

## Reviews

**Amsler**, Mark, *Affective Literacies: Writing and Multilingualism in the Late Middle Ages* (Late Medieval and Early Modern Studies, 19), Turnhout, Brepols, 2012; hardback; pp. xxvi, 424; 5 b/w, 5 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503532363.

This formidable work is the nineteenth issue of a notable series that encourages connections across disciplines and a geographical and chronological broadening of focus. The vitality of the series, and this volume in particular, comes from a determination to let a diversity of approaches deepen our understanding of human activity.

The book contains seven chapters – minimally annotated – an Introduction and Afterword, and is supported by a lengthy bibliography and indices. The Introduction and first three chapters present the dense theoretical landscape within which Mark Amsler situates his study. The last four chapters of the book use these theoretical tools to explore specific areas of socially constructed literacy in the period of 1100 to 1510.

Amsler's central argument is that 'later medieval literacies were fundamentally shaped by their persistent multilingualism and textual performativities and that different literate groups reworked ideas of grammar and textual authority to create new relations of power, agency, and resistance from the production and reception of written texts' (p. xxii). It is an argument that draws heavily on the work of James Gee's *Social Linguistics and Literacies: Ideology in Discourses* (Routledge, 2008), among others including Foucault, Derrida, Bourdieu, Deleuze, Bakhtin, and Street. Within this framework, texts are given agency as sites for the social construction and deconstruction of power and identity.

The first chapter, 'Theorizing Medieval Literacies', seeks to reconsider the validity of entrenched, simple binaries, especially the opposition of literate clergy and illiterate laity, and the privileged position Latin holds within that framework. For Amsler, literate discourses are more heterogeneous than this model suggests. The diversity of literate products, inclusive of written, oral, administrative, literary, religious, paratextual, private and public modes, and the interactions between these illustrate the fallibility of simple oppositions. What is apparent is the indivisibility of these textual behaviours, of Latin and vernacular literacies, from one another.

Chapter 2, 'Language Ideology and Marginal Latins', describes how Latin and vernacular literacies express and disrupt power structures in the

Middle Ages with a particular focus on England. The activities in which these literacies met, in glossing, code switching, translation, style, and syntax, were wide ranging. Amsler is as attentive to the impact of contemporary debates about the place of Latin in the linguistic spectrum (drawing on the work of Robert Kilwardby, Roger Bacon, Guillaume de Conches, Peter Helias, and Dominicus Gundissalinus, among others) as he is to the way that linguistic authority was physically mediated on the manuscripts themselves.

Chapter 3, 'Affective Literacies', treats in detail the practices and attitudes that constitute the subject of the whole volume. Affective literacy for Amsler denotes 'a range of emotional, spiritual, physiological, somatic responses readers have when reading or perceiving a text' (p. 103). Amsler explores this by looking at the fetishisation of texts as objects and the way this regulated and destabilised social relations.

Chapter 4, 'Reading Assimilation and Jewish Latin Textuality', is the first of a sequence of focused studies that trace the themes established in the first section in particular contexts. In this chapter, Amsler uses the contentious *Opusculum de conversione sua*, attributed to Hermann of Scheda and defined as a 'borderland text' by Gee, to explore the way the relationship between Hebrew and Latin literacy constructed identity and authority.

In Chapter 5, 'Ovid's Mythography and Medieval Readers', Amsler looks at a range of interpretative strategies devised to deal with morally problematic scenes, the rape narratives, in the Ovidian corpus as a means of engaging with the inter-textual politics of canonicity through the notion of the hypo-text and archive. Amsler traces this politics from Ovid through to Berchorius, Christine de Pizan, and Chaucer, among others.

Chapter 6, 'Grammar of Unruly Latin in Middle English Writing', challenges traditional accounts of medieval vernacularisation by demonstrating how normative multilingualism and multi-literacy was. In this complex context, Amsler shows how Latin was not foundational for Latin literacy only, but also facilitated vernacular literacies through the common alphabet and use of translation and gloss to bridge the gap.

Chapter 7, "'Clean and Chaste Latin": Literacy, Humanism, and the Boy Jesus', uses the case of John Colet's refounding of the St Paul's school to illuminate the role that grammar schools had in moderating literacy as a socio-cultural activity. Amsler looks at everything from curriculum, to physical space and administration to demonstrate how ideologically situated literacy was.

The mission of the book is ambitious in every respect. Examples are thematically driven and often synchronically deployed. At times, one wishes Amsler would have paused to consider the context, historical or otherwise, in more depth. The heady theoretical prose and the structure invite repetition. Nevertheless, the volume as a whole is a fine illustration of how a socio-linguistic approach can bring together disparate material to

restore complexity and thereby enhance our appreciation of literacy in the late Middle Ages.

RACHEL YUEN-COLLINGRIDGE, *Macquarie University*

**Baker**, Nicholas Scott, *The Fruit of Liberty: Political Culture in the Florentine Renaissance, 1480–1550* (ITatti Studies in Italian Renaissance History), Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 2013; hardback; pp. 382; 22 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. \$49.95, £36.95, €44.95; ISBN 9780674724525.

*The Fruit of Liberty* tells the fascinating story of the rise of the Medici and the changing political fate of Florence as it changed from a republic into a ducal principality. Nicholas Scott Baker examines the role of the elite office-holding class – that is, all those Florentines who had the possibility of accessing political power, but not necessarily those who formed the governing regime – in Florentine politics from 1480–1550. He demonstrates that the dramatic reorganisation of Florence’s political institutions in this period occurred with the assistance and participation of this group. The civilian magistrates allowed this change in the political status of Florence because they believed it was the best way to preserve their traditional values and the republican tradition. Baker draws upon a wide variety of sources, including artworks, correspondence, and diaries, with a particular focus on the writings of Piero di Jacopo Guicciardini (father of historian and political theorist Francesco).

Fourteenth-century Florence was *stato popolare*, a republic, but the Medici family dominated Florentine politics throughout the fifteenth century. In 1434, Cosimo il Vecchio Medici had become a principal citizen of the city and its unofficial head of state. His son, Piero, and grandson Lorenzo il Magnifico, inherited these positions. Despite such prominent figures, Florence remained a republic in both practice and culture. Lorenzo’s sons, Cardinal Giovanni and Giuliano, were exiled after his death in 1494, but returned in 1512 to defend Florence against the Spanish army that had sacked Prato, only a few kilometres away from Florence, after which they were considered liberators of the city.

By this time, however, the Medici family’s interests and focus had switched to Rome. From the liberators of 1512, they became a threat to Florence’s independence and left the city financially drained supporting the Medici pope, Clement VII’s anti-imperial policies. In May 1527, in an effort to restore the Republic, the Medici were again exiled from Florence.

The fragile republic did not last long and after a ten-month siege beginning in October 1529 the Medici returned. The office-holding class was preserved as much as possible and of the ninety-eight most prominent men of the failed Republic only twenty-one received prison sentences and only six were executed. The new Medici regime of Alessandro sought stability and security

in Florence. However, there were further erosions of the *stato* and in 1532 the 250-year-old institution of the Signoria was abolished and replaced by two new councils: the Dugento (Two Hundred) and the Quarantotto (Forty-Eight). After the murder of Alessandro in 1537, nineteen-year-old Cosimo I replaced him and soon annihilated any trace of the Republic, becoming the Duke of Florence in name and practice. The community of office-holders had transformed themselves into courtiers and Baker succinctly demonstrates that the creation of the Medici principate was completed with the support of the office-holders of Florence.

The traditional iconography of the city had long been David and Goliath – exemplified by Michelangelo's *David* that was placed in front of the Palazzo della Signoria in 1504 – which represented the *virtù* of the Florentine *stato*, and for the office-holding class the overcoming of hardship and the ideals of the Republic. Throughout these periods the iconography of *virtù* continued to embody the ideals of the Republic despite its erosion by the rule of the Medici. At the 1549 celebrations of the feast of St John the Baptist, the patron of the city, a float depicting the battle between David and Goliath halted at the doors of the home of Cosimo I. It represented Cosimo I as David. The iconography of David, defender of *virtù*, had undergone a political transformation: 'David was no longer a communal symbol but an avatar for the Medici Prince' (p. 230).

This is a highly scholarly and interesting book. The notes section is comprehensive and would be exceedingly helpful for any further study on this topic. *The Fruit of Liberty* is a delight to read and very difficult to put down. It is a must for any scholar interested in Renaissance Florence.

TESSA MORRISON, *The University of Newcastle, NSW*

**Beadle**, Richard, ed., *The York Plays: A Critical Edition of the York Corpus Christi Play as Recorded in British Library Additional MS 35290, Volume II* (Early English Text Society, Supplementary Series, 24), Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2013; hardback; pp. lxii, 549; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9780199590360.

This long-awaited companion volume to Professor Richard Beadle's text and manuscript study of the *York Corpus Christi Play* (*Volume I*, 2009) completes the EETS editions of the four surviving English Biblical cycles. It is an outstanding achievement by a scholar who, as he writes, has 'been concerned with the York Plays in one way or another for the best part of a lifetime' (p. vi).

The Introduction to *Volume II* describes the Plays' performance context, their documented history between 1399 and 1579, and their language, including the main scribe's modernisation and his toning down of northern dialectal features. Headnotes elucidate the 'bringing forth' of each of the forty-seven pageants by its Craft or Crafts with reference to the *Ordo*

*Paginarum*, a production list compiled in 1415 by the York civic authorities. The Headnotes also consider each pageant's text as preserved and amended in London, British Library, MS Additional 35290, the Register compiled between 1463 and 1477 on the council's behalf, to record and to vet the Corpus Christi Day productions. In the 1550s and 1560s the Common Clerk of York's deputy, the eponymous John Clerke, annotated and amended the Register against the performances that he witnessed. *Volume II*'s explications of alterations and marginalia by Clerke and others thus bring Tudor productions of the Plays to imaginative life. Each Headnote also outlines its pageant's sources and analogues, and discusses pertinent theatrical and literary issues, and versification. Extensive commentaries on lines and passages keyed to the *Volume I* edition deepen the reader's understanding of subjects dealt with more broadly in the Introduction and Headnotes. This method has the advantage of thoroughness, and the disadvantage of retaining across subsections repetitions that probably should not have survived a final general editing. *Volume II* concludes with a Glossary that most readers will need to consult in order fully to comprehend the often-difficult Middle English of the texts edited in *Volume I*.

This monumental work resists detailed remembering after a single seriatim reading. However, even such a reading illuminates life in a late medieval and Tudor provincial city in all its multilayered complexity, and with an immediacy that even the most adept social history or literary or dramatic criticism will struggle to equal. Among the book's revelations is the mesh of topological connections, many based in patristic symbology, that criss-cross the whole cycle of plays; that penetrate beyond its borders into liturgy and private devotional practices; and that mutually illuminate other arts, such as painting and sculpture. Also surprising for a dramatic tradition sometimes dismissed as mere entertainment and indoctrination for the masses is the sophisticated theological thinking that animates many of the pageants. Such thinking further deepens the 'incarnational aesthetic', recognised by Gail McMurray Gibson as fundamental to fifteenth-century religious culture (*The Theater of Devotion* (University of Chicago Press, 1989), pp. 8–10).

For example, *York Plays Volume II* shows that the clerical author or authors of the Shearmen's pageant, *The Road to Calvary*, injected layers of patristic and Thomist meaning into Jesus's seamless coat as a stage object, but centrally emphasised a eucharistic significance appropriate to the production context of Corpus Christi (p. 310). At the opposite end of its spectrum of interest, *Volume II* traces the continuing financial interactions between Craft representatives and the York civic authorities. It further demonstrates the ingenious ways in which the pageants promoted the everyday achievements of their producing Crafts. Discussions of staging and costuming differentiate clearly between facts and speculation. In these ways and many others, such as its mapping of the pageants' performance stations around York, *Volume II*

grounds the Plays' intellectual and spiritual dimensions in the physical life of northern England.

The principles of 'pure' scholarship that govern this book seem to be less highly valued in Australian universities now than they were formerly. It is therefore a relief to see that these same principles are continuing to produce impressive results in England. The now completed series of EETS cycle play critical editions testifies to this unequivocally.

CHERYL TAYLOR, *Griffith University*

**Benson**, Robert L., *Law, Rulership, and Rhetoric: Selected Essays*, ed. Loren J. Weber with Giles Constable and Richard H. Rouse, Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2014; paperback; pp. 408; R.R.P. US\$68.00; ISBN 9780268022341.

*Law, Rulership, and Rhetoric* is a collection of unpublished writings left upon the sudden death of Robert L. Benson (1925–1996). Benson was a renowned historian of medieval canon law and the Holy Roman Empire, particularly under the Hohenstaufen dynasty. This collection includes articles in various stages of revision, as well as lectures and conference papers, selected and edited by Loren J. Weber, one of Benson's last students, and collaborators Giles Constable and Richard H. Rouse. The editor and his collaborators are to be commended for the transparency with which they have addressed such issues as the uncertain dating and unfinished nature of some pieces and Benson's incomplete or obscure notes. The 'Editor's Preface' clearly explains why they have not reconstructed citations or updated the essays with newer scholarship to which Benson would not have had access.

Benson was a student of Ernst Kantorowicz, whose theorisation of the king's two bodies profoundly shaped current understandings of how medieval rulership was conceived of and performed. Kantorowicz's influence is clear in Benson's work, which centred on examining the 'elaborate network of concepts [used] to justify, express, and conceal the awful realities of power' and the 'ways in which medieval men conceived the highest governing officers: emperor, king, pope, archbishop, bishops' (p. 46). Benson had an enduring interest in the ways in which power was theorised and bestowed in acts of ecclesiastical and imperial election.

*Law, Rulership and Rhetoric* comprises five sections, reflecting the main themes of Benson's scholarship and his interdisciplinary approach to sources. These included decretals, capitularies, and chancery records as well as chronicles, religious texts, art, and poetry. Part I, 'Thought and Culture', considers the influence of classical Roman topoi in high medieval political and religious thought. Part II, 'Art and Rulership', explores images of imperial power in frescos, chalices, and manuscript illuminations. Part 3, 'Medieval Rulership', examines the rhetoric of kingship in early Germanic monarchies,

while Part 4 focuses specifically on Frederick Barbarossa and his relations with the papacy. Part 5, 'Medieval History in Modern Perspective', includes three historiographical pieces defending Kantorowicz against accusations of Nazism and a rumination on 'The Medievalist as Hero' in contemporary popular culture. The essays reflect Benson's characteristic wit and clarity of style, which rendered his dense and precise scholarship highly readable. To take one example: 'Urbs et orbis' (pp. 3–19) examines the significance of this classical Roman topos in twelfth- and thirteenth-century political thought. It begins with an anecdote about Benson's wife purchasing an upscale shopping bag, inside of which is inscribed the legend 'URBU ET ORBI'.

Scholars in Benson's speciality areas will find much of value here. Of note are several lectures and unrevised articles from the 1980s that were probably intended for inclusion in Benson's book on Frederick Barbarossa, left unfinished at his death. Complementing these is an important early piece, 'Imperator oconomus Ecclesiae: Notes on a Decretistic Theory of the Imperial Office'. This appeared in an unpublished 1955 *festschrift* but until now it was only accessible in typescript in the archives of the *Monumenta Germaniae Historica*.

More generally, the volume has plenty to offer political and legal historians and those interested in broader questions about medieval political culture and the semiotics of power. Finally, Benson's witty, erudite, and sometimes poignant reflections on being a medieval historian in the modern world make this book an engaging read for any medievalist.

E. AMANDA MCVITTY, *Massey University*

**Blanton**, Virginia, **O'Mara**, and **Patricia Stoop**, eds, *Nuns' Literacies in Medieval Europe: The Hull Dialogue* (Medieval Women: Texts and Contexts, 26), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xxxiii, 367; 19 b/w illustrations, 6 tables; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 978250353972.

This volume contains seventeen papers originally delivered at the 2011 Hull conference on Nun's Literacies in Medieval Europe. Most readers will find some of the material (and some of the contributors) unfamiliar, as this comparative volume ranges widely across northern Europe (especially Germany, the Netherlands, Sweden, and England) from the eighth to the early sixteenth centuries, so the editorial introduction is particularly welcome.

The first section, 'Literacy and Nuns: Finding and Interpreting the Evidence', opens with Helene Scheck's consideration of a Carolingian manuscript and the evidence for its study over several centuries by French and German women religious literate in Latin. Bruce L. Venarde discusses a different kind of literacy in Petronilla de Chemillé, first abbess of Fontevraud, who in the twelfth century used 'the written word as a strategic tool' (p. 20). Alison I. Beach writes on Mathilde von Neuffen, one of five twelfth-century

scribes at the double monastery of Zwiefalten whose names are known, arguing that she was one of many women involved in book production there. We then take a chronological and geographical leap into late medieval England, with Marilyn Oliva's analysis of nuns' French, English, and Latin household accounts, and Veronica O'Mara's discussion of the late medieval English nun, which gathers together the scattered evidence for a large number of female scribes.

The second section, 'Language and Literacy: Latin and the Vernacular', highlights the lack of Latin literacy among English nuns, with contributions devoted to Sweden, Austria, and the Netherlands, but nothing on England. Monica Hedlund writes on (Continental) nuns' Latinity, with particular reference to the Swedish Birgittines; Cynthia J. Cyrus studies literacy in several Viennese women's houses, and Thom Mertens writes on fifteenth-century Middle Dutch books of hours and other liturgical texts, and their use by a variety of women religious.

The third and longest section, 'Literate Nuns: Reading and Writing in the Convent', initiates more of a dialogue between England and the Continent, with three contributions on English and four on Continental nuns. Lisa M. C. Weston writes on the embodied 'habits of literacy' (p. 149) among seventh- and eighth-century Anglo-Saxon nuns, while Stephanie Hollis writes on Romsey Abbey and the legendary that it owned in the fifteenth century (now London, British Library, MS Lansdowne 346), as possible evidence of an 'early medieval tradition of literacy' (p. 171). Virginia Blanton writes on the six extant legendaries in Latin, Anglo-Norman, and English 'owned by or gifted to late medieval English nuns' (p. 188). Turning back to Europe, Alfred Thomas writes on the German, Czech, and Latin literacy of Bohemian noblewomen, and Regina Schiewer studies the *St Georgener Predigten*, an early thirteenth-century Cistercian sermon collection in German clearly aimed at literate and learned nuns. Jonas Carlquist addresses the extent of the Vadstena Birgittine nuns' learning, with particular reference to mealtime readings of devotional texts in Swedish translation, and Ingela Hedström pursues this subject more generally, showing that the Vadstena nuns' daily activities required not only reading, writing, and access to books, but also scribal activity, especially in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.

The final section, 'Authorship and Nuns: Writing by the Nun for the Nun', is significantly the shortest, with two contributions: Wybren Scheepsma on Griet Essinchghes, an early sixteenth-century Windesheim nun, and her work on the sister-book of Diepenveen, and Patricia Stoop on sixteenth-century sermons from a Cistercian abbey near Brussels.

This fascinating collection advances our knowledge of medieval nuns' literacy, but shows that it is still uneven.

ALEXANDRA BARRATT, *The University of Waikato*

**Bose**, Mishtooni and J. Patrick **Hornbeck II**, eds, *Wycliffite Controversies* (Medieval Church Studies, 23), Turnhout, Brepols, 2012; hardback; pp. xiv, 359; 1 b/w illustration, 2 b/w tables; R.R.P.€90.00; ISBN 9782503534572.

*Wycliffite Controversies*, arising from a conference on the subject of 'Lollard Affiliations', boasts an impressive list of contributors. Many of the luminaries of Wyclif, Lollard, and late medieval English religious studies are represented here, including Anne Hudson, Fiona Somerset, Peter Marshall, and the late Mary Dove. These and many other authorities bring their considerable expertise to this volume, and the result is a remarkable collection of essays.

While editors Mishtooni Bose and J. Patrick Hornbeck note that their goal with this collection is the 'breaking down [of the] traditional narrative of lollardy' (p. 11), the essays themselves spend little time directly addressing the received narratives. Nevertheless, even those readers with only a passing acquaintance with, or those who have not caught up with recent scholarship in, this area will find much that is fascinating, particularly in the way that the contributions manage to flesh out and reify the conventional, stereotypical, often one-dimensional figures of Wyclif and Lollardy. Many of the essays demonstrate, very clearly, that before Wyclif and the Lollards were condemned, they were legitimately immersed in the religious and cultural debates of the time and were not always simply 'heretical'.

Most of the contributions are worth noticing, but I can only offer a selection here. In his chapter, Kantik Ghosh provides a sophisticated consideration of what had traditionally been regarded as the appropriate style for theological debate, and how this came to be contested as laymen, untrained in formal theology, began to participate in formal religious discussion. Alastair Minnis examines Wyclif's *De statu innocencie* – in which he speculates on the nature of humankind's prelapsarian state – contextualising this work especially with the better-known discussions of this issue by Augustine and Aquinas. Rob Lutton's essay fruitfully uses psychological, intellectual, and sociological variables to develop a framework for studying the relationship between religious dissent and orthodoxy. Specifically, Lutton is concerned with 'the assessment of the cultural relevance of Wycliffite-inspired dissent in terms of religious experience as well as intellectual content' (p. 118). I also enjoyed Robyn Malo's deconstruction of the Wycliffite opinion of relics: despite their well-known condemnation of pilgrimages and images, Wycliffites did not object to relics *per se*, but rather it was the ostentatious decoration of them that was condemned.

Perhaps because of their origins as conference papers, many of the contributions – such as Maureen Jurkowski's consideration of 'the question whether the Lollards should be considered a religious sect' (p. 261) and Mary Raschko's comparison of three sermons on the parable of the vineyard

– seem to be either narrowly focused studies, fairly empirical recountings of factual detail, or offer conclusions that could be developed further. Still, all of contributions are well researched and the contributors are clearly knowledgeable. I found Anne Hudson's contribution to be rather vague on its overall point. But it is, likewise, a rewarding read, for Hudson displays, in her discussion of the seemingly ever-expanding grey area between orthodoxy and heresy, her deep and vast understanding of the topic with numerous fascinating vignettes about various Wycliffite books and their owners.

The inclusion of Peter Marshall's historiographical survey of Reformation historians' interest in Lollardy is somewhat curious. While his general assessment is that recent post-revisionist history has found little room for Lollardy, this collection shows that Wyclif and Lollard studies are quite vibrant all by themselves – and perhaps some new approach to examining the connections between Lollardy and the Reformation is yet to appear.

*Wycliffite Controversies* is a very welcome addition to Lollardy and Wyclif scholarship, demonstrating as it does the calibre of the scholars working in this area and the vibrancy of the research being produced. It will be of great interest to scholars of late medieval religious history in general.

LESLEY M. O'BRIEN, *The University of Western Australia*

**Bromilow**, Pollie, ed., *Authority in European Book Culture 1400–1600* (Material Readings in Early Modern Culture), Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. xi, 232; 6 illustrations; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9781472410108.

In this volume, Pollie Bromilow presents a cohesive and engaging series of chapters that makes a positive contribution to our appreciation of aspects of authority in early modern print culture. The ostensible objective of the volume is to question the notion of 'authority as an enduring value that has the same presumed sources, agency and effects in the pre-modern period as in the twenty-first century' (p. 2). Bromilow's careful selection of contributions ensures that the volume achieves its goal of effectively problematising this assumption, while individual chapters remain united in voice and relevant both to each other and current scholarship in the field more broadly.

A number of the chapters focus on the physical aspects of early modern print culture, exploring the ways in which choice of font, paper, printers' devices, and illustrations contributed to a book's perceived authority. Such physical aspects might also extend to the ways in which a book or manuscript was distributed to its audience, with consequential effects for its reception. Brian Richardson's chapter, for example, explores these physical means of authorisation through the themes of paratexts, revision, inscription, and transmission. These themes are themselves echoed in Adrian Armstrong's typologies of authority: viral, aesthetic, discursive, pragmatic, editorial,

and proprietorial. Richardson's and Armstrong's contributions serve well at the beginning of the volume, as they set up a framework within which to contextualise subsequent chapters.

Richardson notes, for example, that pragmatic authority – 'the guidance of readers' – 'tends to be exercised through metadiscourse, in particular through prefatory material' (p. 38), and this typology springs immediately to mind when one reads Helen Swift's discussion of Martin Le Franc's 'use of his prologue to set the ground-rules for reading' (p. 49). Other themes also find repeated expression throughout the volume, including the common use of humanist discursive and rhetorical strategies to establish a text's authority in the minds of readers (e.g., pp. 72–73, 75–76, 98–99) and the construction of an authorial persona (whether real or imagined) to add credence to a text (e.g., pp. 93, 138, 139–44, 191–94, 196–97).

While common themes are apparent throughout the volume, a number of chapters present particularly interesting engagements with their subject matter. In Chapter 3, for example, Swift presents an alternative reading of Martin Le Franc's *La Complainte du livre du 'Champion des dames' a maistre Martin Le Franc son acteur*. *La Complainte* presents a debate between Le Franc's earlier poem, *Le Champion des dames*, and Le Franc himself, with *Le Champion* complaining of its frosty reception at the court of Philip the Good in the mid-fifteenth century. Swift suggests that *La Complainte* was itself an authorising exercise, 'a strategy to boost interest in the original *Champion* manuscript' (p. 45), rather than a genuine lament of *Le Champion*'s rejection, as has been often accepted. In a similar vein, Massimo Rospocher presents alternative readings of the propaganda that was generated by Pope Julius II's publicity machine, illuminating the 'positive side' of the pope's image, 'which he himself took an active part in managing with his protean quality of generating a huge range of activities whose collective object was to exalt his figure and his role in contemporary affairs' (p. 97). What emerges is an unfamiliar image of the pope alternately as herald of a 'Golden Age', an early modern Julius Caesar, and peacekeeper.

Overall, this volume is a valuable contribution to the study of authority in the early modern period, and provides its reader with useful tools to consider the multiplicity of actors, social influences, and historical contingencies that also shapes the notion of authority in other contexts.

CHRISTIAN THORSTEN CALLISEN, *Brisbane, Queensland*

**Burt**, Richard and Julian **Yates**, *What's the Worst Thing You Can Do to Shakespeare?*, New York, Palgrave Macmillan, 2013; paperback; pp. ix, 166; 19 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$29.00, £17.50; ISBN 9781137270498.

John Heminge and Henry Condell, both instrumental in the preparation of William Shakespeare's *First Folio*, open the *Folio* with a plea that readers 'Reade [Shakespeare] againe, and againe' (p. 1). What's the worst thing you can do to Shakespeare? According to scholars Richard Burt and Julian Yates, through a conversation with Heminge and Condell's plea, the answer is, 'not read him' (p. 1). In their co-authored volume *What's the Worst Thing You Can Do to Shakespeare?*, Burt and Yates embark on a project of 'un/reading' (p. 14) Shakespeare through the analysis of rich and varied responses to his work in a variety of media forms, focusing in particular on the 'media specific interruptions of reading in print editions, film adaptations, and so on' (p. 14).

*What's the Worst Thing You Can Do to Shakespeare?* comprises an introductory chapter and four other chapters. In each chapter, Burt and Yates attempt to present a rethinking of previous understandings and assumptions about Shakespeare's work, through combining close textual and media analysis, and highlighting the complex interaction of the Bard's work with various commentaries, adaptations, and re-workings.

Chapter 1 begins with Burt and Yates defining readers as 'biocultural wetware' (p. 1), an organic system through which Shakespeare's work survives and lives on. Emphasising the links between text, media, and reader, Burt and Yates encourage readers to view Shakespeare's plays as a 'mobile, conflicting, conflicted, and partially time-bound set of practices' (p. 2). They then examine the 'rhetoric of unreadability' (p. 3) in notable critical debates in New Textualism and the history of the book.

Chapters 2, 3, and 4 are each devoted to a single play, *Hamlet*, *Romeo and Juliet*, and *The Tempest* respectively. Chapter 2 begins with a fascinating crosscut conversation between scholar John Dover Wilson's seminal work *What Happens in Hamlet* and philosopher Avital Ronnel's account of *Hamlet* in her work *The Telephone Book*. Through an examination of Hamlet's role as a dysfunctional relay system in the play, Burt and Yates tackle Barnardo's opening question in *Hamlet*, 'Who's there?' exploring the way in which voices in *Hamlet* go missing, are interrupted, recorded, and relayed (pp. 30–37). In Chapter 3, Burt and Yates offer a detailed analysis of what they term a 'spin off' (p. 63) of *Romeo and Juliet*, the short film *Where is My Romeo* by Iranian director Abbas Kiarostami. The film, which focuses on the reactions of a series of women watching Juliet's suicide at the end of Franco Zeffirelli's film adaptation of *Romeo and Juliet*, examines ideas of presence and absence and mourning. In Chapter 4, Burt and Yates explore the contrast between George Lamming's *The Pleasure of Exile* and Aimé Césaire's *The Tempest*, and the idea

of book drowning and its connection to the paratext of the closing credits in Peter Greenaway's *Prospero's Books* and Julie Taymor's *The Tempest*.

Chapter 5 tackles the film *Anonymous*, director Roland Emmerich's take on the contentious Shakespeare authorship debate. While the film brazenly posits that the Earl of Oxford is the true author of the Shakespeare's works, the film 'refuses to bear witness to the fact of that writing' (p. 114). Burt and Yates convincingly argue that *Anonymous* is part of the disaster film genre, concerned with the idea of the archive and its destruction, deconstructs 'assumptions ... about anonymous authorship', and is ultimately a 'catastrophic mess' (p. 116).

*What's the Worst Thing You Can Do to Shakespeare?* is written in a refreshing quick-fire style, at times informal and irreverent, but nevertheless engaging, entertaining, and scholarly. Detailed endnotes, including full references of all works cited, a cumulative index of references, and over a dozen well-chosen black-and-white illustrations (mostly screen captures from various media cited in the book) are included.

MARINA GERZIC, *The University of Western Australia*

**Cadden**, Joan, *Nothing Natural is Shameful: Sodomy and Science in Late Medieval Europe* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013; cloth; pp. 368; 8 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$85.00, £55.50; ISBN 9780812245370.

Joan Cadden's *Nothing Natural is Shameful* is a fascinating read. It is the product of close examination of over one hundred extant manuscripts of the *Problemata* – 'in deference to its medieval readers, its author will be called "Aristotle"' (p. 8) – a text which deals with over 800 questions surrounding mainly natural phenomena. Cadden focuses her study on Book IV, question 26, which deals with people who commit the *sodomiticum peccatum* ('sodomitical sin'). She explores how medieval scholars dealt with justifying the exploration of what was considered a very unpleasant subject: despite its link to the great Aristotle and its (possibly) falling into the category of 'natural phenomena', question 26 in the *Problemata* was typically either glossed superficially or left out entirely by redactors.

*Nothing Natural is Shameful* consists of an Introduction, five chapters, a short epilogue, an appendix, an extensive bibliography, and index. The layout of the first two chapters loosely follows the tradition of the *Problemata*, although focusing only on *problema* 26. Each segment, translated from Messina's translation of the Greek original, is followed by in-depth discussion. While Cadden has concentrated mainly on Pietro d'Abano's commentary, as his was the first Latin commentary on the *Problemata*, she takes other versions into account when they digress or have reader and/or scribal annotations that shed more light on the topic. She makes full use of these digressions

and annotations, not only to highlight consistent thought among scholars on the topic of sodomy, but also to show how opinions could diverge quite dramatically. Not everyone was convinced that the topic should be addressed at all: while Walter Burley claimed that ‘Nothing natural is shameful’ (p. 1), one copyist avoided transcribing not only *problema* 26, but the entirety of Book IV, consisting as it did of the troublesome questions about why sex was pleasurable.

Cadden’s analysis, with its attention to detail – both literal (the palaeographical evidence) and literary (the intellectual context) – is impressive. By paying such close attention to the ‘errors’ and changes in the various manuscripts, Cadden is able to bring to the fore social and cultural undertones that are so easily missed. In one instance, for example, she notes how one scribe changed the word *parvos* as *pravos*; she says that ‘in the conventions of Latin palaeography, the abbreviation for the two words are similar but distinguishable, so the copyist was presented with the opportunity but not the imperative to mix them up’ (p. 192). The first term, as in the original text, means ‘small ... testicles’, the latter term ‘bad ones’ (i.e., men), a not inconsequential difference. Although Cadden states that the term sodomy is ‘at once too narrow and too vague’ (p. 3), she says that a more definite concept of what the term meant to medieval scholars will develop out of a detailed analysis of the texts. What emerges is not a simple definition but a solid grounding in the complexities of thought that surrounded the topic.

The appendix is particularly noteworthy. While, as Cadden says, to ‘offer a fixed text of Pietro d’Abano’s *Problemata* commentary is to contravene the very premise’ of her book, she has included ‘a transcription of BNF lat. 6540’, as it would be ‘churlish’ not to do so. The reader is provided with a very interesting text in the original medieval Latin, an important starting point for anyone interested in pursuing the topic of medieval thought on sodomy further.

While fascinating, this is a challenging read of complex discussions and numerous long sentences, and a more liberal deployment of commas would have made for easier reading. The use of endnotes instead of footnotes is perhaps sensible: given the extensive and complex nature of many of the notes, footnotes would have been unwieldy. The well-populated primary and secondary bibliographies will be of use to modern scholars of gender, sexuality, intellectual, cultural, philosophical, and medical history, and will hopefully inspire further engagement with the fascinating text that is the *Problemata*.

DEBORAH SEILER, *The University of Western Australia*

**Calin**, William, *The Lily and the Thistle: The French Tradition and the Older Literature of Scotland*, Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2013; cloth; pp. 432; R.R.P. CA\$70.00; ISBN 9781442646650.

William Calin is the doyen of studies of medieval French literature and poetry, Breton, Scots, and Occitan, an ‘internationally recognized Maker of the Middle Ages himself’ (Richard Utz and Elizabeth Emery in their preface to a recent *festschrift*). He encouraged and developed the research of most of the best-known scholars in the field, to whom he expresses his gratitude in the Introduction to this work. The footnotes alone serve as a guide to all the studies that have been made of the individual medieval and Renaissance Scottish poets considered. These are, with the exception of Mary Queen of Scots, people who wrote in Scots. Works in Gaelic are not considered although they might cast some interesting light on the sources. The problem of oral usage is only touched on. Because these poems are now accessible only when a written version survives, it is the literary texts that determine Calin’s understanding and interpretation.

Calin’s identification of French works that parallel or may have inspired the Scottish poets and his consideration of the traditions to which they belong casts light on the ways in which narratives were adapted, embellished, and extended to meet contemporary Scottish needs. He shows how the Scottish poets belonged to the whole European tradition in which embodied entities such as Philosophy, Nature, or Fortune played a critical role in poetic exploration of reality and reflections on subjectivity, morality, and time. The effect of translation and quotation on the ways in which ideas are transmitted filters through what are a series of snapshots of the works of poets who wrote in Scots from the time of *The Kynges Quair* to James VI. These are divided into four parts, distinguished by genre, each of which makes the case for the Scottish writer using that genre and being directly influenced by or borrowing themes from contemporary French poetry. The choice of genres results in some important writers like John Barbour being omitted.

Some of Calin’s analogies are more convincing than others. Considering that the constant symbolic use of the rose and lily goes as far back as Walafrid Strabo in Charlemagne’s time and was common everywhere, and taking into account the context in which it was written, surely William Dunbar’s Rose in *The Thrissel and the Rose* must be the Tudor Rose?

The tightly inward looking nature of this scholarship restricts explanations that look beyond the literary context. It is wholly focused on the texts. The historian looks in vain for the more general contextual explanations for French influence in Scotland. Where is the Auld Alliance, the significant presence of French merchants in Scottish towns, the notice of students going to Paris for their university education, the structuring of the court and the patronage of monarch and noble?

This leads this reader to have reservations about his wisdom in including Mary Queen of Scots's writings in French that surely have a very different background from the rest. Treating the Casket sonnets as authentic opens a further can of worms that surely contributes little to an analysis of the role of the French tradition in Scotland. Relating them to the work of Louise l'Abbé can only create further doubt if recent French scholarship that seeks to demonstrate that l'Abbé's works are male creations is accepted.

Calin's whole underlying conviction, as is made clear in his conclusion, is that the French literary tradition was the most influential and pervasive in the period throughout Europe and very obviously in Scotland. Even the humanist turning back to classical texts that had been newly revised to eliminate error is given a French ambience. The implication is that ideas and forms must have a single point of generation and a clear path of transmission. As a result his amazing scholarship is unidirectional. But are the French *sui generis*?

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*

**Campbell**, Erin J., **Stephanie R. Miller**, and **Elizabeth Carroll Consavari**, eds, *The Early Modern Italian Domestic Interior, 1400–1700: Objects, Spaces, Domesticities* (Visual Culture in Early Modernity), Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. xiii, 267; 21 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €65.00; ISBN 978409468110.

Recent interest in the material culture of Renaissance and early modern Italy has greatly enriched our understanding of the everyday home lives of mainly elite Italians. This volume explores the notion that the Italian domestic interior was a space to be lived in, and the objects within it were not static or inanimate but had important social functions that reflected contemporary social processes and attitudes.

The chapters all emphasise that the domestic interior was a dynamic space with objects, space, and uses of various rooms changing according to season or as circumstances necessitated. This dynamism is reflected in the first chapter that opens Part I on domesticities. Catherine Fletcher's discussion of the Casali family's patrician's palace in Bologna and their villa in Monteverchio shows that rooms could have various uses, such as a ground floor study that also contained a bed. The family home in the city contained items for use in business, but the villa, which was a place of leisure, instead, included playing cards and musical instruments. Susan Naletzyty considers the mobility of domestic objects by discussing Pietro Bembo's display of personal objects from his home in Padua in a borrowed house in Rome, as well as the display of objects in his own home and garden that housed guests in his absence. In Adelina Modesti's contribution, the comings and goings (*via/vai*) of the house of renowned seventeenth-century Bolognese artist, Elisabetta Sirani, emphasise that household and workshop co-existed

as a space where, simultaneously, important patrons were entertained, young artists were trained, Elizabetha painted, and the domestic work of the house carried on.

Part II discusses ‘people, spaces and objects’, with examples from Florence, Venice, and Bologna. The bringing up of children in the Florentine palace is the subject of Stephanie R. Miller’s essay. An especial interest in children in fifteenth-century Florence – a consequence of their increasing survival in the decades after plague had decimated their numbers in the late fourteenth century – is illustrated in the number of sculptures of children, toys, and other objects that have been recorded in household inventories. A discussion by Margaret Morse of the Venetian *portego* (portico) and its uses follows. The *portego* was the place in the Venetian palazzo where guests were entertained, religious pictures displayed, and it was the area most open to the outside world. Erin J. Campbell’s study of the seventeenth-century Bolognese interior indicates that guests entertained in these houses could find themselves in rooms that were effectively art galleries for family portraits.

The spaces of sociability are the subject of Part III. Maria del Prano outlines how in Florence, the downstairs room near the vestibule was sparsely furnished but had multiple uses: as a bedroom for the household head in the summer, a room in which to entertain guests, a space to hang family portraits, and a space for recreation, games, music, and convivial conversation. The function of the Venetian *portego* as a household proto-art gallery and its social function both to display the public status of the family and as a stimulus to a topic of learned conversation is discussed next, in Elizabeth Carroll Consavari’s essay. Kate McIver’s very interesting article on the layout and social functions of kitchens provides a perspective on the domestic interior hitherto little studied.

The last two chapters in this section are the only ones dealing with courts. Allyson Burgess Williams provides a vivid account of the living quarters of Lucrezia Borgia who, unlike her more famous sister-in-law, Isabella d’Este, chose to decorate her quarters with gorgeous (and perishable) tapestries rather than paintings and sculptures. Diane Webb concludes this section by outlining the rituals and splendour of the Montefeltro Court in Urbino through the surviving book of court rituals, which reminds visitors about the importance of cleanliness and good manners when visiting the duke.

Part IV takes an historiographical turn, with Adriana Turpin reminding us that our modern view of what an Italian domestic interior may have looked like owes much to nineteenth-century collectors’ and historians’ often erroneous perceptions of what they must have looked like. Susan Wegner’s discussion of a curator’s attempt to create a more authentic view of a period room as part of an exhibition is a fitting end to this book.

A short review cannot do justice to the breadth and depth of quality research in this book. It provides an excellent account of the field and it deserves to be highly regarded.

NATALIE TOMAS, *Monash University*

**Chapman, Alice**, *Sacred Authority and Temporal Power in the Writings of Bernard of Clairvaux* (Medieval Church Studies, 25), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xii, 237; R.R.P. €70.00; ISBN 9782503541051.

A topic well known to Germanists, the Investiture Controversy of the eleventh and twelfth centuries has formed a framework for medievalists studying history, religion, and literature. In her book on Bernard of Clairvaux's writings on the relationship between the Church and state, Alice Chapman makes a detailed study available to the English-speaking world. In the years following the Concordat of Worms in 1122, debates and efforts ensued to effect a cooperation between ecclesiastical and temporal power and authority. Chapman explores the language employed by Bernard that delineated the spheres of influence and served to mediate ideologically and politically.

Chapman provides a comprehensive introduction outlining the content of the five chapters of the book. Her premise is the use by Bernard of the words *auctoritas* (authority) and *potestas* (power). She sees the use of these terms as having their beginnings in a distinction made by Gelasius I in a letter to Emperor Anastasius in 494, referred to as the 'two swords theory', of difference between ecclesiastical and imperial power. Though Bernard does not cite Gelasius anywhere, his use of these terms demonstrates his concept of a more complementary relationship between the powers.

Chapman proposes that a linguistic analysis of Bernard's works advances insights into Bernard's understanding of the relationship between royal power and ecclesiastical authority, and she has made good use of electronic media to search his works. The work of Mary Stoll is used to 'shed light on the political situation following the Investiture Controversy' (p. 6) and to give an assessment of pontiffs and emperors during this period. Chapman makes the point that she does not address in detail the concept of jurisdiction and other terms associated with power and authority, such as *vis* (force) and *licentia* (license).

The first chapter introduces the Gelasian thesis and its historical development, arguing that Gelasius's distinction between *auctoritas* and *potestas* was used to uphold and promote the position of the Church. Chapter 2 explores Bernard's use of these terms, noting that *potestas* had a broader application in Bernard's writings, and that it was not merely a counterpart to *auctoritas*. Chapman addresses Bernard's concept of the order of creation and ecclesiastical unity, as well as the issue of ambition and responsibility creating disorder in the Church.

In Chapter 4, the authority of the Roman See is further explored in terms of Bernard's *apostolica auctoritas*. Chapman examines Bernard's language in his *De consideratione* and his letters of advice to his former pupil Eugenius III. Here Chapman explores the influence of the language of the classical Roman senate and senatorial *auctoritas*, including a discussion on the difference between the use of *ministerium* and *dominium*. As an example, Chapman presents a letter from Bernard to Sancia, the niece of the Infanta Elvira of Spain, during a dispute between two Benedictine houses, in which Bernard attributes *auctoritas* to royal Sancia in negotiating a solution.

Chapter 5 serves as a consolidation of Bernard's understanding and concept of ecclesiastical and temporal realms, always making use of his language. There is a further assessment of the use of his terms historically, with reference to their use in the Vulgate, that influenced the Christian understanding and interpretation of these classical expressions, and where *potestas* occurs more frequently, *auctoritas* being used only once. Chapman's conclusion argues for Bernard's subtlety as opposed to Gelasius's distinction, and gives an overview of how ecclesiastical independence and the debate surrounding power progressed from Innocent III to Boniface VIII. Though meticulous, Chapman acknowledges the difficulty in deciphering Bernard's personal opinions in his works, alluding to suggestions for further study in this area.

The book has a comprehensive bibliography and the index is useful for tracing historical figures mentioned. The inclusion of political and ideological developments and historical figures make this primarily linguistic study enjoyable and informative, and a valuable addition to studies on Bernard of Clairvaux and the relationship of politics and language.

STEPHANIE L. HATHAWAY, *The University of Oxford*

**Coleman**, Joyce, Mark **Cruse**, and Kathryn A. **Smith**, eds, *The Social Life of Illumination: Manuscripts, Images, and Communities in the Late Middle Ages* (Medieval Texts and Cultures of Northern Europe, 21), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xxiv, 552; 9 colour, 135 b/w illustrations, 1 b/w line art; R.R.P. €130.00; ISBN 9782503532127.

This attractive and illustrated, edited volume of fifteen essays offers an interdisciplinary perspective on manuscript illumination, traversing English, French, literary studies, and art history. Divided into Part I, Spiritual Community, and Part II, Social and Political Community, the book spans a range of manuscripts and texts – secular and religious, French and English – that were patronised, owned, and read during the later Middle Ages, mostly by high-status individuals.

Part I opens with three essays that approach religious imagery in the context of a physical, spiritual, and intellectual connection between

manuscript contents and readers. In her consideration of Christ's blood as ink, Marlene Villalobos Hennessy suggests 'a relationship between the book and the body that is inherently social' (p. 18), while Alixe Bovey in her essay on the Smithfield Decretals argues that manuscript illustrations deepened lay readers' understanding of the Eucharist. Finally, Lucy Freeman Sandler builds upon work by Michael Camille to examine the imagery of two Old Testament cycles and their relationship with written text in the Psalters of Humphrey de Bohun.

Kathryn A. Smith and David Joseph Wrisley go on to investigate the communities and social contexts surrounding illustrations. Smith considers a book of hours and a group of English wall paintings in terms of their 'viewing communities' and the 'communication technologies' that help to forge and strengthen social bonds between individuals (p. 122), while Wrisley's study on Jean Germain's *Debat du Crestien et du Sarrasin* references the late medieval debate around papal authority.

Part I closes on two studies of richly illuminated playscripts. Robert L. A. Clark and Pamela Sheingorn point to the social function of the Arras *Passion* manuscript, despite the removal of this and other such luxury books from any theatrical staging, while Laura Weigert considers aspects of marketing and genre suggested by the images in Anthoine Vêrard's *La vengeance de nostre seigneur*.

Part II opens with two thoughtful analyses of the effects of image placement in the *mise en page*. Logan E. Whalen considers how page design might influence representation and reception of moral instruction in Marie de France's *Isopet*, and Nancy Freeman Regalado highlights an illustration in Bibliothèque nationale de France (BnF), MS fr. 146 that 'marks a crucial point of encounter' between text, music, image, and the social (p. 316).

Anne D. Hedeman and Mark Cruse both highlight the performativity of illustration, with Hedeman examining legal and historical documents in the *Procès de Robert d'Artois* (BnF, MS fr. 18437) and Charles V's *Grandes chroniques de France* (BnF, MS fr. 2813), whereas Cruse assesses the function of image in romance in the *Roman d'Alexandre* of Oxford, MS Bodleian 264.

The collection's next two articles explore the relationships between genre, content, and image. Joyce Coleman postulates that presentation miniatures were restricted to didactic texts, and Dhira B. Mahoney cites the power of illustration to 'make the book, fluid in itself, a constantly changing literary artefact' in three versions of Anthony Woodville's *Dictes and Sayings of the Philosophers* (p. 465).

The collection closes on two studies of books owned by high-status women. An opulent prayer book from James IV to his new bride Margaret Tudor provides the subject of Elizabeth Morrison's study of marriage, politics, and iconography, and Mary Erler argues that inscriptions in books are 'carriers of social meaning', citing a book of hours owned by Jane Guildford (p. 529).

In their Introduction, the volume's editors describe illustrated manuscripts as 'associative objects', creating and shaping social bonds (p. 2). This agency has certainly forged illuminating links between manuscripts, themes, and issues in this wide-ranging collection. The volume presents an alternative approach to word and image, and will provide a useful point of reference for scholars interested in manuscript contents beyond text.

REBECCA LYONS, *The University of York*

**Corbellini**, Sabrina, ed., *Cultures of Religious Reading in the Late Middle Ages: Instructing the Soul, Feeding the Spirit, and Awakening the Passion* (Utrecht Studies in Medieval Literacy, 25), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; cloth; pp. vi, 307; 12 b/w illustrations, 15 colour plates; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503545691.

This collection comes out of a 2010 conference, itself of a European Research Council-funded project studying social and cultural changes in lay access to religious and textual knowledge in pre-Reformation Europe through the production, distribution, and use of vernacular Bible translations. In spite of the umbrella project's focus on the Bible, there are studies here of a variety of instructional and devotional texts, including meditations on the Passion and saints' lives. The volume spans a wide set of geographic and linguistic contexts, reaching from England across the Low Countries, France, Germany, and Italy, to Poland.

The twelve essays are divided into four thematic groups, exploring the intersections between Latin and vernacular, orthodoxy, and heterodoxy, the impact of printing on the dissemination of orthodoxy, the interplay between lay readership and the socio-cultural contexts of production, diffusion, and acquisition, and methodological aspects of the study of reading. The groupings are reasonably coherent, although readers will find other commonalities that cut across these divisions. The fourth grouping perhaps makes least sense, since many of the other articles also explicitly discuss methodological issues and make important contributions (in particular, those of John Thompson and Mart van Duijn).

The articles of the first group all consider the intersections of Latinity and use of vernacular with questions of orthodoxy. Else Marie Wiberg Pedersen makes a strong case for distrust of the vernacular among the guardians of orthodoxy, especially when it is used by women. The other three contributions show that in different times and places, the picture was more nuanced. Sabrina Corbellini, examining evidence from fourteenth- and fifteenth-century Florentine private libraries, manuscript colophons, interpolations in personal copies of texts, and cases of lay (male) authorship of religious texts, uncovers networks of lay readers and writers with a high degree of religious literacy, participating in a culture of exchange with religious communities in

which there was room for debate and negotiation. Thompson's investigation of reading networks in England through manuscripts of Nicholas Love's *Mirror of the Blessed Life of Jesus* finds among them a diversity of ideological perspectives and practices. Eyol Poleg likewise challenges the simple equation of vernacularity with dissent: he uses evidence from the layout, composition, and annotation of Wycliffite Bibles to argue that many of their owners were using them as aids to engage with the orthodox Latin liturgy.

The articles in the second section all deal with the relation between printers and public in the formation and dissemination of early printed books. Koen Goudriaan takes on the argument that the Church actively used the printing press as a missionary tool. He challenges the theory that the *Devotio Moderna* stimulated the production of printed books, and concludes that the printing of religious material in the Netherlands remained a purely commercial affair, ruled by perceptions of demand, until 1520. Van Duijn also takes up the theme of supply and demand in his examination of the interplay between printers' strategies and public appropriation in the production and dissemination of the Delft Bible. Kristian Jensen's study of the reading of Augustine in the fifteenth century, like Goudriaan's contribution, tests some commonly received ideas against evidence of form, content, and readership. He shows that, at the time the Augustinian canon was still being determined, there were different textual communities formed around different groupings of texts.

The third theme encompasses a wide field, and the three contributions illustrate its diversity. Suzan Folkerts's contribution studies the circulation of manuscripts of the *Devotio Moderna* and translations of the New Testament in urban settings in the Low Countries. Her study shows that the text was reproduced in a variety of forms which are associated with different users. Werner Williams-Krapp's study of the medieval German Lives and Miracles of St James provides some interesting insights into the influence of debate among the laity (for instance, over the veracity of miracle stories), and cult practices such as pilgrimage, on the content of reading material. Anna Adamska's contribution, while dealing with a well-studied subject in other geographic contexts – the ownership and commissioning of books by royal women – throws light on the fascinating multi-lingual context of the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth.

In the final group, Margriet Hoogvliet gives a useful overview of approaches to the social history of reading, including work in media studies, illustrated by material from France in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, and Andrew Taylor raises the question of how far we can recover the private religious motivation of a public figure in his study of representations of Margaret of York in devotional books produced under her patronage.

This is a valuable collection of essays that successfully demonstrates the importance of reading as a cultural practice within Christianity.

JANICE PINDER, *Monash University*

**Cummings**, Brian and Freya **Sierhuis**, eds, *Passions and Subjectivity in Early Modern Culture*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. 328; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781472413642.

This collection brings together essays on the study of the history of the passions in early modern culture (especially England). In doing so, it intervenes in a well-established field that is attracting increased attention from literary scholars, historians, and philosophers alike. As the editors, Brian Cummings and Freya Sierhuis, observe, 'In the last two decades, intellectual history has worked voraciously to end the neglect of the passions in the understanding of early modern thought and assumptions' (p. 3). Indeed, it now seems odd even to refer to any such 'neglect', so thoroughly have scholars scoured the period for attitudes and concerns about the passions.

The avowed aim for this volume is, as the editors put it, to 'make new connections between embodiment, selfhood and the passions in order to suggest both new models of the self and new models for interactive and interdisciplinary history' (p. 6). These new models are positioned against the more body-focused approaches of two major figures in the study of the passions, Gail Kern Paster and Michael Schoenfeldt. Cummings and Sierhuis argue that this 'turn to the body' has resulted in work that assumes an early modern body almost entirely in thrall to its passions. As they observe, 'Within this picture, human agency has almost been removed in the search for a pathologized self' (p. 5). The essays in this collection, they state, are more interested in finding connections between 'the abstract subject of political thought and the inward selves of literary history' (p. 9), and thus are less focused on Galenic physiology or faculty psychology than many previous studies.

Many of the essays included here are excellent. Space constraints preclude me from discussing all the essays in detail, but those that stood out to me included Christopher Tilmouth's essay, which takes up recent work on inter-subjectivity to show how this understanding of early modern selfhood helps us read accounts of the passions more accurately; Russ Leo's, on Spinoza; Cummings's 'Donne's Passions: Emotion, Agency and Language'; Felicity Green's essay on Montaigne and emotion; Katherine Fletcher on how Milton's monism pushes him to counter Cartesian dualism in his writing; and Katrin Ettenhuber's essay on Augustine, Donne, and grief. These clearly argued essays share a clear focus on the passions and what their study can bring to our understanding of the passions in early modern literature and philosophy.

Although the collection is well conceptualised and, in general, well focused, one or two of the essays here seem less relevant to the overall topic than most. Here I think of Joe Moshenska's essay on metaphor and touching, which is interesting and well written, but not clearly related to the study of the passions.

Unfortunately, the quality of the essays subsides towards the end of the collection. Some of the final essays were not very clearly argued, or else rest on rather dubious assumptions of influence or causality. Stephan Laqué's essay, for example, is plagued by the desire to read Shakespeare as ahead of his time – in this case, as an influence on Descartes's theories of the passions. Laqué asserts that 'in Descartes there is an unacknowledged debt to the Danish prince' (p. 268) – a claim of which I am unconvinced despite a very interesting discussion of what he terms the 'theatre of the passions' as played out in *Hamlet*.

However, overall this collection is well worth consulting for anyone interested in the passions in early modern thought, literature, and history.

JENNIFER CLEMENT, *The University of Queensland*

**Dane**, Joseph A., *Blind Impressions: Methods and Mythologies in Book History* (Material Texts), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013; cloth; pp. 232; 9 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £42.50; ISBN 9780812245493.

Joseph Dane's new book on (mostly English) book history and bibliography makes seemingly simple questions complex, challenging, and often interesting. What is a 'book'? What is an 'edition'? What counts as bibliographic or textual evidence? Dane is known for his witty, inventive, sometimes acerbic style of critical scholarship, and that is not a bad thing.

Well travelled in the Huntington Library's (California) collection of early printed books, Dane challenges a number of myths and assumptions about how early book history is to be reconstructed. In one of his key chapters, 'Bibliographers of the Mind', Dane takes on Donald McKenzie's influential essay, 'Printers of the Mind' (1969) and the insistence on 'facts' among 'Old' and 'New' Bibliographers. For Dane, McKenzie's essay, using printer's records, focuses more on purpose than method: What do we think we are doing when we try to reconstruct the printing history of a seventeenth-century book? What do we think we know when we have such a reconstruction? Dane uses the occasion to reflect on the purposes of the three types of bibliography – analytical, enumerative, descriptive – in relation to the distinction between 'books', idealised objects of bibliographic analysis, and 'book copies', physical, individual objects. Dane concludes that evidence from the printers' records (idealised books) is not compatible with evidence from the books themselves (book copies). Physical books, book copies, as material objects disrupt and

escape printers' records, bibliographers' methodological theorising, and library cataloguers' descriptions.

Dane reads bibliographers' statements of purpose, method, and scope sceptically, with an eye for the impossible claim. When an editor declares an edition is 'invaluable', Dane asks, For whom? When an editor claims to have collated five copies of the many printed copies of the play, Dane asks, Which copies? copies of the same edition? different editions? collated against what? Dane challenges the discourse of bibliography – his own scholarly discourse – to account for its references, assumptions, and implications. Dane is a practising bibliographer who is also a myth buster.

Dane's book is made up of methodological, topical, and case study chapters. Chapters 1–3 take up the kinds of questions raised by McKenzie's 'Printers of the Mind' and by problems of periodising early printed books as sometime between manuscript culture and a magical 'Ca.1800' as the beginning of modern printing. He presents a marvellous critique of the uses of type fonts as primary evidence for reconstructing printing history. Chapters 4–6 are devoted to the intricacies and contradictions of cataloguing, especially in light of the Huntington Library's collection of early printed books. The third section, almost one half of the book, is devoted to individual case studies of bibliographic problems: two-colour printing, compositor analysis, book illustrations, the status of the 'fragment' in bibliography and cataloguing, and the significance of digital archives. Dane writes a meta-book on bibliographic discourse.

Dane is a contrarian, as anyone who has read his earlier works knows. His meticulous close readings of bibliographic method and analysis often turn up contradictions, paradoxes, and (unwitting) sleights of hand in scholars' claims about books as objects and their printing histories. But Dane is not interested in *gotcha* scholarship. Rather, he unpacks in quirky prose the unexamined assumptions that undergird received narratives of early print culture, especially the grand narratives of early printing proposed by Elizabeth Eisenstein, Mark Bland, Lucien Febvre, and Henri-Jean Martin.

Dane narrativises his experiences in early printed book collections in ways that supplement his textual analyses. For instance, his narrative of his project to test accounts, including his own, of early two-colour printing, using the Huntington's extensive collection, is exemplary for its candour and for its representation of the failure which is knowledge. What Dane narrates is a tale of inferential inevitability: 'Yet once I began to see the pattern of history in these books, I found nothing but confirmation.' Later, at the Museum of Fine Arts (Boston), when Dane looks at the famous 'Mansion Boccaccio' (*De casibus virorum illustrium*), printed in Bruges, he realises he's been wrong all along. The banality of the Boccaccio book's printing 'destroyed all the elegant theorizing' he had done about two-colour printing (p. 155).

Dane's reflexive, hard-edged critiques of myths and assumptions of bibliography and printing practices foreground how book histories (plural) do offer us something important. First, whereas grand narratives of the early history of printing often smooth over the messy starts and stops, trials and errors, the disorder of production histories, when we look at book copies as distinct objects, not just as types, we come to terms with material history. Second, while cataloguers, librarians, and bibliographers make early books (and manuscripts) accessible to us in particular collections organised in particular ways, book users and readers need always to be aware of the extent to which any catalogue system predetermines what is 'important' for us to look at, what is significant 'evidence', what is 'worth examining'. So, Dane argues, a more grounded historical knowledge about books and their transmissions requires that readers and bibliographers step outside the catalogue system and the narratives it predetermines and look carefully at the objects themselves. Dane understands the importance of the anomaly, the wrinkle, the unexpected detail that loops us back to re-view the object we have been bypassing all along.

MARK AMSLER, *The University of Auckland*

**D'Arcens**, Louise, *Old Songs in the Timeless Land: Medievalism in Australian Literature 1840–1910*, Crawley, UWA Publishing, 2012; paperback; pp. 220; 15 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. AU\$34.95; ISBN 9781742582542.

In the British press, Australian colonial identity was one of family likeness, a position perpetuated throughout the Victorian age. In the Australian press, the burgeoning local literature began to shift away from this sense of the familial to develop a new kind of relationship and a new identity altogether. By 1910, Australia had progressed from its colonial beginnings as a far-flung penal colony of the British Empire to a newly found federated autonomous state. Although Australian publications in this period reveal a consciousness of the various literary genres and practices in British publishing, these were often altered and forged into a different, and therefore independent, shape. In so doing, Australian literature revealed a renegotiation of style and concept and ideology.

As a part of this renegotiation, Louise D'Arcens's book takes just one major literary genre, Victorian medievalism, and explores 'how Australian writers developed a body of medievalist literature that was responsive to, and formative of, the cultural landscape of colonial and early Federal Australia' (p. 15). The result is an engaging and wide-ranging study of what might seem, at first glance, to be an unlikely topic. Under the rubric 'Medievalism', D'Arcens includes the Gothic, Historical Romance (Walter Scott's novels in particular), the poetry of Tennyson, the Oxford Movement (Newman, Pugin), Pre-Raphaelitism, Orientalism, Aestheticism, Decadence,

and a 'contemporary material medievalism' (p. 66) as represented by William Morris and Company, and the arts and crafts movement. Victorian medievalism has been the basis of any number of in-depth studies, so that at one level its presence in a nascent Australian literature is not surprising and it is indeed, as she rightly points out, a 'legacy of British colonialism' (p. 3). Her work, however, reveals another level altogether, an argument, broadly speaking, in which medievalism becomes the vehicle with which to express the development of autonomous nationhood and which anticipates the separation of the colony from the mother country.

Each chapter is discrete in itself and for this reason the study does not offer a fully developed, over-arching, and particularised argument. Rather, D'Arcens takes very differing bodies of work and as case studies explores the ramifications of that broad argument noted above within very specific genres. Almost all of the material explored engages at varying depths with visions of, or meditations on, Australia's future, in particular how that future will play out politically. Close readings of novelists Rolf Boldrewood and Joseph Furphy reveal a Walter-Scott-inherited Anglo-Saxonism, exploring how Australian medievalism focuses the gaze on race and class politics by adding an antipodean dimension. If Boldrewood 'develops a vision of Australia's future' (p. 41), Furphy, more complexly, formulates 'his views on the ideal form of social and political organisation for Australia' (p. 45).

The second chapter addresses women novelists Rosa Praed, 'Tasma', Ada Cambridge, and Catherine Martin, engaging with the intersection of gender and culture, with their focus on the 'Australian Girl', a vigorous and outgoing young woman in telling contrast to middleclass British concepts of refined and constrained femininity. D'Arcens shows these novelists characterising a new and fit generation who will prove indispensable for the coming nation. As D'Arcens points out, their work 'demonstrates medievalism's capacity to function ... as both common imperial currency and a reflection of the minutiae of antipodean colonial environments' (p. 57).

At the centre of D'Arcens's study, the third chapter offers a fascinating reappraisal of the poetry of Adam Lindsay Gordon to reveal what D'Arcens argues is Gordon's 'literary engagement with the Middle Ages' adding that the medieval is 'central to his sense of its unique, if unexpected, correspondence with modern Australia' (p. 95). It is further claimed that Gordon's medievalism 'is central to his reputation' (p. 101), but the ensuing discussion, while proving of real interest, is not entirely convincing. The final two chapters, on poetry in the periodical press and Australian theatre, because dealing with a considerable range of virtually unknown material, become unavoidably descriptive. Nevertheless both chapters validate the argument that Australian medievalism was of 'everyday consumption', comfortably familiar to a broad readership, and that medievalist theatre in particular 'placed before colonial Australian audiences ... scenes of nation formation' (p. 170).

This is a study I have long anticipated which offers the reader a significant reappraisal of early Australian literature. For instance, in reading the landscape poetry of Christopher Brennan, I was excited to discover what I thought were clear resonances with the Middle English poem *Gawain and the Green Knight*. D'Arcens's work supplies a meticulously researched study that justifies my own long-held belief in the medievalist strands woven into the literature of the Australian nation and provides future researchers with an invaluable tool to further their own studies into this fascinating topic.

JUDITH JOHNSTON, *The University of Sydney*

**Findlay**, Alison and Liz **Oakley-Brown**, eds, *'Twelfth Night': A Critical Reader* (Arden Early Modern Drama Guides), London, Bloomsbury, 2013; paperback; pp. 285; R.R.P. £17.99, AU\$36.99; ISBN 9781472503299.

Whatever a teacher's enthusiasm for sharing with students the multi-faceted appeal of *Twelfth Night*, he or she may well hesitate over points of entry into the ever-growing mass of performances, contextual studies, and criticism. Such a teacher will find this little book, which brings together old and new thinking about Shakespeare's 'most perfect comedy' (p. 52), a godsend.

Enticements to deeper investigation in the Introduction and four of the contributed essays mean that the collection fulfils some of the functions of an annotated bibliography, but with the added inducement of sequential intellectual themes. For example, Peter Kirwan's chapter is a diligent, wide-ranging, yet tightly-written evaluation of recent pedagogical approaches to *Twelfth Night* that deals with linked Shakespearean plays, characterisation, genre, carnival, gender, text, language, and visual resources. Kirwan's interleaved insights into related internal issues such as Sebastian's and Viola's teachability sustain the reader's engagement. R. S. White's chapter, 'The Critical Backstory', and William C. Carroll's discussion of Keir Elam's 2008 edition and post-2000 commentaries are reliable and readable accounts of a rich tradition.

*A Critical Reader* also offers succinct guidance on the performance history and recent productions of *Twelfth Night*. In summarising a wide selection of stage and film versions, Linda Anderson objects, rightly in my view, to the anachronistic nineteenth- and twentieth-century 'trend toward tragic Malvolios' (p. 67), but astutely analyses the dilemma of directors staging the comedy for modern audiences, to whom Malvolio's treatment 'can only appear as cruelty and his adversaries as sadists' (p. 68). Disagreements between Kirwan and Anderson, for example with reference to the 2006 Hollywood film, *She's the Man* (pp. 59, 207–08), leave space for teachers and students to make up their own minds.

Four further essays in *A Critical Reader* are aptly titled 'New Directions'. Elam argues that an emphasis on optics in the Viola plot and on graphics in the Malvolio plot 'is central to the comedy's dramatic economy' (p. 109). Randall Martin applies stimulating social and psychological insights about shipwreck to Viola's, Sebastian's, and Feste's progress through the play, while also making connections with Pauline eschatological teachings. Tiffany Stern's essay demands reading as an essential preliminary to debating *Twelfth Night*'s festive and/or melancholic moods. Stern detects in the Folio text traces of 'an earlier version ... perhaps closer to the play's probable *Twelfth Night* performance' (p. 168), and warns that the relevance of Feste's songs to Shakespeare's work 'may arise simply from the fact that they are (now) there' (p. 171).

Andrew Stott bases his interpretation of Feste as a professional comedian on an analysis of Robert Armin's literary promotion of clowning as expert paid work. In seeking to undo C. L. Barber's 'gassily optimistic assessment' of *Twelfth Night* (p. 144), Stott finds in Illyria's 'cut-throat world' 'a dark core that is never far from tipping into cruelty and violence' (p. 159). He posits convincingly, on the basis of their interchanges (iv. 2. 31–60), that Feste's verbal tormenting brings the imprisoned Malvolio to a 'space of dissociative disembodiment' (p. 165) that threatens a loss of identity. The further claim, however, that *Twelfth Night* ends 'in summary imprisonment, promises of revenge and a song that takes as its subject the world's stubborn refusal to improve' (p. 145), is surely overstated, given the centrality to the last scene (v. 1) of clarifications, resurrections, and release. Malvolio, Viola's sea captain, and presumably Antonio as Sebastian's restored friend are freed; Malvolio's is the only promise of revenge; and 'When that I was a little tiny boy' encourages a freeing of the audience too, both from life's inherent sadness, and from engagement with Feste's and the other characters' troubles – 'But that's all one, our play is done' (v. 1. 404). Furthermore, we have seen that Stern problematises the textual authenticity of Feste's songs.

The simultaneous publication of *Twelfth Night: A Critical Reader* as a paperback, hardback, eBook, and PDF is a welcome sign of the respected Arden series' adaptation to the instantaneous computing age. However, speed of production may also be responsible for a flow of small grammatical and printing errors, and at one point a transposition of Sebastian's and Antonio's roles (p. 159). Despite these minor shortcomings, the multifarious productions and the disagreements among experts so eloquently canvassed in this collection testify to *Twelfth Night*'s continuing inspirational vitality into the twenty-first century.

CHERYL TAYLOR, *Griffith University*

**Fisher**, Matthew, *Scribal Authorship and the Writing of History in Medieval England* (Interventions: New Studies in Medieval Culture), Columbus, Ohio State University Press, 2012; cloth; pp. 221; R.R.P. US\$54.95; ISBN 9780814211984.

*Scribal Authorship* is one of those rare and delightful books that is as enjoyable to read as it is insightful and scholarly. Matthew Fisher's book challenges some of the core assumptions of manuscript studies and suggests a more intensely communal and constructive textual tradition for the Middle Ages in which scribes are critically engaged readers and writers, not just the means for the mechanical production of texts. Fisher's argument centres on scribes as a significant (but often overlooked) part of the audience of medieval texts, who had direct access to the texts and the ability to alter texts, intellectually and mechanically, as they saw fit. The Introduction cites MS Arundel 74, fol. 2<sup>v</sup> in which scribal error has been extensively corrected by another scribe. Moreover, the corrupted text seems to have caused an illuminated letter author portrait to be abandoned (presumably so as not to authorise the incoherent text) – a tangible sign of scribes intellectually invested in their work.

Chapter 1 lays the groundwork, with a brief lesson in palaeography followed by a discussion of medieval evidence of scribal practices and the assumptions made by modern editing. Scribal corruption and the danger of the incompetent scribe (a popular topic of complaint for medieval authors) is a familiar issue for manuscript scholars. However, Fisher instead posits that 'the true threat of scribes was their competence' (p. 58), suggesting that it was more often aesthetic concerns or the desire to correct mistakes that resulted in textual variation. For the medieval scribe, copying was not always separate from composition and often there was little to distinguish scribe from author.

Chapter 2 parallels the work of scribes in copying and composing to the work of authors of medieval historiography, a genre that derives its authority from citing (or at least appropriating) other texts. This chapter follows the evolution of rhetorical strategies used to construct authority in histories, in particular the developments from Bede, to Henry of Huntingdon, to Geoffrey of Monmouth. Just as authors of history bring together sources to create a text that is shaped by the present, so scribes bring together exemplars and their knowledge of medieval literature to correct and improve on the texts they copy. Although this chapter at first seems divergent from the book's main focus, by comparing the work of scribes with the work of authors, Fisher effectively explores the implications of his redefined scope of scribal activities.

Chapters 3 and 4 analyse versions of the *Short Chronicle* copied and altered by the Harley Scribe and Auchinleck Scribe 1. Both the Harley lyrics and the

Auchinleck manuscript show evidence of careful planning and ordering by parties with knowledge of the texts. Rather than constructing a textual *stemma*, the analysis views each manuscript version of the *Short Chronicle* as a distinct entity that has been customised and amended. The Harley Scribe rectifies historical details in his version of the chronicle, making use of unrelated textual exemplars to inform his corrections and additional compositions. Additionally, the latter section also features a fascinating digression about the materiality of composition, charting the discernable progression from wax tablets, to the use of parchment scraps, to composition directly onto the page.

*Scribal Authorship* is clear, precise, and engaging, and as the argument develops, Fisher is careful to address its consequences logically and sensitively. The resulting model replaces assumptions about exemplars, copying practices, and scribal authority with a broader scope of scribal agency, supported by evidence from medieval texts and manuscripts.

ALANA BENNETT, *The University of York*

**Flood**, John, James R. **Ginther**, and Joseph W. **Goering**, eds, *Robert Grosseteste and His Intellectual Milieu: New Editions and Studies* (Papers in Mediaeval Studies, 24), Toronto, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2013; cloth; pp. xiv, 430; R.R.P. US\$90.00; ISBN 9780888448248.

Robert Grosseteste (c. 1170–1253) was by any standard a remarkable figure among the great thinkers of the thirteenth century, not least because he was never part of the circle of masters associated with the University of Paris. This volume marks an important complement to existing scholarship on Grosseteste. Not the least significant contributions to this volume are three studies by the late James McEvoy, one co-authored with Mette Lebeck on Grosseteste's understanding of human dignity, another co-authored with John Flood on the way Grosseteste was used in the early modern period, and a third, an eloquent essay on Grosseteste as Spiritual Guide. This volume provides not only a range of essays on Grosseteste's writings and intellectual context, but also critical editions and translations of some little known texts, notably his *De Luce* (edited by Cecilia Panti and translated by Neil Lewis), his rendering of *The Dialogue of the Christian and the Saracen* by John of Damascus (by Meridel Holland), and his Sermon 86 on The Ten Commandments (by Michael W. Dunne).

In many ways, Grosseteste stands apart from his Parisian contemporaries by not being affected by the dominant directions of their thought. Thus Neil Lewis opens the volume with an essay on his philosophical understanding of free will as 'flexibility towards opposites'. This approach differs significantly from the views of his peers that it was freedom from compulsion (William of Auxerre), the ability to do what one wills (Alexander of Hales), or a capacity

to retain rectitude of the will (Philip the Chancellor). Grosseteste shares with them a common debt to Bernard of Clairvaux in their being a hierarchy of freedoms, with, at its base, freedom from necessity, then freedom of grace, and finally freedom of glory or pleasure, but emphasises that it must involve genuine choice between any opposites (not simply between good and evil). A similar emphasis on the dignity of human capacity comes out in the paper by Lebech and McEvoy on his thinking on human dignity, theorised in terms of the human person as made in the image of God, with a capacity for reciprocity and communication modelled on that of the Trinity. Next is Joe Goergin's study of Grosseteste's *Dicta*, a text that has only recently come to scholarly attention. These derive from 147 oral presentations given in the 1230s on a wide range of topics, moral, exegetical, and homiletic (usefully listed in an appendix). McEvoy's essay on Grosseteste as a spiritual guide draws out how he was able to build on the monastic spirituality of St Bernard with its emphasis on experience, but to extend this to a non-monastic milieu. His spirituality was thus rooted in a Scriptural emphasis on the priority of love, without relying as much on the rhetoric of the cloister. The sermons that he preaches on evangelical poverty, studied by Michael Robson, illustrated how the Franciscan ethos enabled him to transform monastic values within a larger, uncloistered world.

A second section of the volume is devoted to Grosseteste's intellectual context. He was fascinated by the flowering of new astronomical learning, particularly rich within England. Edgar Laird points out that this new learning was based not just on the writings of Aristotle, but on the *Almagest* of Ptolemy. A core element of Grosseteste's understanding of the universe was its mathematic structure, a theme that Ptolemy developed much more than Aristotle, drawing on a Pythagorean perspective, but supplemented by observation of the heavens. This conviction in the mathematical basis of physical reality was a theme that Grosseteste made his own. More from a philosophical angle, James Long considers how Grosseteste's conviction that a theologian had first to absorb natural sciences shaped the responses of Fishacre, Rufus, and Kilwardby to the account in Genesis of how woman could be made from Adam's rib. Cecilia Panti's comparison of Grosseteste and Adam of Exeter on the physics of light rounds out this group of papers on his context, while also serving as an introduction to the text and translation of the *De Luce* presented in the volume's third section. In a useful table, Panti offers her own perspective on the chronology of his scientific writings, which she dates to between 1200 and 1230, when he starts to focus more on exegetical and homiletic issues.

Grosseteste's decision not just to learn Greek, but to translate many significant Greek scientific and theological texts, gave him direct access to a vast pool of learning known only second hand to most of his contemporaries

on the continent. This volume presents with satisfying elegance the freshness of his approach to both the natural world and to Scripture.

CONSTANT J. MEWS, *Monash University*

**Gordon**, Andrew and Thomas **Rist**, eds, *The Arts of Remembrance in Early Modern England: Memorial Cultures of the Post Reformation*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. xi, 259; 23 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781409446576.

Each of the ten essays in this volume contends that the ‘arts of remembrance were omnipresent in early modern culture’ (p. 1). Remembrance in this volume takes three forms, which make up the sections of this book: ‘Material Remembrance’ – consisting of material culture created for commemoration, such as statues, tombs, portraiture, and furniture – ‘Textual Rites’, and ‘Theatres of Remembrance’. This volume also has a special focus on the impact of the post-Reformation period on contemporary forms of commemoration.

Lucy Wooding’s essay on remembrance and the Eucharist serves as a fine opening to the strongest section of this book. Wooding’s essay explores how contemporaries coped with their desire to remember and respect the dead after the post-Reformation Protestant church eschewed Purgatory and prayers for the dead. Wooding does an excellent job of delineating the various ways that people remembered the dead through prayer, not only to ensure early release from Purgatory, but also to express love.

Robert Tittler’s essay on portraiture also examines the ways in which the Reformation affected memorial practices, this time for Catholic recusant families. As portraits were often displayed in family homes in prominent areas, they served as propaganda intended to affirm the social status of the family, provide visual legitimation and differentiation of status, and for Catholics, reify the family history of loyalty and sacrifice to their faith. Like Wooding, Tittler also asserts that the abandonment of Purgatory and ‘associated forms of prayer and remembrance’ (p. 40) caused contemporaries to look for other ways to ensure remembrance.

Furniture and household fixtures work in much the same way as portraiture in Tara Hamling’s essay, which introduces the unexamined domestic interior as a space of remembrance. Hamling argues that furniture and fixtures in homes functioned like monuments, to establish and prove status, to commemorate rites of passage, such as marriage and death, and to serve as a ‘permanent record and reminder of ancestral and familial heritage’ (p. 61). In the following essay, Oliver D. Harris charts the ‘genealogical obsessions’ of three gentlemen (p. 13). The attempts of these men to establish an exhaustive genealogy led to the establishment of elaborate family vaults, mausoleums, and even a forged pedigree.

The essays that make up the second section of this volume, 'Textual Rites', focus on remembrance via texts, in the form of poetry, religious history, political accounts, and posthumous memorialisation through the literary. Thomas Rist examines George Herbert's 'poetic materials', specifically the materials used in churches as objects of remembrance. Rist argues that Herbert's fixation on these materials was a response to conflicting notions of religious objects in the post-Reformation period. Tom Healy's study of *Actes and Monuments*, the ecclesiastical history penned by John Foxe, focuses on how this text enacts remembrance among believers. Marie-Louise Coolahan illustrates how widowers chose to arrange posthumous manuscripts of their wives' work in order to represent them as 'the reformed ideal of womanhood: religious devotion enacted in writerly activities' (p. 163).

The essays of 'Theatres of Remembrance' concern remembrance in the theatre. Janette Dillon examines representations of conflict over religious iconography as expressed through staged images, and answers larger questions about iconography and collective memory. Philip Schwyzer illustrates the commemoration of historical events through re-enactments in Shakespeare's plays, specifically Henry at Blackfriars and Richard at Rougemont. Andrew Gordon's essay on the afterlife of comedy focuses primarily on the clown Richard Tarlton, and how the comic remembrance of the dead is tied to ideas about Purgatory and ghosts.

The subjects of these essays are diverse and will be of use to historians and scholars of literature and theatre. Coupled with their focus on changing post-Reformation culture, they make for fascinating reading, and an invaluable resource for scholars of memory and post-Reformation religious culture.

JENNIFER JORM, *The University of Queensland*

**Hicks**, Leonie V. and Elma **Brenner**, eds, *Society and Culture in Medieval Rouen, 911–1300* (Studies in the Early Middle Ages, 39), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xiv, 400; 35 b/w illustrations, 25 b/w line art; R.R.P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503536651.

Rouen enjoyed an extended era of influence from the tenth to the early thirteenth centuries as the chief city of Normandy during its time as a rising duchy and, after 1066, its union with the English crown. After the conquest of Normandy by the French king Philip Augustus in 1204 the city continued to grow, but its central role in the political and economic life of the Anglo-Norman and Angevin realms was lost. Considering its importance throughout the period, it is somewhat surprising that more attention has not been paid to the city in recent historiography, at least among English-speaking scholars. This volume seeks to repair that oversight by presenting a series of articles on Rouen during and just after its time of prominence, building on developments in urban history and the methodologies of the 'spatial turn'.

The collection opens with Bernard Gauthiez's detailed study of the topography of the city and the changes it witnessed from the eleventh to the thirteenth centuries. In the twelfth century Rouen was 'notably larger than Paris' (p. 28), with perhaps 25,000 inhabitants. Detailed charts of the shifting layout of the city, based on the author's own intense study of the subject over many years, provide an excellent basis on which to appreciate the subsequent discussions of related aspects of Rouen's history. For example, Leonie Hicks considers movement through the city streets in episodes such as processions and riots. Hicks assesses chronicle descriptions of these events which, she argues, can illuminate social conditions and urban culture. This focus on urban space and its changing uses over time allows a number of the volume's essays to speak to one another in enlightening ways. While disagreements are not absent (over issues such as the concept of a 'capital city' and whether Rouen can be described in this way) the overriding sense is of unity in diversity. A result such as this is not always the case in collected editions of essays, but here the contributions tend to complement one another even while approaching Rouen's medieval past from a variety of perspectives.

Another of the volume's key themes is the examination of social networks. Fanny Madeline and Paul Webster both assess Rouen's importance to the Angevin monarchs, especially by studying royal itineraries and patronage. Similarly, Daniel Power argues for a strong relationship between the Anglo-Norman aristocracy and Rouen's mercantile elite despite a rhetoric of disdain towards the latter by the former in contemporary texts. At the other end of the social spectrum, Elma Bremner and Leonie Hicks focus on Rouen's outsiders: not only the poor and the sick, but also Rouen's significant Jewish community which suffered notable violence in 1096 during the moment of religious fervour associated with the calling of the First Crusade. Essays by Richard Allen and Grégory Combalbert consider Rouen's role as an archiepiscopal seat and the secular as well as spiritual networks that emerged as a result of its important ecclesiastical function.

The volume could usefully be consulted in conjunction with another recent Brepols collection, *Normandy and its Neighbours 900–1250* (see my review in *Parergon*, 29.2). That edition covered a very similar time period but tended to look outwards, as its title suggests. Here the focus is inwards but together the two collections represent a significant advance in scholarship on Normandy during its medieval heyday. The metropolis at its political, social, and economic centre is only just beginning to reveal its secrets. Medieval Rouen was, as the volume's editors conclude, 'an important city, about which much still remains to be discovered' (p. 10).

LINDSAY DIGGELMANN, *The University of Auckland*

**Higham**, Nicholas J. and **Martin J. Ryan**, *The Anglo-Saxon World*, New Haven, Yale University Press, 2013; cloth; pp. xv, 477; 100 colour illustrations, 40 line drawings, 60 maps; R.R.P. US\$45.00; ISBN 9780300125344.

Chronologically, the scope of this book is even broader than its title implies: Chapter 1, 'Britain in and out of the Roman Empire' treats the entire period of Roman rule in Britain, not just its final decades; while the final chapter, number 8, 'The Transformation of Anglo-Saxon England', is largely devoted to developments after the Norman Conquest. Both of these chapters are the work of Nicholas Higham, who is also responsible for Chapters 2 and 3, 'The Origins of England' and 'From Tribal Chieftains to Christian Kings'. Chapters 4 to 7, in a book with a broadly chronological arrangement, are the work of Martin Ryan – 'The Mercian Supremacies', 'The Anglo-Saxons and the Vikings, c. 825–900', 'Conquest, Reform and the Making of England' (dealing with the first three quarters of the tenth century), and 'The Age of Æthelred'.

Each chapter is followed by two essays, each normally six or seven pages long, with a general heading 'Sources and Issues'. These deal with diverse topics – 'Gildas' and 'King Arthur' (here identified as probably originating in folklore) in the case of Chapter 1, for example, and 'The Bayeux Tapestry' and 'Domesday Book' at the end of the final chapter. Regrettably, these are not listed in the table of contents. Eleven of the essays are by Higham, the remaining five by Ryan. The only jointly authored section is an excellent and very readable 'Introduction' discussing the relevance of the Anglo-Saxons today and outlining developments in the study of the Anglo-Saxon period since 1066.

As befits a one-volume survey, the work tends to steer a middle path when discussing the many obscure and contentious issues that arise, making clear when matters are in dispute. Regarding the 'Adventus Saxonum', for example, Higham concludes that 'Overall ... the evidence favours large-scale population continuity alongside significant migration' (p. 104). His later observation that 'Behind the rhetoric, the Normans had imposed an alien regime on an unwilling people by force ... constructing a racially segregated state in which the minority treated the majority with contempt' (p. 412) is a rare deviation from a measured tone.

In a 'blurb' on the book's back cover Michael Wood states that it 'will be of value to specialists but accessible to the much wider range of readers who are fascinated by this formative period in British history'. However, some members of both groups will experience a little disappointment. Serious students will regret the absence of any footnotes in a work very frequently asserting that more recent scholarship has overturned or seriously challenged longstanding interpretations. (The detailed chapter bibliographies are a

valuable but not entirely satisfactory substitute.) The ‘general reader’ with a layman’s interest in the period may find the detailed discussion, particularly in the earlier chapters largely based on archaeology, somewhat arid in places. Though beautifully produced and richly illustrated with many impressive colour photographs this is no coffee table book. It requires careful reading of a text that occasionally makes demands on the reader.

Its claim to cover the ‘world’ of the Anglo-Saxons is largely justified. Old English poetry and Anglo-Saxon visual arts receive little attention, but diverse disciplines, including history, archaeology, numismatics, environmental science, and genealogy, are brought to bear on illuminating many aspects of religious and secular life during the long period covered. Recent developments, such as the discovery of the Prittlewell Chambered Grave and the Staffordshire Hoard (both the subject of essays) are considered. This study is likely to replace the highly regarded *The Anglo-Saxons* (Penguin, 1982), edited by James Campbell, a work it resembles in scope and physical appearance, and may well establish itself as the standard one-volume study of Anglo-Saxon England for several years to come.

JOHN KENNEDY, *Charles Sturt University*

**Hornback**, Robert, *The English Clown Tradition: From the Middle Ages to Shakespeare* (Studies in Renaissance Literature, 26), Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2013; paperback; pp. xiii, 240; 6 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £50.00; ISBN 9781843843566.

Robert Hornback takes as his task here the ‘unearthing’ of ‘Yoricks’, by which he means the attempt to excavate the specific ways in which four particular clowning/fooling contexts in Renaissance English writing had actual ideological import. The book is therefore an admirable attempt to address the comic afresh as a rhetorically powerful force. In this respect, Hornback’s work sits alongside recent sociological studies that have tried to take the comic seriously, such as Jerry Palmer’s *Taking Humour Seriously* (Routledge, 1994) and Michael Billig’s *Laughter and Ridicule* (Sage, 2005).

Hornback’s study is explicitly distanced from new historicism, specifically from its ‘sweepingly dismissive “subversion-containment” dynamic’ (p. 6). Hornback treats ideology, refreshingly, as a moving rather than as a static structure that is simply reinforced within contexts of comic clowning.

The first neglected clowning context (Yorick) to be unearthed is the tradition of black-faced natural fools. Here Hornback reminds us of the long association in Augustinian theology between blackness and foolery (*stultitia*). Black was not merely symbolic of abstract ‘evil’ but also of the mental and moral degradation suffered by humanity after the fall. Hornback discusses evidence from the Mystery play cycles, the iconography of the black-masked fool (*insipiens*) in the historiated ‘D’ of the *Dixit* beginning Psalm 52 (The fool

says in his heart, 'There is no God') in manuscripts of the psalter, and from the sixteenth-century 'Wit plays'. All tend to triangulate blackness, the Devil, and stupidity or moral insanity, a triangulation that, Hornback claims, will come to underpin ideological constructions of Africans as incorrigible natural fools all too easily. *Othello* is not much mentioned here, perhaps because it does not fit the focus on clowning. However, Hornback's observations here surely enrich our sense of the ideological weight underlying accusations of 'devilry' both by Othello (iv. 2. 240) and by Emilia (v. 2. 142).

The book also engages with Robert Weimann and Douglas Bruster's work on the malleable Vice figure in *Shakespeare and the Power of Performance* (Cambridge University Press, 2008). Hornback provides a convincing challenge, across Chapters 2 and 3, to the critical notion 'that Renaissance drama flourished because it left behind a presumably confining religious mode of "medieval" drama' (p. 19).

Chapter 2 excavates the tradition of 'Protestant misrule' appropriated from the medieval religious inversion rituals that once worked to reinforce Catholic norms and was now used, instead, in the service of Henrician and Edwardian state propaganda, to make Catholicism itself look ridiculous. However, subtle – and not so subtle – redeployments of the Lord of Misrule figure did not belong only to the iconoclastic early reformers who opposed Catholicism. As the investigation in Chapter 3 of the Puritan and anti-Puritan writing shows, the Marprelate tracts appropriate the clowning misrule figure to construct their own carnivalesque satiric vision of the ecclesiastical status quo. Moreover, the topos was invoked within the anti-Puritan backlash against the Puritan Martinists in order to construct their pretensions to wisdom as inveterate folly and a terrifying threat to the social order. The figure of the stage-Puritan, the 'very devout ass' – such as Shakespeare's Dogberry – is central here. Hornback concludes that religious ideology is actually a persistent feature of stage clownage at least until well beyond the end of Shakespeare's career despite the turn in taste to neoclassical decorum.

In keeping with the focus on identifying humorous clowning contexts as rationally (if ideologically) self-conscious critique, Chapter 4 pursues a discussion of the differences between the fools of the Quarto and Folio versions of *King Lear*. Hornback maps the Q- and F-fools onto the distinction between the artificial and natural fool respectively, identifying the specifics of the Q-fool's bitter and comic rationality in contrast to F's less amusing but pathos-infused character.

In these ways, *The English Clown Tradition* is a compelling move in the important direction of breaking down the serious/non-serious dichotomy that has so far dogged critical accounts of humour's politics, prompting a great many fresh directions and questions for research on the ideological and rhetorical power of the early modern comic in the process.

DANIEL DERRIN, *Macquarie University*

**Houllemare**, Marie, *Politiques de la parole, le parlement de Paris au XVI<sup>e</sup> siècle* (Travaux d'Humanisme et Renaissance, 479), Geneva, Droz, 2011; paperback; pp. 672; 15 b/w illustrations, 26 tables; R.R.P. US\$146.00; ISBN 9782600114370.

This almost 700-page monograph based on Marie Houllemare's doctoral thesis analyses speech as an active component of law making in the Parlement of Paris in the sixteenth century. Through the speeches, texts, rituals, and ceremonies of men of justice, Houllemare skilfully examines the linguistic, gestural, and performative rhetoric by which they established authority within the hierarchy of the institution as well as before the wider public, and negotiated with monarchs who held varied political and judicial ambitions for the institution.

The initial section analyses *parlement* as a space of socio-political regulation and dialogue whose legitimacy derived both from the manner in which it was used and a language of signs that was theatrical and procedural. Houllemare first explores how *parlement* established power and authority as a venue for the resolution of personal conflicts of *justiciables* able to manipulate the institutions' complexities and the law's conflicting civil jurisdictions. In Chapter 2, Houllemare examines the balance of authority between king and *parlement*, negotiated in discourse, gesture, and personal relationships. From tense relations with François I who used the *parlement* in largely symbolic ways to assert the supremacy of the monarchy, Houllemare reveals the efforts at reconciliation and partnership under Henri II for whom *parlement* played a crucial role in both judicial and religious reformations. Chapter 3 examines *parlement's* creation of its own authority. Its lavish furnishings and location may have heightened its royal and religious connections but Houllemare also explores the significance of rituals of time, space, order, and ceremony that demarcated secret from more visible aspects of its work for a far wider public. The construction of institutional memory that reflected and shaped a shared mentality is the focus of Chapter 4. Houllemare highlights the key role of personnel, such as the *greffier*, as agents in a process of assimilation of oral texts to a unified written record which would become a powerful tool in building the *parlement's* own narrative of its identity and purpose.

Section II turns towards the oratory arts and the men who were its leading practitioners, and through it we encounter the lives and works of individuals such as Anne Robert, Simon Marion, Etienne Pasquier, Christophe de Thou, and the Segulier dynasty. Houllemare begins by exploring the rhetorical skills developed in shared training, familial heritage, and close-knit patterns of *parlementaires'* domestic life. Chapters 6 and 7 chart the shift from a technical, legal language to an oratory art that was wielded by a developing professional group who increasingly saw themselves as mediators between the people and the law. If the ideal that dominated the first half of the century was a rhetoric

of simplicity, sobriety, and a claimed neutrality reflecting an objective truth, through close examination of the archival and printed pleas of around twenty leading lawyers, Houlemare demonstrates a much more human reality of emotive persuasion, verbosity, and appeals to the vanity (and authority) of both judges and the institution. In the second half of the century, she detects a discernible humanist influence, tracing the presence of non-legal texts in *parlementaires'* libraries, their reading and notation practices, and their sources of reference. Houlemare finally explores how *parlement's* leading men seized new opportunities for expression within the institution as their speech left its confines and entered new domains in print, fashioning new identities for themselves and their colleagues as they did so.

In the final section, Houlemare analyses the potency of different models for the *parlement* conceptualised by its members. As a senate, *parlement's* magistrates could position themselves as a recognised political force, guardians of the kingdom's fundamental laws and interlocutors with the monarch. The model of the theatre instead emphasised oratory skills and the institution's opportunities for gesture and ceremonies through which it interacted with a wider public and become a place for healing and exploration of contemporary feelings. The conceptualisation of *parlement* as a sacred temple by contrast drew from humanist and biblical ideas, and emerged with Henri II's employment of the institution as an instrument of religious reform, creating in 1547 the *Chambre ardente* to pursue heresy trials. However, those disenfranchised by the vision of a purified, sacred, moral body found the vision of a forum more inclusive to their voices, which could function as a more politically open space to explore current affairs through cases that impacted wider national interests.

Ultimately, Houlemare argues how uneven and uncertain the rise of the monarchy over *parlement* appears when studied at such close quarters. This is an insightful cultural history of a key French institution of the period that has much to recommend it. Although it engages closely with a considerable volume of original archival and printed sources and primarily a secondary scholarship focused directly on *parlement*, particularly that created by a handful of key French scholars, readers will find that it offers rich pickings for more than political and legal historians alone.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

**James**, Carolyn and Antonio **Pagliari**, trans., *Letters to Francesco Datini by Margherita Datini* (The Other Voice in Early Modern Europe, 16), Toronto, Iter/Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2012; paperback; pp. 431; 1 colour illustration; R.R.P. US\$37.00; ISBN 9780772721167.

Carolyn James and Antonio Pagliaro have brought to life the first English translation of the 251 letters Margherita Datini (1360–1423) wrote to her husband – the merchant of Prato, whose life was famously described by Iris Origo – between January 1384 and January 1410. It is a fascinating corpus of letters, made even more special by the fact that it is by far the largest collection of letters by a single premodern, western laywoman.

In the enlightening Preface to the edition, James explains why this collection has remained largely ignored: it belongs to a large mercantile archive frequented solely by economic historians looking for Francesco Datini's business records, not the epistolary voice of a woman. But perhaps two further reasons account for this neglect. Prato is no Florence or Venice, and its State Archive has only recently attracted sustained attention from Renaissance scholars. This is a familiar story for Italian Renaissance scholars working outside Florence, Venice, and Rome. Another reason is language. Margherita and Francesco Datini's letters have been available through modern Italian editions for some time now – Margherita's since 1977 and Francesco's since 1990. These editions were printed by Prato-based publishers and in relatively small print runs. The accessibility has been further limited by the fact that the original documents are in a polymorphic Tuscan vernacular, and contain cryptic and at times confusing domestic and private information that only the Datini and their entourage could have understood. An example is a postscript at the end of letter 13 in which Margherita asks her husband to relate to a 'Benvenuto the bread man' that 'not everyone who managed to make you laugh should be a jester'.

This English edition is a remarkable contribution to the study of women's writing. Not only does it make this unique corpus of letters accessible to general and academic readerships, the translation is carefully produced to account for the complex swings of registers, styles, and content. I have crosschecked the 1977 Italian edition of these letters against this English version, and found the latter flawless, inspired, and utterly convincing.

Margherita was no ordinary woman: from a disgraced knightly Florentine family, she emerges from her letters as a spouse required by her irascible and workaholic husband both to conform to and stray from the conventional obedience expected of wives as described by the prescriptive texts of the period. In her letters, Margherita communicates unrelenting love, fractious complaints, stern reproaches, and intelligent observations on everyday life. She embraced the domestic and mercantile business in a dignified and canny

manner, fending off her husband's demands, suspicions, and inattentiveness. Such endurance of Francesco's often inconsistent, tactless, and demanding behaviour towards her was somewhat rewarded towards the end of her husband's life: in January 1410, Margherita produced a flurry of letters showing utmost confidence, authority, and empowerment. On 4 January of the same year she was occupied with preparations for Cardinal du Puy's visit, while at the same time she was busy attending to signing documents and keeping debtors at bay until the cardinals departed Prato.

Margherita's strong-willed and wise views extend over domestic turmoil, her husband's business, and the complex social fabric of employees, friends, and family in Florence and Prato are couched within an impressively complex syncretism of epistolary conventions, improvisation, self-representation, and pragmatic communication. Margherita asserts her voice by engaging in various levels of mediation: the expectations of her husband and the Florentine and Prato mercantile neighbourhoods, and the complex and gendered relationship with her scribes. The latter is particularly interesting, for in her letters Margherita constantly redefines the boundaries between semi-private and semi-public communication and her dependence on and independence from the male scribe and Lapo Mazzei, her informal and involuntary teacher of calligraphy.

The letters are accompanied by highly informative footnotes that provide essential contextual details on the familial members, the community at large, and material culture of fourteenth-century Italy. This is a rich and enthralling contribution to our understanding of the role of early modern women to written culture and to their social worlds, and the importance of the epistolary forms in the expression of the 'other voice'. I look forward to reading Pagliaro's translation of Francesco Datini's letters to Margherita.

ANDREA RIZZI, *The University of Melbourne*

**Jamroziak**, Emilia and Karen **Stöber**, eds, *Monasteries on the Borders of Medieval Europe: Conflict and Cultural Interaction* (Medieval Church Studies, 28), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. x, 274; 9 b/w illustrations, 8 b/w line art; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503545356.

Chapters in this carefully edited volume derive from a conference under the same title, which was held at the University of Leeds in 2008. They are here organised around the twin themes of 'Conflict and its Resolution' and 'Acculturation and Cultural Interactions on the Frontiers'. Studies with a focus on the interconnected notions of borders-boundaries-frontiers – a stronghold of German-language historiography for much of the twentieth century – have been undergoing a resurgence over the past several decades and, as this volume attests, are attracting a new generation of scholars from different linguistic backgrounds and specialisations. With this renewed

interest comes a waning of nationalistic biases and a search for ‘more consensual ways to engage with the world’, as the editors put it. They see the ten chapters as contributing to the development of an explanatory model, a historiographical approach more concerned with abbeys and friaries as ‘intercessory and commemorative’ communities than as ‘tools of territorial and political control’.

Perhaps not surprisingly, definitional issues remain somewhat slippery. By narrowing the focus onto monasteries they hope to shed light on a hitherto neglected area, namely, how border conditions, broadly understood, shaped the nature of monastic and mendicant communities, with a view to explaining their function and the success or failure of monastic institutions in these regions.

This conceptual breadth is as much reflected in the topics covered as in the geographical sweep of the papers. There are papers relating to Scandinavia: Iceland’s Skiduklaustur Augustinian monastery and the Cistercian complex of Alvastra in Östergötland, Sweden. The Germanic/Slavic regions are represented by articles on the Cistercian abbey in Toplica, Croatia, the Teutonic Knights–Polish tensions of c. 1339, and mendicant provincial boundaries in Silesia, Lusatia, and Pomerania. Aspects of patronage relating to Angevin France and Frankish Greece are also explored. There are studies of the Canons Regular of medieval Catalonia and the quest for relics on the Anglo-Welsh frontier in Wales. The volume concludes with an insightful study of the depiction of Jews in the *Ordo prophetarum*, the liturgical drama found in the Laon troper (F-LA263). The chapters are furnished with substantial individual bibliographies and listings of primary sources and the volume as a whole is well served by a general index.

It is in the nature of such collections that concerns and themes touched on in many of the chapters and hinted at in the Introduction are left to coalesce in the reader’s mind. The lot of the Cistercians is one such topic. This Order whose ethos drew it to far-flung reaches, to borderland areas, was not necessarily the order that, always and everywhere, proved to be best equipped to meet the challenges of those regions. Relations with local communities, the laity, were decisive and therein lay the seeds of success of the mendicant orders. The ‘abject failure’ of Greek Cistercian houses explored in Nicky Tsougarakis’s chapter is a case in point. Their general demise stands in contrast not only with the more politically savvy mendicants but also with the more resilient Cistercian women, buoyed as they were by strong familial ties to Frankish aristocracy and associated land endowments.

For reasons made clear in the editors’ Introduction, the volume restricts itself to male houses only. One cannot but wonder whether the Greek experience noted above might not have had parallels in other borderland locations. It is to be hoped that the many strengths of this fine collection of

papers will open ears to the editors' plea: 'Nuns of the frontiers merit their own dedicated study'.

ROBERT CURRY, *The University of Sydney*

**Jarrett**, Jonathan and Allan Scott **McKinley**, eds, *Problems and Possibilities of Early Medieval Charters* (International Medieval Research, 19), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. x, 301; 5 b/w illustrations, 4 b/w tables, 7 b/w line art; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503548302.

Charters (or the collections of them called cartularies) are a major source of documentary evidence for early medieval history. But their use and interpretation, and indeed the trajectories they have taken in terms of preservation and transmission, are not straightforward. At least so suggest the editors of this collection. The chapters present evidentiary analysis of charters from a range of early medieval European areas including Anglo-Saxon England, Catalonia during the period of Carolingian rule, and monastic centres in Sweden and Carolingian Burgundy. Each in turn considers particular charters, the evidence they yield, and the problems they present to historians. The geographic centres under discussion comprise the so-called *Urkundenlandschaft* ('charter landscape'), where historians can trace norms in the way charters were used and created across different geographical regions.

Several chapters point out that charters were often composed according to stock formularies; nonetheless there is significant variety in the content and scribal traditions across the charter landscape. The opening chapter lays out the problems and the potentials of using charters. Many of the chapters though have more to say about the problems of using charter evidence than their potential, but do make important points about working within evidentiary limits. The chapter by Martin Ryan on charters composed in England before the Viking invasions points out that the confusions that can arise from charters are in part a consequence of confusion in the minds of people from the period, and the fact that charters were often a formulaic record of more complex legal and familial situations that were both oral and written. Allan McKinley's chapter charts a complex series of relationships in one family line in Alsace, again offering the caution that the formulaic language and structure of a charter may not reflect any historical uniformity in practice.

Subsequent chapters urge the consideration of charter evidence as 'narrative' evidence, narratives, or as evidence of a kind of representation of social relations, including charters from Swedish Cistercians and Burgundian scribes. Chapters on charters from Carolingian Burgundy (by Charles West) and Carolingian Catalonia (by Jonathan Jarrett) both suggest the charters are evidence of the extent (or otherwise) of Carolingian cultural influence in these areas and in some instances the retention of local usages. Further

investigation of Carolingian royal charters (in the chapter by Shigeto Kikuchi) yields evidence on the use of honorifics.

Many of the chapters suggest what cannot be done with charters while also working with and through the often-extensive archival silences to draw out points of significance. One such is Morn Capper's chapter on charters relating to the Mercian kingdom. She is dealing with a rare instance where the victors have not written the history – in this case expansionist Mercian kings such as Offa – but instead the history of the Mercians derives from the charter evidence of areas they conquered. Further strong use of charter evidence comes in Alaric Trousdale's chapter on charters from the reign of Anglo-Saxon monarch Edmund, where the author notes that the systematic study of witness lists provides important means of untangling evidence of active factions. Many of the chapters are tentative analyses, pointing out for instance that many surviving charters have not yet been edited into modern editions, nor are the circumstances of their creation always clear (were there chanceries, for instance, or other arrangements? Is there such a thing as a 'typical' archive?). But the collection overall is a useful demonstration of diverse areas of the charter landscape and the different uses for the evidence charters provide.

MARCUS K. HARMES, *The University of Southern Queensland*

**Kane**, Bronach and Fiona **Williamson**, eds, *Women, Agency and the Law, 1300–1700* (The Body, Gender and Culture, 15), London, Pickering & Chatto, 2013; hardback; pp. 240; R.R.P. £60.00, US\$99.00; ISBN 9781848933842.

The editors acknowledge a 2009 conference entitled 'Women's Voices: The Power of Words in Medieval and Early Modern Europe' for stimulating the dialogue which has resulted in this exciting collection of ten essays. The desire to recover the female voice is a thread that runs throughout the volume. The preface and introduction combine to set the scene for what is a very rewarding reading experience.

In Part I, 'Shaping Women's Testimony', Cordelia Beattie draws on theories of subject positions to analyse the structure and language of late medieval chancery bills and the petitioning subject, demonstrating that both writers and petitioners shaped women's testimonies. Jeremy Goldberg's reading of late medieval York church court records reveals female agency as he explores the idea of 'ventriloquized' voices, while also identifying a change in the crafting of witness statements across this period. Goldberg also discusses memory and remembrance, themes crucial to Bronach Kane's essay, which widens the focus from York to include examples from Canterbury. Analysing women's depositions, Kane explores the role of collective memory in representing personal memory, opening up another category of

remembrance through which women could exercise authority and agency as they testified.

Part II, 'Encountering the Law', begins with Rosemary Horrox's reading of a late medieval gentry widow's will as an 'informal', and ultimately unsuccessful, encounter with the law. Horrox recognises a larger story of shifting allegiances and changing political fortunes within such encounters, an aspect also acknowledged in the following essay by Deborah Youngs. With an evocative title quote ('She hym fresshely folowed and pursued'), Youngs captures both the movement across space and the agency of women who travelled from Wales to London to seek justice in Star Chamber in the early Tudor period. Young's two case studies demonstrate how women overcame the restrictions that could prevent their pursuit of justice through the legal system. Next, Janka Rodziewicz considers women and the hue and cry in late fourteenth-century Yarmouth, arguing that it provided positive involvement in community regulation, legal systems, and a means of protection for women and their families.

Part III, 'Women's Voices and Women's Spaces' opens with Amanda Flather's careful reading of examples of iconoclastic violence by women in early modern England, through the categories of gender and sacred space. Flather highlights how women asserted agency through speech and the treatment of material religious objects, actions that also demonstrate an active involvement in religious change. Also writing on seventeenth-century England, Bernard Capp focuses on a narrative published nearly a century after the events that it describes. Religious conviction in the face of dissent and a young woman's desire to achieve autonomy are found in this powerful narrative that lends itself well to a reading of women's voices and spaces. Fiona Williamson's analysis of parish politics, the streets and thresholds of a community, and women's voices in seventeenth-century Norwich focuses on a defamation suit between two Norwich families to read how insult was used to damage social status and sexual reputation in community disputes. To conclude, Nicole Whyte analyses how identity and agency were expressed in seventeenth-century Welsh households through a study of the boundaries of household space. Reading Star Chamber cases of forcible entry and disseisin, Whyte highlights the contested nature of the household through the categories of entries, boundaries, and the idea of a moral landscape.

Stereotypes of women's roles were established and perpetuated within legal systems but these essays show that they could sometimes be overcome through careful negotiation, resulting in examples of female agency. Chapter notes are at the end of the volume, along with a good index. There is no bibliography. The volume should appeal to a wide readership but, most especially, to those interested in women's studies, gender studies, and legal history.

SALLY FISHER, *Monash University*

**Kay**, Sarah, *Parrots and Nightingales: Troubadour Quotations and the Development of European Poetry (Middle Ages)*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013; cloth; pp. 400; 9 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$79.95, £52.00; ISBN 9780812245257.

Sarah Kay's new book takes its cue and its central approach from an age-old emblem that identifies the task of the lyricist with that of the nightingale (or the sparrow), as opposed to that of the parrot (or the crow). While the sparrow and the nightingale (from Catullus to Keats) are identified with the articulation of a rhetoric of spontaneity and natural correspondence, the parrot would imply the verbatim repetition of words and a higher reliance on adequate contextual response by the audience, but also a higher mediation by literary institutions and cultural gatekeepers. The way of the nightingale presents itself as one of free-flowing, unproblematic poetic thought, articulated by the objective existence of its objective content (be that feeling or experience). In stark opposition to it, the way of the parrot would be one of strict quotation: of negative response, modification, twisted irony, or parasitic appropriation. And yet, the core question of mimesis that lies at the centre of early modern poetics emerges precisely from the intersection of both ways: the way of the nightingale and the way of the parrot. Renaissance imitation stems from this crossroads as a textual development in both its philosophical and rhetorical aspects; not primarily a matter of ontology, but also, quite crucially, one of rhetorical practice.

The book starts by examining textual practice, and maintains a close attention to detail throughout the entire volume. This approach makes the volume useful even for the non-specialist, who will see here new paths for medieval lyrical poetry to prolong its literary influence well into Modernity. Kay's outstanding contribution goes a long way in detailing the ways in which the long road to Renaissance literary imitation is grounded on myriad textual imitative practices, such as citation, quotation, contrafacta, recreation, and insertion. I particularly enjoyed the way in which the author shows the working influence of quotation in the emergence of a vernacular grammar and theory of poetic composition. A detailed examination of Raimon Vidal de Besalú's work, for example, helps the author establish fruitful links with the emergence of a sense of literary tradition and vernacular canonicity. Likewise, a chapter devoted to troubadour anthologies of quotations (and to Ferrarino de Ferrara's in particular) also shows in great detail and depth the importance of verbatim quotation, and its functional role for both individual poets wishing to develop an authorial voice and for the emergence of national literary cultures across Europe.

Kay's new book is a wonderful, richly textured demonstration that the song of the nightingale feeds on the squawk of the parrot, and that both are intimately linked in our literary traditions. Thus, the emergence of the

individual poetic self is necessitated by the positioning of the authorial voice in a literary tradition that constitutes itself by way of quotation. Dante's appropriation of the troubadour tradition is also examined as part of that cultural process. Going beyond previous accounts of appropriation in Dante's poetical practice, Kay is here able to link this phenomenon as part of a broader historical process. The last chapter (devoted to Petrarch) seems an only too fitting conclusion to this line of argument.

Finally, the author's careful framing of quotation practice within a modern and contemporary theoretical framework adds significant value to this thoroughly researched, highly engaging volume, helping to bridge gaps in the literature. The book builds on essential recent work within rhetorical studies (Grafton, Orr, Dragonetti, among others), but also draws inspiring links with the work of Lacan, and with Derrida's notions of *monolanguague*, *duplicité*, and *signature*. I found that these theoretical connections added great richness, weight, and scope to a fascinating book of outstanding scholarly worth, bringing an even sharper focus to debates that remain to this day an invigorating challenge for the scholar interested in rhetorics and poetics, whether that may be a task for parrots, for nightingales, or for both.

CARLES GUTIÉRREZ-SANFELIU, *The University of Queensland*

**Kent**, Francis W., *Princely Citizen: Lorenzo de' Medici and Renaissance Florence* (Late Medieval and Early Modern Studies, 24), ed. Carolyn James, Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. viii, 372; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503541716.

Professor Bill Kent was a pioneer of Medieval and Early Modern Studies in Australia, and a foundation for some of the most substantial work on the area being done nowadays. His work on Florentine social history spans more than thirty-five years, and stands out by its scrupulous attention to historical detail and by its philological and archival zeal, including the *historia minora* or *minima*, and their role in the bigger picture. Much of his gigantic task involved a thorough revision not only of perceived ideas but also of method, and this posthumous volume is a valuable testament to that great legacy. All these qualities are brilliantly illustrated in the fourteen essays reprinted in this collection, and in the concluding chapter on 'The Death of Lorenzo', previously unpublished and available here for the first time.

This book deals with particular, isolated aspects of a man who strove to reveal very little about himself, cultivating instead an image that blurred the private and the public. In doing so, Lorenzo de' Medici succeeded in becoming an indispensable leader and social mediator. Kent's essays avoid assessments of Lorenzo based on praise or blame, and focus closely on the small print of the events, persons, and institutions that made him up. His

writing puts together precious unknown materials around much-discussed issues, and sheds light on different aspects of Lorenzo's leadership.

The collection starts with a number of chapters devoted to Lorenzo's intellectual and personal upbringing, followed by an analysis of his political coming of age and public life, and his active interest in the arts, and also included are separate chapters on architecture, music, religious life, and the trade guilds. Of the first group, I have found particularly inspiring the pages dedicated to the women in Lorenzo's life, and their influence in his political apprenticeship. The chapter dedicated to 'Lorenzo de' Medici at the Duomo' is a joy to read: richly interwoven with contemporary correspondence and archival material, Kent's expert handling of primary sources adds great depth to his fine historical analysis. There are also shorter pieces that illustrate concrete aspects of how Lorenzo's role as a patron of the arts came hand in hand with his political craft and networking skills. Kent surveys and considers the scholarly tradition on these matters, but seldom accepts any commonplace ideas of judgements of value, preferring to offer the evidence in context to his readers, and let them decide for themselves. Other chapters deal with lineage matters, or studies on family history, and also include valuable appendices with letters from lesser-known members of the Medici family, or from servants and admirers of the house of Medici that throw a refreshing new light onto the bloody events following the murder of Giuliano de' Medici, Lorenzo's younger brother.

In its scope and detail, this book will serve as a wonderful complement to Kent's previous *Lorenzo de' Medici and the Art of Magnificence* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2004), and a source of inspiration and practical advice for new researchers in the field. It will also be useful for those of us who look forward to the completion of the critical edition of Lorenzo de' Medici's *Lettere*, a monumental collection of more than two thousand letters, and a long-term scholarly project that required not only the best philological and historical expertise, but also a clear-headed vision for the discipline, close scholarly cooperation, and strong institutional partnerships. Professor R. Rubinstein started the project, and Bill Kent contributed to it for several years as general editor before his untimely death. Lovingly edited by Carolyn James, this wonderful collection of essays will also help us chart our way through that wondrous sea of letters.

CARLES GUTIÉRREZ-SANFELIU, *The University of Queensland*

**King, Helen**, *The One-Sex Body on Trial: The Classical and Early Modern Evidence* (History of Medicine in Context), Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. 286; 10 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781409463

Helen King challenges Thomas Laqueur's thesis that in classical and early modern medical thinking there was only a single 'one-sex' body, whereas a 'two-sex' body was not introduced until the eighteenth century. King highlights how Laqueur's selective use of Hippocratic gynaecology means that his 'one-sex' and 'two-sex' body 'reduces complexity to simplicity' (p. xi). However, King is not simply interested in exposing the inconsistencies of Laqueur's findings from his influential 1990 book *Making Sex: Body and Gender from the Greeks to Freud*. Through close reading of classical and early modern medical treatises, she writes the study that maybe Laqueur should have produced.

In the Preface, King describes her general dissatisfaction with Laqueur's 'simple two-stage model'. Despite finding inaccuracies in Laqueur's simplified model, King notes its continuing influence in history and literature. Therefore, the need to thoroughly critique Laqueur's 'one-sex' and 'two-sex' body is long overdue. A wider assessment of Laqueur and the popularity of the *Making Sex* book start the Introduction. King highlights how Laqueur's habit of selective quotation from *Aristotle's Masterpiece* to strengthen his argument results in a misleading view of classical medicine.

Chapter 1 focuses on Laqueur's 'one-sex' body 'with its notion that men are women with their "insides out" – and vice versa' (p. 31). King argues that the model attributes a 'misleading uniformity' to premodern Europe (p. 31). The chapter then delves into a reassessment of Laqueur's narrow use of Galen, Hippocrates, Plato, and Aristotle. In Chapter 2, King investigates what Laqueur claims to be a pictorial representation of the 'one-sex' body in Figure 27 of Vesalius's *Fabrica* (1543). She discusses the importance of the caption and labels of Figure 27 that, crucially, Laqueur omitted. King also examines Vesalius's womb and vagina in its sixteenth-century context. Like his contemporaries, King notes, Vesalius combines one-sex and two-sex anatomy.

Chapter 3 concentrates on different Victorian readings of Phaethousa – a woman who stopped menstruating and grew a beard. In particular, the Victorian fascination with bearded ladies is discussed. This leads King to consider Phaethousa as a hermaphrodite, and to a discussion on the difficulty of classifying hermaphrodites.

The early modern understanding of Phaethousa as a sex-change story is analysed in Chapter 4. Her eventual death, linked to her unusual condition as proof that a woman cannot become a man, upholds a 'two-sex' model. Yet King also highlights how Phaethousa's death is omitted from some early

modern accounts to argue how sex change is possible so that her story conforms to a 'one-sex' body. She then examines in more detail early modern readings where Phaethousa is the dutiful wife who misses her absent husband to the point where she becomes him. The various accounts of Phaethousa lead King to conclude that her story reveals the complexity of the early modern engagement with female anatomy and gender identity.

Chapter 5 begins King's analysis of Agnodice, the story of a woman who disguises herself as a man to learn medicine then reveals herself as a woman in court by exposing her body. Agnodice's story is also linked to hagiography, further demonstrating how it cannot be attributed to any one genre. In Chapter 6, King discusses whether Agnodice could be considered a midwife or a physician. She also investigates how women were already organised as midwives long before male physicians claimed the role.

King then analyses, in Chapter 7, different versions of Agnodice's story through how it is sometimes used to accentuate medicine or midwifery. This is followed by a discussion on the diagnosis of Agnodice's first patient, and how effectively a man could treat a woman patient. Chapter 8 serves as a conclusion discussing how sexual identity is applicable to all parts of the body, and not just the genitals.

King's book rigorously interrogates the 'one-sex' and two-sex' models until there is no doubt that they are simply wrong. She also replaces Laqueur's reductive models with fascinating insights detailing the complex understanding of the reproductive system and gender identity in the classical and early modern periods. *The One-Sex Body on Trial* is an essential text, which ends a dubious chapter in academic history.

FRANK SWANNACK, *The University of Salford*

**Kuefler**, Mathew, *The Making and Unmaking of a Saint: Hagiography and Memory in the Cult of Gerald of Aurillac* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 320; 34 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$79.95; ISBN 9780812245523.

In his new monograph, Mathew Kuefler describes the rise and fall of a medieval saint. What on the surface may seem to be an exploration of a rather insignificant saint is something more substantive. While focusing on one of the few laymen to become a saint in the Middle Ages, the study takes on a variety of issues regarding, not only the value of hagiographies as historical sources, but also the importance of understanding what has 'been lost'. As Kuefler reminds his reader, 'What has been forgotten in history is often as meaningful as what has been remembered' (p. 117).

The book opens by taking on the entrenched scholarly view that sees Gerald's original *vita* as the work of one author, the second abbot of the monastery of Cluny, Odo (878–942). Kuefler's closer inspection of the

evidence exposes this attribution as ‘a house of cards’ (p. 14). Instead, Kuefler suggests that Odo composed the much less detailed account known as the *Vita brevior*, while the main body of the life, the *Vita proluxior*, Kuefler attributes to the known forger of saints’ lives, Adamar (c. 989–1034).

Why, might the non-specialist ask, does one need to know the exact authorship? Because, as Kuefler explains in Chapters 2 and 3, modern historians have mined Gerald’s life for information about Odo and ninth- and early tenth-century Southern France during a time when the Carolingians were losing their grip on power. If, as Kuefler claims, Adamar reworked Odo’s original *vita* sometime in the 1020s, then the majority of Gerald’s biography reflects the viewpoints of a man writing a century later than previously assumed.

This later dating, however, does not undermine these texts’ value as historical sources. Kuefler proposes that the *vita*, and in particular Adamar’s focus on violence, provides insights into the early eleventh-century struggle among ‘local landowners and warlords’, men who were increasingly competing ‘with each other for greater wealth and status’ and also the ways that the primary victims of this violence – the churchmen and the peasants – dealt with this disorder. Kuefler believes that some of the impetus behind the *Pax Dei* (Peace of God movement) that blossomed in this era can be detected in Adamar’s remaking of Gerald’s life.

In Chapter 3, Kuefler discusses the difficulties Adamar faced in presenting a layman as a saint. This section shows that saints’ lives were far more than just banal accounts of well-trodden hagiographical traits, but individually crafted characterisations exposing the unique values of the individual authors, and the historical context in which they were composed.

The second half of the study offers Kuefler’s diachronic investigation of Gerald’s legacy from the eleventh century to the present. Kuefler explains how and why certain saints like St Martin of Tours gained notoriety and eternal vibrancy, while others like Gerald gradually fell into oblivion. The notion that saints’ lives were and are fluid and living objects represents a crucial concept in these final chapters. Kuefler makes the sensible point that each generation has represented the saint largely to fit their own needs and beliefs. Therefore, nineteenth-century literary and visual depictions of Gerald tell one more about that era than the actual saint and/or his characterisation from the earliest depictions. While the changing values and requirements of the local communities surrounding Gerald’s homelands help to explain the survival of an obscure saint like Gerald, they also provide an explanation for this saint’s gradual fall into obscurity until only a fragment of the saint found in the original *vita* remains.

Though this book may take some patience for the non-specialist to digest, Kuefler has successfully taken on Walter Pohl’s challenge, found in the Introduction, for postmodernist scholars to apply their methodology to

a wide range of medieval texts. Kuefler has also lived up to his own ambition 'to reveal the hagiographer behind the hagiography' (p. 6). Regardless of whether or not one accepts Kuefler's alternative view on the authorship of the *Vita Geraldi*, the study's in-depth and careful analysis of these little-known texts is essential reading for anyone hoping to understand this saint and his world.

MICHAEL EDWARD STEWART, *The University of Queensland*

**Kurihara, Ken**, *Celestial Wonders in Reformation Germany* (Religious Cultures in the Early Modern World, 13), London, Pickering & Chatto, 2014; hardback; pp. 224; 1 b/w illustration; R.R.P. £60.00, US\$99.00; ISBN 9781848934443.

*Celestial Wonders in Reformation Germany* is a fascinating study of how the superstition surrounding, and fear of, celestial phenomena were often used by the clergy in early modern Germany to publicly validate their religious and political positions. In sixteenth-century Germany, celestial *Wunderzeichen* (wonder-signs) included such wondrous astrological phenomena as comets, novae, and eclipses, as well as meteorological effects such as the halo phenomena where multiple suns or moons could be seen. Other sights included fire-signs where witnesses claimed that the sky had turned blood red, or that they saw armies, rods, crosses, animals, and various other objects in the sky. According to Ken Kurihara, 'we are not sure what people saw in the sky in reality, but we can safely state that these phenomena are collective illusions that reflect their inner concerns' (p. 19). The most commonly recorded celestial phenomena were comets, with at least fourteen recorded in the sixteenth century.

It was a century of extreme climatic change and a mini ice age, and in the second half of the sixteenth century the social and political conditions of Germany gave the people ample reason to fear that various catastrophes would soon befall Germany. The *Wunderzeichen* discourses reflect these fears and the people's need to know what they could expect for their future: there were various contemporary interpretations of these strange celestial phenomena but all could be summarised as 'repent or face disaster'.

People in Lutheran Germany in the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries showed a great deal of interest in these phenomena and the sheer number of publications concerning strange celestial signs attests to their enormous popularity. Types of publication included broadsheets, news pamphlets, wonder books, astrological tracts, sermons, devotional books, scientific works, and personal letters. Fear of God's wrath and the imminence of the Last Judgement was a dominant theme through most of the *Wunderzeichen* literature and Kurihara claims that the Lutheran eschatology is the key to understanding the relationship between the clergy

and *Wunderzeichen* discourses. Exploiting the popular interest, some Lutheran clergy incorporated news of these celestial phenomena into their sermons and other writings as they strengthened Lutheran eschatological convictions that the day of the Last Judgement was at hand and that the final countdown to the end of time had started with Luther's Reformation. These types of celestial phenomena had been explicitly mentioned in the Bible and with the clergy actively incorporating shocking reports of *Wunderzeichen* stories and imagery into these sermons the necessity of repentance was reinforced.

Kurihara demonstrates that almost all of the pre-eminent theologians of the sixteenth century, including Martin Luther and Philip Melancthon, participated in *Wunderzeichen* discourses. Although Luther did not put much trust in astrology he did occasionally express interest in celestial wonders and he interpreted the expression 'signs in the sun and moon' as eclipses that were tokens of God's wrath and predicted sure disaster for the future. Melancthon, the German Preceptor, was particularly interested in *Wunderzeichen* and he promoted astronomy and astrology in the university education system. It was common for the clergy to use *Wunderzeichen* as anti-papist propaganda. Some, such as theologian Christoph Irenaeus, combined the two literary forms of religious polemic and wonder books, and created an original genre: he used the image of water in the floods to attack his theological opponents as being false teachers who invited God's watery punishment. In his *Wunderzeichen* writings he showed that celestial wonders, religious and confessional conflict, and apocalypticism were closely interconnected with the cosmology of late sixteenth-century Lutheranism. Jacob Andreae denounced astrology as 'spiritual fornication' and 'idolatry' that invoked God's wrath, but still claimed that the great comet of 1556 was a call for people to repent, that it was a noted sign of grace for those who did repent, and it was a sign of wrath for the unbelievers.

Kurihara creates a narrative that will be of interest to scholars of the Reformation, early modern studies, historians of religion, and scholars of theology, as well as the history of science. The case studies that are highlighted are meaningful and well chosen and the book is researched to the highest academic standard.

TESSA MORRISON, *The University of Newcastle, NSW*

**Makowski**, Elizabeth, *English Nuns and the Law in the Middle Ages: Cloistered Nuns and their Lawyers, 1293–1540* (Studies in the History of Medieval Religion), Woodbridge, Boydell, 2012; hardback; pp. xvi, 198; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843837862.

Elizabeth Makowski has written another meticulously researched and precisely written study of medieval nuns and law. Following her important studies of the legal basis of enclosure and its effect on different communities

of religious women in medieval Europe – *Canon Law and Cloistered Women* (Catholic University of America Press, 1997) and *A Pernicious Sort of Woman: Quasi-Religious Women and Canon Lawyers in the Later Middle Ages* (Catholic University of America Press, 2005) – this book takes a group of English religious institutions for women and examines the legal environments in which they operated.

Medieval religious women's houses, like their male counterparts, had dealings with different legal systems. Like all land holders, they were involved in court cases over the management of land holdings, rents, and taxes, and because they were also religious institutions, they needed to deal with religious or canon law relating to their spiritual benefits and gifts. Religious women after the 1293 papal decree, *Periculoso*, however, were required to be enclosed and not to leave their convents even to defend their assets in courts. Religious women who remained enclosed therefore were even more reliant on lawyers to represent their interests than their secular or male religious counterparts. This nexus, of enclosed religious convents and the lawyers who represented them, is the subject of this book.

Makowski analyses five enclosed convents where generous patronage ensured that the nuns could successfully withdraw from the world and devote their lives and resources to contemplation and prayer. The chosen convents, like so many other houses for religious women, lack surviving internal documentation such as cartularies or visitation records, so evidence of their presence in court documents is the often only way of tracking the management of their estates. By focusing on houses with few internal documents, her methodology is transferrable to studies of other religious houses where survival of archives is also an issue. The convents she follows are the Bridgettine convent at Syon, three Franciscan convents of Minoreesses in Cambridgeshire and London, and the Dominican Priory at Dartford. Safeguarding land, rents, and other endowments required skilled practitioners in the different branches of property, tax, and canon law. The later medieval period when these religious houses were endowed was also the period when the practice of law became increasingly complex and so legal practitioners became more professionalised. The study is therefore as much about the lawyers and their arguments and tactics as it is about the management skills of religious women leaders.

Makowski's method is to focus on these five convents and then follow legal cases involving their properties through four legal frameworks – common law, chancery suits, episcopal arbitration, and papal appeals. Each of these legal contexts provides her with case studies of suits that are sufficiently well documented to allow analysis of the lawyers and the circumstances of the different cases.

The book begins with three broad chapters that contextualise the nuns, their lawyers, and the routine legal business for which legal services were needed. These chapters are particularly useful in explaining the complex terminology associated with all three. It is likely that readers may be more familiar with one or the other of these three, rather than all of them. Certainly, one of the strengths of the book is the clear explanation of specialised legal and religious terminology. This makes the book useful for any reader who needs to grapple with original medieval legal documentation, particularly in England.

After this initial contextual part, Makowski moves on to the case studies, with chapters allocated to the four major legal systems (noted above) used by the nuns. It is in these chapters where the legal language and disputes over land and entitlements come to life under Makowski's light touch. What might be rather dry and overly complex legal language is given depth and interest by the biographical details for the lawyers and the nuns as well as for the choice of case studies that are investigated. One interesting case that is examined in detail is the complex legal battle that the Bridgettines of Syon Abbey faced in the common law courts when Henry VI decided to redirect some of their endowment to his new foundation of King's College.

Makowski has used a very wide range of legal documents involving many different aspects of the complex secular and ecclesiastical law that governed management and holdings of religious women's corporate estates. Her dexterity with these source materials makes this an engaging and useful book for the study of medieval law and medieval religious women.

DIANNE HALL, *Victoria University, Melbourne*

**McLeod**, Shane, *The Beginning of Scandinavian Settlement in England: The Viking 'Great Army' and Early Settlers, c. 865–900* (Studies in the Early Middle Ages, 29), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xvi, 330; 8 b/w illustrations, 3 b/w tables, 6 b/w line art; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503545561.

Based on his doctoral thesis, Shane McLeod has produced a finely nuanced analysis of the earliest stages of Scandinavian conquest and settlement in England, from approximately 865 to 900. He differentiates between the more commonly used evidence for subsequent generations of Scandinavian settlement in the tenth century and evidence available for the first generation of settlers, associated with the 'great army', who (in McLeod's well-argued view) included others, both domestic and civilian.

McLeod's thesis critiques the limits of available evidence – annalistic/historical, literary, archaeological – and draws upon migration theory to argue in favour of the early stages of conquest and settlement being undertaken not solely by warriors and settlers coming from the Scandinavian

lands of Denmark and Norway. A sound case is developed that the great army and associated settlers included those with prior migration experience, in particular coming from lands that had already been settled by Scandinavians in both Ireland and Francia. McLeod also makes the case that right from the very early stages the invasion and settlement of England involved not just young adult fighting men, but included women and children in greater numbers than scholars have hitherto believed. It also stands to reason that the migrations would have also included administrators, given the nature of the settlement and establishment of Scandinavian rule.

McLeod maps out the underlying principles in migration theory, and identifies in particular five of nine principles that can be applied specifically to the evidence for Scandinavian migration to England. The five principles, for which evidence exists in relation to migration of Scandinavians to England, are: migration through the use of advance 'scouts' for setting up migration 'chains'; the tendency for a migratory flow to continue over a period; migrants being a select group of people from the population of origin; migrants being more likely to have experience of previous migration; and migrants often returning to their place of origin. Having mapped out the evidence for supporting his application of migration theory, McLeod then traces the likely origins of the settlers. He uses annalistic and archaeological evidence to argue for the presence of a significant proportion of Scandinavians from both Ireland and the Frisian coastal areas of Francia in the great army, and thus forming the basis of the early stages of migration to England. In comparison, the evidence for great army members coming directly from the Scandinavian homelands in the early phases of Scandinavian settlement in England is shown to be limited.

McLeod also looks at a number of other aspects of the migrations, as a means for describing a more complete picture of the people and the circumstances that led to their migration. He discusses the likely motivations behind the migrations, and makes a good argument for the immigrants' desire for economic and social advancement as an important motivating factor. He argues that this is especially the case in the desire for wealth through land ownership, which was of high cultural value and for which opportunities were limited in both Ireland and Francia.

McLeod considers the use of client kings as one example of a number of political and economic innovations that came about during the early phases of Scandinavian migration to England. *Inter alia*, he argues that the use of a written treaty between Guthrum and Alfred through which boundaries were agreed and administrative units established was another such innovation, possibly reflecting a continental experience of treaties, resulting in the creation of buffer zones on the margins of Scandinavian rule in England. He also makes the case for Scandinavian innovation in the acculturation of administrative and economic conditions (in particular in Mercia and East Anglia) to existing

Anglo-Saxon activities. He argues that the use of existing coining standards (while at the same time maintaining a bullion economy) are an indication of the Scandinavians' adaptability and flexibility to engage in a moneyed as well as bullion economy as circumstances demanded.

McLeod concludes with a finely worked analysis of the culture and religion of the Scandinavian settlers, proposing instead of the commonly held views of Scandinavian paganism in conflict with Anglo-Saxon Christianity, a situation where the incoming settlers were in fact familiar with Christianity and its cultural and political relevance, and they worked to establish a polity that adapted to (rather than confronted) the existing conditions.

McLeod's first monograph is a thorough and rewarding appraisal of the conditions relating to the early phase of Scandinavian settlement in England, and a worthy addition to the shelves of a scholar engaged in this period.

RODERICK McDONALD, *The University of Iceland*

**Milliman**, Paul, *'The Slippery Memory of Men': The Place of Pomerania in the Medieval Kingdom of Poland* (East Central and Eastern Europe in the Middle Ages, 450–1450, 21), Leiden, Brill, 2013; hardback; pp. xv, 319; R.R.P. €123.00, US\$171.00; ISBN 9789004182745.

Paul Milliman's choice of subject is a testimony to the increased interest in the medieval history of Central Europe and specifically in the history of Pomerania. The region, whose Latin-derived name refers to a location 'along a sea', encompasses almost the whole southern shore of the Baltic Sea, from Recknitz River near Stralsund in the west to the delta of Vistula River near Gdańsk in the east, and Chełmno Land in the south. Milliman's focus is on the very eastern part of this territory often referred to as Pomerelia (Polish: *Pomorze Gdańskie*) or Eastern Pomerania and generally to Anglophone audiences as the Polish Corridor. My preferred term, for the sake of precision and simplicity, is Pomerelia.

The book is the outcome of Milliman's doctoral research into the history of a disputed territory, the formation of new identities, the establishment of new traditions supplanting old ones, and collective memory; issues studied by others in different geographical contexts. The choice of timeframe for this work coincides with the final stages of the Christianisation of Prussia by the Teutonic Order and the establishment of the Order's headquarters in Marienburg (Polish: Malbork) in the wake of the Order's takeover of Pomerelia in 1308.

Milliman uses a variety of sources to provide the context for his examination of issues of memory and identity formation in the region, one which in name at least, ceased to be a frontier community with the formalisation of the conquest of Prussia. In the first three chapters of his book, Milliman charts the history of Pomerelia as a frontier, its place in the internal

politics of Poland and the role of the Teutonic Order in the Christianisation of the region and their subsequent takeover of the subjugated territories. He provides the political context of the origins of the dispute between Poland and the Teutonic Order and the competing claims by the Polish Crown and the Teutonic Order to the new territories of Pomerelia, a dispute that the Poles took to the Vatican for resolution. Two separate trials were held in Pomerelia, one in 1320 and 1339, and both were held before papal legates.

Chapter 1 narrates Pomerelia's emergence as a political entity separate from that of Western Pomerania and Prussia, and for a time independent of Poland. It is an interesting if complicated example of how local communities organise themselves when subjected to an overarching but distant supreme authority. Chapter 2 describes the complicated nature of Pomerelia's succession and the Treaty of Kępnno (1282) which allowed succession of the territory by the Polish King Przemysł II and his successor Władysław I Łokietek (the Short) and the emergence of the Teutonic Order as a key player in the region. Chapter 3 deals with the development of the conflict between the Polish Crown and the Order, when Poland demanded the restitution of Pomerelia and the leadership of the Order maintained its right to Pomerelia's overlordship. Chapters 4 and 5 provide an examination of the key sources, the trial testimonies of 1320 and 1339. Milliman argues that their analysis demonstrates that the perceptions of those called to bear witness before the papal legates changed over the period of twenty years that had elapsed between the trials.

While dealing with the evidence, Milliman integrates analysis of aspects of memory and identity into his discussion. He focuses on collective memory and memory formation as the enabler of the construction of identity; identity which defined and in turn was defined by one's allegiance to one or other of the sovereign powers contesting the territory. The formation of collective memory expressing Pomerelia's geopolitical place is examined on the basis of recollection, oblivion, interpretation, and distortion provided by the witnesses not only based on their own individual, traumatic experiences but their understanding of right and wrong, justice, and their profession and social status. Milliman demonstrates the processes by which Poland and the Teutonic Order overlordship of Pomerelia became perceived as possession by culturally, geographically, and politically exclusive entities.

Milliman avoids the tendency among some historians to treat the antagonism between Poland and the Order as the expression of primarily national differences between the 'Poles' and 'Germans' that has cast a long shadow on the complicated history of Pomerelia as a contested region. What impresses me is Milliman's reference to historians working in Poland and the integration of this scholarship into his own analysis. This is an interesting and thought-provoking study which places Pomerelia firmly on the map of global research as not just another peripheral region suddenly discovered by those

writing in English but a legitimate subject of research for which sources are available universally in Latin.

DARIUS VON GÜTTNER-SPORZYŃSKI, *The University of Melbourne*

**Moncrief**, Kathryn M., Kathryn R. **McPherson**, and Sarah **Enloe**, eds, *Shakespeare Expressed: Page, Stage, and Classroom in Shakespeare and his Contemporaries*, Madison, NJ, Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2013; hardback; pp. 298; 19 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$85.00; ISBN 9781611475609.

This collection is positioned at the intersection of Shakespearean scholarship, staging, and pedagogy. Comprising twenty-eight papers, the volume was developed out of the 2011 Blackfriars Conference at the American Shakespeare Centre. It offers a collection of scholarly papers, ‘staging sessions’, and ‘detailed pedagogical exercises’ (p. 2), driven by an overwhelmingly practical aim. As Ralph Alan Cohen explains in the Foreword: ‘[h]ere scholars ask questions of a peculiarly practical sort’ (p. xiv). The edition is divided into five parts, each containing idiosyncratic topics that give attention to often-overlooked aspects of performance (such as sound directions) or more common areas of analysis (early modern stages and audience seating).

Part I focuses on ‘The Body of the Actor’, and considers the performance of a deaf actor as Old Hamlet in a fascinating chapter by Lezlie C. Cross. Other chapters deal with the maternal body in *Macbeth* (Chelsea Phillips), height difference in *As You Like It* (Jemma Alix Levy), and cast size (Brett Gamboa).

In Part II, ‘Playing the Text’, chapters explore the Porter’s knock-knock joke in *Macbeth* (Chris Barrett), the question of original practices (Peter Kanelos), an enlightening consideration of the playability of Q1 and Q2 *Hamlet* (Matthew Vadnais), and the use of ‘ha’ in Shakespeare’s soliloquies (Bill Gelber).

Part III’s ‘Staging Choices’ considers stage doors and perspective (Jennifer A. Low references Andrew Gurr and Mariko Ichikawa on the doors but surprisingly omits Tim Fitzpatrick), stage business (in which Sid Ray includes an under-explored but intriguing suggestion for teachers at the conclusion). There is also a thoughtful consideration of the staging of ghosts and invisibility (Fiona Harris-Ramsby and Kathryn R. McPherson), and chapters on the use of props to indicate character relationships (Kathryn M. Moncrief), and the role of the Chorus in *Henry V* (Christina Gutierrez).

Part IV on the ‘Playhouse and Playing Conditions’ comprises perhaps the most cohesive section. The topics include on-stage audiences at the Blackfriars (with chapters from Leslie Thomson and Nova Myhill), the first and second Blackfriars (Jeanne McCarthy), the positioning of characters (Annalisa Castaldo), and the use of gallery space (Christine Parker). This

section focuses heavily on practical staging implications and is less directly connected to pedagogy.

Part V turns to 'Technical and Material Matters', and considers heat (Ann Jennalie Cook), lighting (Lauren Shell), sound (a highly useful contribution from Alisha Huber), and economics (Melissa D. Aaron). Aaron's chapter, however, could have benefited from more engagement with criticism on early modern theatre and the market, such as new economic criticism (there are many contributions in and around this field, including Linda Woodbridge, ed., *Money in the Age of Shakespeare: Essays in New Economic Criticism*, Palgrave Macmillan, 2003).

The final chapter of each part provides a practical classroom exercise or activity. These five pedagogical chapters will be useful for educators of secondary or tertiary students: they offer engaging learning activities that hone students' ability to read dramatic literature for staging implications. The exercises include a 'staging' assignment (Miriam Gilbert), as well as activities for exploring character function (Symmonie Preston), considering the audience relationship (Sarah Enloe), using architectural elements (Doreen Bechtol), and special effects (Cass Morris). Although they do not engage significantly with educational theory, the exercises will be useful and interesting for educators and students. However, relegating these practical activities to the final, very brief section of each part seems problematic: it perpetuates a divide between scholarship and pedagogy that the edition otherwise tries to undo.

As *Shakespeare Expressed* features a range of contributions in the areas of scholarship, staging, and pedagogy, the volume might have benefited from a tighter scope as it sometimes struggles to do justice to all fields indicated in the title. This book would be most helpful for pedagogical and performative purposes; both for educators seeking to incorporate practical staging issues into their classrooms and for performance practitioners. It fosters an important conversation on the role of the practical by examining factors sometimes overlooked as tangential.

CLAIRE HANSEN, *The University of Sydney*

**Morrison**, Karl F. and Rudolph M. **Bell**, eds, *Studies on Medieval Empathies* (Disputatio, 25), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xxxii, 352; 2 b/w illustrations, 4 colour plates; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503530314.

Although the Latin language possesses no word for empathy, it is clear from this volume that 'fellow-feeling' was recognised as part of interaction and bonding long before the neologism *Einfühlung* emerged from German philology in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Generated from a conference held at Rutgers University in 2008, this collection of essays is

the first to focus on empathy in a medieval context. The volume is not a traditional *festschrift* in honour of Karl F. Morrison, but offers an ‘intense inquiry’ where he may be seen as both active participant and protagonist (p. xi). The contents often respond to Morrison’s particular interests and ideas, creating a volume that is largely cohesive and honours his scholarly enquiry in this field.

Morrison opens the volume with a *tour de force* on the evolution of empathy from pre-Christian Antiquity to the late Middle Ages. Concentrating on its theological underpinnings and the cognitive system to which it belongs, Morrison suggests that empathy was expressed through both love and cruelty. He not only foregrounds many of the essays to come but provides a valuable conceptual framework for the volume. Eleven articles divided into four sections follow. In the first part, Giselle de Nie shows how St Martin was ‘humanised’ by Paulinus of Périgueux (c. 460–70), not only to make him a recognisable and compassionate spiritual model but also one who, through the use of affective mimesis, could induce empathy in the reader or listener. In a similar vein, Constance B. Bouchard examines the re-written lives of several saints from early medieval Gaul and concludes that their renewal assisted in establishing an empathetic relationship between the saints and those who read their *vitae*. Ending the first section, Rachel Fulton Brown expertly analyses the intercessory role of saints in Anselm of Canterbury’s prayers and shows how empathy could bring the sinner closer to God.

In the second section, Michael Allen applies ‘philological empathy’ to Lupus of Ferrières’s *Epistola* 1 in order to discover the text ‘from within’, while Herbert L. Kessler argues for the curative power of empathetic visualisation in an essay that works alongside de Nie’s study. In the third part, Barbara Newman and Bernard McGinn both explore empathy with God. Newman investigates the doctrine of co-inherence using the analogy of mystical pregnancy found in late medieval hagiographical texts. This piece is complemented by McGinn’s analysis of the development of active and contemplative love. Marcia L. Colish ends this section on a different note, examining Raymond Lull’s ecumenical empathies in *The Book of the Gentile and the Three Sages*. In the final division, Sabine MacCormack and Thomas F. X. Noble explore the ‘dissonances’ and limits of medieval empathy by analysing the change in late antique and late medieval conceptions of hell (MacCormack) and the persistence of the idea of Rome (Noble). Richard Kieckhefer closes the volume by investigating the ways historians have expressed empathy, or related attitudes, towards the inquisitors. This approach allows the reader to consider how empathy can help in reaching a deeper level of understanding.

In his opening line, Morrison observes that the history of empathy has yet to be written. What follows is a series of essays that open up a field of study by examining empathy from a range of disciplinary standpoints. This

rich volume will undoubtedly stimulate further interest in the study of empathy as the History of Emotions continues to engross scholars.

KIMBERLEY-JOY KNIGHT, *The University of Sydney*

**Mostert**, Marco and Anna **Adamska**, eds, *Writing and the Administration of Medieval Towns: Medieval Urban Literacy I* (Utrecht Studies in Medieval Literacy, 27), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xvi, 366; 26 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503549590.

This volume addresses ‘institutional’ or ‘civic’ literacy through a collection of ‘articles discussing the production, uses, and preservation of records for the purposes of municipal administration’ (p. 4). Several areas of contribution to scholarship stand out. Firstly, the very particularity of the contributions goes some way to helping the reader spot what is geographically or chronologically particular, and what is more commonly European. Secondly, this volume puts a wide range of research on European archives, towns, and literacy into English. Thirdly, the researchers present many methodological propositions that will have broader application beyond their own particular studies. Finally, there is an excellent and consistent focus on the surviving written word: its production, use, destruction, storage, survival, and how it has been and can be studied.

Some urban exemplars open the collection. Inger Larsson examines the shift from runic to Latin script in Swedish towns, highlighting early literacy. Geertrui Van Synghel explores the relationship between town and region in ’s-Hertogenbosch, suggesting that rural–urban dynamic influenced the production and keeping of records. Hannes Obermair suggests the Alpine towns were in a unique ‘creole’ cultural border zone worthy of further study. José López-Villalba’s insightful study of Castilian urban chanceries would make a good reference paper for scholars contemplating medieval and early modern town archives. Jeroen Benders examined the north-eastern Low Countries, introducing the archival prospects and particularities of the region. Katalin Szende situates medieval Hungarian towns within wider Western European historiographical concerns, providing a welcome focus on the materiality of written sources. Agnieszka Bartoszewicz surveys record-makers and record making in small Polish towns in connection with universities and legal culture.

Part II of the volume focuses on urban archives as ‘places of power, memory, and secrets’. Here, a variety of case studies explore a range of issues that will generally be of interest beyond their particular settings. Andreas Litschel explores oral forms of communication in a period of documentary proliferation, arguing that archival developments stem from systemic and procedural modes, rather than necessarily being a demonstration of increasing urban governance and control. Hannes Lowagie looks at political

motivations behind the copying, circulation, and preservation of particular documents in Ghent. It nicely complements the preceding paper, similarly drawing attention to the processes of archive formation that do not conform to teleological narratives of the rise of government.

Sarah Rees Jones charts civic literacy in England, and argues that a greater comparative approach is needed for future studies. Michael Jucker focuses on urban secrecy, linking surviving archival collections to their political context. Christoph Weber illustrates how secrecy and confidentiality were normal elements of urban business in Italian Communes. Bastian Walter examines *cedulae inclusae* in the Burgundian Wars in terms of manipulation of events, shared policies, and the fostering of trust and reciprocity.

In Part III, the focus shifts to the *litterati*. Branka Grbavac examines the professional formation of notaries in Dalmatia, draws interesting conclusions about the shifting composition in notaries' backgrounds, and highlights regional links with north-central Italy. Ágnes Flóra focuses on the notaries of Transylvania, arguing that there is evidence of continuity in practices through the medieval and early modern periods, and points out how the notary was an important local official with duties and responsibilities that extended significantly beyond the role of a clerk. Marco Mostert then concludes the volume with a welcome discussion of schools and education.

NICHOLAS BRODIE, *The University of Tasmania*

**O'Doherty**, Marianne, *The Indies and the Medieval West: Thought, Report, Imagination* (Medieval Voyaging, 2), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. x, 377; 3 colour, 36 b/w illustrations, 16 b/w line art; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503532769.

Marco Polo's story continues to entrance readers, likewise Sir John Mandeville's. Contemporaneous travellers' stories include those of Odorico and Niccolò Conti. This book surveys how Eastern lands and peoples were viewed through medieval eyes – and how views changed. Marianne O'Doherty considers literally hundreds of manuscripts of these stories in their many different redactions. The tales were tinkered with but, in addition, chapter headings were inserted, cross-references indicated, and annotations added, though surprisingly, O'Doherty hardly mentions glosses.

In the stories' developments, we get both insights into how medieval people viewed the Far East and, because annotations were accrued over time and opinions changed, some idea of those changes. While the Far East had been known for a millennium and the awareness of non-Christian peoples had been brought home, quite literally, by returning crusaders, not to mention all the tales from the Silk Road, nevertheless much remained problematic: the basic geography and the weird creatures, for example, dog-headed people.

How and why did people read these tales? The Bible was read in at least four different ways; these stories could be read as fact, fiction, analogy, propaganda, or proselytisation. There is much to discuss.

O'Doherty can write beautifully, witness her paper on Odorico (*Italian Studies*, 64 (2009), 198–220, not listed in the references). She knows the literature and deftly mines Consuelo Dutschke's 1300-plus page PhD thesis (UCLA, 1993). She provides extensive tables detailing the manuscripts of the tales of Marco Polo and Odorico (but not the others).

What is lacking is logic; what is present is cumbrous phraseology and loose language. The implied symmetry of the title is absent: the view is solely eastwards. The book is divided into three parts, though the last comprises three disparate chapters. The first part sets the scene, but the introduction to Alfred Hiatt's *Terra Incognita* (British Library, 2008) is much preferable, and more precise. The second deals with Marco Polo and Odorico. In the third, 'Sir John Mandeville' is as enigmatic as ever but, perplexingly, O'Doherty chooses to switch from modern English translations to Middle English ones. The next chapter is on early maps, but now is allegedly *not* about changes (p. 246), though its conclusion says the maps considered 'testify to considerable changes' (p. 294). The final chapter claims she has shown the views were 'plural and unstable'. Sadly, there is no clear and systematic presentation of the complex multiplicity of the ways these stories were read and redacted; we have only a 'dizzying variety' (p. 297).

O'Doherty devotes an inordinate amount of space to describing what she purposes, but it is not clear that she fulfils all her promises. The book is replete with illustrations, often gratuitous, and maps too detailed to be legible. The language is sometimes extraordinary: '... the fully elaborated model in the cosmographical excursus of a symmetrical, wholly interconnected, fully navigable, single-*oikoumene* globe contradicts the alternative cosmological vision ...' (p. 227). '*Oikoumene*' is used instead of the obvious, appropriate term 'known world' which is relegated to brackets (p. 19, cf. Hiatt, *Terra Incognita*, pp. 4–5). 'Paratext' is used to conflate page layout, rubrics, chapter headings (even those introduced by a redactor), marginalia, glosses, and annotations (whether later additions or not). 'Vulgate Latin' confusingly replaces the 'scholarly Latin' of Dutschke (p. 99, n. 2 versus p. 230) but has nothing to do with the Vulgate Bible. 'Locative' is used for 'locational' (pp. 28, 29, 303).

Many are credited for reading early drafts, none for the final draft. A good, tough, traditional literary editor could have made a difference – and possibly prevented this book from being so disappointing.

JOHN N. CROSSLEY, *Monash University*

**Phillips**, William D., Jr, *Slavery in Medieval and Early Modern Iberia* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014; cloth, pp. 272, R.R.P. US\$65.00, £42.50; ISBN 9780812244915.

This study encapsulates the complexity of slavery in Spain and Portugal during the medieval and early modern periods. The first recorded slaveholders on the Iberian Peninsula, the Romans and the Visigoths, shared the view that those who were part of the dominant group should not be enslaved. When the Muslims conquered the Peninsula early in the eighth century, citizens of towns that had resisted them were enslaved. Although the situation was reversed during and after the re-conquest, it varied across regions. While most slaves in Castile were Muslim, those in the maritime areas of the Crown of Aragon were generally from the southern and eastern Mediterranean and beyond the Black Sea. Although there were Muslim slaves in Portugal, little is known about slavery here prior to the 1440s, when the trade in Sub-Saharan slaves began. By the end of the fifteenth century, the Portuguese were bringing African slaves to the Iberian Peninsula directly from Africa's west coast. By the beginning of the sixteenth century, these slaves were joined in Spain by enslaved captives from the war in the Canary Islands. William Phillips points out that although there were often large numbers of slaves in Spain and Portugal, they could not be called slave societies. Indeed, during the sixteenth century slaves probably made up only 10 per cent of the population of the city with the largest number of slaves, namely Seville.

Phillips emphasises that the Iberian experience of slavery varied enormously. Christians, Muslims, and Jews alike could be slaves, slave owners, or traders. One could be born into slavery, kidnapped and enslaved, or captured and enslaved as a result of conflict. Moreover, slaves could find themselves 'at any number of points between full slavery and full freedom'. Phillips brings his survey of slavery to life with examples taken from notarial documents. This means that he is able to provide rather more examples of the Spanish owner/slave relationship than the Portuguese. He does so in the full knowledge that such documents were almost always drawn up at the instigation of the owner rather than the slave. Indeed, when it comes to documents that promise or grant manumission, Phillips rightly points out that the majority of slaves freed in this way actually bought their freedom while others were freed once they became too old and frail to work. In the latter case, manumission was likely to result in destitution and starvation.

While the Roman tradition of having domestic slaves continued on the Iberian Peninsula into the early modern period, their practice of maintaining slave gangs did not. By the medieval period, slaves who worked outside the home did so alongside free workers. Even those who manned the galleys toiled with convicts and free labourers. However, things were very different beyond the Peninsula. The trade in African slaves expanded as the demand

for labour grew in the American settlements. During the first two centuries of the colonial period, the medieval Mediterranean style of domestic slavery and plantation slavery coexisted. However, slavery on the Peninsula declined during Portugal's war with Spain, which lasted until 1668. The death knell came in the 1760s when Carlos III established diplomatic relations with Morocco. Laws were passed in Portugal in 1773, and in the early nineteenth century in Spain, freeing the last slaves. As slavery declined and died out on the Iberian Peninsula, it flourished in the empires, lasting until the late nineteenth century in Brazil.

*Slavery in Medieval and Early Modern Iberia* provides a richly textured overview of the development of slavery in Spain and Portugal. It is aimed at those interested in slavery in the Americas, as well those concerned with the Iberian Peninsula, illustrating why the experience of slavery came to vary so much across South America, North America, and the Caribbean.

HEATHER DALTON, *The University of Melbourne*

**Pohl, Walter and Gerda Heydemann**, eds, *Strategies of Identification: Ethnicity and Religion in Early Medieval Europe* (Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages, 13), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. x, 450; 14 b/w illustrations, 4 b/w line art; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503533841.

In *Strategies of Identification*, editors Walter Pohl and Gerda Heydemann have collated six articles on ethnicity as it relates to Christianity in early medieval Europe, alongside an Introduction detailing methodological strategies to deal with identification as outlined by Pohl himself. The Introduction and five of the papers are in English, with one paper in German.

Pohl recognises identification as a basic cognitive mechanism for sorting. Identification, as such, is shaped by similarities and differences between humans expressed through conceptual devices such as ethnicity, where individual identity (itself a collection of a variety of cultural *personae*) is linked to or subsumed within a variety of social groups. These social identities are paradoxical in the sense that they represent continuity on one hand, and continual adjustments on the other. The methodical question then becomes how to (re)construct relevant cultural models for ethnicities that are, in a sense, both fluid and set within contexts obfuscated by the passage of time. Pohl proposes that ethnicity depends on agency between the individual and the various social groups and that this agency, as discourse, can be studied: ethnicity is not a 'given'; ethnicity must be studied in a broader context; ethnicity is a result of social practice; ethnic identities matter in different contexts. Nothing is really added here to the current consensus in this approach, but the methodological clarity that Pohl brings to the 'slippery' concept of ethnicity as identification is a rewarding read. The interaction

between ethnicity, political power, and Christianity forms the theme for the rest of the volume.

The first chapter, in German, is Richard Corradini's examination of Augustine's use of the *peregrinus* or the pilgrim moving within the City of Man (as represented by Babylon, Jerusalem, and Rome) to define a 'utopian' form of ethnicity based on Christian values, rather than the common trope of identifying ethnicity through *gens* or tribe, and ultimately, in a Judaeo-Christian sense, as a Chosen People. In her contribution, Gerda Heydemann examines Cassiodorus's attempt to (re)define the ambiguity within Christian interpretations of tribe or *gens*. Focusing on his *Expositio psalorum*, Heydemann argues that Cassiodorus attempted to move current interpretations away from an equivalence between the identity of the 'saved' and a particular *gens*. While Augustine set aside *gens* and *gentes* in favour of a Christian *populus*, Cassiodorus made no distinction, proposing that Christianity was also a *gens*.

Using eighth-century Merovingian hagiographies, specifically Arbeo of Freising's *vitae* of Emmeram of Regensburg and Corbidian of Freising, Maximilian Diesenberger explores the use of ethnic stereotypes in mapping out competing visions of the political (or ecclesiastical) order in Bavaria. Marianne Pollheimer then explores a series of ninth-century Carolingian sermons by Hrabanus Maurus, written for Haistulf, Archbishop of Mainz. Within these sermons, the Biblical concept of shepherd (*pastores*) and sheep (*oves*) is examined, as it developed in the Carolingian period. Ethnicity, however, does not appear to be fully integrated into the argument.

Helmut Reimitz follows with an analysis of the meanings behind *de vobis sum* and *homo ignotus* within a context of competing constructs of Frankish identity in the sixth and seventh centuries, specifically those of Gregory of Tours and the compilers of the Fredegar Chronicle. He proposes that these 'cultural brokers' mediated different forms of ethnicity to construct their competing visions: for Gregory, Christian identity was key to the integration of the Merovingian kingdoms, and, thus, he did not give the *gens francorum* a particularly prominent place in his histories; for the compilers, the *gens francorum*, as descendants of the Trojans, Romans, and Macedonians, were a superior offering among the Christian *gentes*, and, thus, an aspirational ethnic identity. Lastly, Clemens Gantner explores the changing ethnic perception of the East Romans as Greeks through the examination of papal letters in the seventh and eighth centuries. While, since the early seventh century, Syriac and Latin speakers regarded Greeks as the core of the empire, the Greek speakers of the empire self-identified as Romans. With Rome subject to imperial authority, and the majority of the Popes in this period from the core of the empire, the papacy generally avoided the 'externalising' term *Greci*.

*Strategies of Identification* is curious in its reluctance to apply learned speculation to the fruits of its methodological labours. Papers are uniformly well written and researched, but this emphasis on the 'how' has not resulted

in much enlightenment on the ‘why?’ Diesenberger’s deft methodological handling of ethnicity, and the subsequent enlightening interpretations we can draw from this methodology, are not mirrored equally in the other papers. Nevertheless, this volume represents an enormously detailed approach to ethnicity and identification, and will be of use to any scholar interested in the nexus between ethnicity, Christianity, and the construction of secular power in early medieval Europe.

STEPHEN JOYCE, *Monash University*

**Raber**, Karen, *Animal Bodies, Renaissance Culture* (Haney Foundation), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013; cloth; pp. 264; 27 illustrations; R.R.P. \$65.00, £42.50; ISBN 9780812245363.

Karen Raber analyses early modern representations of animal bodies. In the Introduction, she challenges the notion of human superiority. Her chief concern is the dismissal of how animals have shaped human society and culture in that they are inseparable.

Chapter 1 examines the anatomies of horses in Carlo Ruini’s *Anatomia del cavallo, infermità e suoi rimedii* (1598) and Andrew Snape’s *Anatomy of an Horse* (1683). It identifies the influence of Andreas Vesalius’s *De humani corporis fabrica* (1543) on Ruini and Snape. Raber notes the importance of a monkey, dog, and goat in the frontispiece of Vesalius’s *Fabrica*. Although the animals are marginalised in the frontispiece, Raber argues that their presence indicates the human reliance on animals to articulate a sense of superiority. This implication is taken a stage further when Raber examines the lavish illustrations of horse anatomies in Ruini and Snape. Rather than being regarded as a beast, the horse is revered as a noble animal and anthropomorphised for its fearless strength. The horse and its human rider are fused into an invincible warrior.

Raber assesses the early modern fascination with centaurs in Chapter 2. By analysing the literature of Sir Philip Sidney, Shakespeare, John Donne, and Edmund Spenser, she gives an insight into the Renaissance fear of humans degenerating into beasts. She also reveals how horses signify the early modern need to regulate bodily passions. The chapter then addresses a more intimate connection between humans and horses. Raber clearly states that this intimacy is not simply sexual, but gives a feeling of completeness when a human is riding a horse. In early modern training manuals, Raber discovers how humans and horses communicate with each other through the bodily movements articulated in the act of riding.

In Chapter 3, Raber explores the rather distasteful early modern habit of consuming horses’ urine, excrement, and internal organs. She reads *Hamlet* as a play ‘about parasitism’ or the interplay between human and animal in terms of who is consuming and living off whom (p. 111). The presence of worms and other internal pests in early modern human and animal bodies maintains Hamlet’s obsession with death and decay.

Chapter 4 sees a shift in focus as Raber concentrates on how human and animal bodies interact in the architecture of urban and rural spaces. Yet she also notes how animals have no regard for human boundaries. In her analysis of how bees, ants, spiders, and birds construct architecture, Raber notes how they influenced the early modern notion of the home. She also acknowledges how keeping a pet transforms the home into a cosy domestic space. The chapter ends with a fascinating discussion of *Romeo and Juliet* in terms of cats and dogs. Raber notes how in early modern literature, cats 'are universally understood to be female' (p. 148). Dogs indicate bestial behaviour. The brawls in the play's open spaces of the street and square indicate an 'infestation of violent creatures' (p. 149). Yet the enclosed private spaces of the garden, marital chamber, and tomb signify a quiet rational retreat.

Raber turns her attention to moles and sheep in Chapter 5. She notes how the mole that works the soil from underneath conflicts with the farmer who labours above it. Yet the mole that is blind to notions of boundaries and property ownership makes humans blind to its intimidating underground world. The chapter then turns to Sir Thomas More's *Utopia*, where Raber argues how sheep are depicted 'as dangerous animals' rather than innocent, docile beasts (p. 161). The sheep's habit of endlessly eating grass turns them into cannibals, as crops to feed humans cannot be grown on the land. They also need less human labour to be maintained than a whole field of crops.

In the Conclusion and with reference to More's *Utopia*, Raber states the importance of how human culture cannot be removed from its 'experience of embodiment' with animals (p. 179). Even in twenty-first-century medicine, the human relationship with animals is given renewed importance.

*Animal Bodies, Renaissance Culture* is a wide-ranging study that gives an intriguing account of the early modern relationship with animals and their bodies. The book highlights how closely humans and animals are linked in the Renaissance, often in surprising, shocking, and humorous ways. Raber provides an array of startling insights that are particularly well brought together in her reading of *Romeo and Juliet*. The book will appeal to students and academics interested in early modern literature and animal studies.

FRANK SWANNACK, *The University of Salford*

**Richardson**, Glenn, *The Field of Cloth of Gold*, New Haven, Yale University Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 288; 12 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00; ISBN 9780300148862 (review copy supplied by Inbooks).

The 1520 meeting between François I and Henry VIII, now known as the Field of the Cloth of Gold, is well known to many scholars of the period, but as Glenn Richardson points out in this new examination of the event, it is some forty years since it has been the object of dedicated study. This is surprising for, as Richardson argues, in this time a wealth of new scholarly

approaches such as cultural, gender, and material history appear particularly apt to bring new perspectives to this glittering act of cultural diplomacy.

Richardson's text sets out to do just that, investigating what the Field was meant to achieve, how it conveyed its messages in material and gestural forms, and its impact on the wider European stage of the era. Richardson is well placed to conduct such an analysis, having previously studied both Henry and François (alongside Charles V) in his 2002 work *Renaissance Monarchy*. What new insights can his analysis of this particular event bring to how we understand kingship, aristocratic display, governing masculinity, and international diplomacy at this period?

Richardson is perhaps strongest on the practical elements of the meeting, dedicating several chapters to the extensive preparations and resources required for the Field. He provides many fascinating details of the provision of food and drink, and timber and cloth preparation for the Field's temporary housing with lavish textile furnishings and coverings. In each case, Richardson highlights the diplomatic complexities of negotiating even these minute details, each of which carried deep significance concerning the hospitality and might of the respective monarchs.

Richardson's style is very accessible. Modern comparisons to more recent events such as the French–British Chunnel project or national narrative formation in the Beijing Olympics were perhaps designed to assist a broader readership. However, the rather descriptive nature of much of the work seems a missed opportunity to conduct a deeper analysis, engaged with the current historiography highlighted in the work's Introduction, to make explicit what wider arguments these details can contribute to.

Moreover, for a text in which material and visual cues are so significant, it is surprising that visual sources are not integrated in a more sustained way. None of the black-and-white images included in the inset pages are linked by figure numbers where they are discussed in the text. Pertinent details such as the artist, title, date, or location of the images is not provided in either the image captions or on the List of Illustrations page. Richardson argues in Chapter 4 that the panel series from the Hôtel de Bourgtheroulde, Rouen, is one of the few near-contemporary depictions, yet only two panels are shown in the selected illustrations. Neither is named in the caption as belonging to that series nor does the description provide information on the personnel included in the scenes (even the monarchs are listed in opposite order to their appearance in Figure 10). Figure 12, 'Francis and Henry after Wrestling', is discussed only obliquely on p. 139. The illustration description itself makes no mention that it is presumably a nineteenth-century (British?) imagining of this event, commenting: 'This humorous depiction of the episode of the wrestling match between Francis and Henry VIII is very much at Henry's expense.' In short, a reader glancing through the illustrations or List of Illustrations page is given no cue that this is a far later visualisation,

made in a very different context and for a very different audience, in order to interpret it.

Disappointing too are the relatively brief references to Queens Claude and Katherine, both of whom attended and participated in aspects of the event. Women's own sense and display of honour is not investigated here, nor are the material and visual messages of their attire, gestures, or activities at the Field afforded sustained analytical attention. Instead, in one of the few paragraphs in the text concerning their contribution, Richardson offers a series of rather speculative sentences, not linked to original sources, to consider their role at the event. Of the first meeting of the queens, 'Doubtless, she [Katherine] congratulated Queen Claude on her advanced pregnancy. ... She [Claude] would have responded to Katherine instinctively with all the *politesse* at her command as a noblewoman of the age' (pp. 132–33). This seems a missed opportunity for more rigorous analysis, especially as Richardson notes that the two women were the focus of elaborate chivalric ceremony at the Field and that Katherine was not in favour of the Anglo-French alliance.

Throughout, Richardson seems unwilling to draw upon wider theories about early modern masculinity, femininity, gift giving, aristocratic representation, and display, to understand these activities and presentations. The term 'self-fashioning' appears once, in quotations, on the final page of the volume (p. 209); it is not explicitly considered (or discounted) as a lens through which some of the behaviour and display of the Field might be read. On how we should ultimately interpret the Field, Richardson is at best enigmatic, his final sentence: 'Ultimately, the meaning of the event is declared by its name – the Field of Cloth of Gold' (p. 209).

In sum, it is likely that Richardson's text will become the new reference point for the Field: it provides an important repository for a wide range of technical details and precise information about the event. It should certainly give stimulus to other scholars to integrate Richardson's explanations of nuances and fine details into the wider scholarship in the field and to show how these change or contribute to how we understand cultural, gender, and international politics of the era. This would achieve what Richardson himself argues for, that we take the Field seriously.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

**Russell**, Delbert W., *Verse Saints' Lives Written in the French of England* (French of England Translation Series, 5), Tempe, Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2012); hardback; pp. xvii, 231; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$64.00, £48.00; ISBN 9780866984799.

This most recent volume in the admirable French of England Translation Series published in Arizona has as its centre the translation of four Saints' Lives from MSS of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries: St Giles, St George, St Faith, and St Mary Magdalene. They are of varying length, the Life of St Giles being six times as long as the Life of St Mary Magdalene. The brief account of Mary Magdalene's life seems largely due to the sheer difficulty of portraying a prostitute become saint to a medieval audience. Recreating her image as a protector of pregnant women did not help.

The format is similar for the four Lives. Each Life begins with a solid introduction, about twenty pages long, tracing the creation and growth of the cult, telling something about the authors and their public, outlining the treatment of the Latin sources, and ending with a section discussing important ideas or literary techniques specific to the particular Life. The four translations constitute half the bulk of the book, forming its second half, looking oddly subordinate to the scholarship. Carefully researched notes accompany the translations of the Lives, and an appendix provides short samples of all four texts in Anglo-Norman.

Delbert Russell refrains from commenting on the religious values promoted by the Saints' Lives, leaving that evaluation to the readers. Some of the conventions in these Saints' Lives are absurd and need no comment, but there are troubling aspects that one might expect comment upon, like the fact that there is little evidence in the Saints' Lives to indicate that their God is a loving God. Russell's book would have benefited from remarks specifically placing the Lives within the context of Christianity as we understand it to have been maintained in the later Middle Ages. It was a Christianity that was severely judgemental, emphasising pain and suffering: the medieval God was not the loving God that some modern Christians like to portray. And Russell does not recognise sadistic or pornographic elements: the book in that respect exists in a psychological vacuum. In the Life of St George, God seems to take a keen interest in prolonging George's tortures: George is tortured and executed three times before his fourth and final series of tortures and execution. One of St George's tortures, his being set upon a sharp-pointed 'bucket seat' and anally impaled, is clearly pornographic as well as sadistic. The beautiful St Faith is passively stripped naked before she is attached to her metal rack and roasted while a devout (?) admirer looks on from a distance.

The general picture of the saints that emerges is of highly opinionated, rigid figures, patronising at times towards God, asocial, and masochistic. It is hard to accept these often irritating figures as admirable. And how are

they going to endure Heaven? The image of God Himself varies according to the author of the tale. George's God is sadistic, Giles's is kinder, while Mary Magdalene's, not quite knowing what to do with her, is unreliable in granting her her miracles: a woman who becomes pregnant after praying to Magdalene dies during childbirth in spite of her prayers, remains dead but incorrupt for two years, to be finally restored to life in response to another prayer to Magdalene.

This book is a work of dedicated scholarship, adding four previously untranslated Saints' Lives to the growing body of works in Anglo-Norman now available.

JOHN BESTON, *The University of Queensland*

**Salonius**, Pippa and Andrea **Worm**, eds, *The Tree: Symbol, Allegory, and Mnemonic Device in Medieval Art and Thought* (International Medieval Research, 20), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xviii, 258; 4 colour, 102 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €125.00; ISBN 9782503548395.

This attractive, lavishly illustrated, large-format volume investigates the tree in the Christian Middle Ages in nine essays and an 'Introduction' by the editors. Pippa Salonius and Andrea Worm open with reference to Ramon Llull's *Arbor scientiae* ('Tree of Knowledge'), part of his masterwork *Ars magna* ('The Great Work') of 1305–08. They note that fifteenth- and sixteenth-century printed editions of Llull's work caused the tree images he employed to 'become iconic images of arboreal schemata in the context of logic and the systematization of knowledge' indicative of 'how evocative the tree was as a structuring device' (p. 3). This directs the reader to the fact that the collection is not concerned with trees *per se*, as living plants and part of nature, but rather the ways in which tree symbolism expressed meaning (to map familial relationships, or to point to theological truths by reference to the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil and the Tree of Life in the Garden of Eden, for instance).

Marie-Pierre Gelin's and Ute Dercks's contributions are concerned with the use of artistic representations of trees within built structures (chiefly cathedrals and other large-scale churches). Gelin examines churches in northern France and England (Canterbury Cathedral, Wells Cathedral, Troyes Cathedral, and others) whereas Dercks focuses on southern France, Catalonia, and Italy (Vézelay, Girona, Modena, and others). The wide distribution of high-quality artistic renderings of biblical tree imagery on churches is clearly conveyed in these chapters. Salonius's own chapter brings the Tree of Jesse and the Tree of Life together and narrows the focus to two churches in Orvieto, both of which were associated with the Franciscan order. She traces a fascinating Byzantine genealogy for the Orvieto imagery, and her chapter dovetails neatly with Ulrike Ilg's, which also investigates the Franciscan Order.

Symbolic uses of the tree in medieval manuscript illustration are the focus in a number of chapters, including those by Worm and Marigold Anne Norbye. The second of these essays considers the high medieval use of the 'Tree of Porphyry ... a plain, traditional diagram that accompanied medieval logic since the sixth century, first in Boethius's commentary on the *Isagoge*, and later, in the thirteenth century in Peter of Spain's *Tractatus*' (p. 97). This theme of the tree as organisational structure for a particular field of knowledge is pursued with reference to soteriology in Susanne Wittekind's chapter, which discusses the Tree of Vices in addition to those trees already mentioned.

One contribution remains to be discussed, that by Barbara Baert and Liesbet Kusters, which examines examples of the visual depiction of the meeting between the resurrected Jesus Christ and Mary Magdalene in the garden. She mistakes Jesus for the gardener, and when he disabuses her he cautions her to touch him. In illustrations of this dramatic moment a tree is often a prominent motif.

In conclusion, this volume is a valuable addition to the scholarship on late medieval visual practices in architectural and manuscript contexts, and also to the literature on pedagogical and organisational devices employed in medieval intellectual texts. The editors and chapter contributors are to be commended on this achievement.

CAROLE M. CUSACK, *The University of Sydney*

**Scarci**, Manuela, ed., *Creating Women: Representation, Self-Representation, Agency in the Renaissance* (Essays & Studies), Toronto, Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2013; paperback, pp. 205; R.R.P. US\$21.50; ISBN 9780772721464.

This volume aims to explore both the creative agency of early modern women and how they were 'created' by others. However, meanings of representation, agency, and creativity are not explicitly articulated in the Introduction, and the authors do not appear to pursue shared concepts or questions. The result is a set of essays that includes examinations of women writers, texts about women, married women's legal position, women's patronage of creative projects, their management of finances, and what might be termed one woman's 'creative' sexual behaviour.

The first section takes us to the political culture of early seventeenth-century France into which a series of women intervened through fiction. Essays by literary scholars Jean-Philippe Beaulieu, Diane Desrosiers, and Renée-Claude Breitenstein highlight both the individual and shared strategies of authors Suzanne de Nervesse, Charlotte de Henault, and Madeleine and Georges de Scudéry, for participation in contemporary political discourse.

The second section continues to study women and their writing, but through quite different texts and with more disparate questions in view.

Jane Couchman examines letters of Huguenot noblewomen to show how motherhood emerged as powerful role in the second generation. Patricia Demers studies both highly individual and gendered responses to Psalm 51 in *misereres* by Anne Vaughan Lock, Mary Sidney Herbert, and Elizabeth I in her translation of Marguerite de Navarre's *Miroir*. Anne Lake Prescott considers women's presentation as writers in their printed texts, tracing changing contextualisation of Marguerite de Valois's memoirs across the political regimes of seventeenth-century England, always framing her significance in relation to leading men.

A third section explores women and their bodies, examining the conceptualisation of women's bodies as part of their husband's honour in fifteenth-century legal texts from Valencia (Dana Wessell Lightfoot), and changing perceptions of women's contributions to midwifery in accounts by practitioners Louise Bourgeois and Marguerite du Tertre de la Marche, during a period in which men gained increasing control of obstetrics (Bridgette Ann Sheridan). Cristian Berco investigates penitential practices in the Counter-Reformation Church, highlighting distinctive attempts to regulate female and male desire for spiritual discipline.

The final section, on women and their agency, sees Elena Brizio argue that thirteenth- to fifteenth-century Sieneese notarial records show women protecting daughters and grand-daughters in innovative ways through their wills to bypass the strictures of statutes. Francesco Divenuto explores the architectural and aesthetic negotiations of Charles de Bourbon and Maria Amalia of Saxony through letters directing renovations to their palace at Caserta. Divenuto shows how Maria Amalia was responsible for bringing baroque innovations to Naples, favouring the fashion for Chinoiserie and new industries such as silk farming and porcelain manufacture.

Essays thus span the thirteenth to the eighteenth centuries (a long 'Renaissance' indeed), examine French, Spanish, Italian, and English examples, and consider agency in myriad ways, through different source types, and as it affects women of different social levels. Scarci concludes her Introduction with welcome, if not novel, encouragement to turn more closely to sources created by women themselves, but does not address such questions as how these might be defined, issues of mediation negotiated, or our current concepts of agency and representation expanded. Creative agency, what it can mean for women, and where we look to analyse it in their experiences, is a topic of much current interest to scholars but the essays here contribute to its understanding more as individual pieces than the volume perhaps does as a whole.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

**Smith**, Charlotte Colding, *Images of Islam 1453–1600: Turks in Germany and Central Europe* (Religious Cultures in the Early Modern World, 16), London, Pickering & Chatto, 2014; hardback; pp. xv, 304; 80 b/w illustrations, R.R.P. £60.00, US\$99.00; ISBN 9781848934061.

In this study of European perceptions of the Islamic Turk and Ottoman Empire in the German speaking regions of the Holy Roman Empire, Charlotte Colding Smith undertakes an ambitious project to examine a wide selection of European texts and related visuals concerning the Ottoman Empire and its inhabitants produced between the fifteenth and early seventeenth centuries for a German speaking audience. These include incunabula works, broadsheets, news pamphlets, encyclopaedic works, and costume books. By adopting a Warburgian approach to the study of works in print, the author has visually analysed and situated the texts and visuals within their contemporary historical and cultural milieu.

Smith has organised the book into six themed chapters with the relative placement of eighty images. The first chapter examines prints produced for audiences in the German territories of the Holy Roman Empire from the 1453 Ottoman conquest of Constantinople to the beginning of direct conflict between the Holy Roman Empire and the Ottoman Empire in Europe during the early sixteenth century. Through a comparison of fifteenth-century incunabula and early sixteenth-century prints with those found in medieval illuminated manuscript text and illustration, Smith demonstrates that European perceptions of the Islamic Turks at this time were inherited, and informed by earlier images and ideas shaped by crusader wars with the Saracens, Moors, and other Islamic groups. Furthermore, classically inspired humanist and theological writings, as well as Italian influences, derived from the latter's involvement in trade and conflict with the Ottomans, and shaped northern perceptions of the expanding Islamic Empire.

In Chapter 2, the author claims European perceptions of the Islamic Turks changed with direct exposure to the Ottoman armies, the associated atrocities of war, and the imminent threat posed to the German territories and Christianity following the Hungarian defeat at Mohacs (1526) and the siege of Vienna (1529). Earlier generic images were replaced by detailed depictions of Ottoman costume and military accoutrements. The author believes the diversity of texts and visuals reflects both the fear and respect of the German people for their powerful adversary.

Chapter 3 explores the incorporation of the Ottoman Empire and the Islamic Turks into theological and biblical texts by linking apocalyptic prophecies with contemporary events, which proved a useful tool of propaganda for both Reformation and Counter-Reformation arguments.

Chapter 4 examines texts and visuals produced by travellers associated with European embassies to the Porte to reveal the way European perceptions

altered during the sixteenth century when the relationship between the powers shifted from one of conflict to diplomacy. These printed works by northern European diplomats and artists were reproduced for a European audience increasingly fascinated with the wealth and power of the Ottoman court and the divergent customs, religion, and inhabitants of the Islamic Near east. The theme of fascination and the desire to gain knowledge and understanding of the Ottoman Empire and its inhabitants continues in the final chapters as European text and imagery is explored in popular printed costume books and encyclopaedic images as seen in genealogies, histories, and cosmographies.

Smith's findings of diversity in European perceptions relative to the contemporary historical period underpin those of James G. Harper (*The Turk and Islam in the Western Eye, 1450–1750*, Ashgate, 2011) who claims European perceptions of the Turk and Islam in the early modern period were shaped by a combination of factors including time, geographical proximity to the Ottoman Empire, and the 'worldliness' of the maker. Smith believes the vicissitude in perceptions, albeit with concurrent enduring themes, reflects cultural history and the evolving relationship between the powers that transitioned from one of military conflict to diplomacy during the course of the period under examination. The work makes an important contribution to understanding European interactions with and perceptions of the Ottoman Empire by highlighting local experiences in the German-speaking lands of the Holy Roman Empire as expressed in print.

AMANDA VAN DER DRIFT, *The University of Queensland*

**Stone**, Charles Russell, *From Tyrant to Philosopher–King: A Literary History of Alexander the Great in Medieval and Early Modern England* (Cursor Mundi, 19), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. viii, 254; 7 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €70.00; ISBN 9782503545394.

This is a very interesting study of Alexander's changing reputation, from his early glorification by the ancient Greeks to his damnation by the Stoics and the medieval Church, with a more realistic acceptance in modern biographies. The book has been well presented by the publisher, Brepols, and well researched by Charles Stone, with a judicious choice of illustrations, as on p. 32, explaining an illumination that shows Alexander dividing his kingdom. He is not riding a horse, as is usual, nor holding a large sword, as on p. 19, but is most imposing with his flashing eyes.

On p. 207 of Stone's work, sixteenth-century Arthur Golding's only mention of Alexander is that when young he loved reading historical works, sleeping with Homer's *Iliad* under his pillow. He struck a schoolmaster for denying his students the works of Homer. This shows a young Alexander, ready to strike his schoolmaster for the sake of his fellow students. This would have

been while studying at Plato's school in Athens, to which he later donated 800 talents. His other inspiring tutor was the incomparable scholar Aristotle, who taught him at Pella until he was seventeen, mainly using Homer's two epics and the Greek tragedians. Up to the death of his father, Philip II, Alexander would have been well trained also in military matters, especially as a cavalry leader, and his Macedonian troops were very well prepared for conquests, having recently conquered Greece, and ready to attack the wide-spreading Persian Empire, as Stone points out.

Quite recent accounts of Alexander's life and character have harked back to his condemnation found in medieval biographies, as in Chambers's *Biographical Dictionary*, published in 1897, stating that after entering Persepolis in triumph his passions were inflamed, as he became a slave to debauchery, and his caprices were as cruel as they were ungrateful. In a fit of drunkenness, instigated by an Athenian courtesan, Thais, he set fire to Persepolis, leaving it in ashes, and then put to death an innocent Parmenio, together with his son who was guilty of conspiracy, and finally murdered his elderly foster-brother, Clitus, in a drunken brawl, for praising Philip's accomplishments.

By contrast, Arrian in his work on Alexander, published in 1575, wrote: 'Not without some divinity was a man of this sort born on earth, a man who has no mortal equal. ... His legacy and glory, greater than that which befalls mortal man, have even survived among people up to this very day. Even I, although I have reproached some of Alexander's deeds in my history ... confess that my admiration for him still exceeds my sense of propriety' (see p. 211). So too in the Oxford Classical Dictionary, 1966 reprint: 'the sack of Persepolis was probably intended to mark the end of the Persian monarchy', and no mention is made of his drunkenness, debauchery, or cruelty, and 'He died of a fever, the greatest general of his race and probably of antiquity'.

The main flaw in Stone's work is his use of Latin translations that omit or mistranslate words, and of Anglo-Saxon works that are almost all left untranslated. On pp. 23–24, the Old English text from Orosius is followed by a modern English version, but many others in Old English are left untranslated. For some readers this is unfortunate.

By contrast, quotations in Latin are all translated, but they leave out words and phrases in the original, or mistranslate them. On p. 49, the diminutive *adulescentem* suggests 'a sweet young man' and *crureque vulnerato* means 'with his leg wounded', not 'a bloody wound'. On p. 50, *Enim uero* is 'For, indeed', *illorsum* is 'there' or 'thither', *Ergo* is 'And so', and *quoque* ('also') has been omitted. On p. 52, *corpore* should be read, and on p. 79, *Sed quia* is omitted, and on p. 88, *nimis avidus* is 'all too keen'. On p. 104, *sumpto cum melle* is 'taken with honey'. Finally, on p. 108, it should be *armipotentis Alexandri*.

Besides the quotations, the book's scholarship is generally most impressive, and it will add a great deal to the history of that extraordinary but controversial leader, Alexander the Great.

JOHN R. C. MARTYN, *The University of Melbourne*

**Turner**, Wendy J., *Care and Custody of the Mentally Ill, Incompetent, and Disabled in Medieval England* (Cursor Mundi, 16), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xii, 336; 2 b/w illustrations, 3 b/w line art; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9782503540399.

This is a fascinating study. It provides a systemic overview of a particular theme in medieval English society. Some of the topics addressed include the various means of characterising and classifying the mentally ill, legal and administrative structures for the preservation of their properties and person, and the treatment of the mentally ill in criminal law.

As Wendy Turner points out, existing scholarship seems to be informed by a combination of literary studies and speculation, a trend not exclusive to this field, and one determined as much by the difficulties of accessing sources in previous years as by scholarly priorities as such. Remediating this is Turner's wide-ranging evidentiary net, bringing in a range of source materials and types. This can be nicely illustrated by highlighting that Turner examined 655 manuscripts in the National Archives covering the period 1200–1500 so as to assess the frequencies of terms for mentally ill persons.

While detailed quantitative work sits behind the analysis, the prose is not interrupted by a focus on numbers. Rather, the unique personal circumstances and cases of some of the mentally ill of medieval England serve to make this a very readable study. Vignettes abound, of various officials determining the state of a person's mental health by quizzing them about details of their life, people who struggled with episodic mental handicaps, some of the unique crimes of the mentally ill, and many more, which populate this book with a variety of interesting, and very human stories. There are also cases, however, that reveal less caring approaches, such as that of Walter Wyght, a royally appointed guardian, whose behaviour Turner suggests was 'distant at best', and 'manipulative at worst' (p. 208). It is not quite *Breaking Bad*, medieval style, but it is interesting.

Turner's overall structure works through various continuities and changes. The broad cultural ideas generally derive from the general Classical and Christian milieus, and these are picked up and modified by a range of English legal texts. The tension between legal and medical classifications is also addressed, and is particularly interesting in light of the way that some study areas can become overly isolationist, a danger that Turner skilfully avoids. Questions of competence for the management of property and the commission of crimes explore a spectrum of related legal and administrative

problems, before turning in greater depth to the rise and eventual decline of royal prerogative wardship. There is a discernible turn to royal administration apparent about the thirteenth century and an obvious decline from the fifteenth century. It is fascinating to see connections between the strength of government and the degree of royal competence and interest in managing the affairs and property of the mentally ill. Also, the rise of the use of wills seems linked to the desire to circumvent royal oversight, prepared by people sound in mind and body but wary of their futures and worried for their heirs.

Impressive appendices add to the usefulness of this study. Scholars who have other interests, particularly associated with the royal officials like escheators, the legal nuances of English laws and customs applied in conquered or marcher territories, property, and inheritance law, or the criminal law, will benefit from parts of this study. So too will those interested primarily in constructions and understandings of mental health and illness, because this book has made a valuable contribution to that field.

NICHOLAS BRODIE, *The University of Tasmania*

**Van Dussen**, Michael and Pavel **Soukup**, eds, *Religious Controversy in Europe, 1378–1536: Textual Transmission and Networks of Readership*, Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. viii, 350; 6 b/w plates, 8 maps; ISBN 9782503544281.

One of the puzzles in medieval studies is not the loss of texts but their survival. While extant texts are important, the sheer quantity can overwhelm and present serious analytical challenges. Occasionally, medieval texts reflect little more than banal observations of no importance cloaked in unremitting dullness. One pitfall into which scholars may slip is the misguided assumption that manuscript analysis is the heart of historical investigation. Arguments suggesting that proper work cannot be undertaken until there are better editions of texts – as if modern philosophers, theologians, and historians are deficient in the same skills and training which medieval thinkers possessed – fail to persuade. The narrow focus on texts can result in over-interpretation. For example, not all references to blood and the Eucharist in Hussite texts imply Utraquist doctrines or practices. Medieval miscellanies do not necessarily indicate any particular guiding intelligence while recent taxonomies may suggest more about current trends than medieval ideas. It is easy to construct fictional foundations or veer into conclusions (that is, that texts provide proof of consensus or shared perspectives) quite foreign to the Middle Ages. Pavel Soukup notes the difficulty of following the transmission of ideas from academe to popular audiences. The trail is only accessible by means of careful research and even then difficult to tell if a glimmer is light or will-o'-the-wisp. Philologists did construct new texts and alter old ones, outraging institutional authorities who considered textual tampering

unforgivable. All of these cautionary tales are present in this absorbing and stimulating collection of twelve essays.

One of the emerging themes from this consideration of textual transmission and networks of readers is heresy. After all, heresy figured largely in religious controversy in the later medieval period. The editors correctly point out that heresy was selective and political as well as objective and theological. Medieval texts facilitated and prevented heresy. Lollard, Waldensian, and Hussite texts alarmed the church while ecclesiastical texts denounced the heretics as bats, toxic frogs, wolves, and thieves who lurked in cellars and caves plotting to disseminate poisonous error. One of the prominent heresiarchs of the period wrote that some people accused of heresy were really mighty saints and it was better not to call someone a heretic. That said, Jan Hus was condemned for heresy on the basis of his own written texts. By the fifteenth century, institutions of higher learning were established to intentionally combat heresy. Lincoln College, Oxford and King's College, Cambridge may be included. Modern notions of academic freedom and universities as the marketplace for the free exchange of ideas are anachronistic.

Several chapters are particularly important. The essay by Daniel Hobbins on the distribution of the works of Jean Gerson is a model of careful scholarship and suggestive ideas for further research. Fiona Somerset warns the reader of the difficulty of tracing textual culture, an admonition which cannot be overstated. Georg Modestin focuses on a single text, expertly illuminating context, strategy, and manuscript tradition. Soukup explores the important but overlooked use of the term 'Mohammedan' in Hussite polemics. There are solid contributions from established scholars such as R. N. Swanson and Anne Hudson and it is encouraging to see the work of younger Czech scholars in English (Soukup, Lucie Doležalová, Pavlína Rychterová).

There may not be any particular logic in many medieval texts and it is surprising that book burning is largely absent from this volume. Just as the papal schism hardly mattered to most academics, so likewise texts had no bearing on the lives of most medieval people. Michael Van Dussen and Soukup have given us a volume – in the usual handsome Brepols style – delineating their importance for the rest.

THOMAS A. FUDGE, *The University of New England*

**Wilson**, Adrian, *Ritual and Conflict: The Social Relations of Childbirth in Early Modern England* (History of Medicine in Context), Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. 270; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781409468127.

The increasingly complex and conflicting theorising about the nature of gender relations in the past inevitably circles around the one function for which the female is essential, the production of the next generation of humans. Whether it was a means by which a woman could exert power depended in part on the accepted but fundamentally economic relationships between people in the particular society of the time. Shifts in modern perceptions of a woman's role have led historians to re-examine whether women shared a separate culture in the past and if so how they were thereby enabled to protect and promote their own interests inside a legal and religious structure that gave men primacy.

Whereas it has long been recognised that the production of a legal heir gave most women an assured position, Adrian Wilson, in this work, seeks to give the rites of childbirth in themselves, quite apart from the outcome, a critical role in establishing women's position in seventeenth-century England. He sees them as sufficiently powerful to render the idea of the patriarchal family largely mythical. Interest in the rituals surrounding childbirth is not new but the suggestion that by themselves they might significantly undermine the male-controlled family is surprising. Giving birth without assistance is risky and in most societies about which we have information there were established support practices around the event. Since so far as power within gender relations is concerned there were distinct variations between adjacent cultures one must wonder whether and how one set of practices in a closed environment produced a different power relationship to another. Wilson's analysis, however, is narrowly focused on England and the seventeenth century. This provides a view of the detail largely at the expense of setting the rituals in a European context that might identify some useful differences, which he acknowledges in his conclusions.

He starts with illegitimacy as what he terms 'a violation of the marital norm' and uses the problems it created to indicate where and how it undermined women's position. He sets out the relevant English Statutes clearly but does not analyse with equal clarity the expectations that underlay them. This is a pity, as a comparison with the approaches of the very different Irish, Scottish, or French law might indicate how the English attitude to the bastard came to differ.

His analysis of the usual rituals that established the bonds of marriage is restricted to the formulas laid down by the Church of England. Although he considers that the intellectually different approaches of non-Conformists, Roman Catholics, Jews, and others, although a small minority, might need to be considered as alternative interpretations of the gender order, particularly

where divorce was concerned, he does not look at their formulae. His analysis of the wife's duty to obey makes clear that there were many contradictory explanations of the reasons for this. This, to a degree, undermines the historiographical construction of the patriarchal society but Wilson admits that the evidence to prove whether the ritual, as Natalie Zemon Davis long ago suggested, was a moment when women as a group were on top is fragmentary at best. Nevertheless, he suggests that this is only the tip of the iceberg of a flourishing separate women's culture.

Wilson is selective in the sources he considers. Despite acknowledging that there might be differences between town and country, rich and poor, he treats the ritual as essentially common to all. He makes no use of the detailed information about royal ceremonial and practice in childbirth and does not reflect on the extent to which society may have seen monarchical behaviour as something to be copied. This social symbolism was possibly considerable and may well have helped mould cultural, social, and religious practices at other levels. Mircea Eliade's ideas of the incorporation of the sacred in renewal rites might also fit a rite that strengthens bonding. These theories, however, might weaken his concept of an independently maintained woman's culture. Historians are still a long way from an agreed account.

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*

### Correction

Our review of Mary Astell, *The Christian Religion, as Professed by a Daughter of the Church of England* (*The Other Voice in Early Modern Europe*: Toronto, 24), ed. Jacqueline Broad printed in *Parergon*, 31.1 (2014) incorrectly mentioned the University of Toronto Press. This title is, in fact, published by the Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies and Iter, both at the University of Toronto, but not connected with the University Press. We apologise for any confusion caused by this error.