edited volume invites reading from cover to cover. The collection centres on Stampa's only extant work, the *Rime* (1554), a lyric sequence published six months after her death. Essays from the disciplines of literature, gender and women's studies, philosophy, eco-criticism, and history reveal the connections between Stampa's writing and a wide range of early modern cultural and intellectual movements. These include Petrarchism, Neoplatonism, medieval and early modern concepts of the sublime, and Renaissance writing about women.

In the opening essay Jane Tylus identifies Stampa's intertextual allusions to the poems of, and writing about, Sappho. Newly rediscovered fragments of Sappho's work appeared in early modern texts printed after Stampa's death. However, Tylus traces the intellectual networks around Stampa to posit an earlier contemporary discourse and manuscript circulation of Sappho's poetry to account for Stampa's significant allusive references to Sappho. These references bear directly on Stampa's authorial positioning both in a genealogy of female authorship and within the Petrarchan tradition. They also represent one of the earliest poetic responses to the sublime that arose out of the rediscovery of the pseudo-Longinian treatise *On the Sublime*. In Stampa's innovative emphasis on embodied—rather than idealized or spiritual—love, Unn Falkeid establishes the parallel presence of an earlier tradition of the sublime. Falkeid demonstrates the continuity of Stampa's sublime realism with a medieval Neoplatonic tradition nurtured within the *dolce stil nuovo* of Dante's generation of poets, and Franciscan spirituality. Aileen Feng unravels the history of female *invidia* as a corrosive element in the representation of homosocial relations between women from the Middle Ages. Feng locates this trope in the *Rime* in references to an anonymous female rival, envious of both Stampa's beloved and her status as poet. By articulating her desire for the other woman's envy in her proem, and elsewhere in the collection, Stampa establishes a triangle of mimetic rivalry between herself, the anonymous women, and her beloved. Stampa's representation of female envy then functions within her *canzoniere* to enable, rather than discredit or undermine, Stampa's poetics, thereby recuperating the trope of female *invidia*.

Close readings of such themes as jealousy and the pains of love, in Stampa's *Rime* are complemented within the collection by broader studies of Stampa reception and poetics. Angela Capodivacca explores a literary forgery that stages a correspondence between Stampa and 'Mirtilla', a female correspondent addressed in a passionate epistolary poem in the *Rime* (poem 291). Capodivacca argues that the intertextual web of poems and letters woven after Stampa's death in the voices

of Gaspara and Mirtilla, which stretches into the nineteenth century, embodies the desire expressed within Stampa's poem for intimate communion and community through epistolary and poetic exchange. Ulrike Schneider considers sixteenth-century debates about the definition of the lyric genre and the status of the lyric 'I' in her study of Stampa's strategic use of personae. Stampa used several masks within the *Rime*—the poet-lover, Anasilla (a metonym for the lover-poet and Stampa's academic pastoral persona), and Stampa—that served to reference and blur the extratextual world of the female author and the intratextual world of the poetry. Encomia addressed to Stampa, and correspondence poems presented after the love poetry within the macrotext of the *Rime*, take as a theme the fictional status of the *canzoniere*. Through the textual structure, and by appearing in a variety of roles within and outside the love poetry, Schneider argues, Stampa plays with the ambiguous status of the lyric as neither purely fictional nor entirely pragmatic and referential.

The figure of Anasilla is analysed through the methodology of material eco-criticism by Troy Tower. Anasilla is a feminized form of the Latin name of the river Piave (Anaxus) that ran through the land of Collaltino di Collalto, identified as the beloved addressed in Stampa's *canzoniere*. Tower reveals the many aspects of place and poetry Stampa connotes through this name. Stampa's description of a second beloved towards the end of the lyric sequence, after she is abandoned by Collalto, is an important innovation in the Petrarchan *canzoniere* form. Veronica Andreani explores Stampa's self-representation as both a phoenix and a salamander to shape a lyric subject to challenge both the model of Petrarch and the fate of women in Ovid's *Heroides*. Stampa's innovation had been effaced by modern editors until a recent bilingual critical edition of the *Rime* respectfully rendered the ordering of the 1554 printed text (*The Complete Poems: The 1554 Edition of the Rime, a Bilingual Edition*, edited by Troy Tower and Jane Tylus, translated by Tylus, University of Chicago Press, 2010).

The value of this collection lies in the breadth of literary-critical approaches that connect Stampa's poetry to broader cultural movements, illuminating the importance of female-authored texts for students and scholars of early modern literature and cultural history.

JULIE ROBERTS, *The University of Melbourne*

Finan, Thomas, *Landscape and History on the Medieval Irish Frontier: The King's Cantreds in the Thirteenth Century* (Environmental Histories of the North Atlantic World, 1), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; pp. xv, 215; 11 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503542928.

Thomas Finan has written an engaging and interesting book using his expertise in the history and archaeology of one of the frontier areas of medieval Ireland. Over the past couple of decades, this and other archaeological projects have transformed our knowledge of medieval Gaelic Irish society. Finan's book is the first in a new Brepols series on medieval environmental histories and he puts forward

the case for the importance of landscape studies and attention to geography and archaeology as disciplines that offer important advances in our knowledge of medieval societies. He situates his study of the area broadly encompassed by the modern County Roscommon in the Irish midlands with introductory chapters on medieval Irish history and politics. This area was ruled by the O'Connor dynasty of Irish rulers in an often uneasy series of royal grants from the English crown, interspersed with Anglo-Norman settlements and military centres. Finan's chosen time period of the thirteenth century was when the Anglo-Normans pushed periodically into the west of Ireland, encountering resistance as well as some measure of success. While much of the material on the politics of the period will be familiar to scholars of medieval Ireland, Finan's introductory chapters do provide necessary context for his substantive analysis. The main section of the book starts with a chapter on the physical landscape and climate of the area, contextualized in relation to current theories on European and global climates. Finan here explores the documentary and environmental evidence for periods of poor weather in Ireland and Roscommon possibly caused by distant volcanic activity. He follows this with detailed chapters on the built environment, then the Anglo-Norman presence in Roscommon, and finishes with a chapter on the Gaelic Irish.

In Ireland archaeological excavations and research were to a large extent at the mercy of the needs of development during the boom years of the 1990s and early 2000s. Due to strict Irish antiquities laws, development and construction of roads require archaeological excavations. In the boom period there were many excavations in advance of the tide of building and infrastructure construction. Such rescue archaeology has slowed since the economic collapse in Ireland in 2008, and now there is a wealth of reports on the excavations conducted during the boom. A downside of this activity, though, is that it occurred in areas dictated not by the research questions and interests of archaeologists and historians but by development priorities alone. As Finan explains, this means that there has been a bias towards excavations in urban centres that are mostly built on the sites of Anglo-Norman settlements. Consequently there is much less archaeological evidence for Gaelic Irish domestic and political settlements. In particular he points out that the analysis of ringforts—the most frequently occurring domestic structures remaining from medieval Ireland—is so far limited by the paucity of archaeological excavations. Of the approximately 40,000 identified sites remaining in Ireland, only a couple of hundred have been excavated to date. This means that expert analysis of such basics as the dating of construction, continued use into the later medieval period, and even their function, has not been possible.

After explaining these and other difficulties with the available evidence, Finan then looks at settlement patterns using modelling of clusters of domestic structures such as reuse of earlier ringforts and construction of ecclesiastical buildings, through the use of a combination of documentary and physical evidence. He surveys and analyses the different Gaelic Irish and Anglo-Norman settlements

sites in Roscommon based on size and proximity to other strategic landmarks. Moated sites were associated with Gaelic Irish elite usage and ringworks and masonry castles with Anglo-Norman settlement. While some of the higher prestige buildings, such as the monasteries of Boyle and Lough Key, are well known and reasonably well documented, Finan points out the deficiencies in current knowledge of ecclesiastical and monastic landownership and use.

Roscommon was a frontier area, with Anglo-Norman settlement and building sometimes failing completely or not succeeding to the levels that had obviously been planned. Urban areas grew up around the Anglo-Norman military establishments at Roscommon, Athlone and Rindoon, although the latter was not successful. The chapter on Anglo-Norman settlement in Roscommon is nuanced and integrates documentary and physical evidence giving a complex and layered history of different political strategies, some of which failed. Bogs, roads, and waterways were crucial in determining success or otherwise of Anglo-Norman incursions into Roscommon during the thirteenth century. However, there was only tepid success in encouraging English settlers to undertake the risks of establishing themselves in the frontier areas, despite inducements. Outside the areas directly around the great castles, Gaelic Irish were able to resist the Anglo-Norman settlement push. Through a variety of political and military means, Gaelic Irish lords did maintain ‘some semblance of regional hegemony’ (p. 192).

Finan’s book is a useful addition to scholarship on the history and archaeology of medieval Ireland and of medieval frontier societies generally.

DIANNE HALL, *Victoria University*

Fugelso, Karl, ed., *Studies in Medievalism XXVII: Authenticity, Medievalism, Music*, Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2018; hardback; pp. 282; 9 colour, 17 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843845034.

Medievalism, as a field of study, is somewhat ill-theorized and highly contingent. Karl Fugelso’s preface to this volume highlights the ‘ambiguity [...] acute in medievalism’, its ‘erraticness’, ‘slipperiness’, ‘elusiveness’ and ‘malleability’ (p. xiii). Perhaps such uncertainty can offer space for productive energies that might enable the field to theorize itself? But to explore issues of authenticity when the field is itself so elusive is perhaps a little ambitious, especially when the apparent vehicle for this exploration is a collection of nominally related papers on diverse topics, covering modern literary and visual arts, religious and political appropriations, and adaptations of ‘medieval’ in popular culture. The agency of the medievalist is here paramount: Fugelso notes that each contributor creates ‘their own particular middle ages [and this reveals] much more about [...] the medievalists, much less about the Middle Ages’ (p. xiii). Thereby, discussion of authenticity devolves to the contributor and their idiosyncrasies.

Beyond Fugelso’s preface and David Matthews’s ‘Introduction’ (reflecting on the ‘Middle Ages in the Modern World’ conference convened in Manchester in mid-2017) there are ten chapters across three sections: ‘Medievalism and

Authenticity’, ‘Other Responses to Medievalism (and Authenticity)’, and ‘Early Music (and Authenticity) in Films and Video Games’. A topic specialist will find useful material here, but all are largely topic- rather than theory-focused. Perhaps this is a shortcoming, an artefact of the collected paper format, and a theorist may need to look elsewhere. Aside from Matthews, who (wryly?) observes that the field of medievalism studies ‘is becoming less interested in itself as a form of organised study with a set of disciplinary problems [...] instead characterised by scholars who simply get on with the work in their chosen field’ (p. 10), there is little here treating the field generally; Fugelso’s observed ambiguity (and the field’s contingency) is not addressed.

The first section is largely Lit Crit: three chapters on literature, two on visual media. Nickolas Haydock examines different notions of authenticity informing the reception of the nineteenth-century gothic novel and Clare A. Simmons historicizes inauthenticities in Keats’s medievalist poem ‘St Agnes’. Next, Carolyne Larrington parses medievalizing emotions in *Game of Thrones*, and Elan Justice Pavlinich explores medievalist race depictions in two Disney film productions. Timothy Curran concludes this section, looking at religious medievalism in Romantic poetry.

The second section casts the net widely. Daniel Wollenberg looks at long political shadows cast by medieval philosopher William Ockham, and Matthias D. Berger explores modern nationalist implications of medieval battle re-enactments. Then follow three well-wrought contributions on visual arts: Lotte Reinbold considers pre-Raphaelite refractions of *Kingis Quair*, Aida Audeh finds resonances of Petrarch and Dante in the art of Van Gogh, and Tessel M. Bauduin traces the medievalism of Surrealists.

The final section, dealing with music in medieval-themed cinema and video games, is its own piece of work: it even has its own introduction. Here, Karen M. Cook looks at authenticities of chant-based sound medievalizing video games, Adam Whittaker tracks the auditory texture of cinematic depictions of plague, and Alexander Kolassa explores medievalizing soundscapes in the Russian film *Hard to Be a God*.

Most of the analyses in this volume take the form of a statement of principle or position, followed by discussion or close reading of passages, products, attributes, characteristics or characterizations. It is a tried and true method, the bread and butter of (particularly North American) academe, and a useful approach to understanding influences, motivations, and contexts associated with a given work, genre, or movement. It is all productive, but it is hard to avoid the feeling that we need more, and better. Simplistic constructs, untended generalizations, and acritical monoliths surface at numerous places in this volume and these are revealing: ‘the Middle Ages’, ‘the medieval period’, ‘the medieval world’, ‘traditional Christianity’, ‘the rupture between the medieval and the modern’. These go forth unexamined and ill-defined, an un-nuanced vocabulary of populist historians, not academia. As practitioners in medieval studies, we all feel ‘the

restlessness of the contemporary [...] which needs to be contested' (p. 10), but we must realize that grappling with our restlessness depends on our own contemporary self-awareness being contested. Alas, without theory, self-awareness is illusory. This is not so much a criticism of this particular publication, but a reflection on the divergent state of scholarship in medievalism, perhaps the pressure to publish early and often, and possibly because some modernists are not sufficiently expert on the detail of medieval specifics, and thereby tend to speak more in such simplifications.

Many important and incisive observations are made in this volume, and there is much to stimulate and focus the mind of the scholar on reflexes of 'medieval' in the modern, but these chapters will be most effective if read within a grounded context of nuanced medieval studies, whence generalizing assumptions might be critiqued and challenged.

RODERICK McDONALD, *Sheffield, United Kingdom*

Hardman, Phillipa, and **Marianne Ailes**, *The Legend of Charlemagne in Medieval England: The Matter of France in Middle English and Anglo-Norman Literature* (Bristol Studies in Medieval Cultures), Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2017; hardback; pp. 489; 5 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843844723.

Over recent years an increasing awareness of multilingualism in medieval England has been informing linguistic, literary, and cultural scholarship. This book, exploring the intersection of Anglo-Norman and Middle English literary production across religious, geographic, and socio-political contexts, is a solid piece of work sharing in this discourse. The volume focuses on translations and adaptations of various Charlemagne narratives in France and England from the twelfth to the sixteenth centuries. It embraces both close textual readings and material philology, and it does this within a frame of commonalities and cultural ties between England and France, rather than dwelling on anachronistic or unhistorical divergences between the two.

The linguistic context of medieval England, and its implications for literary and philological analyses, are established at the outset. Latin, French (both continental and Anglo-Norman), and Middle English were spoken and written in England well into the late medieval period, and the authors argue that the presence and use of these languages influenced the character and purpose of translation and adaptation. The introductory chapter explores in detail such implications, including the acceptance that French in England was not a marker of foreignness, any more than Middle English can be taken as a marker of a (burgeoning) national identity. Indeed, the perspective that this volume takes on these texts and traditions explicitly addresses issues of identity, and the authors argue that any notion of Middle English literature as marker of identity is anachronistic and wrong. In fact, the opposite case is made, that a medieval English interest in translated French material is better understood as an appropriation of the French tradition, arising

from and endorsing the idea that the English, in embracing Carolingian narrative into their cultural story-worlds and imaginings, were constructing themselves as insular French, rather than differentiating their Englishness.

The book is bipartite in structure. Chapters 1 to 3 discuss the ways in which the Charlemagne tradition became acculturated, translated, and appropriated in England, while chapters 4 to 6 are each concerned with three discrete narratives: Roland and the battle of Roncevaux, *Fierabras*, and *Otinel*.

In addition to reviewing much prior (and often dismissive) scholarship on the relationship between French *chansons de geste* and English material, the first chapter, 'The Insular Literary Context', also traces the circulation of, and local developments in, French-language material in England. It then maps formal poetic aspects of the developing English tradition, considering critical issues relating to genre and providing a detailed analysis of verse forms and structure in English metrical romances. The chapter concludes with strong arguments in favour of understanding the English material as formally coherent, intertextual, and comprising a consistent selection and translation program.

Chapters 2 and 3 then explore, respectively, the translation of the Charlemagne tradition from continental French into Anglo-Norman, and the appropriation of the tradition into Middle English. The Anglo-Norman works show particular interest in three primary themes: crusades and the alterity of Saracens, the role and importance of holy relics, and the status and importance of kingship and monarchy. These themes carry over into the Middle English adaptations, but with interesting and important changes in emphasis or focus, relevant to the insular context.

In the second part the authors provide detailed descriptions and analyses of all manuscript versions of the relevant narratives. These studies include comparisons with continental versions, variance within the insular material, and examination of the social and political conditions of production. The three narratives being examined (*Roland*, *Fierabras*, *Otinel*) are each afforded their own chapter, and a very useful appendix is included that lists insular Charlemagne texts and manuscripts.

The English and Anglo-Norman Charlemagne texts are shown to be embedded in multi-layered and motivated translation and adaptation practices, and this book reveals an orientation theorizing these works in terms of medieval historiography and *translatio studii et imperii*. The authors note that recent translation theory tends to tread carefully around cultural appropriation, but for these medieval textualities the authors here emphasize the fact that adaptation is 'a major impulse in medieval literary creation' (p. 16), where appropriation is an important path for reconfiguration and recontextualization. So, noting such an approach informing the Middle English Charlemagne texts, the authors take the stance that the appropriation of Carolingian narrative is indeed a legitimate and important mechanism implicated in the heritage of both insular and Angevin people, whether English- or French-speaking, or both.

This is the third in the University of Bristol's 'Charlemagne: A European Icon' series, following *Charlemagne and his Legend in Early Spanish Literature*

and Historiography, and *The Charlemagne Legend in Medieval Latin Texts*, both published in 2016. Further volumes are in preparation, including *Charlemagne in Medieval Francophonia*, and *Charlemagne in the Celtic and Scandinavian Worlds*, and these are eagerly awaited, an important series for scholars of Carolingian narrative in Europe.

RODERICK McDONALD, *Sheffield, United Kingdom*

Heslop, Kate, and Jürg Glauser, eds, *RE:writing: Medial Perspectives on Textual Culture in the Icelandic Middle Ages* (Medienwandel—Medienwechsel—Medienwissen, 29), Zurich, Chronos, 2018; paperback; pp. 328; R.R.P. CHF48.00, €48.00; ISBN 9783034010290.

Mediality is a theoretical orientation for textual and manuscript scholarship that resists the simplistic, outmoded constraints of the orality/literacy binary, instead negotiating contextualities and embracing variability, dynamics, and performativity in medieval texts without privileging or fetishizing any particular mode, such as the manuscript. This ‘turn’ treats text, textuality, the text bearer, and transmission processes as essentially medial: texts are go-betweens, they mediate power and authority, they enjoy a social existence, they are meaning-producing, relational, and contingent. ‘The medium is [...] always engaged in a process and, as it is human culture that is of interest here, this process concerns *meaning*, its transfer, materialisation, transport, translation, [and] expression’ (p. 20).

This book speaks theory from the outset, and the introduction, authored by Kate Heslop and Jürg Glauser, sets the frame. To talk of texts changing in the course of transmission is to talk of mediality. Where once scholars sought an urtext, or favoured a genealogy of textualities, we now have transmission studies embracing later textual expressions alongside the earlier, and valuing variance over fixity. This book certainly accepts the baton from the likes of Paul Zumthor and Bernard Cerquiglini. Here, mediality plays out across a range of ‘discussions’, many of which will be familiar to medievalists: the relation of oral to literary, the textualization of traditional narrative, memorial text as both literary and performative, the active processes of scribal culture, multi-modality in manuscript scholarship, text promulgation and book production, and hagiography in the context of the political culture of the northern church.

The first section in this volume discusses the role of mediums—the go-betweens, those who mediate—in Norse narrative, and there are but two papers in this section. Kate Heslop opens with a well-wrought examination of the multi-valenced and over-determined ‘medial signature’ (p. 45) of Mímir in Norse myth, while Judy Quinn follows with a close reading of Jóriðr’s prophetic dreams in *Sturlunga saga*, identifying intertextualities and topoi that mediate between the Christian/pagan dichotomy.

The second section, ‘Media’, contains six contributions, all of which focus on aspects of the materiality of Norse texts: the circumstances of their production, use, and performance, and the ways in which these texts are aware of and

negotiate their own performative conditions. Else Mundal's contribution returns to *Sturlunga saga* for examining the ways in which saga performance is reflected in narrative, exploring the influence of written narrative on oral performance. Karl G. Johansson follows with a detailed literary archeological examination of *Hauksbók*, against a schema that treats manuscript culture as accretive, in which compilations, collections, and composite manuscripts are a function of both the culture of production and the culture of subsequent collection, compilation, and the archive. Kevin Müller also looks at *Sturlunga saga* in his philological treatment of the varied lexis of reading and writing, drawing useful conclusions about the type of activities in medieval Iceland that contributed to the literary and the narrative arts. Next, Lena Rohrbach looks at changes in written form—laws, charters, deeds, holy texts, epistles—from the thirteenth century, steering her analysis towards concepts of 'pragmatic literacy' in medieval Iceland. Then follows discussion of shifting markets for narrative literature in Iceland, in which Svanhildur Óskarsdóttir examines social conditions influencing literary production, and the evolution of late medieval literary tastes towards exemplary material, when the secular/ecclesiastical boundary becomes blurred. The second section concludes with Guðvarður Már Gunnlaugsson's thorough codicological analysis of *Flateyjarbók*, wherein he attempts to understand the time and resource commitment for producing such a magnificent manuscript.

The third section is 'Mediality': the various processes by which manuscript, text, and narrative contribute to the generation of meaning. In the first three chapters, Margaret Clunies Ross, Jonas Wellendorf, and Russell Poole focus on the mediality of translation, the first two addressing the *Fourth Grammatical Treatise* in its varied learned and cultural/reception contexts, while Poole explores the contextual construction of meaning in *Merlínúspá* as a function of translation, where the Latin original is mediated into a Norse tradition. Finally, the volume concludes with two chapters that deal with Íslendingasögur: Gísli Sigurðsson examines intersections between oral and literary culture in the performance of *Njáls saga*, and Ellen E. Peters discusses generic challenges associated with *Víglundar saga*.

In all, this collection is eclectic, set within an ambitious theoretical frame that is still evolving and perhaps not yet universally accepted or understood. Indeed, there are contributions in this collection that do not clearly align with medial theory, which itself has to negotiate its unclear differentiation from other theoretical approaches, such as New Philology. Nevertheless, the ambition is laudable, the overall quality of the volume and individual contributions is high, and the concepts are challenging. It is now up to us if this volume is to mark an important step in the evolution of how we understand and negotiate medieval text and context.

RODERICK McDONALD, *Sheffield, United Kingdom*

Hostetter, Aaron, *Political Appetites: Food in Medieval English Romance* (Interventions: New Studies in Medieval Culture), Columbus, Ohio State University Press, 2017; cloth; pp. 222; R.R.P. US \$79.95; ISBN 9780814213513.

Political Appetites opens with a thought-provoking appraisal of the entanglement of human food production with politics, culture, and the environment over the long historical *durée*. Aaron Hofstetter artfully descends from this discerning overview and closes in on the politics of eating as the point of entry for this study, declaring that ‘food choice is always a political act’ (p. 7), the political being ‘any action made by humans that influences other humans’ (p. 7). Literature affords opportunities for critiquing social order, and the extraordinary diversity of the romances produced in medieval England provides a genre par excellence for such ideological exploration. Bringing the political potential of food choice and literary production together, Hofstetter examines ‘the ways in which scenes of cooking and consumption dramatize political and economic tensions in aristocratic culture, anxieties that expose the ideological roots of these elaborate literary productions’ (p. 14).

Power is framed as a form of appetite, so that literary eating becomes redolent with critical potential, as in the case of *Richard Cœur de Lion*’s anthropophagy, where ‘the imperialist Western European ambitions of the Crusades are evinced by the king’s anthropophagic desires, his craving for political power glutted directly by human carnage’ (p. 25). By contrast, the cannibalism of the Mermedonians in the Old English *Andreas* (‘a hagiographic romance’, p. 34) leaves them marooned within temporal and spiritual contradictions; ‘gluttony for power stands in the way of cultural togetherness’ (p. 65). In the *Roman de Silence*, cooking’s mediation between nature and nurture is queered. Nature bakes humans rather than forging them, shifting the power of creation from generation to gestation, producing ‘bodies of humans [that] are merely stamped in the bakeshop with so-called “natural” gender distinctions’ (p. 82). Such binaries are ‘surface distinctions, vulnerable to Nouriture’s manipulation’ (p. 82). The cooking of the cross-dressing *Silence* returns diners to their natural states, revealing human essences through combining substances, and Merlin’s results in the emetic disclosure of formerly concealed truths. The meals that nurture the hero of *Havelok the Dane* during his ascendance to sovereignty attest to his fundamental role in producing a cohesive society. The harmonious relationship between ruler and subjects is signalled by the vanquishing of his hunger as they satisfy each other’s needs, literal and symbolic, but this equation does not completely resolve the troubling issues opened up through *Havelok*’s forays into the world of the poor. In *Sir Gowther*, which ‘operates as an inverted sort of conduct poem’ (p. 141), Gowther’s penitential and animalistic mode of consumption exposes the maintenance of privilege and power implicit in the disciplined bodies of the noble diners, drawing attention to ‘a viciousness that perpetuates the realm of refined behavior’ (p. 165) with particular starkness. Applying the spirit of Brillat-Savarin, Hofstetter argues that eating

well in all of the texts is an indicator of a fully realized humanity that authorizes political agency.

Political Appetites amply demonstrates the rich significance of ‘the powerful and provocative imagery of the edible’ (p. 17) in medieval romance. Its predominantly Marxist line of inquiry results in rewarding readings of these specific romances as well as scope for deeper reflection on this genre more generally in medieval England. For readers explicitly interested in the treatment of food, Hofstetter’s exuberant embrace of food metaphors, which deliberately conflate language with appetite and eating, warrants further comment. The joyous references to literary stews and savours tend to disembodify the processes they refer to and privilege language in this equation. Romance is thus a ‘hungry genre’ (p. 13), while literal hunger ‘is fundamentally the product of political economy’ (p. 145); there seems an impatience in these formulations with the banality of the physical experience of hunger. For Hofstetter, food endures as a powerful theme in romance because it ‘reminds us of the circumstances of our basic condition in the material world: our dependence on labor, our concern with status and recognition, our relation to government, our yearning for a coherent narrative of historical progress’ (p. 29). This list of ‘basic conditions’ evoked by food references is remarkable for omitting the bodily sensations of hunger and satiety; while references to embodiment are profuse throughout this study, food is conceptualized at a remove from the body, with labour privileged instead as the most meaningful category of material experience. Apart from the cross-dressing Silence, there is little discussion of food’s relationship with specific classes of bodies such as those of children or women; the ladies ordered to breastfeed Gowther die horribly, but the availability of their breasts is simply described as Gowther’s father ‘submitting the child’s nutrition to common Western European practice’ (p. 147). Embodied experiences of eating are appropriated as metaphors for critical reading of romance; ‘one realizes exactly what one is eating once the teeth sink into the dish’s ornately prepared flesh’ (p. 31). *Political Appetites* nonetheless offers a welcome and stimulating contribution to scholarship on the intersections of literature and food.

MELISSA RAINE, *University of Melbourne*

Ibbett, Katherine, *Compassion’s Edge: Fellow-Feeling and Its Limits in Early Modern France* (Haney Foundation Series), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2017; hardback; pp. 304; R.R.P. US\$75.95, £66.00; ISBN 9780812249705.

The history of social emotions—those that mediate human relationships—is of increased interest as scholars have grown in their appreciation for the significant role that emotion plays in shaping power relationships, for some even acting as a social structure itself. Ibbett’s *Compassion’s Edge* is an intellectual history of fellow feeling, particularly compassion and its associated emotions of pity and charitable care, in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century France. If Sarah McNamer’s

key insight into medieval compassion was that it was gendered, thus becoming associated with women, Ibbett's is that compassion has an 'edge', a boundary that defines the limits of its operation. In this, she contributes to a history of emotions that rejects a simple emotional valence—positive or negative emotions—for recognition of how they embed within social relationships and are given meaning through their social practice.

If intellectual history is sometimes associated with 'high-brow' knowledges, one of the strengths of *Compassion's Edge* is the broad diversity of texts that Ibbett engages with as she elucidates the uses and contexts of the language of compassion. She moves from dictionaries and theologies to pamphlets and religious debates to the historical novel, before a concluding chapter takes her to hospital records in colonial Montreal. A key question throughout is the difference that religious positioning makes to the articulation of emotion—is there a Protestant compassion? A Catholic pity? Through a close reading, Ibbett comes to suggest yes, or at least that their deployment is shaped by the religious contexts of the user. Given this, it is perhaps not surprising that the 'edge' of compassion is critical for Ibbett—compassion always has its limits, marks boundaries, enables sectarian division. Moreover, this is a limit that causes the actor to pause, with pity and compassion felt by the observer but failing to lead to action. As she acknowledges in the conclusion, a modern reader might find this frustrating, as we do at, say, outpourings of anger at injustice but a lack of practical response. Ibbett asks instead that we take seriously emotion as a form of action, an embodied practice based on an engagement with the suffering other, an acknowledgement of their humanity. In a divided world, this recognition might be enough.

Compassion's Edge's argument is made across six chapters that develop over a rough chronology, but also feature distinct genres. The first half of the book looks at ideas of pity, compassion, and caritas in religious and philosophical writing, as intersecting but distinct emotions, comparable in their capacity to inscribe similarity and difference. The second half seeks to complicate these accounts through their application in the novel, drama, and hospital journals. If the former section seeks compassion and its boundary, the latter half explores compassion's failures—moments of connection between humans missed. The final chapter—examining a colonial compassion marked by its distance in space and time from the preceding discussion—in contrast finds a more active, directed compassion in the care of a nun and her insistence on enacting compassion through the 'caress' (p. 222) of practical action. It is a care actively set against the colonial imposition (harm) of missionary work in the new world, an intimacy of empire that has been subject to significant critique.

Ibbett's analysis is skilful, nuanced, and reflective. Criticism is rather mean-spirited. Yet, as a text with an important argument, I kept wanting her to push back against McNamer a bit more explicitly—did this gendered care in the new world reflect that compassion was womanly, or did its productive use by male authors suggest the limits of this argument for the early modern? What too of work on

charitable care in early modern France—such as that by Susan Broomhall—that shows a similar enactment of compassion in hospitals at home? How did such caring practices complicate compassion's boundaries? How did a rhetoric of fellow feeling fare when put into action? That this book raises such questions, however, is really evidence of its quality, its capacity to inspire new questions and further research. As such it is an important contribution to the history of emotions, to religious belief and practice, and to the operation of the early modern community.

KATIE BARCLAY, *University of Adelaide*

Kiening, Christian, and **Martina Stercken**, eds, *Temporality and Mediality in Late Medieval and Early Modern Culture* (Cursor Mundi, 32), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. x, 257; 50 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503551302.

Editors Christian Kiening and Martina Stercken focus their volume 'on the period around 1500' (p. 3). They argue that the 1500 period engages in a crucial temporal intersection of medieval and early modern mediality. The essays collected also reflect a recent trend in academic studies of the medieval period's important influence on early modern texts.

Temporality and Mediality in Late Medieval and Early Modern Culture begins with Barbara Schellewald's analysis of the Cappella della Madonna dei Mascoli mosaic in St Mark's, Venice. The mosaic's depiction of celestial light represented by gold ground captures shifting light within the medieval church, to imply a viewer's engagement with 'sacred time' (p. 33). Schellewald makes an interesting observation that during the fifteenth century scientific advancements in optics led to gold ground being abandoned in images. The mosaic's traditional use of medieval gold ground, conversely, transcends early modern scientific developments.

Marius Rimmele examines the symbolic folding and unfolding structures of religious triptychs in late medieval Antwerp and Cologne. Space and time are collapsed and extended so that the viewer either becomes part of the painting's spiritual world, or the 3D triptych infiltrates the viewer's temporal reality.

The mediation of heavenly and earthly space and time is also the backbone of Britta Dümpelmann's study of St Mary's altarpiece by Veit Stoss in Kraców. By studying sculpture rather than paintings, Dümpelmann argues that touch is more important than sight. By 1500, the medieval sinful sexual connotations of touch are displaced by notions of embodiment and disembodiment. Heavenly and earthly time merge in the tangible visible spectacle of St Mary's sculpture.

Kiening's contribution identifies how medieval salvation history mediates past, present, and future temporalities through the mortal and divine notions of the Passion. Examining texts of Christian pilgrimages to Palestine, Kiening infers that spiritual experiences contained by time and space are dwarfed by an eternal perspective.

Stercken explores Gerhard Mercator's world map of 1569. The common critical assumption is that Mercator's famous map showcases technical advancement over medieval cartography. Stercken argues that the medieval influence on Mercator of mediating time in pictorial and textual map-making has been ignored by academics. Mercator follows the encyclopaedic *mappae mundi* by inserting images of exotic beasts and written histories of newly discovered regions. He also uses early modern scientific technologies to augment his new map. As Stercken notes, Mercator borrows liberally from medieval traditions and early modern advancements to create a world map demonstrating universal knowledge that transcends time and space.

Anja Rathmann-Lutz examines the *Rudimentum Novitiorum* (1475) through its innovative use of discontinuous text, pictorial family trees, charts, and illustrations. As Rathmann-Lutz argues, critics of the compendium have previously failed to acknowledge the *Rudimentum Novitiorum*'s similarity to earlier illustrative histories. Readers are encouraged to flip back and forth through the compendium's different timelines to experience history as a form of medieval time travel.

Marcus Sandl tackles the relationship between prophecies and prophets. He utilizes the medieval theological concept of the *figura* to argue that the prophet negotiates transition. Time is mediated through a prophetic exchange charting 'salvation history' (p. 221). The prophet's historical and theological knowledge is reinterpreted in an age of reformation obsessed with accumulating wealth, goods, commodities and information.

To close the volume, Aleksandra Prica examines the *Hypnerotomachia Poliphili*, printed in 1499. The close relationship between life and literature informs the essay, and Prica's main interest in the text lies with a particular form of allegorical interpretation. Meaning in the *Hypnerotomachia Poliphili* is created by a resonance of 'lingering', a literary conceit signified by narrative stasis or an accumulation of historical knowledge (p. 230), especially, as Prica argues, when the text encounters architectural ruins. The twin narrative functions of historical stagnation and tragedy become a self-referential locus for contemporaneous life histories.

Temporality and Mediality in Late Medieval and Early Modern Culture locates a temporal anxiety that the various artists and writers studied attempt to transcend through their work. Students and scholars of the medieval and early modern periods will discover a fascinating volume of groundbreaking academic research inviting further study.

FRANK SWANNACK, *University of Salford*

Law, Ceri, *Contested Reformations in the University of Cambridge, 1535–1584* (Studies in History New Series), Woodbridge, Royal Historical Society, The Boydell Press, 2018; hardback; pp. x, 235; R.R.P. £50; ISBN 9780861933471.

Martin Bucer's funeral at Cambridge in 1551 could be described as 'a display of Protestant piety and celebration' (p. 1), but his exhumation and burning six years later signalled 'Catholic condemnation and triumph' (p. 1). By 1560 the deceased and desecrated Bucer was reinstated as a member of the university (p. 112) though his heresies were so odious to some that Great St Mary's Church was reconsecrated on account of Bucer's body having lain therein (p. 76). The tale of Bucer's body is the story of the disputed legacy of the Cambridge Reformation. Chancellor John Fisher went to the scaffold in 1535 and Emmanuel College was founded on Puritan principles in 1584. The period between these events is investigated here.

This is a valuable book in confirming and correcting traditionally held beliefs about the role of the University of Cambridge during the Reformation, but the monograph brings new questions to the historiography. It has often been assumed that Cambridge educated the reformers while Oxford burned them. Ceri Law makes clear it is not quite that simple. Instead, she argues that her assessment differs substantially from earlier historiography, which she concludes not only reveals important insights but simultaneously conceals a great deal of the reality of the consensus, conflict, and compromise that characterized the half-century of university history under examination (p. 3).

Her thoughtful and well-researched book gathers together a plethora of useful and provocative observations. These include that in 1535 the university curriculum was rewritten (p. 1); conformity not resistance was crucial to the Reformation at Cambridge (p. 6); the White Horse pub story may be true but not factual (p. 18); Cambridge was not, simplistically, a Reformation university (p. 42); university men who supported the 1549 *Book of Common Prayer* were almost as likely to support oaths of Catholic orthodoxy in 1555 (pp. 72–74), indeed Oxbridge remained vital to renewed Catholicism (p. 97); rood screens went up and down with some regularity at Great St Mary's (p. 171); Cambridge maintained, at least from time to time, a modicum of academic freedom where debates about religion could still be heard (p. 178); very few students studied theology directly (p. 184); and in the end notions of religion and university are not fixed or stable concepts (p. 189).

Perhaps the book ultimately reinforces the idea that Reformation itself, and not just in England, was hardly a monolithic achievement or a linear development. Hugh Latimer was steadfast to the stake and Stephen Gardiner desired to restore Cambridge to full Roman Catholic conformity (pp. 72–73). The reformer Robert Beaumont, once a Marian exile, by 1565 wanted to punish clerics refusing to wear a surplice (p. 169). Andrew Perne, five times Vice-Chancellor, was a veritable theological weathervane (pp. 76–78). Perne preached the sermon in 1557 at the heretication of Bucer (p. 76) and took to the pulpit again in 1560 when the

proceedings were reversed and the dead heretic was rehabilitated (pp. 112–13). Perne was consistently faithful to the prevailing current of religion. William Cecil managed to survive the vicissitudes of Reformation and served almost four decades as Chancellor. Purity of doctrine and fidelity to tradition were among the factors prompting a 1582 report to conclude: ‘the whole bodye of the Universitie is oute of frame’ (p. 22). Cambridge, like any institution, was made up of many people and those people disagreed. The academic context should not, Law warns, be underestimated as a context for resistance (p. 140). During the Elizabethan era, it was treason to proselytize others into Roman obedience (p. 151), whilst Catholics organized book burnings in an effort to root out heresy (pp. 78–79). Treason and bonfires were serious. Other protests were more benign. In 1565, believing the vice-chancellor was too ‘popish’, university students seized his horse and mockingly shaved the horse’s head, causing the mane to resemble a tonsure (p. 169).

Law’s fundamental arguments and conclusions cannot easily be gainsaid. She is right to argue that Cambridge did eventually become a Protestant university. Ultimately its teachings and practices were reformed. The early infusion of Lutheran ideas, the later accommodation of Presbyterian commitments, led to an even later acknowledgement that religious diversity could not be eliminated and indeed it was perhaps undesirable to even attempt it. Barnes, Latimer, Cranmer, and a number of their colleagues were among the most significant figures in the English Reformation and each had some roots in Cambridge soil. The study of Reformation at the University of Cambridge is an exploration of social, political, and religious considerations, and a close reading of those factors reveals that the results of Reformation were ‘both decisive and divisive’ (p. 38).

Perhaps the state of Reformation in the University of Cambridge can be put down to a deliberate policy on the part of authorities who refused to ‘open windows into the souls of university men’ too widely (p. 123), and this, coupled with strategic conformity, helps to explain the nuanced and conflicted history of religious change in this chapter of Reformation history.

THOMAS A. FUDGE, *University of New England*

Lemon, Rebecca, *Addiction and Devotion in Early Modern England* (Haney Foundation Series), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2018; hardback; pp. xv, 280; 4 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £50.00; ISBN 9780812249965.

This volume traces changing understandings of addiction, demonstrating the concept’s former associations with devotion, which the modern, clinical sense obscures. Lemon, a literature scholar, draws on multiple disciplines to argue her case, and her work should assist scholars in several fields.

Etymologically, the word derives from the Latin ‘to speak’; an ‘addict’, in Roman contract law, was one sentenced, bound over to someone or something. In sixteenth-century England, addiction developed connotations of devoting oneself

to something. Addiction to the right thing was estimable. It could, however, involve compulsive abandonment, addiction as possession, inclining towards the term's present-day, pathological sense.

Lemon considers the word's application to one mode of addiction (in the modern sense), namely to drink, showing how the sense heads toward modern understandings, but she examines too its more intangible forms: devotion to God, fellowship, love, and so forth. She expresses hope that her investigation of alcoholism will stimulate research into other pathological addictions. No doubt it will.

The volume opens with a survey of the literature of addiction. This is admirably thorough, as are the endnote references. They represent an invaluable resource for anyone entering the field, although their comprehensiveness renders them a little daunting.

Then follows a set of four chapters, each devoted to an early modern play that features the word 'addiction', and whose action centres on addiction. Lemon uses each play to situate in its historical context one particular sense of addiction, while interpreting the play in light of the concept, advancing a reading not previously apparent. Her arguments are sophisticated and nuanced (though hard to reproduce in summary).

Chapter 1, for instance, contends that Marlowe's *Doctor Faustus* dramatizes the consequence of failure to commit, whether to God, the Devil, or any particular line of study. Calvinist theology represented addiction to God as heroic; Faust demands a contract from Mephistophilis because his willpower is insufficient to bind him by addiction alone. Failure to addict himself is what damns him.

Lemon proceeds to explore other aspects of addiction in Shakespeare's plays: to love and melancholy in *Twelfth Night* (examining its transformative power); addiction to fellowship in the *Henry IV* plays, where Falstaff turns to drink to overcome increasing rejection by Hal; perhaps most interestingly, in *Othello*, where Cassio's addiction to alcohol and Othello's to love are used to question an addict's responsibility for actions taken while intoxicated. Occasionally, Lemon possibly carries her argument too far; what she has to say is nevertheless always interesting.

A final section addresses shifting attitudes to health drinking, a practice imported from the Low Countries by soldiers returning from the Dutch Wars, between the 1580s and 1660s. Lemon seems apologetic for this chapter's different approach, but this is one historians may find especially interesting. Participation was, effectively, compulsory, producing drunkenness (and heading towards modern alcoholism). Voluntary or otherwise, health drinking entailed submergence of the individual within the general will. Lemon shows how secular writers, such as Jonson and Shakespeare, satirized pledging in the 1580s and 1590s; reformist pamphleteers later condemned it, increasingly stridently. In the 1630s, Cavalier poets embraced it as laudable: it created sentiments of unity and liberation among captive or disheartened loyalists.

This is highly interesting, though Lemon may not appreciate pledging's full implications. She presents it as something disapproved of initially by both secular and godly writers. However, the situation was possibly more complicated. The Dutch Revolt pitted Protestant patriots, aided by England, against Catholic Spain, so soldiers' health drinking potentially had jingoistic, sectarian overtones. If these continued after pledging established in England, how might Catholics have responded? Jonson was certainly Catholic, Shakespeare possibly so: their wariness conceivably had a sectarian aspect. If so, did England's increasingly Protestant culture release puritans to condemn the practice on moral grounds, while its dissipating religious significance enabled royalists to appropriate it for use in a new political contest? This merits further investigation. Such a qualification, though, does not invalidate Lemon's argument: it builds upon it, testament to its power to engage the reader.

Overall, the work succeeds in unfolding changing understandings of addiction, drawing attention to its forgotten links to devotion. Lemon amply demonstrates that addiction involved abandonment to something beyond oneself: God; the beloved; a community or cause; a substance. Such addictions might be estimable, but could have deleterious consequences, depending on the source of addiction. Addiction also interfered with legal notions of selfhood and responsibility; there was uncertainty whether the addict controlled or was controlled by the addiction. In prompting scholars to pay closer attention to the word's implications, the work performs valuable service. Readers are unlikely to take the term or concept for granted in future.

PATRICK BALL, *University of Tasmania*

Lu, Mingjun, *The Chinese Impact upon English Renaissance Literature: A Globalization and Liberal Cosmopolitan Approach to Donne and Milton* (Transculturalisms, 1400–1700), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 248; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472461254.

This is an intellectual history of globalization; how ideas about China, as a material and cultural presence, were received and treated in seventeenth-century texts and literature. Mingjun Lu's argument is that key intellectual values of cosmopolitan Europe came about by interactions with other cultures, and that these negotiations and the values that they produce can be seen in its literature. Donne and Milton, among others, are sites for such negotiations, drawing upon ideas about China that filtered through what were perceived to be Chinese goods and through reports of Jesuits, both of which updated older ideas about Cathay already operating in European culture.

Before the eighteenth century and its interests in chinoiserie, Lu claims that China plays a role in Europe that has not been recognized by scholars thus far more interested in interactions with Moorish, Jewish, and American peoples in this period. Lu suggests that contemporaries were unsettled by the place of China, perceived as self-sufficient, not inferior nor enemy, in a European hierarchical

order of world cultures. For Lu, ‘enlightened thinkers’ (p. 26) such as Donne and Milton, who engaged with cultural pluralism and developed an ‘enlightened cosmopolitanism’ (p. 27) through their intellectual encounters with China, ‘planted the very seeds of Western liberalism that was to witness a full blossoming in the eighteenth-century Enlightenment’ (p. 27).

The first chapter examines Spanish coinage in Donne’s elegy *The Bracelet* as a global flow of precious metals and global commerce that provided the platform for international cultural exchanges. Lu then studies Donne’s image of Anyan in ‘Hymn to God; My God, in My Sickness’ to argue for the poet’s global vision and what she terms theological cosmopolitanism, a willingness to engage with a globalized world into which Christian theology might be placed. The third chapter explores his engagement with the radical chronological difference of the Eastern annals from the biblical symbolic economy. Although she concludes that Donne was unsuccessful in his attempts to assimilate Chinese chronology into a scriptural timeframe, his efforts reveal him to be an intellectually flexible, cultural pluralist.

In the fourth chapter, Lu analyses how Milton engaged with the influential controversy surrounding Joseph Scaliger’s use of Juan González de Mendoza’s work *Great and Mighty Kingdom of China*, to develop a universal chronology. In both Chapter 3, for Donne, and Chapter 4, for Milton, Lu argues that these poets were negotiating a powerful Other that destabilized their worldview, and developing a global perspective. Milton, she argues, was willing to engage with alternative accounts of time in his representation of biblical time and world histories in *Paradise Lost*, with contemporary claims for the primacy of Chinese language, and with the idea of common ground between languages. Milton is cosmopolitan, for Lu, in the sense that he can accommodate the notion of linguistic diversity in the same way that his allusions to the world empire forged by the Mongol Tartars could serve (not uncritically) a comparative exploration of ideas about empires.

Lu’s exploration of Donne and Milton from this perspective is novel, although at times her insistence on the connections in their work and ‘enlightened’ views feels somewhat forced. With the exception of the first chapter’s focus on early modern commercial developments, the other case studies analyse how European works about China influenced Donne’s and Milton’s thinking. Lu’s Donne and Milton are thus sedentary global travellers and exemplars of an early modern imaginative reception of Chinese culture.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

Lucas, Adam, *Ecclesiastical Lordship, Seigneurial Power and the Commercialization of Milling in Medieval England*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 436; 37 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £90.00; ISBN 9781409421962.

While most scholars agree as to the importance of innovation and technology adoption, the questions surrounding these phenomena, that is, their determinants,

location, timing, and effects, remain open and keep attracting the attention of researchers from a variety of fields. Adam R. Lucas's *Ecclesiastical Lordship, Seigneurial Power and the Commercialization of Milling in Medieval England* represents an important contribution in this aspect. The book offers an excellent opportunity to look into the fascinating case of the adoption of water and wind power in Western European milling during the Middle Ages and provides a fresh overview of its history and historiography. It examines milling in a broader cultural, economic, legal, and political context and challenges existing views on the basis of the author's own findings and the most up-to-date relevant literature.

Lucas, a leading researcher of ancient and medieval technology, and the author of *Wind, Water, Work: Ancient and Medieval Milling Technology* (Brill, 2011), presents in this book new findings regarding the role of ecclesiastical landlords in commercial milling. His systematic examination of charters, account books, surveys, and other documents from thirty English religious houses, including a large share of small and medium houses, lead him to conclude that Augustinians, Cistercians, and minor orders provided non-seigneurial milling alternatives in many parts of England from the twelfth century onwards. Thus, non-seigneurial mills were not held only by lay hereditary and customary tenants, and ecclesiastical lords contributed to the commercialization of milling in this period as well.

Lucas's book, nonetheless, goes far beyond the mere presentation of findings. He provides a comprehensive examination of the discontinuities in the evolution of manorial property rights and the complexities of ecclesiastical patronage, as the key for understanding the ways in which religious houses and other lords acquired, managed, and drew revenue and services from mills. The first three chapters, which I find to be a little over-detailed, are dedicated to the foundation of English monasticism in the seventh century, the origins and properties of mill suit in the context of the development of feudal land tenure, and the commercialization of milling in England between the eleventh and fifteenth centuries. Chapter 4 outlines the religious orders' foundation, location, wealth and holdings, and milling activities vis-à-vis their broader management practices, whereas chapters 5 to 8 summarize the findings of Lucas's research, discussing the number of mills, their types, the timing of their mentions, the details of their acquisition, the type of tenure by which they were held and leased, their profitability, and estimating the proportion of mills that each house was likely to build.

There are a number of claims raised by Lucas throughout the book. Amongst them is the contention that there was demand for mechanical milling by tenants and that lords' main concern was competition from other mills, rather than the use of hand mills (a point that was also shown in my 2010 article in *Economic History Review*, 'The Effect of Political Fragmentation on Investments: A Case Study of Watermill Construction in Medieval Ponthieu, France'), contesting Marc Bloch's theory from the 1930s which saw mills as a symbol for class struggle. He also shows that 'suit of mill' existed in Anglo-Saxon England on royal and

ecclesiastical estates and became more widespread after the Conquest as a result of the manorial reorganization by William I, who created and expanded existing manorial demesnes from land which had formerly been held in free tenure (with obligations), and extended seigneurial monopolies to territories that had not formerly been subject to them. As to the increase in commercialization and investment in urban and rural industries from the late twelfth century, Lucas claims that was a result of the fall of many mills out of seigneurial control, as many demesne mills were either leased to free and customary tenants for a life (or more), or granted to religious institutions. The analysis of the sources also allows Lucas to conclude that both ecclesiastical and lay lords clearly recognized mills and milling as important contributors to their manorial revenues and social status, and sought to exploit their seigneurial privileges as much as possible. Thus, they all extracted higher *multure* rates and revenues from seigneurial mills in large estates than they did in areas with mixed ownership, which enabled competition between seigneurial and non-seigneurial mills. Lastly, Lucas finds no evidence to support the claim that the wealthy episcopal houses were proactive and entrepreneurial mill investors. It suggests that rather than having built most of their own mills in this period, they acquired most through grants and purchase from kings, magnates, and knights.

My last comment is a technical one and has to do with the hardcopy of the book. As much as I recommend this book, it is important to note that its small font makes the reading very difficult, and I therefore suggest purchasing the electronic version.

KARINE VAN DER BEEK, *Ben-Gurion University of the Negev*

Maddern, Philippa, Joanne McEwan, and Anne M. Scott, eds, *Performing Emotions in Early Europe* (Early European Research, 11), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. xxx, 296; 25 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9782503572376.

My first thought on reading *Performing Emotions in Early Europe* is that this book—particularly its introduction—is something I needed in 2015. It is still useful now, but it would have been of particular use to those of us involved in preparing *Emotions in Medieval Textual Media* (edited by Mary C. Flannery) for the same Brepols series ‘Early European Research’. That *Performing Emotions in Early Europe* has been so long in the production is no fault of the editorial team. The illness and passing of Philippa Maddern seriously delayed the editing and compilation of the chapters, which began life as papers in a 2011 conference under the aegis of the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions (CHE). Perhaps because that conference was so foundational to the CHE’s work, and because the CHE has been so central to the study of premodern emotions during the long production timeline of this book, nothing about the final product feels out-of-date. Rather, it collects varied and interesting interventions into ongoing scholarly conversations.

Performing Emotions in Early Europe defines performance broadly, on the basis that emotions ‘are anticipated and produced through certain bodily acts and naturalized gestures’ (p. xiv), and works from the shared assumption that emotional performances are not singular acts but part of systems of repetition and ritual. The scope of the contributions is broad, and includes studies of late medieval liturgical music, early modern marriage negotiations, Renaissance art, and contemporary performance of premodern drama. The introduction deserves special mention for its clarity in drawing together key threads, and its lucid theoretical framing. Philippa Maddern, Joanne McEwan, and Anne Scott draw together performance theory, emotion theories from a range of disciplines, and historicized textual readings, and the introduction serves not only as a platform for the subsequent essays but a forward-looking essay that will prove useful to scholars in many areas of the history of emotions.

One noteworthy aspect is the number of chapters that build their arguments on the basis of evidence from several different media and source types. Emily Cock’s essay is a particular stand-out in this respect, for its deft navigation between legal records of prostitution and fictional representations. There is a strong art history thread throughout the collection, where we find artistic representation of emotion placed in conversation with literary texts (Scott), liturgical history (Richard Read) and historical records (Louise Marshall).

Several chapters are also notable for their navigation of the vexed problem of the distance between emotions invoked in historical documents and the lived experience of emotion. Susan Broomhall and Jacqueline Van Gent’s chapter looks at the deployment of love as a justification, motivation, and demonstration of loyalty in documents relating to Orange-Nassau marriage negotiations. Here the authors allow space for the probability of real feeling—parental love and concern, love as desire for a prospective spouse, and so forth—alongside love as justification for political choices. Particularly interesting are cases where love is *not* invoked: in the event of failed marriage negotiations, a parent might cite protective love of their daughter as a reason not to pursue the marriage against the bride’s inclination, while the same parent might make no mention of love for their child when pressing another, reluctant, daughter into an advantageous marriage. Broomhall and Van Gent do not use these examples to speculate on whether protective love was actually a felt emotion for either child, but examine the factors which make the public performance of such love appropriate to one situation but not the other. Similarly, Lindsay Diggelmann’s chapter on emotional performance, particularly of kings, in Anglo-Norman historical records, attends closely to the bodily signals of intense emotion. Here Diggelmann focuses on the ways in which a diverse and sometimes contradictory suite of emotional performances could be construed as appropriate to kingship, rather than on either the felt emotion of the historical king or seeking a consistently proscriptive emotional model from the historical source record.

The chief weakness of the volume is that its one chapter on contemporary performance is left oddly isolated at the end of the book. Steve Chinna’s chapter

analyses a 2011 production of *The Duchess of Malfi* at The University of Western Australia. The chapter itself is stimulating, and offers insights into the emotional experience of both spectators and performers, as well as the difficulties inherent in identifying and recording these aspects. Unfortunately, none of the other contributions are in conversation with this piece, and I suspect Chinna's work would have more to offer if *Performing Emotions in Early Europe* had incorporated other pieces on contemporary performance or remediation of premodern texts.

AMY BROWN, *Port Stephens, NSW*

Martin, Catherine Gimelli, *Milton's Italy: Anglo-Italian Literature, Travel, and Connections in Seventeenth-Century England* (Routledge Studies in Renaissance Literature and Culture, 33), New York, Routledge, 2017; hardback; pp. xv, 318; 20 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £110.00; ISBN 9781138670617.

Milton's Italy, by Catherine Gimelli Martin, is a book of ambitious scope; such a vast topic could easily be too much for this slim volume, written by a single author. Indeed, the last significant book on the topic was *Milton in Italy*, a collection of essays by different authors (ed. Mario di Cesare, *Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies*, 1991). Twenty-six years later, in *Milton's Italy*, we have a sole scholar attempting more or less the same task.

Martin aims to address certain misconceptions about Milton and Italy. First of these misconceptions is the idea that Italy was only of real consequence for Milton during his 1638–39 tour; second, that seventeenth-century Italy was somehow a lesser version of its former glory; and third, that Milton despised Catholics.

The last of these three points would seem the most difficult to argue: surely the Puritan author of 'On the Late Massacre in Piedmont' and 'In Quintum Novembris' has no love for the Catholics. In the first three chapters, Martin makes an eloquent case for Milton's universal rather than identity-based ideologies: Milton saw the religious struggle not as Catholic versus Protestant or Italian versus English, but tyranny versus liberty. Milton, like the rest of the northern Protestant tradition, owed much to Italian reformists like Marsilio Ficino, Giovanni Pico della Mirandola, and even the anti-papalism of Dante Alighieri. True, Milton saw Rome as the opponent of Christian liberty—but its antithesis was to be found in Florence, not the Protestant North.

Perhaps Martin goes too far in promoting Milton's tolerance for Catholics when she states that 'he did not have any problems with his Catholic convert brother Christopher, to whose family he left some property' (p. 62). We do not know the date of Christopher's conversion, or with certainty whether he even converted at all, but it is likely that Christopher only became a Catholic after his older brother's death, during the reign of James II. For an examination of the evidence concerning Christopher's conversion, readers can refer to *The Arms of the Family: The Significance of John Milton's Relatives and Associates*, by John Shawcross (University Press of Kentucky, 2004).

Martin provides a refreshing account of seventeenth-century Italy, an account that undermines the familiar narrative of European culture migrating northwards and westwards in the late Renaissance. Secular thought still flourished in Counter-Reformation Italy: even Galileo (famously alluded to in *Paradise Lost*), whose imprisonment is symbolic of Catholic hostility to scientific thought, was only an unfortunate victim of political manoeuvring between the Dominicans and the Pope, Martin argues.

In the fourth chapter, Martin embarks on a lengthy discussion of Paolo Sarpi's account of the Council of Trent. As Martin herself writes, 'these technicalities are regrettably tedious, but the resulting differences in outlook are dramatic' (p. 121). Chapter 5 continues discussing the intellectual significance of Italy as the capital of the Republic of Letters, and the influence of Italian Neoplatonic thought on Milton's verse.

Martin concentrates on Milton's 'Italianate' English verse more than the actual Italian-language sonnets. While *Milton's Italy* draws on the work of John Hale, Estelle Haan, and Stella Revard, who have all made excellent studies of Milton's foreign-language writings, unfortunately Martin herself seldom analyses Milton's Italian and Latin poems in their original languages.

In Chapter 6, Martin looks at the way in which Milton elevates Eve, the Lady of *A Mask*, and his own wife to the feminine sublime, becoming *donne angelicate* in the tradition of Dantean and Petrarchan heroines. In this chapter especially, readers will find an original and compelling interpretation of Milton's characters, with comparatively little recourse to prior scholarship.

Chapter 7 deals with more well-trodden territory, the Italian sources of Milton's classical republicanism: Machiavelli, Sarpi, Pico, and Dante's *De Monarchia*. Again, Sarpi stands out, as Milton 'structures his texts around [Sarpi's] fundamental principles' (p. 215) and even borrows Sarpi's imagery. It is of course not a simple matter to distinguish whether inspiring ideas in the Renaissance come directly from the classics or are the product of Italian interpretations. Martin confronts this issue directly in Chapter 8, showing how much *Paradise Lost* owes to Italian innovations on the classical epic. Italian epicists developed celestial battles and transformed the *locus amoenus* into a Christian Paradise.

The final chapter deals with the influence of Italian opera, specifically with regard to *Samson Agonistes*—so often thought of as the most 'Greek' of Milton's works. Building on the work of Frank Prince, Martin performs a close reading of select passages with attention to rhyme patterns and syllable distributions.

Casual readers may be overwhelmed by the continuous torrent of allusions and brief quotations in this volume; sometimes there is not enough contextual information, so that it feels like more of a reference-book than a cover-to-cover read. *Milton's Italy* is nevertheless an indispensable resource for any Miltonist who wishes to know more about the land that the poet himself called 'the lodging place of all *humanitas*'.

SCOTT WILLIAMS, *University of Queensland*

Millar, Charlotte-Rose, *Witchcraft, the Devil, and Emotions in Early Modern England*, Abingdon, Routledge, 2017; hardback; pp. 230; 15 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £105.00; ISBN 9781472485496.

This book examines sixty-six extant witchcraft pamphlets in order to re-examine the role of the devil in beliefs around early modern English witchcraft. In addition, Charlotte-Rose Millar's monograph also emphasizes the relationship between witchcraft and emotion. Importantly, this book challenges previous understandings of English witchcraft as a 'predominantly non-diabolical crime' (pp. 2–3). It also investigates the collaborative nature of early modern witchcraft, which has, Millar claims, been overlooked in secondary literature that tends to represent witchcraft as a solitary or individual activity.

The monograph comprises five chapters: the first investigates the role of the devil in early modern England; Chapter 2 focuses on the complex and critical figure of the familiar; Chapter 3 turns its attention to how witchcraft and the devil provided a means for witches to act on their emotions; Chapter 4 explores the sexual nature of the relationship between a witch, familiars, and the devil; and the final chapter asserts the collaborative nature of early modern English witchcraft and offers suggested links between witchcraft, Catholicism, and Quakerism. In addition, the book includes fascinating images from the pamphlets and a useful chronological appendix of all sixty-six pamphlets.

The pamphlets are interwoven deftly throughout, although the book does not progress through its analysis of the pamphlets in an explicitly chronological fashion and this at times can feel slightly disorienting—although Millar does repeatedly offer context for the pamphlets discussed in detail. At various points I felt it would have been useful and interesting to incorporate further analysis of the narrative voices of the pamphleteers, the rhetoric employed, and the relationship between fiction and reality. For a reader not well-versed in pamphlet literature, extended discussion of the origins of the narratives (mentioned briefly at pp. 71, 132–33), critical analysis of authorship (where known), discussion of the sources of information (briefly speculated on p. 133), publication processes, and readership would have enhanced my understanding of the pamphlets and the public construction of early modern English witchcraft. Millar acknowledges that witches' confessions 'could be influenced to a greater or lesser extent by pamphleteers, judges, examiners, and clerks' (p. 104). More attention to this could have in particular enhanced discussion of the representation of gendered emotion as evidenced in the pamphlets.

The book clearly makes a case for the diabolical nature of early modern English witchcraft, so much so that occasionally it felt this point had been so well established that the book could move to further discussions. The 'understudied' (p. 48) figure of the familiar is illuminated thoroughly and European and English understandings of witchcraft are clearly articulated. Chapter 3's discussion of anger as 'a strong motif throughout witchcraft narratives' (p. 88) is less developed. Millar connects the decline of revenge narratives in witchcraft pamphlets with the

decline of revenge tragedy in the seventeenth century (p. 87); discussion of the relationship between early modern drama and literature and witchcraft pamphlets might have been further expanded. This chapter also explores how the display of anger is not only gender-based but also ‘class-based’ (p. 90), and identifies that witches tend to be ‘emotionally vulnerable’ (p. 90). Chapter 4’s discussion of the erotic nature of witch–devil relationships makes an important argument for the reinterpretation of the 1640s’ pamphlets as offering evidence not of an ‘aberration’ but an ‘intensification of ideas that were already circulating’ (p. 137). This chapter offers a discussion not only of witchcraft and sex but of broader attitudes to sex and sexual practices in the period (p. 124). The final chapter situates the pamphlets within the major socioreligious upheavals of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, broadly aligning social anxieties about witchcraft with Catholicism and Quakerism.

This monograph will be of value to those interested in early modern English witchcraft and the history of the emotions, specifically in terms of gender and emotion. It offers an invaluable appendix of pamphlets, analysis of images from the pamphlets, and a clear re-evaluation of the role of the devil in early modern English understandings of witchcraft.

CLAIRE HANSEN, *James Cook University*

Milligan, Gerry, *Moral Combat: Women, Gender, and War in Italian Renaissance Literature* (Toronto Italian Studies), Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2018; hardback; pp. 344; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. CA\$75.00; ISBN 9781487503147.

Moral Combat reveals that Renaissance literary discourse concerning gendered militancy framed active combat as the natural obligation of men, while casting women in several roles, ultimately aimed to praise or shame men into action. Gerry Milligan suggests that the rhetoric used in present-day debate about women in combat roles has ancient foundations, but that the first sustained cross-cultural discourse on the topic occurred in the sixteenth century. Using a comparative literary approach Milligan traces intersections and developments of classical and Christian rhetoric, tropes, and didactic narratives, to reconstruct the literary backdrop from which Renaissance authors wrote of militant women in their own time of political instability in the Italian peninsula. Milligan makes an important contribution to scholarship on Italian literature, not least due to *Moral Combat*’s grounding in an extensive primary source bibliography including several works by female writers.

The first chapter introduces ideas that resonate throughout the book, including the dual influence of classical and Christian authorities, arguments based in women’s physicality or socialization, the view of women as victims or aggressors, the distinctions between poetic conceit and historic reality, and the relative hierarchical values of gender and class. It compares Plato’s pro- and Aristotle’s anti-female combatant stances, the likewise conflicting biblical

and hagiographic exemplars, and theological treatises, and it identifies popular Renaissance interpretations and incorporation of these competing perspectives. The second chapter turns to the virago in chivalric epic poetry, again beginning with a classical model, presenting Virgil's Camilla as a precursor to warrior women in Renaissance literature. Milligan analyses recurring tropes including the public revelation of a knight's female identity. The chapter discusses works by Laura Terracina, Moderata Fonte, and Margherita Sarrocchi. Chapter 3 examines the militaristic language and objectives of a selection of influential women, whose stances are couched in their political setting. It opens with Catherine of Siena's fourteenth-century letters (published in 1500) and closes with Isabella Cervoni's sixteenth-century poems.

Collectively, chapters 4 to 6 present a fascinating examination of the changing didactic assessment of female combatants, commanders, and victims in women's biographies published over two and half centuries. Chapter 4 focuses on Plutarch's *Bravery of Women* (regaining popularity due to a 1485 translation), in which militant women acted collectively against social ills, and Boccaccio's anthology *Famous Women* (c. 1362), in which individual militant women as well as female victims of war are interpreted as examples to inspire men to battle and women to domestic virtue. Chapter 5 examines biographies written 1440–1550, including Giuseppe Betussi's 1545 translation and additions to *Famous Women*, to consider the influence of class in representations of recent, historical, and predominantly noble women's role in policing masculinity and contributing to the war effort. The final chapter considers literature written for and about 'warring queens' in the years 1550–1600; it draws attention to the inclusion or exclusion of Elizabeth Tudor in Italian biographies and discusses Francesco Serdonati's 1596 edition of *Famous Women*, expanded and dedicated to Caterina Sforza's granddaughter Christine of Lorraine.

The study conducts insightful literary analyses of works ranging from key classical thinkers to medieval chivalric epics, to fourteenth-century women's letters, all of which contributed to the rhetoric used in the cumulative moralizing compendiums of illustrious women from the late fourteenth through the sixteenth centuries. Milligan makes a convincing case for fifteenth- and sixteenth-century authors' recourse to classical and Christian literary models, while flagging the current relevance of his study through reference to gendered rhetoric used in militaristic discussions of the last century. At times figures and works spanning centuries are treated as assumed knowledge or juxtaposed in a way that requires the reader to be familiar with the context to recognize the relative weight they should place on the evidence as either part of an active contemporaneous discourse or as a broad-scale cultural one. From a historian's perspective, the argument would have been strengthened by more regular and direct grounding of source material in its historical context and a clearer rationale for the opening and closing dates of the last two chapters (particularly in light of a brief identification of the Italian Wars as a catalyst for sixteenth-century interest in women's militancy).

Milligan acknowledges the value that would come from further research into the readership and reception of the fifteenth- and sixteenth-century works, but this is not the prime focus of the present study. Rather, Milligan offers readers new insights into the cultural literary development of gendered discourse concerning combat, while proposing potential avenues for further research using different methodologies. *Moral Combat* provides an informed, engaging, convincing, and useful foundation for a long-overdue scholarly discussion of women's role in the war narrative. I would recommend this book for students and scholars interested in the gendering of warfare and didactic humanist literature.

ELIZABETH REID, *The University of Western Australia*

Powell, Susan, *The Birgittines of Syon Abbey: Preaching and Print* (Texts and Translations, 11), Turnhout, Brepols, 2017; hardback; pp. xxii, 348; 5 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90; ISBN 9782503532356.

This volume brings together some of Susan Powell's many contributions over the past two decades to the study of the late-medieval Birgittine community of Syon Abbey. The community—comprised of both a sisterhood of nuns and a brotherhood of priests, deacons, and lay brothers—was well known for its intellectual culture, and it is this theme that provides a common thread throughout the collection of essays.

Five of the seven chapters (2 to 6) reproduce material published elsewhere between 1998 and 2010. Although Powell herself acknowledges that the field of Syon studies has advanced considerably in even the past decade, these essays have not been revised beyond the occasional addition to the text and (more commonly) updated footnote. To each is appended a headword outlining the original publication details of the essay and any changes made, and an afterword discussing the scholarship that has appeared since the essay's initial publication. While these afterwords go some way towards bringing the essays up to date, it seems a missed opportunity that this recent literature and any resulting developments in Powell's thoughts on the topic were not integrated into the body of the text.

Chapters 2 to 4 focus on preaching and sermons. The Birgittine brothers were 'specifically enjoined to preach to the laity' (p. 50), and Syon's status as a pilgrim destination gave it a large and frequent audience for preaching. Chapter 2 provides an overview of preaching practices at Syon and the extant evidence for sermons preached there. The primary focus here is the *registrum* of the brothers' library, but Powell also cites the importance of exploring 'collections without clear Syon associations' (p. 71). The latter line of research is developed in the subsequent chapters. In Chapter 3, Powell undertakes a close analysis of Cox MS 39, in an effort to determine whether the sermons it records might have been composed and preached at Syon; the evidence, while suggestive, is ultimately deemed inconclusive in the absence of further research. Powell finds more decisive evidence of Syon connections in the sermons included in Caxton's editions of John Mirk's *Festial*, which are the subject of Chapter 4.

Alongside preaching, the Birgittines of Syon sought to fulfil their ‘mission to relay pastoral and devotional material to the laity’ (p. 128) through the production and dissemination of vernacular texts. Chapters 5 and 6 explore this engagement with the book trade. The former discusses both manuscript and print, but is primarily concerned with the vernacular printed texts written or commissioned by the English Birgittines. Particularly interesting here are Powell’s comments on Syon’s greater print profile in the 1520s and 1530s, which she attributes primarily to the abbey’s ‘new, jeopardized position’ (p. 144) due to the King’s Great Matter. Chapter 6, updated slightly since its publication in 1998, considers Lady Margaret Beaufort’s ownership and sponsorship of books and printers. Powell justifies its inclusion by noting that its relevance to the scholarship on Syon has often gone unrecognized.

This core of five essays is framed by two newly-written ‘book-ends’. Chapter 1 provides an excellent overview of the Birgittine Order and of the foundation, composition, and intellectual activity of the community at Syon—the only Birgittine house in England. In Chapter 7, Powell discusses the later history of Syon, covering the latter Henrician period, the house’s brief re-foundation under Mary I, and its two periods of exile. As well as providing a useful introduction to the abbey’s post-Dissolution experience, this chapter makes a distinct contribution to the history of the book. It closes with a meticulously researched section tracing the histories of eight printed books inscribed by Syon nuns.

The seven essays are supplemented by a number of useful appendices. An introductory ‘Note on the Bibliography of Syon Abbey and the Birgittine Order’ provides a welcome complement to Powell’s extensive bibliography and footnotes, outlining the key general works on the field, the main scholarly contributors, and accessible editions of both Latin and Middle English texts. Powell also includes lists of manuscripts and printed texts produced by Syon, and of woodcuts of St Birgitta in Syon printed texts.

The volume’s nature as a collection of discrete essays means that it does not always hang together as a whole, and contains elements of repetition. However, it is nevertheless an immensely valuable introduction to Susan Powell’s influential work, and to the study of Syon Abbey more broadly. It should prove an essential starting point for those new to the field. Those familiar with Syon studies will have likely already encountered some or all of the five core chapters in their original form. However, the two new essays, as well as the impressively researched paratextual material, render the book a worthwhile resource even for established scholars.

STEPHANIE THOMSON, *University of Adelaide*

Purton, Peter, *The Medieval Military Engineer: From the Roman Empire to the Sixteenth Century* (Armour and Weapons), Woodbridge, The Boydell Press, 2018; hardback; pp. xiv, 351; 30 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781783272875.

As its title suggests, the ambition of this work is to focus on the changing experiences and status of the military engineer in the Middle Ages. Warfare made these individuals important skilled workers: indeed, critical assets for leaders. This does not mean, for the most part, tracing who these workers were and what they did, but rather what kind of people they must have been, the skills that they would have required, and the varied transmission pathways by which they could acquire such knowledge. Peter Purton traces a continuous, evolving corpus of professional and technical knowledge across the period, assessing the impact of new forms of warfare—from the introduction of mobile siege towers to gunpowder—on the practitioner and the skills that these demanded.

The time period covered here as ‘medieval’ extends from late antiquity to the early sixteenth century with Leonardo da Vinci. The earlier period has a relative deficit of direct sources for this subject, and Purton thus pulls together written sources, archaeological material and visual evidence from many social levels. He is interested in what might be revealed about these workers, not just in the employ of rulers but also that of noblemen, bishops and other kinds of leading officials who were also responsible for warfare or defence. Purton’s investigations span Christian Europe in interaction with the Islamic world, with brief investigations into the activities of the Mongol empire and Chinese technologies that impacted Europe.

As might thus be expected, there is no consistent terminology for such workers, as they change skillsets and significance across the period, and in the context of varied kinds of documents in which references to their work appears. The word ‘engineer’, which combines both the functional making of engines and machines and the creative, in the sense of ingenuity, is employed in the title and throughout the work as an acknowledged shorthand for a group of skilled men in varied roles and of different status, who would not necessarily have identified with this term. It is difficult to sustain any clear distinction between civil and military engineering and thus Purton’s subject ranges across land reclamation, hydraulic engineering, dams, canals, and ship building, as well as more familiar military technologies such as the trebuchet.

For the earlier periods, there are fewer names and more conjecture from archaeological evidence about the skills and knowledge that must have been needed to exploit advanced technologies such as irrigation, bridge-building, geometry (for laying an encampment), as well as arms manufacture. Individuals start to emerge from the records more consistently by the twelfth century, as payment records provide details of who such men were, how they were paid, and for what appear to be increasingly specialized technologies.

By the thirteenth century, there are growing references to military technology in advice to rulers, but far less is said about the men who were needed to make

and maintain it. Account records, though, suggest that there are more of such men and performing more specialized roles. With the introduction of gunpowder and new artillery forms in the Christian and Muslim worlds by the fourteenth century, designated gun masters emerge among the named individuals whose careers can be fleshed out to some extent. In the fifteenth century, increased literacy assisted the production of practically oriented manuals and the advent of the expert master-author such as Jörg of Nürnberg, papal gun master, who left his own account by which something of a professional career can be constructed. Purton concludes that the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries are marked by moves towards ever more defined specialisms, making famous polymaths such as Leonardo outliers to the broader trend.

The work concludes with an appendix of military engineers and miners listed in the Pipe Rolls of the English Exchequer, showing something of Purton's methodology for identification, and a useful glossary of terms. Much of Purton's broad discussion of the economic, social, and technological contexts for new military developments will be familiar but the details pulled together are fascinating and cover many fields of interest to scholars of the period. There is, though, a slipperiness to this expansive subject and Purton is often circling around a set of speculative 'possibly's, 'perhaps's and 'must have been's. Until the final chapters, as I think the author would agree, it remains difficult to discern the individuals who are at the centre of the work.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

Reyerson, Kathryn L., *Mother and Sons, Inc.: Martha de Cabanis in Medieval Montpellier* (The Middle Ages Series), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2018; cloth; pp. 264; 9 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £54.00; ISBN 9780812249613.

This book will be of great interest to scholars interested in practical evidence for women's exercise of agency in the late Middle Ages, and for how women negotiated the limitations placed on them. It is also an illuminating example of how relatively technical primary sources can be synthesized to create a case study of a particular social and economic setting, that of an 'urban merchant family of the 1330s and 1340s' (p. 7).

Martha de Cabanis (c. 1295/1300–c. 1348) belonged by birth and marriage to Montpellier's mercantile elite. The early and unexpected death in 1326 of her husband, a mercer, left her with three young sons to provide for and a business to manage. It is precisely because of this that Martha left a much greater documentary trace than would otherwise be expected, with several hundred Cabanis contracts from 1336 to 1342 contained in a single notarial register. In *Mother and Sons, Inc.*, Kathryn Reyerson draws on those records to reconstruct Martha's business and real estate transactions on her sons' behalf as their guardian and eventual business partner, as well as on her own account. As such, this book functions as a companion volume to Reyerson's *Women's Networks in Medieval France: Gender*

and Community in Montpellier 1300–1350 (Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), which looked at the life and business dealings of Agnes de Bossones, a contemporary of Martha de Cabanis.

Reyerson has specialized in the social and economic history of Mediterranean France in the late Middle Ages, usually taking a localized and particular focus, such as trade, or banking. In *Mother and Sons, Inc.* she uses Martha's case to consider how far gender constrained women as economic and legal actors but also how women could be mobilized in families' interests. Chapter 1 sets the scene for Martha's life, with an overview of fourteenth-century Montpellier's political situation, layout, population, trade, and economic resources. Chapter 2 deals with Martha's family background and with the kind of childhood, education, and marriage arrangements she was likely to have had. Chapter 3 introduces Martha's husband's family and uses that context to explore how, in the absence of genealogical information, a family's history can be reconstructed through evidence of housing proximity and their business alliances and professional and legal ties. Chapter 4 draws on sources on urban domestic architecture and material culture to reconstruct the Cabanis's likely domestic setting. The notarial corpus that is Reyerson's main source cannot supply much detail about Martha's life beyond business, so chapters 2 to 4 are necessarily more speculative than they would be if Reyerson had also been able to draw, for instance, on letters or family chronicles. Chapters 5 to 8, focused on business, benefit from being able to make detailed use of the notarial records.

Chapters 5 and 6 explore the responsibilities that fell to Martha after her husband's death and the legal capacity she had to meet them, in theory and in practice. Widows like Martha enjoyed a privileged status vis-à-vis other women, particularly in southern France, but Reyerson cautions us against taking for granted the 'privilege' of agency for such women (p. 89). She also shows how notarial documents, which capture the interaction of customary and Roman law in practice, offer an excellent guide to a region's 'living law' (p. 87).

Chapter 7 gets to grips with the detail of the Cabanis's dealings in silk, linen, and mercery, examining their business strategies such as partnerships and use of credit, and Martha's role in these, especially before her sons could act independently. Chapter 8 covers similar territory but in relation to real estate, and here Martha is more visible as an investor in her own right. The chapter considers the reasons for women's greater visibility in real estate than business dealings, and also examines women's, and families', use of agents and their management of risk. This chapter also offers welcome explanations of the confusing, multilayered nature of medieval property rights and the legal instruments used to exploit them. Later in the book a short appendix on the currencies in use in Montpellier and a glossary of terms used by notaries in contracts are similarly helpful.

Chapter 9 reviews the Cabanis's trading enterprise over time as a family collaboration, looking at how Martha and her sons responded tactically to evolving circumstances. In her final chapter, Reyerson convincingly concludes that family

networks and relationships constituted ‘communities of support’ (p. 148), which facilitated both the conduct of business and the exercise of agency by women such as Martha, whom she sees as not untypical of her background. In doing so, she arguably offers us a way to think about female agency that does not call for exceptional or high-status individuals or one-off circumstances, but can potentially be applied to the lives of many women across Europe in the late Middle Ages.

JENNIFER LORD, *Monash University*

Robertson, Kellie, *Nature Speaks: Medieval Literature and Aristotelian Philosophy* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2017; cloth; pp. 456; 10 illustrations; R.R.P. US\$69.95, £60.00; ISBN 9780812248654.

Nature speaks to us, all the time. If only we were fluent in her tongue! Modern environmental studies have developed a set of tools to interpret biophysics in their relationship with our subjectivities as human individuals, as scholars, and as citizens of the twenty-first century who both inhabit and transform their environment. But long before 1960s’ system theories (and certainly long before so-called ‘complexity theory’), the pre-modern mind also had ways of dealing with the limits of our knowledge, and willingly sought out to speak with nature, and to hear her voice speak. Unlike the modern and post-industrial intellect, the enquiry into Nature was a textual enquiry. The image on the book jacket sleeve of Kellie Robertson’s book shows one such conversation, as depicted in fourteenth-century Guillaume de Deguileville’s *Pèlerinage de la vie humaine* (one of the core texts of this book), where Grace Dieu disputes lively with Nature against a stark background of green foliage and a red curtain with a gold-rimmed square pattern (ideas, perhaps?). Grace Dieu wears blue, and her long-flowing blonde hair cascades from beneath her majestic crown. Nature wears a long red dress, and a white modest veil. But they both are engrossed in the debate, pointing at ideas and arguments with their hands, showing the flow of ideas to one another, and actively engaging in lively conversation. They mirror each other, and they weave a text that both explains them to one another, and constitutes them as subjectivities. Nature speaks, and humans can not only listen, but also learn from it.

At a moment when our relationship with Nature is at a crucial crisis, Kellie Robertson’s book explores this fecund medieval link between the language of physics (natural philosophy) and of literature (of love poetry, in particular) in the different personifications of Nature during the late medieval period. With an astonishing knowledge of comparative literature and a masterly command of sources that ranges from Heraclitus to Raymond Williams, Robertson starts by exploring the medieval reception of Aristotle’s *Physics*, and its polymorphic penetration not just in the classroom and the monastery, but also into imaginative literature in both Latin and vernacular sources. In a second section, those concepts are applied to literary representations of a personified Nature in French literature, with specific attention to texts by Jean de Meun and Guillaume de Deguileville.

Robertson reads those core texts in a comparative fashion and as part of a broader textual tradition that includes Latin and vernacular encyclopedic texts, Aristotelian commentaries, philosophical treatises, and polemicists' exchanges in lesser-known genres such as epistles or scholia; and our reading is made all the better thanks to this approach.

Finally, the author turns her attention to the English vernacular tradition, and provides an engaging, indeed fascinating, reading of Chaucer and of Lydgate that combines close reading of the chosen sources with adequate and carefully interwoven cross-referencing of secondary sources.

This is a joy to read. This is also an essential book for scholars of medieval Aristotle and for anyone interested in medieval love poetry. It will provide an arsenal of suggestions and projects for anyone interested in the work of Juan de Mena, of Juan Ruiz (Archpriest of Hita, and author of the *Book of Good Love*), and Latin love poetry collections such as the *Carmina Rhipullensia*. And for that, we should be immensely grateful. I know that I am.

CARLES GUTIÉRREZ-SANFELIU, *The University of Queensland*

Scase, Wendy, Laura **Ashe**, and David **Lawton**, eds, *New Medieval Literatures 17*, Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2017; hardback; pp. 242; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843844570.

This book presents a collection of thoroughly researched, very well-written papers, exploring concepts of materiality. Each essay addresses assumptions of anthropocentric views of the world, identifying and analysing elements that disrupt such views.

Michael Raby locates his study in the Old English *Boethius* and *Soliloquies*, problematizing the relationship between animals and non-animals. He observes the struggle to articulate the differences between animals and non-animals as a linguistic problem, and notes the theological implications of this problem. His paper is a rich discussion of the ambiguities inherent in distinguishing creatures that occur within these texts.

Aaron Hostetter's 'Disruptive Things in Beowulf' discusses the power of the inanimate realm, although he ultimately rejects the New Materialist view of the power of objects, noting that the poem dismisses 'thing-power' (*passim*). He observes that even death is a rejection of the power of physicality. Within this study, however, he also has intriguing observations about the power of absent objects.

Eliza Zingesser's essay on 'Pidgin Poetics' examines bird language in lyric poetry. She offers a fascinating analysis, focussing on the twelfth-century Occitan troubadour Macabru's use of rhyme, sequence, assonance, and metrical structure. She undertakes a similarly rich analysis of Richard de Tournival's 'Psittacine Poetics'. Zingesser identifies the tensions between sound and sense, meaningful and meaningless language, and the power of 'the sonic over the semantic' (p. 80).

R. Jacob McDonie identifies the link between ‘melodious joy’ (p. 91) as a musical encounter and as a song-friend in ‘Performing Friendship in Richard Rolle’s *Incendium Amoris*’. In analysing the significance of the ‘melodious’ as the expression of friendship, McDonie identifies the intersections of music, performance, friendship, and self, as a framework for Rolle’s communal self. He concludes that Rolle is not a spiritual loner, but provides a model for mystical life, reframing his love of God and the expression of this love.

Diane Cady’s study of ‘Chaucer’s *Man of Law’s Tale*’ is an intriguing examination of ‘the intimate ties’ (p. 117) between money and language, economics and aesthetics. She adds a layer to this with a discussion of gender and value. Cady examines storytelling and merchandizing as analogous enterprises and makes insightful observations about the gendered structure of storytelling, and the link between storytelling and incest. She concludes that medieval poetics broadly represent an economy ‘in which commodification and desire are entwined with ideologies of gender and value’ (p. 149).

The words used by priest and doctor, the ‘metaphorical comparison between confessional and medical expertise’ (p. 151), are examined by Joe Stadolnik in ‘Gower’s Bedside Manner’. This study elucidates the medieval manners of expert conversation and explores Gower’s use of these manners as literary device. Stadolnik suggests that Gower is orienting his reader to the experience of textual confabulation, the telling of apt stories to inform or distract. By invoking medical conversations, Gower helps his readers to experience the text, fashioning ‘a bespoke literary encounter’ (p. 172) within a framework they understand.

Boyd Johnston examines Lydgate’s refashioning of Chaucer’s *House of Fame* in *The Temple of Glass*. Her chapter, ‘Vitreous Visions: Stained Glass and Affective Engagement in John Lydgate’s *The Temple of Glass*’, explores the affect of medieval glass, which reaches ‘beyond its materiality’ (p. 178). She argues that Lydgate establishes an aesthetic of stained glass that feeds into his narrative, as the characters within the poem absorb and re-enact the drama on the walls. Her study of the materiality of the glass, its fragmented nature and yet capacity to combine, and the ways in which this can be understood as a key to entering dream-vision imagery, is insightful and helpful.

Spencer Strub’s ‘The Idle Readers of *Piers Plowman* in Print’ is an appropriate paper to draw the book to a close. It shifts the emphasis from what the readership of a book can tell us about the text, to what the book can tell us about its readers. Focusing on the reception of medieval literature, Strub narrows his study to Owen Roger’s 1561 copy of *Piers Plowman* (the Bancroft *Piers*), and the New Haven Beinecke Library *Piers* (Id L26 550). His interest is in those ‘idle readers’ whose marks on the book are concerned with personal context or reflection, and not polemic. He notes that amongst these readers the text is frequently engaged with as Christian instruction, rather than as evidence for inter-confessional debate. He concludes that *Piers* was much more a living document in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries than previously thought.

This is a fine collection of essays, with tantalizing points of comparison across them. For those interested in teasing out ideas around materiality, and how we engage with the medieval world from a twenty-first-century perspective, it is of particular value.

MARY-ROSE McLAREN, *Victoria University*

Schirg, Bernhard, ed., *Die Ökonomie der Dichtung: Das Lobgedicht des Pietro Lazzaroni an den Borgia-Papst Alexander VI (1497). Einleitung, Interpretation, kritische Erstedition und Kommentar* (Noctes Neolatinae, 26), Hildesheim, Olms, 2016; hardback; pp. 517; 19 illustrations; R.R.P. €88.00; ISBN 9783487154145.

Until fairly recently there has been a distinct reluctance on the part of modern scholarship to tackle neo-Latin encomiastic poetry. Understandably so, given the intricacies of the genre, the obscurity of many of its practitioners, and the not wholly unfounded impression that such work was produced by paid hacks whose sole aim in writing was to serve the interests of their patrons. Added to this was the widely shared conviction that works of this kind, often dashed off at high speed, with one hand on the pen and the other extended to receive cash payment, could have no real poetic value.

All that has suddenly changed over the past decade or so thanks largely to a younger generation of German scholars. Brushing aside contested issues like that of poetic value, a new wave of scholarship has come at the Latin encomiastic literature of the Renaissance with a fresh set of questions: how was such work produced? Who exactly dictated its parameters? What exactly were the circumstances surrounding its composition and diffusion?

Clearly it is not possible to answer such questions in the abstract, which is why most of the new work tends to focus, like the book under review, on a specific figure, and even, as here too, on a specific work. Pietro Lazzaroni (c. 1425–c. 1500) is certainly no household name. Little is known of his life, beyond what can be gleaned from the information he drops here and there in his thirty-six known poetic compositions. Most of these were occasional verse pieces that he deliberately crafted to please the powerful in the hopes of promoting his own social advancement. The strategy appears to have paid off in Milan: a 1200-hexameter-long verse history of the dukes of Milan (the *Vita Ducum*) resulted in his being appointed to teach law at the University of Pavia in 1480. This put him into direct contact with a number of influential figures in the entourage of the effective ruler of the duchy, Ludovico Maria Sforza. Although Lazzaroni's prospects at the Milanese court were to remain precarious at best, he continued for the rest of his life—as far as we can determine—to tailor his poetic efforts to the apologetic needs of the Sforza regime.

As its subtitle indicates, Bernhard Schirg's book revolves around Lazzaroni's last and longest poetic composition, the *Carmen ad Alexandrum VI*. Written in the

spring/summer of 1497, and addressed to the notorious Borgia pope Alexander VI, the poem consists of 2100 hexameters organized into three books. Schirg not only provides us with the first edition of the poem, but also with an exhaustive commentary explaining the context. In commissioning Lazzaroni to write this work, Ludovico Sforza was investing him with what might be described as a literary mission impossible. Because he was addressing a pope, Lazzaroni was first of all obliged to conform to the requirements of the genre, or sub-genre, of papal panegyric, a tricky task in itself. Secondly, he had to slant his content to meet the needs of a particularly delicate moment. By the middle of the year 1497 the formerly cosy relationship between Milan and Rome had deteriorated almost to the point of no return. Lazzaroni's poem was part of a desperate last-ditch move by Ludovico Sforza to patch up his broken ties with the Borgia pope.

Schirg shows how Lazzaroni skilfully negotiated various obstacles, especially in Book I, where he had to provide an account of the first five years of the Borgia pontificate (1492–97) without so much as alluding to the reasons for the falling out between Rome and Milan. Yet perhaps the most impressive thing about Lazzaroni's performance was the speed at which he completed his work. Here we come to the concept of the 'Economics of Poetry', a formulation that has become a byword in the field, as can be seen in *The Economics of Poetry: The Efficient Production of Neo-Latin Verse, 1400–1720*, edited by Paul Gwynne and Bernhard Schirg (Peter Lang, 2018). Panegyric poetry being strongly wedded to the context in which it aimed to make an impact, it had to be churned out at top speed, before events shifted into other unforeseeable avenues of development. *Die Ökonomie der Dichtung* is primarily concerned with answering the question as to how it was possible for a practitioner like Lazzaroni to come up with so many intricately woven Latin hexameters in less than two months. Finding the answer involves Schirg in a painstaking examination of Lazzaroni's entire literary corpus, in a quest to identify the techniques that ensured such a rapid pace of production. It turns out that one of the key measures the poet adopted was the recycling of passages from his own previous work: a dubious practice, but in the 'publish or perish' world of the panegyrist, meeting deadlines was perhaps the most important challenge the writer faced.

GARY IANZITI, *University of Queensland*

Thomas, Alfred, *Shakespeare, Catholicism, and the Middle Ages: Maimed Rights* (The New Middle Ages), Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2018; hardback; pp. xv, 260; 13 colour illustrations; R.R.P. US\$109.00; ISBN 9783319902173.

This well-written, widely researched and precisely documented book should stimulate debate, but some of its claims and interpretations may not convince some readers. The approach taken raises the question: how useful is it, scholarly speaking, to put forward conjectures that superficially are improbable and which,

without new evidence, are unlikely to be either proven or rejected? *Shakespeare, Catholicism, and the Middle Ages* is strong in historical research, but less convincing in literary analysis.

In opposing Stephen Greenblatt's view that 'Renaissance learning and individuality' decisively transformed a 'benighted, superstitious medieval world' (p. x), Alfred Thomas takes his cue from Jacques Le Goff to argue that the 'Protestant' Tudor-Stuart state was more restrictive and totalitarian than Catholic medieval Europe. This assumes an over-simple Protestant/Catholic dichotomy that ignores the Church of England's ritualized self-definition as 'one holy *Catholic* and Apostolic Church' (Nicene Creed, my italics), and the same church's origin as a compromise that combined Catholic with Reformist elements.

Building on its binary premise, the book contends that early modern playwrights, principally Shakespeare, responded to the political and religious oppression of their era by perpetuating medieval strategies of veiled dissent. The subtitle pun accordingly identifies the 'maimèd rites' at the burial of Ophelia, who is alleged to be a likely 'adherent of Catholicism' (p. 147), with the 'maiming of rights' under the 'Protestant' monarchs, Elizabeth I and James I. A series of comparisons based on debatable claims of generic continuity across the centuries elaborates this proposition in seven chapters.

Contentiously categorized as 'political allegory', *Richard II* is said to redeploy the techniques of 'chivalric romances' such as *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight* (*SGGK*), the *Alliterative Morte Arthure* (*AMA*), and Malory's *Morte Darthur* in a critique of Elizabethan absolutism (p. 7). Preliminary discussions discern the operation of late medieval politics in each of these Arthurian works, which, as Thomas admits, Shakespeare may not have read (p. 34). *SGGK* and *AMA*'s survival in unique manuscripts makes it unlikely that he had. Finally, Chapter 2 extends the suspicion of contemporaries including, as reported, Elizabeth herself, that Shakespeare's dramatization of King Richard's failings, deposition, and murder was covertly a call for the queen's overthrow.

Chapter 3 offers convincing analyses of *The Prioress's Tale*, *The Passion of the Jews of Prague*, the Croxton *Play of the Sacrament*, Marlowe's *The Jew of Malta* and *The Merchant of Venice* as 'projective inversions' (p. 76), in which Christian audiences and readers projected doubts about their faith, inspired perhaps by the growth of heresies, on to the Jews. Thus, these works characterized Jews as perpetrators of religiously inspired crimes rather than as what they were—victims.

This book often hedges its detection of pro-Catholic subtexts in medieval and Renaissance works by markers of uncertainty, such as 'may well have decided', 'may have suggested', 'may have reminded', 'resonates with', 'may equally allude', 'may well have evoked', 'would thus have resonated with', 'may be said'. However, this verbal circumspection does not negate the objection that the equivalences perceived too often cohere into allegorical readings of Shakespeare and other playwrights that audiences at the time are unlikely to have understood. For example, Chapter 4 equates Hamlet's famous alternatives, whether 'to take

arms' or 'to die, to sleep' with Elizabethan Catholics' choices of either reacting violently against the 'Protestant' state or of acquiescing in persecution (pp. 115–16). Similarly far-fetched is the suggestion that as Protestants the 'Oedipal' father-son pair, Hamlet and Claudius, 'are ultimately responsible for having suppressed the Catholic religion', here equated with Hamlet senior's Ghost (p. 143). It defies logic too that *King Lear*, which in Act 1 promotes King James's campaign against a divided Britain, would, 'by underscoring the differences between James and Lear', paradoxically have highlighted 'the similarities between them' (p. 22). Just as unlikely are the suggestions in Chapter 5 that Cordelia's divided loyalties may have 'exemplified' for recusant members of the Jacobean audience 'their own impossible situation in trying to reconcile loyalty to the Crown with their spiritual allegiance to the Pope'; or that Cordelia's defiance of Lear parallels some notable Catholic women's defiance of Elizabeth and James (p. 154). Equally hypothetical is the suggestion that Cordelia's hanging would, in an unrecorded performance of *King Lear* in 1609, have reminded a Yorkshire audience of the hanging forty years earlier of 600 'adherents of the true faith' (p. 150). Although this book is rightly cautious about claiming Shakespeare as a secret Catholic, arguments favouring the idea that he 'was at least sympathetic to the Catholic cause' (p. 63) build throughout and carry weight.

In *Shakespeare, Catholicism, and the Middle Ages* excursions that draw on the author's proven expertise in Czech history and texts will be new to many readers. His treatment of English people, events, and writing between 1100 and 1620 is admirably specific and wide-ranging. Yet this book's arguments for the operation of a Catholic propagandist intent that was perceptible to contemporaries in so many Renaissance poems and plays must finally be regarded as speculative.

CHERYL TAYLOR, *Griffith University*

Thomson, R. M., *The Fox and the Bees: The Early Library of Corpus Christi College, Oxford. The Lowe Lectures 2017*, Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2018; hardback; pp. viii, 95; 23 colour illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843844853.

This most welcome volume joins the many other fine contributions to the history of medieval libraries that Rodney M. Thomson has made. Yet the Library of Corpus Christi College, founded in 1517 by Richard Fox to bring the 'New Learning' into better focus in Oxford, has special claims. In his three Lowe lectures, 'Richard Fox: The Concept and the Foundation of the College' (pp. 3–15); 'John Claymond: Executor of Fox's Erasmian Programme' (pp. 19–31); and 'The Library in the Age of Elizabeth' (pp. 35–52), Thomson sets out to demonstrate that the Corpus Christi Library was different, in that it was, from the start, 'consciously Renaissance' (p. 4).

The first lecture considers the materials that allow us to study the library from the beginning: the still-existing books of Fox and his protégé, John Claymond, the college's first president; the books of Claymond's friend, Greek scholar

William Grocyn; the 1598 catalogue of the library's chained books; Fox's Statutes describing the conception of the library; the college's financial accounts (recording book repairs, acquisitions, binding, chaining); and the library room itself. Thomson also studies Fox (c. 1448–1528): his education, career, and the origins of his interest in the New Learning. He looks at Fox's colleagues, including John Shirwood and Desiderius Erasmus; provides Fox's programme of studies, and his 'beehive' of President, twenty Fellows, twenty scholars, two chaplains, and two clerks, pointing out that what was new was the choice of texts the lecturers were to expound, and that thus might be expected in the College Library.

Lecture 2 concerns college President, John Claymond (c. 1467–c. 1537), of the humanist circle including Grocyn, Linacre, Tunstall, and More. Thomson examines a notable handful of Claymond's many donations to the library, including Reuchlin's *De arte cabalistica* (1530), and Erasmus's Greek and Latin New Testament (1519). He gathers Claymond's friends and colleagues, several living at the college: Erasmus, Grynaeus (who borrowed Claymond's manuscript of Proclus as the basis for his edition), Vives, Lupset, and king's astronomer Kratzer. He considers other aspects of Claymond's life, via an inventory of his movable goods from even before his presidency, from 1498 to 1518. Thomson notes Claymond's Latin learning (including his unpublished commentary on Pliny's *Natural History*), and considers how Claymond and Fox obtained the books and manuscripts in Greek for the college. Some were imported, in barrels, primarily from Venice (p. 25); others, owned by Grocyn, were sold or donated to the college. Hebrew and Latin-Hebrew works obtained for the Library are also considered (p. 28). The library was largely formed, Thomson finds, by 1537, although other, slightly later, donors had a part, such as Richard Fox's nephew, John (classical and Italian Renaissance works), and Thomas Walsh (patristic). By Claymond's death, Thomson records, the library contained 'virtually all the Greek and Latin classics known to us today' (p. 31) except Apuleius's *Metamorphoses*, Lucretius, Apicius, Claudian, and Petronius.

In the third lecture, Thomson deals expertly with the patchier book donations after Claymond's departure. Richard Marshall, Dean from 1553 to 1559, donated fifteen books, not all Protestant, including works by Anselm of Canterbury and Bernard of Clairvaux. On the death of President Thomas Greneway (d. 1571), the library received sixty-three printed books, thirty-nine in original bindings, many theological, and Protestant, such as Luther's works. Thomson also discusses here the physical disposition of the library, including the organization of the sixteen desk-plus-seat units, some double-sided, accommodating between eleven and twenty-one books, on each side of a central aisle. The book order was unusual, beginning not with biblical, but ancient and modern, works in Greek and Latin on geography and astronomy; then ancient works, mainly Greek, on medicine and philosophy; Latin history; Greek and Latin rhetoric; Cicero; Greek literature; Latin literature; Greek and Latin grammar; and miscellaneous; then Bibles and Greek and Latin Fathers, before modern theology.

Colour illustrations, many full-page, support each lecture. They not only provide a taste of the library's treasures, but also a high-quality resource for the wider use of scholars of illumination, handwriting, early printing, marginal indexing and subscription, multilingual formats, and early bookbinding.

Four appendices add much of value—'Surviving Books from the College Library to 1589' (with shelf marks and grouped by donor); 'Letter of John Claymond to an Unidentified Old Friend' (with translation); 'Letter of Thomas Linacre to Claymond'; and 'Extracts from the College Accounts', from 1517 to 1599—as do the bibliography and index. Thomson's writing has a concise simplicity that makes reading the volume wholly pleasurable; his underlying scholarly rigour is always present.

JANET HADLEY WILLIAMS, *The Australian National University*

Vann, Theresa M., and Donald J. Kagay, *Hospitaller Piety and Crusader Propaganda: Guillaume Caoursin's Description of the Ottoman Siege of Rhodes, 1480*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 394; 10 b/w illustrations, 2 maps; R.R.P. £80.00; ISBN 9780754637417.

Theresa Vann and Donald Kagay's book *Hospitaller Piety and Crusader Propaganda: Guillaume Caoursin's Description of the Ottoman Siege of Rhodes, 1480* presents the first modern Latin edition with an English translation of the famous *Obsidionis Rhodiae urbis descriptio* (*Description of the Siege of Rhodes*), written by vice-chancellor of the Order of the Hospital, Guillaume Caoursin, and which is considered to be the first authorized account of the 1480 Ottoman siege of the island of Rhodes. Rhodes was the stronghold of the Order of the Hospital, commonly called the Knights Hospitaller, a religious military organization founded in Jerusalem after the First Crusade of 1099 on the basis of the previously existing community serving the city's hospital.

Also included are two eyewitness accounts by Grand Master Pierre D'Aubusson's *Relatio obsidionis Rhodie* and Jacobo Curte's *De Urbis Rhodiae obsidione a. 1480 a Turcis tentata* as well as the English translation of Ademar Dupis's *Le siège de Rhodes* and *Description of the Siege of Rhodes* by self-proclaimed poet to Edward IV, John Kay. Combined they create a compelling narrative of the Order of the Hospital, as much protector of Rhodes as it was protector of western Christendom.

The first couple of chapters ensure that the reader is able to contextualize the siege and the strategic importance of the Hospitallers on Rhodes. In Chapter 1 the reader is introduced to the historical background of the Order of the Hospital, detailing the evolution of the Hospitallers' organizational structure before moving through to set out a brief history of Rhodes, including the impact of the Ottoman siege and the strategic military as well as sociopolitical significance of the city. It is within this short chapter too that Mehmet II's intentions of Islamic expansion are introduced, with Hospitaller Order records from 1453 to 1480 suggesting that 'Mehmet could think of nothing else but the threat posed by the Knights

on Rhodes' (p. 9). Chapter 2, 'Danger from the Great Debt and the Great Turk 1453–1480', expands on Mehmet's ambitions, the resulting fall of Constantinople, and the increase of efforts to protect and fortify Rhodes. Chapter 2 is considerably detailed in presenting the complexities of funding such works and illustrates the delicate religious and political relationships required in order to meet the envisioned coming burden of assault.

Chapter 3, 'The Genesis of the *Descriptio*', provides keen insight into Caoursin's career in the Order and illustrates how 'he would have been aware of the power of rhetoric to persuade and command others' (p. 47), using this to his advantage when crafting the *Descriptio* and the way in which the Order was represented. Chapter 4 contains the collation of three separate printed Latin texts of Caoursin's work, the authors explaining the nuances found in each before moving through to presenting the *Descriptio*. Chapter 5 presents Pierre d'Aubusson's work relating it to a 'public letter reporting the news from the battlefield' (p. 149) rather than the more classical historical (and narrative driven) approach undertaken by Caoursin. Given the importance of Caoursin's work it is not surprising that it receives the bulk of attention by the authors.

Chapter 6 contains John Kay's text, with Vann and Kagay noting that his particular influences, such as his belief in the religious nature of the conflict (p. 179), may have shaped the narrative thus presented. Both Dupis and Curte's translations appear in chapters 7 and 8 respectively, with Dupis's original work noted for its rarity, with only three recorded copies worldwide. Vann and Kagay note the similarities between Dupis's work and Caoursin's text and provide the reader with comparisons, despite Dupis situating his text as his own retelling of the siege. In addition to these important texts, Vann and Kagay present selected magisterial bulls in a comprehensive appendix to further illuminate the inner workings of the Order in protecting Rhodes and safeguarding their reputation. These bulls provide fascinating insight into the preparations involved in the siege and indeed describe the siege itself—Vann notes that these have been taken from the archives of the Knights of Malta.

Vann and Kagay offer an exceptionally well-researched book that brings together archival documentation on Rhodes and the Order that presents eyewitness testimony of the siege and clearly illustrates the curation and development of the Knights' representation as defenders of Christendom. In collating the Latin editions and English translations of Caoursin, d'Aubusson, and Curte and supplementing these with texts of Kay and Dupis, Vann and Kagay's impressive work will contribute towards continued scholarly review of these works and allow historians to further study and contemplate presentations of the Order and the strategic religious and political importance of Rhodes.

SAMAYA BOROM, *Monash University*