

## Reviews

**Akhimie**, Patricia, and Bernadette **Andrea**, eds, *Travel and Travail: Early Modern Women, English Drama, and the Wider World* (Early Modern Cultural Studies), Lincoln/London, University of Nebraska Press, 2019; paperback; pp. 384; 3 b/w illustrations, 2 b/w maps; R.R.P. US\$35.00; ISBN 9781496202260.

I learned much from this collection of sixteen essays, in particular those in Part 1, which documents the travels of a handful of exceptional women within and between Europe and the Islamic world (Ann Broomfield Keeling, Mariam Khan, Teresa Sampsonia Sherley, Catherine Whetenall) and between America and Europe (Pocohontas). Their exploits are impressive, and their lives make for good reading. Part 2, which looks at women and travel in drama, has some outstanding contributions but was more uneven in terms of speculative arguments. Of the eight chapters, three deal with Desdemona in *Othello*, and the others with less obvious but nonetheless interesting targets such as Cleopatra, Marina in *Pericles* and The Empress in *The Blazing World*, Rosalind in *As You Like It*, and Bess in *The Fair Maid of the West*.

The aim of the collection is to demonstrate that, despite the ubiquitous bans on women's mobility in prescriptive literature, women did indeed travel overseas, and they participated in the era's expansionist projects (Introduction, 4). Richmond Barbour paves the way for this counter-argument to the conduct books in the opening chapter with a fascinating description of Mrs Keeling's travels with her husband, General William Keeling, in the East India Company. This very readable chapter provides ample evidence of support for wives on board for a range of reasons all ultimately in the interests of the company. Barbour uses Desdemona as an apt comparison. Michael Slater similarly presents documentary evidence to show that women such as Desdemona from elite circles were indeed expected to travel with their husbands. Given all the women in this collection are from these higher echelons of society is it necessary to justify their travels? Apparently yes. For contemporary biographers it remained obligatory to prove that feminine virtue, chastity and respectability were not incompatible with their female voyager. The two most common justifications for travel were love of husband and religious motivation. In the case of Teresa Sampsonia Sherley, a Circassian polyglot who travelled widely with her husband, the adventurer Robert Sherley, Carmen Nocentelli proposes her representation as a travelling *consort*, a gender-neutral term, overcame the usual sexual suspicions for female travellers. By drawing on European biographies Nocentelli uncovers a very different Sherley myth. Bernadette Andrea's essay focuses on Teresa's religious motivations by reference to a Carmelite relic she wore around her neck, a piece of flesh from

the body of St Teresa of Avila. The account of the relic's origins and subsequent 'career' makes for compelling reading. Most of the historical essays draw on archival records or biographies. One of the few to use personal travel writings is Laura Ambrose, whose careful analysis of Lady Anne Clifford's diaries and memoirs reveals how Clifford constructed her own image of herself not so much as a traveller but as moving between her estates. This also explains Clifford's use of the term 'remove' rather than 'journey' (p. 169). Mobility in fact becomes the primary means through which Clifford organizes and remembers her life (p. 171) and by which she continually claims her legal entitlement to her estates.

It is not possible to cover all sixteen contributions here, but the following stand out in Part 2. One is Laura Aydelotte's 'Mapping Women', which covers several plays, including *Othello*. Aydelotte traces the way male and female characters employ geographic names and what that says about the boundaries of their power within the world of the plays they inhabit (p. 182). This is part of a digital project, 'Shakespeare on the Map', to identify and map the place names in Shakespeare's plays and their gendered contexts. *The Taming of the Shrew* (not discussed by Aydelotte) is a good example of the value of this type of digital analytics: repeated references to Padua remind the audience of this centre of the study of medicine, and its relevance to Petruchio's treatment of Kate (see Ursula A. Potter, *The Unruly Womb*, Medieval Institute Publications, 2019). Also of interest is Suzanne Tartamella's use of intertextuality to illuminate Rosalind's travel in *As You Like It*. Tartamella turns to the Book of Ruth and a seventeenth-century epic poem, *Ruth Revived* (1639) to persuade us that Shakespeare's audience would have been familiar with the story and have understood the analogies. The documentary evidence is slight, but the argument is persuasive, so hopefully this will lead to further evidence of the influence of the story of Ruth in Shakespeare's time. Part 2 closes with Gawyn Moore's informed and articulate elucidation of *The Fair Maid of the West*, which, like Richard Barbour's opening essay, is a pleasure to read and serves as an excellent introduction to the field of travel and women in drama.

I commend this collection for achieving what its editors set out to do, that is to restore women travellers to visibility in the history of Shakespeare's era (p. 4).

URSULA A. POTTER, *The University of Sydney*

**Ashe, Laura, and Ralph Hanna**, eds, *Medieval and Early Modern Religious Cultures: Essays Honouring Vincent Gillespie on his Sixty-fifth Birthday*, Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2019; hardback; pp. xii, 284; 17 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843845294.

Vincent Gillespie, J. R. R. Tolkien Professor of English Language and Literature at the University of Oxford, has made enormous contributions to scholarship in the areas of literature and religious culture of Late Medieval and Early Modern England, not least of them his monumental work *Syon Abbey*, in the Corpus of British Medieval Library Catalogues series (British Academy, 2001). His scholarly output, fully catalogued in this volume, attests to his varied research

interests, and is all the more impressive when balanced against the demands of teaching, research supervision, and administration that fall upon the incumbent of the Tolkien Chair at Oxford.

The twelve essays of this volume, arranged into four chronological bands extending from ‘After Lateran IV: The Thirteenth Century’ to ‘Reform or Renewal? The Sixteenth Century’ (at least the earlier part of it), all connect well with Vincent’s own research interests, and in some cases respond to his work.

Annie Sutherland explores the tradition that Christ was born in a ‘house without walls, in the street’, which in the context of *Be Wohunge of ure Lauerde* is an apophatic space, invoked to challenge the anchorite, actually enclosed within ‘fowr wahes’ to mirror Christ in vulnerability to the world. Nicholas Watson explores the transmission and reception of Nicholas of Abingdon’s influential and widely disseminated *Mirror of the Holy Church*. Daniel Orton discusses Roger Bacon’s humanistic campaign and reassertion of the category of the poetic in response to scholastic disinterest in, if not hostility towards, poetry in thirteenth-century Paris and elsewhere.

The set of essays focused on the later fourteenth century begins with Anne Hudson’s study of Oxford, New College MS 67, an ‘Early Version’ copy of the Wycliffite Bible, but with distinctive revisions, including readings from the ‘Late(r) Version’ in the latter parts, from the Pauline epistles. While this manuscript seems to be an unusual departure from the usual tendency to avoid blending of versions in manuscript transmission, it warrants further attention in itself, along with attention to revisions in other manuscripts as yet only cursorily catalogued as ‘EV’ or ‘LV’. Michael Sargent proceeds in a similar vein, exploring the patterns of circulation of, and variation in, the two books of Walter Hilton’s English text of *The Scale of Perfection* and Thomas Fishlake’s Latin translation and transformation of the work. Barry Windeatt explores changing spiritual and cultural currents in post-Conquest English treatments of the Assumption of the Virgin in texts (including drama) and iconography, and the delicacy with which some accounts approach the questions of bodily resurrection, the nature of Mary’s death or ‘dormition’ and other aspects of the narrative details that accreted around the story.

Ian Johnson discusses the mediation of voices and discourses in the writing of Nicholas Love and Reginald Pecock, demonstrating how they reshaped their sources and spiritual discourses in distinctive ways. Susan Powell examines the textual material relating to Santa Zita (known in English as Saint Sithe), found in a later fifteenth-century English manuscript, now Biblioteca Statale di Lucca, MS 3540. Remarkably, a cult of this thirteenth-century saint from Lucca (a patron of domestic servants, and, in England at least, those who have lost keys) spread quite widely in later medieval England. Denis Renevey explores the contributions of Archbishop Thomas of Rotherham and Lady Margaret Beaufort to the popularization of devotion to the Holy Name of Jesus, which also forms the subject matter of a sermon Caxton added to his 1491 edition of John Mirk’s *Festial*.

In the last section of the book, Alexandra da Costa examines the changing early-Reformation contexts in which lay readers engaged in study of the Bible and devotional works in the vernacular, and the views on how such reading should be conducted, as expressed by Erasmus, Tyndale, More and others. Tamara Atkin explicates and discusses the 1553 inventory of a printer's stock, probably that of William Powell from The George, and its implications for the sale and circulation of orthodox devotional texts in the year of Edward VI's death and the accession of Mary. James P. Carley rounds off the collection with an investigation into John Leland's notes from Lord Mountjoy's lost manuscript of 'the annals of the mysterious John, Abbot of B.'

The volume concludes with an account of Vincent Gillespie's life and scholarly career (by Ralph Hanna), a bibliography of his publications, and an index. For scholars engaged in the field(s) embraced by the title this book will be indispensable. The acumen of the editors and contributors is complemented by the high standard of production by the publisher.

GREG WAITE, *University of Otago*

**Balzaretti**, Ross, *The Lands of Saint Ambrose: Monks and Society in Early Medieval Milan* (Studies in the Early Middle Ages, 44), Turnhout, Brepols, 2019; hardback; pp. xvii, 640; 17 b/w illustrations, 15 maps, 28 b/w tables; R.R.P. €130.00; ISBN 9782503509778.

In this monograph in two parts, Ross Balzaretti examines the early medieval legacy of the Monastery of Sant'Ambrogio both in Milan and in the wider hinterland. The monastery enters the historical record in the last decades of the eighth century as the first Carolingian monastic foundation south of the Alps. The monastery had a significant and influential heritage. Attached to the basilica built by church father Bishop Ambrose of Milan (c. 337/340–397) to house the martyr relics of Gervasius and Protasius (and where Ambrose himself was eventually interred), the monastery came to be a significant player within patronage networks in early medieval Italy and Francia. Balzaretti examines the surviving charters attached to the monastery to narrate a 'thick description' of the processes by which religious and secular negotiated networks of ownership in the eighth, ninth, and tenth centuries. The first part focuses on Milan, while the second engages with Milan's hinterland. The result is an observation of the profound and dynamic connection between town and country in this period, and the increasing and contested role of monasticism in this connection.

Balzaretti begins by examining and contextualizing the evidence: the surviving charter collection held at Sant'Ambrogio. The approach is both descriptive and historiographical, placing the charter collection in complex discussions framed around authenticity, and noting the importance of the collection as constructs or 'dossiers' rather than 'ad hoc' voices. Subsequently, Balzaretti moves into a brief discussion of the contested nature of early medieval 'urbanism' through an examination of the archaeology of the Po Valley. This methodology is then

repeated for the reception of Bishop Ambrose himself, emphasizing the impact of the church father on both Milan and the wider landscape.

Having established the context, Balzaretti moves to the Monastery of Sant’Ambrogio and its place within Milanese society. Internal and external sources are utilized to describe both the history of Milan in the early medieval period, and the history of monasticism in Milan in the same period. The evidence for the transition from Roman imperial capital to a medieval metropolis is limited, and it is only with the earliest charter evidence for the eighth century that Balzaretti is able to engage with positioning the Monastery of Sant’Ambrogio in the urban landscape. Sant’Ambrogio’s foundation is placed in 784–789 in the context of Charlemagne’s conquests. This royal connection set in train significant patronage for the monastery in the following centuries, but also, as Balzaretti points out, the monastery became a ‘pinch point’ for royal intrigue. Balzaretti traces the gifts to the monastery from the charter evidence over the next 250 years, detailing the urban networks of power and their relationship with estates in the hinterland. He marshals this evidence to confirm Milan’s status as a ‘real city’ with a distinct urban society in the early medieval period.

In the second part, Balzaretti moves to situating the Monastery of Sant’Ambrogio in the hinterland of Milan, utilizing the charter evidence as dossiers that establish and connect communities. A brief overview of the history of the ‘manorial system’ in Italy is followed by an examination of the monastery’s relationship with the estates of Campione, Gnignano and Colgono, Valtellina, and Limonta and Inzago, all in the Po valley or on the lakes of Como or Lugano. This is, perhaps, the most effective part of Balzaretti’s monograph. His emphasis on charter collections as dossiers gives voices to communities and the profound changes to society caused by increasing land gifts to monastic foundations. Legal charters detail increasing monastic control leading to profound tensions between religious and secular over ownership and roles. It also details the profound interactivity between religious and secular, with the majority of monastic holdings being worked by the laity.

The presentation of this monograph as a work in two parts speaks to structural issues that can impede the reader’s access to the rich detail. The assessment of early medieval Milan often calls on complex interpretations of limited and ambiguous evidence and the later charter evidence is sometimes ‘depersonalized’ when placed within grander narratives. The charter evidence for the hinterland, however, is rich in connections and more clearly applied to the intimate contexts. It is the latter half of the monograph where the notion of ‘dossiers’ laid out at the start illuminates our view of early medieval communities and how they operated; the former half appears to be over-contextualized, and the charter evidence lost in broader thematic arguments.

The complex nature of monastic patronage and the profound changes to society, as evidenced here in a northern Italian context in the eighth, ninth, and tenth centuries, adds witness to the profound changes wrought by the institution

of monasticism in the medieval period. Balzarretti brings a wealth of evidence to this complex picture, and, indeed, advances our understanding. However, in attempting to directly foreground this later period with a detailed and sometimes abstracted vision of its past, the monograph arguably attempts ‘a bridge too far’. This reader would have welcomed two monographs rather than one.

STEPHEN JOYCE, *Monash University*

**Bartlett**, Robert, ed. and trans., *Gerald of Wales: Instruction for a Ruler (De Principis Instructione)* (Oxford Medieval Texts Series), Oxford, Clarendon Press, 2018; cloth; pp. lxx, 801; R.R.P. £125.00; ISBN 9780198738626.

Robert Bartlett is a well-known luminary of British medieval studies, and his recent edition and translation of Gerald of Wales’s *De principis instructione* for the Oxford Medieval Texts Series does not disappoint. Gerald himself is, of course, one of the most colourful writers of the Middle Ages, and though his works on Ireland and Wales are apparently read more often (both then and now), the *De principis instructione* is a valuable source for a variety of aspects of late twelfth-century British history and culture. As is typical of Gerald’s work, the text commences with a particular program, and then—through a process of revision, adaptation, and expansion—becomes a hodge-podge compilation of the author’s thoughts about a variety of disconnected topics. It is valuable for its depiction of royal values, its anecdotes, its often vituperative portrayal of court life and the Angevin kings, and other contemporary events. The work survives in only a single fourteenth-century manuscript from the Cotton collection (Julius B XIII), while Bartlett prints its original preface from another manuscript (Cambridge, Trinity College MS R. 7. II). The present form is a revision made probably in 1216–17 of a lost original written *c.* 1191. Gerald originally published the first of three books only, apparently due to fears that his vituperations of the Angevins would land him in hot water. What alterations were made between *c.* 1191 and 1216–17 are matters for speculation.

Book 1, forming roughly half of the text by volume, is structured around princely virtues: patience, modesty, prudence, bravery, generosity, and so on. However, as Bartlett notes, ‘what [Gerald] liked best was telling stories’ (p. xxiii). And so there are stories about Edward the Confessor, Thomas Becket, the Scots and Picts, the ‘discovery’ of the tomb of Arthur and Guinevere, and more. The work bears some similarities to Walter Map’s *De nugis curialium* and John of Salisbury’s *Policraticus*; at times sharing stories and common sources, in general the three works evidence a courtly milieu attracted to that curious mélange of history, morality, and legend that so characterizes the second half of the twelfth century. Books 2 and 3 concern English and French politics, and here the author shows his preference for the French dynasty as compared to the Angevin. There are valuable details about the later years of King Henry II (r. 1154–89).

Nevertheless, the material is scattered, repetitive, and sometimes difficult to interpret. Books 2 and 3 also include discussions of the Holy Land, particularly

Eraclius's visit to Europe in 1184–85, the fall of Jerusalem to Ṣalāḥ al-Dīn in 1187, and the campaign of Holy Roman Emperor Frederick I ('Barbarossa'). The work ends seditiously with an expression of hope that the French kings will unite 'two or three kingdoms' and offer liberty, but 'the hope was not able to come to fruition' (p. 733) because God became angry after the Angevins' attacks against the church.

Of much interest is Gerald's attitude to King Henry II. He attacks Henry unreservedly for his assault on Thomas Becket and says that Henry's sons' rebellions were divine vengeance for the murder (p. 669). Gerald bemoans the deferment of Henry's crusade, and says that his funding of monasteries as recompense was done under a deceitful pretext (p. 467). Gerald strongly repudiates Henry's mocking welcome of the news that Eraclius was arriving to request support for the Kingdom of Jerusalem (pp. 531–33)—he depicts Henry as selfish, accusing Eraclius of wanting a crusade for his own benefit. Gerald also regrets Henry's blasphemies (pp. 615, 661) and his attempt to delay Richard from setting out on crusade (pp. 593–95). The sometime contact he had with the king and other powerful people, and his unique perspective, make the text invaluable.

Bartlett's translation is competent and accurate, though at times it sacrifices literalism for readability (for better or for worse). His introduction is lucid, concise, and thorough. This book is a scholarly achievement, the culmination of decades of work on Gerald and on medieval British history more broadly. It would suit the shelf of anyone interested in Gerald, medieval Britain, twelfth-century court culture, or the Angevins.

KEAGAN BREWER, *The University of Sydney*

**Bath**, Michael, *Emblems in Scotland: Motifs and Meanings*, Leiden/Boston, Brill Rodopi, 2018; hardback; pp. xxviii, 346; 191 colour figures; R.R.P. €125.00, US\$150.00; ISBN 9789004364059.

From its Latin and Greek roots, the sense of 'emblem' was 'inlaid work'; by the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, it was 'symbol', 'type'. In that linguistic evolution, as Michael Bath notes in his Preface, Alciato's *Emblematum liber* (1531)—its use of a woodcut illustration of moral, proverbial or political ideas, with a Latin motto above, and a verse epigram below—was crucial as the model for the many later emblem books (Whitney, Montenay, Batilly, Farley, and Quarles).

The foundation of Bath's study is the magnificent Stirling Maxwell Collection of emblem books at Glasgow University Library. His eight chronologically arranged essays reflect this Scottish context, especially in architectural example. In their explorations of the use and transmission of emblems, however, the essays range widely across different terrains, including cultural and political relations, Christian iconography, court ceremonies, and Modernist garden design. Translations throughout, of the Latin, Greek, and French inscriptions and distichs quoted in the text, notes, and captions, are of great assistance, as are the numerous well-placed illustrations.

The first chapter examines the meaning of a fool's-capped man, who lurks behind King Herod's shoulder, within the fifteenth-century Crucifixion scene painted on the rood screen at St Marnock's Church, Fowlis Easter, Angus. Bath's many European examples of similar figures are contextualizing. In his discussion of the 'Jester Figure' (pp. 7–22) switching between the word 'jester' (a professional fool) and 'fool' (simpleton or, biblically, an impious person), both twists and informs the argument.

The emblematic links between three women, Christine de Pisan, Georgette de Montenay, and Esther Inglis, are the matter of Chapter 2. Bath draws on the previous work of Alison Saunders, Alison Adams, and Marie-Claude Tucker, adding to it, notably on portraiture (pp. 31–34); and with Susan Groag Bell's innovative research on the *City of Dames* tapestries, his observations usefully confirming hers.

In Chapter 3, Bath identifies Guillaume de la Perrière's *Morosophie* ('The Wisdom of Folly', 1553) as the hitherto unknown source of a motto over the now-demolished fireplace at Castle Ruthven (Huntingtower). The accompanying woodcut introduces a wider discussion (acknowledging Saxl and Iwaki) of the topic *Veritas filia temporis*. There are valuable Scottish examples here, and in the related study of the more doctrinally difficult emblem, *In utrumque paratus*, including Skelmorlie's funerary ceiling (1636), and Rossend Castle's painted ceiling.

Chapter 4 examines ceremonies associated with royal baptisms (James VI, 1566; Henry, 1594), the first through its illustration of the phrase *Anglici caudati* ('all Englishmen have tails'), the second via William Fowler's *True Reportarie*. There is confusion at p. 87. Bath cites a letter of 1517, from James V—or, since James was then five, Governor Albany—to Pope Leo. It refers to matters relating to the previous Pope, Julius, who died in 1513, and to the king's older half-brother, Alexander Stewart, killed at Flodden in 1513, thus not alive in 1517 as Bath assumes.

The country house built at Pinkie in 1613 by Alexander Seton, Earl of Dunfermline, and its relationship to its historic site (where the 1547 battle repudiated the Treaty of Greenwich and union with England), is the subject of Chapter 5. Attempting to understand the man and his villa, Bath has identified Seton's books (Vredeman, Du Cerceau, Vaenius, Blaise de Vignière, Lebey de Batilly and others) and studied the villa's external inscriptions and the Long Gallery's painted Neostoic emblems.

Chapter 6 begins with a rare contemporary (1618) response to the use of emblems: the account of how Church of Scotland minister, Patrick Simson, was encouraged on his deathbed by his brother to remember those emblems decorating the walls of his manse (Holy Rude Kirk, Stirling). His recollections included their source, 'Pierus', Pierio Valeriano's 1556 *Hieroglyphica* (an expansion of Horapollo's Egyptian lexicon to incorporate the major Christian iconologies). Bath shows how the (reformed) climate of Simson's day affected the use of these emblems.

Chapter 7 examines the Scottish gravestones, in Fife but also further north, which drew on Francis Quarles's 1635 *Emblemes*. Bath looks, too, at stonemason John Service, carver of those in the Stirling graveyard near Simson's manse; at unnamed carvers who consulted Quarles in their work; and at earlier Scottish sculptural and painted uses, such as those at Caerlaverock Castle and Gardyne's House, Dundee, noting both Protestant and Catholic settings.

In the final chapter, Bath's focus on the work of Scottish writer and visual artist Ian Hamilton Finlay shows how the emblem has survived to be relevant into the present, though still aware of its past: Finlay's *Heroic Emblems* alludes to Paradin's *Devises heroïques*, 1551, for example; just as his garden, Little Sparta, combines carvings of modern warfare vehicles—the tank, for instance—with ancient mottos, such as 'Semper festina lente'.

*Emblems in Scotland* is dense at times, but Bath's research, in an area not so well known, is worthwhile.

JANET HADLEY-WILLIAMS, *The Australian National University*

**Bepler, Jill, and Svante Norrhem, eds, *Telling Objects: Contextualizing the Role of the Consort in Early Modern Europe*, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz, 2017; cloth; pp. 269; 19 b/w illustrations, 59 colour plates. R.R.P. €70.00, US\$67.00; ISBN 9783447109352.**

This lavishly illustrated book provides a visual complement to the rich scholarship expounded in this edited collection. The book's purpose is to examine roles that foreign consorts 'could assume in processes of cultural exchange and cultural transfer within Europe during the period 1500–1800' (p. 9). As the book's title suggests, the focus is on the objects that the female consorts brought with them and exchanged rather than the consorts themselves. These 'telling objects' emphasize the importance of cultural transfer and cultural exchange as central to the role of the consort who was the 'foreign' wife in her husband's court. The courts examined include one each from England (Palumbo), Italy (Modesti), and Portugal (Lopes), but the majority focus on northern Europe, particularly Austria, Denmark, and Germany, as well as on lesser known courts such as Poland. Its span is the late sixteenth century to the eighteenth century.

The first section on 'cultural transfer and exchange' contains two chapters that provide overviews of key themes. The first emphasizes the consort and her retinue as key agents of cultural transfer because of their different language and customs, which could influence the court of her spouse greatly. Unlike objects belonging to her husband, which tended to remain in the same place tied to his dynasty, hers were constantly on the move. Bauer makes the important observation that the objects themselves are gendered because of their owners' patterns of usage.

Almut Bues describes a key source for research on these 'telling objects': inventories. At key points in the life cycle of these female consorts, inventories of their objects are compiled: at marriage, widowhood, remarriage, and death, each an opportunity for cultural transfer of objects or exchange and their movement.

Focusing on specific genres and materials used for cultural transfer, the next section discusses how female consorts created an international image of themselves and their courts through various types of cultural patronage. These types are portraiture (MacLeod); English book collecting (Palumbo) and fashion and textiles (Modesti). Cultural power became political power.

Precious objects are indeed precious when they are imbued with dynastic, religious, and scientific significance and become 'objects transformed'. In the case of fragments from the True Cross, its transformation meant that this relic carried different meanings for two sisters from the French branch of the Gonzaga: both religious and scientific (Kociszewska). The sumptuous golden horn symbolized a bilateral cultural exchange between Copenhagen and Dresden, where the princess of Saxony was able as a widow of a Danish prince to keep a precious bejewelled horn that was then reworked with her own jewellery prior to remarriage and was later inherited by another female through matrilineal inheritance (Wade).

The last and longest section explores gift culture. The exchange of gifts had a number of purposes: to initiate relationships, develop networks, solidify relationships and alliances. Gifts given by princely husband and wife couples often had the arms of both inscribed on the gift, or if not their family's coat of arms then each of their initials. This type of gift indicated that the spouses were collaborating as a 'working couple'. Many of these gifts were small and included foodstuffs, plants, animals, and birds (Keller). The remaining essays on gift culture focus on substantial single objects or collections of objects during the 1700s. Meissen porcelain tableware in Chinese Ming dynasty style was a valued princely gift for display rather than use (Cassidy-Geiger). The luxury coach that brought Anna of Austria from Vienna to Lisbon allowed her to be seen during her bridal journey, and its use during her marriage signified its prestige as a part of Anna's cultural heritage and as a gift. (Lopes). The gift of an ivory egg, inside of which is another golden egg with a hen and a tiny gift, was a precious jewel whose gifting between Danish princesses inspired similar jewels as Easter gifts from rulers to their consorts. This tradition spread as far east as Tsarist Russia in the nineteenth century, with the Tsar commissioning Easter egg gifts for the Tsarina by Nicolas Fabergé (Marschner).

This is a very useful scholarly collection, which could have benefited from tighter editing to avoid the constant repetition of the same ideas needlessly in several chapters. The style of documentation is also a bit confusing, mixing in-text sourcing of non-English quotations in one chapter with footnoting the text in another. However, these are minor quibbles about a book that will delight the eye and also provide much food for thought about the role of a consort and the material culture she brought with her upon marriage, received or gifted to others, including the transmission of objects via the maternal line in early modern Europe.

NATALIE TOMAS, *Monash University*

**Boulton**, Meg, and Michael D. J. **Bintley**, eds, *Insular Iconographies: Essays in Honour of Jane Hawkes*, Woodbridge, Boydell Press, 2019; hardback; pp. xvi, 254; 12 colour plates, 31 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781783274116.

Professor Jane Hawkes will be a figure familiar, in person or in print, to most Anglo-Saxon scholars. In a career not yet over, despite the appearance of a volume in her honour, Hawkes has made an immense contribution to the study of Anglo-Saxon stone sculpture, and Anglo-Saxon art more broadly, with her cosmopolitan and interdisciplinary approach. One of her crowning achievements appeared recently: *Volume XIII: Derbyshire and Staffordshire*, produced in conjunction with Philip Sidebottom, in the British Academy series *Corpus of Anglo-Saxon Stone Sculpture* (2018).

*Insular Iconographies* consists of twelve papers by the honouree's own research students or examinees, many now early-career scholars in academic posts. These papers emerged from a symposium held at York, UK, in 2015. Giving voice to young scholars in this way is indeed a fitting enterprise for acknowledging a scholar who has guided and fostered postgraduate students so well throughout her career.

Several papers focus on individual Christian stone monuments and explicate them in varying ways. Most take a broad interdisciplinary view, encompassing comparanda from the stone corpus and other art media, placing objects in socio-cultural context, and exploring the depths of religious and scriptural reference that underpin the sculptural programs. Carolyn Twomey examines the baptismal font at Wilne, repurposed from a section of a cross column; Colleen M. Thomas explicates a vine scroll panel from the South Cross at Kells; Elizabeth Alexander discusses the Old Testament scenes (relatively rare in the corpus of stone sculpture) on the Newent Cross, and in particular the scene of Abraham and Isaac. Meg Boulton explores the interplay of scenes on the fragmentary Rothbury Cross, focusing on the panel that appears on the book cover—a host of angels looking down at the hellish scenes depicted at the foot of the same side of the cross.

In one of the most outstanding papers of the book, the appropriately named Heidi Stoner surveys the tradition of stone sculpture on the Isle of Man, and the problematic history of scholarship pertaining to it. She raises important theoretical questions about the traditional methodologies of periodization, localization, and classification in relation to the study of sculpture more broadly within the British Isles, as well as on Man itself. Another impressively broad-ranging paper is Tom Pickles's 'Conversion, Ritual, and Landscape: *Streoneshalh* (Whitby), *Osingadun*, and the Anglo-Saxon Cemetery at Street House, North Yorkshire'. His main point of departure is the high-status female bed-burial, which, he argues, signals a kin group's response to the new role of females, particularly aristocratic ones, dedicated to God in the 640s and 650s, rather than being required to conform to the traditional patterns in their society.

The remaining papers deal with textual or other art-historical topics. Michael Bintley neatly combines consideration of the role of stones and sculpture in Anglo-Saxon society with the accounts of stone and marble messengers in the poem *Andreas*. Michael Brennan considers Alcuin's possible authorship of the *Propositiones*, only to confirm the pseudo-Alcuinian status of the text. He nevertheless provides an illuminating discussion of the mathematical tradition at the Carolingian court, and Alcuin's involvement with it. Harry Stirrup examines the unusual Hell Mouth Initial of the twelfth-century Laud Bible; Mags Mannion provides a survey of Irish glass beads, their production and decorative motifs; and Melissa Herman discusses the iconography of the human face in pre-Christian Anglo-Saxon art.

One or two papers might have benefited from a little more pruning and compression, but collectively the contributions offered here offer much that is new and interesting, and many will be essential reading for those in the field. The editors have been meticulous in their work, and I noted only a couple of small errors in references.

GREG WAITE, *University of Otago*

**Briggs, Charles F., and Peter S. Eardley, eds, *A Companion to Giles of Rome* (Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition, 71), Leiden, Brill, 2016; e-book; pp. xii, 319; R.R.P. US\$194.00, €157.00; ISBN 9789004315396.**

Giles of Rome has never quite made the A-list. Machiavelli, typecast as the Eminem of medieval political thought, enjoys instant name recognition alongside a reputation for being occasionally offensive. Aquinas, on the other hand, remains an enigmatic Beyoncé-esque figure; even those who have not dived deeply into his back catalogue recognize both his genius and his influence. If constructing a taxonomy of late medieval celebrity, Giles, however, would be a Lloyd Cole-like figure. This is, in part, because, despite a semi-dramatic shift in style late in his career, his work is marked by strong underlying themes. In the context of this slightly stretched metaphor, however, the most important point is that, beyond a devoted and knowledgeable fan-base, his name is likely to invoke hazy recollection among some over-forties while leaving most to reach for Google. While this *Companion* is unlikely to change that, it is not only a welcome addition to the shelves of those interested in late medieval thought, but a notable reminder of Giles's influence among his contemporaries.

Today, Giles is probably best-known as a so-called papal hierocrat. His *De ecclesiastica potestate* sits alongside the work of James of Viterbo as the intellectual underpinning of Pope Boniface VIII's ultimately disastrous attempt to pit papal theory against the reality of Capetian power at the start of the fourteenth century. A few decades earlier, Giles wrote what would become the most influential mirror of princes in the Middle Ages for the man who became Boniface's most implacable foe, King Philip IV. At the same time, Giles was the

dominant intellectual force within the Augustinian order, a university master, an archbishop, and a voice in favour of suppressing the Templars. As one of the editors, Charles Briggs, explains in the first chapter, the last thirty years have seen a renewed interest in Giles and his work. This entry in Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition series capitalizes and builds on this research to provide a rounded introduction. Following Briggs's overview of Giles's life, works, and legacy, seven chapters explore his approach to, respectively, theology; natural philosophy; metaphysics; cognition; ethics and moral psychology; logic, rhetoric, and language; and political thought.

Overall, the chapters are of an extremely high quality, written by leading experts in the field. Together, they draw attention to two questions: the degree to which Giles's thought was shaped by Aristotle, Augustine, and Aquinas, and the extent to which Giles himself stepped beyond his influences. They nuance our understanding while underlining strongly, as Roberto Lambertini highlights (p. 273), that drawing a simplistic dichotomy between Augustinianism and Aristotelianism is highly misleading. Generally speaking, the editorial quality is high. The book is equipped with excellent bibliographies and a comprehensive index. I spotted only one obvious typo (p. 13, n. 31: the date should read 1293, not 1393) and two cases of repeated words in Chapter 6. Nevertheless, it should be said that the formal introduction (pp. 1–5) is perfunctory; it is little more than a series of abstracts. Further, while most chapters include the Latin source material in their notes, Richard Cross's discussion of Giles's theology (Chapter 2) does not. Editorial intervention here would have ensured greater consistency. Constantino Marmo's contribution (Chapter 7), while drawing attention to Giles as the first medieval commentator on Aristotle's *Rhetoric* and offering analysis of his much-neglected commentary on the *Posterior Analytics*, like Chapter 2, ends abruptly without any summing up. This seems out of step with the volume as a whole. It is also unclear why Chapter 5 (Giorgio Pini's 'Cognition') restricts itself to Giles's mature thought, while Chapter 6 (Peter Eardley's 'Ethics and Moral Psychology') takes a—welcome—longer view.

Inevitably, specialists will find points of contention in individual essays. Lambertini's discussion of Giles's political thought, is, for example, stimulating and comprehensive. Nevertheless, I would respectfully disagree with his assertion that Richard Scholz's 1929 edition of *De ecclesiastica potestate* remains 'unsurpassed' (p. 267). Robert Dyson's 2004 edition employs all five extant fourteenth-century manuscripts, whereas Scholz relied upon four closely related texts. In addition to introducing Cremona, Biblioteca Governativa MS 81, Dyson corrects a number of Scholz's misreadings, and provides the treatise with a new, much expanded, and improved apparatus as well as an updated English translation. But this is a minor quibble, not a serious criticism: Lambertini's chapter highlights how recent research has nuanced our understanding of the complexity of Giles's political ideas and I will certainly recommend it to my own students. Of the book, as a whole, there are areas that individual readers will wish to have seen expanded:

Briggs's discussions of both Giles's episcopal career and his later influence are but two such cases for me. This is not, however, a criticism but a call to further research. Overall, the volume is exactly what a good companion should be: informed and thought-provoking.

CHRIS JONES, *University of Canterbury*

**Burger**, Glenn D., *Conduct Becoming: Good Wives and Husbands in the Later Middle Ages* (Middle Ages Series), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2017; hardback; pp. 272; 4 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £54.00; ISBN 9780812249606.

This book is a challenging and important contribution to the understanding of 'thinking' in the later Middle Ages. Analysing the purpose of texts that focus on the behaviour of women and men is fraught with difficulty in the context of twenty-first-century feminism. Frequently, I found myself rising to challenge Glenn D. Burger's paradigms, only to have him add another, richer layer of interpretation.

The book is logically constructed. Burger lays the foundations of the study by identifying the significance of texts that move the 'good wife front and center' (p. 2) to become a model; the negotiation of new social responsibilities that this opens up; and the fusion of new and old ideologies that can be observed in the texts. One implication of such texts is the transformation of morality to ethics.

Burger sets the scene for the analysis and examination of specific texts with a discussion of embodied reading, where the action of reading itself helps to bring about the sought-after behaviour. He argues several ideas that build on each other: that an affective contract lies at the core of medieval developments in thinking about marriage as a sacrament; that conduct literature for women 'mainstreamed' thinking about married relations and households and transmitted this across Europe and across social classes during the fourteenth century; that literature aimed at the good wife provides the context for 'a new model of heterosexuality' (p. 24); that love of the marrying kind constituted an affective, rather than an erotic or feudal, contract, and that this kind of love 'empowered new forms of social activity' (p. 24).

Burger further argues that conduct texts had the capacity to reconfigure female identity, which, in turn, created a space for a new authority for men as husbands and fathers, creating new patterns of social recognition and engagement. Consequently, this literature provides 'a powerful medium for such a rethinking of gender and sexual relations' (p. 25). He presents this conduct literature as a hinge, or turning point, between marriage as it had been known and developed during the medieval period, and the beginning of a new understanding of heterosexuality that can be seen emerging during the early modern period. Central to this notion is the transformative power of the 'reversioning of female embodiment' (p. 26) and the tension which this generates within the social context.

Burger then analyses specific texts, each of which adds a further layer to his interpretation of the role of conduct literature as determining functions and

behaviours within both the family and wider society. Such texts as the *Journées chrétiennes* provide a recognized role for women beyond that of an enclosed religious life (Chapter 1). *Les Enseignements de Saint Louis à sa fille Isabelle*, the *Speculum dominarum*, and *Le Miroir des bonne femmes* present a new belief in the capacity of women's nature for improvement, just as men are capable of improvement. They reflect changing marital relations and authorize the aristocratic household as 'a new model for the social' (p. 31; Chapter 2). Burger then uses *Le Menagier de Paris*, a household book, to examine what happens when the newly understood social function of marriage, as constructed via conduct literature, is played out in an urban merchant's household. The bedchamber becomes the rehearsal space for the more public playing out of the couple's marriage, which centres on the good conduct of the wife under the authority of her husband (Chapter 3). The final layer added by Burger is a discussion of the earliest iterations of the Griselda story. Boccaccio and Petrarch's versions are examined, as well as Philippe de Mézière's French translation, and the inclusion of this into *Le Livre de la vertu du sacrement de mariage* and Chaucer's *Clerk's Tale*. In these texts, shaping narratives of the good woman becomes a privileged way of describing and determining conduct (Chapter 4).

While Burger observes that conduct literature existed within situations of power imbalance, he never tackles head-on the questions of control, power, and misogyny that can be seen so close to the surface. Rather, his focus is on how these texts were read by women as empowering in their recognition of the feminine, and their creation of a social and ethical role for the married woman. His overarching interpretation is that conduct literature presents the experience of affect in marriage and the embodiment of cognition as ethics. He concludes by teasing out the implications of this for literary production, studies on affect and the history of emotions, and the history of marriage, gender, and sexuality. This is a scholarly work rich in ideas and insight that offers new ways of engaging with late-medieval thinking and feeling.

MARY-ROSE McLAREN, *Victoria University, Melbourne*

**Burgess**, Glyn S., and Douglas **Kelly**, trans., *The Roman de Troie by Benoît de Sainte-Maure* (Gallica, 41), Woodbridge, D. S. Brewer, 2017; hardback; pp. viii, 475; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781843844693.

**Ferrante**, Joan M., and Robert W. **Hanning**, trans., *The Romance of Thebes* (Roman de Thèbes) (The French of England Translation Series, 11), Tempe, AZ, Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2018; hardback; pp. viii, 365; R.R.P. US\$74.00; ISBN 9780866985864.

The *Roman de Thèbes* and *Roman de Troie* first appeared in the period 1150–1170, within the cultural ambience of Henry II's and Eleanor of Aquitaine's dominions. These *romans antiques*, based on classical and later Latin sources, were popular

and influential. As the translators of the *Roman de Troie* remark, against the forty-five known manuscripts that contain one of the romances of Chrétien de Troyes, now much better known, there are fifty-eight for Benoît's poem, including thirty with the complete text—all 30,300 lines of it. The anonymous *Roman de Thèbes* survives in six manuscripts and also remained well known: when Pandarus visits Criseyde in Chaucer's *Troilus and Criseyde* he finds her with her ladies in a 'paved parlour' listening to a 'romance of Thebes' that is likely to be a version of this poem.

The *Roman de Thèbes* probably appeared somewhat before the *Roman de Troie*. It is based on the *Thebaid* of Statius, written around 91 CE, surviving in over 100 manuscripts, and widely studied in the medieval period. Dante movingly introduces Statius into *Purgatorio* 21, and Chaucer adapted the *Thebaid*'s closing tribute to Virgil in a passage at the end of his own *Troilus*. Statius's epic is a noted horror story, in which war stemming from unnatural brotherly hatred brings the participants, just and unjust alike, to a bad end. The translators show that the *Roman* reduces much descriptive detail in the classical text, plays down the role of the gods, emphasizes 'feudal and courtly' elements in the narrative, and favours the Greek side in the war as surrogate Christians. More generally, they give an excellent short overview of how the *romans antiques* 'translated' ancient works into their own cultural milieu. The translation is based on a version in a later fourteenth-century manuscript, London, British Library, MS Add. 34114, also including crusades material, and clearly associated with Henry Despenser, Bishop of Norwich 1370–1406, and a noted soldier. There is detailed discussion of this connection, drawing on Christopher Baswell's research to suggest that it served the 'battling bishop' 'as an exercise in compensatory nostalgia, recuperating disappointment and disaster through the filter of narratives of crusading and chivalric glory'.

The *Roman de Troie* boldly reworked late classical anti-Homeric supposed eye-witness accounts of the Trojan War by Dares Phrygius and Dictys Cretensis, unbiased observers from the Trojan and Greek camps respectively. These works, originally written in Greek but known in Latin versions, were thought to be historically reliable, unlike those of the 'lying' poets. In this first-ever English translation, Glyn Burgess and Douglas Kelly expertly summarize what Benoît did with his originals—he prided himself on adding his own *bons dits*—and offer a helpful overview and outline of the narrative, with its nineteen battles, along with an appendix discussing key narrative terms, and indexes to names and places. They too stress the confidence with which the *Roman* assimilates ancient 'history' into familiar cultural and political norms, without fear of anachronism; Troy, even more than Thebes, was a truly 'contemporary' twelfth-century matter. The Introduction, organized by themes—including historiography, causality, trauma, *cortiesie* and its ambiguities, women in war, and the gods—gives necessary information on these matters to readers poised on the brink of the abundant text.

The two volumes take interestingly different approaches to translation. Ferrante and Harding render the *Roman de Thèbes* line by line in prose: ‘It was May, in the morning | that Polynices rode away. | Polynices rode alone, | deep in thought and afraid | for he does not know for certain | where he can go safely’. This inevitably loses the poise and elegance of the original’s octosyllabic couplets, giving a rougher, edgier feel, but it has the virtues of clarity and speed, and it keeps the characteristic switches from past to present tense that seem to invite us closer to the action. Burgess and Kelly necessarily set out their much longer poem in prose paragraphs. They choose to keep it all in the past tense, and in a more formal register. Theirs is also a readable text, although without the braking and balancing effects of the original’s rhyme and metre it becomes rather more like a *historia*, of the kind Guido delle Colonne later made of Benoît, than a *roman* written for listeners: ‘The Greeks had succeeded in their effort and they went back happy in high spirits. They had sustained losses among their troops, but, as is customary in such conflicts, those who lose later win’.

Both poems are of major importance and influence in the history of Western vernacular narrative, daunting in their length (especially Benoît’s) and difficult of access for many readers. These learned and informative translations are therefore extremely welcome contributions to medieval studies.

ANDREW LYNCH, *The University of Western Australia*

**Butler**, Katherine, and Samantha **Bassler**, eds, *Music, Myth and Story in Medieval and Early Modern Culture* (Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music), Woodbridge, Boydell Press, 2019; hardback; pp. xiv, 318; 5 b/w plates, 10 colour plates; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781783273713.

The essays in *Music, Myth and Story in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* examine how the conceptual understanding of myth, story, and music changed through the medieval and early modern period. Each essay investigates an area of connection between these three concepts through some of the less-studied allegorical narratives and musical materials produced and performed during this extended period. While the individual chapters showcase strong interdisciplinary methodology, it is the tight orientation of the contributions towards two thematic streams that raises the whole above the usual miscellaneous nature of an edited volume.

The collection is divided into seven sections that broadly address two themes: myth/story in relation to either musical theory and philosophy or musical performance and practice. The sections are arranged chronologically, from the fifth century to the early eighteenth century. This allows the two themes to be addressed multiple times, effectively illustrating how these concepts changed over time. The editors mitigate the breadth of chronology by limiting the geographic coverage to Italy and England.

Section 1, with essays by John MacInnis, Ferdia Stone-Davis, and Elina Hamilton, addresses the theme of myth and the philosophy of music through

studies of the melding of classical and biblical myth to conceptualize music as a reflection of celestial harmony and as a force exercised by humanity to maintain this harmony. Hamilton's essay is especially effective in highlighting the repercussions of this worldview through her study of the influence of origin myths on identity-creation in late medieval England. In Section 3, Jacomiens Prins argues that the popularity of the Orpheus myth is a result of the flexibility it afforded writers to justify music's positive moral and intellectual influence within the changing philosophical framework of Renaissance Italy. Katherine Butler furthers Hamilton's examination of musical origins through a study of interrelated biblical and classical myths that justified the moral action of music in early modern England. In Section 6, Katie Bank provides a novel study of how myth and satire play a similar literary role in navigating the relationship between reality and fiction. Aurora Faye Martinez brings the conversation on musical philosophy back to the allegorical use of biblical myths to understand the human relationship with sin through Matthew Locke's musical setting of Marvell's 'Dialogue between Thyrsis and Dorinda'.

The theme of myth and story in relation to musical performance begins with Section 2, in which Jason Stoessel examines musical iconology/graphy through to the Renaissance, with a fascinating study of the depictions of *musica*/Musica in a variety of artforms in Western Europe. Tim Shephard and Patrick McMahon similarly use representations of the myth of King Midas to tease out the moral repercussions of good or bad musical judgement. Their most intriguing example is of the images on a polygonal virginal, where the position of the player determines a particular meaning to the pictorial narrative. In Section 4, Jamie Agpar shows how the political narrative in early medieval England influenced the use of alternating, or responsive, performance, and Ljubica Ilic frames seventeenth-century musical depictions of the Echo myth in relation to the modern development of the idea of the reflective self.

Sections 5 and 7 expand this theme, examining how music-related myth is communicated in performance. Samantha Bassler's application of a framework of disability studies to the literary portrayal of female madness in Shakespeare provides a new dimension through which depictions of mental health can be understood through musical characterization. Sigrid Harris effectively depicts how the fear induced by mythological women singers was transferred onto real female performers in early modern Italy. Finally, in Section 7, Amanda Eubanks Winkler and Erica Levenson examine the adaptation of music-related myths for the English stage in the eighteenth century. Levenson's discussion of the political elements of different operatic styles reconnects with the theme of national identities explored by Elina Hamilton and Katherine Butler.

The interdisciplinarity of the essays effectively showcases how narratives about music and performed through music enabled medieval and early modern people to explore power dynamics between genders, nations, able-bodied and disabled, classes, and the individual and society. The essays showcase less-studied

biblical characters such as Tubal/Jubal/Tubalcain and Isaiah and classical figures like Echo and Philomena. The conversation between long-established myth and the use of new stories to understand music as a cultural force is a key tension in and between the essays that illustrates a fundamental shift in the conception of music between the Middle Ages and the early modern period. The cohesive thematic arrangement of the essays serves to underpin the innovative arguments in this volume.

CLAIRE MACHT, *University of Oxford*

**Byrne**, Aisling, and Victoria **Flood**, eds, *Crossing Borders in the Insular Middle Ages* (Medieval Texts and Cultures in Northern Europe, 39), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. viii, 332; 2 b/w illustrations, 4 b/w tables; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503566733.

Although ‘Crossing Borders in the Insular Middle Ages’ is the title of an international project that has produced at least two conferences to date, and one in which the editors of the volume now being considered play leading roles, there is no overt attempt in this book to establish any association with project activity. The book contains thirteen single-author chapters and an introductory essay by the editors. Despite the common connotations of the word ‘insular’ in medieval studies, the focus here is on the high and late Middle Ages, not the centuries before 1000, and Iceland receives prominence beside Britain and Ireland. Though England receives some attention, particularly in chapters on Welsh translations of English Tudor period prophecy literature, and on Anglo-Latin abuse poetry during the Hundred Years’ War, as well as in Rory McTurk’s essay examining alliterative patterns in *Piers Plowman* and skaldic poetry, the emphasis of the volume is on the literatures of Wales, Ireland, and Iceland. Scotland does not feature here.

Nine of the thirteen chapters after the introduction are largely devoted to considering the practice of translators (or as some authors prefer to say, ‘redactors’) in rendering into the vernacular Latin texts from antiquity or the Middle Ages (and to a considerably lesser extent texts from other medieval vernaculars). The source texts are varied—from the *Aeneid* and Statius’s *Thebaid* (both rendered into Irish) to *De excidio Troiae historia* attributed to Dares Phrygius (c. fifth century CE) and Geoffrey of Monmouth’s *Historia regum Britanniae* (both rendered into Icelandic). The emphasis of the chapters is on what the translators or redactors have achieved, considered in the light of the milieu in which they worked and their likely audiences: source study has a long history, but the focus here is not on tracking down sources for its own sake as an intellectual exercise, or on demonstrating how a translator failed to appreciate the subtleties of the source text. The studies here lead in most cases to an enhanced appreciation of what was achieved in the reworking of the source.

Other essays consider gentry libraries in late medieval Wales and discuss the possibility that the portrayal of the paradisiacal Glæsisvellir, ‘Shining Fields’, in Icelandic sources may have been directly influenced by something similar in Irish

mythology. It will be apparent that the broad theme of ‘crossing borders’ has been interpreted so as to allow contributors considerable latitude. In discussing the Anglo-Latin abuse poetry Joanna Bellis admits that the poems ‘did not so much cross a border [...] as erect one’ (p. 109), and in seeing parallels between what he describes as contrapuntal alliteration in William Langland’s great poem and the work of the earlier Norse poets McTurk understandably makes no suggestion that the skalds exerted a literary influence in fourteenth century England.

The chapters in this volume are very lucidly written (though Sif Ríkhardsdóttir’s more theoretical discussion of emotive literary identities, emotive script, and emotive coding in the earlier part of her essay is understandably a bit more challenging). In general, they do not focus on the major historical subjects or the best-known literary masterpieces of medieval insular cultures (but Sif Ríkhardsdóttir has some brief but interesting comments on *Njáls saga* and *Egils saga Skallagrímssonar*). Leading scholars are represented in the volume, and most of the chapters have extensive and useful individual biographies, typically extending over at least three pages. There is an index of manuscripts and a general index, but, somewhat disappointingly, no biographical information about the contributors or systematic indication of institutional affiliation.

The study of medieval translation practices is a field increasingly attracting attention, and those concerned with that subject should find this volume a rich resource. Other students of medieval literature, particularly those whose interest is in Middle English or in the insular realms before the development of English hegemony, will probably not find much vital to their research but may well be entertained by exploring what for them could be interesting scholarly byways.

JOHN KENNEDY, *Charles Sturt University*

**Campbell**, Laura Chuhan, *The Medieval Merlin Tradition in France and Italy: Prophecy, Paradox, and Translatio* (Gallica, 47), Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2017; hardback; pp. viii, 211; R.R.P £60.00, ebook £19.99; ISBN 9781843844808.

In the *Phaedrus*, 275e, Socrates says of books that ‘once written down they are tumbled about anywhere, all alike among those who understand them and among strangers, [...] the book cannot protect or defend itself’. This comes to mind when reading medieval manuscripts, transcribed by poor scribes, so that, ‘Viviane, the *bonne clergiesse*’ becomes ‘Nivienne [...] *la demoiselle cacheresse*’ (p. 79). Bound together, hybrids are refashioned for new uses. Like Chinese whispers, messages are transmuted and deformed. The medieval *Merlin* manuscripts are no exception. The focus of this study are lateish Italian versions; the early fourteenth-century Florentine *La Storia de Merlino* ‘translated’ by Paulino Pieri into a text that ‘consists of a combination and rearrangement of material’ from the early thirteenth-century French *Merlin en prose* by Robert de Boron, and the late-thirteenth-century *Les Prophecies de Merlin* (p. 187), and two Venetian texts, *Lo Libero dello savio Merlin* by Jachomo de Çaune Barbier and *La Historia di*

*Merlino* compiled by Luca Venitiano. To glean these facts, turn to the appendices, for the Introduction jumps straight into a confusing account of Pieri's rendition of Merlin's story of the corrupt city of Orbanza, which was, according to Pieri, translated by 'a Maestro Riccardo at the behest of Frederick II, Holy Roman emperor' (p. 1).

Socrates' observation not only applies to medieval manuscripts, but also to the philosophy of language. Campbell is not content to follow those 'obsessed with binary oppositions within the translation model [...] too concerned with defining and redefining the relationship between translation and the original' (p. 25, n. 80, quoting Susan Bassnett and André Lefevere). Instead she engages with 'Charles Sanders Peirce's tripartite sign, rather than Saussure's signifier-signified dichotomy'. Peirce, she tells us, 'regarded all interpretation as a translation between signs, creating a continuum of related signs that he termed "semiosis"' (p. 25). Semiosis is produced by the mutual interaction of the three components of the sign—the object (similar to the signified), the sign itself (the signifier) and a third component: the interpretant, which is a mental sign produced in response to an object. Ouch! Poor Saussure, poor Peirce! Seeing them tumbled about into so inaccurate a repetition of words, by a stranger to their enterprise, is insufferable.

Campbell's appeal to Peircean semiotic theory is only pretentious window dressing. In the detailed descriptions of the way in which stories from the *Merlin en prose* and *Prophecies* are reworked by Pieri, Barbier, and Venitiano, she claims that the transformations are not so much distortions from some archetypal original, but are new elaborations, that gain new significance from the new context in which the text is confected (pp. 35–36). No elaborate theory of meaning is applied. In this vein, the first chapter deals with the various, sometimes contradictory, versions of the story of Merlin's conception by the devil, as found in in the original *Merlin* and its continuations, and the way in which differing treatments of the origins of the devil's seduction of his mother, offer alternative accounts of the sin of despair, lack of faith, temptation, and redemption. In the next chapter, a similar comparison is made of the varying explanations of the success of the Lady of the Lake in entombing Merlin, focusing more on the French *Suite de Merlin*, and the *Historia di Merlino* than on Pieri's version, and reading the incident through a variety of other stories in which women 'undo' men, such as Samson and Delilah or Aristotle and Phyllis (pp. 65–66), or even Adam and Eve (pp. 92–93). It is observed that different versions of the story convey different moral messages and explanations of the source of Merlin's downfall. The fourth and fifth chapters turn to the topic of prophetic discourse in general. As Campbell is well aware, the meaning of the verb '*transfere*' and the concept captured by '*translatio*' were much wider than 'to translate', being anything from transcribe, transmit, transfer, or translate (pp. 18–24). Not distinguishing these concepts, she treats Merlin's prophetic transmission of his knowledge as a form of translation, and asserts, 'the obscure language of Merlin's prophecies [...] embodies the disconnect between divine and

earthly language, producing semiotic fragmentations that are characteristic of the fragmentation of information in *translatio*' (p. 23).

Socrates' complaint in relation to written texts was that they could acquire an illegitimate authority. In the Merlin tradition, the figure of Merlin authorized the repetition of obscure 'prophecies' and histories, both read for pleasure and put to use by 'experts' in prediction. The situation was not so different from today, when literary academics use obscure theories, authorized by philosophical experts, to bolster their intellectual authority. If Campbell had preferred Wittgenstein's 'meaning is use' theory to Peirce's 'semiosis', she might have offered a more readable, cynical, and plausible account of the variety of uses to which the Merlin texts were put.

KAREN GREEN, *University of Melbourne*

**Cassidy-Welch, Megan, *War and Memory at the Time of the Fifth Crusade*, University Park, PA, The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2019; cloth; pp. 202; R.R.P. US\$84.95; ISBN 9780271083520.**

The twentieth-century profusion of war memorials, veterans' groups, and national memorial-holidays—particularly commemorating World War I—has led some historians to propose a modern 'boom' in war memory. Launching a medievalist of Cassidy-Welch's skill into such a historiographical battleground proves refreshing. The Middle Ages, itself a semiotic source for pro-war fanaticism during the First World War, provides Cassidy-Welch an opportunity to reconsider the historiography. While earlier periods, she argues, focused on martyrdom, sacrifice, and redemption, modern vocabularies prefer to frame war in terms of loss, trauma, and necessity, signalling an epistemic shift. Focusing on the Fifth Crusade, Cassidy-Welch analyses the nature of the qualitative shift and offers possible reasons for it. The book thus contributes to both medieval history and the history of war memory.

Cassidy-Welch's volume asks why remembering war was so important to early-thirteenth-century writers and what purposes remembrance served. The book purports to argue that 'crusading possessed a unique temporal and spatial logic in which remembering was central' (p. 3). The crusade, as Cassidy-Welch shows, was enshrined in individual and collective memory, through family; cultures of martyrdom; liturgy and collective prayer; regional identity constructs before the rise of the nation state; and so on. Contemporary writers indeed considered crusading a part of the arc of biblical or providential history. For example, as readers of Nicholas Morton's work, among others', will know, warrior culture and martyrdom were interpreted through the lens of the 'ever-popular' Maccabees (p. 36). The crusading movement, as a whole, memorialized Christ's life; that much seems obvious. Cassidy-Welch therefore wonders why the early thirteenth-century crusades ended up in Livonia, Byzantium, Spain (that is, the *reconquista*), southern France, and Egypt, with 'sites of memory' (p. 15) for particular families and regional groups springing up in these places. Following Nicholas

Paul, Cassidy-Welch considers family memory important to ‘aristocratic self-fashioning’ (p. 11), but the early thirteenth century saw this evolve, due to the rise of new theatres of war and genres of writing such as vernacular histories and crusading romances.

Cassidy-Welch’s chapters consider crusaders preparing and managing how their actions will be remembered; eye-witnessing as memory-authority; the memorialization of crusaders; remembering loss; places of memory; and the memorialization in home territories of objects or relics associated with the crusade. Cassidy-Welch shows that some similarities exist between modern and medieval practices of war memory: the desire for a nice funeral; regrets about young decedents’ loss of a prosperous future; instructions on the disposal of property; expressions of love to family; and expressions of higher purpose. Nevertheless, these wishes are historically contingent; thus, crusaders wished to memorialize their membership of a military-religious confraternity or their financial contribution thereto. Creating memory is thus a ‘social process and a tool for socialization’ (p. 21), whereby shared identity and purpose are created.

All in all, the Fifth Crusade has rarely been a focus for crusade scholars. So, although it does not replace them, Cassidy-Welch’s volume can be added to the useful work of Reinhold Röhricht, James Powell, Joseph Donovan, Bernard Hamilton, Jean Richard, and others. But Cassidy-Welch’s volume does something altogether different, and very valuable. It tells a story of thought-worlds and cultural practices. As a whole, the piece is interesting, well written, and makes an important historiographical contribution, particularly in its later chapters on places of remembrance and the materials of memory, where the analysis finds its greatest novelty. I particularly enjoyed the stories of individuals and their families, which go a long way to humanizing our own memory of the crusaders. Cassidy-Welch is to be congratulated.

KEAGAN BREWER, *The University of Sydney*

**Cevins**, Marie-Madeleine de, *Confraternity, Mendicant Orders, and Salvation in the Middle Ages: The Contribution of the Hungarian Sources (c. 1270–c. 1530)*, trans. Iris **Black** (Europa Sacra, 23), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. xvii, 365; 22 b/w illustrations, 2 maps, 14 graphs, 2 b/w tables; R.R.P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503578712.

Mendicant spiritual confraternities have a bad reputation and the very term, so Marie-Madeleine de Cevins cheerfully forewarns us, inevitably engenders a certain malaise in the reader. Her dense, detailed and exhaustively researched study of an undoubtedly complex and poorly documented topic takes us into the competitive world of the medieval mendicants (Franciscans, Dominicans, Augustinian Hermits and Carmelites) and shines light onto a practice they deliberately kept obscure. To meet their communal material needs, friars needed benefactions. Benefactors, to be encouraged, needed to be recompensed. In effecting recompense, the friars needed to tread warily to obviate accusations of simony that would sully the

essence of their appeal, their commitment to poverty. And so, in exchange for material benefits, the friars promised spiritual graces (*bona spiritualia*) accrued by their community, the incalculable value of which was ever accumulating. In this way, their unwritten indebtedness was discharged in the manner sanctioned by Rome (Urban V's bull, *Beneficia sanctorum*).

Confirmation of membership of a spiritual confraternity took the form of a formal letter, a charter, the wording of which was largely formulaic and changed little over the centuries: 'I, Friar [...], hereby receive you into each and every suffrage of our Order, and into its confraternity, in life as in death, granting to you by the present document full participation in all the spiritual wealth that the clemency of the Saviour shall judge our brothers of the Kingdom of Hungary worthy to achieve' (Franciscan, c. 1282–1320).

Membership entailed no ceremony of inclusion; no lists of members were kept; and no active solidarity was cultivated between *confratres/consorores* and the friars. In essence, mendicant spiritual confraternities were conceptual communities. And therein lies the challenge for the researcher: How to investigate a topic, amorphous in nature, the formal evidence for which is a repetitive monotony?

The phenomenon was by no means restricted to any one part of Europe; to date, however, the richest cache of inventoried material is found in Hungary. To these Hungarian sources, rarely discussed in West European languages, Cevins brings an impressive breadth of scholarship, the fruits of more than two decades' research into Hungarian and Central-European ecclesiastical archives. She makes the point that while the mendicants were strongly represented in Hungary, they did not indulge in actively selling letters of affiliation of the 'fill-in-the-blanks'-type that was common in England and Bohemia. As a consequence, Hungarian spiritual confraternities retained their currency for longer.

Cevins's study provides fascinating glimpses into how the orders projected themselves to the faithful. We see, for example, the vigorous support of spiritual confraternities provided by the Inquisitor-General of Franciscan Observants, John of Capistrano, during his high-profile tour of Central Europe: 'engaged in a fierce struggle against heresy and the infidels, [he] made spiritual confraternity into a weapon of "conquering pastoral care"' (p. 193). His letters of affiliation make clear that admission to the Franciscan confraternity is to be understood as admission to the Three Orders of St Francis—*nota bene—de Observantia*: the Friars Minor of the Observance, the Sisters Minor of St Clare, that is, Damianites of the Observance [*sorum minorissarum et sancte Clare seu sancti Damiani de Observantia*], and the Third Order Penitents. At the time of his writing, however, the majority of Poor Clare houses in Central Europe, the grand foundations especially, were aligned with the Franciscan Conventuals. For their part, the Conventual Franciscans, with their calls to 'follow, naked, the naked Christ' (p. 191), were striving to present themselves as more reformed than the Observants. And although confraternal *bona spiritualia* extended equally to women and men, not a single abbess or

prioress appears in the role of affiliate, notwithstanding the prestige, the royal protection, and the aristocratic membership that distinguished many of Hungary's monastic establishments for women.

In the final chapter, Cevins reverses the perspective to present a view from the other side: how affiliates might have regarded their membership of a spiritual confraternity. A rare insight can be gleaned from a 1520 register found in a Dominican priory in Transylvania in which all the types of spiritual commitments made to benefactors, protectors and friends are tabulated. Progressing from a base level (prayers collectively recited at Mass now and after the beneficiary's death) through a more generous mid-level (association with the accumulating spiritual merits of the friars through Divine benevolence) we reach the top level (perpetual masses, burial in the friary, and interment in the habit of the order), only ever sparingly used. On this spectrum of *bona spiritualia* confraternities were regarded as occupying the mid-range, and perhaps for that reason, aggregations of affiliations became more common. One member of a family, for example, might secure spiritual confraternity for his relatives from the Franciscan Observants, while another family member secured the same from the Dominicans, and so on. More grist for the Reformation.

ROBERT CURRY, *The University of Sydney*

**Coley, David K.,** *Death and the Pearl Maiden: Plague, Poetry, England* (Interventions: New Studies in Medieval Culture), Columbus, The Ohio State University Press, 2019; hardback; pp. 236; 10 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$99.95; ISBN 9780814213902.

*Death and the Pearl Maiden* tackles a literary mystery that has puzzled late medieval scholars. The plague known as the Black Death, which caused millions of deaths in Europe and England, is hardly mentioned in late medieval English literature. David K. Coley offers a complex, multifaceted, and often brilliant explanation of why the unflinching descriptions of the Black Death's devastation in European texts make England's underwhelming literary response disturbingly conspicuous.

Coley focuses on four Middle English works preserved in the British Library MS Cotton Nero A.x, article 3 (*Pearl*, *Cleanness*, *Patience*, and *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*) written at the height of the endemic between the 1370s and 1390s. Coley argues that the collected poems powerfully meditate on the plague and its cultural aftermath, eschewing a direct account. His argument uses trauma as a literary tool because traumatic events negotiate the fraught space 'between acknowledgement and suppression' (p. 6). The need to voice untold horrors becomes muted by their very nature.

Coley's analytical method is split between providing insightful readings, and self-critical comments. Early in the Introduction, he admits that the texts being examined contain no substantial evidence of engaging with the plague. He adds that his thesis is entirely speculative and based on allusive references.

His admission, however, becomes a critique of the New Historicist approach requiring that literature has a direct and clearly traceable engagement with historic events. Throughout the study, the pattern of anticipating the critical response to his readings enables Coley to add another layer to his speculative insights.

*Death and the Pearl Maiden* examines first the second poem from the MS Cotton Nero A.x, *Cleanness*. The poem's descriptions of dismemberment and death graphically adapted from the Book of Genesis resonate with the Black Death. By looking back at the destruction of Sodom and Gomorrah, Lot's wife acts as a 'traumatic witness' to catastrophic events (p. 34). She embodies Coley's thesis as being a readable symbol for an unspeakable traumatic event and its silenced victims.

The analysis of *Pearl* begins with an illustration of Christ's crucifixion from the *Holkham Bible* (1327–40). As it precedes the Black Death, the image is startling both in its prescience and how it undermines Coley's thesis. The illustration shows Christ's body covered with blue-black spots and sores. Coley's point is that the illustration provides a common context in which the sins of the world can be absorbed into any pestilence-influenced text. The illustration also shows that because *Pearl* contains many references to bodily sores and swellings, it does not necessarily signify the Black Death. Perhaps in recognition of such criticism, Coley augments his argument through the poem's references to odours and summertime that resonate further with the medieval experience of the plague.

*Patience* adapts the biblical story of Jonah, who, fleeing from God's command to go to Nineveh, ends up in a whale's body for three days. Before analysing the poem, Coley discusses intriguing research on the psychology of flight. Rather than escaping the terror, flight involves fleeing to familiar enclosures, even if it means more danger. By magnifying Jonah's notion of flight without refuge in *Patience*, Coley provides a convincing historical context to the futility of trying to escape the Black Death.

In *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*, Coley examines the female character Morgan le Fay. He argues that she represents the cultural changes the Black Death thrust upon England. The plague's devastation of over half of England's population created a labour shortage, giving aristocratic women greater autonomy in social and economic affairs. As the monstrous sorceress and crone, Morgan le Fay personifies the immoral female sexuality associated with the spreading of the Black Death. Furthermore, as the Lady of the Manor's associate, her influential presence in court reflects the new-found power a plague-ravaged England afforded aristocratic women.

Having prised a plague narrative from the examined texts, Coley concludes by offering various explanations for the problem of late-medieval English literature's indirect response to the Black Death. The most thought-provoking explanation is that Middle English was considered too vulgar a language to give a direct voice to the traumatic devastation caused by the Black Death.

*Death and the Pearl Maiden* is an insightful and provocative study essential for academics interested in medieval literature and the Black Death. Although Coley does not provide satisfying conclusions for his thesis, the challenging self-critical style of the work will influence future studies.

FRANK SWANNACK, *University of Salford*

**Collins, David J., SJ, ed.,** *The Sacred and the Sinister. Studies in Medieval Religion and Magic*, University Park, PA, The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2019; hardback; pp. 304; 6 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$74.95; ISBN 9780271082400.

The title of this commemorative volume dedicated to Richard Kieckhefer is inspired by his 1994 article ‘The Holy and the Unholy: Sainthood, Witchcraft and Magic in Late Medieval Europe’. The volume aims to advance an understanding of the relation between terms which, thanks to Kieckhefer’s pioneering efforts, now appear a great deal less remote than they once would have. Collins’s introduction provides a brief overview of Kieckhefer’s impressive contribution. One remains perplexed, however, by the claim that his 1984 book *Unquiet Souls* built on the theoretical foundations of his two 1994 articles (p. 6).

‘Traditional Holiness’ begins with Claire Fanger applying Kieckhefer’s reflections on self-mortification to Christina Mirabilis and Francis of Assisi, whose performative suffering she interprets as wilfully transforming the body into a bridge between matter and spirit. Sean L. Field follows with an examination of the *Second Vita* of Margherita Colonna by the otherwise unknown Stefania. A member of the prominent Roman family, Margherita is commemorated in only one manuscript, but I found her a welcome addition to the usual cast of holy women. Field’s predictably expert analysis of the *Vita*’s sources highlights both the hagiographical strategies appropriate for laywomen and their elevated educational level.

‘Conflicts over the Holy’ leads off with Kristi Woodward Bain on medievalism and heritage. An erstwhile student of Kieckhefer, she references his latest book, *Theology in Stone: Church Architecture from Byzantium to Berkeley* (Oxford University Press, 2004). The study of how a 1409 conflict between monks and parishioners over the church of Wymondham has been preserved in stone and in memory is interesting, though I was unable to discern any connection, beyond Kieckhefer’s recent interests, to the overall theme of the volume. By contrast, Elizabeth Casteen’s examination of the continuity in medieval thought and law between mystical rapture and sexual violation, particularly in the demand for signs of bodily damage, furthers in a most fruitful way Kieckhefer’s 1994 insights. The section concludes with Maeve B. Callan discussing syneisaktism—holy partnership between the sexes. The clear references to this practice in the Gospels have not prevented its continual denunciation, especially by those most open to accusations of it, such as the notoriously misogynist Jerome. Callan takes

the story up to the twelfth century, with a particular interest in Ireland, although the evidence is confusing.

‘Identifying and Grappling with the Unholy’ opens with Michael D. Bailey considering whether magic could be considered a religious movement, a question inspired more by Herbert Grundmann’s seminal *Religious Movements of the Middle Ages* than by anything Kieckhefer wrote. Bailey decides that it could have been but never was, largely due to the Church’s persistence in defining and excluding practices, much as it did with heresy, whose proponents also normally regarded themselves as true Christians. Next, Katelyn Mesler gives us the text of Nicholas Eymeric’s *Contra infideles demones invocantes*. Less well known than Eymeric’s *Directorium inquisitorum*, it justifies inquisitorial jurisdiction over non-Christians, particularly Jews. This is clearly a very important source for the history of the inquisition, and one can only echo Mesler’s hopes that a fully annotated edition will eventually be produced. The challenging nature of the only surviving manuscript has prevented Mesler from proceeding further with the task at this stage, so we must be grateful for what she has brought us. Anne M. Koenig concludes the section with a wide-ranging exploration of the connections between magic and madness in fifteenth-century Germany. Magical and naturalistic explanations for mental disorder were not opposed but rather overlapping conceptual possibilities to be drawn on in appropriate cultural contexts. In practice, the naturalistic usually predominated.

Finally, ‘Magic and the Cosmos’ starts with Sophie Page explaining how theological beliefs about the earthly presence of demons were integrated into the cosmological model of the spheres. As well as elucidating the positions of various prominent scholars, this essay would also serve as an excellent introduction to medieval cosmological and demonological beliefs. David Collins concludes the volume by comparing Albertus Magnus’s treatment of the Three Wise Men with that of other commentators. Matthew’s brief account left much room for speculation. Albertus brought the full impact of rediscovered Aristotelianism to bear on questions such as who the magi were, how they knew what they knew and what kind of a star it could possibly have been.

There is appropriately a bibliography of Kieckhefer’s publications, followed somewhat strangely by three pages of ‘Other Sources’. This includes a small portion of the references contained in the notes to the various chapters, but the basis for the selection remains mysterious. Volumes of this kind are necessarily eclectic and preferences will depend upon interests. Certainly, Casteen comes closest to addressing the stated theme. The contributions are generally of high quality and the volume a fine tribute to an important scholar.

LOLA SHARON DAVIDSON, *University of Technology Sydney*

**Courtenay, William J.,** *Rituals for the Dead: Religion and Community in the Medieval University of Paris* (The Conway Lectures in Medieval Studies), Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2018; paperback; pp. 228; 43 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$45.00; ISBN 9780268104948.

Among historians of the medieval university, Bill Courtenay stands supreme, certainly among scholars working in English. In a field of study that is dominated by historians of individual fields of intellectual endeavour, Courtenay has always demonstrated a sure grasp of the institutional framework of learning. In this book, he signals a shift, already evident to those who keep up with his prolific output in journal articles and book chapters, by moving more clearly than ever to the twin (and related) fields of social and religious history. His argument that historians of the University of Paris have tended to overlook the religious framework and devotional structures that shaped the lives of both teachers and students is important. In large part, this neglect may be due to a scholarly focus on the efforts of episcopal and papal authority to intervene in the University rather than the social rituals of that institution. Courtenay brings together in seven chapters, given as lectures, the fruit of meticulous research into different ways in which religion intersected with university life.

*Rituals for the Dead* is not quite as accurate a summary of the book's theme as its subtitle, *Religion and Community in the Medieval University of Paris*. Its title singles out one time-consuming, but largely neglected aspect of university life: the requirement imposed on teachers and students to pray collectively for the dead. Courtenay outlines how each of the four nations in which students in arts were grouped had its own church in rather the same way as a confraternity. In terms of social life, whether secular or religious, these churches created their own parishes with their own rituals, including those of burial and remembrance of the dead. This leads Courtenay into a fascinating chapter on the theological problem created by the apparent injustice that the wealthy could afford a much faster journey to Paradise by the masses that they could commission for their relatives. The dominant (although not universal) view was that a pious action done through charity would indirectly help others without wealthy supporters.

Courtenay also devotes attention to the requirement on masters of each nation to celebrate the five Marian feasts of the Virgin, as well as the feasts of St Nicholas and St Catherine as the patronal saint of each nation. His focus is on the Virgin, remembered not just in these feasts, clearly as a unifying force given the ferocity of antagonism between the nations, but in the imagery of the Great Seal of the University of Paris. Courtenay's close attention to the seals of university masters in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries (on which he has published elsewhere) leads him to document his research into the Great Seal of the University of Paris, which he argues was first created by 1220, but was cancelled by the papacy in April 1221, reasserted in 1222, but then the matrix was smashed by Cardinal Frangipani in 1225 and not restored until 1246, when Pope Innocent IV allowed the seal to be used for a seven-year period, extended in 1252 for another ten years. While Courtenay mentions this chequered history of the Great Seal, he does

not dwell on its evident political significance. Rather he focuses on institutional Marian devotion as emblematic of religious cohesion to which all the masters were expected to adhere. Courtenay's observation that the Great Seal (the design of which he plausibly suggested might go back to that in use by 1220) has no iconographic precedent, is of interest. It combines an image of the crowned Virgin and Child, with a bishop (St Nicholas) and St Catherine on either side, above images of two regent masters lecturing from books, and of students reading and debating with each other. While Courtenay is strong on the association between Mary and Wisdom, he does not comment on why Nicholas and Catherine were specially revered at the University. Perhaps this was because St Nicholas was linked to the young, and St Catherine with having disputed with philosophers prior to her martyrdom.

Another fascinating angle in this book, not picked up by its title, comes in his chapter, 'A Hidden Presence. Women and the University of Paris'. With his encyclopaedic knowledge of sources, he documents how women were involved in teaching literacy, at a pre-university level, across Paris, as well as sometimes being involved in crucial university-related businesses, like the book business. The book is about much more than rituals for the dead. Its strength lies in its meticulous attention to the power of often unnoticed detail to enrich our understanding of the practicalities of living under the shadow of the University of Paris.

CONSTANT J. MEWS, *Monash University*

**Cropp**, Glynnis M., and John Keith **Atkinson**, eds, *Un Dit moral contre Fortune: A critical edition of MS Paris, BnF, fr. 25418* (European Translations, 6), Cambridge, MHRA, 2018; paperback; pp. 182; R.R.P. £12.99, US\$17.99, €14.99; ISBN 9781781887608.

The medieval preoccupation with Boethius's *The Consolation of Philosophy* (c. 523–25 CE) is evident in the numerous translations, commentaries, and glosses that appeared in the Middle Ages. In France alone, there are some thirteen distinct translations. While some versions were copied and circulated widely, others such as the anonymous late-fourteenth- or early fifteenth-century French verse translation Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France (BnF) MS fonds français 25418, exist in a single parchment. This sole extant copy coupled with the intellectual complexity of the text has made it difficult for researchers around the world to study the manuscript. Luckily for contemporary scholars, enthusiasm for Boethius's reception in vernacular French lives on in the work of editors Glynnis M. Cropp and John Keith Atkinson. While Paris, BnF, MS fr. 25418 has no title in the manuscript, the editors derived *Un dit moral contre Fortune* from the beginning of the Prologue in which the reviser states his intention: 'Contre Fortune [...] | Dez dis Bōece vueil conter | C'om dit de Consolacion (5, 7–8)' (p. 5).

Professor Emeritus and Honorary Research Fellow in the School of Humanities, Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand, Cropp is an internationally renowned specialist in the field of the vernacular translations of

Boethius's *Consolatio* as well as medieval French and Occitan literature. Atkinson, an independent scholar and Honorary Research Consultant with the School of Languages and Cultures at the University of Queensland, Australia, edits and directs theses in regional medieval French translations of *Consolatio Philosophiae*. Each having decades of research and publications, Cropp and Atkinson bring unique expertise to medieval studies evident in this volume.

In this critical edition, Cropp and Atkinson provide an edited, abridged translation of Renaut de Louhans's *Roman de Fortune et de Felicité* (1336/7). With Atkinson as adviser, Béatrice Atherton edited Louhan's medieval verse translation of Boethius (Paris, BnF, MS fonds français 578) as her doctoral thesis for the University of Queensland (1994). For the present critical edition, Atherton made her thesis available in open access through the University of Queensland eSpace Library. This allowed Cropp and Atkinson to delineate the dependence of the *Dit moral* on the *Roman de Fortune* in two appendices: 'Table of Concordance' for both texts and 'Sample Passages' of *Le Roman de Fortune* (edited by Atherton), with brief notes for comparison with *Un Dit moral*. The variance in length between the two texts appears as the most obvious difference. At 7914 verses, *Roman de Fortune* contains longer discussions and examples such as the mythological narratives and philosophical arguments. Still, the reviser of *Dit moral* distinguished Fortune from Felicité more prominently and inserted Christian religious instruction within 4588 verses.

The reviser's devotion to God is clearly observable in the emphasis given to Christian morality by the stern narrative. In Boethius's original thought and the present translation, Philosophie stresses that happiness, Felicité, is found within (not in material things). Yet, unlike *Consolatio*, *Dit moral* dedicates a degree of attention to Covetousness such that it constitutes a substantial secondary theme. A passion easily ignited by Fortune, Covetousness burns and inflames humans to crave earthly delights.

The handsome cover illustration of this volume containing Louhan's *Roman de Fortune* (from Brussels, Bibliothèque royale de Belgique, MS 10220, fol. 2<sup>v</sup>) captivates the reader while the attention to detail in this MHRA Critical Text does not disappoint. After the preface and abbreviations, an enlightening introduction offers a most useful description of the manuscripts' contents, form and structure, terms, moral lesson, versification, and linguistic features. The edited text is followed by the aforementioned appendices, notes on the text, and a table of proper names. The glossary illuminates difficult terms and a comprehensive bibliography concludes the work.

The acculturation of Boethius's most studied work in medieval France is brought to light in *Un Dit moral contre Fortune*. In the long and complex history of the *Consolatio Philosophiae*'s transmission and interpretation, Cropp and Atkinson's volume presents a 'last link in a chain of translations' (p. 2) and is thus an important and necessary addition to studies in the field.

JENNY DAVIS BARNETT, *University of Queensland*

**Dawson**, Mark S., *Bodies Complexioned: Human Variation and Racism in Early Modern English Culture, c. 1600–1750*, Manchester, Manchester University Press, 2019; hardback; pp. 280; 13 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £80.00; ISBN 9781526134486.

While unique phenotypic traits are evident among dispersed populations, the concept of race is essentially a social construct and its appropriateness is contested because of its association with the cultural politics of racism. But the fact remains that the term was in reasonably common usage from the early sixteenth century, although without the sinister connotations it later acquired. It is generally accepted that it was not until around the early eighteenth century that the modern concept of race began to develop as a powerful and widespread means to justify discrimination. Although it is easy to find earlier examples of race-based denigration and discrimination, by and large distinctions were made between peoples by Europeans on the basis of cultural differences.

But when and how did the immutable interpretations of difference associated with racial discrimination begin to replace the relatively permeable barriers to acceptance presented by ethnocentrism? This is the issue that Mark Dawson explores in *Bodies Complexioned*. In doing so, he challenges the view that two factors impeded the acceptance of racial stereotyping. The first of these was inertia of belief in humoralism, whose supposedly mutable impact on bodily disposition conflicted with the essentialism of racism. The second factor was that for racism to take hold it had to supplant ethnocentrism. That entailed overcoming belief in monogenesis, Christian universalism, and the importance of sociocultural factors in how Europeans assessed themselves and others.

Over six chapters Dawson presents evidence to support his thesis that it was unnecessary for one form of discrimination to supersede another; instead, humoralism itself became the basis of intrasocietal discrimination that was then adapted to accommodate learnings from the encounter of Britons with other peoples. Consequently, the purview of this paradigm of embodied prejudice expanded outwards and become an antecedent of modern racism.

In the first four chapters Dawson seeks to demonstrate how widespread this thinking was and what conclusions English people came to concerning the meaning of bodily difference. Something that stands out in these chapters is the impressive range and number of sources that Dawson draws upon, which sets this work apart from many other studies on the early development of racial prejudice in England.

The first chapter examines the role of religious discourse in the way in which the body was read. Dawson asserts that religious beliefs were foundational: variation in complexion was thought to have originated with the fall of man, and humoral differences could be used to judge a person's state of spiritual well-being. That such beliefs were pivotal is unsurprising given the centrality of religion in English society at the time.

In Chapter 2 he turns to the relationship between humoralism and astrology, examining the way in which people had recourse to the latter to better understand their complexions. Dawson reveals just how widespread interest in astrology was, but in doing so overwhelmed this reader with the examples he provides. What he achieves, though, is to demonstrate that implicit in the practice were the assumptions that humoral dispositions were innate, rather than mutable, and inheritable.

Chapter 3 focuses on the role of drama in conditioning attitudes to bodily difference. I am sceptical about claims concerning the influence of the early modern English theatre, because it could unsettle as much as reinforce paradigms. However, Dawson's argument that drama informed people of the embodied markers of social status is well supported.

In an impressive feat of research and analysis of descriptions of wanted persons advertised in newspapers, Chapter 4 reveals that physical distinctions were being made systematically and widely by ordinary citizens and highlights that skin tone was progressively becoming a more critical marker of difference.

In the fifth chapter Dawson shows how the English transported their humoral logic to make assessments of other peoples, arguing that just as the English could self-identify with certain embodied characteristics, they could also make judgements about the innate nature of others. It is an interesting chapter, but the analysis is principally focused on the Americas; it would have been useful to have seen insights from contact with Morocco, where the English were very active up until the early 1680s, including possession of Tangier for two decades.

In the final chapter Dawson examines how humoralism was used to support competing conceptions to explain perceived differences between various population groups, and how fairness of skin came to be regarded firstly as a sign of elite social status and then over time a collective marker of superiority over other peoples.

The book does have shortcomings. The inclusion of too much detail at times obscures the discussion, evidence is sometimes stretched too far, but by far the biggest problem is the often-florid prose. Nevertheless, the book will reward the dedicated reader, as Dawson presents a compelling case for considering the role of humoralism in the story of the development of racism.

RICKIE LETTE, *University of Tasmania*

**Egeler**, Matthias, ed., *Landscape and Myth in North-Western Europe* (Borders, Boundaries, Landscape), Turnhout, Brepols, 2019; hardback; pp. viii, 263; 18 b/w illustrations, 3 b/w tables R.R.P. €70.00; ISBN 9782503580401.

An edited collection of twelve chapters plus introduction, this volume is the second published in the relatively new and promising series, Borders, Boundaries, Landscape, edited by Eleanor R. Barraclough (it follows Savborg and Bek-Pederson, eds, *Spiritual Encounters in Old Norse Literature and Tradition*, 2018).

As is common with edited collections, the standard of scholarship is variable. So too, the remit, focus, and length of individual chapters. Like a gift box of Christmas chocolates, there are insightful, perfectly formed delights to be savoured, and a few faux pineapple flavours with distinctly less appeal. Between the satisfying and the fruity, sublime range a host of agreeable, if not entirely edifying, fare. Despite the editor's best intentions there is limited dialogue between the chapters: each remains a sweet unto itself.

As the title appropriately signposts, three themes ostensibly draw these chapters together: myth, landscape, and the region of 'north-western Europe'. Matthias Egeler works hard in the Introduction to provide a cohesive narrative to link these themes with the collected chapters. At a superficial level, there is no doubt that each does have as its focus an aspect of myth and landscape from the denoted region. However, this surface level is simply not enough upon which to build critical incursions in the field. Myth and landscape are delightfully troubling terms: they are not universal or self-evident concepts. Egeler makes this entirely apparent in his useful Introduction, which canvasses many of the interpretations and critical applications of both terms. I would advise that this is an introduction not to be skipped and I commend his choice of topic/s and spirit of interdisciplinary engagement. Nonetheless, the degree to which individual authors engaged critically with these conceptual lynchpins varies greatly. This is not simply the case of differing interpretation and application of key concepts—that is a delight of the themed collection form—but rather, an inconsistency in the acknowledgment of the unstable meaning of key terms from chapter to chapter. Similarly, another dominant theme that ran untroubled through many chapters was that of wild vs domestic/cultured place and the boundaries which maintain such distinctions. Elizabeth Fitzpatrick, in her analysis of hilltop cairns as boundary monuments (Chapter 6), does subject the concept of wilderness to critical scrutiny, but for many others such designations were deployed as 'given'. Many opportunities were missed for teasing out and problematizing key categories and their construction.

The most problematic conceptual issue in the volume is also the source of its great richness: myth. This not only pertains to what the term encompasses for individual authors, but the way in which it appears to invite forms of universal speculation. There are moments of this less robust association in the volume, for example, in cases where very detailed and specific analysis of text or vernacular beliefs about a specific location are suddenly designated as correlates with traditions from cultures and times vastly different. These 'other' cultural examples often deployed as short 'tab-on' at chapter end. Most only undermine the rigour of the preceding analysis. The erasure of cultural difference in this style of associated mapping is of significant ethical concern.

Egeler structures the volume in two sections: (i) Myth and Real-World Landscapes, and (ii) Myth and Landscapes of Literature. This organization is not seamless; given their content, many chapters could slip over the designated section

borders. Indeed, most of the case studies could usefully disrupt the maintenance of the binary between ‘real’ and ‘literary’ landscapes and/or ‘real’ and ‘folk-belief’ inscribed places. Highlights of the first section include Terry Gunnell’s exploration of ‘sitting out’ as ritual practice for obtaining ‘mystical knowledge’ in relation to grave mounds, particularly a pre-Christian mound from Litlu-Ketilsstaðir (north-west Iceland); Egeler’s own chapter on the place-lore of *Hvandalur Valler* (northern Iceland) and Fitzpatrick’s exploration of ‘Finn’s Wilderness and Boundary Landforms in Medieval Ireland’. In the second section, of note is Marie-Luise Theuerkauf’s detailed and focused reading of selected *Dindshenchas* narratives in the Middle Irish *Tochmarc Emire*, and Edyta Lehmann’s analysis of poetic wooded spaces from Old Irish poetry to contemporary verse. It is in this chapter that ecocritical concerns find a voice in the volume, with Lehmann emphasizing the ‘real-life and metaphorical significance’ of landscapes in the contemporary context of widespread landscape degradation (p. 252). The many ways—plural epistemologies—in which landscape is viewed, valued, and experienced is of immense contemporary relevance and more could have been made of the volume’s overall contribution in this regard.

Despite these conceptual reservations regarding key term definitions and their varied deployment, this volume is a highly valuable contribution to scholarship on the diverse ways in which landscape—physical, metaphysical, and all ‘gradients’ between—was inhabited and understood in medieval north-western Europe. In particular, there are exciting moments of interdisciplinary analysis and engaging discussion of the relations between Norse and Celtic traditions. Only, just as with that box of Christmas sweets, one is left wishing for more!

JAY JOHNSTON, *The University of Sydney*

**Einbinder**, Susan L., *After the Black Death: Plague and Commemoration among Iberian Jews* (Middle Ages Series), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2018; hardback; pp. 240; 4 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$69.95, £54.00; ISBN 9780812250312.

The great pandemic that swept across Europe in the fourteenth century and killed millions, earning itself the grim name of ‘the Black Death’, has been the object of many studies in recent decades. Those historians who have examined the effects of the plague on the Jewish communities scattered across Western Europe have tended to focus on the antisemitic accusation that Jews caused the plague by poisoning wells, and the massacres and trials that it provoked. The actual impact of the epidemic on Jewish communities has been neglected, and it is this significant oversight that Susan Einbinder endeavours to address in this book by using a variety of sources of information: documentary, literary, medical, and archaeological.

The first chapter (pp. 14–31) provides historical context that will be useful to readers unfamiliar with the history of medieval Jews in the fourteenth century prior to the outbreak of the plague in 1348, especially attacks on Jews in the 1320s. The

following four chapters all focus on a different type of primary evidence and seek to highlight what it can reveal about the impact of the plague on various Iberian Jewish communities. The second chapter (pp. 32–56) analyses the commemorative liturgical lament (*qinah*) of Emanuel ben Joseph, comparing it with other extant laments and noting the absence of calls for revenge and its emphasis on faith and penitence. Moving on, the third chapter (pp. 57–87) focuses on writings of a very different nature: a medical tractate on the plague authored around 1349 by Abraham Caslari. Beyond its medical nature, Einbinder argues that aspects of the work offer important evidence on religious and social reactions to the epidemic. Contrasting the work with similar Christian ones, Einbinder notes the absence of expressions of communal trauma in the work. The fourth chapter (pp. 88–116), appropriately entitled ‘Stone of Memory’, examines surviving tombstone epitaphs related to plague mortality in Toledo (Castile, central Spain). It notes the absence of evidence in these texts of anti-Jewish violence in Toledo itself and argues that ‘the range of imagery and narrative formats’ in them ‘maintain an individuality and elegance even as they grapple with multiple deaths among families and friends’. Once again, we are left not so much with a sense of a collective trauma but ‘a range of religious and cultural outlooks’. Finally, the fifth chapter (pp. 117–47) analyses the grisly evidence of an attack on the Jewish community of the town of Cervera (Catalonia) in 1348 found in a mass grave and self-perception in the ‘survivors’ literature’ that was produced in the aftermath of the outbreak of anti-Jewish violence. The book ends not with a conclusion but with a useful appendix, containing translations from Hebrew into English of the epitaphs carved in the tombstones of Jewish plague victims in Toledo.

In this volume, Einbinder has sought to argue that the great plague of the late 1340s was not as cataclysmic for the cohesion of Iberian Jewish communities as it might have been thought. Anti-Jewish violence was not a general phenomenon (it occurred in Aragon but not in Castile) and it did not cause a ‘crisis of faith’ amongst Iberian Jews. The variety of sources studied constitutes not only one of the major strengths of this book but also its principal weakness, since the quantity of evidence remains limited and this correspondingly limits the scope of Einbinder’s conclusions. The absence of a concluding chapter underscores the fact that this volume reads more like a collection of independent articles than an integrated work or monograph. Overall, the argument seems to remain tentative and more research will be needed to buttress it. Nevertheless, this book offers a valuable scholarly contribution to our existing knowledge of the impact of the Black Death on Jewish communities in the Iberian Peninsula. As the coronavirus pandemic sweeps the globe in 2020, this timely book reminds us to be wary of making assumptions about the psychological impact of deadly epidemics on communities.

FRANÇOIS SOYER, *University of New England*

**Etchingham**, Colmán, Jón Viðar **Sigurðsson**, Máire Ní **Mhaonaigh**, and Elizabeth **Ashman Rowe**, *Norse-Gaelic Contacts in a Viking World* (Medieval Texts and Cultures of Northern Europe, 29), Turnhout, Brepols, 2019; pp. xii, 439; 8 b/w illustrations, 1 b/w table; R.R.P. €65.00; ISBN 9782503579023.

This high-quality publication is a true collaboration, to the extent that the four authors take joint responsibility for the content. As a consequence, it retains coherence and consistency throughout, a quality that is often lacking in volumes of collected chapters. Overall, there are but a few quibbles, and the only one worth noting is the volume's title, which promises, but does not deliver, the 'Viking World'. Perhaps the book it might be better titled *The Textualities of Late Medieval Contacts between Norse and Gaelic Elites*. This work is concerned geographically with the 'Norwegian Insular Viking Zone' and the subject matter is confined to late textual reflexes and interactions of cultural elites, not really the 'Viking World' at all.

The professed focus of this book 'is to account for the continuing relevance of Norse-Gaelic contacts' (p. 3) in the 'long' thirteenth century, from the 1169 Norman invasion of Ireland to the early fourteenth-century Hauksbók edition of *Landnamabók*: a period that is nominally post-Viking Age. Within this frame, four textual witnesses from the thirteenth century are examined: *Konungs skuggsjá*, *Njáls saga*, *Landnámabók*, and (perhaps the least known of the four) *Baile Suthach Síth Embna*, a Gaelic praise poem for Ragnall mac Godfraidh, king of Man, that incorporates the dual Gaelic-Scandinavian heritage of Man as its subject matter. The four texts are examined for signs of Norwegian influence during the period, within the wider context of increasing Norman influence in Scotland and the Isle of Man. Indeed, Man comes out of this study enjoying a significant degree of centrality for the milieu, as a location that was politically, culturally, and geographically critical to the continued Norse presence, influence and textual production in the 'Zone'.

The authors argue a sound case that both the 'Wonders of Ireland' component of *Konungs skuggsjá* and the source material (that is, the putative *\*Brjáns saga*) behind the Norse accounts of the Battle of Clontarf in *Orkneyinga saga*, *Njáls saga*, and *Þorsteins saga Síðu-Hallssonar* was composed in the Norse-Gaelic milieu on the Isle of Man. Moreover, they argue evidence for this early twelfth-century Manx Norse source material to have made its way to Iceland (as source for the Icelandic saga versions) via thirteenth-century Norway. The authors also note ties and reciprocal interests between Hákon IV's Norway and the thirteenth-century Norse kings of Man, arguing, inter alia, that Norway's interests in Ireland (such as is revealed in *Konungs skuggsjá*) are mirrored by Manx interests in Hákon's predecessor, Ingi II Bárðarson, evidenced in *Baile Suthach*. In that poem, Ragnall's status idealizes both Irish and Norse cultures, and the poet is shown to be operating at the intersection of high-status Gaelic and Norse cultural and political spheres.

The volume incorporates the text of much of the material it discusses, with much of this newly edited and translated: the ‘Wonders of Ireland’ section of *Konungs skuggsjá* and *Baile Suthach* are both presented anew here. Also included in original and translation are the four Icelandic texts dealing with the Battle of Clontarf: the three excerpted prose accounts from the sagas noted above, along with the verse version (also found in *Njáls saga*) known as *Darraðarljóð*. Moreover, the *Konungs skuggsjá* text is analysed in tabular comparison with three related *mirabilia* texts: *De mirabilibus Hiberniae* (attributed to Bishop Patrick), the Middle Irish *Do Ingantaib Érenn* and Gerald of Wales’s *Topographia Hibernica*, examining both context and motivation behind Norse interest in Ireland. Similarly, *Baile Suthach* is edited and read closely in the context of the array of political and cultural factors intersecting in the Irish Sea during the period, and implications for understanding the position and status of the Manx king in respect of both Ireland and Norway are explored. The Clontarf material is examined comparatively and contextually, highlighting both the composition process, and the diverging textualities of the event.

Having examined *Konungs skuggsjá*, *Baile Suthach*, and the Battle of Clontarf in Chapters 2, 3 and 4 respectively, the authors then turn in the fifth chapter to Gaelic personal names incorporated in the genealogies of the *Landnámabók*, the thirteenth century text(s) describing the settlement of Iceland. Here the authors identify possible motivations in claims to high status Gaelic ancestry, contextualized in thirteenth-century Icelandic politics, and discuss the high likelihood that some of these genealogies were motivated politically, were likely to have been fictitious, and were introduced as literate culture rather than being a part of oral tradition.

At a time when costly hard copy collections have become, de facto, the medium *du jour* of academic publication, for aspiring and established academics alike, a volume such as this comes along and one’s faith can be restored in this system of knowledge production, for this volume offers new and challenging findings, in a manner that is truly collaborative.

RODERICK McDONALD, *Emu Forge, Sheffield, UK*

**Fenster**, Thelma, and Carolyn P. **Collette**, eds, *The French of Medieval England: Essays in Honour of Jocelyn Wogan-Browne*, Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2017; hardback; pp. 360; 6 b/w, 1 line illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843844594.

This book is a Festschrift for Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, whose prolific scholarship on the French written, read, and spoken in medieval England has fostered much-needed interdisciplinary research into Britain’s plurilingual past. Its publication is a welcome intellectual and political intervention at a moment when Brexit has seen fervent claims advanced about England’s essential difference from Europe, and created a climate in which speaking English has become problematically entangled with the idea of being ‘English’. Felicity Riddy’s ‘Foreword’ notes that

as an Australian, Wogan-Browne ‘sees England with an outsider’s clarity: part of a small island that is closer to France than Tasmania is to mainland Australia; always mongrel and multicultural but caught up in a monoglot version of its own past’ (p. xiv). Approaching the French of England from a variety of disciplinary perspectives, the contributors complicate and destabilize simplistic narratives about language and identity by providing rich explorations of Francophony and multilingualism across a breadth of literary, social, political, and commercial contexts and practices.

Despite the diversity of subject matter, literary and archival sources, and methods represented—from close reading of a single literary text to data-driven analysis of government records spanning years—the volume is given a pleasing coherence through its underlying connections to the major thematic strands of Wogan-Browne’s work. Most of the contributions focus on texts and contexts c. 1100 to c. 1500, with chapters by Paul Cohen and Delbert Russell considering afterlives of the French of medieval England in early modern and nineteenth-century scholarship. Thomas O’Donnell, Emma Campbell, and Monika Otter engage with practices of translation, glossing, and translational ethics. Working across French, Latin, and English in scientific, literary, and musical manuscripts, the authors challenge the construction of linguistic hierarchies by emphasizing the co-presence of languages and their flexible uses in multilingual communities. Chapters by Fiona Somerset, Serge Lusignan, and Richard Ingham examine the cultural and political weight carried by French vocabularies and registers deployed within, respectively, political complaint poems; cross-border communications from the Anglo-Scottish Wars of 1295–1314; and the *Early South English Legendary*. Theoretically sophisticated studies by Christopher Baswell and Thelma Fenster extend upon Wogan-Browne’s pioneering work on women’s textual communities. Fenster offers a fascinating, if disturbing, account of the dissemination of anti-Jewish myths and stereotypes through French texts commissioned by aristocratic English laywomen and intended for the instruction of children. Baswell deftly integrates considerations of space, gender, and disability networks to develop a stimulating and original reading of the *Lives* of three women saints in the Campsey manuscript.

Andrew Taylor, Nicholas Watson, and R. F. Yeager address questions of audience and illuminate intricate interactions between French and English languages in medieval literary texts, whether a *chanson de geste* that turns out to be ‘a Plantagenet celebration of Charlemagne’ (p. 100); the canonical *Piers Plowman*; or John Gower’s under-studied French poems. Turning from manuscript cultures to social contexts, W. Mark Ormrod and Maryanne Kowaleski draw on the considerable data of the ‘England’s Immigrants, 1350–1550’ project to investigate language acquisition and use amongst French-speaking immigrants to England at either end of the Hundred Years’ War. These chapters present invaluable empirical evidence for ‘daily linguistic encounters’ (p. 194) and for how people understood and experienced national and regional identities. Robert M. Stein’s posthumous

contribution, in the form of a short but dense conference paper, contemplates the ways territory and sovereignty were imagined in twelfth- and thirteenth-century Anglo-Norman chronicles and poetry, with ‘important consequences for the whole course of the historiography of state formation or nation building’ (p. 273). Finally, Robert W. Hanning’s ‘Afterword’ brings the book to a satisfying conclusion, drawing together its diverse threads to highlight broader interconnections and intellectual contributions, while also providing a useful guide to the reader who may wish to dip in and out as their own research interests dictate.

This volume covers an impressive amount of disciplinary, methodological, and theoretical ground, so it seems churlish to note what it does not include. Nevertheless, as a scholar interested in legal history, I was slightly disappointed not to find some specific consideration of the uses of French in English legal culture. Paul Cohen makes brief reference to 1362’s Statute of Pleading, but there is much more to discover about ‘law French’, not simply as a technical language but as a cultural force that helped to shape the vernacular identities of England’s lawyers. This, however, is a minor quibble about a rich and well-conceived collection that will reward readers from disciplines including literature, history, linguistics, and musicology.

E. AMANDA McVITTY, *Massey University*

**Gaposchkin, M. Cecilia**, *Invisible Weapons: Liturgy and the Making of Crusade Ideology*, Ithaca/London, Cornell University Press, 2017; hardback; pp. xxv, 349; R.R.P. US\$69.95; ISBN 9781501705151.

In writing *Invisible Weapons*, arguably the first ‘devotional history of the crusades’ (p. 6), Cecilia Gaposchkin has made an original and valuable contribution not just to the modern study of the crusading movement, but also to scholarship on medieval religious thought and practice. By privileging the study of ‘liturgy *in* history’ (p. 9) as opposed to the history *of* liturgy, Gaposchkin’s approach to her rich and thoroughly documented source material opens up insightful new perspectives on the interdependence between crusading ideology and liturgical texts in the medieval West between the eleventh and sixteenth centuries.

As Gaposchkin points out in the introduction, one of the advantages of examining the crusades through a liturgical lens is that ‘the narrative told through the liturgy resists the traditional way of telling the story of crusading’ (p. 12). Instead of using the traditional numbering system of the crusading expeditions to dictate the shape and direction of her analysis, Gaposchkin organically lets the sources themselves ‘establish turning points [...] [and reveal] seminal moments of creativity and change that occur against the larger backdrop of continuities and slow developments’ (p. 12). Consequently, the book focuses on the striking liturgical developments that coalesced around such ‘turning points’ as the capture of Jerusalem by the earliest crusaders in 1099, the loss of the city to Saladin in 1187, Pope Innocent III’s promulgation of the bull *Quia maior* in 1213, and the Ottoman conquest of Constantinople in 1453.

An intelligent chapter on ‘Preliminaries’ helps to orient readers who may be unfamiliar with the history of the crusades and the nature and terminology of the Catholic liturgy. Chapter 1 then lays the groundwork for the analysis by tracing the profound influence of pre-crusade liturgy on the formation of crusading ideology in the regions that ‘would become the heartland of the crusades’ (p. 57). Chapter 2 builds on this foundation and explores the general shift from militancy and triumphalism towards penitence, introspection, and salvation in crusading spirituality and its attendant liturgy in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries by analysing the increasingly tight liturgical nexus between rites for departing pilgrims, rites for arms-bearers and their equipment, and rites for the blessing of the crusader’s cross. Gaposchkin thus reveals how liturgical ideas and practices imbued crusading ideology and evolved in turn under the influence of the nascent crusading movement.

In Chapter 3, one of the cornerstones of the book, Gaposchkin focuses on liturgical performance as a key element of both the lived experience of the First Crusade and the way in which the expedition was narrated in contemporary and later chronicles. Picking up on these themes, Chapter 4 offers an illuminating analysis of how the liturgy celebrating the triumph of 1099 moulded the cultural memory of the First Crusade within the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem in the twelfth century. To conclude what is effectively a thematic triptych at the heart of the book, Chapter 5 charts the many and varied ways in which the memory of the First Crusade was incorporated into the Western liturgy in the twelfth century, presenting an analysis which crucially ‘shows that the liturgical commemoration of 15 July [1099] was not an exclusively clerical discourse’ (p. 167).

If the first five chapters are primarily concerned with how the liturgy paved the way for the First Crusade and then transformed in response to its stunning successes, Chapters 6 and 7 analyse instead the implementation of liturgical measures such as ritual clamours, prayers, and processions as an attempt both to mitigate disasters (such as those of 1187 and 1453) and to bolster new crusading expeditions in the later Middle Ages. Although the latter concentrates on the ‘flowering of liturgical supplication in support of crusading against the Ottomans’ (p. 227), both chapters complement each other and convincingly explain ‘the way in which the crusades were iteratively sacralized and brought into the very heart of Christian identity’ (p. 195) from the late twelfth century on. The book concludes with three excellent appendices on the liturgy of the commemoration of 15 July 1099, the development of the crusading clamour across different texts over time, and the non-liturgical evidence for liturgical measures in support of the crusades.

It has to be said that the discussion of evidence for liturgical practices on later crusading expeditions feels a little slender in comparison to the treatment of the First Crusade, whose prominence within Gaposchkin’s analysis is both inevitable and (admittedly) understandable. But this is only a minor quibble about a study that represents a major achievement. In my view, *Invisible Weapons* is one of the most important books on the crusades to be published in recent decades. Like the

very best scholarship in the field, it deepens our understanding of the crusades and the ideology that fuelled them, but situates the whole phenomenon within the wider cultural context of the medieval West, revealing ultimately how ‘the liturgy imbibed the ideals of crusade such that crusade ideals and aspirations became part of Christian identity’ (p. 261).

JAMES H. KANE, *Flinders University*

**Graney**, Christopher M., *Mathematical Disquisitions: The Booklet of Theses Immortalized by Galileo*, Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2017; paperback; pp. 176; R.R.P. US\$25.00; ISBN 9780268102418.

In Australia we can, almost daily, watch the sun slowly trace a circular arc across the sky. So it is counterintuitive to think that it is the sun, and not the earth, that is the centre of our existence. Increasing, and increasingly accurate, astronomical observations, enhanced by the invention of the telescope, accelerated the acceptance of Copernicus’s description of the solar system over the more convoluted Ptolemaic systems of epicycles (circles on circles). In the early seventeenth century, in addition to pre-Copernican views that had the authority of the Bible to back them up, there were also many common-sense observations that militated against the view of Copernicus. It was not just the earth going round the sun but also the earth spinning on its axis that caused consternation, and disbelief.

Enter Locher, or should we say Christoph Scheiner, Locher’s Jesuit mentor, since there was, and remains, controversy over who exactly wrote this book (for convenience I shall attribute it to Locher below). The debate on authorship is something for elsewhere and has already been taken up by one reviewer. Whatever the case, the book was published forty years before Newton, and what a difference Newton’s theories would make! This volume shows the sorts of attitudes that people would have to grapple with until the works of Newton arrived and became widely understood. In particular, the complexities of gravitation had yet to be worked out. Here we see the ideas of a lover of astronomy, ideas that are very largely quite sensible and/or comprehensible, being put forward in 1614 in opposition to those of the Copernicans (Copernicus’s book was published in 1543).

Graney’s translation, which takes certain liberties I shall mention later, takes us deep into contemporary thought and, for a very large part, the thought is perfectly acceptable: Locher follows common sense. He seems even more sensible when you remember there is no understanding of action at a distance, which was a key to Newton’s ideas. The translation helps us to see how Locher (and many contemporaries) thought.

Today, it is hard for us to realize how relatively quickly the vision of the solar system and the heavens changed in the century after Copernicus published his scheme. The sizes of stars and their distances were a revelation, while the use of the telescope, invented in 1608, led to obvious questions that could not be answered in Locher’s time (*Disquisition XLII*, p. 98). The author is aware of this

and accepts part of Copernicus, for example, the view that Mercury and Venus go round the sun, while also accepting Tycho Brahe's view that five planets go round the sun (pp. 59–60), but he is looking, and waiting, for further clarification: as he says on p. 58, it is easy to criticize, hard to get things right.

This is unashamedly 'a student-friendly translation' (p. ix). Nevertheless, students of the history, or perhaps better, of the development, of science will find many fascinating insights. A few examples. Unlike many in the seventeenth century, Locher is careful to distinguish astronomy and astrology (and has no interest in the latter) (p. 16). The argument on p. 19 against infinite multitudes held sway until George Cantor in the nineteenth century! (There is a similar argument in *Disquisition XIX*, pp. 51–52.) On the other hand, he argues there can be no slowest speed (p. 24), that distances are infinitely divisible (p. 49, item 5) but infinitesimals are impossible (p. 21). More surprising, perhaps, is his argument (against Aristotle in particular) on p. 22 that the universe cannot have always existed but must have had a beginning, but then the Bible's authority is supreme (p. 31). Further, Graney adds commendable notes: note 100, re p. 43, on centripetal force, is outstanding, as is Locher's insight.

On the negative side, the more academic will baulk at the translator's remark (p. xxvii): 'I at times significantly reorder or shorten Locher's original phrases', and indeed whole paragraphs! Nevertheless, he has, as he says, preserved the mathematics (in fact more than that: the astronomical science) of the text, but, comparing the original Latin, which is readily accessible online, is a time-consuming exercise for the pedantic. Further, interjecting translations from, for example, the eighteenth and other centuries, disrupts the flow. Sometimes references are incomplete. For example, on p. 11, Clavius is referenced but his book, the Jesuit 'bible' for arithmetic, is not listed, though it is among the *Opera Mathematica*, listed in the bibliography. But these are small quibbles.

Graney has presented the next generation with a fascinating view of the science of astronomy under rapid and unfinished development, and presented it in a way that is accessible and eminently readable.

JOHN N. CROSSLEY, *Monash University*

**Hesson, Angela, Charles Zika, and Matthew Martin**, eds, *Love: Art of Emotion 1400–1800*, Melbourne, National Gallery of Victoria, 2017; paperback; pp. xii, 233; fully colour illustrated; R.R.P. AU\$49.95; ISBN 9781925432312.

Is there any emotion more complex and nuanced than love? It is well known that the ancient Greeks had at least sixteen terms for love in all its forms: from love that is physical (*eros*) to altruistic (*agape*), to love of a friend (*philia*). The Swiss philosopher Denis de Rougement recognized these nuances in his classic book on the subject, *Love in the Western World* (1956), in which he attempted to survey the evolution of love from a literary perspective, with particular focus on the later emergence of romantic and passionate love. Rougement's attempt to read

two thousand years of texts through evolving concepts of love is one of the most significant forays in the field of the history of emotions. Surprisingly, a similar history for visual culture remains to be written.

Therefore, the present publication is a very welcome one indeed. *Love: Art of Emotion 1400–1800*, is an impressive and beautifully illustrated catalogue that accompanied the exhibition of the same title at the National Gallery of Victoria (NGV) in 2017. As the principal outcome of a collaboration between the NGV, The University of Melbourne, and the ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions 1100–1800 (CHE), the exhibition and now its catalogue are part of a burgeoning field of historical research in which the emotions are at the forefront rather than receded. The painstaking curation by Angela Hesson deserves to be singled out—it could not have been easy to bring cohesion to this diverse and complex array of objects—as much as her excellent and evocatively titled ‘Silver-sweet and Frantic-mad’ introduction to the catalogue. For those who could not attend the exhibition, this catalogue is a welcome surrogate; those who did will be drawn into happy reminiscence of a thoughtful and often sensual show that was further enriched by accompanying music.

The focus is very much on Western art, with the diversity of objects well suited to an emotion that continues to defy facile characterization. Love as embodied in family, friendship, religious devotion, patriotism, and nostalgia are represented not only in the expected paintings and prints but also earthenware bowls, porcelain sculptures, reliquaries, rings, fans, silks, and linens. A significant outcome is to highlight just how varied and rich the NGV collections are, with over two hundred objects chosen for inclusion. The shifts between the micro and the macro, the private and public—tiny painted snuff boxes to large scale canvases—are entirely fitting for the multifarious theme. Objects have lives, and they are very much palpable here.

As rich in thought as the objects themselves are the scholarly essays, which invoke the works of art featured in the exhibition and beyond. Anne Dunlop gives a rich discussion of the reception of Ovid, whose poetry was so central to early modern conceptions of love; Patricia Simons explores the spaces of love from gardens, to bathhouses, to taverns; and James Grantham Turner considers depictions of bodies in physical and amorous pursuits. Rituals of love are detailed by Matthew Martin, while Gary Schwartz explores the love of art itself. Some of the most surprising objects featured in the exhibition—such as pendants, rings, and fans—are discussed by curator Angela Hesson and Lisa Beaven, and their characterizations of ‘the erotic charge between collector and objects’ are amongst the most compelling passages in this catalogue. Indeed, it is the ‘the emotional life of objects’ that is perhaps the most striking thematic to emerge.

In effect, the choice of works and the timeframe predate the notion of romantic love. Perhaps a significant outcome here is to highlight how relatively recent such a notion really is (as anticipated by Rougement’s book cited above). As Anne

Dunlop points out, the essays and objects to hand ‘suggest just how historically contingent the idea of love always is’. This catalogue is highly recommended.

ANDREA BUBENIK, *University of Queensland*

**Jones, Claire Taylor**, *Ruling the Spirit: Women, Liturgy, and Dominican Reform in Late Medieval Germany*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2018; cloth; pp. 224; R.R.P. US\$59.95; ISBN 9780812249552.

Medievalists tend to avoid liturgical studies. This book, however, concerns liturgy in its widest sense: the services of the church (the mass, the canonical offices, the little office of Our Lady) rather than the intimidating minutiae of introits and antiphons. It focuses on the convent of St Katherine in Nuremberg, which was reformed by Observant Dominican friars in 1428, and whose library contained over 700 manuscripts, about a quarter of them Latin liturgical texts.

Claire Taylor Jones argues that although the Dominicans were primarily a preaching order, for the nuns preaching was replaced by the performance of the Latin office: didactic texts written for them by Dominican friars and found in St Katherine’s library showed how this activity could fulfil Dominican spiritual ideals. In the first half of the fourteenth century, Johannes Tauler in his vernacular sermons and Heinrich Seuse in his Latin treatises had taught the virtue of true detachment (*gelassenheit*) achieved through orderly liturgical devotion governed by discretion (*bescheidenheit*), as opposed to disorderly mystical experience. Tauler had discouraged extra-liturgical prayer and Seuse urged conscientious attendance at mass and office.

Jones then turns to the numerous ‘sisterbooks’ produced by Dominican nuns in southern Germany and Switzerland, also in the fourteenth century, but favourably received by the Dominican reform in the fifteenth. Again, many were owned, and copied, by the St Katherine’s nuns. These texts not only celebrated visionary experience but also obedience to the Dominican rule and strict liturgical observance. This raises the question of the nuns’ fluency in Latin, and Jones cites some interesting examples from the ‘sisterbooks’ of the use of Latin liturgical texts.

But in the later fourteenth century liturgical observance fell into disrepair among the Dominicans, leading to the reform movement at the end of the century. This was slow to gain traction, and it was not until 1428 that St Katherine’s was reformed by a third Dominican, Johannes Nider. This included reform of the Office and the correction and updating of liturgical books. There was a new concern for the nuns’ ability to understand Latin, leading to the production of vernacular translations, to be read aloud at mealtimes or studied privately.

The immensely prolific Nider produced *The Twenty-four Golden Harps*, a sermon-cycle inspired by Cassian but with his liturgical emphasis excised, for the pious laity and religious. Later he made a close German translation of Cassian for the nuns alone (St Katherine’s owned two copies). The widely disseminated *Harps*

promoted ‘contemplative visualization of Christ and Mary’ (p. 104) and the use of the imagination, but the translation, of which only three copies survive, privileged liturgical prayer, particularly the recitation of psalms.

Nider oversaw the retraining of the St Katherine’s nuns in the conscientious performance of the Office, which ‘supported the virtue, contemplative devotion and piety of those who participated’ (p. 122). In addition, their library contained texts designed for communal reading—Humbert of Romans’s commentary on the Augustinian Rule, William Durandus’s *Rationale*, Tauler’s sermons, German translations of gospels and epistles—which helped the nuns to understand the literal and spiritual significance of the liturgy.

Finally, Jones turns to Johannes Meyer, chronicler of the reform movement, editor of ‘sisterbooks’ and author of the *Book of the Reformation* and *Book of Duties*, both written in the vernacular for the nuns. The latter prescribes ‘the banal day-to-day activities’ (p. 144) that freed most of the nuns for prayer. It also recommends readings for mealtimes such as Cassian, Gregory the Great’s *Dialogues*, the Augustinian Rule, and liturgical readings, and requires various office-holders, particularly the novice mistress, to train the nuns in the performance of the Office.

His *Book of the Reformation* presents an exemplar of the ideal of communal worship in the lengthy life of the Dominican nun Clara von Ostren. Because she ‘could not sing’ she was assigned duties that excluded her from participation in the Office and mass (p. 155). But in response to her earnest prayers, the Virgin miraculously endowed her with a such good voice that she became choir mistress!

There is such a wealth of material in this book that it is sometimes confusing: is it primarily a bibliographical study of texts belonging to St Katherine’s, or an historical study of the Dominican reform in Germany, or an account of four Observant friars and their writings for women? In addition, its concern with the unfashionable subject of liturgy and its extensive use of medieval German sources (always translated, however) may prevent it from gaining a ready audience among those interested in medieval women religious. But they should step outside their comfort zone and venture into unfamiliar territory.

ALEXANDRA BARRATT, *University of Waikato*

**Jørgensen, Dolly, and Virginia Langum**, eds, *Visions of North in Premodern Europe* (Cursor Mundi, 31), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. x, 373; 17 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503574752.

One outstanding feature of this miscellany is the skilful fitting together of the chapters: despite approaching the topic from disparate angles, and spanning antiquity to the eighteenth century, each segues seamlessly into the next. Close interrelations between the contributions likewise make this volume one best read as a whole. Something would be lost in consulting a single essay.

The North, as Dawn Hollis puts it (p. 225) is ‘something between a direction, a place and a sense of distance’, necessarily envisaged in regard to a

South. Rather than consider it as a geographic entity, the book addresses notions and constructions of North, how these changed over time, and how northerners incorporated southern sentiments into their own experience.

The investigative method is frequently innovative and multi-disciplinary. Barbara Auger, for instance, uses linguistic, textual, and architectural evidence to propose that chroniclers devised a conversion narrative satisfactory to Norman dukes—in which pagan Vikings fled Scandinavia to become Christian Normans—from classical accounts of barbarian invasions, and scriptural precedents whereby the Old Testament prefigured the New. One result of this methodological verve is that readers are regularly exposed to theoretical concepts: imagology, belonging, p-values, paramaps, and a ‘grammar of the North’. While these are interesting, the terminology is not always as fully explained as might be desired.

Connections between chapters create recurring motifs. Those interested in a history of ideas about the North can follow the influence of notable writers, down time and on each other: Strabo, Pliny, Jordanes, Adam of Bremen, Jean Bodin, Olaus Magnus, Olaus Rudbeck, and others. Stefan Donecker describes how the notion, obtained from Jordanes, of Scandinavia as a breeding-ground for migratory tribes suffered when Tacitus’s *Germania*, which suggested Germans were sedentary, resurfaced in 1450.

The essays reveal persistent ambivalence towards the region. Pär Sandin’s and Lewis Webb’s chapters, which survey classical references to Thule and Hyperborea, describe positive and negative attitudes. This duality persisted. Hollis finds resemblances to orientalism in eighteenth-century southern sentiments towards Scots and northern Englanders.

Classical and biblical texts represented the North as a source of barbarians and the seat of Lucifer. Northern writers had to integrate such stereotypes with their own experience. Several contributors address this dilemma. Steffen Hope describes twelfth-century Norwegian authors, new to Latinate Christendom, equating the ‘real’ North with Lapland, home of the pagan Sami. This strategy, whereby northern nations sought to identify themselves with southern civilization by displacing undesirable northern attributes onto other peoples, is addressed by several contributors, including Jeremy DeAngelo and Virginia Langum, who reviews English reactions to the prevalent climate theory, which endowed northern nations, themselves included, with negative character traits.

Southern visions of the North were less complicated, with Vikings and Protestants striking Spaniards and Italians as confirmation of its reputation. However, as Mateo Ballester Rodríguez, and Helena Wangefelt Ström and Federico Barbierato describe, after the Thirty Years’ War these nations’ improved acquaintance with Sweden and Denmark forced them to adjust their ideas. The effect on preconceptions of advancing knowledge is another of the book’s recurrent themes. The rise of Germany, England, and Sweden rendered climate theories that linked high latitudes with barbarism untenable.

The development of a Republic of Letters also prompted reassessments of the North. Kim Simonsen presents the Faroe Islands as a case study. Päivi Maria Pihlaja concludes the volume with an account of French astronomer Jean Sylvain Bailly's unlikely location, after scientific inquiry, of Europe's first advanced civilization, Atlantis, at the Spitsbergen Archipelago between Norway and the Arctic. This brings the volume full circle, back to Thule and Hyperborea, but also attests a shift from southern stereotypes of the North as the home of evil, monsters, and savages, to a positive view of it as the fount of liberty and civilization. Contributors note the dangers inherent in a move from an adverse climate theory of temperaments towards an association of northerliness with civilization and purity.

Several chapters concern cartography and how it reflected developing knowledge about the North. Mirela Avdagic examines descriptive mapping (chorography) over the classical era. Others deal with the placement of animal images on maps. Vicki Szabo proposes that the shifting locations of marine monsters, and fluctuating levels of concern about them, may be proxy evidence for climate change and changes in biogeography. Dolly Jørgensen considers the situation of land animals, demonstrating that as mapmakers became more familiar with Scandinavia, and their techniques changed, they needed to select new species as representative of the North.

All in all, the volume comprises a collection of essays, sophisticated in themselves, which engage with modern concerns and new methodologies, but are expertly integrated with each other too.

PATRICK BALL, *University of Tasmania*

**Kane, Bronach C.,** *Popular Memory and Gender in Medieval England: Men, Women, and Testimony in the Church Courts, c. 1200–1500* (Gender in the Middle Ages, 13), Woodbridge, The Boydell Press, 2019; hardback; pp. 309; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781783273522.

How do we remember? In *Popular Memory and Gender in Medieval England*, Bronach Kane explores how memory is deployed by lower-status people in church court testimony, particularly attending to memory as an embodied, material practice. As the gender in the title suggests, this book considers how men and women remembered the past differently from each other, but its achievement is much more significant than this might suggest. In writing a history of how ordinary people remember, we learn of memory as not just a process of thought but as bound up with and emerging through the body, environments, and everyday life. Memory studies is a huge area of research, but attention to memory practices amongst medieval and early modern people has been a more modest endeavour. *Popular Memory* can be situated alongside works such as Andy Wood's *The Memory of the People* that move from memory as an exploration of what is retained and forgotten and its relationship to power and nation-building, to memory as something of the everyday and the local.

*Popular Memory* is a substantial book, with seven chapters, and a scholarly introduction and conclusion. It begins with a discussion of how canon law, the legal context of the evidentiary base of the volume, understood and acknowledged memory as a form of legal proof and the (limited) role it allowed for women in providing legal testimony. The remainder of the book explores the different ways that memory was presented within the courts by witnesses to legal cases and how it was given authoritative force. Ranging across themes of sexuality and sex, gendered and especially reproductive bodies, birth, marriage, and death, written memory and orality, and finally place and landscape, *Popular Memory* highlights how the legal evidence—accounts of things seen, thought, felt—were articulated through the mundane and embodied experiences of everyday life. The birth of a child or a wedding became ways to assuredly affirm the dating of a particular event; courts recognized these social facts as memorable for the individual and so they could become anchors that other pieces of evidence could be tied to and made legally compelling. Similarly, descriptions of place and landscape or material items gave weight to testimony, offering explanations as to why certain types of information were known and retained. In doing so, memory was made authoritative through being embedded in the personal and, in particular, in the rhythms of family life and labour.

It is perhaps not surprising therefore that memory was a gendered practice. The lives of men and women, their experiences of sex, reproduction, marriage, work, and property use, were shaped by gender, and so the contours of their testimony, and capacity to speak authoritatively in particular areas, reflected these gendered experiences. As *Popular Memory* suggests, this was not entirely transparent. Men were not only allowed to speak to a wider range of topics and types of legal case, but had greater literacy levels, enabling them to use writing more readily to affirm their memory practices, and were generally considered more reliable witnesses. At times, this allowed their memories to be given greater weight than those of a wife or similar female family member, even in cases where women might have been thought to have more reliable memory experiences (such as a husband countering his wife's dating of childbirth). Yet, as this book shows, if patriarchal norms gave broad shape to the operation of the law, testimony and the gendered experience of memory also offered opportunities to contest, resist, and negotiate power structures. Personal stories, recounted through embodied histories, offered a type of agency for the lower orders.

This overview does not do justice to this book. What makes it a rich and fascinating contribution to the field is not just the larger observation of memory's embodied and material dimension (as original as this is), but its beautiful reading of the source material and its thoughtful unpacking of the nuances of lower-order life during this period. This is a rewarding piece of work with lots of intelligent insights hidden within its larger argument. The methodology—attending to memory practices through embodiment, emotion, and material practice—is highly fashionable and even more successfully deployed. This book is a must read for

historians of any period interested in these themes, or just for those looking for a pleasurable escape into the lives of lower-order medieval families.

KATIE BARCLAY, *University of Adelaide*

**Klaassen, Frank, ed.,** *Making Magic in Elizabethan England. Two Early Modern Vernacular Books of Magic*, University Park, PA, The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2019; hardback; pp. 160; 66 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$89.95; ISBN 9780271083681.

Frank Klaassen's *Making Magic in Elizabethan England* consists of transcripts of two anonymous Elizabethan manuscripts of magic: the Antiphoner Notebook (Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Additional B. 1) and the Boxgrove Manual (London, British Library, MS Harley 2267). In addition to making two obscure and difficult manuscripts accessible to scholars and students of medieval and early modern magic, Klaassen's insightful introductions and notes explain how magic developed and changed during the early modern period. He particularly focuses on how the scribes of the manuscripts altered and adapted the original texts in response to the changing religious and cultural environment of early modern England.

The Protestant parish priest of Boxgrove commissioned a scribe to copy the Boxgrove Manual in the late sixteenth century. The original manuscript is not extant. Written in English, it is a work of learned, ritual magic that draws heavily on the 1578 edition of Agrippa's influential *De occulta philosophia*, as well as other medieval Latin texts of conjuring and necromancy, thus making them accessible to a vernacular audience. It contains lamens and pentacles for the summoning of spirits, many of which have bled through the paper, obscuring the text on the other side. Consequently, Klaassen's consummate transcription has made the text more accessible to modern scholars by overcoming many of the impediments created by the incompetent scribe.

The Antiphoner Notebook was created in the second half of the sixteenth century, probably by a cunning man, on fragments from a fourteenth-century English liturgical manuscript and copied towards the end of the sixteenth century by two scribes. It is a collection of spells, charms, and cures, written both in English and Latin, dealing primarily with the practices with which cunning folk were most concerned: finding thieves, locating treasure, and countering witchcraft. Some of the Latin is untranslatable and Klaassen has done an excellent job of adding suggestions for what the Latin might have meant. For the scribe of the Antiphoner Notebook, the Latin was part of the numinous power of the magic and therefore needed to be retained, despite the problems it presented. To overcome some of these problems the scribes relied on Reginald Scot's *Discoverie of Witchcraft*, first published in 1584. Although this was a sceptical, anti-Catholic work written to expose the practices of cunning folk as fraudulent, it nevertheless provided a useful collection of simplified and vernacularized magical spells, amulets, and remedies that were widely used by cunning folk in the early modern period.

In *Making Magic in Elizabethan England* Klaasen interprets and explains how the scribes who created the manuscripts altered and modified their original sources in response to scientific, religious, and cultural changes in post-Reformation England. In the Boxgrove Manual, for example, the Protestant author removed all the overtly Catholic aspects from his sources. The removal and translation of the Latin from the earlier sources was part of a process in which learned magic was popularized for a much wider English-speaking audience. The Antiphoner Notebook, on the other hand, is ‘a book of magic that preserves older elements, adopts features of the new religion, and despite itself, creates entirely new ones’ (p. 24). Furthermore, the scribe, particularly in his engagement with Scot’s *Discoverie of Witchcraft*, contemplated the differences between religion and magic, thus creating what Klaasen describes as a ‘peculiarly early modern intellectual artefact’ (p. 26). Earlier studies have tended to depict cunning folk as clinging to the old religion for comfort and support in a rapidly transforming world where superstitious, magical practices were being eradicated. Klaasen’s study of the Antiphoner Notebook supports the work of historians such as Owen Davies, by showing how the practice of cunning folk was dynamic and versatile, meeting the changing needs of the communities they served.

Much of the earlier research into English magical traditions has portrayed England as ‘a stagnant intellectual backwater’ (p. 1) and the astrologer John Dee, who borrowed from Europe’s intellectual, sophisticated magical culture, has taken precedence. Klaasen points out that Dee is anomalous to rather than representative of English magic, and in *Making Magic in Elizabethan England* he makes a significant contribution to a growing body of work that explores England’s own unique, complex, and dynamic subculture of magic. While he demonstrates continuity with medieval magical and necromantic texts, Klaasen’s exploration of how the scribes transformed the earlier manuscripts by blending a variety of sources shows that they carefully considered and altered the texts to suit their own purposes. Klaasen’s explanations of how these adaptations were created in response to the intellectual and social transformations of the sixteenth century make for an extremely interesting and useful study of English magic.

JUDITH BONZOL, *Sydney, New South Wales*

**Kovesi**, Catherine, ed., *Luxury and the Ethics of Greed in Early Modern Italy* (Early European Research, 14), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. xxx, 305; 32 colour illustrations, R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9781350098428.

The timeline for the birth of modern consumption practices in Western Europe is constantly in scholarly flux. Some say that the modern consumer society began in the nineteenth century in places like America, others in England or France during the late eighteenth century at the dawn of the industrial revolution. Others still will argue for the seventeenth century with the invention of joint-stock companies and the proliferation of cheap goods that trade from the East and West Indies offered European consumers by the end of that century.

In the introduction to this edited collection of twelve essays, derived from a conference held in 2014, Catherine Kovesi pinpoints the birth of modern consumption practices to Italy during the fifteenth century, when debates about luxury and greed were reframed for the first time since antiquity to critique growing trends of aspirational consumption among newly moneyed communities. This is a bold claim to make, but one that this edited collection does so quite convincingly as it moves from discussions of the meanings of luxury and greed in early modern Italy, to essays dealing with the consumption, dissemination, and imitation of luxury consumer goods throughout the Peninsula.

Section 1 identifies the meanings of the term ‘luxury’, placing it squarely in the context of what it meant in the changing moneyed and consumer landscape of Florence. Kovesi argues that Italy was the first country in Europe to develop a vernacular term—*lusso*—in the fifteenth century, to describe consumptive practices by people with new money and aspirations. She argues that tracing the term luxury through the genealogy of the Latin *luxus* has led historians astray, as *lusso* is related to *luxus/luxuria* but was purposely created in the vernacular to critique new cultures of consumption rather than lust/sensuality. Essays by Kovesi, Lino Pertile and Peter Howard in this section all challenge the assumption that luxury and greed were exclusively associated with the elites, as they discuss the difference between magnificence and luxury, the former being the inherited right to extravagance (framed as a virtue) of the elites, the latter being attributed to the newly moneyed.

Section 2 and Section 3 carry on discussion by examining how goods such as food, clothing, household objects, and books were consumed and disseminated by craftspeople, street pedlars, vendors, and diplomats throughout the Italian Peninsula and beyond. Essays by Maria Giuseppina Muzzarelli and Rosa Salzburg explore the clothing and small luxury items consumed by non-elites who often skirted the boundaries of sumptuary legislation, while those by Timothy Wilson and Sean Roberts examine luxury gift-giving between women and between diplomats. Jola Pellumbi discusses magnificence in her essay on Venetian senatorial dress, a burdensome expense that could financially cripple those patricians forced to wear them. As these robes reflected the dignity of the state, they were considered a magnificence as opposed to a luxury. However, as many nobles simply could not afford magnificence, the significant question posed is: when does magnificence become luxury?

Essays by Laura Giannetti and Rebecca Earle also discuss food and luxury. Earle challenges north-western European ideas about chocolate that associated the food with decadent luxury, pleasure, and idleness. She argues that Spanish discourses stressed chocolate’s ordinariness due to its association with the American colonies where it was widely consumed. Earle’s article, while fascinating, is primarily focused on Spain. Besides a short description of chocolate consumption in the Spanish territories of Sicily and Naples, very little attention is paid to chocolate in a wider Italian context. Was chocolate considered ordinary

in the north of Italy like it was in Naples, or was it a luxury? This question is not answered; probably because it is not part of Earle's overall research focus. As a result, it sets this otherwise excellent essay out of joint with the rest of the collection.

Two of the most interesting and innovative contributions to the volume focus on the materiality of consumer goods to explore how Renaissance Italians faked it until they made it. Essays by Timothy McCall and Paula Hohti examine a wide range of imitation and counterfeit items produced and consumed during this period, from jewels made of coloured glass, to cheaper metal alloys that imitated gold and silver. Both authors stress how widespread this phenomenon was, making it Italy's best (un)kept secret during the Renaissance as rich and poor alike participated in these practices either to keep up the pretence of magnificence (and avoid the financial toll explored by Pellumbi) or to own affordable ornamental objects that decorated their houses.

While the themes of luxury and magnificence do shine through much brighter than those on greed, this collection makes a much-welcomed edition to histories of luxury and consumption in premodern Europe. It offers new and important research about material culture in early modern Italy, building on the work of scholars such as Evelyn Welch, and makes a convincing attempt to relocate the birth of a consumer society much earlier than the eighteenth century, to begin in fifteenth-century Italy.

SARAH BENDALL, *The University of Sydney*

**Krötzl**, Christian, and Sari **Katajala-Peltomaa**, eds, *Miracles in Medieval Canonization Processes: Structures, Functions, and Methodologies* (International Medieval Research, 23), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardcover; pp. x, 290; no illustrations; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503573137.

Much ink has been spilled on medieval hagiography, and rightly so given that the cults of the saints were so important to European culture and spirituality. However, too little research exists regarding the large and complex problem of the process of medieval canonization and its documentary heritage. This book offers first steps in redressing that gap. Building upon the work of Michael Goodich, André Vauchez, Gábor Klaniczay (who is also one of the contributors), and others, the volume asks such questions as: On what evidence were saints canonized? To what extent was there a formalized process, or was it idiosyncratic? What changes took place over the period? On what grounds did assessors distinguish 'true' saints' miracles from 'false' ones?

The book begins with an administrative, but necessary, introduction that traverses the relevant terminology and broad changes that took place as the canonization process became more and more formalized, particularly between the twelfth and fourteenth centuries. From there, the book dives into a series of exciting papers that will be of varying interest to varied readers. Without wishing to detail each paper (since the contents page should be available online),

broadly speaking they are concerned with the idiosyncrasies of miracle collecting, recording, and proof. There was a swirling maelstrom of factors that influenced a pope's decision as to whether or not to canonize a saint: politics, the miracles' nature and epistemological foundations, distance, cultural affinity, international relations, and the personalities of the different popes and cardinals involved. In addition, the vast majority of the miracles pertain to the healing of ailments, so the collection may be of interest to scholars of medieval medicine and the body.

Canonization in the Middle Ages was a serious business. It involved the intersection of lay and ecclesiastical cultures, which included layers of epistemology and issues around the oral and the written. Sometimes there were processions into the lands from which the alleged saints came (*processus in partibus*) and these functioned like a sort of happy inquisition. The process of canonization is also important for legal history, since, as Fröjmark observes (pp. 139–40), the articles of interrogation 'were carried out in a manner that resembles the examination of witnesses at a trial'. Overall, the proofs used to justify miracles include wide reporting, the probity of informants, and the provision of post-factum physical evidence, with a preference for interviewees who had witnessed the events. Even then, as Didier Lett observes, there was much scepticism about saints' miracles, for various reasons.

Overall, the book offers a welcome contribution to a difficult, sometimes dry topic that is nevertheless of much importance to medieval European society. But I would like to raise a few minor quibbles that do not overshadow the important contribution this book makes. The vast majority of personalities and situations under discussion pertain to the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, so the book could more correctly have been titled *Miracles in Late Medieval Canonization Processes*. There are, of course, logistical reasons for this late focus, given that the documentary inheritance is much stronger for later centuries, though there is certainly enough from earlier centuries to build discussions on. I felt that more of the papers could have dived deeper into manuscript study, given that the documentary heritage of canonization processes is one of the book's primary focuses. The highlight in this regard was Fröjmark's chapter on Swedish miracle collections. Finally, more comparison between earlier and later canonization processes could have been useful to establish the extent to which medieval norms were unique, though admittedly the logistics of this are difficult.

These issues do not override the strength of this work in broad terms. Perhaps the largest contribution of the book is to bring to the study of the saints a new focus on the important and multifaceted issues around canonization. I hope that the authors continue their explorations of this.

KEAGAN BREWER, *The University of Sydney*

**Kwakkel**, Erik, and Francis **Newton**, introduction by Eliza **Glaze**, *Medicine at Monte Cassino: Constantine the African and the Oldest Manuscript of his Pantegni* (Speculum Sanitatis, 1), Turnhout, Brepols, 2019; hardback; pp. xxxvi, 255; 46 b/w, 16 colour illustrations, 6 b/w tables; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503579214.

This is an example of the meticulous, detailed codicological study of a single, puzzling but unimpressive object, with the object of drawing conclusions of wide cultural significance. The object is a manuscript, The Hague, Koninklijke Bibliotheek, MS 73 J 6, containing Constantine the African's *Pantegni*, formerly dated to the twelfth century, recently redated by Kwakkel *c.* 1080 (before 1086). That makes it the earliest known copy of this influential medical encyclopedia, which was a translation and adaptation by Constantine of Ali ibn al Abbas al'Magusi's *Kitab Kamil as-sina'a at-tibbiya* (*Complete Book of the Medical Art*). The manuscript, at first sight unexceptional, is of the greatest interest for the many curious problems it raises. First of all, although undoubtedly written at the great southern-Italian abbey of Monte Cassino, it is written not in the Beneventan script that was locally dominant, but in Caroline minuscule. Then, although it is the earliest surviving copy of the *Pantegni*, later manuscripts contain earlier versions of the text. Moreover, it contains only the first part (*Theorica*) of the work, less useful than the second (*Practica*), and even then originally incomplete but finished about a century later. And then, the text contains nine longish lacunae, apparently registering Constantine's uncertainty about how to translate a particular term or passage. The book's long, thin format is a strikingly unusual shape. Finally, it contains an introduction in the three parts that were to become standard, but here Part 2 comes last, and is written in a different hand in red, with a *signe de renvoi* to show where it is meant to fit. All of these problems the authors both discuss and propose solutions to. The solutions shed light on one of the most important constituents of the 'Twelfth-Century Renaissance': the translation of scientific (mainly medical and astronomical) texts from Arabic and Greek.

The authors begin (in Chapter 1) with the scribe, whom they identify in other manuscripts from the abbacy of the great Desiderius (1058–1087, when he became, briefly, Pope Victor III), and even give him a name, Geraldus. The evidence for this is his alleged subscription to the document Monte Cassino, Archivum, Aula II, Caps. CIII, Fasc. no. 10, dated June 1061: 'Ego Geraldus indignus presbyter et monachus interfui et subscripsi'. However, neither in the authors' Figure 1.8, nor in the (much better) Plate 194 of Newton's *The Scriptorium and Library at Monte Cassino 1058–1105*, does the script of the subscriber appear to be the same as the copyist of the charter; nor is Geraldus called a scribe. I think that the main copyist of the Hague manuscript and others must still (alas) go nameless.

Chapter 2 examines those codicological aspects of the manuscript that shed light on Constantine's translation practices, with special attention to the nine lacunae that suggest that the text represents a revision stage. Chapter 3 introduces the individuals who made up 'Team Constantine', helping him with the translation

and its dissemination. In Chapter 4 the authors discuss the oddly long, thin shape of the manuscript ('Holster' format), showing that most books of this shape were for use in the classroom. This chapter contains a valuable, wide-ranging discussion of this format as found in books dating from before *c.* 1200. But if the Hague manuscript was planned to be so used, was it actually so used? It shows no signs (such as marginal annotation) of this, nor can it have been truly useful, given its incomplete state. What can we make of this? The authors do not say, nor is it possible to guess, beyond the general notion of a project that went off the rails. Chapter 5 proposes the idea that Constantine was already at work on the project in Salerno, before he transferred to Monte Cassino, and that an important copy, now at Erfurt, represents the 'Salerno' stage of his work.

All in all, the book demonstrates how known scribes, translators, and assistants, with variant drafts of texts written on different substrates and preserved in different surviving manuscripts, could, in pursuit of the goal of completing a revolutionary product in the history of Latin knowledge, struggle with an extremely challenging set of problems. The book is well produced, but I must complain about the standard of the abundant plates. It seems, for at least some publishers, that the technology for producing accurate reproduction on the same paper as the main text is lacking (or unused), and so many of the plates, besides too-small reproduction, are fuzzy and cannot be used as evidence for the points which they are there to support (as with the example cited above). The colour plates, produced in a group on superior paper (I–XVI, at pp. xvii–xxviii) are much better.

ROD THOMSON, *University of Tasmania*

**Lachaud**, Frédérique, and **Michael Penman**, eds, *Absentee Authority across Medieval Europe*, Woodbridge, The Boydell Press, 2017; hardback; pp. 266; 4 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781783272525.

'Kingship was always incarnated and rested on the notion of direct access to the person of the king, a reality which stood in opposition to that of the caliphate, where the person of the caliph was often hidden from sight' (p. 19). In their introduction, the editors suggest this explains why the medieval West, unlike Islam, did not develop a theoretical literature underpinning the delegation of power, and that it presented obstacles to temporal, unlike ecclesiastical, hierarchies of power. When authority derives from presence, rulers experience difficulties: they cannot be everywhere. The lack of theoretical sources has stimulated contributors to the volume to adopt innovative approaches. Chapters range from the Merovingian to early modern eras, span Europe from Italy to Iceland, and address the topic using diverse sources and methodologies.

The subject raises several questions. How did kings project their authority? Laurent Hablot, in a study of wide applicability, examines rulers' use of emblematic means—banners, coats of arms, and so on—to mark their territories. Taking a specific case, Bruno Dumézil looks at Merovingian kings' use of gestures,

itineration, poetry, and other means to establish their virtual presence. Léonard Dauphant too considers itineration and its symbolic and practical applications by later French monarchs. The use of seals to assert authority is a recurring motif throughout the volume.

How did rulers delegate authority? That could be problematic. Frédérique Lachaud explores the dispute between Henry III and Simon de Montfort over the nature and powers of the latter's role as king's lieutenant in Gascony. Their conceptions seemingly differed. In Burgundy, Philip the Bold (r. 1384–1404) compensated for his frequent absences by having his wife represent him as governor, but did she have actual power? Not necessarily, Michelle Bubenicek concludes. Conversely, Torsten Hiltmann proposes that French kings commandeered the medieval 'kings of professions' (minstrels, mercers), turning them into their representatives, thus extending royal control over these occupations.

What mechanisms were there for coping in a king's absence through minority, captivity, or infirmity? In Scotland, proxy rulers were required for sixty per cent of the years 1286 to 1424. Various forms of guardianship were tested, which Norman Reid and Michael Penman suggest assisted with the evolution of representative democracy. Hans Jacob Orning cites Icelandic sagas as evidence that, while kings and magnates grappled with questions of authority and obedience, local chieftains were primarily concerned about providing for communal needs.

Normandy, in the early thirteenth century, had two absentee monarchs. England's king had been expelled; French kings ruled from afar through *baillis*, charged with re-assimilating the duchy without provoking rebellion. Tom Horler-Underwood's examination of a 1247–48 inquiry, initiated by Louis IX, reveals that although *baillis* consolidated the recovery of Normandy, this did not involve the smooth transition to prosperity often supposed. This is one of several chapters that draw revisionist conclusions. Italian bishops' relinquishment of temporal power during the Investiture Contest, for instance, is typically understood as reflecting ideological abandonment of worldly authority. Robert Houghton, though, taking Parma as a case study, uses charter records to show that, in the decades before their loss of power, bishops were increasingly missing from their sees, cultivating international networks at the expense of their local authority, while other groups rose to prominence.

The editors state (p. 2) that, when defining 'absentee authority' they adopted 'no very fixed parameters'. A few chapters seem to treat 'absence *and* authority' rather than absentee authority, positioning the two concepts in alignment to each other. These conceivably reflect a last-moment alteration in the volume's title. Late-medieval genealogical rolls of English kings, argues Olivier de Laborderie, present even usurpers as genuine rulers, because their absence would have diminished rightful kings' authority. James Bothwell investigates internal exiles within the English king's domains, a group usually neglected by scholars in favour of persons banished altogether. These chapters, though interesting, are somewhat poorly connected to the topic.

The contributions witness authority's complexity, even when absent, exposing contests between different groups with rival interests, hierarchies of authority, varied attitudes to what it constituted, diverse ways of manifesting it. The volume's final sentence urges scholars to further study. Certainly, the work's introduction describes aspects of absentee authority not otherwise canvassed in the volume, leaving scope for research. The chapters, together and individually, are suggestive. Considering the editorial remarks quoted at the start, it might be rewarding to investigate the legends, widespread in folklore through Christendom, of 'hidden kings' such as Arthur, absent but each waiting to perform a second coming, from this perspective of 'absentee authority'. If Europe liked its authority figures incarnate and accessible, how might such myths have reflected that preference?

PATRICK BALL, *University of Tasmania*

**Leitch**, Megan G., and Cory James **Rushton**, eds, *A New Companion to Malory* (Arthurian Studies, 87), Woodbridge, Boydell & Brewer / D. S. Brewer, 2019; cloth; pp. xiii, 325; 11 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843845232.

*A New Companion to Malory* contains fifteen essays along with a detailed introduction and other front matter. The first five essays (by Catherine Nall, Ralph Norris, Thomas H. Crofts and K. S. Whetter, Megan G. Leitch, and Siân Echard) discuss the text(s) and contexts of *The Morte Darthur*. The next seven essays (by Cory James Rushton, Dorsey Armstrong, Amy S. Kaufman, Andrew Lynch, Lisa Robeson, Raluca L. Radulescu, and Meg Roland) offer multiple contrasting and complementary approaches to Malory. The final three essays (by Rob Gossedge, Masako Takagi, and Daniel Helbert) consider Malory's several afterlives. Each essay is a model of scholarly inquiry intent upon illuminating one or more facets of a key Arthurian text that never exhausts our capacity for such inquiry.

The current volume is a worthy successor to the 1996 *A Companion to Malory* (Boydell & Brewer) edited by Elizabeth Archibald and A. S. G. Edwards. It does not replace that earlier collection so much as build upon it in light of the elevation of Malory's work to canonical status in areas both curricular and critical, and of the publication in 2013 of P. J. C. Field's two-volume critical edition of the *Morte* (D. S. Brewer). Further, *A New Companion* offers readings of Malory by established and emerging Malorian scholars appropriate for both undergraduates and new postgraduates interested in this foundational Arthurian text. These readings engage both long-standing questions and new critical approaches to provide up-to-date guidelines for reading, teaching, and writing about Malory.

Thus Amy S. Kaufman seeks to balance Malory's perceived misogyny and the multi-faceted representations of women within the text of the *Morte*. Ralph Norris and Cory Hames Rushton bring fresh perspectives to the vexing problem of what if any sources Malory may have used for different sections of the *Morte*. Thomas Crofts and K. S. Whetter suggest connections between Malory's status

as author and later editions of his work; Siân Echard compares print editions of the *Morte*; and Megan G. Leitch links Malory's great work to other contemporary long-form prose romances. Meg Roland attributes to Malory a wider world view than what one might suspect from someone generally thought of a 'knight prisoner', while Catherine Nall and Lisa Robeson ground Malory in domestic chivalric concerns, social movements, and politics. Building upon earlier work by Thomas Hanks and Janet Jesmok in their 2013 *Malory and Christianity* (Medieval Institute Publications), Raluca L. Radulescu revisits Malory's religiosity.

In offering a series of approaches to Malory's literary artistry, *A New Companion* provides formal readings of the text of the *Morte* (by Cory James Rushton), an examination of Malory's approach to character (by Dorsey Armstrong) and gender (by Amy S. Kaufman), as well as to what we now call the 'affective turn in literary studies' (by Andrew Lynch). The collection complements these essays with three discussing the post-medieval and early modern Malory. Continued Japanese interest in, and important contributions to, Malory scholarship are catalogued by Masako Takagi. Rob Gossedge details the cultural roles Malory played in twentieth-century Britain, while Daniel Herbert shows how nineteenth-century America freely engaged with the *Morte*.

If I have a quibble with *A New Companion*, it would be with the absence of an essay (or essays) devoted to Malory's legacy in all manner of modern and post-modern non-print media, which further attests to the continued canonicity and popularity of the *Morte* in multiple forms of high and low culture. Filmmakers, for instance, are quick to cite Malory as a putative source when even the most casual readings of their films suggest otherwise. So too, the overwhelming and increasingly diverse Malorian presence in paintings, sculptures, music, theatre, television programming, juvenilia, comic books, video games, advertisements, political discourse, brands of food and beverage, websites, and so on has become a staple of everyday life that is almost unparalleled, and thus a ready source for critical study. This lacuna aside, Malory studies have increasingly become a fair field full of folk, so it is no mean feat that the editors of, and contributors to, *A New Companion to Malory* have jointly given us such an invaluable resource, which will doubtless, in turn, lead to further fruitful labour in that fair field.

KEVIN J. HARTY, *La Salle University*

**Males**, Mikael, ed., *Etymology and Wordplay in Medieval Literature* (Disputatio, 30), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. viii, 272; 11 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503575759.

To the modern reader, the relationship between etymology and wordplay may appear neither necessary nor natural, but for medieval textual analysis and exegesis, this book reveals these two seemingly divergent literary and cultural activities are closely related. Mikael Males explains that the aim of the volume is 'to investigate [...] how the functions of etymology and wordplay may contribute to our understanding of medieval textual culture and cognitive perceptions' (p. 2).

The book achieves this through an examination of a range of medieval examples of wordplay and etymologies, exploring what these might reveal about the cultural practices from which they originate. Moreover, wordplay is shown to have been an important intellectual and scholastic pursuit, not just a witty activity for its own sake. As Males notes, ‘the nexus of wordplay and etymology, and the flexibility inherent to it, has resulted in a staggering array of strategies for producing and retrieving meaning in texts’ (p. 7).

The book contains nine contributions, starting with Males’s broad genealogy of the Latinate origins of the field, in which he notes tensions between the phonological and semantic arbitrariness of philosophical discourse on the one hand, and the non-arbitrary nature of medieval textual practice, particularly biblical exegeses. Wim Verbaal’s erudite analysis of the writings of Alan of Lille follows next, and he takes particular interest in the learning needed for reading Alan’s ‘deliberately difficult’ (p. 79) texts and the relevance of wordplay for Alan’s works. Next comes Keith Busby’s analysis of moral and ethical medieval paranomasia (wordplay derived from phonetic similarity) in the thirteenth-century Old French works of Gautier de Coinci, and this is followed by Stephen Michael Carey’s analysis of soteriological macaronic texts, in which heteroglossic paranomasia is used for emphasizing semantic ambiguities, where debased and highly sexualized readings sit alongside the moral reading. Paolo Borsa’s contribution is next, looking at wordplay in both the metrics and the materiality of thirteenth-century Italian poetic manuscripts, and he explores ways in which the *mise en page* underpins playful options for the reader, and identifies the influence of vernacularity in the wordplay itself. The sixth chapter, from Jan Erik Rekdal, turns to the medieval Irish textual tradition, and the use of polysemy, etymology, and wordplay in cognitive and exegetical writings, whether glosses, legal texts, or tales. Eric Weiskott’s contribution in the following chapter focuses on one particular text, the Old English poetic *Exodus*. He explores the extensive (and difficult) wordplay as an index of the tastes and aims of a long-lost interpretive community, with exegesis facilitated through layering of puns, kennings, and poetic variations. The editor, Mikael Males, then contributes a chapter on wordplay, etymology, and poetry in the interpretation of dreams in Icelandic literature. He finds that Icelandic dream interpretation developed into a native activity that diverged from the Latin tradition, likely due to the strong poetic tradition in wordplay that was already in place in Iceland. The final chapter, by Julia Verkholtantsev, turns to the use of etymologies in medieval origin narratives of the Slavic peoples, discussing the ways in which *etymologia* is used as a multivalenced interpretive tool, contrary to etymology’s modern scientific use as a tool of logic. More broadly, Verkholtantsev argues that, taken in the context of historical narrative, *etymologia* is more than linguistics, and must be ‘taken seriously as a medieval historiographical structure and epistemological method’ (p. 264).

Throughout the book, the value of medieval etymologies is shown to be both in the clues they hold to modes of medieval reading and thought, and clues

to medieval views on interpretation and the acquisition of knowledge. Likewise, for wordplay: all the contributions in this volume emphasize the importance of recognizing wordplay in all its forms as a serious method for moral, ethical, and intellectual pursuits, far from the place that wordplay occupies in modern culture. Indeed, as this volume reveals, the very act of medieval reading can demand a high degree of intellectual engagement, and in the process the various forms of wordplay, whether puns, double entendre, polysemy, or even the physical manuscript layout itself, will contribute to the meanings available for the engaged reader. Overall, the fact that etymology and wordplay can be discussed as a coherent discursive behaviour is itself a sound indicator of the roles that both played in medieval textual culture, and in exegetical and moralistic works in particular. This volume offers an important window into both the commonalities and cultural divergences of text, manuscript, and scholarship across medieval Europe, and helps position both wordplay and etymology as serious topics in medieval thought and knowledge.

RODERICK McDONALD, *Emu Forge, Sheffield, UK*

**Maurer, Helen, and B. M. Cron, eds, *The Letters of Margaret of Anjou*, Woodbridge, The Boydell Press, 2019; hardback; pp. 317; 2 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £95.00; ISBN 9781783274246.**

Margaret of Anjou was the queen consort of Henry VI, the last Lancastrian king of England, who lost the throne in 1461 to his Yorkist rival who became Edward IV. Her reputation as a vengeful woman, coupled with the role she undertook during the struggle known today as the Wars of the Roses, has made her an enduringly fascinating figure to researchers and the general public alike. This book is a new edition of the surviving correspondence of Queen Margaret, and aims to provide an up-to-date study of all of her extant letters and bring them together in one place. These letters were written between 1445 and 1461, spanning the period during which Margaret was queen consort, and testify to a variety of different interests and activities undertaken either on her own behalf or on behalf of others.

Scholars of this queen have long known of and utilized this cache of material in their research. The bulk of the extant letters are preserved as copies in a late-fifteenth century commonplace book that currently resides in the British Library, London. Most of Margaret's letters from said book were first transcribed and published by Cecil Monro in 1863, and it is that source that many scholars have, until now, turned to in lieu of consulting the commonplace book itself. Monro, however, chose not to include seven of the letters from the late-medieval book, probably considering their content to be unimportant, although he made no mention of his reasons for doing so in the preface of his book. The editors of this volume, Helen Maurer and Bonita Cron, are clearly familiar with the extant letters of the queen, having used the material themselves in their own published research on Margaret of Anjou.

This volume is divided into two parts; the first part, ‘Great and Good Queen’, contains eight chapters, and the second, ‘Political Queen’, contains four chapters. Each of the chapters corresponds to one of the categories into which the editors have divided the letters. Using their own research and expertise on the queen and her world, the editors have added vibrant and valuable contextual narrative to each of the letters while placing them in a logical and thematic order. This procedure is not without its drawbacks. As the editors themselves acknowledge (p. 2), there are some letters that can be placed in more than one category, but one must perforce be chosen. One example will suffice to demonstrate. In letter no. 79 (p. 149), the queen wrote to the archbishop of Canterbury regarding the king’s pardon granted to a lady named Alice Marwarth (the reason is unmentioned in the letter itself). This letter is included in Chapter 7: ‘Belief and Benevolence’ but can just as easily fit into Chapter 5: ‘Protector and Peacemaker’. Moreover, the structural division into two parts and the categorization of the letters into so many chapters in Part 1 does not appear to be wholly justified. The letters placed in Part 2 are deemed to be the ‘overtly political’ (p. 3) ones. Yet it does not appear to have been entirely necessary to put two parts in place at all, since the chapters adequately convey the thematic underpinnings.

Nonetheless, its structure helps to distinguish this new volume from the 1863 Monro collection and renders it superior in many respects. As other researchers of Margaret of Anjou will know, the Monro collection does not appear to have been arranged with any particular order in mind. Additionally, although Monro added some comments of his own preceding each letter, they are not very extensive ones. The editors’ efforts at historical placement of each included piece of correspondence has substantially added value to this revised edition. The other major improvement is the addition of the seven letters from the original commonplace book that were left out by Monro, as well as seventeen letters or items that are related to the queen and sourced elsewhere. Since an avowed objective of the editors was to publish all of the queen’s extant letters, this certainly improves access for future scholars looking to use this type of primary evidence for further research. A sizeable number of other letters, such as letters numbered 120 and 121, by the Milanese ambassador to his duke (pp. 275–76), and letter number 65 by King Henry VI to the chancellor of the duchy of Lancaster (pp. 118–19), help the editors flesh out the narrative.

Ultimately, this volume will be useful primarily to scholars focused on research related to Margaret of Anjou, queenship, and epistolary writing. The editors believed that Monro’s transcription and collection of this queen’s correspondence were in need of major revision (p. ix). In that respect, the categorization and extensive contextualization carried out by the editors renders this volume a worthy successor to the Monro collection.

MICHELE SEAH, *University of Newcastle*

**Moore**, Jill, *Inquisition and its Organization in Italy 1250–1350*, York, York Medieval Press, 2019; cloth; pp. xi, 300; 2 b/w illustrations; £60.00; ISBN 9781903153895.

Henry Charles Lea is the standard by which all studies of the inquisition are measured. His epochal work was brilliant, immense, and frequently definitive. In an important essay, Richard Kieckhefer argued there was no such thing as ‘the Medieval Inquisition’. While acknowledging their acumen and contributions, Jill Moore challenges both scholars. Her revisionist monograph is a significant achievement. Where Lea tackled the subject on a European scale and Kieckhefer sought to correct a misapprehension, Moore limited herself to a century of medieval history in Italy. In this way she succeeds in delving deeply into archival materials where she examines the mechanics of inquisitorial activities. Going beyond most historians of heresy, Moore interrogates the development of the Italian inquisition by investigating the lives of individuals who made inquisition possible. Building on the provisions of the thirteenth-century papal bull *Ad extirpanda*, Moore explores the relationship between inquisitors, local bishops, and immediate civil authorities. She argues the traditional image of the feared and autonomous medieval inquisitor requires nuance. The supporting cast of notaries, messengers, spies, *familia*, vicars, informers, companions, bankers, jailers, and ‘those who served the sacred office’ in a variety of ways, enabled the inquisitor to function effectively.

Moore does not obfuscate the challenges facing the historian of the inquisition. Records are sometimes sloppy, marked by an absence of coherence, exacerbated by uneven local foundations, lacking uniform structures, exhibiting information gaps, frustratingly scanty, aggravatingly jumbled, occasionally presented in scrappy outline, and all in all are far from providing a clear picture. These challenges noted, Moore achieves a readable and convincing narrative that augments and corrects Lea and Kieckhefer and produces an important new and original chapter in the history of the inquisition. Against Lea, she adds enormous and useful specificity and suggests, against Kieckhefer, there was a formal institutionalized inquisitorial office. She achieves these objectives by carefully surveying a broad range of sources: statutes, chronicles, financial accounts, civil records, court dossiers, inquisition handbooks and manuals, matriculation rolls of notarial colleges, records of provincial chapters of the Franciscan and Dominican orders, convent necrologies, tax records, diaries, among other sources. What emerges? The inquisition relied upon cooperation with ecclesiastical and secular authorities. Heresy was not exclusively church business. Inquisitors possessed great power but were also subject to enormous insecurity. Requirements imposed upon the inquisition in terms of accountability were monitored and secret spies kept tabs on the holy office. Inquisitors embedded spies in suspected communities of heresy, placed stool pigeons in prison to secure usable intelligence, and paid informants. Symbiotic relations developed between the inquisition and convents. Existing statutes are not necessarily reliable about what happened in practice.

Inquisitorial staff were not ad hoc appointments. Chapter 4 on notaries is worth the price of the book. The involvement of Dominicans and Franciscans indicate that inquisitorial activity was mainstream for the mendicant life. Importantly, Moore demonstrates the orders had different methods of conducting the work of the inquisition and also shows it was not a hermetic system. Inquisitorial messengers had to wear ‘bright-red ribboned headbands’ or ‘tall caps with four red lilies’. Violators of the dress code might be whipped naked in public. There was opposition. Inquisitors were kidnapped, beaten, stabbed, murdered. Others were simply ignored. Notaries were coerced and sometimes falsified records.

Efforts were made to intercept heretics at city gates and heresy hunters were not necessarily of one class or another: distinctions were yet to emerge between episcopal and papal inquisitions. The persecuting society can be detected in inquisitorial operations, though Moore argues a culture of impunity cannot be assigned to its work in this period. Tongues were amputated, hamstringing and blinding occurred, cartloads of heretics were sometimes destroyed, and pranksters who entertained in pubs suggesting bowls of lasagne were the Host attracted inquisitorial scrutiny. Questions remain: what is still buried in Italian archives? How were inquisitorial activities financed after *Ad extirpanda*? The model suggested by Innocent IV (confiscation of heretics’ property) is a flawed business plan, incentivizing inquisitors to be busy being busy, and vulnerable to the worst kinds of abuse, including selling the ashes of the burned heretic. How were inquisitors trained? By what criteria were they appointed?

Latin text citations are generally translated; the book is well laid out with chapter sections and summarized conclusions. The index could be improved. What emerges convincingly in this book is the crucial role played by local factors to the extent that it is perilous to attempt to make global statements about the inquisition and the medieval war on heresy. Moore offers a corrective in many respects to the work of Lea and Kieckhefer. Moreover, she offers hard evidence suggesting a definitive Office of the Inquisition in thirteenth-century Italy. This study cannot be ignored or minimized by those seeking to understand the history of heresy and its repression.

THOMAS A. FUDGE, *University of New England*

**Perry, David M.**, *Sacred Plunder: Venice and the Aftermath of the Fourth Crusade*, University Park, PA, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2015; hardback; pp. 248; 6 illustrations, 3 maps; R.R.P. US\$69.95; ISBN 9780271065076.

Following the sack of Constantinople in 1204, countless precious *spolia* were taken and relics ‘translated’ to churches and monasteries through Western Europe. Today one only need survey the wealth of Venice’s Basilica of San Marco and its treasury to appreciate just how much that city gained. But how did the faithful make sense of where these objects came from, how they suddenly arrived at churches and monasteries, and their impact on the community? As David M.

Perry notes in his introduction to *Sacred Plunder*, when it came to enrichment and an elevated profile, ‘Mere possession of a new relic [...] was not sufficient to transform potentiality into actuality. For that, a relic needed a story’ (p. 3).

The stories of how these post-1204 relics were spatially ‘translated’ form a subgenre of hagiography, and it is on these *translatio* narratives that Perry focuses, exploring the memorialization and search for meaning found in them. He confines his study within two broad parameters: time, as he concentrates more or less on the decade following 1204, and the source for the narratives he examines, Paul Édouard Didier Riant’s two-volume *Exuviae sacrae Constantinopolitanae* (Leroux, 1877–78). Thus, despite its title, the study does not focus exclusively on the reception and understanding of the relics that arrived in Venice after 1204, but rather on the Western European contexts in which the relics were to be found following their dispersal, and the *translatio* narratives that arose from these.

In Section 1, ‘Contexts’, Perry explores the 1204 hagiographies from two perspectives. First, he examines the chronological moment in which certain relics were acquired; second, he considers the conceptual frameworks of those who acquired them. Central to Chapter 1 is the question of how relics were acquired: whether in haphazard or organized looting, whether authorized or not. Chapter 2 explores the specific papal responses to their taking, from using claims of sacrilege for advantage, to extending papal control over the patriarchate of Constantinople.

Section 2, ‘Texts’, turns from these contextual understandings to specific post-1204 *translatio* narratives. Perry explores nine: Bishop Nivelon de Chérisy’s enrichment of Soissons cathedral, Bishop Conrad von Krosigk’s work in Halberstadt, the translation of St Mamas’s head to Langres, the arrival of the relics of St Theodore Tyro in Gaeta, the relics of St Andrew in Amalfi, the relics of St Simon the Prophet and St Paul the New Martyr in Venice, the arrival of St Clement’s relics at Cluny, and a narrative exploring Abbot Martin’s collection of relics in Pairis, Alsace. Perry examines how the texts respond to grave charges—for example sacrilege or unauthorized looting—as they discuss, with unique responses to their contexts, the necessary movement of the relics. The Venetian texts, for example, frequently invoke the events of the Fourth Crusade, while a number of the others shy away from them. Perry observes in Chapter 4 that the narratives’ authors often seek to absolve their actors of any misconduct: first, by suppressing any mention of the Fourth Crusade (*‘translatio only texts’*); and second, by finding a powerful narrative in what Geary termed, in 1978, *furta sacra* (*‘pious-theft narratives’*).

In Section 3, ‘Outcomes’, we turn more closely to Venice. Chapter 5 explores the historical role of *translatio* narratives in Venice before and after 1204, where it is possible to trace ‘the metamorphosis of Venetian identity that began after the Fourth Crusade’ (p. 137), and Chapter 6 examines the intersection of that identity with the burgeoning myth of Venice. Perry’s case studies are taken from art, such as certain marble reliefs at the Basilica of San Marco; and from correspondence and chronicles, such as a letter sent by Doge Ranieri Zeno to the pope after a

fire in the basilica's treasury in 1231. Perry observes that one change in Venetian *translatio* narratives after the Fourth Crusade is how they seek validation through a connection to key and unimpeachable Venetian myths or stories, such as the *translatio* of St Mark's relics or the historic rivalry with Genoa.

This final section of the work, dedicated to Venice, opens up fascinating avenues and develops further our understanding of the evolution of the myth of Venice. Perry highlights how Venetians validated contemporary events by linking them explicitly to the city's past, actively constructing their medieval historical narrative. Yet the bulk of *Sacred Plunder* is spent delineating the categories of post-1204 hagiographical texts, frequently with respect to a structure that felt superimposed. This also required frequent cross-referencing and slowed the energy of Perry's argument. Nevertheless, *Sacred Plunder's* investigations of memory, and of its narrativization in Venice in particular, will be of interest to specialists. And its contributions to the discussion of medieval hagiography and the movement of relics will be of interest to scholars in those fields.

KATHLEEN OLIVE, *The University of Sydney*

**Piera, Montserrat, *Women Readers and Writers in Medieval Iberia: Spinning the Text*** (The Medieval and Early Modern Iberian World, 71), Leiden/Boston, Brill, 2019; hardback; pp. xxiv, 483; 12 colour plates; R.R.P. €127.00, \$US153.00; ISBN 9789004400375.

As this reviewer argues elsewhere, since the rise of feminist and gender historiography, recent scholarship has articulated new vocabularies and methodologies for discussing medieval and early modern women, thereby breaking down long-standing yet artificial barriers between the study of public and private agency in the premodern sociopolitical world. Literary scholar Montserrat Piera's timely and thoroughly researched monograph, *Women Readers and Writers in Medieval Iberia: Spinning the Text*, is a welcome and excellent addition to this undertaking.

Piera nails down her intentions immediately and succinctly; her aim is to articulate a new paradigm to represent premodern reading while studying women's textualities as a process of spinning and weaving not only words but also social practices, emotions, and *affectus* held by her to mean 'the embodiment of the ability to affect and be affected' (pp. ix–x). And, she delivers this in spades. Having examined the various implications, historical, literary, and allegorical, of spinning and weaving, including its gendered aspects, Piera reveals the kind of women we might encounter in medieval and early modern documents and visual artefacts and how we might use these to uncover their experiences from the distant past. She then reminds her reader of the inadequacy of our current, conventional, and compartmentalized critical paradigm: 'the defeatist affirmation of the lack of protagonism of women' in premodern societies (p. 7). Instead, we ought to approach premodern women 'more assiduously, transversally and intersectionally'

if we are to understand the world in which they ‘inhabited, affected, and shaped’ (p. 7).

The choice of medieval Iberia as the backdrop for her extensive and detailed case study is noteworthy given the spatial fluidity of the medieval Iberian Peninsula, which hosted a multicultural and multiconfessional society in terms of political, religious, architectural, and linguistic diversity. Piera cites David Wacks’s suggestion that the Peninsula should be conceived of as a place of ‘a good deal of bi- and multilingualism, di- and polyglossia, conversion, and other types of crossings and syntheses’ (p. 10) that exerted a transformative effect upon Iberian society, rendering it ‘a literary polysystem in which authors of different confessions, writing in different languages, nevertheless participated in a shared “sense of local identity”’ (pp. 10–11). The importance of this to Piera is that the same framework can also encompass social and gender implications. While essentially a scholar of languages and literatures, Piera approaches her study likewise as a cultural historian. To avoid marginalizing them, she approaches her systematic analyses of extant Iberian women writers by studying them in the context of their times and places, yet never conceiving of them as totally separate entities from one another. Her comparative or ‘relational’ methodology aims to consider ‘the world of women not as a separate enclave in the world of men but rather as a “long border” that requires exploration and mapping with new conceptual tools’ (p. 14).

Part 1, ‘Reading Women’, consists of three chapters that explore and attempt to reconstruct the nature of female medieval Iberian readers, what they read, whether Iberian female readers were like those in other parts of Europe, how they reacted to what they read or what was read to them, but most of all ‘how *gendered* was their reading’ (p. 17)—how and whether they differed from their male counterparts. Focusing on two types of texts encountered by medieval Iberian women, texts written or orally delivered by preachers as well as a diverse selection of secular lyric and romance texts, Piera emphasizes the instability of both masculine and feminine identities and the fluidity of gender construction in the Middle Ages. Having probed the dynamics of reading and gender construction, Piera moves seamlessly to Part 2 of her study to examine several instances of female authorship in five detailed chapters focusing upon ‘The Court’, ‘The Convent’ and Isabel de Villena’s *Vita Christi* and her regendering of Christ’s *Passio*. She closes the circle of her discussion with an Epilogue, ‘Discarding the Distaff’, masterfully unpicking Beatriz Bernal’s rewriting of Minerva in her *Cristalián de España*.

While near flawless, Piera’s study contains some unforced errors/misapprehensions. In 1380, Joan I did not request manuscripts of ‘*lo libre de Johan Mendreville e lo romanç de Mexaut*’ from his mother (p. 209). His mother, Elionor de Sicília, died in 1375. Rather, he sought them from his bibliophile and erudite mother-in-law, Marie de France, mother of his third wife Violant de Bar. Moreover, Piera ought perhaps to have nuanced her understanding of the fragile

position in 1396 of María de Luna, Violant's successor to the post of queen-consort of Aragon, during the new king's prolonged absence in Sicily. This would have led Piera to a better grasp of the political motives underpinning corruption charges levelled against Violant and Joan's principal advisors and servants by Queen María during Martí I's absence—charges he dismissed upon his return. These minor shortcomings, however, do not detract from Piera's excellent monograph. It is a very welcome addition to the English-language corpus, and will be of considerable and durable value to Ibericists and non-Ibericists alike.

ZITA EVA ROHR, *Macquarie University*

**Pluskowski**, Aleksander, ed., *Environment, Colonization, and the Baltic Crusader States: Terra Sacra I* (Environmental Histories of the North Atlantic World, 2), Turnhout, Brepols, 2019; paperback; pp. xxviii, 548; 189 b/w, 8 colour illustrations, 41 b/w tables; R.R.P. €115.00; ISBN 9782503551326

**Pluskowski**, Aleksander, ed., *Ecologies of Crusading, Colonization, and Religious Conversion in the Medieval Baltic: Terra Sacra II* (Environmental Histories of the North Atlantic World, 3), Turnhout, Brepols, 2019; paperback; pp. xx, 246; 73 b/w, 9 colour illustrations, 22 b/w tables; R.R.P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503551333.

*Terra Sacra* is the term coined to 'emphasize the clash of sacred associations embedded in the landscapes of the eastern Baltic' (p. 2), and with this orientation these two volumes squarely place medieval human theocratic expansionism into environmental, ecological, and social contexts. These books comprise the primary published output of a four-year research project, funded by the European Research Council, which set out to examine the broad environmental impact of the fourteenth- and fifteenth-century crusader states in the eastern Baltic region, and the societies created through successive phases of military conquest, colonization, and religious conversion. Much of this expansion was instigated under the military, Christian, Teutonic Order, which rose to authoritarian prominence prosecuting penitential wars (with papal sanction) against pagan Baltic tribes, after Christian eyes turned from the Byzantine east following the fall of Jerusalem.

The study traces the impact of the Christian theocratic regime on the regions that were to become known as Livonia and Prussia, and the regime's establishment of a social system based around centralized defensive castle-convents holding authority over the wider landscape, exploiting synergies of technology with religion for the purpose of maintaining and expanding territorial control, and accruing and monopolizing the wealth of the land. The analyses in these volumes explore growth, establishment, and impact of specialized economies where lordships developed and operated specialist farms—arable cropping, dairy cattle, sheep—that served diversified markets, and in the course of the centuries, imposed

marked and divergent impacts on local environments. The research identifies the importance of conventual castles at the core of the Christian expansion, with the establishment of towns encouraging the immigration of colonists, while environmental transformation is revealed as doubly significant for the colonized pagan Baltic tribes, as they held many aspects of the natural world as sacred: a natural world that was modified permanently as a result of the crusades.

This work is strongly interdisciplinary. It synthesizes and contextualizes a wide range of data sources across an array of disciplines: archaeology, history, and environmental and ecological sciences, all heavily supported with detailed and well-visualized data, and extensively illustrated with supporting maps, illustrations and photographs, both technical and descriptive. Environmental analyses of the characteristics of occupation and settlement activities are prominent throughout both volumes, deriving and closely examining geographic data for land use, vegetation, and animal use, integrated with archaeozoological, geoarchaeological, and archaeobotanical evidence.

The scope of this project was massive, and the comprehensive nature of these two volumes is due in part to the fact that very many people were involved in both the research and the writing, from a number of European countries. All up, the two volumes are composed of thirty-five chapters and five appendices, with close to fifty contributors. The research itself was overseen by a project team of twelve, of which the editor, Andrew Pluskowski (University of Reading), was the principal investigator, while the many project partners came from a wide range of universities and research institutions across Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, and the United Kingdom. Unfortunately, with such a large undertaking it is only possible to provide a broad description of the contents of these two volumes, and this review is certainly unable to do justice to the scope and precision of scholarship that has been brought together here in this landmark work.

The first volume offers a series of comparisons of changes in the environment in the crusader states of Livonia (situated approximately in modern-day Latvia, Lithuania, and Estonia) and Prussia (located largely in modern-day Poland). This volume divides into three sections: the first seventy-five pages are theoretical, introducing the historical framework, setting out the methodological and interpretive frameworks, and detailing the regional chronology from Indigenous society, through periods of active crusading, followed by colonization, consolidation, and ultimately, secularization. This section also explores and seeks to calibrate dating relativities across the many evidence types being used, a challenge for any interdisciplinary study. The fact that it explicitly confronts this issue speaks for the quality of this work. Moreover, there are distinct resonances in this work with our own twenty-first-century anxieties, such as is found where the methodological chapter discusses the relevance of understanding colonialism, frontiers, and anthropogenic ecological impacts. The next two sections of *Terra Sacra I*, one each for Livonia and Prussia, provide parallel chapters for these regions that examine historical and archaeological backgrounds, changes in

vegetation, the zooarchaeological data for animal exploitation (farming, hunting, and fishing), the nature and environmental impact of settlements, the ways that the landscape was reorganized, and the overall environmental impacts of the conquests in each region. The concluding chapter of this volume synthesizes the analysis for the two regions and reflects on the relevance and applicability of the multi-scalar methodology involved. This chapter in particular gives an overview of new approaches to territoriality and the intensification of cultivation that arose through conquest, discussing such environmental factors as deforestation, changing social and economic dynamics in the coastal zone, the exploitation of resources and standardization of cultural and environmental factors under a dominating centralizing regime. Noteworthy is the study's finding that emphasizes the importance of acknowledging cultural and ecological heterogeneity across the regions concerned, notwithstanding the advent of a standardizing militant Christian cultural milieu. Indeed, this understanding of heterogeneity was noted as a benefit of the researchers' multi-scalar methodology, which treated the environment 'as a multidisciplinary lens on cultural transformation' (p. 506).

*Terra Sacra II* ostensibly presents a number of case studies from across the eastern Baltic region, but to describe in such simple terms undersells this enterprise. The introductory chapter here returns to the wider multi-scalar frame of the work, through which physical evidence is considered in the context of social and political order and authority, and where changes in such activities as religious and sacred behaviours and belief systems are contextualized in terms of social and economic organization: much of this is derived from detailed assessment of physical evidence. Beyond the introductory chapter, the second volume contains a selection of eighteen papers that were presented at conference in 2014, divided into six thematic sections concerned with the interpretation of physical evidence along the following lines: (i) resources use and building and construction, (ii) food resources and sustenance, (iii) urban human health, (iv) human impact on the landscape, (v) changes in the sacred landscape, and (vi) the regional context of animal and fish exploitation. Within these six themes the case studies provide precise and detailed analyses that trace changes across a wide variety of subjects; for example, from the use of timber in settlement patterns in medieval Latvia to raw material sources and use of brick in castle construction in both Livonia and Prussia; from a long diachronic (tenth to seventeenth century) osteological analysis of faunal food remains in Estonia to isotope analysis for better understanding animal husbandry practice in medieval Poland; from the analysis of lake sediment samples as evidence for human impact on vegetation in Latvia to the diachronic cartographic analysis of sacred landmarks across Livonia. This is just a reductive description of six of the eighteen chapters, and the list goes on. These are all highly specialized archaeological and geographic studies that push the boundaries of knowledge and open new fields for future research.

As both a literary historian and historical linguist of the medieval North, the reviewer is familiar with interdisciplinarity (especially between literature,

archaeology, and history) but seldom has he come across it in such measure. Perhaps the challenge now is for those of us who are historians, linguists, and scholars of literature to consider how such multi-scalar and scientific research methodologies might be negotiated into our fields. These books certainly represent a bold future for studying the physicality of medieval eastern Europe, but alas, this looks an expensive undertaking, and one wonders how often such an exercise is likely to be funded in our increasingly straitened times. Nevertheless, the die has been cast, and these volumes set a standard which, at least in some fields, many will be striving for.

RODERICK McDONALD, *Emu Forge, Sheffield, UK*

**Poettering**, Jorun, *Migrating Merchants. Trade, Nation, and Religion in Seventeenth-Century Hamburg and Portugal*, Berlin/Boston, De Gruyter, 2019; hardback; pp. viii, 389; 10 b/w figures, 23 b/w tables; R.R.P. €59.95; ISBN 9783110469936.

In this meticulously researched, elegant, and focused but comprehensive work, Jorun Poettering challenges historiography on the unique success of early modern Portuguese diaspora merchants by comparison with their Hamburger and Netherlander counterparts. Examining diverse sources, most importantly Hamburg legal, banking, and customs records, and materials from the Portuguese Inquisition, Poettering shows that insular diasporic groups were often less successful in business than those who integrated with the surrounding community, and that the attitudes and institutions of the receiving society were often far more important for assimilation and business success than the internal character of the diaspora community.

Poettering's study is divided into three parts, which increase in specificity, historiographical intervention, and depth of primary source research. The first section (pp. 11–100), examines the political and legal context surrounding the Portuguese, Netherlander and Hamburger merchants under study. While somewhat dense for non-specialists, this section presents a welcome account of major events that drove migration, and a detailed examination of particular institutional systems relevant to migrants, including provisions for citizenship, consular representation, and the role of the Inquisition. The second section (pp. 101–80), focuses on the particular experiences of individual migrant merchants. In Chapter 6, Poettering uses Hamburg's vast financial and legal records to measure foreign presence, and, in the absence of similar sources in Portugal, employs Inquisition records of conversion to Catholicism as a proxy for migration numbers. Chapter 7 collects a compelling mix of qualitative and quantitative material to argue that the organization of Hamburg society made it more challenging for merchants to integrate and ascend the social hierarchy than their counterparts in Portugal. With data on assets and business turnovers from Hamburg, Chapter 8 shows that Netherlander merchants there were substantially more successful than the locals, while Portuguese merchants were somewhat less well-off, a fact illustrated with

colourful qualitative examples of 'representative' merchant lifestyles in both Hamburg and Portugal. Chapter 9 is Poettering's densest quantitative chapter, using customs and trade figures to explore patterns of commerce in Hamburg, confirming historiographical arguments that foreign merchants were poorly represented in commodities barred to exchange between foreigners, but challenging claims that Portuguese controlled the sugar and spice trade and Hamburgers were over-represented in traditional Hamburg goods: in fact, each trade was diverse, and each individual merchant's product line and geographical specialization was unique. Chapter 10 documents in brief detail the various institutions in Portugal and Hamburg which facilitated expatriate merchants to overcome the challenges of foreignness and long-distance commerce, including notaries, brokers, the postal service, newspapers, insurance, and bills of exchange.

The third section (pp. 183–259) is the most distinctive and engages with the social side of migrant merchant life. Chapter 11 examines, with qualitative examples that complement existing historiography, the formation and maintenance of trust, and how it played out differently in merchants' business and personal lives. Chapter 12, on business networking, is dominated by original archival research, and shows that merchants frequently worked with others outside their ethno-religious community, but though Hamburger and Netherlander merchants frequently married local women, Portuguese merchants never did. 'The result', argues Poettering, 'was that their networking opportunities were much more limited than those of the Hamburgers and Netherlanders' (p. 194). Chapter 13 presents a contrast to this individual networking by exploring the presence of foreigners in new, large companies like the Hamburg Commercial Deputation and the Portuguese Brazil Company. Finally, Chapters 14 and 15 employ a methodologically instructive blend of oblique sources to access the internal community life of migrant communities (for example, using Hamburg's Admiralty customs books to show that Portuguese traders stopped working on Jewish holy days). One small weakness in the third section is Poettering's artificial divide between business trust, which emerges from reliability and good sense, and personal or community trust, which emerges from adherence to the group's collective ethical principles: in reality, businesses can break down due to religious conversion, and family relations over poor money management, nearly as easily as the reverse.

Poettering concludes that while all migrant merchants shared the experience of foreignness, which at some level drove them to seek community within their own social groups, this 'wish differed in intensity according to how much the host society opened to them its social resources, and also according to the way they wanted to live their nation's identity'. For this reason, 'the particularity of the Portuguese Jews was their permanent special status not as merchants, but as a social and religious group' that was 'less integrated and less assimilated into the culture in which they lived' than the Hamburgers and Netherlanders that integrated in a generation or two (p. 266). Overall, Poettering presents an

extremely accomplished and rigorous study that will be of interest to specialists in Portuguese Jewry and Hanse history as well more general students of early modern migration, long-distance trade, and diaspora.

NAT CUTTER, *University of Melbourne*

**Priyadarshini, Meha**, *Chinese Porcelain in Colonial Mexico: The Material Worlds of an Early Modern Trade* (Palgrave Studies in Pacific History), Cham, Palgrave Macmillan, 2018; hardback; pp. xviii, 198; 5 b/w, 25 colour illustrations; R.R.P. US\$99.99; ISBN 9783319665467.

Meha Priyadarshini argues that while objects such as feather paintings receive attention because they evoke the violent history of colonial Mexico, Chinese ceramics have been neglected because they involve trade with Asia and are perceived to have less ‘political value’ (p. 101). This compact, beautifully written study addresses that neglect, examining every aspect of the trade in a way that makes it essential reading for those interested in art history, material culture, global trade, and the Spanish settlement of the Philippines and Mexico.

The first of six illustrated chapters, ‘Introduction: A Global Commodity in the Transpacific Trade’, explores how and why Chinese porcelain was exported to Mexico. The focus of the second is Jingdezhen, the source of these ceramics, and the third is Manila, their major destination. The point is made that Chinese merchants traded goods, including Jingdezhen-made ceramics, across the South China Sea, to Luzon and the other islands of the Philippines long before the arrival of Europeans in the region. When European traders arrived in this established ‘intercultural space’ they did not demand anything that the Chinese were not already accustomed to providing (pp. 64–70). Yet, their arrival certainly increased demand, making Jingdezhen ‘the porcelain capital of the world’ and Manila a global trading hub.

The author evokes the skilled and meticulous nature of ceramics and porcelain production, where the skilled and intensive labour required of the potters and painters was matched by expertise of those packing these delicate items for export to Manila and beyond. Indeed, Manila became such an important port because of the involvement of Chinese merchants and labourers, and by 1603 there were 20,000 Chinese residing in and around Manila, compared with only around a thousand Spaniards (pp. 65–66). As Manila was planned and funded by the Viceroyalty of New Spain (Mexico), essentially a colony was controlling a colony, leading to tensions between Spanish colonists and Chinese artisans and merchants. The Parián—the large enclosed marketplace beyond Manila’s walls where Chinese goods were sold—was often destroyed as hostilities erupted between the two. Despite such interruptions to trade, the fact that the central marketplace in Mexico City also became known as the Parián indicates the hold that Asian goods and Manila had on the popular imagination (pp. 72–79).

Chapters 4 and 5 focus on the urban centres of Acapulco, Mexico City and Puebla, and on the local aesthetic that emerged from the importation of Chinese

ceramics into Mexico. Acapulco was established as a port to receive Manila galleons. Although usually only one galleon came a year, its arrival instigated weeks of frantic activity and a fair that became famous around the world. Most of the goods that arrived were transported by Indigenous labourers along the 280 miles of ‘difficult terrain’ known as the Camino de China (pp. 103–06, 170). As such commodities, including ceramics, came ‘unmediated through Spain’, they were adopted and appropriated in ways specific to local needs and tastes. Religious institutions and wealthy consumers in Mexico began ordering custom-made objects, such as vessels decorated with insignia or heraldic crest. *Mancerinas* (cups for drinking chocolate) were also ordered from Jingdezhen. This meant that, while in Europe Chinese cups were filled with Chinese tea, in Mexico they were filled with chocolate (pp. 83, 120). Alongside this demand for Chinese-made ceramics grew a demand for locally produced vessels. The stylistic choices Mexicans made rendered their work unique, and quite different from ceramics produced by Asian-influenced potters in Spain. Although Chinese figures were incorporated into the painted scenes, so were local motifs. For example, the quetzal, a Mexican bird, replaced the Chinese phoenix (pp. 102, 153, 171–73). The craftsmen of Puebla in particular incorporated aspects of Chinese ceramics, such as the blue and white aesthetic, into their earthenware. Priyadarshini points out that although Puebla is not often included in discussions about global trading nodes, its earthenware ceramics, in particular the *chocolateros* (a vessel for making drinking chocolate), were exported all over Mexico, and to Guatemala, Honduras, Cuba, and Santo Domingo. Moreover, although Peru did not have steady trade links with Mexico, such ceramics have been found there and in Venezuela (pp. 118, 133–35).

An important aspect of this book is that, while it delves into the local—clearly illustrating its incorporation into the global, it also highlights disconnects in the chain of production, transportation, and consumption. For example: although porcelains produced in Jingdezhen were ‘transported further and further away’, the world of the Chinese artisans who produced them was not expanded and their lives remained restricted (p. 55); and while the Indigenous Mexicans who carried these porcelains from Acapulco to Mexico City were an integral part of this transpacific trade, they could not afford the ceramics they transported (pp. 103–06, 170).

HEATHER DALTON, *University of Melbourne*

**Putter**, Ad, and Judith A. **Jefferson**, eds, *The Transmission of Medieval Romance: Metres, Manuscripts and Early Prints*, Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2018; hardback; pp. xiv, 241; 10 colour, 11 b/w illustrations, 7 graphs, 6 tables; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843845102.

These essays examine the transmission of medieval romances through investigation of their material (codicological) and verse forms. Introducing them, editors Ad Putter and Judith A. Jefferson review the history of romance studies (including the various prejudices attached to the genre), then mark up what the

dual approach has amply exposed, that there is much more to learn about an area considered well-studied.

Rhiannon Purdie's '*King Orphius and Sir Orfeo*, Scotland and England, Memory and Manuscript', examines transmission by memorization, based on study of extant manuscript copies of the Orpheus romance—three of the ME *Orfeo* (on which see also Minkova, and De Groot, in this volume); one of the OSc *Orphius* (NRS MS RH13/35); and David Laing's transcription of a 1586 fragment, 'Orpheus king of Portingail' (La.IV.27(54)). She argues, from a variety of evidence types and a deep understanding of the critical literature, that *Orphius* 'not only evolved from *Orfeo*, but continued to evolve and change gradually as it passed through memorial transmission' (p. 21).

Derek Pearsall, in 'The Metre of the *Tale of Gamelyn*', uses his vast knowledge to test whether significant differentiations can be made between metrical forms that have in the past been described loosely as 'the old septenary/alexandrine couplet' (p. 33). The journey is fascinating; the conclusions carefully tentative.

'Rhyme Royal and Romance' is Elizabeth Robertson's valuable contribution on the way in which romance is, and is not, transmitted. She argues that rhyme royal, introduced into English by Chaucer, is rarely chosen for romance because, as her close analysis then demonstrates, this form, by expanding, then binding the thought, 'mitigates against some of the aims and purposes of romance' (p. 50).

Ad Putter addresses the non-literate (memorial, melodic) forms of romance transmission in 'The Singing of Middle English Romance: Stanza Forms and *Contrafacta*'. He focuses on verse forms in *Sir Tristrem* (pp. 72–84), *Horn* (pp. 84–86), and *Bevis of Hampton* (pp. 86–90), building on the work of earlier scholars interested in musical performance. Putter eruditely makes the case for sung/orally performed romances, his attentive exploration of the terms, forms, memory slips, and possible music enjoyably compelling.

A study of material transmissions, Carol Meale's 'Deluxe Copies of Middle English Romance: Scribes and Book Artists', asks, of four of the five illustrated Middle English manuscripts containing romances, where they were made, for whom, and why so few survive. On Auchinleck (pp. 92–98, 114), Meale's essay has interesting links to Putter's.

Thorlac Turville Petre asks, 'Is *Cheuelere Assigne* an Alliterative Poem?' He compares *Cheuelere Assigne* with other alliterative romances, expertly considering syntax, metrics, possible emendations and rewriting, presence and absence of characteristic alliterative vocabulary, the defining accentual rhythm of balanced half-lines, and audience.

Attention to the finer details of transmission characterizes Donka Minkova's 'Language Tests for the Identification of Middle English Genre'. She reports early findings of attempts 'to quantify the behaviour of adjectives in Middle English verse that relate frequency in the ambient language to metrical placement and possibly text type' (p. 144).

In ‘The Problem of John Metham’s Prosody’, Nicholas Myklebust studies how the transmission of Chaucer’s metrical line has been interpreted, engaging with *Amoryus and Cleopes*, and other Lancastrian poets (Bockenham, Ashby). He shows the importance of Metham’s metre, because of ‘the pressure it places not only on literary traditions of romance and metre but also on critical traditions of contextualization and reconstruction’ (p. 169).

With Jordi Sánchez-Martí’s ‘The Printed Transmission of Medieval Romance from William Caxton to Wynkyn de Worde, 1473–1535’, interest moves to the marketing approaches of these printers, his findings especially useful on the different kinds of romance readers each printer sought.

Contextual matters and transmission are the subject of Michelle De Groot’s ‘Compiling Sacred and Secular: *Sir Orfeo* and the Otherworlds of Medieval Miscellanies’. De Groot points out that each of the three *Sir Orfeo* manuscripts was compiled in differing circumstances, scribal organizational intentions thus not easy to evaluate. She shows how the romance and its surrounding material (religious and secular), ‘help to define each other’ (p. 196), and that the reader’s role is a key.

Manuscript circulation and possession, as seen in five inscriptions, occupies Rebecca E. Lyons in ‘The Woodville Women, Eleanor Haute, and British Library MS 14 E III’. She mentions the political and geopolitical space of the handwritten notes, showing their bearing on the manuscript’s use, and how they help to reveal familial and social activity.

The volume is well supported, with lists of figures and abbreviations, and a substantial index.

JANET HADLEY WILLIAMS, *The Australian National University*

**Schutte, Valerie, and Estelle Paraque, eds, *Forgotten Queens in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Political Agency, Myth-Making, and Patronage*, New York, Routledge, 2019; paperback; pp. xiii, 198; 6 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £34.99; ISBN 9781138085466.**

Growing out of ‘The Routledge History of Monarchy’ (2019) project, this collection brings together a variety of queens’ consort who have ‘disappeared from history or have been deeply misunderstood in modern historical treatment’ (book cover). As the editors acknowledge in their introduction, queens were more than simply mothers and wives; they were influential politically and culturally, and often wielded significant power. The chapters that follow present a variety of case studies that attempt to both undo some of the blatant lack of historiographical attention from which non-regnant queens (barring a few notable exceptions) have suffered, and shed ‘light on queens who have remained in the shadows of others for too long’ (although they do perpetuate the Eurocentric view of queenship that the editors criticize other volumes for similarly doing) (p. 2).

Some of the chapters provide largely narrative biographies of forgotten queens. Gabrielle Storey offers an interesting study of Berengaria of Navarre (wife

of Richard the Lionheart) and Joanna of Sicily (wife of William II of Sicily), using three different chronicles to show that queens did exert political agency, despite the chroniclers' attempts to erase them from history.

Likewise, Sybil Jack provides a comparative biography of two contemporary queens, Katarina Jagiellonica (consort of John III of Sweden) and Sophie of Mecklenburg-Güstrow (consort of Frederick II of Denmark), analysing their various strategies for exercising political power.

Some of the chapters use textual sources as a way to analyse a queen's life. Valerie Schutte offers an interesting discussion of Richard Jonas's *The Byrth of Mankynde*, the only book dedicated to Katherine Howard, the fifth consort of Henry VIII, showing how a desire for patronage could also serve as pointed counsel. Conversely, Andrea Nichols discusses the textual history of one of Britain's founding myths, namely the Albine legend and the regency of Queen Gwendolen, focusing on the survival and then decline of the myth of an almost certainly apocryphal queen.

The remaining chapters more overtly engage with the themes of the collection. Lois Huneycutt provides a masterful study of the various queenly descendants of St Margaret of Scotland (including Empress Matilda), demonstrating the importance of myth-making to monarchical power, and arguing that these queens remembered or forgot their Wessex ancestry according to contemporary need.

Maria of Navarre, the first consort of Pedro IV of Aragon, is often relegated to cursory mentions, but Lledó Ruiz Domingo's chapter offers a fascinating study of a woman who was able to quickly cement her position through patronage and piety, and who gave birth to four children before her death at the age of eighteen.

Considering the vital role of dynastic unions, Estelle Paranke's chapter focuses on Elisabeth of Austria, consort of Charles IX, and their daughter, Marie-Elisabeth. Admired and loved in their own lives, Paranke suggests that their 'flawless' lives caused them to subsequently be overlooked in a period full of larger-than-life figures (p. 122).

Arguably one of the most forgotten early modern English queens, Catherine of Braganza, consort of Charles II, is the subject of Eilish Gregory's chapter. Gregory's study of Catherine's relationship with the Catholics in her household provides a fascinating examination of the way the Portuguese queen successfully patronized Catholics in a dangerous and shifting religio-political period.

Jennifer Germann provides a fascinating account of the various adaptations of Jean-Marc Nattier's 1748 portrait of Marie Leszczinska, consort of Louis XV. The chapter—sadly the only one to contain images—emphasizes how this one painting shaped the Queen's memory, and that its myriad of meanings allowed it to become a 'touchstone for women in the later eighteenth and nineteenth centuries' (p. 167).

Cinzia Recca analyses the political agency of Maria Carolina of Austria, consort of Ferdinand IV of Naples, focusing on the various advice-treatises prepared for the Queen. Ferdinand, who lacked any interest in ruling, happily

allowed his wife to rule in his stead, and Recca's study suggests that Maria Carolina is undeserving of a negative legacy that is instead largely the result of the period's wider geopolitical tumult.

It must be noted that the text contains several frustrating mistakes and inconsistencies, which distract from the content. Similarly, while catchy, the descriptor of the queens in this collection as 'forgotten' perhaps does them a disservice. The lack of sources concerning many of the queens in the collection—some of whom lived (and reigned) for very short periods—suggests that they were forgotten (intentionally or not) by their contemporaries, not subsequent generations of scholars. The collection's indisputable value, however, is in its focus on these queens' political agency, myth-making, and patronage. These ideas run through all the chapters (with differing levels of engagement), giving a lens through which to view the queens, and offering new avenues for future research.

This is an engaging collection, with several stand-out chapters, that should be considered a valuable resource not only for the study of medieval and early modern European monarchy, but also for gender, patronage, and collective memory more generally.

AIDAN NORRIE, *University of Warwick*

**Shyovitz, David**, *A Remembrance of His Wonders: Nature and the Supernatural in Medieval Ashkenaz*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2017; cloth; pp. ix, 336; 8 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £52.00; ISBN 9780812249118.

The lasting impact of the twelfth-century Ashkenazic Jewish Pietist movement (*Hasidei Ashkenaz*) on the subsequent trajectory of Jewish history, theology, liturgical practice, and culture can hardly be over-estimated. In this fascinating, meticulously researched book, David Shyovitz delves deeply into the writings of the Ashkenazic Pietists to probe their views on the 'natural' and 'supernatural'. The rich primary source material that underpins the scholarship of this book includes some of the most important writings that emerged from Ashkenaz during this period. Plumbing this complex and, at times, esoteric corpus of medieval texts to explore this topic is a daunting task, but one that Shyovitz has clearly embraced with zeal.

From the outset, Shyovitz rejects the assertion that, when compared with the philosophical/scientific discourse that blossomed on the Iberian Peninsula among medieval Sephardic Jews, Ashkenazim during this period were disinterested in the natural world, inward-looking and superstitious. Instead, he argues that the views expressed by the Pietists demonstrate a deep interest in the workings of the natural world and the theological significance of both the mundane and magical, and that their ideas were consonant with wider intellectual currents of the era.

Chapter 1 discusses empirical observations by the Pietists concerning God's 'wonders' in both natural and supernatural phenomena, with topics ranging from the properties of air to the power of magnetic stones. Shyovitz asserts that the Pietists'

attitudes, beliefs, and hypotheses expressed in this literature are in accord not only with medieval Ashkenazic Jewish theology, but reflect the Pietists' engagement with prevailing currents of thought in medieval Christendom. For example, in Chapter 2 entitled 'The World Made Flesh', Shyovitz makes a convincing case that the human body—often called the '*olam katan* (small world) in Hebrew—was considered by the Pietists to be a 'microcosm of the created world in its entirety' (p. 19), a concept that finds parallels in twelfth-century Christian theological writings and visual sources. In particular, Shyovitz compares the microcosm-ism of the Pietists and microcosmic motifs in works by Hildegard von Bingen, whom he notes was active in the German Rhineland where important medieval Jewish communities were located, including those of the early Pietists. The close parallels between incarnational worldviews in Christian and Jewish sources leads Shyovitz to suggest that, in this regard, the Pietists were not just exposed to and aware of Christian theology, but influenced by it. Shyovitz shows the extent to which the Pietists use corporeal language to explain not only the spiritual body, but also the soul's inhabitation of specific bodily locations and the consequential inseparability of body and soul. While this finds parallels in Christian thought, as discussed in Chapter 3, it also contrasts dualistic conceptions of the body and soul that were prevalent among some Christian theologians. Particularly interesting is this chapter's discussion of the paradox between the Pietists' emphasis on the positive value of the body on the one hand, and their well-known advocacy of ascetic and extreme penitential behaviours on the other.

Chapter 4 deals with the views of the Pietists on monstrosity and supernatural beings, examining again commonalities and differences between Jewish and Christian sources. Shyovitz highlights that processes of human transformation evident in some supernatural beings, such as werewolves, particularly interested the Pietists, who viewed this as a positive quality, a manifestation of the human body's stability as opposed to the incorporeality of other, more malevolent supernatural creatures, such as demons. In addressing the historical legacy of the werewolf motif in this chapter, however, Shyovitz digresses perhaps unnecessarily from what is otherwise a well-focused essay. The vivid portrayal of grotesques and hybrid figures in a fourteenth-century manuscript that appears as the book's cover illustration also suggests a missed opportunity to explore how the Pietists' views on the monstrous may have influenced representations of supernatural beings in later medieval Jewish books from Ashkenaz.

Though Chapter 5 may appeal less to the squeamish, Shyovitz offers a meaningful contribution to 'medieval waste studies' in which he explores the Pietists' somewhat obsessive views on bodily excretions and effluence, and how these relate to the wider theological discussion concerning the human body that pervades this book. This chapter reveals the extent to which the Pietists sought to protect the purity of ritual objects, sacred space of the synagogue, and even privately spoken prayer from being defiled through contact—direct or indirect—with voluntary, involuntary, and necessary bodily emissions. Though seemingly

paradoxical, Shyovitz argues that this is consonant with the Pietists' positive, microcosmic conception of the human body as the *'olam katan*.

Densely packed with rich information, and including helpful translations of all texts, this book is a valuable contribution to medieval scholarship. It will be useful for both specialist readers in medieval Jewish studies, along with those interested in medieval discourse on the natural and supernatural, and parallels between medieval Jewish and Christian theology.

SUZANNE WIJSMAN, *The University of Western Australia*

**Szende, Katalin, *Trust, Authority, and the Written Word in the Royal Towns of Medieval Hungary*** (Utrecht Studies in Medieval Literacy, 41), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; pp. xx, 416; 50 b/w illustrations, 12 b/w tables; R.R.P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503578811.

The appearance and nature of formal communication and the purposes it served in Europe in the Middle Ages have been extensively analysed in the last forty years. This excellent study extends the existing scholarship that has examined the complex relationship between trust and writing in other parts of Europe to the medieval kingdom of Hungary. It makes available to those unfamiliar with the languages of the region a comprehensive understanding of the nature and manner of government in this critical but often neglected area of the continent.

While Hungary has its distinctive history, the questions Dr Szende considers are part of the wider analysis of the various ways in which different forms of writing underlay the management and legitimation of local social and political cultures by the monarch and other authorities, including the church, in this period. She applies ideas about medieval literacy and communication first developed by Michael Clanchy and more recently by Marco Mostert to an area where literacy came late and was complicated by the multiple languages in use in the different local communities. Dr Szende's research is focused on the roughly thirty Hungarian locations that were royal free towns where the development of written records as evidence of accepted agreements on matters such as land ownership and testamentary dispositions was shaped by the particular needs of both central and local government.

Dr Szende devotes a chapter to each aspect of the problem, focusing on them one by one. First, with great clarity, she briefly sets the scene both for the historical background and for the historiography before moving to the question of the ways in which the growth of civic literacy, particularly the need to use documentation to authenticate agreements, affected the growth of urban identity in the royal towns. She establishes the chronological steps by which an administrative system that was generally accepted as unimpeachable—that is trusted—became established. She starts by elucidating the importance of the authenticity of the town seal, before moving on to the choice of a clerk able to construct the formulary, and the appearance of a writing office where the town books and eventually an archive were developed. The urban leaders who were often summoned to the

central courts were able to see and learn the ways in which the royal courts and the ecclesiastical chancelleries were structured. Hungary could also see how nearby areas of Germany had borrowed from central practices.

Dr Szende's principal focus is on language, as she regards that communication as crucial to any social development and fundamental to effective government. Without trust in the authority of the government there would be no acceptance of the content of the documents it legitimated. She shows how the different uses of the written word were affected by the issue of what language was chosen for the documents. Her analysis of the choice of language for different purposes in Hungary broadens our understanding of the issues widely debated in studies of the process elsewhere. When and with what rituals and what public expression of authority the signs on parchment replaced the spoken word as a guarantee of a binding agreement, differed in Hungary from some other areas as the local languages acquired particular roles.

One must hope that, as mentioned in the conclusion, Dr Szende will pursue further the comparison of developments in Hungary with those that occurred elsewhere in Europe. She provides a brief consideration of this comparison in three cities—Ghent, Augsburg, and Poland—as an indication of the similarities and differences that may be expected.

SYBIL JACK, *The University of Sydney*

**Tamminen**, Miikka, *Crusade Preaching and the Ideal Crusader* (Sermo: Studies on Patristic, Medieval, and Reformation Sermons and Preaching, 14), Turnhout, Brepols, 2018; hardback; pp. ix, 332; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503577258.

The extant crusade model sermons of the thirteenth century have attracted increasing scholarly attention over the past few decades. A series of invaluable studies by historians such as Penny Cole, Christoph Maier, Nicole Bériou, Jessalynn Bird, and Alexis Charansonnet has made these fascinating texts more widely accessible and shed considerable light on their composition, dissemination, sources, rhetorical strategies, themes, and impact. This new book by Miikka Tamminen explicitly builds on the work of these scholars and explores how concepts of the 'true' or ideal crusader were constructed and promoted in the model sermons and preaching aids composed by a group of crusade preachers who had all either studied or taught at the University of Paris at some stage: Phillipe le Chancelier, Jacques de Vitry, Roger of Salisbury, Eudes de Châteauroux, Humbert de Romans, Federico Visconti, and Guibert de Tournai.

Drawing on thirty-six texts summarized at the outset (pp. 24–43) and listed in five useful appendices for ease of reference (pp. 291–97), Tamminen offers nothing less than 'a comprehensive study of crusade sermons [...] where the focus is on the messages intended for those who have already taken the cross' (p. 2). Although no single book could truly provide 'a comprehensive study' of such a rich corpus of sources, Tamminen's analysis does illuminate the perspectives of

the crusade preachers in detail. Fortunately, that detail never comes at the expense of clarity.

The structure of the book is simple, but logical: following the introduction (pp. 1–43), the remainder of the study functions as a kind of triptych, with each chapter tackling a specific set of themes and motifs deployed by the preachers in their idealized constructions of crusaders' spiritual comportment and physical conduct. Chapter 2, 'The Crusade and the Bible' (pp. 45–89), is not only the least substantial chapter, but also arguably the least innovative, even though it does provide a thoughtful and concise analysis of the ways in which preachers used various biblical figures such as Joshua, Achor/Achan, the Maccabees, and the prostitute Rahab as examples of the kinds of behaviour that they should both adopt and avoid. Though undoubtedly interesting, the chapter's final subsection on 'Biblical Prophecy' (pp. 74–89) does not engage thoroughly with previous scholarship on apocalypticism in the crusading context, and fails to explain clearly how the apocalyptic and prophetic material discussed aided preachers in constructing and instructing 'true' crusaders.

Chapter 3, 'The Crusader and God' (pp. 90–201), on the other hand, is both very long (perhaps too long) and full of insightful observations. One of the most important of these is that the ideals, language, and imagery of the imitation of Christ (*imitatio Christi*), inextricably bound up with concepts of self-denial, rejection of the world (*contemptus mundi*), love for God, and the ready embrace of suffering, remained as prominent in thirteenth-century crusade ideology as they had been in the twelfth century (pp. 108–32). This chapter also aptly illustrates the preachers' complex, nuanced, and by no means consistent views on crusading stigmata, indulgences, and martyrdom.

Chapter 4, 'The Crusader and the World' (pp. 203–78), shifts the frame of reference and investigates how the preachers articulated the ideal crusader's relationship with wealth, family, home, and society. As in Chapter 3, Tamminen further refines our understanding of thirteenth-century crusade ideology by demonstrating that, contrary to what some scholars have suggested, awareness and expressions of the fundamental link between crusade and pilgrimage persisted in this period and can be seen in many of the model sermons (pp. 239–50). Furthermore, Tamminen shows convincingly (and somewhat surprisingly) that not all preachers were hostile or opposed to the participation of women and children in crusading expeditions, as is especially clear in the case of Eudes de Châteauroux (pp. 262–69).

For all its merits, *Crusade Preaching and the Ideal Crusader* suffers to some extent from the lack of a consistent central thesis, perhaps because 'true' crusaders (*veri cruce signati*) as a discrete and well-defined category appear only infrequently, and rarely explicitly, in the sources in question. A noticeable impediment to the flow of the analysis is the tendency to provide block excerpts from sources (several of which are re-introduced on multiple occasions throughout the book) in the footnotes accompanying paraphrases and loose translations in the

body of the text. The effect of this is the accumulation of numerous interesting observations and small-scale discussions that do not necessarily cohere as a well-developed argument.

On balance, Tamminen makes a lucid and instructive contribution to scholarship on the crusade model sermons and thirteenth-century crusade ideology more broadly. His analysis effectively complements the best recent work in this field and shows that, even if we can tease out some features that are common to all of the model sermons, there was no monolithic conception of the ‘true’ crusader in the thirteenth century, but rather many different conceptions of this idealized figure. Students, teachers, and researchers seeking to understand the complex development of crusading ideas in this period will no doubt read this book with great interest.

JAMES H. KANE, *Flinders University*

**Ward, John O.**, *Classical Rhetoric in the Middle Ages: The Medieval Rhetors and their Art 400–1300, with Manuscript Survey to 1500 CE* (International Studies in the History of Rhetoric, 10), Leiden, Brill, 2019; hardback; pp. xvii, 706; 1 colour illustration; R.R.P. €199.00, US\$239.00; ISBN 9789004368071.

Almost fifty years after it was examined, John O. Ward finally publishes his influential dissertation on Western medieval attitudes toward the Graeco-Roman art of rhetoric. His ground-breaking work, targeting neglect of a significant aspect of the medieval imagination, has been ‘refreshed’ for a contemporary academic audience. Ward follows the reception of two key Roman rhetorical texts from the year 400 to 1300, namely *De inventione* and *Rhetorica ad Herennium*, attributed to the Roman rhetor, Marcus Tullius Cicero (106–43 BCE), though his authorship of the latter is no longer accepted. Ward begins with the commentary on *De inventione* by the fourth-century rhetor, Victorinus, and ends at the point where the rhetorical texts of Aristotle become widely influential in the West.

Noting that these Ciceronian texts are, in the modern era, regarded as lesser works, Ward establishes these ‘*juvenilia*’ as fundamental to medieval approaches to rhetoric. His analysis of the surviving manuscript corpus demonstrates the importance of these works on the intellectual culture of the medieval period. In a Christian tradition, it was, perhaps, Augustine of Hippo who first endorsed the select influence of Cicero’s *juvenilia* on the medieval West, cementing subsequent suspicions of Cicero’s more mature works as ‘showy’. It is only in the Renaissance, Ward argues, that the ‘true’ figure of Cicero is revived.

Ward subsequently moves to examining medieval attitudes to classical rhetorical theory through an investigation of the impact of the *juvenilia*. The *Ad Herennium* represents a more systematic teaching tool, and Ward details its utility in the learning and practising of the art of rhetoric, especially as an authority on style and memory and their impact on persuasive speech and writing. The *De inventione*, on the other hand, concentrates, as per its title, on an aspect of rhetoric,

invention, and is less tightly organized. However, the *De inventione* still had utility, particularly in its rhetorical classification systems and its discussions of practical applications of rhetoric.

Moving to a teleology of Ciceronian textbooks, Ward charts the influence of Cicero (and the ‘Ciceronian’ first-century rhetor, Quintilian) on the period 400–1100. The decline in the classical Ciceronian rhetorical tradition in the late Roman period sees Victorinus’s new take on Cicero. His commentary on *De inventione*, inspired by the Platonic philosophies of Quintilian, shifts rhetoric from a high art to an art dependent on the character and motivations of the person using it, thus attaining, in the new Christian landscape, a theological aspect. The fifth-century rhetor, Grillius, subsequently shifts the debate further to more Hellenistic ideas of rhetoric as an acquired art and not an innate talent, though not without some resistance from sixth-century rhetors such as Boethius and Cassiodorus. Seventh- and eighth-century figures such as Isidore and Alcuin pick up on the classical, now Christian, ideal of the rhetor as the *vir bonus*. Alcuin, in particular, relates rhetoric to a doctrine of persuasion, perhaps in a context of increasing religious compulsion in secular politics. Increasingly, as Ward shows, rhetoric is displaced by grammar in this period, with rhetoric regarded as an abstraction.

The twelfth and thirteenth centuries are the hey-day of the *De inventione* and the *Ad Herennium*. The scholastic revolution sees an increasing interest in defining art and the relationship between the arts. Rhetoric becomes increasingly embedded in theological debates over whether it is a tool for reason, an innate truth, or a simple art. These fierce debates involved notable medieval intellectuals such as Abelard, Hugh of St Victor, and Bernard of Chartres, and produced a group that spurned both rhetoric and Cicero, the so-called Cornificians. In a climate increasingly charged with accusations of heresy, the *De inventione* became preferred because of its more definitive role and suitable exemplar, whereas the *Ad Herennium* was seen as so utilitarian that it offered no perspectives to the unwary.

Ward demonstrates that medieval rhetoric could not escape from the philosophical premises of medieval Christianity. In connecting the shaping of language to both theological and, indeed, political identity, Ward has offered a new way to read texts and to read arguments. However, like many texts with a genesis in the twentieth century, there is a tendency to favour the high Middle Ages over the early Middle Ages. In concentrating on Cicero there is a tendency to downplay other rhetorical traditions such as the Judaeo-Hellenistic styles advocated by Cyprian and Jerome. Also, in attempting to keep with the older layout of the dissertation, the newer material is incorporated in a curious fashion—this reader wishes that the book had simply been rewritten. A key message for our times is Ward’s observation that these intense debates took place against a backdrop of fears that the social relevance of knowledge was in danger of being forgotten.

STEPHEN JOYCE, *Monash University*

**Wells-Furby**, Bridget, *Aristocratic Marriage, Adultery and Divorce in the Fourteenth Century: The Life of Lucy de Thweng (1279–1347)*, Woodbridge, The Boydell Press, 2019; hardback; pp. 258; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781783273676.

The medieval period presents the scholar with challenges simply because of the lack of surviving source materials. Each research project is constructed through threading together thin strands of remaining evidence, usually found in a myriad places. By extension, constructing accounts of the lives of medieval women is even harder. Bridget Wells-Furby, an independent scholar who researches the landed gentry in medieval England, has done a remarkable job in trying to unravel the story of Yorkshire heiress Lucy de Thweng. Thweng, who lived an eventful life of three marriages, divorce, a lengthy widowhood after her second marriage, and an extramarital relationship that resulted in birth of a bastard son. In her recent monograph, *Aristocratic Marriage, Adultery and Divorce in the Fourteenth Century: The Life of Lucy de Thweng (1279–1347)*, Wells-Furby attempts to piece together and understand the life of Lucy (and, by extension, other medieval women who had similar experiences), by exploring stages in her life, such as wardship, marriage(s), divorce, widowhood, and adultery.

The monograph is structured around the concepts of marriage, divorce, and separation, exploring Lucy's story chronologically. It is meticulously researched, with each chapter revealing a plethora of detailed information. In order to contextualize Lucy's story, Wells-Furby presents different cases of separation, divorce, remarriage, and adultery that appear in the records. For example, Chapter 3, 'Separation and Divorce', provides an extremely detailed survey of numerous cases of why separation and divorces were sought, looking at particular cases where, it should be stressed, a wide variety of reasons were claimed for divorce to be granted. Importantly, these cases show that contemporaries were grappling with issues of divorce and separation, more so than perhaps historians have thought in the past.

Lucy de Thweng, in particular, sought a divorce in 1303 from her first husband William Latimer for unknown reasons, and left the marriage after Latimer went to war in Scotland. Wells-Furby uses Lucy's case to show that medieval women who wished to seek separation or divorce needed to have alternative sources of support—in Lucy's case her uncle. Divorce also came with other risks. Medieval women were vulnerable to abduction by their husbands if seeking separation and divorce, but also if they were widows or divorcees and had some personal wealth. Wells-Furby concludes that Lucy was likely abducted after her divorce from Latimer—due to her having land from the divorce settlement—as Lucy was already romantically involved with a man called Nicholas Meinill, to whom she bore a bastard child, but eventually married a man called Robert de Everingham. As such, it is through Lucy's story that Wells-Furby is able to unpack the very troubling conditions some women were exposed to throughout this period, and the risks that some took in order to leave their marriages.

The main issue with the monograph stems from gaps in the source material. Due to the lack of surviving records on medieval women, and Lucy in particular, the monograph does devote more space to the details of other cases than to Lucy herself. As Wells-Furby states in her conclusion: ‘medieval historians are never more at the mercy of their source material than when considering personal feeling and trying to deduce them from stray incidental references’ (p. 196). While she is aware of these problems, Wells-Furby chooses to undertake an extremely detailed examination and survey of cases of separation, divorce, adultery, and remarriage on a large scale. It is understandable that this research accompanies Lucy’s story in order to provide adequate context, which Wells-Furby acknowledges is crucial. However, it often means that an exploration of Lucy’s story is relegated to the end of the chapters and often feels supplementary to the monograph. Wells-Furby is able to summarize *all* of Lucy’s biography in the ten-page conclusion, which repeats all information presented in the chapters. Readers are also provided with an overwhelming number of names and details from the cases that, while fascinating, could have been summarized more concisely. Furthermore, Wells-Furby often does not draw any strong conclusions from these findings, choosing to state that there is no way of knowing exactly how common such instances of divorce were, for example. In her choosing not to draw any strong conclusions, the argument therefore feels lacklustre.

However, this work by Wells-Furby offers an extraordinary level of detail not usually seen. The in-depth research within this monograph makes it a very important contribution to scholarship about the lives of fourteenth-century women and, especially, the marriages, divorces, and separations of women in the medieval world.

HILARY JANE LOCKE, *Macquarie University*

**Wright, Monica L., Robin Netherton, and Gale R. Owen-Crocker, eds, *Medieval Clothing and Textiles*, Volume 15, Woodbridge, The Boydell Press, 2019; hardback; pp. xiii, 195; 36 b/w illustrations, 3 colour plates; R.R.P. US\$70.00, £40.00; ISBN 9781783274123.**

For fifteen years *Medieval Clothing and Textiles* has provided a forum for interdisciplinary research into ‘the fabric of the medieval world’ (p. xi). The seven articles in this issue exhibit the excellent scholarship for which the series is known. The contributors are concerned with various aspects of the manufacture, materiality, use, and cultural meanings of cloth and clothing. They examine evidence from the early to the late Middle Ages, extending from Scandinavia to southern Europe. This volume marks a transition for the series, with Monica Wright assuming the role as lead editor of this issue while founding editors Robin Netherton and Gale Owen-Crocker step back from steering this influential series.

Gale Owen-Crocker, who has been a driving force in textile studies for nearly five decades, opens the volume with a succinct and characteristically perceptive survey of the state of the field. Presenting an overview of textile studies

for researchers new to the field, she considers methodological and interpretive challenges in the analysis of material textile artefacts, textual evidence, and discusses recent theoretically informed approaches such as object biographies. The footnotes are replete with references to databases, repositories, sources, and other research guides, all of which are introduced with informed commentary to orient readers to the key resources for medieval textile studies. Researchers new to the field will find much of value here, and the article is ideally suited to teaching.

Two articles engage with questions about the materiality of textiles and how it influences the cultural meanings of cloth and clothing. Working from the critical insight that material resonances matter for metaphor, Maren Clegg Hyer examines the interplay between interlace designs in Anglo-Saxon textiles and literature as expressed in the metaphor of ‘wordweaving’. Her analysis of Latin and vernacular poetry demonstrates how authors drew on the familiar, recognizable patterns of textile and manuscript interlace design to create ‘experientially resonant’ poetic metaphors particular to their historical place and context.

In the other article to examine textile artefacts, Tina Anderlini undertakes a comprehensive analysis of medallion silks. Drawing on surviving fragments, textual, visual, and material evidence, she demonstrates the importance of these luxury fabrics for display in religious settings. She also shows how these textiles influenced other aspects of material culture, examining wall painting, sculpture, and mosaics to demonstrate how the roundel design of these silks served as a ‘source of inspiration for other arts and a strong sign of sanctity, honour, power, and wealth’ (p. 136).

An unusual depiction of weaving cloth is the focus of Joanne W. Anderson’s study of a painted Annunciation scene in a church in South Tyrol. Focusing on the depictions of the Virgin weaving and an unfinished heraldic textile on her loom, Anderson deftly contextualizes the imagery to show how it expresses the devotional and social identities of the patrons. She concludes that material processes of cloth production also serve as a metaphor for creation, ‘of both things and life in the making’ (p. 159).

A theme taken up by several contributors is how clothing signifies identity, denotes personal change, and mediates social relations. Through an intertextual analysis of the depiction of attire and changes of dress in *The Niebelungenlied* and the *Völsunga Saga*, Elizabeth M. Swedo argues that clothing was a ‘versatile and powerful signifier’ (p. 54). She distinguishes aesthetic preferences for types of clothing in the two traditions, arguing that ‘fictive clothing’, especially that which served as the vehicle for narrative action, needed to resonate with the cultural expectations and social experience of the audience.

The material and cultural importance of cloth and clothing in elite households is the subject of Hugh Thomas’s finely grained study of the use of textiles at the court of John I of England. Drawing on household accounts such as close rolls, this study models approaches to using these records to understand how fabric was valued, produced, and exchanged within a royal court. Thomas also discovers

evidence for personal clothing preferences, suggesting that John had a ‘clear aesthetic preference for variety and colour’, indicating a desire to appear ‘stylish’ (p. 97). He concludes that fashion as well as the display of power influenced John’s textile choices.

Alexandra Concha Sahli examines the significance of the habit as an expression of collective identity and religious practice for beguines and lay penitential groups in the high Middle Ages. Focusing on the controversies aroused by the dress of these groups, she argues that the gradual acceptance of their habit by ecclesiastic and secular authorities also reflects the importance of dress as a means to ‘announce’ new forms of lay devotional life from the thirteenth century.

Collectively, this issue showcases current vibrant research into medieval textiles. Several articles would be particularly well-suited for teaching or to orient researchers new to the field. It concludes with a useful list of recent publications and an index for the series. This volume will be a valuable resource for textile historians and medievalists working in many disciplines for some time.

JULIE HOTCHIN, *The Australian National University*

**Zweck**, Jordan, *Epistolary Acts: Anglo-Saxon Letters and Early English Media* (Toronto Anglo-Saxon Series), Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2018; hardback; pp. 240; R.R.P. CA\$75.00; ISBN 9781487501006.

Jordan Zweck’s study of ‘epistolary acts’ in early medieval England argues that there is more to understanding vernacular epistolary culture in the period than studying the limited surviving letters written in Old English. Zweck broadens her discussion to include letters and other epistolary moments incorporated into Old English texts, both poetry and prose. In doing so she argues that these examples provide further insight into how not just the content of letters, but their materiality, delivery, and reception were translated into Anglo-Saxon vernacular culture.

Zweck’s introduction establishes several paradigms for her study, including, most importantly, her working definition of ‘epistolary acts’. This term incorporates ‘all the elements that make up protocols of letter writing, delivery, reception, and storage’ (p. 7). By deeming these ‘acts’ Zweck aims to highlight not just the content of letters but the physical activity involved in their construction and delivery, as well as their material qualities, which also create some physical connection between letter and scribe, messenger and recipient (p. 7). With this awareness of an epistolary culture broader than just the letters themselves Zweck demonstrates a useful point of engagement between medieval studies and media theory (p. 10). This link is utilized successfully throughout the book in her readings of various textually embedded ‘epistolary acts’. Another important aspect of Zweck’s definition of these acts is the focus on the vernacular; a significant thread throughout the book is the consideration of how specifically Old English representations of these ‘epistolary acts’ translate these from a Latinate language and culture into the vernacular.

A series of case studies offering close readings of several Old English texts structures *Epistolary Acts*. The introduction, as well as establishing the wider framework of the argument and its relationship to media studies, offers a reading of *The Husband's Message*. This is a helpful springboard for the rest of the book's discussion of epistolary communication. It highlights important features of letters, including the role of the messenger, by drawing attention to distance between sender and receiver, and identifies the ways in which the material of a letter can give a sense of its 'hypermediacy'. This is an example of the successful incorporation of media studies theory into the book, as hypermediacy is 'a condition which forces a viewer to confront its nature as medium' (p. 18). Zweck's reading also emphasizes the 'asynchronicity' of letters and how this influences the temporality of the poem itself. It is an interesting and innovative approach to *The Husband's Message*, which lays important groundwork for her close engagement with texts throughout the rest of the book.

Following the introduction, the first chapter establishes the early medieval English conception of epistolarity, including forms, features, and expectations about letters as well as the specific vocabulary associated with them. The discussion of vocabulary is particularly useful for the chapters that follow. The next chapters focus on one or several Old English texts in detail: the Old English *Sunday Letter* in Chapter 2; *Apollonius of Tyre* and the *Letter of Christ to Abgar* found in Ælfric of Eynsham's *Lives of Saints* in Chapter 3; and the anonymous *Life of Saint Mary of Egypt*, Ælfric's *Life of Saint Basil* and the anonymous *Legend of the Seven Sleepers* in Chapter 4. The discussion of each text highlights that representations privilege different aspects of engagement with letters, such as the retention of memory and the role of messengers. The discussion of the *Sunday Letter* in its various Old English forms is especially compelling, as Zweck demonstrates the relevance of an under-studied text and uses its various recensions to comment on the importance of transmission. The readings in each of these chapters are interesting and well-supported by close reading of the texts in question, but they can leave unanswered questions about the role of translation in shaping the sources that Zweck chooses to focus on. Her consideration of the ways in which Latinate epistolary culture is translated into the vernacular could have used more expansion, and the relationship between these texts as translations and their original source material might have been more convincing had more detail been offered about the sources in question.

Overall, Zweck's book makes a significant contribution by arguing for a more inclusive understanding of epistolarity in early medieval English texts. While it might have been helpful for there to be more focus on actual Old English letters before moving to the discussion of epistolary acts in texts, the book makes a clear and perceptive case for giving the inclusion of letters in texts more thought and offers important insights into broader concepts of memory, transmission, and materiality in the representation of letters in Old English texts.

EMMA KNOWLES, *The University of Sydney*

