

Reviews

Ahronson, Kristján, *Into the Ocean: Vikings, Irish, and Environmental Change in Iceland and the North* (Toronto Old Norse-Icelandic Series), Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2015; cloth; pp. xvi, 245; 79 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$80.00; ISBN 9781442646179.

This is an extremely impressive monograph, which deals with a number of methodological and substantive questions. At its core is the diachronic problem of the settlement of the Atlantic islands in the first millennium CE; in particular, the problem of determining the extent of Irish contact with Iceland prior to the Norse settlement (*landnám*) in around 870 CE. This problem is approached by way of Kristján Ahronson's own field studies of cave-sites and stone sculpture, which have turned up new data of the first importance. At all points, however, the attempt is made to reflect upon both the wider environmental context – an approach which Ahronson shares with much recent work on medieval settlement in the North Atlantic – and the wider intellectual framework in which these data are received. This latter critique, which Ahronson develops in an original way, ranges between the nineteenth and twenty-first centuries, reflecting on the development of the modern disciplines of anthropology, archaeology, and history out of premodern antiquarian thought. This may seem a rather eclectic admixture, but it is generally successful in creating the space for a critical reflection on data, sourced from a number of disciplines, which have often been subject to fairly narrow interpretation.

Chapter 1 uses the early work of Sir Daniel Wilson and Eugène Beauvois as starting points for reflection upon the intellectual roots of investigation of early settlement in North America and the North Atlantic. Two chapters (Chapters 2 and 6) reflect on epistemologies of interdisciplinary researches and environmental studies respectively. Other chapters develop Ahronson's previous studies of place-names with the Old Norse *pap-* element (Chapter 3) and cross-forms common to the Hebrides and Iceland (Chapter 7). The most important and original content in this volume is contained in Chapters 4 and 5. Here, Ahronson sets out in detail his strategy and results from a campaign at Kverkarhellir and Seljalandshellir, two man-made caves near the very southern tip of Iceland, which overlook the suggestively named Vestmanneyjar ('islands of the Irishmen').

The work at Kverkarhellir develops earlier approaches of Holt and Gudmundsson to the cave-site Kolholtshellir, where they attempted to relate

spoil from the construction of the cave to the widespread volcanic ash (tephra) deposit of 871 CE. This tephra horizon, made up of ash from the eruption of Vatnaöldur, is generally known, on account of its coincidence with the first Norse settlement, as the ‘*landnám* tephra’. At Kverkarhellir, Ahronson is successful in setting out a relative chronology of spoil and tephra-layering that indicates the cave was constructed prior to the Norse *landnám*. The implications of this are considerable.

The evidence from contemporary literary sources does no more than suggest that the Irish visited Iceland in the late 700s. Icelandic sources, dating from the mid-1100s, suggest actual Irish settlement prior to the Norse *landnám*, but the evidence is at a long remove from events, and the Irish in these sources play a role that suggests a limited memory of events has been imposed upon by a later Christian historiography. Ahronson’s work offers the potential to expand upon these literary data using an environmental narrative. His work at Kverkarhellir – potentially a ‘smoking gun’ in establishing a pre-Norse chronology – is placed in the context of the wider investigations of the environmental history of the Eyjafjallahreppur landscape by Andrew Dugmore and others. There is more to do here – we cannot, for example, assume that a pre-Norse presence necessarily means ‘Irish’ – but the research potential is well mapped out by Ahronson.

The explicit focus on using the data from Scotland to add value to the evidence from Iceland leaves the Faroe Islands with rather less attention than they might warrant. Here, recent studies by Fisher and Scott (sculpture) as well as Ó Corráin, Sheehan, and Stumann-Hansen (Irish settlement) offer data that may further refine Ahronson’s thesis. It is sensible, however, that Ahronson has not tried to solve every problem in one book. My only real quibble is with the lack of an Index; a university press should provide this as an essential feature.

In conclusion, this ground-breaking monograph brings detail and great clarity to a topic whose treatment has frequently been piecemeal and even romantic. It makes a major contribution to our understanding of the early medieval settlement of the North Atlantic.

JONATHAN WOODING, *The University of Sydney*

Akae, Yuichi, *A Mendicant Sermon Collection from Composition to Reception: The ‘Novum opus dominicale’ of John Waldeby, OESA (Sermo, 7)*, Turnhout, Brepols, 2015; hardback; pp. xvi, 360; 7 b/w illustrations, 3 b/w tables, 1 b/w line art; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503530345.

Yuichi Akae’s contribution to Brepols’s *Sermo* series sets out to clarify and detail the systems constructed by the mendicant orders to support their preaching ministry, in particular that of the Austin friars in fourteenth-

century England. Akae undertakes what he calls a ‘vertical approach’ to his topic by focusing on a single-author model sermon collection, *Novum opus dominicale*, written by John Waldeby at the Austin convent at York. In contrast to previous horizontal approaches, which compare a number of sermons from different collections in order to ascertain the typicality of a sermon subject or its form, Akae explores Waldeby’s collection as a microcosm through which the technologies of late medieval England’s entire mendicant preaching and education systems can be determined.

The book is divided into two distinct sections. The first section establishes in three chapters the wider context in which the *Novus opus dominicale* operated. Akae positions Waldeby as an important mendicant preacher and places him at the heart of the Augustinian educational reforms of the 1350s. Rejecting as overly speculative previous attempts to reconstruct Waldeby’s career through an examination of the wider educational system in which he acted, Akae provides a thorough and definitive replacement for previous biographical works on Waldeby based solely on available documentary evidence. Continuing a close textual examination, demonstrating linguistic and codicological proficiency, Akae compares surviving manuscripts of the *Novum opus dominicale* and their use and placement in the York convent library. He thus reveals the way that Waldeby’s sermon collection was ‘intended for multiple audiences’ and had multiple functions for its readers, the Augustinian youths in their novitiate and preachers from both within and beyond the York convent.

The long and dense fourth chapter, which marks the beginning of Section II, is where Akae’s labour is most evident. Undertaking a complex comparison of Waldeby’s *Novum opus* with the *Forma praedicandi* of Robert Basevorn, he anatomises the modern sermon form used by the mendicants that appeared at the beginning of the thirteenth century. Placing the texts within the ‘same intellectual milieu’, he demonstrates that ‘Basevorn’s discussion of preaching techniques illuminates the intentions behind Waldeby’s particular practices. Waldeby’s sermons, on the other hand, supply concrete contexts for Basevorn’s explanatory language’ (pp. 116–17). While Akae admits that Waldeby’s and Basevorn’s shared context cannot be proven categorically, he maintains that the similarities between their approaches are ‘robust enough’ to conclude that they both relate to an identical and particular form of the modern sermon.

In addition to revealing much about the techniques of sermon composition, viewing each text through the lens of the other has the benefit of adding to the discussion of the mindset of mendicant preachers and the paths that they needed to negotiate between language and audience, and the literacy and levels of education of their readers and hearers. When combined with Chapter 5, which analyses the role played by the concept of sign (*signum*)

as biblical interpretation and mnemonic technique to shed further light onto Waldeby's mindset and the possible experiences of his audiences, Akae's analysis draws attention to the hybrid nature of the modern sermon form between text and performance. He concludes that the preachers and audiences shared 'a world of imagery', going on to say: 'The mental space visualized by the preacher is transmitted through his preaching to the audience, who is led to share the space and "see" things in this space' (p. 260). Indeed, Akae likens this experience to the modern phrase 'virtual reality'.

In one of the more fascinating aspects of his analysis, Akae coins the term 'fractal' to describe the dynamic process of the modern sermon, which leading sermon scholar David d'Avray has likened to a kaleidoscope: 'in modern sermons, rather than a single pattern being repeated and duplicated in exactly the same shape, there are a variety of motifs and their combinations, multiplying and dividing in similar patterns on different levels ... The concept of fractal not only captures this dynamism, but also it offers an analytical approach to supplement the figurative kaleidoscopic description' (pp. 196–97). This particular concept is a valuable addition to the language and technologies available to the historian of sermons and preaching.

With dexterity and precision and an intensive and scrupulous approach to his sources, Akae ultimately tackles three inter-related topics: John Waldeby; the mendicant preaching support system embodied in the Augustinian convent at York; and the form, content, and function of Waldeby's sermons. In examining Waldeby's model sermon collection, he importantly positions his own work as a model for similar analyses of single-author sermon collections, setting the bar very high indeed.

ANNA MILNE-TAVENDALE, *University of Canterbury*

Alfonso, Esperanza, and Jonathan **Decter**, eds, *Patronage, Production, and Transmission of Texts in Medieval and Early Modern Jewish Cultures* (Medieval Church Studies, 34), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. vii, 383; 35 b/w illustrations, 3 b/w tables; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503542904.

This volume considers the themes of patronage and text production in the context of Jewish culture in medieval and early modern history. Editors Esperanza Alfonso and Jonathan Decter cast a wide net in terms of the parameters for this informative book, covering everything from client–patron relations – and how they differed from traditional non-Jewish models – to the production of specific religious texts in a variety of geographical and cultural settings.

From the beginning of the volume, readers' traditional assumptions about patronage are challenged. Essays including that of Eleazar Gutwirth

show that Jewish patronage was influenced by both Christian and Islamic models, at times an exercise in prestige and legacy for the patron, and at others a communal adulation of a sacred text for its own sake. Chapters by Marina Rustow and Joachim Yeshaya explore the patronage of Jewish poetry and literature in the Islamic east, arguing that these texts served primarily to benefit and solidify entire Jewish communities, not individuals. This is in contrast to the western, or Andalusian, model of boosting the social status of a single patron or family name.

The political and ideological motivation of the Jewish client in serving the interests of patrons is another interesting theme in this volume. Lucia Finotto explores book dedications by Jewish scholars, who would equate the leadership of King Robert of Naples to that of King Solomon. Such 'legitimization tools' (p. 161), used to glorify the king, enabled the protection of the city's Jewish population in the early fourteenth century. In a similar vein, Michaela Andreatta reflects on the work of Flavius Mithridates in fifteenth-century Florence, who was 'irreverent and exploitative' (p. 192) in his approach to his Hebraist patrons. Mithridates tailored his interpretations of Jewish thought to suit humanist tastes; for instance, by equating the study of kabbalah to that of other authoritative rabbinic sources, he subversively legitimised his patrons' interests despite the fact that they were outside the scope of normative Judaism.

The Hebraist appropriation of Jewish scripture is inevitably part of the story of Jewish text production in the early modern period. Both *conversos* and Jews were engaged in the translation and dissemination of traditional texts for use by Christians despite their polemical usage. Using the example of Cisneros's Complutensian Polyglot Bible of the sixteenth century, María Teresa Ortega-Monasterio demonstrates how the Bible enabled simultaneous study in Hebrew, Aramaic, Greek, and Latin on the same page. This humanist approach to text study in turn legitimised the Polyglot Bible as a reference source with which to persecute Jews during inquisitorial tribunals. Also related is the chapter by Ángel Sáenz-Badillos, who considers Rabbi Moses Arragel's biblical translations and how his efforts to remain true to Jewish tradition were overrun by Christian sensors in fifteenth-century Castile. In these cases, the published versions of translated Jewish texts for Hebraist use strayed very far from the original.

The physical, performative act of scribing is the theme of two interesting chapters in this volume. Both Eva Frojmovic and Gemma Avenozza emphasise the importance of writing, not just for the production of precious books, but for the transformative act as scribe. In Frojmovic's insightful paper, the mitzvah of scribing a book is 'a performance of piety but also very much of social status' (p. 320), where two Masoretic Bibles from the turn of the fourteenth century show evidence that the patron also wrote a significant

portion of the text. Such dual functionality allowed the scribe/patron to elevate both his spiritual and social prestige.

Several other chapters in this volume consider case studies of Jewish texts ranging from the production of illuminated *haggadot* to rare Arabic versions of the Jewish Bible. At times, the reader struggles to see the thematic link between all of the included chapters, but anyone interested in the production of Jewish texts or the role of patronage in the early modern period will benefit from the research presented here. The vast array of geographical and historical examples in the book is evidence of the foremost importance of text in Jewish culture throughout history.

REBECCA LOBEL, *Monash University*

Apetrei, Sarah, and Hannah **Smith**, eds, *Religion and Women in Britain, c. 1660–1760*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 228; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781409429197.

This collection explores the experiences of women during a tumultuous time in Britain's history, when popular beliefs and practices of religion were in upheaval, from a multidisciplinary perspective; it includes essays from the fields of history, literary studies, and theology. It focuses on historical understandings of the contributions made by women to religious reform in the late seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, examining their experiences of negotiating complex terrains and boundaries, while shaping new religious practices and discourses.

Women's participation in, and dedication to, religion were viewed by some as the key to the institution's survival into future generations, and, as editors Sarah Apetrei and Hannah Smith point out, needed to be patrolled and safeguarded as a result. The editors stress the importance of providing a space in which to explore contributions made by individual women to the construct of religion, as well as surveying the ways in which these changing times affected women, an area they identify as in need of further research. Notions of femininity, virtuousness, and piety, as well as feminism, are explored throughout this collection, specifically in relation to the work undertaken by women of the period to shape religious discourses, along with the ways these dialogues impacted upon women. A particularly significant concept explored within this volume is the artful way in which 'polite' conversation was used by women of the time to contribute to this changing landscape.

Audiences interested in furthering their understanding of women's experiences during this time will benefit from the insights provided by scholars within this volume, ably tied together by Apetrei and Smith's initial commentary. Their overview of the complexities of the changing landscape of religion in Britain during this time provides a solid grounding for the reader and paves the way for the in-depth analyses in the chapters that follow.

These chapters explore the challenges faced by women during this period in relation to changing social and religious expectations and norms from various religions. Alison Searle and Sarah Apetrei examine these issues in relation to marriage, while Alasdair Raffe, focusing on Scottish Presbyterianism, and Claire Walker, focusing on English Catholicism, explore the ways women acted as the keys to a religion's survival through tumultuous times. These essays are followed by Melinda Zook's investigation into the extent to which Mary II's influence during her reign shaped the future of the Church of England. The influence of women on Anglicanism is further explored by Sarah Hutton and William Kolbrenner as they focus on individual contributions to the Anglican Republic of Letters by, respectively, Masham and Astell. Hannah Smith's essay explores 'Whig feminist' Susanna Centlivre's fight to enlighten her contemporaries about the Tory Party's almost propagandist influence over women's beliefs at the time.

The final chapter in the collection by Emma Major explores the dichotomy of Catherine Talbot's life. Her 'life, letters and publications' were recognised by her peers as 'exemplifying the teachings of her Church' and as demonstrations of virtue, and were thus seen as a 'public concern', yet at the same time, she challenged gender constructs and roles. Major notes the way Talbot often undertook ecclesiastical duties traditionally restricted to male bishops, as a result of her deeply spiritual friendship with Bishop Thomas Secker. In this way, unintentionally, perhaps, Talbot challenged contemporary gender norms and helped to shape the way women interacted in religious and spiritual spaces.

Apetrei's and Smith's previous research in the areas of women in religion and politics makes them well-placed to edit this collection, and the chapters they have selected combine well to determine how gender was influential in guiding the religious practices and scope of opportunities that were available. Unfortunately, as the editors note, the available evidence ensures that much of the discussion surrounds figures of status, derived from either socioeconomic standing or notoriety. Despite this, this volume provides an excellent exploration of factors that influenced women and their religious practices in Britain, during the period between the mid-seventeenth and the mid-eighteenth centuries.

TROY HEFFERNAN, *University of Southern Queensland*

Austen, Katherine, *Book M: A London Widow's Life Writings*, ed. Pamela S. **Hammons** (The Other Voice in Early Modern Europe: Toronto Series, 26), Toronto, Iter/CRRS, 2013; paperback; pp. vii, 216; 8 b/w plates; R.R.P. US\$27.95; ISBN 9780772721501.

In Pamela S. Hammons's modernised and carefully annotated edition of Katherine Austen's intriguing autograph manuscript miscellany, *Book M*, the oeuvre of a pious, ingenious, and literary widow in Restoration London is presented to the reader in an accessible and frequently illuminating text. Largely understudied by literary scholars of the women's canon of Renaissance England, this elegant edition of Austen's life writings is a welcome addition to a small body of recent research on Austen's manuscript.

Widowed young, Austen was protectress of her children and her family resources, deploying an innate cleverness and piercing self-awareness to successfully manage, negotiate, and subvert the structures of patriarchy in seventeenth-century London. Hammons sensitively situates Austen in time – she lived from the late 1620s to 1683 – and in the complexity of her social location in the aspirant gentry. Through her multi-generic compilation of texts, written and compiled primarily between 1664 and 1666 – spiritual meditations, sermon notes, financial records, letters, personal essays, and more than thirty occasional and religious lyric poems – Austen elaborated a perspective of herself in relation to the mundane and spiritual worlds. This outlook, refracted through a providential worldview, intersects dramatically with the upheavals and chaos of England's civil wars, the Commonwealth and Protectorate, the Restoration of the monarchy in 1660, the Great Plague outbreak of 1665–66, and the Fire of London in 1666.

Hammons demonstrates a subtle and intuitive grasp of Austen's writing and the repertoire of her considerable literary capabilities as a thinker, writer, and poet, deftly treating the personal and theological connection of the texts. Footnotes enlarge on Austen's history, her seventeenth-century vernacular, and biblical discourse, without encumbering the text itself. The short analysis of Austen's outlook in the introductory essay does not stint on interpretive detail, and offers a comprehensible *entrée* to the text and its multiple and various genres. The complexity of these textual forms, their modes of discourse, and assumed readerships demand more extended attention here, a purpose that a short review can only partially serve.

'When I view over the assurances and hopes I have had in this book of my meditations', Austen writes towards the end of *Book M*, 'I have overcome my enemies and my fears, but such is the unsureness of every ground in this world to anchor on as I soon come to wade in deep places again' (p. 194). A viable and often-used medium for women writers in seventeenth-century England, the manuscript form and the practice of writing itself enabled Austen's contemplation and comprehension of herself in relation to

the significance of her temporal and spiritual worlds. Hammons argues that this perspective was ‘carefully tailored’ (p. 10): among the most compelling of Austen’s own idiosyncratic preoccupations to shape her sense of self, and examined by the editor, include her engagement with prophetic discourses and her considerable effort to govern how she was perceived as a widow.

Most suggestively, Austen’s self-figuration as a widow entails a deliberate inversion of this state and a fashioning of herself, as Hammons’s lucid interpretation emphasises, as ‘a seventeenth-century English Penelope’, ‘heroically loyal’ to her dead husband, while also a shrewd, eagle-eyed guardian of her material resources against suitors (p. 20). The scripted multidimensionality of Austen’s self-presentation is skilfully rendered by Hammons who alerts the reader less familiar with Austen’s works to her deployment of the tropes of female weakness and fragility in her meditations to play down her actual considerable material, familial, and personal resources.

Ultimately, however, it is perhaps in the author’s chronicling of the spiritual and metaphysical complexities of her everyday life, and God’s immediate intervention therein through dreams and visions, that the modern reader comes closest to Austen’s sense of self, to her text, and to the world she inhabited. Hammons’s volume, indeed, succeeds in enabling Katherine Austen to ‘the future generations tell’ (p. 34).

LISA DI CRESCENZO, *Monash University*

Bailey, Mark, *The Decline of Serfdom in Late Medieval England: From Bondage to Freedom*, Woodbridge, Boydell, 2014; hardback; pp. 385; 4 b/w maps, 56 tables; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781843838906.

Drawing on a wealth of archival evidence, exhibiting a nuanced approach to historical and archival contexts, critiquing established theoretical propositions about historical systems and causality, and drawing conclusions sensitive to their sometime conditionality, this excellent study is an exemplar of qualitatively sensitive, quantitative history at its best. Mark Bailey comprehensively alters scholarly understandings of, and approaches to, researching English serfdom’s nature, heyday, and decline. The serfdom that this reviewer learned about no longer exists, and the nature and causes of its disappearance have been dramatically shifted. This is one of those rare works that demands that textbooks be rewritten or discarded.

Bailey begins by exploring the definition of serfdom and its role as a subject within wider historiographies. He lucidly discusses how serfdom and serfs have been integral parts of now slightly antique historiographical debates and propositions relating to the development of England’s rural economy. He addresses standing hypotheses concerning the timing and causes of serfdom’s decline, all while subtly undermining those propositions

by revealing how theoretical they actually are. In charting its place in such historiographies, Bailey reveals serfdom between c. 1350 and c. 1500 to have been surprisingly little studied in its own right, and shows how, with limited evidentiary underpinning, theories on its decline have come to be considered established facts.

From this position, Bailey reviews evidence for the decline in personal serfdom in the century and a half after the Black Death, seeking to provide a more satisfactory understanding of the link between medieval villein tenure and early modern copyhold. Bailey begins with a seemingly encyclopaedic chapter of servile incidents by which serfdom can be defined and discerned in the available source materials. While ostensibly a survey of features of serfdom, it is quite an interrogative study of the same on its own. Drawing on previous studies, Bailey presents the normal view that villein tenure in England had 'effectively disappeared' by 1420 and personal serfdom by 1480, both trends apparently commencing about 1380 (p. 61). Continuing his approach of presenting established scholarly views and yet undermining their assumptions, in the chapter that follows, Bailey takes aim at 'the excessive simplicity of prime mover explanations' that often used limited data to posit causes for serfdom's decline (p. 82). He charts the relative significance of manumission, economics and demography, peasant resistance, and migration, presenting standing cases for each while building an overall argument in favour of further case studies.

The second half of the book offers numerous case studies. Bailey presents in considerable detail his qualitative and quantitative analyses of various manors and their sources, ranging across a diverse range of deliberately chosen samples. Particularly concerned to provide analytical coherence in the face of disparate evidence, Bailey sets out to provide each manor with its own chronology of serfdom, based on its own pre-Black Death 'base-line', and to identify a range of manorial types, as representative as possible of the available evidence and the wider later medieval English experience. These are then presented in detail, qualifying the evidence, presenting it quantitatively, and providing a brief overview for each manor. It is a refreshing change from large studies that demand the numbers and the number-gatherers and -crunchers all be taken on trust. Through this process, Bailey is sensitive to the source material, trusts readers to be capable of understanding the evidence contributory to the arguments when guided through it, and provides a good case study of historical research methodologies at work, as well as offering these case studies of manors ranging from large ecclesiastical holdings to small manors held by lower gentry.

Finally, Bailey turns again to the bigger picture, and with the compiled evidence shows fairly comprehensively that villein tenure was 'in fact, in headlong retreat from the 1350s, and had largely decayed by the 1380s' (p.

287). Bailey also complicates the extant narrative for the decline of personal servility, revealing that there were elements of both rapid and longer decline depending on the particular servile incidents in question. Overall, Bailey builds a strong case that the Black Death was more significant than has typically been allowed, that there is little evidence for a widespread hostile reaction by landlords to these shifting conditions, and even that evidence for migration does not align well with regional patterns of serfdom's observable decline. Any idea of English peasants throwing off their yoke in the wake of the Peasants' Revolt of 1381 is no longer tenable. This book has much to recommend it, both for its content and for its methodological rigour, but also for demanding a wider rethink of social and economic shifts between medieval and early modern England, and perhaps beyond.

NICHOLAS D. BRODIE, *Hobart, Tasmania*

Baker-Bates, Piers, and Miles **Pattenden**, eds, *The Spanish Presence in Sixteenth-Century Italy: Images of Iberia* (Transculturalisms, 1400–1700), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. xiv, 278; 18 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781472441492.

The historical image of Spanish hegemony on the Italian Peninsula from the second quarter of the sixteenth century until the end of the seventeenth has, as the editors of this volume note, tended to be 'surprisingly monochrome' (p. 229). Scholars have clothed it in a language that emphasises Spanish dominance and Italian subordination, and focuses on the actions and agency of the conquerors over the conquered. Even the recent, revisionist works by historians, such as Thomas Dandele and Michael Levin, have still operated within this essentially binary understanding of identity. The editors and contributors to this volume seek to overturn this paradigm to reveal, instead, a variegated and richly textured experience. They do so, in the first instance, by rejecting the basic categories of 'Spanish' and 'Italian' as fixed, national constructs. In their place, the editors suggest that scholars need to focus on 'the cultural and political continuums ... in which all historical actors were accustomed to move' (p. 230).

In practice, this overturning amounts generally to emphasising the meanings that Italians gave to the Spanish presence and the ways in which Italians accommodated, resisted, or otherwise engaged with their Iberian conquerors. However, three of the contributors – Clare Copeland, Elena Calvillo, and Jorge Fernández-Santos Ortiz-Iribas – offer analyses that are particularly revealing of the complex, multiple layers of identity at play in the experience of Spanish hegemony.

Copeland demonstrates how the canonisation of five Iberian-born saints on 12 March 1622 did not constitute a triumph of 'the spiritual glory of

Spain' (p. 116), as the Habsburg monarchy claimed, and promoted, only one of the newly canonised saints (Isidore of Madrid), while pan-European religious orders claimed the others. Calvillo examines the ways in which two artists who were neither Spanish nor Italian (the Croatian Giulio Clovio and the Portuguese Francisco de Holanda) translated the Roman *maniera* into a style acceptable to the court in Madrid by combining it with the Habsburgs' preferred northern naturalism. In the process, they became cultural mediators between Italy and Iberia. Finally, Ortiz-Iribas argues that the marquis del Carpio, Gaspar de Haro y Guzmán, ambassador to Rome and then viceroy in Naples in the late seventeenth century, achieved popularity and made significant political reforms by following neither Spanish nor Italian models but instead by pursuing the French standards of Louis XIV and Jean-Baptiste Colbert.

The essays in this collection have their origins in a conference held at Oxford University in 2012. Such origins lend it an overall coherence and sense of purpose that edited collections can sometimes lack. The contributions are arranged into three thematic sections (addressing political, religious, and artistic interactions) and a brief Introduction by Simon Ditchfield provides some perceptive observations on the nature of the relationship between Spaniards and Italians in light of the cumulative impression of the contributions. While the standard of all the essays is high, two deserve particular mention: those by Miles Pattenden and by Robert Gaston and Andrea Gáldy. Pattenden argues that the apparent Spanish domination of sixteenth-century Rome was, in fact, undermined by Philip II's 'counterproductive policies' (p. 66) that disincentivised his clients and pensioners from identifying themselves as stakeholders in Habsburg rule. Gaston and Gáldy offer a persuasive reading of the tomb of Pedro de Toledo, viceroy of Naples in the mid-sixteenth century, as a fundamentally Spanish artwork, despite its superficial Italian classicism.

The uniform standard and overall coherence of the volume make it an important contribution to the growing revival of scholarly interest in the Spanish presence in Italy and in the Mediterranean as a unifying rather than dividing space during the early modern period. Indeed, in many ways, the volume offers Spanish Italy and the western Mediterranean the type of perspective and approach that has come to dominate recent research into the eastern Mediterranean and exchanges between the Venetian and Ottoman empires in the work of scholars such as Molly Greene, Eric Dursteler, and Natalie Rothman. Such an approach emphasises the fluidity of identities in the early modern Mediterranean, the permeability of political, cultural, and even religious boundaries, and the ways that categories such as 'Italian' and 'Spanish' were continually negotiated and transformed through encounters and exchanges. The editors candidly admit that the volume does not offer a coherent, new paradigm for understanding the experience of the Spanish

presence in Italy. They instead conclude by offering a series of questions and an invitation to further research and an ongoing conversation: an invitation that, hopefully, other scholars will take up.

NICHOLAS SCOTT BAKER, *Macquarie University*

Berns, Andrew D., *The Bible and Natural Philosophy in Renaissance Italy: Jewish and Christian Physicians in Search of Truth*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 309; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9781107065543.

The Bible and Natural Philosophy in Renaissance Italy, as promised in the Introduction, ‘explores the reciprocal relationship between biblical interpretation and natural philosophy in sixteenth-century Italy’ (p. 3). To the late modern mind, these two disciplines may seem uncomfortable bedfellows, but as Andrew D. Berns amply demonstrates, the intersections between biblical interpretation and a variety of sub-disciplines in Renaissance Italian natural philosophy can make for fruitful and absorbing scholarly analysis. The book is not only about the role of scripture in natural philosophy, or natural philosophy in interpreting scripture, but the individual case studies which make it up constitute learned analyses of how biblical texts were analysed, explained, and put to use – alongside engagement with a broad swath of ancient, medieval, and early modern sources – in ostensibly scientific explorations of natural phenomena.

The main purpose of the book is to show how many northern Italian medical men imagined scripture not necessarily as in some way especially authoritative, but as on par with other ancient scientific sources; that is, they invoked the Bible in scientific treatises in order to resolve natural philosophical disputes, and in so doing, they ‘expanded the classical canon to include the Bible’ (p. 74). This is made clear through a number of examples in the first two chapters. Sixteenth-century botanists, like Aldrovandi, argued – against their ancient forebears – that to understand properly plants mentioned in the Bible, one had to study them firsthand. And in commentaries on an ancient medical treatise by Dioscorides, Italian physicians like Amatus took the opportunity, among other things, to correct Jerome’s Vulgate. Similarly, Guilandinus emended both the Vulgate and Septuagint in virtue of his own discoveries in natural philosophy; and he and his colleagues contended with ancient pagan authorities on natural philosophy like Pliny and Varro with appeals to the biblical text as an authoritative account for certain aspects of natural history.

The third chapter details a long genealogy of ideas regarding the curative properties of precious stones associated with biblical texts, and, more specifically, outlines the sixteenth-century context of Jewish and Christian

medical thought wherein hyacinth was identified with the biblical *tarshish*. Berns's investigation provides us access to a world of a peculiar philological, geological, biblical, and philosophical make-up, along with a portrait of a physician (de 'Pomi) who put his knowledge of Greek and Hebrew lexicography to use in bringing together scripture and science.

The issue of Jewish–Christian relations in the sixteenth century, touched on variously throughout the third chapter, is brought to the forefront in Chapter 4. Among other things, Berns here argues that what lay in the background of a friendly Jewish–Christian epistolary exchange over unusually deformed children was the question of whether to baptise (in the case of Christians) or circumcise (in the case of Jews) these 'monsters'. The chapter shows how religious concerns, even where there appears to be an inchoate desacralisation of the biblical text, were inextricably bound up with scientific discourse, and in some cases drove the research itself; even if at the same time a congenial relationship between Jewish and Christian physicians suggests that their ultimate concern was the 'advancement of scientific knowledge' (pp. 192–93).

The final chapter details Portaleone's understanding of incense and how that understanding was shaped by his consideration of a wide array of sources, his own work as a botanist, and his consultations with local spice grinders. The cornucopic array of Portaleone's sources not only gave him privileged insight into identifying biblical incense, but also permitted him the ability to make it himself, or at least to describe how to do so, despite the long-standing proscription against it in premodern Jewish tradition. In this way, the chapter is a contribution to the increasing awareness by historians of connections between scholars and artisans in early modern Europe, and a rare – if not unique – exploration of the intersections of pharmacology, botany, and biblical studies.

Like his subjects, Berns moves comfortably between Latin, Hebrew, and Italian texts, many of which themselves contain analyses of ancient Greek works. This book is a work rich in detail, insight, and erudition, which serves as a substantial contribution to sixteenth-century intellectual history, and will be of great interest to students and scholars not only of early modern natural philosophy and the history of medicine, but also of the reception of the classical world, the history of philology, and Jewish–Christian relations. Finally, it makes a most interesting contribution to the history of biblical interpretation by showing how diverse genres and disciplines must be studied for a fuller account of how the Bible was read and used in the Renaissance.

KIRK ESSARY, *The University of Western Australia*

Bjork, Robert E., ed. and trans., *Old English Shorter Poems, Volume II: Wisdom and Lyric* (Dumbarton Oaks Medieval Library, 32), Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 320; R.R.P. US\$29.95, £19.95, €23.50; ISBN 9780674053069.

The Dumbarton Oaks Medieval Library (DOML), which was launched in 2010 and now runs to almost forty volumes, aims to provide accessible dual-language, facing-page translations of Byzantine Greek, Medieval Latin, and Old English texts, with limited commentary. Such editions, according to the DOML website, will ‘make the written achievements of medieval and Byzantine culture available to both scholars and general readers in the English-speaking world’. The series insists on comparatively good quality materials: maroon cloth binding with gold lettering, dense cream paper stock with a pleasurable smoothness to its touch, and a bound-in ribbon bookmark in royal blue.

This particular volume is the sixth of the DOML translations from Old English, and the second of shorter poems: the first was published in May 2012 and was explicitly concerned with religious and didactic poems. This volume is a translation of a selection of twenty-four poems and twelve metrical charms sourced from two volumes of the mid-twentieth-century edition, *Anglo-Saxon Poetic Records: A Collective Edition*: from the 1936 volume, *The Exeter Book*; and from the 1942 volume, *The Anglo-Saxon Minor Poems*. The Introduction does not provide an explanation as to why certain poems were selected from these editions, while others were excluded, although Robert Bjork’s division into four generic categories – metrical charms, gnomic and proverbial poetry, wisdom poetry, and lyric and elegy – reveals a default selection scheme. This is a collection of well-managed and sound translations of many of the important shorter poems in the Old English corpus, such as ‘The Wanderer’, ‘The Seafarer’, ‘Widsith’, ‘Deor’, and ‘The Wife’s Lament’, in addition to a wide array of proverbial material and charms for easing the trials and tribulations of (and perhaps indicating social anxieties within) everyday Anglo-Saxon life.

Newly translated editions are important for increasing the awareness of this literature, for student, teacher, and general reader alike. But this is a popular and pretty, rather than a critical, edition. Alas, there is a litany of absences from this volume (and I assume this to be editorial policy across the DOML series) that will frustrate the scholar in her or his engagement with this poetry. There are no footnotes in the main body of the work, and the reader is obliged to flip back and forth between the translation and the ‘Notes to the Text’ section while reading. The Index lacks page numbers (except when the indexed item is mentioned in the Introduction), instead indexing by poem-name abbreviation and line number. This requires the reader to flip back to the Table of Contents to find the poem. Worse still, if

the indexed item is in the 'Notes to the Text' section (there are two types of such notes: ordinary notes signified by the letter 'n' after the line number, and headnotes signified by the letters 'hn' after the poem title), the reader is obliged to search the Table of Contents not for a page number but for the relative position of the poem in relation to the others in the volume, and then leaf through the notes section until the notes for that particular poem can be found. References can be found within the footnotes that are not included in the Index, and the bibliography is framed as 'selected', but 'incomplete' would be more precise. Citations can be found (such as to *Völundarkviða* and *Biðreks saga* in the annotations to the poem 'Deor' on p. 255, in an important discussion of analogues of the Welund myth) that have not been incorporated into the bibliography.

Recent developments in the study of the medieval text, with greater focus on the manuscript as the starting point, appear to have been ignored in this edition. In fact, basing a new translation on an older, published edition rather than original manuscript research is no longer the preferred approach, and is perhaps best suited to more rudimentary undergraduate teaching texts. Indeed, the implications of 'new' or 'material' philology (contextualising the manuscript materiality, resisting single authoritative 'best' editions, exploring the implications of the inherently unstable medieval text) have not even been acknowledged in this volume. This is old school: in all, a disappointingly deficient volume of otherwise beautiful and intriguing poetic material, in an edition that has squandered a brilliant opportunity. A new critical edition and translation of these poems would have advanced this field considerably. Unfortunately, this is not that edition, but it is a pleasurable read nonetheless.

RODERICK McDONALD, *University of Iceland/University of Copenhagen*

Böhringer, Letha, Jennifer Kolpacoff **Deane**, and Hildo **van Engen**, eds, *Labels and Libels: Naming Beguines in Northern Medieval Europe* (Sanctimoniales, 1), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xii, 235; 2 maps, 4 b/w tables; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503551357.

This collection of essays is the first volume of Brepols's new series Sanctimoniales, and comes out of the work of the Arbeitskreis geistliche Frauen im europäischen Mittelalter (Research Group for the Study of Religious Women in the European Middle Ages) which was established in 2004 by the series's co-editors.

The beguines and beghards that are the focus of the essays collected here represent the new forms of medieval spirituality that emerged in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. The new approach to faith was characterised by a personal and inner-oriented kind of religious life, that reflected the ideals of poverty and penance, and Christ's sufferings and it tended to marginalise

the intermediary role of the clergy. Groups of beguines and beghards could be found all over Europe, especially in the Low Countries, Germany, and northern France. Indeed, in his contribution, Walter Simons claims that more than one hundred and fifty beguinages 'are known to have existed in the southern dioceses of the Low Countries before 1300' (p. 37).

In general, the book tackles the problem of terminology: various words were used to name beguines and beghards, which have misled both contemporaries and later scholars. Even the etymology of the words 'beguine' and 'beghard' has been questioned, but most of the nine contributors stick to the theory that they originate from the root 'begg', and related to murmuring or mumbling after reciting prayers. Simons further remarks that 'any question of terminology raises the far more difficult one about the relationship between language and social change' (p. 9). This problem helps explain why different groups reacted differently to this new form of religious practice and why traditionalists clashed with reformers.

Limitations of space prevent a detailed discussion of each contribution, but two are especially noteworthy. Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane, focusing on beguines in Würzburg, writes about two Clementine (after Pope Clement V) decrees in terms of their effect on beguines: 'The Clementine decrees have received insightful analysis in recent years, yet the repeated generalization of the "common" or "vulgar" naming of the women has been taken rather at face value' (p. 54). Deane adds that in 1320, 'a marked terminological shift appears'; that is, after the publication of the Clementine decrees, there is virtually no use of the term 'beguine' in fourteenth-century documents from Würzburg, apart from two incidences of the term 'beguinages' (p. 64).

In her essay, which focuses on lay religious women in thirteenth-century Brabant, Vera von der Osten-Sacken casts more light onto the character of the beguine movements and their daily accomplishments. Like most of the other contributors to this volume, von der Osten-Sacken relies directly on Latin records, such as Jacques de Vitry's *Vita Mariae Oigniacensis*, for her evidence. Von der Osten-Sacken also reveals that the role models of beguines came about not only through 'external preaching' but also through 'their own biblical studies' (p. 101). And although their principles followed those of the Cistercians – beguines fostered personal relations with adjacent Cistercian women – the first beguines rejected enclosure to form open lay communities. The first beguines are also thought to have originated from affluent, middleclass families, which had become wealthy through trade and financial transactions. Additionally, like contemporary crusade preachers from the milieu of Petrus Cantor, the first beguines regarded suffering as God-given, and an opportunity to do penance for themselves and others, and rather than simply as punishment.

All of the contributions in this collection are very informative and as a whole form an indispensable resource on the topic of beguines and the

issues related to labelling them. I fully recommend the publication to anyone interested in the topic. From a technical viewpoint, it needs to be added that the book is equipped with statistical tables, maps, and an index.

MARIUSZ BĘCŁAWSKI, *Kozminski University*

Bokody, Péter, *Images-within-Images in Italian Painting (1250–1350): Reality and Reflexivity*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 264; 20 colour, 70 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781472427052.

The ongoing importance placed on Italian painting between 1250 and 1350 is demonstrated in Péter Bokody's new book, which has its origins in his doctoral dissertation. The Hungarian art historian, now teaching at Plymouth University, examines the major shift in painting that occurred at this time, which led to a new visual language that transformed the two-dimensional image into a representation of three-dimensional space. This period is given heightened significance because it marks the beginning of the familiar narrative that leads on towards the development of Italian Renaissance art and the growing dominance of perspectival imagery in European art. Italian art ceased to be dominated by Byzantine art at this time, and began to develop its own identity. The artists covered in this discussion – Giotto, Duccio, Simone Martini, and the Lorenzetti brothers – are familiar ones and the sites include Assisi, Rome, Florence, Siena, and Padua.

Focusing on painting, Bokody suggests that the images produced at this time had become 'imitations of reality in terms of their spatial, chronological and emotional aspects', that they were a 'mimesis of reality'. While John White and others have focused particularly on the treatment of rectangular objects creating three-dimensionality on a two-dimensional plane, Bokody does not discuss the development of perspective. While the idea of *mimesis* was to have ongoing ramifications, he is as interested in the more reflexive pictorial tendencies like *trompe l'oeil*, architectural illusionism, or the idea of meta-painting. He argues that these self-reflexive aspects perhaps also played a role in the development of this new realistic style. Barthes's concept of the 'reality effect' is also evoked in this analysis, as the presence of superfluous or insignificant elements can contribute to a work's realism, becoming key elements in a visual rhetoric.

Bokody focuses his research particularly on Giotto and contemporaries such as the Lorenzettis and Taddeo Gaddi, while the frescoes at Assisi provide many of the examples. Like White in his earlier study, he also side-steps awkward questions such as the attribution questions in this building and the involvement of Giotto.

Bokody organises his study into seven chapters, exploring questions around three-dimensional space, the role of meta-painting, and the idea of the

reality effect. In this chronological exploration, he begins with the emergence of images-within-images in the Legend of St Francis in the Upper Church of Assisi where they played an important iconographical role, and served as a key element in the work's realism. The depiction of St Francis praying before the cross of San Damiano is an important example of this, demonstrating too how the representation of prayer was already being depicted in a Franciscan context and revealing how images were venerated.

As the focus of the book is on the marginal or secondary images-within-images labelled 'paragon', in the second chapter, illusionistic frames, columns, and chambers are discussed, highlighting how mural paintings reproduced real architectural elements. The third chapter discusses Barthes's idea, examining both the depiction of architecture and images-within-images and the influence of antique and contemporary models, although these did not necessarily conform to pre-existing models. The self-reflexive aspects of some paintings are also explored in Chapter 4. The layering of meanings was also made possible in these works, and its implications for Netherlandish painting is developed in the next chapter. Giotto's Arena Chapel frescoes are discussed in Chapter 6, while the final chapter discusses the impact of these innovative approaches in the work of artists, such as Bernardo Daddi and Taddeo Gaddi, who followed Giotto.

This is a clever book that reinvestigates familiar, if often overlooked, aspects of this significant moment in Italian art. It reflects the hold this period has had on the historical imagination when Italian art moved out of the shadow of Byzantine influences to develop its own style. This new style developed into the Italian Renaissance. As Bokody makes clear, the trends identified are precursors of Netherlandish and early modern art.

JUDITH COLLARD, *University of Otago*

Bollermann, Karen, Thomas M. **Izbicki**, and Cary J. **Nederman**, eds, *Religion, Power, and Resistance from the Eleventh to the Sixteenth Centuries: Playing the Heresy Card* (New Middle Ages), Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2014; hardback; pp. 264; R.R.P. US\$90.00; ISBN 9781137431042.

This collection situates itself as a refutation of R. I. Moore's thesis that heresy was the product of a 'persecuting society', by focusing on the political background of particular cases. Karen Bollermann and Cary J. Nederman compare the trials of Peter Abelard and Gilbert of Poitiers, both of whom were vehemently pursued by Bernard, the powerful abbot of Clairvaux. The different outcomes were influenced not only by the contrast between the arrogant Abelard and the restrained Gilbert but also by the determination of the pope and cardinals to affirm papal authority against the charismatic abbot.

Abelard also suffered from the revolutionary activities of his former pupil, Arnold of Brescia. Against Moore's dismissal of such conflicts as personal squabbles around minor doctrinal differences, Bollerman and Nederman argue that the participants understood these quarrels to have widespread institutional and political implications.

The remaining papers develop this theme without engaging Moore directly. Andrew Larsen shows that heresy accusations in late fourteenth-century Oxford involved both conflicts within the Church and the patronage of nobles, such as John of Gaunt who protected Wyclif. Papal schism, a disputed imperial election, and popular unrest provided the backdrop to the prosecution of Wyclif's Bohemian follower, Jan Hus. As Thomas A. Fudge implicitly recognises, the inquisitorial machinery mobilised against Hus, and his flat refusal to obey the Church, brings his case within the ambit of Moore's 'persecuting society'. Henry Ansgar Kelly responds to a recent attempt by Daniel Hobbins to rehabilitate the judge in Joan of Arc's trial. Kelly argues that neither Bishop Cauchon nor the assessors from the University of Paris followed due process, despite Joan's pleas and contemporary criticism. A woman's wearing of male clothing was not heresy, hearing saints was not invoking demons, and in the end, it remains unclear of what it was that Joan was actually convicted. The political background of the trial and Cauchon's payment for the conviction are well known.

Guido Terreni was the first to see Joachim of Fiore's exegetical method as heretical. Thomas Turley concludes that although Guido branded Joachim a heresiarch, he failed to shift the established understanding of heresy. Frank Godhardt argues that the pope condemned Marsilius of Padua's *Defensor Pacis*, in 1327 without having read it, presumably on the basis of oral reports from Ludwig of Bavaria's court. The condemnation misrepresented Marsilius's work as a claim for imperial supremacy, rather than as a treatise on secular lordship. The fifteenth-century papal apologist, Cardinal Juan de Torquemada, attacked both Marsilius and Ockham as the proponents of conciliarism. Thomas M. Izbicki concludes that Torquemada had only read the papal condemnation. In contrast, he used Ockham extensively on ecclesiastical governance while vigorously opposing Ockham's anti-papal views. Ockham thought Pope John XXII had fallen into heresy by condemning apostolic poverty. Takashi Shogimen traces Ockham's influence on the sixteenth-century Parisian theologian, Jacques Almain. Almain used Ockham but moved towards conciliarism, whereas Ockham had denied ecclesiastical authority in favour of a correct understanding of fundamental texts. Shogimen agrees with Moore that heresy is essentially about contested authority.

John Philip Lomax explores the legal arguments around infidelity in the twelfth-century quarrels of Frederick II with the papacy. Both claimed that the other had persistently broken oaths, and both attempted, quite

unconvincingly, to accuse the other of heresy. Jerry B. Pierce demonstrates that far from being feared predators upon the peasantry of Valsesia, Fra Dolcino and the Apostolics were welcomed as genuine followers of the apostolic life, fleeing inquisitorial persecution, by a peasantry determined to resist the escalating pressures of ecclesiastical and secular lords. The volume concludes with a sudden leap to the side as Bettina Koch considers the political context for writings on heresy and apostasy by two premodern Islamic scholars. This is an interesting article of great current relevance but it sits rather oddly as the conclusion to a volume with an otherwise coherent theme of heresy as a political manoeuvre in the ecclesiastical and secular conflicts of medieval Western Europe.

The book is divided into three sections whimsically titled with gambling metaphors. The articles are generally short but comprehensively referenced. Among the proofreading irritations is the frequent substitution of John XXIII for John XXII, an understandable but regrettable error, alas not confined to this publisher. The collection does not present a consistent rebuttal of Moore's 'persecuting society' hypothesis but it deepens our awareness of both the often very specific political stakes in heresy accusations and of their relationship to the broader, ongoing controversy on church–state relations.

LOLA SHARON DAVIDSON, *University of Technology Sydney*

Bouchard, Constance Brittain, *Rewriting Saints and Ancestors: Memory and Forgetting in France, 500–1200* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 384; 7 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$79.95, £52.00; ISBN 9780812246360.

'Time's arrow moves in one direction only; forward' (p. 1). So opens Constance Brittain Bouchard's latest book, which deals with the written records of early medieval France. But as Martin Amis showed us in his 1991 novel, *Time's Arrow*, remembering possesses a more fluid temporality: it is backward-looking and contemporaneously constructive; it is forward-looking but steeped in the language of the past. Thus, although the subject of Bouchard's book is memory, it is in many ways also about time. An ingenious structure guides us from the twelfth century back to the shadowy landscape of Merovingian Gaul, in order to 'give the sources their full due as efforts to remember – or create – a useful past for those who wrote them' (p. 1).

The twelve chapters focus on different genres of source material. The first considers the cartulary in the twelfth century, providing useful information about the nature of these seemingly prosaic documents. The second chapter establishes the purpose of cartularies as mechanisms for communicating and enshrining particular histories by considering composition, copying and dissemination, and subsequent uses of cartularies. This emphasis on the

creation of records for posterity leads into the third chapter, which surveys the monastic chronicle as a close relation to the cartulary.

We move back in time to the ninth century beginning with Chapter 4. Here, the famous Carolingian polyptyques are examined as transformative texts in the ‘exercise of medieval memory’ (p. 53). Although polyptyques were very much like charters in that they recorded monastic property, they were not copied and compiled like charters; or as Bouchard prefers, they were forgotten. The need for meaningful contexts as environments for the formulation and preservation of memory is emphasised here. In Chapter 5, Bouchard considers the ninth century as ‘an age of forgery’, arguing that the sheer number of forged charters during this period reveals that the written word was becoming increasingly important in the conscious reworking of memory.

The Carolingians are further studied in Chapters 6 through 8. Here, Bouchard explores the construction of Carolingian dynastic memory (especially the memory of Charlemagne and his family) as a conscious and effective strategy to legitimate a new lineage. This was done by rejecting the Merovingians, dismissively known until recently as *les rois fainéants*, and by careful articulation of a new and distinctive Carolingian genealogy. Both court writers, including Einhard, and monastic writers contributed to this effort. The ninth chapter on the evidence from Burgundy in the eighth century shows that the broader context of social and economic change was ‘a time uniquely suited for a new dynasty to consolidate its power and become rulers of the Franks’ (p. 174).

We retreat further into the Merovingian world in the final three chapters. Bouchard considers noble, monastic, and religious contexts for the creation and – sometimes – failure of Frankish memory. The great noble families of the Merovingian era differed from their Carolingian descendants in placing less weight on the value of lineage. Early Frankish cenobitic monks, on the other hand, always emphasised moments of foundation and *exordia*. Further back in the sixth century, we find the stirrings of creative memory in Frankish imaginings of martyrs and the veneration of relics.

This is a profoundly ambitious book, not least in its attempt to track a path through a vast sweep of historical time. Bouchard handles the range of sources beautifully, and her descriptions of the sources will be of enormous benefit to students and academics alike. The argument that creative memory was not only active throughout the early Middle Ages, but came into being during the period 500–1200 brings something new to the study of medieval memory in general. We are reminded that memory and remembering, like the pasts they create and modify, also have a history. That this history has been illuminated so carefully and insightfully for us by Bouchard is itself a significant moment in the ongoing construction of the medieval past.

MEGAN CASSIDY-WELCH, *Monash University*

Brett, Martin, and David A. **Woodman**, eds, *The Long Twelfth-Century View of the Anglo-Saxon Past* (Studies in Early Medieval Britain and Ireland), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. xiv, 423; 17 b/w illustrations, 6 tables; R.R.P. £85.00; ISBN 9781472428196.

This collection of essays originated in a conference held at Robinson College, Cambridge, in 2011. The contributors are all highly respected scholars. All of them explore particular sources in which they are acknowledged experts. It is, therefore, perhaps inevitable that the essays are chiefly distinguished by the high quality of their technically detailed analyses of texts and concentrated focus on the local and immediate circumstances of their production.

As Martin Brett states in his Introduction: ‘Large answers tend to become less convincing in detail the more they seek to explain’, and ‘There can be no question of a definitive answer to the question implied in our title’ (p. 8). The aim of the collection, then, is ‘to show how many strands there were to this [Anglo-Norman] identity, each appropriate to different contexts ... The lack of a great answer is itself the best illustration of the richness and variety of the whole period’ (p. 9).

The choice of contributors reflects ‘a desire to avoid any tendency for subject specialists to treat 1066 as a watershed in scholarship as well as in experience’ (p. 1). Strikingly interesting, however, is R. M. Thomson’s all too brief contribution on William of Malmesbury. He compares William’s account of the Conquest in the *Gesta regum Anglorum* with a little known diatribe in his *Commentary on Lamentations* (c. 1135). In it, William expresses his anguish for the state to which ‘we’ English have been reduced by the Normans. Challenging the conventional view that ethnic hostilities had declined by the mid-twelfth century, Thomson finds reason to conclude that English unhappiness with the Conquest persisted well into William’s lifetime.

Catherine Karkov’s admirable study of the Eadwine Psalter is illuminated by her argument that the manuscript is ‘a self-conscious look back at and appropriation of Anglo-Saxon traditions, and an original translation of those traditions into a new visual language’. It can therefore also be understood as ‘symptomatic of the larger multilingual, postcolonial culture in which it was produced’ (p. 290).

Elisabeth van Houts, in a briskly informative survey, demonstrates that, of the Norman historians she discusses, ‘only the Englishman Orderic Vitalis campaigned for the Anglo-Saxon heritage to be taken seriously’ (p. 140). Notable, too, is Bruce O’Brien’s summing up of his examination of a late twelfth-century lawbook: ‘Contemporary readers of the Colbertine lawbook could not have avoided the conclusion that English held a special place among their written languages of law, a place in no way threatened by the increasing use of Anglo-French’ (p. 268).

Like Robert Bartlett, Julia Barrow contrives to give the impression that the destruction of monasteries during the first Viking invasion was a rhetorical topos invented by twelfth-century writers, because monasteries wanting a narrative of continuous tenure that connected them to their saintly founders needed to explain why they had no account of their history in the eighth and ninth centuries. Unlike Bartlett, Barrow omits to mention that the destructiveness of the Vikings – whether there was in fact a monastic holocaust in early Anglo-Saxon England – is the subject of ‘a long and still-lively controversy’ (p. 23). Historians, one might have thought, have least to gain from promulgating the view that the written record consists of rhetorical fictionalisations of the past, in which nothing can be said to have actually happened. To describe Alfred the Great as making ‘a fleeting reference’ to the Vikings’ destruction of monasteries, their treasures, and their books, misrepresents the devastation his preface to *Cura pastoralis* is intended to address. Nor does Barrow mention, for instance, the late ninth-century inscription in the *Codex Aureus* of Christ Church, which records its purchase from Viking raiders by an ealdorman of Surrey.

No alternative explanation for the discontinuity of early Anglo-Saxon monastic history is adequate to explain the extent to which the written record has been lost. Much of what we know about early Anglo-Saxon England derives from manuscripts that survived only on the continent. Many of the sources of Anglo-Saxon writings identified by *Fontes Anglo-Saxonici* are not extant in copies made in England, and so on. The paucity of eighth- and ninth-century accounts of Viking destruction of monasteries, in other words, is part of the evidence that it actually happened. There is, likewise, a paucity of accounts of the devastation of monasteries by Danes in the tenth and eleventh centuries, and of the depredations of the Normans. All three, however, figure in Goscelin of Saint-Bertin’s compositions for the nuns of Barking in the 1080s, which might perhaps have suggested a somewhat different argument if Barrow had included them in her study.

STEPHANIE HOLLIS, *The University of Auckland*

Buc, Philippe, *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror: Christianity, Violence, and the West* (Haney Foundation), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015; cloth; pp. 496; R.R.P. US\$49.95, £32.50; ISBN 9780812246858.

No topic from medieval historiography sparks as much controversy in today’s world as Western Christianity’s historical attitudes towards holy war, martyrdom, and terror. Unquestionably, developments since the attacks on the United States on 11 September 2001 have highlighted the importance of understanding the origins of religiously sanctified warfare, martyrdom, and

terror. Into this divisive environment arrives the timely new monograph by the medieval historian Philippe Buc.

In a rich and sophisticated study, Buc explores what he describes as the long roots of 'Western violence' through a dizzying array of texts, time-periods, and historical cultures as diverse as the late Roman Empire, crusader Catholic Europe, Revolutionary France, Stalin's Soviet Union, and George Bush's post-9/11 United States of America. Confessing that he will be focusing primarily on the 'dark side of Western Christianity', Buc relies on what he sees as the commonalities and not the diversities among these premodern and modern societies' attitudes towards violence, maintaining that the 'degree of regularity' in their views makes his macro-approach credible and, indeed, necessary.

Countering current thinking, which postulates that a more militant and more violent Christianity was a particular feature of the post-Constantine Church, Buc argues forcefully that Christianity had always paired irenic and militant ideologies. While this thesis is less revolutionary than his bibliography suggests, it is this yin and yang of pacifism and bloody militarism that forms the monograph's core.

His disparate chapters illustrate that despite outwardly irenic tendencies, the smouldering embers of intolerance could be, and often were, stoked by Christian intellectuals into conflagrations of brutal intolerance. As Buc rightly cautions, in early Christian rhetoric, 'peace, *pax*, did not mean the absence of conflict but victorious conflict leading to right order and justice, *iustitia*'. So, while many Christian rulers and intellectuals preached pacifism and religious tolerance, they spent much of their time engaging in spiritual and material warfare.

Certainly, a deft intermingling of spiritual and physical warfare had always played a role in Christian ideology. The Church Fathers were fully aware of the paradoxical pairing of militarism and pacifism in scripture. Devout fifth-century Christian intellectuals like Augustine had famously come to accept (though perhaps not as enthusiastically as Buc suggests) that 'good' Christians could serve in the military and destroy Rome's enemies without committing sin.

This position was not limited to a Christian society's foreign enemies. Buc argues that from its origins, 'Christendom struggles simultaneously against physical enemies outside, against vices inside the human being and against vicious men inside Christendom – for instance, resident Jews, false brethren (*falsi fratres*, see Galatians 2. 4), bad clergy, perverts, heretics – and against demons'.

Buc posits that it is only by understanding these ancient Christian attitudes that we can begin to appreciate the lingering vitality of such views in both the Christian and post-Christian West. Chapter 1 reveals how American

war ideologies echo these early Christian militant themes. This helps to explain why America has frequently fought ‘moral wars’ against internal and external enemies. I would agree with Buc that the Christian Roman Emperors, Constantine and Justinian, would have understood the notions of exceptionalism and the easy mingling of ‘mildness and strength’ preached by American presidents such as Abraham Lincoln and George W. Bush.

While recognising the innovative aspects of medieval crusade, Chapter 2 rightly points out the dangers of underestimating the extent to which these earlier militant Christian ideologies motivated eleventh-century Western crusaders. According to Buc, ‘late antique holy war slowly morphed into high medieval crusade’. So, rather than considering the indiscriminate slaughter of Muslim men, women, and children in the First Crusade of 1096–1100 as an aberration of a violent age, Buc believes we should seek its origins in the late Roman and early medieval Christian worlds. Moreover, we should not underestimate the extent to which Western crusaders were motivated by an ‘apocalyptic atmosphere’, in which a ‘literalization or historicization of the Old Testament’ led men to die thousands of miles from home in the arid sands of the Levant. Certainly, the recent rise of ISIS has exposed how rigorist apocalyptic ideologies can drive largely devout individuals to commit heinous acts of violence against populations labelled dangerous others and/or heretics.

As Buc demonstrates in his sections on the eighteenth-century French terror and Stalin’s purges in the 1930s, states, groups, and individuals do not need to be outwardly Christian to be influenced by these earlier Christian ideals.

Some scholars will be uncomfortable with the parallels Buc makes between events like the medieval crusades in the Middle East and modern conflicts. Buc, indeed, is aware that his methodology will open him up to myriad critiques. Yet, he should be congratulated for charging forward nevertheless.

MICHAEL STEWART, *The University of Queensland*

Carman, Charles H., *Leon Battista Alberti and Nicholas Cusanus: Towards an Epistemology of Vision for Italian Renaissance Art and Culture* (Visual Culture in Early Modernity), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 218; 5 colour, 20 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472429230.

One of the most significant inventions of the fifteenth century was single-point perspective. It is assumed to have been invented by the architect Filippo Brunelleschi in his experiments on the sacred site between the Cathedral of Florence and its Baptistery in the mid 1420s. However, it was Leon Baptista

Alberti who codified the concept in 1435, with his *On Painting (Della Pittura)*, originally written in vernacular Italian and dedicated to Brunelleschi. From a twenty-first-century viewpoint, single-point perspective is a mathematical optical illusion that naturalises the angles of buildings and defines space visually and realistically on a two-dimensional surface. Alberti's humanistic and rational approach to painting naturalised the subjects of predominantly religious paintings, seemingly reducing the sacred to the secular and making them mundane through his system of point perspective. There is little recognition that perspective had a spiritual and theological role.

With *Leon Baptista Alberti and Nicholas Cusanus*, Charles Carman sets out to fill this gap and to demonstrate that perspective and painting encompass the meaning of seeing between the realities of the physical (the visual) and the spiritual (visualised). Carman's purpose is two-fold: first, to examine the philosophical and theological underpinnings of Alberti's *On Painting* and how these manifested in painting; second, to analyse Alberti's perception of perspective functions with the understanding of visualisation by the theologian Nicholas Cusanus.

Alberti's sacred aims in painting were expressed by his concept *istoria*, which he puts as the highest artistic achievement. Carman claims that *istoria* is also inherent in Cusanus's theoretical work *On Learned Ignorance* (1440). Both Alberti and Cusanus used the tools of mathematics, but while Alberti was not a theologian, he nevertheless theorised from an instinctive theological grounding that coincided with Cusanus's theology. Perspective vision proposed by Alberti comprised visual rays extending from the eye to the canvas in the form of a pyramid and from the canvas, the pyramid projected to infinity. The single point in perspective marks the point of infinity. The pyramid of vision represented the finite reality and the pyramid of the perspective beyond the canvas represented the infinite: the pyramid tunnelled to a divine force, a single point.

In Cusanus's account, the infinite geometry of God's omnivoyance is likened to a similar function of the divine force of painting that forms the juncture of the finite pyramid of vision and the infinite pyramid of perspective. Cusanus's geometrical explanation of divine transition consists of two triangles emanating from the bases at opposite ends of reality, so that the tip of one triangle meets the middle of the base of the other. One is Oneness (the base of the pyramid of light), at the other base is Otherness (the base of the pyramid of darkness). While Oneness or God emanates light towards Otherness, it diminishes towards the base of the opposite pyramid. Similarly, the darkness of Otherness diminishes towards the base of the opposite pyramid: 'mankind's world of darkness and a multiplicity descends to the apex in God's world and descends from a point in human vision to the base in God's world' (p. 108). There is a reciprocal arrangement of the finite

and the infinite in both Alberti's and Cusanus's geometrical structures of the interchange between the sacred and the secular.

Carman examines the key framing devices – such as Minerva, Narcissus, *istoria*, and single-point perspective – that outline Alberti's allegorical intent. Minerva's wisdom and Narcissus as representing the theme of metamorphosis provide a narrative of polar opposites. Narcissus provides the message of painting's transformative power and constitutes the model narrative device for *istoria*. Alberti's image of the *Winded Eye* representing the mind's eye enhances his transition from the pyramid of vision to the pyramid of perspective – from secular to the sacred – infinity. In the works of both Alberti and Cusanus, vision becomes the tool from the invisible to the mind's eyes, beyond the natural world into the infinite.

Alberti and Cusanus shared the same circle of friends and were often in the same cities, yet, no matter how likely, there is no evidence of them ever having met. However, Carman claims that the meeting of these two thinkers is largely irrelevant, since there is a strong similarity in their work and they shared an epistemology of vision for Renaissance culture. Carman provides images to demonstrate clearly this power of the epistemology of vision.

Leon Baptista Alberti and Nicholas Cusanus is a complex but interesting book that attempts to define an epistemology of vision, to find the sacred in the worldly of the Renaissance period in the work of Alberti and Cusanus. Carman successfully argues that although Alberti was the first to describe single-point perspective in its full context, Cusanus provided the strong theological component to the concept of Alberti's *istoria*.

TESSA MORRISON, *The University of Newcastle, Australia*

Catherine de Médicis and others, *Portraits of the Queen Mother: Polemics, Panegyrics, Letters* (The OtherVoice in Early Modern Europe: The Toronto Series, 35), trans. Leah L. **Chang** and Katherine **Kong**, Toronto, Iter/CRRS, 2014; paperback; pp. ix, 283; 6 colour illustrations; R.R.P. US\$31.95; ISBN 9780772721723.

This compact volume will be ideal for use in class readings or for a scholar new to the study of Catherine de Médicis, best known as a French consort, sometime regent, and queen mother, who dominated courtly life in France for much of the late sixteenth century. Her attempt to steer the Valois dynasty, into which she had married, successfully through the complex religious politics of the period left few satisfied with her interventions or substantial influence. The selection of documents translated by Leah Chang and Katherine Kong for this volume reflects the varied textual positions in support or hostility that were taken by contemporaries, along with the range of genres in which they can be found. Such texts also provide much of the

documentation with which scholars have worked in order to understand Catherine, including letters both to and from Catherine, mixed accounts from individual ambassadors who came to the court, hostile pamphlets from both Catholics and Huguenot propagandists, and fulsome praise in the memoirs of those who observed her at court.

Chang and Kong commence with a detailed Introduction that summarises Catherine's access of forms of power during the reigns of her husband, Henri II, and sons, François II, Charles IX, and Henri III. This is followed by an analysis of Salic law and the nature of political influence that this constructed for women in France. Exploration of current scholarship on the Wars of Religion, Catherine's changing strategies over the long period in which she remained influential, and her possible role in the St Bartholomew's Massacre provide further historical and historiographical contexts. The Introduction supplies a wealth of footnotes directing interested readers to further information. In general, the authors eschew any conclusions themselves about Catherine's aims and success; their focus concerns 'the fashioning of a female political persona' (p. 2) in this period and the ways in which female authority could be rhetorically constructed. They ask how the sources that comprise this multiple portraiture interacted, producing the widespread, predominantly negative, view of Catherine.

Chang and Kong carefully interpret Catherine's letters as mediated documents that present multiple voices. This analysis considers not only the role of secretaries and the nature of Catherine's epistolary practice, but also the manner in which she treated topics from the seemingly intimate to the more formally diplomatic, creating differences of tone across her letters. The selection here spans her first letters in the 1530s to those at the end of her life some fifty years later; texts have been chosen to represent both a range of her styles and the varied challenges that she faced.

These are followed by examples of Venetian relations from 1546 to 1589, considered as performed negotiations by different ambassadors between their courts of origin and residence, and as political documents themselves. As the authors make clear, no document translated here can be seen as neutral. A series of selections from the virulently polemical *Marvelous Discourse on the Life, Actions, and Deportment of Catherine de Médicis, Queen Mother* (1575) are also included. This pamphlet underwent nine editions in five years, and was also translated into Latin, German, and English. In retrospect, it constituted a powerful portrait that caused Catherine's reputation lasting damage. The *Marvelous Discourse* is contrasted with the sympathetic portrait of memorialist and courtier, Pierre de Bourdeille, seigneur de Brantôme, a direct response to what he saw as a text 'more full of lies than truth' (p. 51). The authors continue to emphasise the local political contexts of each text, highlighting

Brantôme's insistence on his own authority and access to the court's chief political protagonists.

These key texts are completed by appendices that offer a series of complementary sources, including Catherine's letters of naturalisation, letters sent to her, literary texts of the period, selections from the funeral oration given by Archbishop Renaud de Beaune in February 1589, and finally a comprehensive bibliography. From a literary and cultural perspective, this is an excellent addition to the growing scholarship on early modern gender and power and one that allows an ideal entry point into the complexities of the narratives produced around Catherine de Médicis.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

Chaucer, Geoffrey, *The House of Fame* (Durham Medieval and Renaissance Texts, 3), ed. Nick **Havely**, 2nd edn Toronto, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2013; paperback; pp. xiv, 274; R.R.P. CA\$25.00; ISBN 9780888445636.

In the words of editor, Nick Havely, 'an edition – even a second one – of *The House of Fame* is never finished', and this edition is indeed not definitive. It is, however, an up-to-date, aesthetically pleasing edition of the poem, which pays careful attention to all five original manuscript texts and claims to offer a 'more substantial (though not exhaustive) list of variants than is available in the most recent (*Riverside Chaucer*) edition'.

Like the majority of editors, Havely chooses Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Fairfax 16 as his base text on account of its tidy state and the fact that it is the earliest of all five manuscripts (dated about fifty or sixty years after the poem's generally postulated date of composition). He preserves almost all the original spellings in his transcription, including the retention of final 'e's even where ungrammatical and unmetrical, and is in general conservative in his adoption of the emendations of past editors, or, occasionally, his own.

Aside from the lengthy bibliography of scholarly criticism, the main contribution of this edition is the delineation of the unique character of each manuscript, identifying the flaws, defects, and distinctions between the manuscripts in detailed textual notes. In this respect, Havely offers an authoritative version of the text, appropriate for a scholar or graduate student.

An example of the value of Havely's conservative approach is found at line 2018 where he prints 'Laughe! and eke in poynt to breste' (as contained in MS Fairfax 16 and Oxford, MS Bodley 636) rather than 'Languysshe and eek in point to breste' (as contained in other MSS). He draws appropriate attention to the divergence from the general editorial practice, explaining why he chooses 'Laughe' instead of 'Languysshe', explaining that it 'marks a turning point in the Eagle's long sentence' where he changes the subject

from reflection on the dreamer's misfortunes back to the main point of his discussion: 'the promise of diversion.'

This edition also differs from other recent versions, such as Katheryn Lynch's *Dream Visions and Other Poems* (Norton, 2007), and his own *Chaucer's Dream Poetry* (Longman, 1997), in its glossing. Instead of a running marginal gloss, Havely includes a rather meagre gloss in footnote form at the bottom of the page, and a select glossary at the end of the book. This suggests an experienced intended readership, but if such an audience is to be offered a glossary, something more elaborate than one-word equivalents would be useful. An example can be found at line 1287, where a glossary might usefully have pointed to unexpected meanings and connotations of difficult and/or technical words. Havely includes a footnote observing that the 'berile' walls may recall the temple mentioned earlier in the poem, or the transparency of the walls of the New Jerusalem. He fails to note, however, that 'berile' is also a stone used for the optical lenses of eye-glasses, with the power to magnify through multiplying and expanding the *species* in the medium, hence making the objects seen through the stone seem larger than they are. This reading is not only supported by the immediate context, but can be plausibly linked to the Eagle's discussion of how sound travels by means of multiplication of *species* through the medium of air.

This accurate and scholarly edition of *The House of Fame* is a useful alternative to the *Riverside Chaucer* edition, offering up-to-date information about dating, language, and verse style, a brief appendix containing Caxton's ending and explicit, as well as press corrections in *Thynne's* 1532 edition, and a substantial commentary section at the end of the book. Nevertheless, the revisions taking into account recent studies in *The House of Fame* aside, there is no great difference between Havely's 1994 and 1997 editions and the present one, nor is it the ideal introduction to the new reader, or a reader who seeks guidance, beyond basic decoding, through the semantic fields opened by the text.

C. K. Y. SAVILLE, *The University of Auckland*

Cruz, Anne J., and Maria Galli Stampino, eds, *Early Modern Habsburg Women: Transnational Contexts, Cultural Conflicts, Dynastic Continuities* (Women and Gender in the Early Modern World), Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback, pp. xvii, 294; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781472411648.

This excellent collection fully achieves its aim to place a spotlight on the social and political contributions of early modern Habsburg women who were born or married into the dynasty. The authors employ a wide range of source types, from letters and clothing to portraits and jewels, to analyse diverse political activities such as gift giving, patronage, epistolary networking, reproductive

labour, household conduct, and courtly display. Collectively, the volume provides strong evidence of the extensive forms of influence of these women.

Anne J. Cruz's Introduction emphasises the lack of consideration of such women in the current historiography, although since this collection's publication in 2013, the scholarship has already increased in leaps and bounds. The volume's focus on transnational and transcultural ties is foregrounded, as are clothing, letters, spaces, reproduction, and artworks as particular forms of power. While there is no explicit conceptualisation of the dynamics of gender and power, the collection's primary aim is to reveal the wide variety and distinctive behaviours of such women as starting points for future discussions.

Part I, 'Transnational and Transcultural Ties', commences with a broad-ranging contribution by Joseph F. Patrouch that works effectively to set the scene for the studies to follow. He analyses the geographical distribution of Habsburg women from 1270 to 1720, demarcating a series of chronological phases that marked distinct roles of daughters in marrying out and thus expanding the dynasty across Europe. Maria Galli Stampino provides an important corrective to a largely critical historiography of the regency of Archduchess of Austria, Maria Maddalena, who married Cosimo II, Grand Duke of Tuscany. She argues that the Archduchess subtly adapted the liberal culture in Florence to her own goals, employing staged performances to project themes that she and her mother-in-law (co-regents after Cosimo's death) embraced. Blythe Alice Raviola descriptively analyses the life of Margherita of Savoy-Gonzaga as a young girl in Savoy, in Mantua where she sought to protect her daughter's position, and later as vicereine in Portugal, emphasising the utility of the transnational connections she forged through marriage and extensive correspondence, and the historiographical consequences of this tripartite life across different regions.

Magdalena S. Sánchez opens Part II, 'Epistolary and Spatial Power', with an absorbing analysis on the intimate correspondence of Catalina Micaela to her husband, Carole Emanuele I of Savoy, who delegated extensive authority to her in his absence. These reveal both strong opinions and a significant degree of emotional labour in her epistolary style. Vanessa de Cruz Medina then considers the vast epistolary networking of Ana Dorotea de la Concepción, illegitimate daughter of Rudolph II, who was placed in the Madrid convent of Descalzas Reales, from where a series of Habsburg women exercised considerable power and influence. These studies both suggest that letters produced effective and emotionally sustaining networks of power. Félix Labrador Arroyo examines royal women's households over the sixteenth century as spaces of significant power that offered prestige, proximity, and status. He demonstrates the complex factional politics that needed to be continually regulated, and adjusted across the century.

In Part III, 'Birthing Habsburgs', María Cruz de Carlos Varona examines the visual and material culture of maternity, from votive images to fertility amulets, that permeated the court and placed pressure on its women to fulfil their reproductive duties. Two studies of the maternal authority developed by Mariana of Austria as regent for Carlos II of Spain provide the bridge to Part IV, 'Visual and Sartorial Politics'. Firstly, Silvia Z. Mitchell reassesses the achievements of Mariana's regency against an unfavourable historiography, situating her power within contemporary legal structures, appropriate cultural values, and her determined personality. Mercedes Llorente then analyses Mariana's portraiture, in which she kept herself visibly present as a ruler depicted seated at her work desk, reprising visual cues of power adopted by Philip II. Laura Oliván Santaliestra shifts focus to sartorial politics with a fascinating essay on the body politics of dress, gesture, etiquette, and image by which the French princess Isabel de Borbón became a Spanish Habsburg queen. Cordula van Wyhe contributes the final study of the range of designs, styles, and fabrics of religious clothing chosen by Habsburg men and women to present their spirituality with subtly varied nuances of continued engagement with the world.

The essays are of a consistently high standard, showing varying degrees of engagement with recent gender scholarship. All finish with a discrete bibliography, making them convenient stand-alone texts to set for student readings. Many of the volume's findings will also pertain to women in other early modern contexts, yet in some aspects the particularities of this dynasty's concerns and operations are unique. As more is published about these important women, the broader nature of female political behaviour at this period can be teased out in nuanced and exciting ways.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

Cuneo, Pia F., ed., *Animals and Early Modern Identity*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 426; 61 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781409457435.

Humans have always shared the earth with other sentient beings; there is no record of a human society devoid of animal life, so the relationship of animal and human inevitably plays a part in the formation of identity at various levels. In so complex a creation as identity, however, with its capacity to shift and mutate, the contribution of other animals to the human sense of self undoubtedly alters from time to time, place to place, and culture to culture.

This book is concerned with one aspect of such relationships. The sixteen essays are individually interesting but lack a common definition of identity and so do not create a clear image of the multifarious ways in which animals were absorbed into the symbolism of early modern life in Western Europe

and at certain moments in the wider context of European world exploration. The symbolism examined largely ignores mundane animals such as rats, mice, rabbits, and hares, although Elspeth Graham provides an interesting insight into the anomalous relationship between fish and humans, while the exotic, from monkey to elephant, is seen as critical.

The focus is on the construction of animal stereotypes in literary, philosophical, and artistic discussions for purposes of establishing an identifiable individual identity for particular humans. The moral qualities attributed to particular species – drunkenness in pigs (considered by Alison Stewart); cunning or craftiness in foxes; courage, fearlessness, and royalty in lions, for example – are then related back to humans. The horse especially lends itself to a variety of significant symbolic functions and no fewer than six contributions look at aspects of this role: horseracing (Miriam Hall Kirch), breeding (Magdalena Bayrether), the link to elite identity (Peter Edwards), warfare (Ingrid Cartwright), education (Juliana Schiesari), and as love objects (Pia Cuneo).

The subjects of the other essays are varied and some are narrowly focused. Karen Raber's discussion of Richard III's personal badge of the white boar, for example, shows how an emblem could be turned against its owner as part of denigrating propaganda. The discussion, though, lacks the desirable wider examination of how and why such badges were chosen – the porcupine symbolism of Louis XII or the Salamander of Francis I of France, for instance – and why this one in particular. More stimulating is Abel Alves's consideration of the ways in which human identity was constructed in relation to non-human animals in the early modern Spanish empire. He provides a clear if brief discussion of the philosophical and biblical arguments that were developed in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries about the nature of animals and anthropomorphism. His illustration of the complexity of these approaches and the relationship of such ideas to beliefs in magical transformations of man into beast opens up a fruitful line of investigation.

Sandra Swart also illustrates a critical aspect of the issue of identity: its cultural specificity. When the Dutch East India Company established a 'refreshment station' at the Cape of Good Hope in 1652, they discovered that the Khoikhoi who already lived there had a totally different attitude to their flocks and herds and for the most part could not be persuaded to barter them for other objects.

The most readable of the essays is probably Larry Silver's, in which he examines the way in which the exotic, from colourful birds like the bird of paradise, ostriches, toucans, and macaws to the rhinoceros, became incorporated into European imagery.

Louisa Mackenzie's essay fruitfully reminds us that early modern people could not easily determine what was fact and what was fable, especially when

it came to the ocean and its mysterious and impenetrable depths. The strange and marvellous monsters she discusses and the ways in which contemporary naturalists tried to examine them illustrate the investigations that also underlie the interactions between human and non-human sentient beings.

The study of human–animal relations has been in vogue now for over fifteen years and has brought together researchers with a variety of backgrounds, scientific, biological, historical, philosophical, literary, and practical. This collection, however, makes one aware that we still await a synthesis that will bring together all the aspects of the field.

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*

D’Arcens, Louise, *Comic Medievalism: Laughing at the Middle Ages* (Medievalism), Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2014; hardback; pp. 219; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9781843843801.

Writing about comedy is a serious undertaking, and Louise D’Arcens offers a studious account of the process, to show that ridicule can have a serious purpose. She sets out possibilities for laughing ‘at, with and in the Middle Ages’ (p. 3), when she announces her plan to probe aspects of medievalism from *Don Quixote* to educational television, concluding with the smells of theme parks. Both of the latter cover an ambit from gravity to grossness. The serious purpose is generally didactic, with varying targets and intentions.

Ridicule of the medieval romance happened even in the Middle Ages, as we see when the Host intervenes to stop the wearying absurdity of *The Tale of Sir Thopas*, with slight unkindness to the pilgrim Chaucer. Cervantes forces harsher revelations on Don Quixote. The laughter at ‘his delusional knight errantry’ (p. 36) is grim, but Don Quixote’s fantasies are his ‘ballast against the changing world’ (p. 38).

‘Chaucer in the Age of Wit’ presents that age’s attempt to refine and renovate a poet perceived as uncultivated and outmoded. D’Arcens points out that Chaucer was at least matched in vulgarity by Rochester and Swift, but Addison and Pope thought the coarseness of the fabliaux must be avoided and more elegant verse forms employed to allow readers of the time to appreciate the antique works.

Using his guise as ‘the people’s court jester’ (p. 73), Dario Fo, in *Mistero Buffo* and other plays, offered political satire, to expose ‘the pretensions and abuses of the powerful, both religious and secular’ (p. 74). Vladimir Mayakovsky and Mikhail Baktin wrote in similar vein, in *Mystery-Bouffe* and *Rabelais and his World*, and Pier Paolo Pasolini also used medieval materials. Umberto Eco showed the importance of medieval laughter in *The Name of the Rose*, and those who have employed it in all ages acknowledge the dangerous effectiveness of piercing satire.

Nineteenth-century comic medievalism introduced the thread of camp that D'Arcens follows throughout, with the bewildering cross-dressing of pantomime and burlesque. All art forms introduced parody of other genres, and historical periods and genres mingled freely. The allusions to other performances included Shakespeare's and contemporary plays, and there was comment on current events. The audience's knowledge and wish to extend it were assumed. The audience was also expected to recognise and be entertained rather than offended by the anachronistic burlesque.

Medieval cinematic figures can speak freely in their disguised voices, and D'Arcens detects parodic references in many films of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. The preposterous picaresque adventures of the knight-errant Brancaleone, in Mario Monicelli's films, seem closest to those of *Don Quixote*. Camp references to sexual mores abound, and the chastity belt becomes a recurring motif. Time travel is sometimes a theme, and its reversal in *Les Visiteurs* offers sustained satire of modern life. As *primus inter pares* in the genre, *Monty Python and the Holy Grail* is selected, for its irreverent familiarity with Arthurian literature and meta-parody.

Laughter has always leavened education, which can be seen as the purpose of many works. D'Arcens considers this in some television programmes and in theme parks. There are frequent allusions to other performances. *Medieval Lives*, presented by Terry Jones, intersperses scholarly sections with Pythonesque sketches. Similarly, Tony Robinson, in *The Worst Jobs in History*, often recalls his role as Baldrick in *Blackadder* in his medieval menial tasks. Terry Deary's *Horrible Histories* gain attention as they ridicule, horrify, and disgust, and D'Arcens notes his contradictory yearnings for both 'a world without schools' and 'schools with good history lessons' (p. 151). References to others' works are plentiful, and all may be seen as a counter to more serious presentations, such as those of Simon Schama and David Starkey. The intimacy of television enhances the effects. In theme parks, intimacy is extended when the visitor enters the setting for earlier events. There may be unsettling visual images, and the smells add olfactory emphasis as 'the most effective means of signifying unmediated pastness' (p. 169). All these methods are intended to dispel illusions of the Middle Ages.

D'Arcens's most perceptive observations come from her assessments of methods and targets, including the genres and those involved, directly or vicariously, and the probing Afterword is a succinct expression of her findings. Each example of comic medievalism is intended to teach, counter delusion, make a political statement, or repair deficiencies in the teaching of history. She emphasises the ambivalence of the differing impulses that generate laughter from the twenty-first century, with safety, sanitation, and a Scratch & Sniff card. Her probing assessments demonstrate methods of comic medievalism without detracting from their ability to engage and amuse us.

ROSEMARY GREENTREE, *The University of Adelaide*

Dockray-Miller, Mary, *The Books and the Life of Judith of Flanders*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. xiv, 146; 36 colour, 5 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781409468356.

Mary Dockray-Miller's 'patronage biography' of Judith of Flanders makes an important contribution to the study of the political and cultural roles of high-status women on both sides of the Channel in the early Middle Ages. Drawing on a variety of scattered and methodologically challenging sources, Dockray-Miller constructs a highly readable and richly resonant narrative. This is a seminal study of Judith, and will hopefully help to pave the way for a contextual and comparative study of the literacy, power, and patronage of Anglo-Saxon women and their continental counterparts.

The marriage of Judith of Flanders ('Countess' Judith) in 1051 to Tostig Godwinson consolidated an alliance between the most powerful family in England and her father, Baldwin IV. She is chiefly known to Anglo-Saxon scholars as the owner of four deluxe gospel books, commissioned in England, c. 1065. The frontispiece to one of these depicts a crucifixion scene, frequently reproduced, in which Mary, with a strikingly bold and confident gesture, reaches up to staunch the wound in the side of Christ with her sleeve. Judith herself is depicted as a small, kneeling figure embracing the base of Christ's tau cross, but is nevertheless visually paralleled to Mary (Pierpont Morgan Library, MS M.709).

The inclusion in Dockray-Miller's study of previously unpublished, high-quality colour reproductions from Fulda, Hessische Landesbibliothek, Cod. Aa.21, and from Montecassino, Archivio dell'Abbazia, cod. Casin. 437, is an additional bonus. The Fulda Gospels also include Judith in a frontispiece illustration, this time representing her in an intimate and unmediated relationship with Christ. Judith, here standing relatively tall and upright, is shown, like Christ, with a book, which she is either giving to or receiving from him.

Judith's gospel books are generally thought to have been executed at York. Dockray-Miller argues strongly in favour of Peterborough. The Fulda Gospels, however, were illustrated in Flanders, where Judith took refuge after Tostig was driven out of Northumbria in 1065 and subsequently killed at Stamford Bridge while attempting to seize the throne from his brother, Harold. Somewhat similarly, her second husband, Welf IV of Bavaria, whom she married in 1070, backed the losing side during the Investiture Controversy, and was deposed from his dukedom in 1078, recovering it only after her death in 1094. Judith, however, gained an enduring reputation at Weingarten Abbey as the pious and generous donor of many precious treasures (golden crosses, reliquaries, and chalices, altar-hangings and vestments adorned with gold, jewels, and embroidery, and so on). She is even named in later sources

(erroneously, Dockray-Miller concludes) as the donor of the Abbey's most prized possession, the relic of the Holy Blood.

Dockray-Miller describes Judith as a 'middle-tier aristocrat', who 'consciously and successfully deployed artistic patronage as a cultural strategy in her political and marital manoeuvres in the eleventh-century European political theatre' (p. 2). Despite the failed campaigns of her two husbands, Dockray-Miller argues, Judith's strategy of asserting her social status through artistic patronage was successful, and allowed her to overcome any implications of defeat.

Noticeably, Judith's wealth seems to have served more to assert her own social status than to shore up the power and prestige of her successive husbands. Dockray-Miller argues persuasively that she gave the Monte Casino Gospels to the Dowager Empress Agnes in 1072 to supplement Welf's diplomacy. But Judith is not known to have donated any of her treasures to Weingarten Abbey during her lifetime, despite its close links with Welf's dynasty. Durham, according to Symeon, received many splendid gifts from Tostig, as well as from Judith, but only one of these, a set of gold and silver crucifixion sculptures, is described as a joint donation. So, too, Judith's gospel books were designed for display in her household and private chapel, although, to understand their full effect, we probably need to recall St Margaret of Scotland's habit of carrying her favourite gospel book in public. As Dockray-Miller points out, the gospel book depictions of Judith contrast markedly with analogous contemporary portraits, which depict married couples as co-donors.

Nor is there any evidence that Judith aided Tostig's bid for the English throne, even though her wealth derived from Tostig's treasury, as well as from her father. Perhaps the explanation for the individualistic nature of her patronage, and for the autonomous manner in which she is said to have contracted her marriage to Welf IV, is her independent possession of a significant amount of portable wealth. Perhaps, too, the possession and donation of portable treasures, rather than land, was not only characteristic of 'middle-tier' aristocrats but the practical choice of ruling-class women like Judith whose marital alliances took them far from home into foreign lands.

STEPHANIE HOLLIS, *The University of Auckland*

Eckhardt, Joshua, and Daniel Starza **Smith**, eds, *Manuscript Miscellanies in Early Modern England* (Material Readings in Early Modern Culture), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 270; 13 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781472420275.

Like many a miscellany, this volume contains a fascinating selection of texts. In the Introduction, the editors, Joshua Eckhardt and Daniel Starza Smith, chart

the history of the term ‘miscellany’ and the phenomenon of miscellanies, and address some of the main scholarly uses of manuscript miscellanies. In short, miscellanies have been used for literary, historiographical, and palaeographical studies of individual texts and authors, but more recently a shift has occurred to examining miscellanies as whole volumes, exploring their varied meanings for authors, compilers, multiple owners, and varied readers. The volume largely builds on this approach of studying miscellanies in the whole, oftentimes in tandem with other texts.

Smith’s essay sets straight to this task, studying how its constituent parts become incorporated into a miscellany volume, focusing on textual materiality before, during, and after compilation. He examines manuscripts, folds, handwriting, and the like to reconstruct a potential original manuscript of John Donne’s *Satyrs*. Smith poses thoughtful questions about whether and when miscellany texts were the termination of a circulating text. Continuing the focus on Donne, Piers Brown explores the term ‘Rhapsody’, and unsettles too-confident definitions of what constituted a miscellany, as opposed to other definable textual collections like anthology. This also provides a means of looking for order within the apparent disorder of a miscellany, and the treatment of contemporary quotation habits in this essay is particularly interesting.

James Daybell’s contribution unpacks notions of letter-writing and model letters. He posits that such letters were not necessarily for simple copying, but were often intended to be politically constructive and personally informative, and to provide moral formation and some basic education. Noah Millstone’s study of prophetic texts highlights the problems of reading such prophecies, both for scholars and for contemporaries. Demonstrating contemporary cynicism and fascination interacting with such texts, Millstone offers some bold conclusions.

Helen Hackett’s study of Huntington Library, MS MH 904 offers a convincing attribution of the ‘Hand B Scribe’, and will be of interest to scholars of English recusants. Hackett also provides a detailed survey of how one volume changed over time, with a formerly quite domestic text reconfigured by the deliberate filling of blank pages. Complementing Hackett’s contribution, Cedric C. Brown examines three manuscript miscellanies to map out connections relating to recusant networks and the activities of the Jesuit missionary William Smith, vere Southerne, and extend earlier work about Catholic networks.

Lara M. Crowley takes an intriguing approach to the issue of writers’ canons, noting that manuscript miscellanies often contain apocryphal and non-canonical works, and uses this fact to develop a wider view of the possibilities offered to explore contemporary readings. Crowley thus moves from staid scholarly assumptions about scribal idiocy or incompetency, and

copying chains that replicate mistakes, to being more open to the possibilities that dubious attributions may be authentic and, more importantly, were seen that way by contemporaries. Following the theme of scribal copying, Joel Swann challenges simplistic interpretations of the relationship between text and scribe, to explore issues of intent and varied reading patterns and habits. Continuing the scribal focus, Eckhardt explores one scribe's discernible oscillation between serious and satirical material, highlighting the need to be sensitive to the literary aesthetics and abilities of scribes.

Finally, Victoria E. Burke concludes with a focus on the aesthetic tastes of one particular compiler. In this case study, Donne's popularity, the theme of moderation, classical excerpts, and the compiler's personal interest in sounds, all provide insights into the changing tastes of one individual reader, firmly concluding the volume with an illustration of the benefits to be had from studying medieval miscellanies in the whole.

Overall, this volume contains a delightful selection of essays. It will be of interest to scholars with particular interests like Donne or English recusants, who might choose the pages related to these topics. And, following its own overall logic, it will be of interest to those willing to approach it in its deceptively miscellaneous whole.

NICHOLAS D. BRODIE, *Hobart, Tasmania*

Eriksen, Stefka Georgieva, *Writing and Reading in Medieval Manuscript Culture: The Translation and Transmission of the Story of Elye in Old French and Old Norse Literary Contexts* (Medieval Texts and Cultures of Northern Europe, 25), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xxii, 262; 12 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503547794.

Stefka Eriksen's notable first book derives from her doctoral research, produced under the auspices of the project, 'Translation, Transmission and Transformation: Old Norse Romantic Fiction and Scandinavian Vernacular Literacy, 1200–1500', at the University of Oslo (2007–11). The project investigated the transformation of literary genres within their social settings by combining historical and philological perspectives to emphasise the importance of manuscript culture and its context. Eriksen's research took its cues from this framework and her study analyses attitudes to reading and writing by comparing three manuscript versions of one text – the Crusade story of Elye and his Saracen princess, Rosamunda – in three historical contexts (late thirteenth-century Flanders and Norway and early fifteenth-century Iceland).

In the first chapter, which defines her methodological approach, Eriksen states that one of her main concerns is philological and she asks: 'what did writing and reading imply in the Middle Ages?' (p. 7). In response to this

question, the author formulates an approach that synthesises elements of traditional and 'new' philology (text-versions and materiality, text-generating, translating, and copying), discussions of orality and literacy, and translation theory, arguing that the text and context define each other. The study is thus based on three main principles: that each version of a text-work is an intelligent response to a previous version and all versions should be considered significant; that all aspects of a text (i.e., material and textual) should be taken into account when it is being interpreted; and that texts are conditioned by social, historical, and cultural contexts while at the same time responding to the potential communicative context.

Eriksen presents three methodical case studies in Chapters 2 to 4. Each begins with an outline of the historical context, which is followed by an analysis of the correspondence between aspects of the materiality of a manuscript (such as codicological structure, texts, illuminations, marginalia, rubrics, abbreviations, and punctuation) and the textual and literary aspects. This is done through an examination of the *mise en livre*, *mise en page*, and *mise en texte*.

The subject of the first case study is the only Old French medieval manuscript to contain the *chanson de geste* of *Elye de Saint-Gille* (BnF, MS FR. 25516). The examination of this manuscript leads Erikson to conclude that it was created by a coherent production unit, commissioned by a patron of high social status. Written within the Latin literary paradigm at a scribal centre of prestige (possibly in north-east France and related to the House of Flanders), and conforming to contemporary Old French *chanson de geste* characteristics in its layout, structuring, punctuation, and abbreviation, Eriksen demonstrates how these aspects, alongside the intricate structural strategies, suggest that it was created by a highly competent scribe and illuminator. Based on the correspondence between graphical and textual features, Eriksen argues that the story was meant to be performed; however, she stresses that this did not preclude private reading. This manuscript, Eriksen argues, was meant 'to hover in between the spheres of literate and oral discourse' (p. 100), suggesting that these domains were not diametrically opposed.

The second case study is of the thirteenth-century Norwegian version of *Eliss saga* appearing in De La Gardie 4-7 fol. This manuscript was produced in a dynamic literary milieu, possibly related to the royal court. Once again, Eriksen demonstrates how it appears to be a coherent entity, produced by different scribes and rubricators who worked in close cooperation. Eriksen skilfully illustrates how, even though it was produced during a time when the Norwegian court was under considerable influence from European politics and culture, the text was adapted to the norms of Norwegian scribal culture.

Unlike the subjects of the first two case studies, the final manuscript (Holm Perg 6 4to) is not the sole surviving copy of *Eliss saga* from Iceland, but

Erikson does not provide a rationale for its selection over other copies, such as Holm Perg 7 fol. Furthermore, as an early fifteenth-century work, this case is a chronological outlier. Nonetheless, as a single production unit from an environment of intense literary activity, the text and context provide the basis for comparative study. The empirical evidence presented by Eriksen strongly suggests that it was intended as a private book; less certain is the evidence that it could have been used for a vocal performance. Eriksen elucidates how textual and rhetorical features alongside the use of initials, majuscules, and punctuation may indicate vocal performance. Yet, a lack of prose rhythm and illustrations counter this supposition. It is possible, though, that the private owner enjoyed the text by reading aloud, without an audience.

In the fifth and final chapter, Eriksen presents a comparative analysis of the three manuscripts, which also serves to conclude the book. The three versions differ in terms of both content and the codicological, literary, and historical contexts in which they were produced and read. Additionally, Eriksen's comparative analysis of the material and textual suggests a different writing process and reception mode for each. A comparison of the French and Norwegian versions shows that a process of inter-lingual translation has resulted in the transfer of aspects of the source culture to the target culture, most notably in the *mise en livre*. In contrast, the *mise en page* and *mise en texte* are characterised by adaptation and replacement. Thus, the Old Norse version is argued to be 'an active and contributing response to its European source culture, rather than a passive and servile reproduction' (p. 220). By comparing the intra-lingual transmission of *Elíss saga*, Eriksen shows that adaptation occurred at all three levels and that the process may be characterised as 'hermeneutically and cognitively dynamic' (p. 225). Thus, Eriksen finds that inter-lingual processes bring about more innovations than intra-lingual ones. Inter-lingual transmission (Old French to Old Norse) adapted to the local standards but also introduced something new, whereas the intra-lingual process adapted to fit within an existing literary standard.

With this monograph, Eriksen's aim to make a contribution to discussions about writing and reading in the Middle Ages through a diachronic, multicultural, and interdisciplinary approach, is realised. Not only does the research demonstrate the dynamic relationship between, and relevance of, vernacular textual cultures, it provides a theoretical and methodological framework that others might apply. Eriksen's insightful research method bridges philological methods in order to view the texts from within, while her historical approach looks outwards and situates the manuscripts in their political, literary, and cultural contexts. The result is a polyphonic study that will be relevant well beyond the spheres of Old Norse and Old French studies.

KIMBERLEY-JOY KNIGHT, *The University of Sydney*

Evans, Jennifer, *Aphrodisiacs, Fertility and Medicine in Early Modern England* (Royal Historical Society Studies in History), Woodbridge, Boydell, 2014; hardback; pp. 225; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £50.00; ISBN 9780861933242.

Oysters, artichokes, and new-laid eggs: provokers of venery or medicaments for infertility? Jennifer Evans explores the role of aphrodisiacs in early modern England. According to early modern medical and popular understandings, various consumables could both stimulate lust and enhance the generative body. Evans's study focuses on how the consumption of aphrodisiacs was considered one of the viable treatments for infertility, with others including soft beds and hot baths, from 1550 to 1780. Through the analysis of printed and manuscript sources, the author argues that, though restricted within the sphere of marriage, early modern England had both a knowledge of what constituted 'provoker[s] of lust', and a belief that such foods and other substances affected the body's reproductive processes.

Early modern knowledge of the sexual body and generation was disseminated through a diverse range of literary genres, from erotic literature to household recipe collections. The author asserts that an understanding of how views on sexual and reproductive bodies were inextricably intertwined is essential to historicising aphrodisiacs. In a statement alluding to Galen's two-seed theory of sex and humoral theory, early modern theologian, Isbrand van Diemerbroeck, observed that 'there is in the Seed of all Creatures, that which renders the Seed fruitful, and is called Heat' (pp. 56–57). Without an initial sexual desire 'heating' the body and thereby stimulating the sexual organs, it was believed that conception would be unsuccessful. While the use of aphrodisiacs did not neatly conform to either Galen's two-seed or Aristotle's one-seed theory of reproduction, the practice did highlight the continuity of humoral theory in early modern England.

Medical writers in the sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth centuries believed that a failure to conceive could be largely attributed to a loss of heat, a deprivation of seed, or a loss of sexual pleasure. Evans asserts that aphrodisiacs constituted a clearly delineated category of medications in the early modern period, with one of their key functions being to ameliorate the suspected causes of infertility. Irrespective of whether the cause of infertility was believed to be natural or magical, the ingestion of natural substances, such as aphrodisiacs, was consistently proffered as an effective treatment. Indeed, scepticism as to the reality of witchcraft in the late seventeenth and eighteenth centuries led to medical writers identifying other causes of infertility, such as anaphrodisiacs, rather than enchanted objects or ligature spells. Curiously, the author also draws a link between aphrodisiacs and emmenagogues, indicating that aphrodisiacs were believed to play a role in improving fertility even outside of the act of sexual intercourse.

Aphrodisiacs were grouped into four main types: hot foods and heating herbs (e.g., rocket, mustard, pepper); nourishing foods and seed provokers (e.g., parsnips, crab, quail); windy meats and flatulent foods (e.g., beans, peas, pine nuts); and sympathetic stimulation and the doctrine of signatures (e.g., satyrium, carrots, acorns). The author observes that many of the grouped aphrodisiacs were thought to have multiple properties, and could fall into more than one of the above classes. It should be noted that windy meats were a contested category, and ultimately discarded upon the late seventeenth-century medical finding that the male erection was driven by a series of blood vessels, as opposed to wind.

Ideas about aphrodisiacs in the early modern period were ubiquitous and dynamic. Anatomical discoveries led to shifts in which substances were considered effective. An initial belief in the ability of aphrodisiacs to also prevent miscarriage had faded by the eighteenth century. The author attributes this particular shift to an emerging sense of food and medicine as distinct entities. Similarly, while aphrodisiacs were initially considered to have universal application, by the eighteenth century, they were increasingly becoming gendered.

Evans offers an engaging and thorough analysis of the changing role of aphrodisiacs in early modern England. This text presents an integrated view of early modern sexual health practices, revealing an intriguing link between abortifacients and aphrodisiacs. It is well researched and incorporates a wealth of detail from a diverse range of contemporary source materials.

JANE BITOMSKY, *The University of Queensland*

Fraeters, Veerle, and Imke de Gier, eds, *'Mulieres Religiosae': Shaping Female Spiritual Authority in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods* (Europa Sacra, 12), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xx, 311; 8 colour, 26 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503549125.

'*Mulieres religiosae*' usually describes the semi-religious lay women who emerged in the early thirteenth century as exponents of a new form of spirituality. This collection extends the term to religious women in general, and aims to examine 'the nuances of what constitutes female spiritual authority, how it was acquired and manifested by religious women, and how it changed and evolved' (p. 1). The contributors adopt a critical approach that shifts focus away from the limitations that could restrict women to instead investigate how women negotiated their circumstances to assert their own voices. Originating in a conference in Antwerp in 2007, the twelve case studies analyse the exercise of female spiritual authority within the Catholic tradition. Geographically, the chapters cover England to Hungary, Sweden to Italy, and chronologically span the late tenth to the seventeenth centuries.

Several contributors examine how individual women negotiated the tensions inherent in speaking publicly or writing on spiritual matters. María Eugenia Góngora discusses how the twelfth-century German visionary Elisabeth of Schönau used her visions on the authenticity of the relics of St Ursula to navigate the expectations of ecclesiastical authority and those of her own community, and to, ultimately, maintain the legitimacy of her spiritual authority. Imke de Gier examines the assertion of authority in Marguerite Porete's vernacular treatise *Le miroir des simple ames*, contending that by claiming to articulate the authority of God's words, the book provided readers with the means for potential transformation into the radical state of freeness the author described as 'annihilation'. In a subtle reading of the shifts in discursive registers in the Long Text of Julian of Norwich's *Showings*, Kathleen M. Smith explores the poetic, spiritual, and political functions of Julian's 'vernacular incantatory rhythms' (p. 188), which the visionary employed to underline the authority of her theological interpretation.

Women also sought to establish themselves as exempla of new modes of female religiosity. Vicktória Hedvig Deák explores how Margaret of Hungary drew on the models of her aunt, St Elisabeth, and stories about the piety of the *mulieres religiosae* mediated by her Dominican confessor, to fashion herself as the first (recorded) exponent of a new spirituality in Hungary. Piroska Nagy examines the role of physical afflictions and emotional states as bases for interpreting spiritual authority in her study of the little-known Cistercian nun, Lukardis of Oberweimar. In a sensitive reading of Lukardis's *vita*, Nagy draws attention to the importance of communal relations and expectations in interpreting somatic experience as a valid sign of holiness, and highlights the delicate tension between individual aspiration and communal self-perception.

Spiritual authority could also be exercised by women by virtue of their office as religious superior. In one of the strongest chapters in the collection, Ping-Yuan Wang takes up this important and often overlooked aspect of women's journeys to religious leadership in her study of the 'ordinary religious women' (p. 267) of the Visitandines in seventeenth-century Brussels. Her analysis of nuns' compositional strategies in the circular letters required by their congregation demonstrates how these women negotiated a 'rhetoric of conformity' (p. 278) to assert a sense of collective autonomy and authority. In a probing chapter, Anneke Mulder-Bakker examines how some religious women exercised spiritual authority as mediators in the secular sphere. Extending her research into older women in medieval society, she argues that age and wisdom, in addition to charisma, could offer a socially recognised avenue for women to acquire authority.

Representations of female spiritual leadership lend insights into how ideas of authority and its practice were negotiated between a religious superior and her community. Andrea Worm's analysis of depictions of female

monastic leaders and their convents in German manuscript illumination from the late tenth to the early thirteenth century identifies a shift from portrayals of powerful individuals to a greater emphasis on the community, a change reflecting successive ideologies of monastic reform. This chapter presents an excellent methodological approach for close contextual study of gender and representation in visual sources. Mathilde van Dijk also illustrates the tensions between leaders and community in her examination of how the spiritual values of the Modern Devotion and expectations of leadership were portrayed as exempla in the *Sisterbook* of the Windesheim nuns at Diepenveen.

Other contributors explore how female communities negotiated claims to spiritual authority within broader social and cultural contexts. Eva Lundquist Sandgren examines the scribal practices of nuns at the Birgittine abbey of Vadstena in the fifteenth century, situating them within a wider culture of international book exchange. Caroline Giron-Panel shows how the spiritual authority of the lay religious communities of the *Ospedali* in seventeenth-century Venice was harnessed to the political and ideological aims of the Republic. In an insightful chapter, Sylvie Duval demonstrates how the adoption of enclosure by monastic and lay religious women in fifteenth-century Italy could enhance their spiritual authority. She identifies the strong support for the practice of enclosure among the women concerned, their families and patrons, and ecclesiastic authorities as a source of political and symbolic, as well as spiritual and social, authority. This essay offers a valuable corrective to perceptions of enclosure as necessarily being detrimental for women, and suggests productive areas for further research.

Regrettably, the volume has several errors. Marguerite Porete is mentioned incorrectly (instead of *priorissa Margareta*) in connection with Lippoldsberg (p. 63, n. 44), which may confuse readers unfamiliar with the subject. There are mistranslations of Latin (e.g., commands for *commendans* (p. 43); costume for *consuetudine* (p. 194)) and several typographical and syntactical oversights.

The editors perceive a decline in scope for women to exert spiritual authority over the course of the period, particularly as regards individual charismatic women. This argument has some merit in respect to those women who sought to establish themselves as spiritual teachers, but it does tend to overlook women's continuing exercise of power through recognised sources of authority, as demonstrated by the office of religious superior and the scope this role could entail. Overall, the collection advances our understanding of the dynamics and complexities women faced in acquiring and exercising spiritual authority, and highlights the creative ways through which individual women negotiated expectations and constraints in their efforts to claim an authoritative voice as a *mulier religiosa*.

JULIE HOTCHIN, *Australian National University*

Gill, Amyrose McCue, and Sarah Rolfe **Prodan**, eds, *Friendship and Sociability in Premodern Europe: Contexts, Concepts, and Expressions* (Essays & Studies, 33), Toronto, CRRS, 2014; paperback; pp. 318; 1 b/w, 3 colour illustrations; R.R.P. US\$ 39.95; ISBN 9780772721709.

The essays in this volume originate from a 2011 conference titled 'Friendship in Premodern Europe (1300–1700)'. Besides a thorough Introduction, the volume is divided into three sections: 'Individual Friendships', 'Networks of Friends', and 'Friendship in Political and International Relations'. In her Introduction, Sarah Rolfe Prodan uses the example of Michelangelo Buonarroti and Pescara Vittoria Colonna's relationship at the turn of the sixteenth century to introduce what she calls the 'fluid geometry' (p. 17) of friendship.

The book's first section focuses specifically on individual case studies: Adriana Benzaquén's close analysis of John Locke and Edward Clarke's epistolary friendship; Malina Stefanovska's examination of the sixteenth-century French nobleman Sieur Louis de Pontis's memoirs, which reveal that friendships could arise quickly, rather than grow gradually over time; and Francesco Ciabattini's chapter on Dante, in which he 'identifies a progression in Dante's oeuvre from a philosophical to a theological conception and rhetoric of amity' (p. 29). The two early modern chapters in particular reveal the fluidity of friendship, both as a category for research and as a contemporary, historical concept. Benzaquén's work on Locke and Clarke, for example, shows that instrumentality and sentimentality were not mutually exclusive: while there was the exchange of information, gifts, and favours between the two friends, there was also a real, personal affection that was not based on instrumentality; in fact, Locke and Clarke seemed to move between instrumental and sentimental friendship with ease.

The second section focuses on networks of friends, starting with the second of the two medieval chapters. Steven Baker investigates how Petrarch, in an attempt to effect reconciliation, sent a single letter addressed to two Italian noblemen, intending that they would have to read it together. Petrarch, Baker argues, constructed a shared 'Italian' identity for both men, even though they were native to different regions. The construction of a shared identity as a basis for friendship and sociability also comes to the fore in Sally Hickson's chapter on syphilis and Renaissance Mantua; the disease served as a basis for a community forged through patronage. Patronage was central to French noblemen's lives and Brian Sandberg's contribution demonstrates how, during the French Wars of Religion (1562–1629), nobles' reliance on each other for support influenced how they viewed friendship. Friendships were questioned when religious views changed, resulting in some friendships being renounced and new ones cultivated. The cultivation and maintenance of a social sphere where sociability and friendship could flourish was not an

easy task, but one that Pierre Bayle tried to create and maintain. Bayle, Jean Bernier demonstrates, wanted scholars taking part in the Republic of Letters to behave towards each other as they would towards friends, engaging in debate with fairness and equality in mind.

The last section begins with Paolo Broggio's discussion of how the Counter-Reformation changed the concept of friendship. Broggio argues that, particularly after the Council of Trent, Catholic doctrine influenced relationships, in general, and friendships, in particular, by using the unequal confessor–penitent relationship as a model to assert the Church's authority. Hyun-Ah Kim, in the second chapter, shows how the Jesuit missionary Matteo Ricci transcended cultural differences while in China. Ricci used both friendship discourse and friendship itself to find common ground, composing a treatise featuring European (Ciceronian) and Chinese (Neo-Confucian) ideas of friendship and forfeiting much Christian dogma to focus on the moral philosophy that both cultures shared. Sharing, according to the sixteenth-century Aristotelian cosmographer, Richard Hakluyt, saw trade as being similar to friendship: both were based on a situation of lack. As David Harris Sacks shows so clearly in his chapter, from the Greek philosophers onwards, exchange – either in the context of a gift or the *quid pro quo* of trade – has been seen as the glue that holds communities, and thus, society, together. No person, nor country, was completely self-sufficient: friends or trading partners were needed to make up for the inherent lack. Christian doctrine interpreted this as God purposely arranging it so that man could never be whole on his own, forcing him to better himself through contact with others. Hakluyt, according to Sacks, collapsed the idea of exchange on the macro and micro level, seeing trade as a form of friendship between nations.

The cover – Peter Paul Rubens's *Self-Portrait in a Circle of Friends from Mantua* (1602–04) – foreshadows both the lack of female friendships in the volume, as well as the favouring of the early modern period. The former is addressed by Prodan in her Introduction, where she notes the dearth of research on female friendships in general and at the 2011 conference in particular. Despite the paucity of medieval essays, the book is a welcome addition to studies on friendship: the volume itself is neatly formatted, with footnotes rather than endnotes, an index of names and places, and with each chapter (including the Introduction) ending with a 'cited works' section.

DEBORAH SEILER, *The University of Western Australia*

Harmes, Marcus, and Victoria **Bladen**, eds, *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 250; 1 b/w illustration; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781472429407.

In *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, Marcus Harmes and Victoria Bladen have brought together, in a truly interdisciplinary collection, various essays to demonstrate that the supernatural was a pervasive aspect of everyday life. The book expands on recent scholarship in this area by aiming to understand how the 'intangible was grounded in the tangible physical world' (p. 3).

The book is divided into three parts. The first, 'Magic at Court', focuses on supernatural power within the Elizabethan courtly elite. In the first chapter, Glyn Parry considers the impact and influence of alchemy on the Elizabethan court, with a special focus on John Dee. Not only does the chapter chart Elizabeth's own fascination with alchemy, but it also demonstrates how, by engaging in political discourse, alchemy's subversive potential ultimately 'led to its marginalization well before the impulses of scientific empiricism' (p. 7).

Pierre Kapitaniak next analyses the context surrounding the publication of Reginald Scot's treatise, *The Discoverie of Witchcraft* (1584). While Scot may have believed that a 'witch mania had taken hold of England', Kapitaniak draws on Scot's own anti-Catholicism to contextualise his work (p. 42). He notes the increasing conflation of treason with witchcraft, demonstrating that witches were more likely to be branded as Catholics.

Michael Devine's chapter is an excellent analysis of the political and religious climate in the lead up to the passing of the 1563 Witchcraft Act. Devine argues that English Catholics were believed to be using magic, particularly in order to overthrow Elizabeth, and this fear manifested itself in the political debates of Elizabeth's early reign. The hyperbolic nature of the debate meant that during the forty years in which the Act was in force, it was not used to deal with magic in conspiracies; rather, it was 'an instrument for dealing with perceived maleficent and anti-social behaviour at a county level' (p. 91).

Victoria Bladen opens Part II, 'Performance, Text and Language', with her analysis of *The Witch of Edmonton* (1621) and supernatural identity. She argues that drama 'represents the way common beliefs in the supernatural constituted powerful pretexts for the persecution of outsiders' (p. 115). Fiona Martin follows with her examination of the shifting attitudes to suicide in early modern England through William Sampson's *The Vow Breaker* (1636).

In the next chapter, Catherine Stevens focuses on Ludwig Latavar's *Of Ghostes and Spirites Walking by Nyght* (1569) as a way to understand the shifting and unclear positions of ghosts within Protestant theology. By not saying mass for the dead and denouncing purgatory, Protestantism battled 'ingrained folk beliefs as well as vestiges of Catholic belief' regarding the fate of the soul (p.

11). Concluding Part II, Martin Dawes focuses on Milton's *Paradise Lost*, and its effect on Restoration politics. Dawes's thesis rests on the idea that the supernatural component of *Paradise Lost* – particularly Christ's chariot – was a pointed commentary on the excesses of Charles II's court.

Part III, 'Witchcraft, the Devil and the Body', contains the collection's most exciting and engaging essays. Marcus Harmes's contribution analyses the role bishops played in investigating demonic possession in England during the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. Harmes observes that 'the agency of the Devil ... concerned some bishops, as claims that people had the power to dispossess or exorcise demoniacs could cut across episcopal authority' (p. 186). He emphasises both how the episcopacy was embroiled in the contest over the authority to deal with demoniacs, and the various ways in which 'episcopal power and authority intersected with secular jurisdiction' (p. 13).

In her chapter, Charlotte-Rose Millar argues that contrary to the prevailing historical narrative, sexuality was indeed a significant factor in cases of English witchcraft. Her study of fifty surviving seventeenth-century witchcraft pamphlets demonstrates that English witchcraft was presented as 'diabolical and highly sexualised' (p. 231). These 'witches' were accused of engaging in both penetrative and non-penetrative sex with familiars and manlike devils. Millar argues that 'the sexual dimension of the English witchcraft pamphlets can thus be located with and recognized as part of the process of Protestant delineation of acceptable sexuality' (p. 13).

The omission of a bibliography – either for each chapter or a general reference list for the book – is disappointing, and the collection focuses far more on witchcraft than is suggested by both the title and the section titles. Nevertheless, these are small criticisms of an otherwise well-written, expertly researched and engaging collection.

AIDAN NORRIE, *University of Otago*

Henry of Avranches, *Saints' Lives Volume I* (Dumbarton Oaks Medieval Library, 30), ed. and trans. David **Townsend**, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. xxvi, 324; R.R.P. US\$29.25; ISBN 9780674051287.

Henry of Avranches, *Saints' Lives Volume II* (Dumbarton Oaks Medieval Library, 31), ed. and trans. David **Townsend**, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 295; R.R.P. US\$29.25; ISBN 9780674728653.

Henry of Avranches was one of the first real professional Latin poets of the medieval period, and has been acclaimed as the foremost Anglo-Latin poet

of the thirteenth century. His career extended from before 1215 until after 1260, and from 1243 until 1260 he was paid generously from the Exchequer of Henry III. In addition, he received patronage from several English prelates, the French king, Lewis IX, and from Pope Gregory IX.

In these volumes, David Townsend continues a thirty-year programme of editing and researching Henry's *oeuvre*. Several of the *Lives* have appeared previously in his PhD dissertation, and (without translations) in the Toronto-based journals *Medieval Studies* and *The Journal of Medieval Latin*. Substantial new contributions in the *Dumbarton* volumes are the *Life of Francis* (of Assisi) – Henry's masterwork in fourteen books dedicated to Gregory IX – and the 1666-line *Life of Guthlac*.

Townsend takes his texts from a manuscript crucial in establishing the canon of Henry's works, Cambridge University Library, MS Dd.11.78, an anthology compiled by Matthew of Paris at Saint Alban's, and noted as 'Verses of Master H.' in Matthew's hand. This manuscript contains nearly a hundred items in a variety of genres, although some are not Henry's. Drawing on the detailed codicological study of the manuscript and its contents which he undertook with George Rigg (published in *Medieval Studies* in 1987), Townsend lays out his criteria for the inclusion of the saints' lives now edited, in descending order of certainty of attribution: Francis, Oswald, Birinus, Guthlac, Fremund, Edmund, and Thomas Becket. The last (c. 1222) is a puzzle, as it is stylistically quite inconsistent with the other *Lives*, and only the first 769 lines, based upon John of Salisbury's prose life, are included in the edition. A *Life of Hugh of Lincoln*, which has been plausibly attributed to Henry, does not appear in the Cambridge manuscript, and is omitted from this edition.

In a departure from the classicising norms adopted in many volumes in the *Dumbarton* series, Townsend retains the medieval orthographical conventions of the manuscript (e.g., *set* for *sed*, *preciosus* for *pretiosus*). These do not distract unduly, and indeed are to be preferred in the opinion of this reader.

Henry's *modus operandi* was to take an existing prose saint's life and expand it, sometimes incorporating material from other sources, but principally drawing upon his broad literary training and his work in other genres (he wrote versified grammars, and put Aristotle's treatise on *Generation and Corruption* into poetry, for example), and employing exuberant use of complex sound patterns, wordplay, rhetoric, and vivid conceits, including features drawn from classical Latin poetry. The predominance of English saints in his corpus reflects his pursuit of patronage by English churchmen, such as Peter des Roches, Bishop of Winchester, for whom the *Life of Birinus*, first bishop of the West Saxons, was written. The life of the obscure and legendary saint, Fremund, was perhaps commissioned by Richard de Morins for the Priory

of Dunstable where Fremund's cult was of economic importance, or possibly written in hope of patronage. One might surmise that Henry was struck by the rich potential for literary play in the sparse prose life, with episodes such as Fremund's eremitical sojourn on 'Fantasy Island' ('*Insula Fantastica*'). Townsend's notes usefully highlight those features of the *Lives* that Henry adds to his sources, as here for example, where the island is made all the more fantastic in its deception of passing sailors: 'nam se postrema priorem, | se prior exhibuit postremam, seque sinistra | mentiri dextram solet, et se dextra sinistram' (lines 154–56).

The Dumbarton Oaks format places tight constraints on the scope of introduction and notes, but within the space allotted Townsend has skilfully distilled the essentials necessary to understand and appreciate Henry's work, and the bibliography indicates the solid foundations upon which they are constructed. As Townsend laments, 'Henry's highly ornamented style can unfortunately be conveyed only intermittently by direct prose translation'. The potential for an alternative is seen in his own verse 'likenesses' extracted from *Francis*, published in *Anglo-Latin and its Heritage* (Brepols, 2001). The prose translations are idiomatic, yet sufficiently close to the structure of the Latin to encourage a close engagement with the original text, which must be the principal aim of such a dual-language edition. The author and the publishers are to be congratulated on two fine additions to this steadily growing publication series.

GREG WAITE, *University of Otago*

Hermann, Permillé, Stephen A. **Mitchell**, and Agnes S. **Arnórsdóttir**, eds, *Minni and Muninn: Memory in Medieval Nordic Culture* (*Acta Scandinavica*, 4), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. x, 244; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503549101.

This collection of essays builds on the 2013 special edition of *Scandinavian Studies*, entitled *Memory and Remembering: Past Awareness in the Medieval North*, which was co-edited by two of the three editors of this volume. This latest publication marks an important development in applying the field of memory studies to the Scandinavian Middle Ages. Memory studies, in essence, comprise a diverse range of approaches to the different ways that people use memory and techniques of remembering, as means for constructing the past, often to convey some sense of continuity and historical meaning into their present.

This volume contains ten essays that investigate different aspects of memory studies as applied to medieval Nordic culture, looking at the role and importance of memory and the means by which cultural memory is held, sustained, developed, transmitted, authenticated, and forgotten. The

volume examines the cultural terms, symbols, and metaphors for memory, techniques used for remembering, and how these techniques explain the construction of the past in medieval texts. The book is set out in two sections, the first including consideration of memory in the context of literary and poetic material, while the second is more focused on memory in the context of historiography and law, with some degree of conceptual overlap between the two.

The use of mythological tropes (Óðinn's ravens being a common example) and the role of both Eddic and Skaldic poetry in structuring, selecting, and maintaining memory play a large part in the first section. In the first article, Pernille Hemann looks at Old Norse textual representations of memory, examining the pairing of memory and wisdom, and the forms and uses of aids to help the process of memorialising. John Lindow's contribution deals with memory techniques (narrative, objects, sites, and ritual) embedded in the Poetic Edda, as a means for examining aspects of Old Norse mythology, while Margaret Clunies Ross and Kate Heslop both write about the poet's role in cultural memory; the former looking at the skald's work as authentication, while the latter is concerned explicitly with the rhetoric and vocabulary for remembering. The first section concludes with Russell Poole considering the status of autobiographical memory as a cultural expression that consolidates a sense of society or community in ensuing generations.

The second part of the volume shifts from mainly poetic and literary material to texts and other cultural products that exemplify the role of memory in historical, administrative, and legal cultures, and the acts of establishing and maintaining cultural memory through the writing of histories and through related formal or institutional means. The second section also takes a wider geographic view, dealing with both Icelandic and continental Nordic culture. Rudolf Simek's survey of Norman historiographical texts, for both Normandy and Sicily, identifies literary indications of Norman memorialising that serve to maintain a sense of identity and articulation with northern Germanic cultural memory. Stephen A. Mitchell considers the role of memory in mythologising a past for the Baltic island of Gotland, using a range of means, including texts, monuments, landscape, heritage objects, and other aids for establishing a shared cultural memory as history. In the next chapter, Gísli Sigurðsson looks at active history writing on the part of the thirteenth-century Sturla Þorðarson and his version of *Landnámabók*, and discusses the way that Sturla memorialises a past that reinforces his own concerns, reorienting historical circumstances and narrative associations to his own benefit, in competition with contemporary political adversaries. In the penultimate article, the role of *minnunga mæn* (memory men) in regional Norway/Sweden is explored by Stefan Brink, who considers ways of maintaining administrative knowledge in a pre-literate society, where such

knowledge was embodied in the skills and abilities of memory specialists. As with Brink's contribution, the last paper in the volume is also concerned with the nexus between oral and literate society and the role of specialists: Agnes S. Arnórsdóttir discusses modes of transmission of administrative and legal practice, exploring the role in early Icelandic law of contemporaneous oral and written modes, arguing that, some centuries after the introduction of Christianity, the role of legal specialists broadened to incorporate legal adjudication based on written law in addition to the orality of being a trained law-speaker.

In summary, this volume marks an important point in bringing to bear the study of memory and the mechanisms of memorialisation on the legal, cultural, and social record of the medieval north.

RODERICK McDONALD, *University of Iceland / University of Copenhagen*

Hiller, Diana, *Gendered Perceptions of Florentine Last Supper Frescoes, c. 1350–1490* (Visual Culture in Early Modernity), Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; cloth; pp. xv, 232; 8 colour, 36 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €60.00; ISBN 9781409462064.

This beautifully illustrated study of nine Last Supper frescoes in Florentine refectories, monastic and conventual, from the mid-fourteenth to the late fifteenth centuries examines these art works from the perspective of the viewer and their gendered perceptions of the frescoes. Diana Hiller argues that male and female religious viewed these frescoes very differently based on varying religious, cultural, emotional, and intellectual contexts, which were themselves gendered.

In Chapter 1, Hiller introduces the tradition of Last Supper paintings in Italy, discussing the handful of Italian non-refectory images, both inside Florence (in the baptistery vault) and the handful of early refectory images outside Florence, painted in the early decades of the fourteenth century. From 1350 onwards, however, frescoes of the Last Supper in the refectories of religious houses became a particularly Florentine phenomenon. Nine frescoes have survived: beginning with Taddeo Gaddi's Last Supper painted on the refectory wall of the Franciscan monastery of Santa Croce, to the 1488 Last Supper fresco painted for a group of Franciscan tertiaries in the convent of San Girolamo. Six frescoes were painted for male houses and three for female houses. All of these frescoes preceded Leonardo da Vinci's famous Last Supper fresco, which was painted in Milan between 1495 and 1498 in the refectory of the Dominican monastery of Santa Maria delle Grazie; as the author observes, this fresco marked the 'apotheosis' of the 'visual and iconographic history of Last Supper images' (p. 7).

The author argues throughout the book that male and female religious perceived the Last Supper images differently and in Chapter 2, she examines the different educational contexts that male and female religious experienced. The male friars, often preaching friars, were schooled in Latin, trained in biblical exegesis and the interpretation of learned texts and glosses written by Church Fathers and later learned theologians. Their monasteries also contained extensive libraries filled with classical, patristic, and theological books and manuscripts, usually in Latin and in the library of San Marco also in Greek. They were taught how to read texts, both written and visual, in a learned way. In contrast, the female religious, even in such aristocratic convents as St Apollonia, were educated rather than learned, and usually could read only in the vernacular, and their libraries held few books. The impact of gender on this experience is only highlighted in this chapter when the convents are examined as a contrast to male experience, implying that gender was an exclusively female phenomenon. Male friars were also gendered and a focus on the impact of gender earlier in the chapter might have led to a more extensive discussion of gender in the monastic learning environment.

Having established the differing intellectual contexts of the male and female religious, in Chapter 3, Hiller argues that friars and monks would have viewed the frescoes as mirrors of their own corporate identity and that the frescoes in male houses, as opposed to those found in convents, contained complex, learned messages that necessitated an understanding of Latin. These frescoes emphasised a more affective, individualised piety, with the nuns being encouraged to concentrate their devotion on individual saints, whose names were helpfully written in the vernacular, in contrast to the lack of names in the frescoes of the male houses.

The last two chapters of the book discuss the perceptual environment of the refectories in the male and female houses, respectively. The records indicate that refectories in the male houses were public spaces that entertained male guests. The texts read during the refectory meal were learned, and in Latin; the friars observed elaborate rituals and the food, both in the frescoes and at the table, was plentiful and reflected an upper-class diet. The presence of guests, abundant food, and learned readings helped to project the status of the community to the outside world. In contrast, the stricter emphasis on enclosure for nuns, the lack of knowledge about the frescoes until after the convents were suppressed in the nineteenth century, and the lack of detail in the surviving records all suggest that convent refectories did not entertain guests. The author also argues that, given the more ascetic food practices of the nuns, their diet was less plentiful and included less meat and cheaper cuts of meat when they did eat it. Moreover, there was a lack of elaborate rituals, and readings were in the vernacular rather than Latin. Additionally, punishment and discipline of errant nuns were practised in refectories rather

than the entertaining of guests. As the author notes, the paucity of sources for female houses makes it difficult to know whether the nuns did sometimes entertain guests; current research indicates, however, that secular women visited convents quite regularly and even stayed for periods of time. Is it also possible that the reason the frescoes were unknown for centuries is because the patrons were themselves female and the full extent of female patronage has only become known in recent years?

These minor issues aside, this is an important and well-researched book. Through its analysis of the Last Supper frescoes, it sheds new light on the experiences of male and female religious. The book clearly indicates the importance of gender as a lens for understanding their viewership of Last Supper frescoes and also as a key mechanism for analysing their differing everyday experience as members of religious houses in fourteenth- and fifteenth-century Florence.

NATALIE TOMAS, *Monash University*

Hopkins, Lisa, and Helen **Ostovich**, eds, *Magical Transformations on the Early Modern English Stage* (Studies in Performance and Early Modern Drama), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 278; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781472432865.

Magical Transformations on the Early Modern English Stage is a rich and varied addition to the field. According to the editors, Lisa Hopkins and Helen Ostovich, the collection aims to ‘consider the force and potential of witchcraft representations on the early modern stage and the kinds of cultural works they may perform’ (p. 2). The collection is divided into four separate yet interrelated parts: ‘Demons and Pacts’, ‘Rites to Believe’, ‘Learned Magic’, and ‘Local Witchcraft’.

Part I opens with Barbara H. Traister’s deft discussion of the transformation of the representation of demons in early modern England. Traister argues that devils transformed from cunning demons to witches’ familiars, before finally fading away as a trope in dramatic works by the 1620s. Traister aligns her argument with Keith Thomas’s work, and suggests that spiritual magic had ‘fallen somewhat out of credit’ (p. 30) in the period. Next, Bronwyn Johnston questions the blurred lines of power between human and the Devil. Johnston skilfully engages with King James’s delineation between ignorant witches who serve the Devil, and powerful magicians who ‘are his maisters’ (p. 31). The common trope of humans overcoming the Devil is contrasted with Faustus’s powerlessness in the face of Mephistopheles’s clever manipulations. Laura Levine then examines the meaning of an oral contract in late Elizabethan England. Analysing the inherent power – or lack thereof – in the words used

to conjure, Levine insightfully contrasts the transformation of contractual law and custom with the limitations and details of the Devil's contract or pact.

Part II then turns to the representation of ritual. Alisa Manninen argues for two forms of ritual: the social and the supernatural. Manninen strikingly uses the duality of *Macbeth's* ritual spheres to contrast the 'localised and temporary nature of Lady Macbeth's social influence' with the 'far-reaching effects' (p. 69) of the witches. Likewise, Verena Thiele examines duality in *Macbeth* by contrasting the demonic, tangible, transferable evil of the witches with the temporary, localised evil of the human Macbeth. Finally, Jill Delsigne contrasts Shakespeare's depiction of Paulina's positive use of the hermetic (Roman Catholic) tradition of animating statues of saints and martyrs in *The Winter's Tale* with the negative depiction of magic-wielding friars in *Friar Bacon and Friar Bungay*.

Part III's discussion of learned magic begins with Peter Kirwan's examination of the author as conjurer; Jasmine Lellock then examines the use of alchemy as a metaphor for the process of ethical transformation of Prospero in *The Tempest*. In her contribution, Lisa Hopkins suggests that the staging of magic and its transformative power could be used to perform ideas of history, national identity, religious conformity, and national security. Hopkins foregrounds the theologically problematic performance of magical acts which grant desires, describing *Faustus* as a play in which the 'tension between the idea of magic and the idea of miracle [is] particularly apparent' (p. 142). This recalls Delsigne's argument about Paulina's awareness of the need to be a conduit for a miracle, rather than perform an act of magic.

Part IV discusses the broader – and somewhat ill defined – area of local witchcraft. Brett D. Hirsch focuses on the interaction between the little known play *Fedele and Fortunio* and Elizabethan concerns over wax images and their possible use against the Queen and her advisors. Hirsch examines how Catholicism and magic are intertwined in the play's performance of ritual. Judith Bonzol then contrasts the strategies of three cunning-women for whom reputation had serious consequences. Bonzol deftly manages the contrasts between the images these women presented as performers of healing – both literal and metaphorical – and their ambiguous position within their communities. Jessica Dell and Helen Ostovich then return to Hirsch's discussion of image magic. For Dell, gender politics in *The Merry Wives of Windsor* is used to contextualise magical concepts, social classification, and problems of female virtue, while Ostovich examines the socially constructed meaning of imagery and the consequences of consumption and desire in *Bartholomew Fair*. Finally, Andrew Loeb takes the discussion from the visual realm into the aural. The inversion and disorder created by the witches in *The Late Lancashire Witches* is emphasised by references to sounds and music gone awry. Loeb notes that one character thinks the church bells

sound as though they are 'ring[ing] backwards' (p. 228). This final section lacks the cohesion of the earlier ones, however, each of the contributions is interdependently engaging.

Hopkins and Ostovich have compiled a thoughtful and thought-provoking collection of essays. *Magical Transformations* is a significant new piece of English witchcraft scholarship the strength of which lies in the varied approaches of its authors and their engagement with their source material.

SHEILAGH ILONA O'BRIEN, *The University of Queensland*

Howe, Elizabeth Teresa, *Autobiographical Writing by Early Modern Hispanic Women* (Women and Gender in the Early Modern World), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 320; 12 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781472435774.

Elizabeth Teresa Howe's thoughtful and insightful new book explores female autobiographical writing (specifically 'authoring', present participle, as opposed to 'writings', plural noun) in the early modern Hispanic world. She provides an engaging and comprehensive survey of theoretical studies on women's writings, in this case from Spain and Mexico, in a period running from 1360 to nearly 1660. The women she chooses are certainly notable, sometimes notorious, and include both nuns and laywomen. It is unsurprising that the majority are nuns: the convent was one place where women could learn to read and write.

What they wrote and how they wrote it are Howe's main concerns. 'Autobiographical' has many interpretations. The first chapter provides a thorough canvassing of the possibilities discussed in recent (and earlier) literature and very sensibly refrains from giving a formal definition. There is good reason for this as Chapter 5 demonstrates: the writing of Catalina de Erauso does not fit easily into the definitions considered, though it is clearly personal and the adjective 'autobiographical' seems perfectly appropriate to this reviewer.

Chapters 2 to 6 consider nearly a dozen women and their autobiographical texts. Among these, I mention only a few. Leonor López de Córdoba, who was at times in the Castilian court and probably writing around 1412, narrates her trials and tribulations in the hope of improving her lot. Sister Teresa de Cartagena, writing half a century later, is on the other hand confined by both the convent and her deafness. The much better known Teresa of Ávila has been much discussed and Howe gives a good overview. The context here is amplified by the existence of biographies of the saint as well as her own writings. Moreover, such writings were printed and circulated widely. This definitely affects perceptions.

Teresa's spiritual daughter, Ana de San Bartolomé, was quite outspoken in her autobiographical writings. The decidedly unsaintly Catalina de Erauso lived not very much later. Having entered a convent at a tender age, she abandoned it to pursue a military career disguised as a man, and what a life! Scepticism has been expressed about her very existence, but there seems little doubt she was real. Her writing is confessional; after a violent life she saves her life by revealing her sex. Her two *relaciones* were published; they are quite short but oddly not explicitly listed in the bibliography.

Finally, there is a very long chapter on Sister Juana Inés de la Cruz, a Mexican nun who was writing at the end of the seventeenth century. Much has been written about her, and readers with previous acquaintance with such work will find this chapter more useful than the general reader. The book's important conclusion, which is very short, is discussed below.

For each of these women, there are many unanswered questions about the role of men, particularly confessors, who varied from instigators to influencers and, given the context, or should I say lack of it, it is not always clear to what extent they affected the women. The subtle oratory whereby Teresa of Ávila 'asserts her license to write what she will' shows that their influences may not have been as effective as some men might have desired (p. 64). Though Howe provides some discussion of the environments in which these women lived and wrote, more would have been welcome.

In particular there is the question: which of these women actually wrote, that is to say, put pen to paper? It seems unlikely that Catalina de Erauso did so, since she left the convent very early. Further, while nuns might learn to read, since that could help with their religious understanding, writing was a completely separate skill, usually acquired only after learning to read. The role of the actual scribe is not discussed, so the book seems best described as being about authoring.

Howe writes well but occasionally seems to be thinking in Spanish: for example 'expounds' might be better than 'exposes' (p. 183). Referencing in the text perplexed this reviewer. There seems a lack of system; sometimes we have just a page number, sometimes a title, sometimes simply an author or editor. Early printed editions seem not to appear in the bibliography. On the other hand, the illustrations are a fine bonus.

Some of the women in this book have been discussed by Howe previously (*Education and Women in the Early Modern Hispanic World* (Ashgate, 2008)). Who knows how many other early writings by women are hidden in archives, or even were printed? Hopefully Howe (and others) will follow her conclusion's final and salutary advice: 'Tolle et lege' – go and get [other women's writings], and read them.

JOHN N. CROSSLEY, *Monash University*

Hutchinson, Mark A., *Calvinism, Reform and the Absolutist State in Elizabethan Ireland* (Religious Cultures in the Early Modern World, 20), London, Pickering & Chatto, 2015; hardback; pp. 240; R.R.P. £60.00, US\$99.00; ISBN 9781848935488.

The failure of the Reformation in Ireland cemented the supremacy of the Protestant ruling elite, who rejected conciliatory policies in favour of coercive strategies to enforce law and order. Mark Hutchinson finds that the Reformation also provided the catalyst for new ways of thinking about political relationships. Making use of the vast Irish State Paper collections, alongside published works, Hutchinson presents compelling evidence that the Irish experience enabled the English to articulate an absolutist state theory for the first time.

Taking Patrick Collinson's 'monarchical republic' as a starting point, Hutchinson explores the reasons why the monarchical republic failed to take hold in Ireland and defines the ideological conditions that led to the triumph of absolutism. Emerging ideologies were governed by the interplay between theology and political theory as the English abandoned the reformist government of the earlier Tudors in favour of a more coercive and punitive regime.

The Protestant concept of grace is central to this book. God's word operated through grace to reform a person's conscience. Only then would they know God and pursue a Godly life. Grace-based friendship implied internal bonds of unity as the godly community worked together in the common interest. For this reason, liberty and the right to political participation depended upon the presence of grace. Protestant observers in Ireland linked rebellion and disunity to a lack of preaching and, by extension, an absence of grace. Civil society was infeasible while the population lacked legitimate spiritual guidance. Reformers struggled to pass the necessary religious legislation and the Old English (descended from medieval settlers) and Gaelic Irish refused to be drawn into the Godly community.

As the English lamented the failure of reform policy in Ireland, they borrowed from English and continental theory to construct an external model for obedience: the state. This state concept was an altered version of Jean Bodin's indivisible sovereignty. In Ireland, authority could not rest with the Queen, who was absent, or with the polity, which was thought to be corrupt. The solution was to invest absolute authority in the institutions of government.

In what Hutchinson purports to be the first open claim to absolutism in Ireland, Sir Henry Sidney argued that he could collect levies from the Pale community as such policy was his prerogative as lord deputy. The lord deputy's insistence on prerogative in matters of policy denoted a shift in thinking about the nature of *imperium* in Ireland. The idea of absolute sovereign

authority detached from the queen and polity and invested in the lord deputy and his council credibly points to a nascent absolutism.

Why did Protestant reformers in Ireland reject the monarchical republic? Hutchinson claims that the answer lies in the religious dimensions of such a concept. As the Old English pressed for a monarchical republic, their Protestant counterparts denied the existence of an Irish mixed polity. Considerations of grace and corrupted conscience led the English to reject Irish claims to liberty. Instead they proposed a statist solution that would constrain Catholic access to government. As Catholics were excluded from political life via legal and extra-legal means, the English formalised political relationships through the apparatus of the state. Feudal language of lordly fidelity was replaced by the authority of state institutions as embodied in the person of the lord deputy. The atomisation of Irish society occurred as tax was regularised and land was converted into freehold, thus defining the relationship between the individual and the state.

Finally, Hutchinson revisits some well-known texts relating to Ireland and considers their contributions to statist thought. Amid the proliferation of Edmund Spenser scholarship, Hutchinson's reading of *A View of the Present State of Ireland* offers a new interpretation. He considers the *View* to be a potentially important piece of early statist theory as its author gave voice to familiar concerns about corrupted Irish consciences and the dangers inherent in Irish political liberty.

Hutchinson makes a valuable contribution to our understanding of early modern Ireland as he unweaves a new, statist thread from the multifarious intellectual tapestry of English writers. Drawing attention to contemporary parallels and the flow of ideas across borders, he situates his scholarship in a wider English and European context, thus opening the possibility of new lines of research into early modern state building.

SAMANTHA WATSON, *UNSW Australia*

Jacobs, Martin, *Reorienting the East, Jewish Travellers to the Medieval Muslim World* (Jewish Culture and Contexts), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014; hardback, pp. xvii, 344; 2 b/w maps, 7 b/w illustrations, 1 b/w table; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £42.50; ISBN 9780812246223.

This aptly titled monograph sets out to recast the 'European' experience of travel to the Near East between the twelfth and sixteenth centuries through an exploration of the travel literature of Jewish writers more specifically. Martin Jacobs investigates the Jewish experience of travel from Europe to the Holy Land, and beyond, in the wake of the Crusades. The author cogently argues that literary genres such as the *itinerarium* and *peregrinatio* were by no

means limited to Latin writers, and that a vigorous corpus of travel writing exists from contemporaneous Hebrew and Judeo-Arabic sources ranging from itineraries, to epistolary writing and poetry.

Jacobs's main concern is the question of whether European Jewish travellers shared 'Western' perceptions of the Middle East with their Christian counterparts. In answering this question, he explores how European Jews interacted with the foreign cultures they encountered, whether Sunni Muslims, Druze, Ismailis and Levantine Christians, or Near Eastern Jewish communities and Jewish sects such as the Karaites. What emerges from this study is a nuanced series of 'shifting views' on the part of the Jewish writers, affected either by an author's personal experience, motivations for travel, or the changing historical circumstances of the time.

According to Jacobs, Jewish travel accounts underwent two distinct phases. The first was prompted by the Crusades and an increase in the number of European Jews making pilgrimage to the Holy Land. Writers such as Benjamin of Tudela in his *Sefer ha-Massa'ot* ('Book of Travels'; mid-twelfth century) wrote an itinerary of the journey from Europe to Jerusalem, focusing largely on visits to holy sites but also reporting on toponyms, distances, populations (Jewish or otherwise), commerce, and trade. While Benjamin's book is basically 'a plotless itemisation of place descriptions', his accounts of visiting religious sites in Mesopotamia offer a unique perspective; this area is portrayed as a 'religious utopia' where Muslims and Jews live in harmony and 'rub shoulders' at the various tombs and shrines. Jacobs is unsure as to the veracity of this claim but believes it may have reflected nostalgia Benjamin felt for pre-*Reconquista* Europe.

The second phase in Jewish travel writing includes letters, journals, and poetry, written by pilgrims and merchants alike, some of whom settled permanently in Jerusalem. These were clearly more personal accounts and the authors displayed a 'clear consciousness of themselves as both observers and authors'. These accounts were varied in their attitude to the cultures of the Near East; these variations depended on the writers themselves, their background, and intended audience. The diary of Meshullam of Volterra (c. 1443–c. 1507) who travelled to the Near East for business purposes, provides a highly judgemental account of the East, and criticises the perceived iniquity of the Muslims and the cruelty of their rulers. On the other hand, another Italian and contemporary of Meshullam, Obadiah of Betinoro (c. 1450–1515), a prominent Rabbi who settled in Jerusalem, shows little bias towards Near Eastern society and offers 'genuine examples of cross-cultural understanding'.

An unfortunate transition that occurs in the 'second phase', at least according to a handful of quattro- and cinquecento Jewish travellers, was an increase in Muslim hegemony over sacred space following the expulsion

of the crusaders from Palestine. While the Italian merchants who made this claim may have been showing the impact of contemporaneous discourse in Italy, this evidence is useful in tracing a slowly moving deterioration in relations between Jews and Muslims in Palestine, which over the last century has become so acute.

The great strength of Jacobs's book is his access to Hebrew source material, much of which he translates into English for the first time. While English translations of prominent authors like Benjamin of Tudela have long been available, Jacobs is able to access the full range of sources including epistles. This access to different types of source material allows for a wide perspective on Jewish travellers' attitudes and experiences in the Near East, making room for nuances and, even contradictions, among the authors.

Like most experiences of interaction with the 'other' throughout history, what emerges in Jacobs's book is a complexity of reactions that reflected historical conditions in both Europe and the Near East. Jacobs tries to show 'the manifold ways in which premodern Jews negotiated their mingled identities: European and Jewish, Western and Eastern'. Jacobs's study, highly engaging and well argued, nevertheless demonstrates that more scholarly attention is needed on this important aspect of medieval and premodern Jewish identity.

KATHERINE JACKA, *UNSW Australia*

Johnston, Mark Albert, *Beard Fetish in Early Modern England: Sex, Gender, and Registers of Value* (Women and Gender in the Early Modern World), Farnham, Ashgate, 2011; hardback; pp. 312; 21 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781409405429.

Mark Johnston's exploration of the beard as a fetish object is a valuable contribution to the growing literature on the gender implications of the adornment and embellishment of the body in early modern English culture. Using a vast array of sources, including drama, poetry, popular ballads, portraiture, letters, wills, diaries, pamphlets, and medical, philosophical, religious, and historical writing, Johnston explores not so much the history of the beard but the complexities of values and meanings given to the beard by early modern English writers. By exploring the significance of the early modern beard (or lack thereof) through myriad registers of value – humoral, erotic, sexual, gendered, spiritual, legal, political, racial, and economic – Johnston meticulously reveals the ambivalent, unstable, complex, and contradictory meanings of the ways the beard was fetishised as a social construct in early modern England.

Johnston begins with a valuable discussion of the concepts associated with the term 'fetish' and the ambiguities and instabilities of the registers of

value to which the beard was subjected. The slipperiness of fetish value and the ambiguous relationship between the beard and masculinity are themes developed throughout the book. Chapter 2, 'Beard, Value and Manhood', is particularly illuminating, showing how beards of various styles, colours, and other qualities, reflected the 'varied and competing cultural meanings of manhood' (p. 33). A wild, overgrown, bushy beard, for instance, could denote an absence of self-control, but could also represent a lack of pretension. Cutting, styling, and otherwise manipulating the beard, says Johnston, questions the beard's reliability as a 'natural index of value' (p. 57). The absence of facial hair, discussed in Chapter 3, requires equally complex interpretation, especially as the smooth faces of apprentices and students were enforced through social regulation, signalling gender subordination and sexual inferiority of young men.

In Chapter 4, 'Re-evaluating Bearded Women', Johnston reveals the transition of values associated with female beards as bearded women were contained away from an unnatural, threatening, wild figure to one of domesticated inferiority. Johnston's discussion of the spectacle of the bearded woman displayed as a natural wonder is particularly interesting. His argument about bearded witches, however, is not entirely convincing. While witches were indeed portrayed as monstrous, dangerous 'others', as old, infertile, insubordinate, and threatening women, the myth of the bearded witch was confined mostly to the early modern English stage, and does not appear in witchcraft pamphlets or court records. Consequently, Johnston's claim that the bearded woman and the witch were synonymous in English drama warrants further discussion. Similarly, the notion that witches shaved or magically defoliated men in order to deprive them of masculinity is rare in English witchcraft, and Johnston's reliance on European sources, such as the *Malleus Maleficarum*, leads him to draw questionable connections between beard removal and castration in English witchcraft beliefs.

The greatest strength of Johnston's analysis is in his depictions of beards, their absence, simulation, management, and meaning on the early modern English stage. Detailed discussion of passages from William Shakespeare, John Lyly, Ben Jonson, Thomas Middleton, and other early modern dramatists provides insights that illuminate Johnston's notable depiction of the dutifully submissive beardless boy–heroine, who parades herself as a pederastic boy in order to marry a bearded man to whom she has 'managed to establish her erotic subordination' (p. 157). The final chapter, 'Devaluing the Beard: Half Beards and Hermaphrodites', documents the transition of hermaphroditism from the mythic and spiritual registers of value in antiquity to the legal and medical value registers of the early modern period. By challenging the sex binary, the ambiguous figure of the hermaphrodite refuses to fit into any category, thus cleverly encapsulating Johnston's argument about early modern beard fetish and the illusion of the fetish object.

Beard Fetish in Early Modern England has been written for an academic audience: Johnston's frequent use of the vocabulary of cultural semiotics renders the work inaccessible for a general readership. In particular, his argument revolving around the dichotomy of the one/two-sex model of sex differentiation requires a sophisticated understanding of Hippocratic and Aristotelian medical theories. Insufficient consideration has been given by Johnston to modern scholars, such as Janet Adelman, Michael Stolberg, and Patricia Parker, who have convincingly challenged the notion that the one-sex model was ever as dominant as Thomas Laqueur and Stephen Greenblatt have presented it. For academic readers, the work is particularly valuable for its depictions of beards in English literature, and it contributes to our understanding of the cultural production of meaning, the complex and contradictory meanings of the fetish object, and the associated implications for gender, sex, and power in early modern England.

JUDITH BONZOL, *The University of Sydney*

Jorgensen, Alice, Frances **McCormack**, and Jonathan **Wilcox**, eds, *Anglo-Saxon Emotions: Reading the Heart in Old English Language, Literature and Culture* (Studies in Early Medieval Britain and Ireland), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 318; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781472421692.

This edited collection of fourteen essays ambitiously seeks not only to apply the study of the history of emotions to Old English and Anglo-Latin literature, but also to set the terms of reference for its future study. The collection admirably fulfils its stated aim to bring emotion to the forefront of Anglo-Saxon studies and harness the current interdisciplinary interest in emotions.

Anglo-Saxon England is not necessarily the first culture that comes to mind when considering the history of emotions and the editors clearly recognise that, in turning the lens of the history of emotions on the world of Anglo-Saxon literature, they are covering rarely trodden ground. While the contributions show great variety, the volume is tightly structured, and a theoretical basis for the study of emotions in Anglo-Saxon literature is set before proceeding to more focused discussions of specific Old English poetics, linguistics, and emotions. As Alice Jorgensen notes in her Introduction, the diversity of topics means that the essays 'do not advance a single theory of Anglo-Saxon emotions' (p. 15). Rather, with *Beowulf* and the elegies receiving some attention in almost every chapter, the contributors demonstrate the wide range of emotions and methodologies that can be applied to the limited Old English corpus.

Jorgensen contextualises the collection by setting a broad frame of reference for the term 'emotion', and more specifically through her

interdisciplinary discussion of the ways emotion (via the lens of personal values) is involved in individuals evaluating their place within their culture. Jorgensen also conveys previous studies of Anglo-Saxon emotions, concluding that emotions have either been peripheral to textual examination, or subjected to myopically focused individual scrutiny. Taken together, this collection redresses the limitations of previous scholarship by avoiding rigid intertextual analysis and applying modern developments in the research of emotions to Old English literature.

Each chapter is unique in its approach to emotion in Old English texts, but several were especially noteworthy. Antonina Harbus appropriately opens the collection with a consideration of emotions as specifically applied to Old English texts. Utilising current research falling under the broad heading of 'Cognitive Science', Harbus focuses on the relationship between audience and literature. Specifically, she seeks to explain how Anglo-Saxon literature continues to evoke emotional responses in modern audiences despite the distance in time and culture from its original creation. In so doing, Harbus demonstrates the richness of Anglo-Saxon texts as a vehicle for the examination of emotion and their value in interdisciplinary research.

Leslie Lockett's chapter provides information critical to reading emotion in Anglo-Saxon literature by discussing the concept of the *mod*. Now an alien concept, but an intrinsic concept of emotion in the Anglo-Saxon world, *mod* can be considered as a conceptual amalgam of the allegorical head and heart: the seat of both emotion and rationality. This discussion provides the background to Lockett's core theme: the exegesis of medical texts that ascribed an intrinsically limited role to the brain, aloof from both the emotion and the rational thought inherent in the highly personal *mod*. (The term *mod* reappears in subsequent essays and Lockett's analysis is a useful reference for them.)

The following chapters begin to provide a narrower focus and they are certainly best understood within the framework set out by the Introduction and opening chapters. Individual chapters consider the imposition of modern English cultural and linguistic concepts on Old English texts; the textual difficulties of emotional transmission through translation; what the complex structures of Anglo-Saxon poetry reveal about contemporary attitudes to emotion; and emotions as revealed through gesture and their inherently contextual nature. Specific emotions are given close attention by Tahlia Birnbaum and Frances McCormack, who provide nuanced examinations of shame as a complex and often positive emotion, characterised in, respectively, Old English psalter glosses and the poem *Christ*. Erin Sebo looks to *Beowulf*, and provides a comprehensive analysis of individual scenes of grief from the poem, using these to facilitate an examination of the interrelation between grief and vengeance.

Encapsulating many of the collection's broad themes, Mary Garrison's contribution makes an appropriate final chapter. Through her consideration of the motifs of grief and loss in Alcuin's letters, she is able to categorise Alcuin's experiences within 'modern psychoanalytical schemes' (p. 260), though she acknowledges the risk of doing so at the cost of contextual understanding. Still, in relating Alcuin's struggles to the modern experience, Garrison is able to make clear the ubiquitous nature of emotion.

As a collection, *Anglo-Saxon Emotions* is well structured and a pleasure to read. It is an important addition to Ashgate's 'Studies in Early Medieval Britain and Ireland' series.

MATTHEW FIRTH, *University of New England*

Khanmohamadi, Shirin A., *In Light of Another's Word: European Ethnography in the Middle Ages* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 216; 1 b/w illustration; R.R.P. US\$47.50, £31.00; ISBN 9780812245622.

Shirin A. Khanmohamadi's first book is a major reworking of her PhD dissertation (Columbia University, 2005). The book improves upon her dissertation, notably in the omission of a slightly awkward chapter on Marie de France's *Lais* in favour of a new chapter on Jean de Joinville's *La vie de Saint Louis*. The result is a tighter series of reworked essays that also examine the *Descriptio Kambriae* of Gerard of Wales, the *Iterarium* of William of Rubruck, and the *Travels of John of Mandeville*, thus focusing on a genre of medieval writing from the end of the twelfth up to the mid-fourteenth century that some still refer to as 'travel literature'. The inclusion of Rubruck nonetheless uncomfortably expands the book into realms that cry out for consideration of other authors like the extraordinary Odoric of Pordenone or John of Montecorvino, but such gaps have been recently and admirably filled, for example, by Kim M. Phillips's *Before Orientalism: Asian Peoples and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245–1510* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013).

Khanmohamadi adopts a recent critical position, styling these examples of medieval travel literature as 'medieval ethnography', which she also classes as a genre of anthropological writing. She is not alone in doing so, joined by notables like Robert Bartlett and Joan-Pau Rubiés. Some readers might object, however, to her rudimentary definitions of ethnography as 'discourse on observed manners and customs', and anthropology as 'the set of ideas and theories attempting to account for cultural diversity of the unity of the "human"' (p. 11). Whether medieval theologies, cosmologies, and other systems of thought (especially experiential scholasticism in the mode of Roger Bacon) can be subsumed into a theory of discourses is beside the point: the modern terms 'ethnography' and 'anthropology' evoke a teleology

that risks refashioning the past in the image of the present. While all history tends in this direction, these sorts of terminological impasses thwart the historiographical dialogue of the past and present.

In this same vein, there is a strongly secularising thread running through Khanmohamadi's book. Khanmohamadi overplays the influence of 'pagan' classical literature upon late medieval travel literature while conversely ignoring the thread of scholastic theology in the writings of Albertus Magnus and Thomas Aquinas. Perhaps the most notable omission is St Augustine, who was well known for his position in his *City of God* that even monsters were God's people. Similar theological views permeate the thinking of Roger Bacon.

It is difficult to understand Khanmohamadi's reasons for adopting such an approach, but the results are sometimes problematic, as, for example, in the chapter on William of Rubruck's account of his travels to the Mongol Khan. Saliently, she emphasises the place of self-reflection and self-visualisation in the mendicant art of preaching. Aron Gurevich has already noted how this practice had transformed preaching in European contexts. It permits Khanmohamadi to identify several instances of conscious self-representation and reflective engagement with Mongol hosts in William's account. Yet, one cannot help noting that it is William writing about William in his *Itarium*: sometimes more critical space needed to be placed between what William portrayed and the reality of a man that was initially seen as an odd ascetic who, for example, to the amusement of his Mongol hosts, chose not to wear shoes in the biting frost and, as A. J. Watson pointed out in the *Journal of Medieval History* 37 (2011), did not understand Mongol gift culture. For Franciscans like William, the exemplary life of their founder, especially his travelling to Egypt to preach before the Sultan, provided a model for the order's interaction with the world's peoples. Franciscans like Ramon Lull recognised the centrality of language in this experience, although this is one of the weakest aspects of William's interaction with his Mongol hosts through an untrustworthy interpreter. Indeed a focus on speech, and one might add song, is one not safely encompassed in Khanmohamadi's approach that relies throughout on visual approaches and optical theory.

Despite these reservations, Khanmohamadi's book provides a refreshing account of medieval travel literature from the recent position of postcolonial medieval studies. She emphasises that these early trans-Eurasian encounters cannot be read according to a colonialist critique. This is not a new position: the late Janet Abu-Lughod noted in her now classic book *Before European Hegemony: The World System AD 1250–1350* (Oxford University Press, 1989) that in the scheme of trans-Eurasian contacts during the rise and fall of the Mongol Empire, European economic entities were inferior to their more easterly counterparts in terms of trade and technology. Europeans had not

yet forged the instruments of power – including regulative mechanisms of institutionalised religion – which colonial hegemonies relied upon in the post-1492 Age of Conquest. Khanmohamadi nonetheless provides a rich account of the four authors examined in each chapter of her book, and makes a valuable contribution to the reinigorated field of medieval travel literature studies.

JASON STOESSEL, *University of New England*

Kirkham, Anne, and Cordelia **Warr**, eds, *Wounds in the Middle Ages* (History of Medicine in Context), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 270; 1 b/w illustration; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781409465690.

Ten essays bring expertise in both the humanities and the sciences to bear on the title topic, *Wounds in the Middle Ages*. In their Introduction, the editors, Anne Kirkham and Cordelia Warr, note the many significances of wounds, not only Christ's crucifixion wounds and their devotional-text setting, but wounds in the military, medical, or theological spheres, they, too, associated with particular texts.

Part I's single essay is a medical overview, John Clasper's 'The Management of Military Wounds in the Middle Ages'. It begins with the wound itself, explaining the usual treatment practices (washing, styptics, astringents, antiseptics, dressings) and the ways wounds heal. A history of wound management from antiquity to the thirteenth century follows, and then of the (partly overlapping) development of surgery in Europe. Clasper notes that ancient treatments, the basis of medieval surgeons' management of wounds, were not without major debates (whether, for instance, pus was good or bad). He discusses the views of the most important surgeon-authors, such as Teodorico Borgognoni, Hugh of Lucca, Henri of Mondeville, and John Aderne, and concludes with a brief consideration of modern practices.

Part II contains two closely related essays. Warr considers medieval descriptions of stigmata and how they differed via two case studies: St Francis of Assisi and Lucia Brocadelli de Narni (*d.* 1544). Warr shows how knowledge of medical theory and practice relating to wounds was used in establishing supernatural or other agency. Louise Elizabeth Wilson examines 'how medical practitioners engaged in the treatment of wounds were portrayed in the miracle accounts' (p. 63). Using St Edmund's miracles (Bibliothèque Municipale d'Auxerre, 123G), Wilson is alert to the challenges in assessing attitudes to the practitioners at a time when they were increasingly involved in civil law cases and canonisation procedures.

In Part III, 'The Broken Body, The Broken Soul', the implied connection is explored. Karine van 't Land's essay studies the learned medical perception of wounds as 'a dissolution of the body'. She focuses investigation on one of

the most influential treatises, the *Canon* of Avicenna (d. 1037), a translation of Ibn Sina's *Qanun*. This study is valuable to many scholars, including those of the medieval Church: excommunications, for instance, listed many of the types of bodily dissolution mentioned here, such as the swellings on the skin, *apostemata*. M. K. K. Yearl's stimulating contribution, addressing 'theological medicine', complements van 't Land's. Using the works of Hugh of Fouillooy (d. c. 1172), William of Saint-Thierry, and others, Yearl discusses their belief that man's moral frailty originated in the body and was responsible for wounding the soul, thus suggesting that the views of early physicians and philosophers who did not make this connection were incomplete.

Part IV's two essays are only loosely linked. Hannah Priest chooses Chrétien's *Eric et Enide* to assess the role of wounds in the construction of chivalric masculinity, and the intersection of that role with the (non-medical) discourse surrounding the wounds of Christ as the 'Man of Sorrows'. Jenny Benham looks at wounding and recompense or punishment in Scandinavian and English medieval law and legal practice, although again, literary texts are as involved in the discussion as legal records.

Part V, 'Wound Surgery in the Fourteenth Century', heads two essays on aspects of this topic. Benham's legal essay would sit better with the first of these, John Naylor's well-structured 'Medicine for Surgical Practice in Fourteenth-Century England: The Judgement against John le Spicer'. Naylor looks most perceptively at the evidence for the London coroner's verdict of professional neglect in the case of a facial wound in 1353. Maria Patijn's 'The Medical Crossbow from Jan Yperman to Isaak Koedijck', by contrast, might have been better placed after Clasper's chapter on military wounds. For Patijn reports on the Flemish physician, Jan Yperman (d. c. 1330), his *Cyurgie*, and an operation illustrated therein, which used a crossbow to remove an embedded arrow. Patijn helpfully examines the medical use of the crossbow in many other illustrated manuscript and printed sources, showing that the practice was generally known.

Part VI contains Lila Yawn's lively essay that exposes the fallacy of violent dismemberment as 'a medieval idiosyncrasy' (p. 223). Her proofs are drawn from Roman times to the 1914–18 war, and she singles out for detailed attention a distinctively medieval attitude to dismemberment: that it could be positive.

An index and superb bibliographies after each essay add greatly to the book's usefulness.

JANET HADLEY WILLIAMS, *Australian National University*

Kirkland-Ives, Mitzi, *In the Footsteps of Christ: Hans Memling's Passion Narratives and the Devotional Imagination in the Early Modern Netherlands* (Proteus, 5), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xxiv, 212; 16 b/w illustrations, 7 colour plates; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503534060.

This insightful, elegantly written, and carefully argued new study is an important addition to the understandings of Hans Memling's narrative paintings and the devotional life of the early modern Netherlands. The book convincingly contends that Memling's Passion narratives are best understood as inviting an embodied devotional response analogous to devotional processional practices in both urban, northern Europe and the Holy Land.

Chapter 1 offers an extended description of three Memling works: a Passion panel originally from Bruges, now in Turin; the Seven Joys of Mary, now in Munich; and the Lübeck Greverada Altarpiece. Description is, of course, interpretation, and the reader of Mitzi Kirkland-Ives's nuanced accounts is rewarded with illuminating readings that neatly demonstrate her arguments for a 'kinetic' epistemology of such images, and their relationships to practices of memory. Indeed, links between these images and rhetorical traditions of memory places (*loci*) might, I think, be extended to consider interest in the order (*ordo*) of narration in the Gospels in the fifteenth-century Low Countries.

The second chapter contains rich and detailed presentations of early modern pilgrimages to Jerusalem. These accounts are quoted at length, allowing readers to encounter a variety of pilgrim voices. The chapter continues the task of showing how devotional imaginations were shaped by 'locations', by the processional culture of Jerusalem, and by the bodily and kinetic experience of holy sites. Accompanying this analysis of 'actual' pilgrimage is an emphasis on 'virtual pilgrimage' for devout readers in the Low Countries, one frame through which Memling's narrative images might be viewed. A final thread in the analysis attends to the ways that devotional practices from the Low Countries shaped the experiences of pilgrims in the Holy Land. This analysis means that scholars now must think further about how the particular social positions of pilgrims – priests, nobles, merchants – affected their devotional expectations and experiences, and how particular images, or image groups, shaped pilgrims' experiences of holy sites.

Chapter 3 returns to the Low Countries and to their processional and dramatic cultures. This is well-ploughed ground, and the material here is not new. What is offered instead is patient reconstructions of the plethora of different processions and dramatic re-enactments on offer in the urban milieu: from the great civic entries of the nobility to weekly processions before or after Sunday mass. Although more might usefully be said about the variety of these regular liturgical processions, few could doubt the chapter's conclusion, that viewers of Memling's works were trained in

experiences of ‘continuous narrative’ where scenes from the biblical past were re-enacted and mapped onto the geography of early modern towns. A processional ‘epistemology’ emerges here which, as Kirkland-Ives neatly shows, was shaped by the processional nature of many of the biblical episodes commemorated (Christ’s entry into Jerusalem, the ascent and descent of Calvary). The procession becomes not simply the mimesis of an individual moment, but the mimesis of a process.

In the fourth chapter, Kirkland-Ives lays out an array of devotional practices that brought the Passion narrative into the fifteenth- and sixteenth-century present. The chapter commences with an extended examination of the sacred geography of Bruges’s *Jeruzalemkerk*, a space that allowed the bodily experience of a pilgrimage to Jerusalem in the heart of the town. Kirkland-Ives sees a ‘more thoroughly developed spatial dimension’ in devotional texts of the period, including the works of the fourteenth-century Dominican mystic Heinrich de Suso, where the Passion is mapped onto monastic geography in a series of memory places. Suso’s texts form part of a wider culture of enacting the Passion narrative through ‘stations’ like those installed on city streets, and in episodic cycles of prayer and images like the seven falls of Christ. This broader culture illuminates a reading of Dürer’s large Passion cycle, where each turn of the page is seen as implying a processional movement from station to station. Memling’s narrative scenes come to occupy a middle ground between this strictly episodic approach and the more thickly textured somatic experiences of pilgrimages, processions, and Stations of the Cross.

The conclusion advances important arguments concerning Memling’s novel inclusion of multi-episode narratives in the same spatial frame. Memling’s narrative spaces can allow ‘ruptures’ of normal chronology, where episodes not in chronological sequence speak to each other; Christ’s and the Virgin’s birth, for example, or the Last Supper and Christ’s agony in the garden. Here, Kirkland-Ives sees space perhaps ‘trump[ing] time’ (p. 177). These arguments tend towards conflating sequential ‘chronology’ with ‘time’, creating what I think is an inaccurate flattening of the possible temporalities of the period. But this small observation should not take away from the achievement of this study in bringing to light habits of thought and action implied by, and embedded in, images, processions, and pilgrimages, and their capacity to make and unsettle space and time in the period.

MATTHEW S. CHAMPION, *St Catharine’s College, Cambridge*

Knoeff, Rina, and Robert **Zwijnenberg**, eds, *The Fate of Anatomical Collections* (History of Medicine in Context), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 336; 10 colour, 29 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781409468158.

This volume provides a new and insightful look into anatomical collections and medical museums. Distinct from other histories of medicine, its primary focus is on the management and fate of anatomical collections, here defined as ‘preparations as well as wax and papier-mâché models’ (p. 5).

The Introduction maps out the historiography surrounding this topic, establishing the gap this text is filling in the field of medical history. Editors Rina Knoeff and Robert Zwijnenberg argue that past histories have generally been concerned with the development of early medical museums or their relationship to the wider public and note that a comprehensive account of what happened to these early anatomical collections has yet to be written. The main aim of the collection is to show the ways in which the interdisciplinary study of anatomical collections can reveal not only advances in medicine but also the history and humanity behind the acquisition of specimens. In support of this aim, the subsequent chapters analyse a range of anatomical collections to see how they have been adapted and transformed to adhere to changes in practice and management. The collection’s interdisciplinary nature is well demonstrated by the inclusion of Ruth Richardson’s chapter titled ‘Organ Music’, in which she writes a fictional account from the perspective of the anatomical specimens themselves. This tale of how anatomical specimens are attached to both physical and musicological bodies nicely complements the volume’s more factual Introduction.

The book is divided into five main sections, but this reviewer found the organisation somewhat confusing: the Introduction states that they are chronologically arranged, but there is a definite sense that they are grouped by theme.

The first section, ‘Fated Collections’, outlines some of the factors that have been crucial to the fate of anatomical collections. Andrew Cunningham, for example, writes on how the Hunterian Museum altered considerably under Richard Owen’s curatorial presence, highlighting how important the curators, or keepers, of anatomical collections have been in shaping a collection’s identity and purpose. The following chapters in this section consider both unsuccessful and successful anatomical collections, linking the discussions back to one of the volume’s main themes, management.

The third section, ‘Preparations, Models and Users’, analyses how anatomical collections fared in the hands of their users. This section features some especially insightful essays covering a range of topics, from travelling anatomical collections in Vienna to the Roca Museum. The last chapter in this section in particular links back to the introductory discussion, showing

how flexible anatomical collections can be and how they can adapt to new audiences and new needs. In the fourth section, 'Provenance and Fate', the contributions take an interesting new direction, offering three careful analyses of the issue of provenance behind specimen acquisition and the subsequent problems that have arisen.

The most innovative articles can be found within the last section, 'Museum Collection Practices Today', in which, too, the chronological organisation is clearest, with modern problems and museological issues discussed. In her chapter, for instance, Rina Knoeff eloquently raises the issue of anatomical specimens being regarded as relics and their consequent veneration by the public. This chapter draws connections between specimens, display, and relics, adding another element, that of spiritual or religious sensations, to the book.

The Fate of Anatomical Collections successfully demonstrates that anatomical collections are still relevant, and that they are fluid, adapting and changing to suit the times, and most importantly that medical history can be interdisciplinary.

REBECCA LUSH, *The University of Sydney*

Kühnel, Bianca, Galit **Noga-Banai**, and Hanna **Vorholt**, eds, *Visual Constructs of Jerusalem* (Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages, 18), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; paperback; pp. xxxviii, 492; 24 colour, 254 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €150.00; ISBN 9782503551043.

This substantial volume consists of forty-four essays in English, originally delivered at the conference 'Visual Constructs of Jerusalem' held in Jerusalem on 14–20 November 2010. Impressive in its contributions, this anthology highlights some of the most recent scholarly and methodological approaches to the study of Jerusalem and its textual, visual, topographic, and symbolic representations. The essays range from iconographical and archaeological studies to historical and more theoretical examinations of sites, objects, and issues related to Jerusalem and its constructs. In this guise, the edited volume under consideration deliberately complements, and also supplements, the 1998 collection of essays *The Real and Ideal Jerusalem in Jewish, Christian, and Islamic Art* (Center for Jewish Art, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 1998), as editors Bianca Kühnel, Galit Noga-Banai, and Hanna Vorholt outline in their Introduction.

One of the real strengths of this anthology resides in its wide-ranging contributions. The essays all look at the topic from various methodological perspectives, and address a variety of sources such as topographical and architectural constructs, maps, murals, sculpture, manuscripts, and printed

books, as well as textual sources such as pilgrimage accounts. In addition to the array of sources and approaches and the historiographical discussions, the temporal and geographical parameters of the essays are equally impressive, ranging from the early Middle Ages through to the early modern period, and including material from Italy, Scandinavia, Croatia, Serbia, and Armenia, just to name a few.

Although not distributed equally, the essays are arranged in thematic categories – some more carefully defined than others – that explore topics such as the formations of *loci sancti*, architectural and topographical translations of Jerusalem, relics and rituals, maps of the city, the Holy Land, and *Mappae Mundi*, as well as literary works and Byzantine approaches to the topic. Many of the essays consider the specific historical and social conditions that motivated particular textual, visual, topographic, and/or symbolic representations or manifestations of Jerusalem and/or the Holy Land in a particular time and place. Some contributions also set in dialogue developments from the Latin and Greek ecclesiastical domains, while others consider links among modes of representation and translation across media that also span great distances in time and geography. All of the essays in the volume demonstrate good models of thorough scholarship. The contributions by Ora Limor, Barbara Baert, Nikolas Jaspert, and Robert Ousterhout deserve special mention for the careful and nuanced reading of the primary and secondary sources and the scholarly exposition of their arguments.

This volume is well produced with footnotes rather than endnotes, and the individual contributions are not particularly lengthy. The twenty-four colour plates are grouped together at the beginning of the book and a substantial number of black-and-white images appear throughout the rest of the volume. The individual essays, thus, could serve nicely in teaching various aspects of Jerusalem and its constructs in particular historical contexts.

Short bibliographies at the end of each essay, or perhaps a general bibliography at the end of the volume, comprising the most cited sources related to the topic from each of the contributions, would have been a welcome addition and could have served as a more general point of departure for future investigations by students and younger scholars in particular. Nevertheless, this impressive collection is a valuable addition to the library of any historian or art historian, and it is particularly noteworthy for its pedagogical value and the many avenues it encourages for further scholarly inquiries.

Alice Isabella Sullivan, *University of Michigan*

Leitch, Megan G., *Romancing Treason: The Literature of the Wars of the Roses*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2015; hardback; pp. 280; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9780198724599.

Since John Bellamy's *The Law of Treason in the Later Middle Ages* (Cambridge University Press, 1970), book-length publications dealing directly with treason in the medieval period have been few and far between. Megan Leitch confronts this seemingly unexplainable paucity of work with a comprehensive analysis of treason in secular literature of the Wars of the Roses.

Developed from Leitch's doctoral work and acknowledging the debt to her supervisor, Helen Cooper, *Romancing Treason* makes an important contribution to the field of fifteenth-century literary studies. In addition to references to Cooper's contributions to the field, the work of James Simpson, David Wallace, Paul Strohm, Larry Benson, and Daniel Wakelin also inform Leitch's study. However, Leitch rightly notes that literary works of the second half of the fifteenth century are less well represented in the historiography. *Romancing Treason* contributes to this gap in scholarship. Reading such works within the context of treason, Leitch also makes significant inroads into exploring the continuities between the literary cultures of the late-Lancastrian and Tudor periods.

Citing a haunting line from the *Squire of Low Degree* – 'Treason walketh wonder wyde' (p. 175) – Leitch remarks upon the way these words present an image of treason personified. The image is pervasive, cutting to the core of *Romancing Treason's* argument, that in the period c. 1437–c. 1497 treason was everywhere, in text and beyond. Leitch asserts that the presence of treason in the textual culture of the Wars of the Roses created anxieties about community and identity while also offering a way through which these anxieties could be addressed. Looking closely at treason in Thomas Malory's *Morte Darthur* and also reading the *Morte* within the wider context of other contemporary prose romances and secular literature of the period, Leitch provides a multitude of instances of how this was so. These other contemporary sources include, for example, the prose *Siege of Thebes*, *Siege of Troy*, *Melusine*, Caxton's prose romances, letters, bills, chronicles, and verse. Incorporated within this analysis is Leitch's convincing argument for the literary complexity of some of these lesser-studied texts. In addition, questions of periodisation are tackled as Leitch suggests that the concept of treason provides a fruitful way of reading across the medieval and early modern periods. For example, in highlighting how fifteenth-century texts challenged ideas of providence, Leitch argues that, in this respect, the divide between medieval and early modern is not so pronounced. As *Romancing Treason* seeks to explore the anxieties surrounding treason in the literature of the period, to consider lesser-known texts of the period in this context, and to examine how treason can be used to map changes and continuities across

time, the line, 'Treason walketh wonder wyde', also reflects the scope of this ambitious, yet successful, work.

The book progresses smoothly, signposted with many a subheading throughout. After a comprehensive Introduction (Chapter 1), the second chapter argues that treason was found across literary forms and 'weighed heavily on people's minds' (p. 20). Beginning with the oft-cited, but perfectly chosen, 1460 letter of William Paston II recounting the exchange between Lancastrian and Yorkist lords at Calais, Leitch sets the scene for the themes of the chapter as she demonstrates that a shared mentality of treason and its associated anxieties extended from this Paston family letter to other genres of texts and to wider audiences.

The broadening of both genre and community leads nicely into Chapter 3 in which Leitch confirms the value of these lesser-read texts for literary analysis and demonstrates their well-suitedness to a reading through the category of treason, and understandings of it across time. Chapter 4 builds on the argument of the previous chapter to show how Malory's *Morte Darthur* confronts social instability as it condemns treason and highlights the relationship between 'lived and literary experiences' (p. 131). Continuing the themes of audience reception and circulation, Chapter 5 sets other printed texts alongside Malory's *Morte Darthur*. In Chapter 6, 'Postscript', Leitch draws attention to the decline of treason-focused texts into the sixteenth century and reaffirms treason as a useful concept through which to track the path from medieval to early modern.

Romancing Treason is a cohesive study, with a convincing and well-presented argument. It is carefully edited, and includes a thorough bibliography and index. The Appendix, 'Chronology', tabulates historical events alongside textual production across the period, a useful tool drawing attention to the necessity of reading literary texts within the contexts of their time. Leitch's work will appeal broadly to any whose interests lie in literary and/or historical studies of culture, politics, and/or law. One of the great strengths of *Romancing Treason* is the way that both fields are brought together, with the result being an important contribution to each.

SALLY FISHER, *Monash University*

Llewellyn, Kathleen M., *Representing Judith in Early Modern French Literature*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. v, 150; 6 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472435330.

Examining Francophone plays, poems, and printed sermons, Kathleen Llewellyn explores the biblical figure of Judith. Judith's was a story with many contradictions for early modern audiences, but which allowed writers and readers an imaginative investigation of the possibilities of female power (including sexual power) harnessed for good.

In this slim volume, Llewellyn only partially succeeds in connecting her detailed textual analyses to wider contexts. Although the political, religious, social, and cultural context of sixteenth-century France is alluded to in the Introduction, little is said directly about how it influenced these presentations by Catholic and Protestant writers. Such factors Llewellyn offers as negative female regencies, religious wars, or an apparent preoccupation with death in early modern France are not brought to bear on these particular interpretations. Further, we know little of how these works were selected; as representative of a wider corpus of contemporary texts about Judith, unique examples, or particularly unusual interpretations? This seems key, especially to assessing the claim to a particularly French interest in Judith at this time and what might underpin it.

Where Llewellyn is strongest is in her careful interpretation of the individual texts. She argues that in *Le Mystère de Judith et Holofernés*, probably authored by Jean de Molinet around the turn of the sixteenth century, Judith's actions are presented as a performance, enacted on the stage of the enemy camp, in which she is an agent of God. In such a way, she does not subvert patriarchy so much as demonstrate obedience to God's will. Llewellyn then explores the poem *La Judit* by Huguenot poet Guillaume Salluste Du Bartas (published 1574), apparently commissioned by Jeanne de Navarre. Drawing upon contemporary theories of sight, she argues that Du Bartas privileges the spectacle of Judith's beauty and attire, and her invisibility at other key moments. In keeping with Calvinist views and perhaps with female readers in mind, this Judith must borrow her jewels and fine clothes, her beauty is deeply problematic (hinted even through choices of rhyme and rhythm) and she is absent in scenes of feasting and drinking.

Curiously, the fact that the Book of Judith was removed from Protestant Bibles by Du Bartas's time is not mentioned until the following chapter, in which Llewellyn examines the *Imitation de la victoire de Judich* by Catholic poet, Gabrielle de Coignard (published posthumously in 1594). Coignard invokes varied notions of community – urban and feminine – within her text while also inserting herself into a group of strong, widowed women in history. Llewellyn interprets parallels between Bethulia and Coignard's Toulouse attacked by Huguenot forces during the wars, and the strong female partnership between Judith and her maidservant Abra. By comparison to the sexually alluring Judiths of male authors, Coignard's is noticeably chaste and humble.

Pierre Heyns, an Antwerp schoolmaster whose play was intended for a juvenile female audience, creates an exemplar. Framing allegorical characters provide commentary to help impressionable viewers to emphasise the heroine's virtues and Judith is distanced from her more reprehensible acts. Llewellyn argues that Heyns's choice of this murderous heroine had a

powerful didactic purpose: Judith, and the lessons Heyns hoped to convey, were likely to be unforgettable. Finally, Llewellyn examines sermons published across the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. Here, she observes, the story of Judith is rarely evoked in its entirety. Only isolated virtues – her fervour, austerity, desire for solitude – are praiseworthy, and this compartmentalisation reflected how problematic Judith's actions had become as a whole for Counter-Reformation Catholicism.

Interestingly, Llewellyn concludes that Judith was anything but silent in the hands of these authors – indeed, they all wanted to speak for her in their own ways. I am less sure, however, about Llewellyn's conclusion that scope for 'early modern woman was perhaps less limited than many have suggested' (p. 135) on the strength of this evidence. One could perhaps argue just as easily that presentations of the Judith story – functioning as a site for exploring strong, fervent women in a purely imaginative forum, and still limited sense, since she assumed this role temporarily and while inhabited by God's will – did as much to maintain the status quo of patriarchy, during a period in which women's right to independent spiritual action appeared increasingly diminished. A stronger articulation at the conclusion of what precisely was distinct about these Francophone treatments (if indeed they can be considered a group with shared preoccupations and contexts) and how these textual presentations can be compared to visual Catholic and Protestant presentations of her story (provided in six black-and-white illustrations) would have been welcome.

However, it is perhaps no bad thing that this intriguing study provokes questions for which it does not yet have the answers. Llewellyn opens a door to a subject that she demonstrates certainly merits further research.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

Lucas, Adam, *Ecclesiastical Lordship, Seigneurial Power and the Commercialization of Milling in Medieval England*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 436; 37 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £90.00; ISBN 9781409421962.

Adam Lucas has been working on the history of mills of all technological sorts – water, wind, tide, horse, and hand – as well as the categories into which they fall, for many years as a follower of Richard Holt and John Langton whom he thanks profusely in his acknowledgements. This book should be regarded as a sequel to his earlier work, *Wind, Water, Work: Ancient and Medieval Milling Technology* (Brill, 2006), and is difficult to read without reference back to it. He has summarised his present argument in 'The Role of the Church in the English Milling Trade, 1086–1540' (available through academia.edu) which makes his position *vis à vis* the different schools of thought clear. Although he

sees the motivation for monastic interest in mills as complex and as varying over time, his own theory, which largely dismisses any idea of monastic care for their tenants, also explains why he avoids some works that one might otherwise expect to find, such as Joshua Getzler's *A History of Water Rights at Common Law* (Oxford University Press, 2004).

Lucas's concentration on mills is justified. At different periods, religious houses managed nearly 50 per cent of all known mills, the portion of their income that the returns represented was considerable, and they were an important source of cash. Unfortunately, he evidently cannot relate the return to the monastery from the mill to the probable area of land or clientele it serviced and there is little indication of the capacity of the mill itself. These are questions that might be relevant to the degree of satisfaction owner, miller, and customer felt and explain the nature of any litigation.

Circumstances have limited Lucas to published material, which accounts for the suggestion that *Inquisitions Post Mortem* end in 1422. His lack of access to manuscripts such as ecclesiastical, manorial, or royal court records leaves some queries about the nature of otherwise unrecorded lawsuits. Among the extensive published cartularies he has chosen twenty-one religious houses as a sample for detailed study that he hopes provide a balanced coverage of the different religious orders, their size, and location. He has studied four Benedictine, nine Augustinian, five Cistercian, and five 'other' orders for the evidence of monastic attitudes to mills.

Lucas sets this detailed study after a survey of the introduction and spread of the different orders, their relationship to their patrons, their management of their estates, and the development of feudal land tenure. He does not look closely at the various recensions of Magna Carta and the charter relating to royal forests where the rights of patrons and donors over abbeys are set and so apparently misses the clause that prohibits monasteries from taking lands from a donor and leasing them back to him, a clause that casts light on some of their previous behaviour.

He accepts that commercialisation, as defined by R. H. Britnell, was happening but does not see it as a forerunner of the Industrial Revolution. He then devotes a chapter to the bishoprics and archbishoprics before examining each of the monastic orders in turn in terms of their overall wealth, the level of their seigniorial authority, the geographical location of their properties, and their interest in commercial exploitation. His detailed examination of each of the mills in his sample is punctilious if frustrating as he rarely discusses the whole of the resources the house had in the area. Sometimes these could be illuminating but apart from places where any dispute over mills is evidently related to the attempts of the monastery to dominate a town – at Cirencester and St Albans, for instance – we get little background. His information is patchy so that we can rarely know who built any particular

mills or what it cost, although it is probable the expenditure would require considerable resources. Lucas offers occasional estimates of the cost of maintenance or upkeep and differentiates between water, wind, and tide mill types on the basis of his earlier work although he does not have figures for most of the mills. Inevitably in a study aiming to cover most of England, his local geographical knowledge on occasion lets him down.

Surprisingly, when it comes to English mill law, after acknowledging its complexity and the problem of establishing when suit of mill appeared, he discusses all aspects of mill rights together and throws in the rights and responsibilities of the tenants alongside other customs. An initial discussion of the division of jurisdiction over tithes between ecclesiastical, royal, and manorial courts might have clarified the argument. He cites Bracton cursorily but might have benefitted from considering Coke's explanations and the cases he cites, even though Coke wrote in the late sixteenth century.

Lucas's final conclusions are that the long-established episcopal and Benedictine houses were better able to exercise seigneurial jurisdiction, including suit of mill, than the houses that were established later. He also sees significant differences between southern and northern monasteries and their involvement in industrial milling although whether that is because they were able to write on a *tabula rasa* in the north might be queried by those who would emphasise the palatinate jurisdictions.

This will be an invaluable reference book for, and its argument will challenge, any historian who subsequently seeks to evaluate this aspect of monastic economic practices in England.

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*

McClive, Cathy, *Menstruation and Procreation in Early Modern France* (Women and Gender in the Early Modern World), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 280; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9780754666035.

In this new monograph, Cathy McClive analyses how the relationship between menstruation and procreation has been perceived both in the early modern period and in the present. Her study addresses three key assumptions about sex, gender, and reproduction during the period 1500 to 1800, namely: that menstruation had largely negative connotations; that it was a direct signifier of womanhood; and that the relationship between menstruation and procreation was straightforward.

Existing scholarship on menstruation in the early modern period typically references the 'menstruation as pollution' paradigm, or highlights its role as a biological determinant. Using the case study of early modern France, the author deconstructs this myth of 'menstrual misogyny' and challenges the traditional gender/sex dyad. Through analysis of early modern French

medical and theological works, and close readings of case studies from personal and judicial sources, McClive reveals a spectrum of both positive and negative attitudes towards this issue.

McClive's study is divided into six chapters. Chapter 1 traces the theological origins of menstruation dogma. By contextualising the relevant passages from Leviticus (Chapters 15, 18, and 20), Pliny the Elder (23–79 CE), and Aristotle (384–22 BCE), we can observe what historian David Biale has termed 'procreative theology'. It would appear that the original biblical interdiction on sex during menstruation arose solely due to anxieties that this was not an optimal time for conception. Pliny the Elder wrote that 'coitus [with a menstruating woman was] fatal for men' in certain circumstances, and that menstruating women had the potential to destroy crops, sour wine, and give dogs rabies (p. 31). These negative associations can be juxtaposed against what Pliny considered the therapeutic benefits of the menses, such as curing epilepsy and tumours, in addition to forming and nourishing an unborn foetus. The second section elaborates on Biale's 'procreative theology' through the analysis of confessionals and medical literature. The key belief espoused in these sources was that procreation would be most successful and produce the healthiest offspring in the immediate aftermath of a menstrual evacuation, when the surface of the womb was 'watered and stickier' (p. 94).

Chapter 3 addresses how menstrual regularity was fundamental to perceptions of women's health and fertile potential in early modern France. Through female narratives and medical observations, the 'bad weeks', 'monthly rain', or 'rules' were measured and monitored to determine what constituted menstrual norms. Such norms were employed in the alleged stigmata case of Marie-Catherine Cadière in 1730 to ascertain whether there was any concurrence of Cadière's symptoms with her menstrual cycle. The fourth chapter analyses the early modern adage that 'fertile trees flower before bearing fruit' (p. 149). McClive shows that contemporaries regarded the relationship between menstruation, sexual intercourse, and conception as ambiguous. Indeed, according to prevailing early modern medical theories and judicial standards, the cessation of menses was considered insufficient proof of pregnancy.

In Chapter 5, McClive reveals how anxieties regarding paternity and inheritance rights cultivated a socio-cultural preoccupation with determining the expected length of a pregnancy. While lunar and solar months, and calculation error on the part of the expectant mother, could prolong or shorten pregnancies, early modern medical authorities considered a normal pregnancy to last between seven and eleven months.

The final chapter examines the 'exceptional normal', to ascertain whether menstruation was considered both sex-specific and a stable signifier of womanhood in early modern France. Using case studies of hermaphrodites

and 'bleeding' men, McClive deconstructs the universal categories of 'woman', the female 'body', and the feminine gender, to provoke recognition of myriad bodies and challenge traditional reductive definitions of the physical body and gender. The eighteenth-century case of Michel-Anne Drouart exemplifies the fluid nature of sex and gender, and suggests that not all bodies conformed to Thomas Laqueur's one- or two-sex models.

Was the act of menstruation sufficient to categorise a body as female? Did menstruation carry wholly negative connotations? And was the relationship between menstruation and procreation in early modern France straightforward? McClive's answer to all three of these questions is a resounding 'no'. This study extends existing scholarship on menstruation in the early modern period. It presents a well-researched and cogent argument on the complexities and ambiguities inherent in the relationship between the menses and conception. While the topic of 'menstruation and procreation' may not appeal to all readers, the author's inclusion of curious contemporary anecdotes and case studies make this book a worthwhile read.

JANE BITOMSKY, *The University of Queensland*

Maddern, Christine, *Raising the Dead: Early Medieval Name Stones in Northumbria* (Studies in the Early Middle Ages, 38), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xviii, 306; 6 colour, 32 b/w illustrations, 12 b/w line art; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503532189.

Christine Maddern's work examines twenty-nine stones incised with a cross and one or more names, either in roman or runic script. Stones incised with crosses but without names are more widespread, but the name stones are seemingly unusual in Anglo-Saxon funerary practice, and most come from two sites. Hartlepool has yielded up nine such name stones, nearby Billingham, one, while seventeen come from Lindisfarne (one now lost), and single examples have been found at Monkwearmouth, Birtley, and Wensley. Most are associated with monastic cemeteries, and date to the eighth century.

The name stones stand apart as a group because of their diminutive size compared with other grave furnishings in stone, such as grave covers or upright memorial headstones. As small, flat slabs probably intended to be recumbent or set against a wall, their dimensions and their design bear a strong resemblance to the cross pages of contemporary manuscripts, such as those in the *Lindisfarne Gospels*, and this similarity would have been all the more striking if they were painted, as residues on one or two suggest.

Name stones have usually been described as 'memorial stones' or 'grave markers', but Maddern looks to eschatological belief and liturgical practice in order to discern the probable function of these stones as signs of belief in, and perhaps anxiety about, the doctrine of bodily resurrection. They seem

to have been regarded as a kind of *Liber Vitae* and a stimulus to prayer on behalf of the deceased, or even as embodied prayers in themselves. Maddern has compiled a detailed and wide-ranging study of the socio-historical, theological, liturgical, and literary backgrounds, in addition to consideration of the areas of archaeology, iconography, and epigraphy that have formed the primary focus for past study of these stones.

The introductory chapters give an account of the stones' physical nature, epigraphy, and excavation history, followed by discussion of analogous stones from sites such as Clonmacnois in Ireland, and the Lombard monastery of San Vincenzo al Volturno in Italy. Only at Hartlepool were Anglo-Saxon name stones discovered in a monastic cemetery *in situ*, during building activity in the 1830s–40s. It has proved a point of controversy whether or not some stones originally lay beneath the skulls of bodies, but Maddern concludes that there is no reason to reject the early accounts making this claim; and the unworn state of these and others suggests that they were interred from the outset. In other words, the inscriptions on the stones need not have been visible to fulfil their function. At Lindisfarne, in contrast, the scattered and fragmented finds might suggest that stones originally resided above ground, perhaps displayed in the main monastic church or another structure, and were later recycled or removed. Although name stones may have played some part in marking the position of a body to prevent intercutting, or to help position the head as a 'pillow stone', or, if above ground, to provide a focus for prayer by the living, it is their spiritual meaning that must define their main function.

The central chapters of the book focus on burial rites and preparation for bodily resurrection, beginning in Chapter 6 with liturgy. Maddern provides a thorough survey of what can be deduced about Northumbrian belief and practice through examining the surviving evidence from England, as for example in the *Stowe Psalter*, and from continental sources such as the Old Gelasian sacramentary, 'Reginensis 316', whose prototype may have been English. Chapters 7 and 8 deal with writing about, and iconographic representation of, 'Apocalypse and Last Judgement', and the documentation of 'Visions, Penances and Prayers'. Chapter 9 concludes the presentation of evidence, with discussion of the iconography of the stones, before Maddern presents her conclusions in Chapter 10.

This book presents a painstaking and detailed exploration of the socio-cultural and artistic background to the name stones, and provides instructive new perspectives on their function. Maddern is judicious and cautious in her conclusions, and presents a compelling case for her view that the stones are indeed all about 'raising the dead', even if the evidence is largely circumstantial. In the absence of any major new discovery of an undisturbed Anglo-Saxon monastic cemetery containing name stones, this book will be, for the foreseeable future, the standard work on the subject. It is well

illustrated and carefully produced, although I did find that in footnotes on page 23, the text cited should be Rosemary Cramp's *Wearmouth and Jarrow Monastic Sites*, and not the *Corpus of Anglo-Saxon Stone Sculpture*.

GREG WAITE, *University of Otago*

Matthews-Grieco, Sara F., ed., *Cuckoldry, Impotence and Adultery in Europe (15th–17th Century)* (Visual Culture in Early Modernity), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 326; 12 colour, 48 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781472414397.

The volume challenges the notion that the transgressive nature of early modern sexual culture is self-evident. In Part I, Jacqueline Marie Musacchio follows the controversial life of the Florentine Grand Duchess Bianca Cappello. She examines Bianca's relationship – despite being married to Piero Buonaventuri – with long-standing lover Francesco de' Medici. Interestingly, Piero was a willing cuckold or wittol having been given a job by Francesco to support Bianca, while also being a philanderer himself. Musacchio unpacks the ensuing complexity through popular Florentine conceptions of adultery, cuckoldry, and house scorning.

Molly Bourne investigates the accusations of impotency against Vincenzo Gonzaga. Early modern physicians tested his virility with the 'trifold operation of erection, penetration and ejaculation' (p. 41). Bourne's fascinating essay identifies how a prince's sexual performance becomes a state concern. M. A. Katritzky examines the skimmington or social shaming ritual in Samuel Butler's three-part poem *Hudibras* (1664). Through magical impotence, Sir Hudibras is targeted by skimmingtons enabling Katritzky to discuss popular seventeenth-century shaming methods. Furthermore, the close association between impotency and cuckoldry emphasises how 'skimmingtons publicly humiliate weak husbands no less than dominant wives' (p. 73). Katritzky concludes a stimulating essay by stating how Butler's poem serves as a social and political satire.

Part II begins with Matteo Duni examining how impotency in the Renaissance could be explained by many widespread causes depending on circumstances. In a critical overview, Duni discusses bad humours, satanic intervention, magic spells, inexperienced youth, and marital incompatibility. Laura Giannetti analyses food recipes that invigorate sexual performance. With the subtitle 'Renaissance Viagra', Giannetti investigates the popular sixteenth-century comic trope of an old man falling for a young woman, in particular, the old man's search for a sexually charged potion. Through a fascinating examination of the enhancing qualities of plants, vegetables, spices, seeds, and fowl, Giannetti unpacks Renaissance anxieties over procreation and old age. Meredith K. Ray critiques sixteenth-century Italian books of

secrets or alchemic sexual remedies. She investigates tests for female virginity and increasing male potency that protected men from cuckoldry.

The essays in Part III analyse visual representations of cuckolds in early modern art with numerous paintings and drawings being reproduced in the book. Francesca Alberti examines Christian tradition and classical mythology in European art by comparing two husbands: Joseph and Vulcan. Both husbands are old with young wives to imply they are cuckolds. Alberti's detailed examination of the visual imagery featuring the two husbands finds an artistic obsession with the cuckold.

Christiane Andersson examines portrayals of cuckolds associated with impotency in early sixteenth-century northern Swiss art. Andersson focuses on two Swiss artists, Niklaus Manuel and Urs Graf, both of whom served as mercenary soldiers. Their drawings depicted mercenaries made vulnerable by military service and their domineering women. In great detail, Andersson studies the bestial imagery associated with cuckoldry, and how men became sex slaves to promiscuous women.

In an entertaining and thought-provoking essay, Louise Rice critiques the comic drawings of the early seventeenth-century Florentine painter Baccio del Bianco. The rich visual style of Baccio's artwork pervades every popular facet of cuckoldry in literary and visual culture. Rice finds every kind of horn associated with cuckoldry including a snail's. In addition, she surmises from Baccio's black chalk drawings that *becco*, the Italian for goat and cuckold, also refers to a bird's beak as a 'pecker'. Cuckoldry and its various associations became a potent comic force in Baccio's prurient imagination.

The editor, Sara F. Matthews-Grieco, ends the volume with seventeenth-century Parisian print culture's unprecedented social and commercial interest in cuckoldry. Her insightful study focuses on print culture as a primary source. Matthews-Grieco discovers marital conflict and unsociable behaviour, such as defecation and drunkenness, ripe for social satire. More seriously, the Parisian prints convey a message of social reform that criticises the city's immorality.

Cuckoldry, Impotence and Adultery in Europe examines sensitive topics that are often ridiculed. The essays adopt a serious but light tone in presenting matters of gendered embarrassment and blatant immorality. Many of the challenging topics in this descriptive and pictorial volume serve as a perfect introduction for undergraduates and lecturers interested in Renaissance sexual culture.

FRANK SWANNACK, *University of Salford*

Mellyn, Elizabeth W., *Mad Tuscans and Their Families: A History of Mental Disorder in Early Modern Italy*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014; cloth; pp. ix, 290; 3 b/w figures, 5 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$55.00, €36.00; ISBN 9780812246124.

Mad Tuscans and Their Families is a fascinating interdisciplinary study, which uses medical and legal sources to understand how families, communities, and civic agencies dealt with the issue of what to do with, and how to care for, people with a mental disorder. That is, those whom contemporaries called 'mad', and whose behaviour sometimes caused chaos in Tuscany for both the family, community, and the state.

This study analyses 300 legal cases, ranging from the mid-fourteenth to the mid-seventeenth century. Almost half the cases are civil cases and the remainder criminal. The majority of cases survive from the sixteenth century onwards, particularly after the 1530s when the ducal system of justice operated and the legal records are in Italian rather than Latin. From 1540, a broader range of Tuscans, not just elite families, began to use the civil courts, and all strata of society are represented in the criminal courts. Gender plays an important part in this narrative. The overwhelming majority of people (over 80 per cent) who appeared in both civil and criminal cases as mad were male, while a substantial minority of petitioners were female (over 40 per cent). Women were perpetual legal minors and were most vulnerable when the male breadwinner was mad and could not support the women and children in his family, threatening its survival and that of his wider patrilineage. There would have been many more people with a mental disorder than appeared in the courts and it is clear from this study that the mentally impaired were not shunned or ostracised by their families and societies. Families looked after their mentally impaired kin and only turned to the civil courts as a last resort when support structures collapsed, confusion reigned, or abuse, neglect, or exploitation of the mentally impaired person was possible.

Chapter 1 examines petitions brought before the Tuscan *magistrato dei pupilli ed adulti* (court of wards), which dealt with the estates and guardianship of minors and mentally impaired adults. The women who appeared in court were the widows, mothers, and aunts 'acting as guardians of patrimony' (p. 21), protecting their family's estate from either the mad person or from rapacious kin. The issue of what to do with criminally insane kin was a problem for the family, community, and the state (Chapter 2), but in general they aimed to protect, and contain rather than punish. Apart from care by the family, the usual outcome, there were few other options. There was a ward for the criminally insane in the communal debtors' prison, but the mentally ill tended not to stay there for long. Galley service was an option that some prisoners were assigned to, or chose, to ensure an end to their sentence. The families of young men under 25 years of age who committed violent crimes

for the first time often portrayed such young men as hot-headed and of little mind, that is mad, in order to seek a mitigation of their sentence. These pleas were often successful. Elizabeth Mellyn argues that the sentences imposed on those deemed mad were often the result of negotiation and compromise.

Contemporary understandings of madness shifted over the three centuries covered in this study. In the thirteenth century, St Francis of Assisi's renunciation of all his worldly goods, including giving his father's earnings to the Church, led to his canonisation. In the mercantile culture of Tuscany, during the sixteenth century or either of the two previous centuries, he would have been declared profligate, deemed mad, and made a ward (Chapter 3). The system of guardianship was designed to preserve what Mellyn calls 'patrimonial rationality'. Spendthrift habits that diluted a family's wealth were viewed as a cause for urgent family and state intervention. By the mid-sixteenth century too, madness was understood as an illness – melancholia – that contemporaries attributed to an imbalance in the body's humours (Chapter 4). This understanding of madness saw it as a physical illness, often pathological, the understanding of which was well enough known by lay people for them to use the language of illness in court to argue for state intervention in their mad kins' lives. For this reason too, the testimonies of lay people in court were believed without the necessity to call upon the medical profession to affirm a diagnosis of mental illness (Chapter 5). Mellyn ends with a brief excursus into the founding of the first institution to house the mentally ill in Tuscany in 1643, the Santa Dorotea dei Pazzereelli.

This book does a masterful job of reminding us that people with mental illness and their carers have a complex history in medieval and early modern Italy, and it deserves further research. This reviewer hopes that Mellyn will undertake that task.

NATALIE TOMAS, *Monash University*

Mengel, David C., and Lisa **Wolverton**, eds, *Christianity and Culture in the Middle Ages: Essays to Honor John Van Engen*, Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 552; R.R.P. US\$68.00; ISBN 9780268035334.

This is a particularly fine tribute to a particularly fine scholar. No respectable medievalist can fail to come to terms with the impressive and stimulating work of John Van Engen, which has been outlined as an appendix. This festschrift and Van Engen's work reflect several important principles, each of which is worthy of consideration and acceptance. First, the scholar must become familiar with the grain of historiographical understanding and, once familiar with the well-worn pathways, intentionally go against the grain and chart out new pathways. Second, medievalists must take religion seriously. Third, Van

Engen's work and the essays in this collection warn about the propensity to sort medieval matters into approved and disapproved taxonomies. Fourth, while the concept of reform may be vexatious, it cannot be dismissed. Fifth, the value of a counterfactual principle should be applied to the entire Middle Ages. Sixth, the goal of scholarship should be neither to defend nor condemn, but to understand and explain. Seventh, 'Christianity', in the later Middle Ages especially, represents a multi-layered complexity filled with options, opportunities, and otherness which defies simplification.

The volume is divided into four foci: the idea of Christianisation; twelfth-century culture; Jews and Christian society; and late medieval religious life. The essays are evenly important, generally well written, suggestive, signposting additional research possibilities: they are a credit to the editors and worthy of presentation to Van Engen. It is impossible in the allotted space to say something about each contribution. I have therefore chosen to reflect on matters that are of personal interest.

Lisa Wolverton's essay on the Christianisation of Bohemia is a model of solid scholarship and critical evaluation. Her contribution, along with those of David Mengel and Marcela Perrett, bring attention to Bohemia, which has for far too long been allowed to languish on the shoals of the mainstream of medieval studies. Perrett's essay is another contribution to an expanding field of investigation into the vernacular sources of the Hussite period. Curiously, she does not mention the analysis of Píbram's polemic against the Tábórite priests published by this reviewer in 2011.

Another essay that stands out for its erudition is R. I. Moore's on the Cathar Middle Ages as an historiographical problem. Against naysayers, it is essential to acknowledge that there really were heretics in the Middle Ages, those who deliberately rejected the authority and teachings of the official Church. Robert Lerner did rightly dispatch the phantom of the Free Spirit heretics a generation ago, but Cathar, Waldensian, and Hussite heretics really did prowl the dimly lit hallways of medieval Europe. The insistence on affirming that heretics were simply created by inquisitors and prelates is not persuasive. Howard Kaminsky was wrong and Jan Hus, for example, was a heretic and so were some of his disciples, the appropriately named Hussites. Moore's essay has historiographical value and should be carefully read. Christine Caldwell Ames's contribution is also valuable in this respect. Moore rightly points out that the collection, *Inventer l'hérésie? Discours polémiques et pouvoirs avant l'Inquisition* (CEPAM, 1998), marks the resetting of the historiographical clock in the study of heresy. This volume is an instructive lesson of how 'nonsense in academic garb should be dealt with'. This is how Moore describes Norman Cohn's takedown of Margaret Murray's thesis about a witch cult and his observation continues to have wide applicability.

Translated primary source documents accompanying several of the contributions are welcome and useful. I find endnotes tedious, and contrary

to the objections of all too many publishing houses, notes at the foot of the page are preferred and ever so much more useful. The volume might have included a photograph of the man who has inspired so many. Otherwise, the editors have much to be proud of and the University of Notre Dame Press has produced an excellent volume, handsomely assembled, and pleasing in every respect, worthy of the substance and reputation of John Van Engen.

THOMAS A. FUDGE, *University of New England*

Mueller, Alex, *Translating Troy: Provincial Politics in Alliterative Romance* (Interventions: New Studies in Medieval Culture), Columbus, Ohio State University Press, 2013; cloth; pp. 253; R.R.P. US\$69.95; ISBN 9780814212219.

This original, well-written, and well-argued study is the latest to challenge the monolithic view – popular when I was in graduate studies in the 1970s – of the so-called ‘Middle English Alliterative Revival’. Alex Mueller first grounds his study, which is as much political as it is literary, in a thoughtful and original rereading of Guido delle Colonne’s *Historia Destructionis Troiae*, which he argues is the foundational text for an alternate reading of the import of Troy and its fall to medieval England’s image of itself. While for Chaucer and his courtly contemporaries, the fall of Troy established the foundation for their own civilisation – England was the New Troy – the alliterative writers expressed marked scepticism about such received wisdom, and resisted any linear view of history that saw their country’s direct descent from fallen Troy and its glorious successor, imperial Rome, as something in which to glory. If anything, the alliterative writers, taking their cue from Guido, offered a provincial critique of the wisdom behind such courtly claims to an imperial legacy for England.

Medieval England knew Guido’s text through the alliterative *Destruction of Troy*, which would, in turn, prove the source for the ways in which the authors of other alliterative poems would read the destruction of Troy; that reading finds not a glorious genealogy upon which to expand but a moral lesson warning against usurpation, siege, and broken vows. Mueller applies this general reconsideration of the glory that was not Troy to specific poems that reflect the generic possibilities embraced by English alliterative romance: John Clerk’s *Destruction of Troy*, *The Siege of Jerusalem*, the alliterative *Morte Arthure*, and *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*.

Clerk, positioning himself as an authority intent upon telling the whole story of the fall of Troy, challenges his readers, initially predisposed as they are to revel in the alleged glories of their Trojan ancestry, to question the true value of such a chequered legacy. *The Siege of Jerusalem* advances the Trojan narrative to its incorporation as the founding myth of the Roman Empire.

Building upon the accepted critique of the poem for its anti-Semitism, Mueller also argues that the notable examples of anti-Semitism within the poem show the poet's disgust with the cruelty of Rome, and elicit sympathy for the plight of the Jews under the harsh rule of their imperial conquerors.

The alliterative *Morte Arthure* establishes King Arthur as the continuation of the so-called glory that was Rome. But the portrait that the poet offers of Arthur is complex. Juxtaposing signs of empire with scenes of cruelty, the poet sees in Arthur's rise further evidence of the inseparability of imperial authority and the death of the innocent. Mueller concludes his examination of alliterative texts by focusing on the Trojan frame in *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*. The central Arthurian tale of the testing of Camelot, Mueller argues, is ultimately disconnected from that frame and obscures the images of death, destruction, and conquest that the frame summons up.

In sum, Mueller argues that the provincial alliterative romances offer a markedly different and totally pessimistic view of England's Trojan legacy. That view stands in sharp contrast to, say, that of Chaucer in *Troilus and Criseyde*, which is indifferent to Trojan history because it is more concerned with courtly love than with military history. Just as the alliterative poets asked their readers to re-engage with their concept of the role Troy played in their history, so Mueller asks us similarly to re-engage with our expected assumptions about the poems that he discusses. In doing so, Mueller has given us an important study that should go a long way toward encouraging further studies and reassessments of these always challenging (in several senses of the word) literary texts.

KEVIN J. HARTY, *La Salle University*

Mulryne, J. R., with Maria Ines **Aliverti** and Anna Maria **Testaverde**, eds, *Ceremonial Entries in Early Modern Europe: The Iconography of Power* (European Festival Studies: 1450–1700), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 412; 7 colour, 38 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £85.00; ISBN 9781472432032.

This collection of fourteen articles discusses ceremonial entries into early modern European cities. The main theme of the volume is the different means employed by royalty, aristocracy, the clergy, and the commercial elite to create a 'common voice' or iconography of ceremony among the elite of society in the fifteenth, sixteenth, and early seventeenth centuries.

The iconography was developed through a ceremonial language that was occasional and flexibly adapted to the political and social circumstances of the time. This language typically used ancient myths that had become part of the humanist language of the Renaissance to create the imagery of triumph. Architecture was the vehicle of the iconography in the ceremonial language

that is discussed in many of the articles. In the ceremonies, the urban landscape would be transformed through the construction of temporary architecture, usually in the form of a triumphal arch. The ancient triumphal arches of Rome were strongly associated with war but in the Renaissance they were interpreted as being closely associated with military and particularly political power.

The triumphal arches were decorated with mythological images creating an iconography as an integrated rhetorical and visual statement in an unfolding narrative that would 'educate' and entertain the onlookers. The temporary structures were often extremely large and overwhelmed the narrow medieval streets, and often permanent buildings were removed or partially removed to accommodate these structures. French king, Henri IV, entered into the city of Rouen on 16 October 1596. Triumphal arches had been sculpted in plaster and built throughout the city as the workmen laboured to the music of Amphion, whose image was reproduced in plaster on one of the arches. The meaning was visually clear that 'Amphion, like the King of Thebes who rebuilt his city through harmonious song, was a metaphor for Henri IV who by the quality of his person will rebuild the country from the rule and fragments shattered through France' (p. 57). Architecture, music, and pageant were the building blocks of the ceremonial language that emphasised the political message.

In the early sixteenth century, the Roman *possessi* used urban space and architecture, and spatial interaction between the ephemeral city – created by the temporary architecture and the procession – and the real city. The carefully selected urban routes and the placement of the arches would highlight particular buildings and commercial zones, emphasising the message of the ceremony. The setting up of arches for a ceremonial procession was recorded as early as 1119 and was well established by the Renaissance.

Not all ceremonial triumphal arches were temporary constructions. Maximilian I, the Holy Roman Emperor, commissioned a magnificent engraved triumphal arch from the workshop of Albrecht Dürer. It consisted of 195 woodcuts printed on thirty-six portfolio size sheets and when assembled it was 3.41 metres by 2.92 metres. The imagery was a genealogy and history of Maximilian and his achievements, which visually created a mixture of power, virtue, and culture. The message conveyed by these images was emphasised by the central archway that was named 'Arch of Honour and Power'. This printed archway was sent to numerous cities throughout the Holy Roman Empire whereby entry to the cities was less ostentatious but nevertheless in the same style of iconography so that the strength of the political message remained the same.

Not all ceremonial processions needed architecture as a vehicle of the iconography. The River Thames in London, 'the only big street in London'

(p. 221), brought different sections of society together to mark important and national events. Anne Boleyn (1533), Catherine of Braganza (1662), and Elizabeth II (2012) entered London on a waterborne procession. All these ceremonies were the platform to educate and entertain with the message of power and authority, religion, politics, and the popular conception of national identity and memory. Identity and memory could be found in the iconography of classical myths such as the myth of the Golden Fleece that represented conquest and royal power. It was a myth that was utilised by the London Company for the Lord Mayor's show in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

All fourteen articles develop a coherent picture of the iconography of power of ceremonial entries between the fifteenth and early seventeenth centuries. It is a multi-disciplined collection, encompassing architecture, musicology, art, and political histories, which fulfils its promise to demonstrate the richness of iconographic languages as the expression of the court and municipalities, carrying the message of power and authority.

TESSA MORRISON, *The University of Newcastle, Australia*

Ortega, Stephen, *Negotiating Transcultural Relations in the Early Modern Mediterranean: Ottoman–Venetian Encounters* (Transculturalisms, 1400–1700), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 212; 12 b/w illustrations, 2 maps; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781409428589.

Stephen Ortega's recent monograph investigates transcultural movement and encounter in the early modern Mediterranean to expose the power structures that facilitated, maintained, and monitored relationships across cultural boundaries. Ortega primarily examines Ottoman–Venetian encounters during a time of transition between the War of Cyprus (1574) and the War of Candia (1645) when the Ottomans and Venetians were experiencing peaceful relations and Venetian commercial interests shifted focus away from the sea. This resulted in an influx of foreign traders to the Serenissima that included many Muslims. Ortega argues that the outcomes of individual transcultural encounters and disputes between East and West were negotiated within networks of interrelated political and social power structures that operated at local and trans-imperial levels. These complex networks were designed to protect and maintain commercial interests between the powerful trading partners. The author supports his thesis through an examination of diverse, individual cases of transcultural encounter taken largely from Venetian inquisition, criminal, trade, and commerce records and makes use of English, Italian, and Turkish primary and secondary sources.

The first of five themed chapters demonstrates the way Venetians empowered intermediaries to manage contact with Ottoman foreigners

at both local and state levels. Intermediaries were chosen because of their ability to move between the diverse cultural realms and therefore better establish and monitor local and imperial transcultural interactions. Ortega provides the example of local intermediary, Francesco Lettino, a Greek with ambiguous loyalties who operated as a trade broker on the Rialto. In the Republic's attempt to reorganise the urban space to reduce the incidence of unsupervised transcultural contact, Lettino was granted permission to establish a *fondaco* in 1621 to house all Ottoman Muslims in Venice. At a higher social level, state appointed *dragomans* or interpreters from diverse ethnic, social, and religious backgrounds dealt with diplomacy and trade to promote and protect Venetian interests.

Chapter 2 examines the role Venetian councils and magistrates played in providing a space for intercultural dialogue that gave foreign subjects a voice in disputes and conflicts. These forums enabled negotiation and resolution of differences that had the potential to impact transcultural relations at the highest level.

In the third chapter, the movement of people across cultural boundaries is addressed. Ortega begins with the case of a Bosnian Muslim woman named Lucia who escaped her marriage and family and fled to Venice. She converted to Christianity and sought protection at the home of a Venetian administrator, only to be pursued by her family and returned. Through an in-depth examination of cases such as Lucia's, the interrelated social and political contingencies involved in crossing cultural boundaries are revealed. They include the willingness of people to change religion as necessary and the difficulties of crossing state boundaries without the support of powerful connections; in Lucia's case, the latter being of secondary concern to preserving the political and commercial interests of the respective powers.

Chapter 4 investigates the way the Ottoman government projected sovereignty as well as political and legal power through the use of envoys, delegations, ritual, guarantees, letters, and networks of officials who effortlessly crossed religious and social boundaries.

In the final chapter, Ortega shows how the 'integrated political space' of the Mediterranean became a site of contested jurisdiction characterised by power struggles and power shifts at factional and state levels. This is exemplified in a dispute that occurred in the Adriatic Sea between the Venetians, Ottomans, and Spanish in 1617 that was subsequently resolved through convoluted social and political negotiations and aggressive confrontation.

With continuing scholarly interest in relations between the East and the West, Ortega's well-researched book provides a valuable contribution to revealing the intricacies involved in negotiating transcultural encounters in the early modern Mediterranean.

AMANDA VAN DER DRIFT, *The University of Queensland*

Panayotova, S., and N. Morgan, eds, *A Catalogue of Western Book Illumination in the Fitzwilliam Museum and the Cambridge Colleges. Part Four: England, Ireland, Scotland, Wales. Volume One: Insular and Anglo-Saxon Manuscripts* (Illuminated Manuscripts in Cambridge, 4.1), London, Harvey Miller, 2014; hardback; pp. 360; 440 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €175.00; ISBN 9781909400047.

The most immediately noticeable feature of this volume is its splendour, deriving from a combination of large format, the use of digital technology to produce crisp illustrations in full colour, generously scaled, and sensitive and elegant layout. Take, for instance, pp. 106–07, which display a breathtaking opening (fols 17^v–18^r) from Trinity College, MS B. 10. 4, an early eleventh-century Gospel Book probably made in East Anglia; or pp. 252–53, reproducing two different leaves from Trinity College, MS B. 5. 2, the second volume of the great late eleventh-century Bible made at Lincoln Cathedral (where the first volume is still *in situ* as its MS 1). The book, then, is visually stunning, and might be deemed a superior ‘coffee-table’ item on that account; this is not true of its text.

The book inevitably invites comparison with the third volume of *Illuminated Manuscripts in the Bodleian Library Oxford*, edited by Otto Pächt and Jonathan Alexander in 1973, covering manuscripts of English origin and provenance. And yet there is really no comparison. That volume (and the whole series) was in small quarto, the reports of each manuscript were very summary, incorporating a general indication of contents and the briefest description of the decoration (e.g., no. 1127, ‘Border, initials’) unless it was extensive and important. The plates, save for the frontispiece, were black and white, good for the time but usually much reduced in scale and often useless for purposes of comparison. They were arranged at the back of the volume, like so many postage stamps in an album, and were from a selection of the MSS only. The two volumes are thus quite different in terms of presentation; there is also no comparison in the level of information offered. In the Cambridge volume, each manuscript is presented with a full description of its structure, contents, and provenance before proceeding to the decoration. Every book is accompanied by at least one illustration, usually of original size but often showing enlarged detail. In addition, there is full commentary covering anything of particular interest in any of these areas – not just the decoration – followed by a comprehensive bibliography: ‘mine of information’ is hardly an adequate description.

The catalogue describes ninety-seven items (ninety-four English, one Irish, and two Welsh) plus thirteen addenda (MSS from the Frankish kingdoms c. 700–c. 1000; a welcome inclusion). The vast majority are in the possession of just two colleges, Corpus Christi and Trinity. They are catalogued in order of date, nos 1–25 bringing us quickly to the year 1000, while we pass the

Norman Conquest at about no. 58. About 40 per cent of the items catalogued, then, are dateable to the last quarter of the eleventh century. Very few of the books have a secure provenance, let alone origin. The identified secure places of origin or at least early provenances are dominated by the Benedictine abbeys or cathedral priories, especially the two Canterbury communities, Christ Church (twenty items) and St Augustine's (fifteen). Most of the decoration in these books is attractive but not outstanding, confined to the initials, sometimes an exceptional opening page containing a major initial accompanied by coloured display script. The few items that could be described as lavish are all Gospel Books: nos 1, 9, 27, 35, 46, 51, all pre-Conquest. Also worthy of note are nos 11 (Amalarius, with its lively initials in ink of text tinted in pastel colours) and 27 (Prudentius, with a complete cycle of tinted line-drawings). Amid many interesting physical details recorded about these books is the high proportion in the format sometimes known as 'holster-book', that is, narrow in proportion to their height (for instance no. 51, a mid-eleventh-century Gospel lectionary, perhaps from Worcester). This is just one example of the sort of detail provided in this volume which will be of interest to historians of the book generally.

My only criticisms of substance might be thought churlish: about thirty items are included which have only monochrome initials in colours sometimes restricted to red or black. Some of these initials have modest decorative ornament, others none at all. It is a moot point whether manuscripts such as these can be described as 'decorated' let alone 'illuminated'. Similarly, one might question the appellation of 'Anglo-Saxon manuscripts' to describe the many thoroughly Norman-looking books from the last quarter of the eleventh century, produced under the 'new management' at places such as Durham, Exeter, and Canterbury. But these are quibbles, and scholars other than art historians will surely welcome the full descriptions and reproductions of such books, often much superior to what is available elsewhere. Disappointingly, typos make a fairly regular appearance after p. 199 (on which one finds 'Caroline miniscule'!).

R. M. THOMSON, *University of Tasmania*

Poska, Allyson M., Jane **Couchman**, and Katherine A. **McIver**, eds, *The Ashgate Research Companion to Women and Gender in Early Modern Europe*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. 572; 24 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £90.00; ISBN 9781409418177.

This volume surveys current knowledge, critical approaches, and historiographical developments over the past four decades of historical research on women and gender in early Modern Europe. It contains twenty-four essays arranged around the broad themes of Religion, Embodied Lives,

and Cultural Production. Each essay provides a synthesis of, and critical reflection upon, current knowledge in the author's field of expertise and suggestions for future research. This format creates a rich and lively panorama of past and current research, and the density of the essays makes each reference list a resource in itself. Fulfilling its role as a research companion, it is essential reading at the literature review stage for graduate students of European history or literature, or for scholars seeking an overview of particular themes across national borders. Individual essays would be an ideal springboard and guide for undergraduate students planning a research essay.

The essay subjects reflect the development of women's history over the last forty years, covering established areas such as women writers (both lay and religious), religious life (Catholic and Protestant), and areas that have flourished in the last twenty years, such as work on women as patrons, artists, and musicians. More recent areas of research are also represented, such as material culture, sexuality, aging, and maternity. I will briefly consider essays from each of the three sections of the book, and reflect on the ways in which 'thinking with women' in each field of study has immeasurably enriched both early modern scholarship and understandings of the past, not only women's history.

Elizabeth Leffeldt writes that the scholarship on female monastic institutions across Western Europe and the Americas from 1400 to 1800 has transformed our understanding of social, political, and religious change in this period. Those studies that were part of the re-examination of the Catholic and Counter-Reformation provided insights into how convents negotiated theological and doctrinal shifts in the Church, or confessional changes in their cities. Other studies emphasised the ways in which female religious institutions were sites of power, integral to the social and political fabric of communities. Wealthy families could dominate administration of convents, and share control of institutions for generations. Lay patronage of convents linked spiritual and cultural capital with conspicuous display in the theatre of political power. Some convents had an economic role in cities, as landholders, investors, and in some cases as capital lenders and producers of goods.

A thematic approach is taken by Elizabeth S. Cohen, whose essay surveys studies that have focused on processes of marginalisation and gendered identities. The strength of research in this area has been to reveal the rich complexity of lived experience, as women negotiated normative boundaries, and multiple sources of marginality, defined as restricted access to bodily, social, cultural, political, and legal assets.

Julie Campbell's essay on the *Querelle des femmes* considers a philosophical and literary subject that occupied both male and female authors from the late Middle Ages. Campbell discusses modern editions of the main texts, and critical approaches to the material, while tracing the shift in scholarship from a focus on individual texts within the debate, to the ways in which the *Querelle*

can ‘function as a barometer of social and cultural tensions in given historical contexts’ (p. 362).

Finally, in the last essay in the volume, Linda Phyllis Austern considers interdisciplinary research in the field of gender and music. The presence of music at all levels of cultural, social, and political life combined with the necessarily embodied nature of the acquisition of musical skills, musical performance, and the frequently gendered contexts of performance provide a rich matrix for generating new understandings of the gendered dimensions of intellectual, social, and political life. Scholarship on gender and music has introduced secular and religious female composers to the early modern musical canon and modern repertoire, furnished nuanced understandings of the reception of musical performance according to the social status and gender of the performer, audience, and patron, and explored the influence of the classical and Christian traditions on representations of music and musicians in art, poetry, and literature.

A few works published after the *Companion* that can be added to an essential bibliography of early modern women include: three bilingual critical editions, Julia Hairston, *The Poems and Letters of Tullia d’Aragona and Others* (CRRS, 2014); Pere Torrellas and Juan de Flores, *Three Spanish ‘Querelle’ Texts: Grisel and Mirabella, The Slander against Women, and The Defense of Ladies against Slanderers*, ed. Emily C. Francomano (CRRS, 2013); Virginia Cox, *Lyric Poetry by Women of the Italian Renaissance* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2013); and Adelina Modesti’s monograph *Elisabetta Sirani ‘Virtuosa’: Women’s Cultural Production in Early Modern Bologna* (Brepols, 2015).

JULIE ROBARTS, *The University of Melbourne*

Rodda, Joshua, *Public Religious Disputation in England, 1558–1626* (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 252; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781472415554.

Joshua Rodda’s new monograph – a revised and expanded version of his doctoral thesis – aims to provide a specialised analysis of ‘the history of public religious disputation, as a practice and phenomenon that shaped religious controversy, and was ultimately broken down by it’ (p. 5). The book traces the foundations of public religious disputation in post-Reformation England, from the accession of Elizabeth I, through to its peak during the reign of James VI & I, to its eventual decline in the 1620s. Rodda’s thesis rests on the observation that those who engaged in public religious disputation believed ‘beyond doubt that their truth would be confirmed by formal and rational argument’ (p. 5).

The book is divided into six chronologically arranged chapters. The first sets out Rodda’s framework for analysis and the definitions of his terms. His definition of disputation as ‘a manifestation of scholarship and scholarly

interaction' (p. 7) is curious at first glance, but is quickly contextualised, particularly when he describes the differences between an academic debate and a religious disputation. The chapter also provides a brief background to the Reformation in England, and the place of disputation in religious circles.

The second chapter provides contemporary examples of disputations in order to 'reconstruct the process as envisaged and deployed in these events' (p. 37). Rodda skilfully explains the roles of the opponent, respondent, moderator, and question in a disputation. He then devotes the rest of the chapter to the actual disputation itself. He recreates how questions were answered, showing how logic, scripture, the Church Fathers, contemporary authorities, and virtuous pagans (particularly Aristotle) were all combined to create a defence. The chapter closes with a discussion of the rules in a disputation, the ideal venue, and the conventions surrounding the publication of accounts, with Rodda making the distinction between the actual disputation and the enlarged argument that was often included in the published account.

The third chapter is arguably the book's most interesting. Rodda details the uses and abuses of religious disputations from Mary I's reign (technically outside the book's timeframe, but contextualised well) through to that of James VI & I. He discusses the consequences of a poorly argued disputation response, and also the various canonical and legal ramifications of a disputation that moved beyond the edges of academic debate.

This theme is continued in the fourth chapter, where Rodda provides source-based examples of public religious disputation. He particularly focuses on how disputations were answered, and also how tactics differed when debating Puritans.

This chapter serves to demonstrate that 'disputation went beyond mere display: it could teach' (p. 130).

The fifth chapter focuses on the increasing attraction of lay audiences to public religious disputations. Rodda uses the example of the January 1604 Hampton Court Conference, convened by James VI & I, which provided leading Puritans an opportunity to publicly defend their positions. James's active involvement in the debates – despite technically being the impartial moderator – demonstrates that the academic rigour of religious disputations was disappearing. Ultimately, lay participation in disputation echoed the Protestant ideal that all believers read, and engaged with, the Bible.

The final chapter charts the decreasing value academics placed on public disputations as a result of this lay involvement. Non-conformists, who did not rely so heavily on the logic and reasoned arguments that had previously characterised academic debates, increasingly used public disputations to question the Church of England and engage directly with their audiences. This reached a point in the early 1620s where 'the dominant individuals in the

church no longer saw disputation as an antidote to controversy, but as a more direct – and more damaging – variety of it’ (p. 191).

Overall, the book is well written and well researched, but its density makes for a challenging read. Curiously, Rodda provides no justification for his reliance on the King James Version of the Bible for scriptural references: given that this version was in circulation for only a sixth of the period the book covers, it is a problematic choice. *Public Religious Disputation in England* will be of greatest value to those with a solid grounding in Reformation history, but it will appeal generally to all scholars of early modern history.

AIDAN NORRIE, *University of Otago*

Ruys, Juanita Feros, *The Repentant Abelard: Family, Gender, and Ethics in Peter Abelard’s ‘Carmen ad Astralabium’ and ‘Planctus’* (New Middle Ages), Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2014; hardback; pp. xvi, 355; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9780312240028.

Enduringly popular, intellectually significant, and quintessentially controversial, Peter Abelard remains a popular subject of research and academic inquiry. The historiography is voluminous. Now comes another tome. Happily, this one is worth sustained consideration. Juanita Feros Ruys’s study is massively learned and erudite. Peter Abelard is reintroduced to medievalists as a figure beyond the heady days of his public life and Ruys sheds new and important light on other dimensions of this complex and fascinating personality. The text produced by Ruys is noteworthy and stands without antecedent or peer both for originality and interpretation.

Abelard’s career hardly requires a resume, as it is so well known among medievalists. His reputation as a teacher and controversialist is beyond dispute, his celebrated affair with the irresistibly larger-than-life Heloise has been the subject of much spilled ink, and the elusive life of their oddly named son Astralabe, are matters of common knowledge. Ruys does not bother reiterating the obvious. Instead, she delves deeply and profoundly into two later writings of Abelard, which have been strangely neglected by scholars. The *Carmen ad Astralabium* is a long didactic poem wherein the aging master provides advice to his estranged son. The *Carmen* engages in a protracted delineation of ethical and theological ideas while the series of six laments, the *Planctus*, is directed at his former lover and wife, Heloise, wherein Abelard conveys similar concerns through the voices of figures embedded in the texts of the Hebrew Bible. Both texts are generally known but have rarely been subjected to the relentless interrogation that characterises Ruys’s methodology.

Twice condemned as a heretic, ruthlessly castrated, misunderstood, and at times despairing of life, Abelard turns to the family he rejected years earlier.

Ruys points out that Abelard appears to find solace in his family in the sting and disappointment of theological, pedagogical, and monastic initiatives. It is apparent that Ruys believes the best way to come to terms with the older, repentant Abelard is by means of a complete study of the *Carmen ad Astralabium* and the *Planctus*. This book fulfils that vision. A literary analysis of both texts, along with a conceptual delineation, provides an entirely new context from which to evaluate Peter Abelard.

Along with these analyses, Ruys makes available to the reader the Latin texts of both the *Carmen* and the *Planctus*, English translations of each, and a multitude of well-informed critical notes. The study is supplemented by an international, up-to-date bibliography. It is essential to read carefully Ruys's Introduction in order to grasp the context and to appreciate the scope of the work that follows. This is not a book for the fainthearted and it cannot be mastered in haste. There is a wealth of detail and much technical discussion. Various manuscript recensions, their transmission, and manuscript annotations are skilfully discussed. One has the sense of being in the hands of one who knows exactly what she is talking about.

What we encounter in *The Repentant Abelard* is a man at odds with his own humanity, who is both drawn to and repelled by familial relations. The textual issues latent in the *Carmen ad Astralabium* and the *Planctus* reveal, I think, a brilliant mind restlessly and rebelliously grappling with the larger questions of life who refuses to adhere to established categories and who resists the pull of convention and tradition. It is as though Abelard has been shown the grain and has chosen actively to go against it. The *Carmen ad Astralabium*, especially, reveals the convictions and conclusions of a great thinker and these are not concealed: there are no easy answers, he tells his son, hard questions are preferable to easy answers, and pilgrims have advantage over settlers. Abelard appears oblivious to the fact that he has made no concession to the youthfulness of his son. One of the critical issues raised in this book is the ethics of *memoria*, which demands further attention.

Ruys utterly dispatches arguments about the authenticity of authorship. The feeble, politically motivated work of Edélstrand du Ménil is gutted and discarded. These texts reflect an Abelard family affair. Of significance is the fact that Ruys recognises and delineates the common features shared by both texts. This is an important book with mesmerising themes that reveals also, and no less importantly, that Peter Abelard loved Heloise to the end. The scholarship underpinning *The Repentant Abelard* cannot be too highly praised.

THOMAS A. FUDGE, *University of New England*

Safran, Linda, *The Medieval Salento: Art and Identity in Southern Italy* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 480; 20 colour, 149 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$95.00, £62.00; ISBN 9780812245547.

This is a methodologically exemplary study of life in the culturally diverse region at the heel of the boot of Southern Italy, sometimes also called the Terra d'Otranto, between the ninth and early fifteenth centuries. The Salento incorporates today the modern province of Lecce in the south and, to the north, most of the provinces of Brindisi and Taranto.

The diversity of religions, languages, and social practices changed over time but had its roots in the region's history. Greek colonies had been founded alongside the Messapians, Bruttians, and Sallentines in the centuries before Roman rule. In the sixth century CE, Italy's Ostrogothic rulers were defeated by the Byzantines who maintained a presence in Southern Italy of varying strength, as did the Lombards from the seventh century. After the Normans defeated the Byzantines, they introduced a feudal regime which was perpetuated by subsequent Swabian, Angevin, and Aragonese rulers. A further influence in the medieval Salento, and to its immediate north, was a relatively small Jewish population that is given some prominence in this study.

What sets this work on cultural identity apart is the focus on art, broadly defined as the locally produced material culture that was visible in the public domain. Thus, inscriptions and graffiti, dress, processions, churches, and wall paintings all provide evidence of the daily life of individuals and communities. Such an approach calls on not just the disciplines of art history and architecture, but also of archaeology, sociology, anthropology, linguistics, history, and religious studies.

Following the main text is a 98-page database listing alphabetically 162 sites and for each site the visual evidence is described, often accompanied by a small black-and-white illustration. The texts of the Hebrew, Greek, and Latin inscriptions are cited and then translated. References specific to an item are included here rather than in the volume's already extensive bibliography. The database is preceded by a map of the Salento with, for each site, a cross-reference to the corresponding entries in the database.

The main text is itself superbly organised with the argument made very accessible through the use of subheadings. Within these sections there is a pattern of presenting separately the Jewish, Orthodox, and Roman rite practices that co-existed in the Salento. At each point, reasons are suggested for differences and specificity is maintained in the dating and location of supporting examples. Thus, the text reads well without requiring constant reference to the database.

The first four chapters, headed 'Names', 'Languages', 'Appearance', and 'Status', are tied closely to the database. The subsequent chapters, 'The Life

Cycle', 'Rituals and Other Practices in Places of Worship', and 'Rituals and Practices at Home and in the Community', make greater use of the figures in the wall paintings (colour plates 1–40) and folkloric, ethnographic, and legal information. Rituals performed, saints revered, venues for local fairs, and an agricultural calendar linked to specific feast days are some of the elements that would contribute to a sense of local identity. Practices that are absent or different in the Salento from elsewhere are also noted.

The final chapter, 'Theorizing Salentine Identity', supports and reinforces the thoughtful approaches adopted throughout the work. This study importantly notes that ethnic designations applied in the Salento, like 'Greek' or 'Norman', had little real meaning. Rather, the people, living side by side, achieved a distinctive identity during the medieval period that was the result of cultural choices made in ever-changing circumstances.

Such a richly documented and lucid analysis of the visual and material culture of one region at a formative period should be a model for other such studies of regional identity.

ANN MOFFATT, *Australian National University*

Salzman, Paul, *Literature and Politics in the 1620s: 'Whisper'd Counsell's'*, Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2014; hardback; pp. ix, 222; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9781137305978.

In his latest work, Paul Salzman examines the ways in which political events of the 1620s manifested within high and popular literature across a range of genres. The author builds his study on a wide range of writing and performance, including pamphlets, sermons, and libels, to trace the social and political changes that engaged writers and readers of the period. The dissemination, circulation, and performance of literature are also emphasised, illuminating the ways in which readers and audiences were drawn into a network of political reflection and commentary.

Part I, 'Imaginings', investigates the conventional genres of drama, poetry, and narrative in relation to politics. The author posits that Ben Jonson and Thomas Middleton became more topical writers during this period, satisfying the public's growing appetite for news and examining the struggle over its regulation in such works as Jonson's *Staple of News* and Middleton's *A Game at Chess*. For Salzman, the publication of William Shakespeare's first folio in 1623 also highlights the political character established by the plays and masques published and performed around it, representing a challenge to, and circumvention of, political interpretations of the period.

Moreover, poetry in the form of libels, satires, epigraphs, and occasional poems, along with establishment poetry by Donne, Herrick, Herbert, and Jonson is testament to the complex nature of interaction between different

forms of literature and politics in the 1620s. Salzman studies the circulation and recirculation of these texts under different circumstances, giving colour to the way in which poetry of the 1620s demands to be read politically. In his discussion of narrative, the author pairs the genre of romance with politics to demonstrate the ways in which Philip Sidney's *Arcadia* and Edmund Spenser's *Faerie Queene*, among others, shifted from being a form of entertainment to a form of political allegory.

Part II, 'Religion', examines sermons, popular religious pamphlets, and religious controversy. Salzman places the sermons of Donne and Lancelot Andrewes in the context of a great range of sermons that spoke to all facets of society, covering an enormous variety of religious and political positions. They were part of the growing obsession in the 1620s with reading for political intent, not only in a specific place and time, but through subsequent manuscript or print publication. The pamphlets and ballads discussed in Part II centre on the notion of religiosity, from homilies and pious works read by people of both low and privileged statuses, to more radical and controversial works. In combination with the author's discussion of doctrines, this section widens the genre of religion and further advances the perception of literature in the 1620s as embodying ever-changing counter-publics through a politicised approach to reading and analysis.

In Part III, 'News', Salzman remains focused on the nature of shifting counter-publics through the most naturally political texts written in the period: burgeoning 'newspapers', printed news-books, manuscript newsletters, and pamphlets. Salzman argues convincingly that news was a commodity in the 1620s, and further, a desire for political information drove reading practice and delineated the relationship between private information and public knowledge. Particularly fascinating is his discussion of the printed pamphlet, a genre which appealed to a wide readership and transcended class boundaries. However, this genre also represented a means of undermining any attempt to control the subject of news. Some pamphlets were political, others only partially so, but they encompassed subjects as diverse as parliamentary events, celebrity scandals, international politics, and international relations. Salzman also studies diaries of the period to gather information on proceedings in Parliament from a private perspective, noting shifts in foreign policy and changes in status. He finds that politics, in its promulgation and reception, moved between public and private spaces across a range of experimental genres.

In *Literature and Politics in the 1620s*, Salzman studies the various relationships between literature and politics, publics and counter-publics, and civic and private literary spaces to trace the construction of the political self. In defining politics in its widest possible sense, he changes our perception of what readers and audiences demanded of literature in the 1620s.

SARAH DEMPSTER, *The University of Western Australia*

Scott, Anne M., ed., *Experiences of Charity, 1250–1650*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 338; 13 colour, 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781472443380.

Designed to complement an earlier volume, *Experiences of Poverty* (Ashgate, 2012), this collection of thirteen essays explores what it meant to participate in charity in medieval and early modern England and France. While the earlier work sought the voices of the poor, this collection aims to illuminate the mental world, motivations, and social context of those who gave to the poor, whether as individuals or institutions.

The essays primarily seek to intervene in two main historiographical debates. One is to provide a definitive rebuttal to the idea that medieval society sought only to alleviate, not eliminate, poverty, and that key institutional interventions in relieving poverty were a product of the sixteenth century. The second is a more open discussion around motivations for charitable giving, its role in the social and religious world of early modern, or indeed any, society, and particularly the nature of the reciprocal exchange between giver and recipient. While primarily focused on the period 1250 to 1650, this latter intervention in the historiography enables an engagement with scholars of charity, giving, and poverty across eras and nations, and ensures this collection will be of use to a broad range of scholars. Coherent as a collection, the essays themselves are consistently intelligent, articulate, and beautifully edited.

The collection is divided into two parts: 'The Written Record' and 'The Material Record'. The first set of ten essays access charity through the more traditional sources of medieval and early modern history: institutional, civic, clerical, and crown records, statutes, chronicles, and wills. The chapters proceed in chronological order across the thirteenth to the seventeenth century, providing a relatively consistent story of the foundational structures and beliefs around charitable giving that underpinned later institutional developments and reform in the sixteenth century in France and England. Sharon Farmer explicitly traces these connections in her work on Paris institutions for the poor over three centuries; Jennifer Stemmler reinforces the provision of early institutional charity with a case study of twelfth-century leprosaria; and Neil S. Rushton seeks to rehabilitate the sixteenth-century Church by recalculating (upwards) the percentage of their income that they distributed as charity. Other essays, including those by Susan Broomhall on Gap and Lesley Silvester on Norwich, seek to articulate the relationship between Church and civic traditions and models of charitable giving, exploring the overlaps, tensions, and relationships between different community groups.

Most of the chapters at some point explore the motivations for giving, providing some key insights into how charity was understood as a concept,

and particularly its relationship to religious maxims. Lisa Keane Elliott's case study of Nicholas Houel's charitable motivations provides a reassuring glimpse that at least some givers had good intentions. A number of authors engage in a wider reconceptualisation of giving that seeks to explore charity as a reciprocal exchange relationship. This is particularly notable in Spencer Young's examination of fourteenth-century *exempla* of charitable giving, the late Philippa Maddern's discussion of bequests to the poor and will-making, and Silvester's chapter on reforming Norwich charitable giving; for all these authors, charitable giving brought benefits, temporal and spiritual, to both parties. Some of the more cynical readings of this relationship wonder, especially given the rise in models of the deserving and undeserving poor during the period, whether charity was anything other than simply selfish. Conversely, Broomhall's chapter on London Huguenots reminds us that, whatever the motivations of the giver, recipients could be demanding and ungrateful too, acting as an overt challenge to a romantic understanding of the charitable relationship. In having this debate, these essays contribute to a wider and ongoing discussion of the meanings of kindness, gratitude, charity, and community in both past and present societies.

The second, shorter, part of the collection comprises three chapters that use distinctive sources to provide alternative histories of charitable giving. Nicholas Dean Brodie uses a nineteenth-century prosecution for theft to provide a history of the physical poor box in the early modern Church, using this symbolic item to tease out the distinctions between poor relief and charity, personal and institutional giving, and collections and donations. Dolly MacKinnon provides an aural perspective, using music books to uncover pauper charitable singing; a reciprocal exchange of giver and recipient where the voices of the poor were quite literally heard. Editor Anne Scott brings the volume to a close with a survey of late medieval European images of charity, an essay which not only has significant geographical scope but situates her argument in conversation with the essays that came before. In a compelling ending to this polished and scholarly volume, Scott demonstrates the ways that the poor themselves could rethink the charitable relationship as one of reward for a life of useful service, rather than a diminishment of the self.

KATIE BARCLAY, *The University of Adelaide*

Semler, Liam E., *Teaching Shakespeare and Marlowe: Learning versus the System* (Shakespeare Now!), London, Bloomsbury Arden Shakespeare, 2013; paperback; pp. 168; R.R.P. £12.99, AU\$16.99; ISBN 9781408185025.

Liam Semler's latest monograph offers a timely reflection on the meaning/s of teaching and of learning literature within a climate of pedagogical 'over-

systematization' (p. 18). This is a situation those of us who teach literature at schools or universities know all too well: in our very knowingness, we have had to become 'system creatures' (p. 129). *Teaching Shakespeare and Marlowe* reflects 'systemness', and provides ways of seeing 'system' – an abstract noun capturing the oppressive features of particular educational institution systems – and of finding productive, if temporary, 'exile' from it.

Alongside an extended allusion to *The Matrix* (Wachowski and Wachowski, 1999), as a system both enabling and oppressive, the book is structured by Shakespearean and Marlovian topoi. We begin, rather intensely, with system-teachers figured as wielders of red-hot poker, like Hubert in Shakespeare's *King John*, sent by John to blind the boy Arthur who is claimant to the throne, and with system-scholars figured like Marlowe's Faustus, limiting the potential of the disciplines in an ever-increasing need for the enabling power of fraught pacts with financial devils. Later, the peculiar nature of the forest in Shakespeare's *As You Like It* helps to theorise productive exile from soul-sucking system. Semler calls this (temporary) exile 'ardenspace', an unpredictable place at the edge of system that system knows not what to do with. At his most exhortatory, Semler writes, 'we must create ardenspaces, the more numerous and diverse the better, so that innovative (or "exilic") ideas can flow into iterative (or "usurped") systems' (p. 50).

Chapter 1 considers soberly the systemness that enmeshes us. 'My colleagues are being munched', Semler writes, 'by the global mania for league table positioning, which is to say, eaten by formula. Formulae are systems' teeth' (p. 13). Speaking as university lecturer and co-writer of the State Higher School Certificate English exam, Semler asks us to 'look at academia now: we live in an age of wisdom teeth and edible academics. Schoolteachers were eaten long ago. They are living an extended burp that provokes endless disapproving looks' (p. 13). While young English students are thoroughly imbued with system logic, they very often navigate its requirements merely by accommodating to an alternate system, instead of 'learning', as we lecturers think and hope they are doing, to articulate new critiques of the world around them from the standpoint of well-reasoned, though personal, discovery. The process of system-to-system accommodation simply reinforces cynicism about 'learning'. It is 'the ultimate revenge effect' (p. 30).

Chapter 2 argues that in a climate of over-systematisation, we cannot enhance learning as reasoned, personal discovery without the production of 'positive turbulence' in systems. The chapter theorises ardenspace by linking it with what W. R. Ashby, Chris Argyris, and Donald A. Schön describe as 'double-loop thinking'; it is like a system that is adjusted from outside, rather than one that simply maintains itself.

Chapter 3 describes the ardenspace attempted by the *Shakespeare Reloaded* project, a collaboration between the University of Sydney and Sydney's

Barker College. Semler describes in particular the initiative of 'Bard Blitz', in which system creatures from both school and university settings, students and teachers, came together to explore ways of promoting a deeper engagement with Shakespeare's texts than is usual in high school environments so often beset with the dysfunctions of system logic.

In Chapters 4 and 5, Semler describes another attempt at the making of ardenspace, this time in the teaching of a particular unit (on Marlowe) at the University of Sydney. Here, the focus was on strategies for encouraging 'an authentic personal encounter with Marlowe's texts', beyond merely a cognitive engagement with the scholarly debates about his work. These chapters show, compellingly, how such personal encounters (and their meaning as 'learning') can be invalidated in university classrooms as much by system-attuned students as by system-attuned lecturers. The central concept here is what Semler calls 'the band of perceived relevance' (p. 98), that shapes, like a discourse, what is and is not worth talking about. To expand 'learning' so as to explore 'beyond the band' and discover the sort of personal-rational encounters with literature that are suppressed by system logics of different kinds operating in educational institutions is elsewhere described lyrically as 'petrol poured on talent and beauty on desire' (p. 32).

This is a short book, but it is extremely rich. Some may find its theorising language heavy-handed, though I found that it suited the style of argument and its humorous, anecdotal style is perfectly suited to the 'Shakespeare Now!' series. The book's strength lies in combining a personal and reasonable exhortation to an urgent revision of what 'learning' can be with a refusal to simplify the issue into merely a matter of resistance. The voice/s that speak here recognise that 'there is no entirely fresh start for system creatures and no easy road for exiles' (p. 129). The 'imperative' rather is 'that we use our humanity and imagination to rediscover potential in learning – outside, inside and between systems' (p. 130). That is surely an important goal if we are to articulate afresh to succeeding generations, and before it is too late, what literary studies uniquely offer.

DANIEL DERRIN, *Durham University*

Smith, David Chan, *Sir Edward Coke and the Reformation of the Laws: Religion, Politics and Jurisprudence, 1578–1616* (Cambridge Studies in English Legal History), Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 308; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781107069299.

Social historians are familiar with the methodological mechanism often termed 'social biography', whereby a person or collective of persons serves to focus research and discussion in ways that examine and illuminate past social worlds. This book does a similar thing, but with law. Here, Edward Coke is

the object of a 'legal biography', a study of the law and politics of Coke's age, rather than a biographical study of the man himself. Essentially, David Chan Smith's purpose is to add complexity to scholarly understandings of Coke's legal world. Challenging a longstanding and quite simplistic approach to the legal developments of the period, which frames the primary context productive of legal change as a binary conflict 'between liberty and royal power' (p. 5), Smith aims to go further than this power struggle dualism. He achieves this by approaching Coke's legal thought and judicial activities through a series of interconnected thematic chapters, mainly concerned with specific case studies that address wider legal contexts, Coke's own professional preoccupations, and the epistemological framework of each.

This book does not, therefore, mimic any conventional biography. It is best approached with some familiarity with Coke and his world, especially because many of the arguments are predicated on rebutting established historiographical constructs and adding nuance to existing scholarship. It is very detailed, comprehensively argued, but at times very dense, making it a book hard to put down and pick up with ease. A few more breaks in the text would not have gone astray. While an impressive addition to the body of scholarship of this period and subject, this reviewer would not recommend it as an aid to teaching. This is a shame, because many of its points are excellent and some detail particularly fascinating. It is an expert book for the experts.

Smith contextualises his study by exploring Coke's own professional history, using this to illustrate some of the complexities and tensions in the common law, and to illuminate how in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries various old legal processes were adopted, adapted, resisted, and re-imagined across that broad period. Through this, Coke's reforming activities are situated in a broader professional context, not entirely excising politics from the legal developments of the period, but certainly diminishing any sense of straightforward ideological constructions devoid of disciplinary or professional constructions, constraints, and concerns. Over the first few chapters, Smith builds a picture of Coke as being concerned to remedy the perception of the law, generally improve its practice, and particularly weed out corrupt usages of it. This provides a comprehensive counter-argument to simplistic presentations of Coke as a sort of champion of the common law. As part of this, Smith uses a case study of law in the Fens in Chapter 3, which may also be of interest to scholars with that regional interest.

Chapters 4 and 5, addressing Coke's own historicising of the common law, are among the most interesting in the book. In Chapter 4, Smith engages with the way Coke addressed the relationship between the common law and the Church courts. This illustrates how an overarching historical narrative, aligning the common law with royal authority against invasive foreign powers, developed from and in a mutually informing relationship with Protestant

histories familiar to Coke. Similarly, in Chapter 5, Smith examines the way that Coke held up the common law as an expression of accumulated reason, positioning it as the arbiter of wisdom, and thereby both the measure and measurer of other legal authorities, laws, and processes.

The final chapters of the book delve into the details of jurisdictional battles, procedural developments, and Coke's wider reforming agenda. Smith explores contemporary arguments and actions in connection with the High Commission for Causes Ecclesiastical and *Cawdrey's Case* (1591), tensions over the role and limits of Chancery, and developments and tensions connected with the theory of delegation of royal authority. Through these, Smith explores and resolves the seemingly ambiguous position of Coke as an enthusiast of royal authority who worked towards limiting its power.

This is a complex book for a complex man in complex times, and Smith has done well to engage meaningfully with that multilayered complexity.

NICHOLAS D. BRODIE, *Hobart, Tasmania*

Sobecki, Sebastian, *Unwritten Verities: The Making of England's Vernacular Legal Culture, 1463–1549*, Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2015; paperback; pp. ix, 262; R.R.P. US\$38.00; ISBN 9780268041458.

Sebastian Sobecki begins this volume with a brief outline of Victorian historiographical attitudes that treated the English law as an insular system resistant to the influence of 'foreign' systems. To simplify his argument, he too interprets 'English law' as common law and statute. Its resistance is often attributable to the oral traditions of the Inns of common law. Sobecki challenges the traditional view that the crystallisation of England's vernacular legal culture occurred during the period 1550 to 1600 as part of a movement towards vernacularism that occurred in the wake of the Reformation.

The central thesis of *Unwritten Verities* is that late medieval practices of vernacular translation, professional adherence to an unwritten tradition, and Lancastrian political ideas generated a vernacular legal culture that challenged Protestant ideas and Tudor ambitions to central government. The novelty of Sobecki's thesis lies in his attempt to counteract tendencies to view the medieval and premodern periods in isolation.

Sobecki begins by tracing the history of the educational and collegiate elements of the common law Inns. He highlights the importance of oral narrative at the Inns as a method by which to establish memory. The author argues that the dominance of oratory skills in the period permitted lawyers to engage in political and conceptual debate on law. He persuasively argues that the common law possessed a singular legal language, an amalgamation of French and English, which he colourfully calls 'Franglais'.

After contextualising the vernacular oral tradition of the common law and its linguistic character, Sobecki moves on to his central thesis. He turns first to the importance of the works of Chief Justice John Fortescue for the promulgation of a non-partisan theory of the common law as it formed part of the contemporary pattern of political discourse and conciliarism in the Lancastrian period.

Sobecki explores the apparently incompatible nature of the unwritten common law tradition in a climate where oral memory was distrusted after the Reformation. He turns to St German's *Doctor and Student* for explanation. That work, the author explains, justifies the unwritten common law tradition by drawing upon its inherent rationality as a characteristic not requiring written expression. Sobecki argues that the common law, as a rational system, agreed with and adapted to post-Reformation religious developments that ultimately led to a relaxation in attitudes towards unwritten verities.

Sobecki considers the impact of a vernacular legal culture on English political thought after the Reformation. He distinguishes the developments in the common law from humanist views that favour an elitist monopoly on law and perceptions that the Sovereign is the only safeguard against tyranny. The author identifies John Rastell's decision to print previously unwritten common law sources in English as a driving force behind populist political ideologies of commonwealth after the Reformation. He argues that the popular views Rastell presented in his vernacular translation promoted an ideology of social participation by making the law accessible to commoners.

Sobecki also examines the rebellions of 1549 to highlight the influence of the vernacular legal culture on populist movements. He argues that the accessibility of the law allowed commoners, with the support of 'learned men', to couch their demands in legal language. Demands that the monarch should promulgate laws in the vernacular for common understanding and debate, the author argues, posed a direct challenge to authority. According to Sobecki, the monarchy's assertion of authority to control common law printing after 1550 extinguished popular movements associated with the vernacular legal culture.

Sobecki convincingly argues his central thesis that a unique common law vernacular legal culture was present in England in this period, which was not limited to the works of John Fortescue, St German, and John Rastell. In a well-researched, exciting, and stimulating account, Sobecki demonstrates how the common law discourse of the Lancastrian period developed to breathe life into popular politics after the Reformation. The book is a pleasure to read and readers will find it replete with examples demonstrating the place of its argument in modern historiography.

The book would benefit from clearer signposts at the beginning of each chapter to demonstrate its position in the overarching argument. Nevertheless,

Sobecki's treatment of English law presents a compelling invitation for future scholarship on the influence of the *ius commune* on England's vernacular legal tradition, particularly in the works of Fortescue. Sobecki's important contribution is essential reading for anyone with an interest in the common law in premodern England.

LINDSAY BREACH, *University of Canterbury*

Solum, Stefanie, *Women, Patronage, and Salvation in Renaissance Florence: Lucrezia Tornabuoni and the Chapel of the Medici Palace* (Visual Culture in Early Modernity), Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 314; 4 colour, 75 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781409462033.

In a field as extraordinarily fecund as Quattrocento Florence, the role of women as patrons of art has been notably absent from the historiography. This is no fault of scholars; determining direct patronal links is often difficult work, and in the case of women, it is more often than not impossible. Traces of female influence are simply not there in the archival sources. For this reason, Stefanie Solum's new monograph performs an important task. It is an admirable attempt to fill this lacuna, and while Solum's contribution is framed by just one artist–patron relationship – Lucrezia Tornabuoni (1427–82) and her role in commissioning Filippo Lippi's *Adoration of the Child* for the private chapel of the Medici palace – the author works very hard to ensure that this example should be seen 'as a key to the larger unwritten history of female patronage in Renaissance Florence' (p. 14).

Solum divides her study into six chapters. The first explains how Lippi's altarpiece, completed sometime around 1457 and currently displayed in Berlin's Staatliche Museen, represents a fundamental shift in the artistic style of the time. His reworking of the adoration trope, with its wooded, almost mystical setting, represented a significant departure from the mid-fifteenth-century norms that dictated the composition of these types of images.

Solum's second chapter taps into the prevailing trends in gender history, and locates Lucrezia's agency, particularly as a Medici bride (she married Lorenzo 'il Magnifico' in 1444), within its historical context. Most importantly, it lays bare Lucrezia's personal piety, one of the foundations upon which the broader argument is built. At the pinnacle of Florence's elite, the intensely devout Lucrezia spent much of her life striving to ameliorate the spiritual damage caused by the fabulous wealth of the Medici, and Solum does a convincing job of portraying her as a spiritual hub for both her family and the Florentines alike.

The third chapter introduces the child Baptist of the altarpiece and goes to great lengths to explain Medici appropriation of what was traditionally a civic image. Solum demonstrates that this artefact was the catalyst for a

persistent new style. This chapter, along with the fourth, is where the author does most of her work linking the challenging image of the young, ascetic Baptist to Lucrezia's spiritual anxieties, which were confirmed by Florence's famous archbishop, Antoninus. His advice, that the Medici required the utmost personal devotion and discipline to avoid falling into the spiritual vacuum whipped up by their temporal concerns, presents an obvious schematic for Solum to follow in building her narrative. Based on a variety of archival and literary sources, including Lucrezia's own poetry, by this stage the picture of a pious woman wholly concerned for the spiritual well-being of herself and her family comes into sharp focus.

Chapter 5 explores nature as a devotional context and explains why Lippi, in conjunction with his patrons, chose to depict the *Adoration* in the forested setting that so distinguishes his altarpiece. Lucrezia's affinity with the Camaldolese Order, whose hermitage was situated in a similarly wild and mountainous location, goes some way to establishing these links, although this section is certainly not as compelling as those that precede it.

Chapter 6 serves as the Conclusion, and importantly locates the altarpiece within the very specific devotional context for which it was ultimately intended, namely, as the culminating point of Benozzo Gozzoli's magnificent fresco cycle depicting the Procession of the Magi. The ceremonial march of the procession, splendidly representative of the temporal world of the Medici, winds its way towards the serenity of Lippi's otherworldly *Adoration*, revealing to the viewer a great many of the spiritual struggles that Lucrezia and her family spent their lives negotiating.

This is an important study, not least because it affords Quattrocento women a role in a discourse from which they were more often than not excluded. It will of course interest art historians, but also scholars wishing better to understand female interaction with the devotional milieu of late Quattrocento Florence. Solum's narrative, which brings together the disparate elements of Lucrezia's piety, is especially strong in this regard, as is its treatment of the very elite, very Medicean concerns that were constantly at the forefront of her mind; these defined her patronage as much as her womanhood, perhaps more so. Also praiseworthy is the author's erudite reading of the artwork itself. Lippi's altarpiece is challenging, but Solum's interpretation is both perceptive and convincing. In the end, this monograph gives a fascinating insight into the development and artistic manifestation of one woman's spiritual journey, and is particularly adept at placing this personal devotion within its broader, historical context. It lends its significant weight to the notion that the search for female patrons in Quattrocento Florence must continue.

LUKE BANCROFT, *Monash University*

Stanton, Domna C., *The Dynamics of Gender in Early Modern France: Women Writ, Women Writing* (Women and Gender in the Early Modern World), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. vii, 255; 20 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472442017.

The title of this book, *The Dynamics of Gender*, provides an immediate clue to the theoretical orientation of the model of gender proposed by Domna C. Stanton. Stanton's feminist close reading of writing by and about women in seventeenth-century France draws on the work of Judith Butler and Michel Foucault to emphasise the unstable nature of gender as a relational, historical category. A key issue for both Butler and Stanton is the capacity of agents to resist normative gender frameworks. According to Stanton, Butler situates agency within 'the apparatus' (p. 1) of gender, suggesting that the processes that produce the categories of 'masculine' and 'feminine' simultaneously create ambiguities and inconsistencies that gendered subjects can use to contest gender norms. Stanton's dynamic theory of gender interprets gender norms as 'a normative repertory of [coexisting and conflicting] types' (p. 4) that are enacted by historical actors who conform to, negotiate, or resist the gender scripts available to them. She applies this theory to six case studies that examine the construction of women in texts by male and female writers.

The book is divided into two parts, each of which comprises three chapters focused on a key text, or, in the case of Chapter 3, two counter-discursive texts. Part I, 'Women Writ', analyses representations of women in texts by male writers including Racine, Fénelon, and Poullain de la Barre. Part II, 'Women Writing', examines representations of women by three female writers: La Guette, Sévigné, and La Fayette. Stanton's aim is to identify 'signs of conformity and of resistance to normative gender scripts and the tensions that their inscribed negotiations produce' (p. 23). To this end, each of the case studies in Part I begins with a discussion of modern critical theory before moving to a contextual, historical close reading of the key text. Chapter 1 uses the critical trope of 'the classical body' to interrogate Mikhail Bakhtin's reading of an anonymous 1622 satire of women's talk at a lying-in. The 'classical' Racine is questioned by Chapter 2's reading of the relationship between political order and the control of women in his 1674 tragedy *Iphigénie en Aulide*. Chapter 3 turns to Foucault's notion of 'reverse' or 'counter' discourse to evaluate the pedagogical and feminist legacy of Poullain's 1674 radical *De l'éducation des dames* and Fénelon's 1687 reactionary *De l'éducation des filles* in the context of seventeenth-century anxieties about female knowledge.

In Part II, Stanton's focus shifts from canonical genres dominated by male writers – satire, tragedy, and treatises – to modern genres associated with female writers – memoir, letter-writing, and fiction. The style of these chapters also shifts, with Stanton's voice becoming clearer and more direct

in her reading of the conflicting female selves constructed by La Guette's defence of female life-writing, Sévigné's assertion of maternal love, and La Fayette's ironic narratorial ambiguity. These three chapters, unlike the chapters in Part I, are not organised chronologically: Chapter 4 analyses La Guette's 1681 memoir, Chapter 5 examines Sévigné's letters to her daughter, which date from the early 1670s to the 1690s, and Chapter 6 considers La Fayette's 1678 novel *La Princesse de Montpensier*.

In her Afterword, Stanton suggests that some of the negative depictions of women she identifies in the male-authored texts in Part I are resisted by the female-authored texts in Part II. For example, representations of mother love in Chapters 4 and 5 run counter to the negative and ambivalent depictions of mothers in Chapters 1 and 3. But this comparison is not straightforward, as Stanton notes that La Guette's moralising discourse in Chapter 4 includes 'virtually misogynistic attitudes toward daughters' (p. 209).

Stanton's critical approach to 'reading-as-a-feminist' employs a number of strategies to uncover ambiguities in the discursive construction of gender in early modern France. Perhaps due to the nature of the book as a series of case studies, Stanton does not develop strong conclusions about the significance of the gender types identified by her 'dynamic contextual historical approach' (p. 211). The Introduction acknowledges the limits of her close reading methodology, claiming that the key texts analysed in the book are 'symptomatic of broader issues', rather than 'representative of all seventeenth-century works by men and by women' (p. 24). The Afterword reiterates the feminist politics of this approach, situating Stanton's method of critique within an 'always unfinished' (p. 212) project of deconstructing forms of alterity.

BRONWYN REDDAN, *The University of Melbourne*

Suerbaum, Almut, **George Southcombe**, and **Benjamin Thompson**, eds, *Polemic: Language as Violence in Medieval and Early Modern Discourse*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 302; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781472425065.

This volume of essays arises out of an interdisciplinary collaboration at Oxford's Somerville College and is a follow up to a previous collection published in 2010. While the earlier book concentrated on polemic in medieval texts, this volume extends the enquiry into the early modern period. In a lucid Introduction, the editors locate their overarching concerns in relation to debates among critical theorists about the ethical consequences of polemic and 'hate speech', and about the potential for certain modes of speech to incite acts of violence, whether or not this is their explicit intention. The eleven contributors historicise this ethical enquiry by exploring the various

mechanisms and genres through which polemic has operated, seeking 'to delineate the characteristics of polemical speech and writing and to assess what role polemical modes played in pre-modern discourse and social practice' (p. 3).

The editors note that recent scholarship on the history of polemic has characterised it as an early modern phenomenon connected to the Reformation and to the invention of the printing press. A stated goal of *Polemic* is to disrupt this periodisation by tracing continuities in the use of polemical modes of speech across the medieval and early modern periods. This is achieved by grouping the contributions using an analytical rather than a chronological structure. Three thematic sections move from polemic contained within specific institutional limits and textual conventions, to polemic as public performance, and as a way to provoke change and incite action.

Individual essays pursue this enquiry in sources dating from the early Middle Ages through to the seventeenth century, and across France, England, Germany, Castile, and as far afield as Muscovy. Such breadth and variety could make for a disjointed volume. However, to the credit of the editors and authors, the strong connections made in each essay to the core arguments and theoretical framework set out in the Introduction make for a satisfying coherence and thematic unity, while also illuminating differences and particularities across time, place, and genre.

Returning in various ways to the question of the ethical consequences of speech, the contributors trouble our assumptions of a distinction between polemic as a formalised intellectual exercise 'contained within social, discursive, or generic conventions' (p. 11), and polemic deployed instrumentally to effect material ends (often violent and/or exclusionary). For example, Monika Otter considers a common didactic genre in which pupils are envisaged attacking and even killing their masters. While the rhetoric in these texts is violent and aggressive, their polemic is also 'framed, bounded, contained and therefore made permissible by the rules of a flyting game' (p. 110). Violent rhetoric is used here to attack schools and scholastic ideals on their own linguistic terms, but at the same time it serves to initiate each new generation of pupils into the privileged social world of a literate elite.

Individual essays engage with polemical speech in both more and less familiar forms. For example, George Southcombe shows how a polemic of moderation in seventeenth-century pamphlet literature in fact worked to justify violence and drive division, leading to the formation of political parties. Almut Suerbaum examines a little-studied genre of vernacular sermons from thirteenth-century Germany. These sermons, intended for public performance before a lay audience, demonstrate that violent polemic against Jews and heretics played an important role in shaping public opinion well before its appearance in the more widely studied vernacular sermons of

the early 1500s. Annie Sutherland and C. M. MacRobert both consider the ways polemic was deployed in fierce debates over the vernacular translation of scripture, the former in late medieval England and the latter in sixteenth-century Muscovy. Sean Curran's contribution uncovers polemic in the unexpected genre of the motet. Curran's original and intriguing analysis suggests that polemic could be expressed in and enhanced by musical devices, and used as a way to guide the performing clerics to recognise and amend their own corruption.

Polemic is a richly realised collection that is a model of interdisciplinary scholarship. It contributes significantly not only to our understanding of polemic and linguistic violence in a broad range of past social, cultural, and political contexts, but also provides invaluable historical context for modern debates about polemic, 'hate speech', and its ethical consequences.

E. AMANDA MCVITTY, *Massey University*

Walsham, Alexandra, *Catholic Reformation in Protestant Britain* (Catholic Christendom, 1300–1700), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 508; 28 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £80.00; ISBN 9780754657231.

Alexandra Walsham has collected together under this title a series of articles that have previously appeared in different journals and collections. Although they do not form a single, fully articulated argument, they all relate in one way or another to her earlier book on Church papists. The collected articles develop her argument that Catholic historians of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries – those who took the historiographical viewpoint that between the established form of Protestantism and persecuted Catholicism in Britain there was always a sharp opposition – were suffering from tunnel vision. Walsham asserts, however, that the interpretation of this history has now been 'decisively reconfigured', with the new interpretation adopting a wider and more international approach. The nature of this collection – the articles have not been much altered from the form they originally took for different purposes – results in some rather abstract presentations that would, in this context, have benefitted from reworking to introduce some more specific illustrations.

Her first chapter provides a historiographical introduction to the recent English work in this area and predominantly in England, from John Bossy onwards, which has revised attitudes to Catholicism in Britain since the Reformation. Her critique downplays Eamon Duffy's work and, although she touches on research into other places in the world where different approaches came into conflict, her concentration is on England and Wales. Other parts of Britain are not discussed in any detail. Her survey of research on Scotland is limited and omits a number of scholars like Patrick Conlon and John Watts

who have made significant recent contributions. This is perhaps a pity as the Scottish experience, which differed in many respects from the English, would have enriched some of her presentations.

Walsham's argument depends very much on her preference for certain types of evidence and a heavy reliance on Jesuit records; underlying this is her conviction that the laity played an active part in the creation and maintenance of a recusant attitude and community. Since undercover practices were almost by necessity domestic this is something that has long been recognised but rarely stressed.

In Walsham's view, English society was pluralist from the start of the Reformation period, leading her to dismiss as 'deeply misleading' dichotomies between resistance and compromise. Instead, she prefers to examine the problems of conscience and conformity as the same for Catholics and Protestants as they faced the moral dilemmas of reconciling secular and religious commitments when the two diverged. While the evidence is patchy, Walsham is convinced that people remained friends and allies across the theological divide.

Walsham also seeks to reconcile the research into the Catholic post-Tridentine renewal that emphasises its intolerance and coercive nature with that of those who have preferred, as she does, to stress the continuing place that miracles and traditional devotion played in the local maintenance of the faith. Paradoxically, her doubts about the success of the Counter-Reformation movement in purging the Roman Church of its superstitious weaknesses, goes back to much earlier common elements of historical accounts. It leads her to restore miracles to a more prominent place in her description of how Catholic belief was maintained and to explore how St Winifred's well remained a place of pilgrimage when so many other wells were obliterated. Sacred space has been the focus of attention since Mircea Eliade brought it to academic attention; Walsham does not address issues related to the transformation of sacred space here, although elsewhere they are well known.

Questions of conversion that inevitably involved the problems of available forms of communication are addressed in three chapters. These touch on the difficulties of translation but curiously not on what is currently an unsolved issue. Recent scholarship has expanded on Beryl Smalley's work on medieval sermons – we can now appreciate how they were used – so that students of later sermon practices ought to consider more closely whether or not there was more continuity in this form of communication than is usually assumed. There are other questions: did contemporaries use the same choice of Bible texts?; how did they transpose them?; were the translations different?

Throughout these articles, Walsham's arguments are most useful in stimulating further areas that need to be considered in future research. For instance, her brief discussion of the appearance of a printed vernacular Bible

as a catalyst in the encounter of ordinary people with spiritual texts raises many important points, especially in regard to different translations. It does not, however, take up the problem of those who spoke no English, so that her conclusions cannot be taken as applying outside England. Welsh Bible translations that were blessed by the Established Church, appeared in the sixteenth century, were greeted as the supreme achievement of the Church, and have been seen as the critical way in which Welsh and Welsh culture were preserved. No similar success was achieved in Gaelic-speaking Scotland where listeners were dependent on the individual translations offered by the clergy. This created a different culture in which the Catholic missionary priests operated and Presbyterian ministers struggled. We must hope that Professor Walsham will take up some of these openings in her future research.

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*

Weston, Robert, *Medical Consulting by Letter in France, 1665–1789* (History of Medicine in Context), Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. 240; R.R.P. £74.00; ISBN 9781409452171.

In *Medical Consulting by Letter in France, 1665–1789*, Robert Weston has gathered in excess of 2,500 letters of diagnosis and consultation relating to over one hundred practitioners to demonstrate the widespread nature of the practice, and to further our understanding of the purposes, practicalities, and limits of medical communication in this form. This approach offers an interesting balance between patient and consultant voices, including their occasional debates over diagnoses and the best remedies, as Weston seeks to provide ‘an analysis of the medicine of the period through the everyday experiences of physicians, surgeons and their clientele’ (p. 13).

The breadth of Weston’s research means that the book will have moments of interest for all medical historians. Social historians more broadly will also no doubt find the discussions interesting, particularly his evidence of medical consultation on behalf of children in Chapter 3. For this reviewer, the most arresting sections of the book pertained to what the consultations revealed about the practical application of medical theories and treatments. For example, Weston is able to perform a quantitative analysis of prescriptions, such as purging, enemas, opiates, and blood-letting, surprisingly finding that the last mentioned, often considered ubiquitous by medical historians, was prescribed in only half of his cases. Such evidence provides a useful accompaniment to the prescriptions given by published medical texts of the period.

Chapter 1 provides an overview of the source material and Weston’s collection techniques, with some interesting discussion surrounding decisions to publish letters in the period, especially as it related to rivalry between the

key medical schools of Paris and Montpellier. The second chapter largely sets the scene for 'who's who' in the correspondence, and their place in the French medical world. In Chapters 3 and 4, Weston turns to how negotiations were conducted within the correspondence and, where the source material allows, outside it. The relationships between patients and their families and different practitioners are considered in regard to authority over the body and its treatment, as well as the capacity to diagnose an individual as diseased and in need of intervention. Chapters 5 to 8 move to the practicalities of diagnosis and prescriptions. Of particular note here is the problematic relationship of disease to language, which is arguably exacerbated within the phenomenon of diagnosis by letter, in an era of developing disease and symptom classification and belief in the idiosyncrasy of disease expression. A final case study of epilepsy allows Weston to tie together his key themes, and exemplifies the way in which he is able to focus his ambitious overview of French medical culture with case studies and a well-maintained structure.

As Weston admits, one of the limitations of the study is the nature of the source material: he finds the correspondence largely limited to discussions of chronic rather than acute conditions (since the latter rarely allowed time enough for postal consultation), and involved patients from the 'more elite sections of society' (p. 31). However, Weston's discussion of the negotiations of authority between patients of higher status and their physicians, surgeons, family members, and others is a highlight of the book.

Also, although he does note that patients were more likely than *ordinaires* to mention their temperament (sanguine, choleric, etc.) when describing their condition, suggesting their greater residual adherence to the Galenic model, Weston finds limited evidence for the consultations as spaces for engaging in the debates over conflicting medical models that consumed the academy and published treatises. Instead, probably unsurprisingly, the consultations focused on the remedies, rather than the theories behind them.

EMILY COCK, *The University of Adelaide*

Wickham, Chris, *Medieval Rome: Stability and Crisis of a City, 900–1150* (Oxford Studies in Medieval European History), Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 536; 13 b/w illustrations, 9 maps; R.R.P. £35.00; ISBN 9780199684960.

Already published as *Roma medievale. Crisi e stabilità di una città, 900–1150* (trans. Alessio Fiore and Luigi Provero (Viella, 2013)), this book has been greeted with considerable enthusiasm and acclaim. Publication in Italian made sense, as most specialists in the field are continental scholars or must be able to read Italian. Publication in English suggests a bid for a wider readership and it is from this viewpoint that I address the book. Non-specialists will find

it demanding but, if they persist, extremely rewarding, for its methods as much as for its results.

The book deals with the problems of 'pre-communal' Rome. Its period begins with a late Carolingian crisis, involving Arab incursions into Lazio, factional violence, and the murder of popes. It ends with the surmounting of a longer crisis (1050–1150), the breakdown of Rome's traditional system of government, and the establishment of the papal Curia and the Senate, new types of political structure. But this 'storyline' is not Chris Wickham's subject. His subject is a series of interlocking facets of the workings of the city – its social, economic, cultural, and political structures – explored and reconstructed in great detail and with supreme methodological awareness mostly from a small and patchy collection of archival documents, 'building blocks originally destined for quite other purposes' (p. 11). Herein lies the book's originality, as well as the hurdles its minute analyses of detail present to the non-specialist reader.

The teasing of information, hypotheses, and explanations out of the documents is enabled by deft manipulation of wider contexts and driven by the posing of bold questions. It is one of Wickham's aims to work through comparisons: 'Rome cannot be understood except comparatively' (p. 3). The comparators are the larger northern cities of Lombardy and Tuscany, but also some southern ones. The comparative perspective yields a Rome with a unique and complex economy, owing to the size of its hinterland (a direct source of agricultural surplus) and its complete control over the *Agro romano*, largely owned by churches and leased. The city itself was not unproductive. In the tenth century, it was the largest in Europe but had fallen behind by 1300. Artisans and merchants were more present than elsewhere in Italy before 1150; the documents allow the creation of 'snapshots of artisanal activity and specialization' (p. 141).

A particularly interesting section of Chapter 2, 'The Urban Economy', focuses on the urban fabric. Here, Wickham draws on recent archaeology and Étienne Hubert's *Espace urbain et habitat à Rome du X^e siècle à la fin du XIII^e siècle* (Ecole française de Rome, 1990), to modify Krautheimer's sharp distinction between the *abitato* and *disabitato*. His tour of the well-documented regions of eleventh-century Rome ('small and bustling') demonstrates an unparalleled differentiation between them in character, social makeup, and economic focus and prosperity and lays the foundations for his two chapters on the elite strata: Chapter 5, 'Urban Aristocracies', and Chapter 6, 'Medium Elites and Church Clienteles: The Society of Rome's Regions in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries'.

Wickham regards these as 'in many respects the central chapters of the book' (p. 181). By squeezing the restricted documentation as hard as he can for information on prosopography, the holding of titles and offices (with

important remarks on terminology), wealth, property, place of residence, and castle ownership, Wickham in Chapter 5 traces changing social patterns and political roles through the rise and fall of thirteen families (e.g., the Tuscolani, 'Crescenzi', Frangipane, Pierleoni). In Chapter 6, he looks at a sample of five medium elite families and three regions. One key interest and special feature of Rome is the importance of regional politics, an issue taken up again in the last, powerful, chapter, 'The Crisis, 1050–1150', where Roman collective politics are set beside papal politics to situate the history of the emergence of the Senate in relation to that of the other communes.

I conclude with the second-last chapter, 'The Geography of Ritual and Identity', which may have the greatest appeal to the non-specialist. This deals with a variety of cultural practices, through which the city's unity, its sense of itself and of its past were created and made available for use: 'Rome's cultural world as ... a set of resources, a toy-box' (p. 384). Here, Wickham gives dense but fresh and critically aware discussions of papal ritual processions, church building and decoration (focusing on San Clemente and Santa Maria in Trastevere), the advent of Justinianic law, and Roman authors' ways of remembering and using the past (papal, secular, and classical).

To sum up, this book is a model for the socio-political history of a premodern city, written in a direct and enjoyable manner.

FRANCES MUECKE, *The University of Sydney*

Wiesner-Hanks, Merry, ed., *Mapping Gendered Routes and Spaces in the Early Modern World*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 398; 43 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781472429605.

This volume contains essays investigating the relationship between early modern gender and space. The first three assess the current scholarly fields in feminism, world history, and sexuality. Valerie Traub examines how modern approaches to gender, race, class, and sexuality can inform early modern studies. Traub's fascinating hypothesis is highlighted by her analysis of seventeenth-century cartography. In the maps' frames, she identifies how European figures in respectable trade attire enforce a heterosexual normality onto a world of exotic and class difference.

The second theoretical essay by editor Merry Wiesner-Hanks examines the critical lack 'between global history and the history of gender and sexuality' (p. 59), focusing on intermarriage between different races and religions and exotic androgyny. She concludes that gender offers a rich resource in understanding early modern global history. Charlene Villaseñor Black challenges the accepted model of the male artistic genius. Her essay explores the recent critical contribution to acknowledging and rediscovering early modern Spanish female artists.

Part II starts with Gerhild Scholz Williams examining early modern cross-dressing. Her two illuminating narrative case studies investigate cross-dressing as a means of transcending cultural boundaries. Through poetry, Tara Pedersen next considers Anne Greene's resurrected life and reputation, comparing Greene's textual body to Hero's from Shakespeare's *Much Ado about Nothing*. Pedersen's fascinating argument opens a debate on how women can control their reputation by re-mapping their bodies.

Pamela M. Jones analyses Teresa of Ávila's previously unstudied 'official persona as presented in a temporary decorative program – an *apparato*' (p. 131). The *apparato* is a series of paintings, sculptures, inscriptions, and music dedicated to Teresa's universal holy realm. Jones provides insights into Teresa's mapped environment as a powerful religious leader and feminist role model. Sara L. French examines the landscape gardens designed by Elizabeth Talbot, Countess of Shrewsbury, famously known as Bess of Hardwick. French's entertaining essay details how Elizabethans viewed the natural world as a manipulative resource. Her last paragraph is particularly chilling.

In a collaborative essay, fishwives from London and Amsterdam are compared. This semiotic study incorporates mermaids and whore mongering. Dutch fishwives, the authors conclude, had greater marketplace agency than their marginal London counterparts.

Part III begins with Elizabeth A. Lehfeltd's study of Ana de San Agustin's autobiography of her life as a Discalced Carmelite nun. Lehfeltd's particular interest is in a figure of baby Jesus that was kept in a box by a revolving window. Interestingly, the window was located at the intersection between the commercial, outside world and the enclosed cloister. Lehfeltd's far-reaching essay perfectly exemplifies the volume's aims.

Kimberlyn Montford examines how, despite patriarchal control and an oppressive Catholic Church, women found autonomy in early modern Roman convents. Montford focuses on the nuns' music that could be heard throughout Rome. Her essay skilfully unpacks the relationship between enclosed female religious, pious chastity, and the music that seeped into a patriarchal city.

A second collaboration investigates the historicising of events through verbal accounts. The essay details how medieval and early modern women formed strong kinship networks by constructing genealogical narratives through a spatial history. The essay makes the thought-provoking implication that history is in constant flux depending on who is recounting it and when. Another collaborative effort explores women's role in creating early modern paranoia. In a striking reading of Shakespeare's *Henry V*, the essay argues that the French Queen Katherine is a potential threat against the English king. A similar reading is given of Portia in *Merchant of Venice* and of Goneril and Regan in *King Lear*. The essay asserts how, together, conspiring women could be a subversive threat without being aggressive.

Part IV starts with Ann Christensen's discussion of 'absent husbands and unpartnered wives' (p. 272). Expanding commercial activities in the New World necessitated that men travel away from their family homes and Christensen investigates this domestic phenomenon through conduct literature and guides to merchant travel. Bernadette Andrea examines the presence of Islamic women in early modern Britain. Andrea argues that these women were not exotic curiosities but had a far-reaching and influential impact on British culture. Finally, Sheila T. Cavanagh examines how the untimely, suspicious death of Amy Robsart (the wife of Lord Robert Dudley) informs a twenty-first-century appetite for celebrity gossip.

Mapping Gendered Routes and Spaces is an important contribution to understanding gender diversity in the early modern period. The volume also goes further by applying this diversity to global history and spatial awareness to invite further study.

FRANK SWANNACK, *University of Salford*

Wiseman, Susan, *Writing Metamorphosis in the English Renaissance 1550–1700*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 254; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781107041653.

In her previous two books, Susan Wiseman reshaped ideas about political contexts for civil war drama and for early modern women's writing. In her new book on metamorphosis, the political is merged with a broader social context, which enables her to explore how the world was conceptualised by a repeating knowledge base that is characterised by 'the imagining of transformation' (p. 1). The idea of metamorphosis explored in this book is far wider reaching than the literary tropes exemplified in Ovid's popular treatment, however influential Ovid may have been on Renaissance literature. Ovid is, rather, a paradigm for a broad social fascination with the process of change as a form of knowledge. Wiseman is concerned to use a methodology that allows her to re-historicise the concept of metamorphosis, avoiding a modern separation of early modern material into areas of knowledge separated by disciplines. Accordingly, Wiseman analyses 'the presence of metamorphosis in five kinds of writing which seem, in modernity, to be separate' (p. 13); these are: classical, sacred, physiological, oral-literate, and ethnographic.

The perfect example of how Wiseman's original methodology produces rich, contextualised analyses is the alignment of the canonical *Midsummer Night's Dream* and the virtually invisible *Black Dog of Newgate* in her first chapter. While Shakespeare's play has always been associated with ideas of transformation, in Wiseman's reading, this is part of a complex layering of human and bestial. Wiseman is able to explore transformation in *A Midsummer Night's Dream* in terms of a shift in the blurring of status boundaries in relation to culture. In her account of the mixed-genre *Black Dog* – part realistic

prison pamphlet, part metaphor of prison as Hell – Wiseman explains that this text ‘chooses to put before us both metamorphosis and doubt about metamorphosis as a mode’ (p. 39). Wiseman links play and pamphlet as examples of how metamorphosis registers changed and the sense of social and political crisis in the 1590s. The emphasis on social consequences is even stronger in Wiseman’s second chapter, which considers the relationship between baptism after the Reformation as contested transformation, and attitudes towards animals and their liminal presence in such ceremonies. Stories, true or otherwise, of animal baptism indicated the social tensions caused by the religious divisions of early modern England, and also, Wiseman argues, fluid relations between status barriers.

This fluidity is also present in the natural world, which, Wiseman argues, was represented for the early moderns as in a constant state of generation and transformation. This insight enables Wiseman to offer a much more subtle account of the relationship between the monstrous and the politics of *The Tempest* than previous critics of the play, who have a less nuanced view of Caliban and his place in the world. Wiseman’s reading of *The Tempest* is in some ways reminiscent of classic new historicist, ethnographically inflected analyses of early modern literature. Where Wiseman differs from those earlier approaches is in the way she explores the ‘non-literary’ material as significant in its own right, rather than as props wheeled in to enhance the literary analysis; this book therefore offers a much richer account of early modern culture and society. When Wiseman turns to the figure of the wolf/werewolf, she indicates just how significant this shifting borderline between human and non-human is for a true understanding of the political dimensions of social and religious thought in the seventeenth century. Accordingly, Wiseman’s complex account of the liminal nature of the werewolf illuminates her reading of *The Duchess of Malfi*. Once again, metamorphosis has a political reverberation: ‘The play uses Ferdinand as lycanthrope to suggest both the ambiguous power of wolfishness and its crucial association with rule’ (p. 151).

Wiseman then considers stories of wild children, placing them in a proper early modern context, rather than in the pervasive Romantic perspective derived from Rousseau. The text that illustrates this complex situation is *The Winter’s Tale*, where once again an iconic play is illuminated through an original, richly descriptive context.

Finally, Wiseman notes how her analysis of metamorphosis accounts for the way that the disciplinary divisions of modernity have to be set aside in order to understand the still fluid conceptions of knowledge and the world that prevailed through the seventeenth century. Such insights underline the fact that this is a book that will be of value to all scholars of early modern Britain, regardless of their disciplinary allegiances.

PAUL SALZMAN, *La Trobe University*