

Reviews

Clemens, Raymond, ed., *The Voynich Manuscript*, New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library with Yale University Press, 2016; cloth; pp. xvii, 304; 268 colour illustrations; R.R.P. US\$50.00; ISBN 9780300217230.

MS 408 in the Beinecke Library at Yale University (the Voynich Manuscript) has been dubbed ‘the most mysterious manuscript in the world’. Its script, language and text remain unknown and unreadable, and its many detailed coloured drawings of plants appear to relate to no known species. Numerous cryptologists, both amateur and professional, have failed to decipher it. It has become something of a cult, with various websites devoted to it and a growing number of adventure novels built around it — including one in the Indiana Jones series. Its history and origins are also mysterious, though it is known to have belonged to Athanasius Kircher and possibly to the Emperor Rudolf II in the seventeenth century.

There is already a digitized version of the Voynich Manuscript available from the Beinecke Library’s website, which is apparently responsible for 11 per cent of the overall traffic to that site and nearly 50 per cent of the traffic to its zoom viewer for images. The Spanish publisher, Siloé, has announced a full-size replica edition, due to be published in 2018. But this Yale-produced facsimile is the first such book to appear, featuring colour images of every page of the manuscript — and even including a re-creation of several fold-out folios which appear in the second half of the codex. The images are high-quality, clear reproductions, with the exception of a slightly blurred folio 100^v.

Apart from the inherent value of having such a facsimile commercially available, this book is important for the accompanying group of authoritative essays, which deal with various aspects of this enigmatic manuscript. René Zandbergen summarizes what is known about its history and provenance between the seventeenth and nineteenth centuries, while Arnold Hunt contributes a fascinating account of the antiquarian book dealer, Wilfrid Voynich (1865–1930), whose name is now inextricably linked to the manuscript he discovered in the early twentieth century. William Sherman reviews the many unsuccessful attempts to decode the manuscript in the twentieth century, including the work of eminent British and American code-breakers better known for their work on Japanese and German ciphers during the Second World War. Jennifer M. Rampling discusses the manuscript’s images and their possible connection with alchemical traditions.

As all these contributors make clear, we are still no closer to understanding either the text of the manuscript or its pictures and diagrams. Extensive investigations into its physical characteristics, reported here by a team of Yale University conservators, have produced some results, however. Radiocarbon dating reveals that the parchment itself almost certainly dates from the first half of the fifteenth century. Chemical analysis of the inks and paints used for the text and images shows that they are consistent with this period. There is no evidence for the manuscript being a later forgery. Indeed, multispectral imaging has revealed the erased signature of the earliest known owner, the Prague pharmacist, Jacobus Horčický de Tepenec (also called Sinapius), who died in 1622.

The Voynich Manuscript remains an enigma. This volume sets out clearly and succinctly the current state of knowledge about this remarkable manuscript. The colour images provide excellent evidence for every amateur or professional who wants to try and unravel its meaning, or simply for those who want to marvel at its mysteries.

TOBY BURROWS, *The University of Western Australia*

Cleminson, Richard, and Francisco **Vázquez García**, *Sex, Identity and Hermaphrodites in Iberia, 1500–1800* (Body, Gender and Culture, 16), London, Pickering & Chatto, 2013; hardback, pp. 224; R.R.P. £60.00, US\$99.00; ISBN 9781848933026.

Estebanía de Valdaracete was a young girl from a noble family who from an early age — in the phrasing of contemporary accounts — distinguished herself in ‘heroic qualities and deeds’, to the astonished wonder of neighbours and fellow villagers: her physical strength, and her outstanding bravery made her stand out in physical exercise, as did her dedication and extraordinary fencing skill. After much debate, she was made to be examined by matrons and determined to be ‘*hermafrodita*’, that is, intersex. Estebanía underwent a ceremonial procedure of *electio* of sex, where she was offered to choose her sex, her gender, and her life, provided that her choice was solid for the rest of her life. She chose to live as a man (Esteban), and took an oath to do so before the bishop and several other authorities. Esteban set up a very successful fencing school in Granada. Her case was treated as a ‘marvel’ or *res mirabilis*, that is, an extraordinary event that showed the omnipotence of God and the inscrutability of His designs.

But precious few cases examined by Cleminson and Vázquez García involve what might have been an intersex person. Most are in fact examples of gender fluidity, which throw a lot of light into our understanding of early-modern gender as an intersectional marker of social rank, class subalternity, and personal agency. The case of Catalina de Erauso (a Spanish Orlando) is an example of such personal agency: in the over-masculine context of the

Spanish Empire, Catalina succeeded in the construction of an individual gender identity by creatively adopting and combining a set of rigid normative gender patterns and roles. Born into the lower nobility, Catalina was soon famous for her rowdy, undisciplined, hyper-masculine character. She escaped a Dominican convent at the age of fifteen and lived an adventurous life as a swordsman, page, butler, cattle owner, tax manager, and soldier, enlisting in the king's militias under a male name, and swiftly progressing to receive the rank of Lieutenant General. When her deception was uncovered, she received permission from the king and the pope to change her name and live as a soldier, and received a pension according to her military rank. Against all odds, her courtly and military manliness was an antidote for the perceived decadence of the Spanish Empire.

However, both Catalina and Estebanía came from good families. Elena/o de Céspedes did not. In 1586 in the city of Toledo (Spain), the officials of the Holy Tribunal of the Inquisition placed Eleno — who was then living as a married man to a woman twenty years his junior — under arrest, under the charge of sodomy ('that utterly confused category', as Foucault put it). It was found out that Eleno had been born as a woman, of *morisco* origin (i.e. formerly Muslim, forcibly converted); she was also dark-skinned, poor, and queer. Needless to say, the officials of the Inquisition Tribunal did not show much mercy on this occasion, nor was she offered much choice.

The three examples excerpted represent a range of situations, problems, categories, and disciplines examined in detail by the authors of this book, which also provides an illuminating analysis of the different discourses employed to deal with them: philosophical, medical, ecclesiastical, legal. The primary literature discussed (from Plato to Galen, from Avicenna to Lacqueur) provides a succinct, accurate, engaging introduction to the cases examined and will offer possible avenues for future research to the attentive reader. This chronological approach to the topic greatly enriches the authors' findings, and will prove an interesting complement to anyone familiar with Foucault's research into the notion of the 'abnormal' in eighteenth-century France. Indeed, this book fills a substantial gap in the scholarship on the subject, mainly limited to Northern Europe and Britain. Studies on intersexuality (and on transgender and sex fluidity at large) have been scarce within Hispanic studies, and largely restricted to literary stage texts. Melveena McKendrick's influential research into the '*mujer varonil*' is a splendid example of such approach. This excellent book by Cleminson and Vázquez García opens up new avenues for on-going research, offers a well-informed survey on the topic, and is a model for future advancement.

CARLES GUTIÉRREZ-SANFELIU, *The University of Queensland*

Cousins, A. D., *Andrew Marvell: Loss and Aspiration, Home and Homeland in 'Miscellaneous Poems'*, London, Routledge, 2016; hardback; pp. 237; R.R.P. £95.00; ISBN 9781409442394.

A. D. Cousins's monograph on Andrew Marvell's *Miscellaneous Poems* (1681) makes a fresh and detailed contribution to our understanding of this enigmatic poet's verse. In this book, Professor Cousins continues his longstanding interest in Marvell that has produced numerous articles and the co-edited collection (with Conal Condren), *The Political Identity of Andrew Marvell* (Scolar Press, 1990). Cousins does not address all the poems in *Miscellaneous Poems*, choosing instead to focus his six chapters on key clusters of poems that scholarship has emphasized as major works: the Mower poems; 'Nymph Complaining' and 'To his Coy Mistress'; 'Bermudas' and 'The Garden'; the religious verse ('The Coronet', the Dialogue poems, 'Eyes and Tears', 'On a Drop of Dew'); the Royalist poems and 'An Horatian Ode'; and 'Upon Appleton House'. Various other poems are discussed, but these are the main foci.

The book is notable for a number of reasons. First, its thesis unifies around the themes of loss and aspiration, home and homeland. These prove to be fertile and interconnected terms that emphasize Marvell's engagement with notions of 'loss of a royalist political order and literary culture', 'loss of home ... versions of homelessness', and 'loss of or separation from a homeland' (p. 2).

Second, these versions of loss are presented as catalyst and matter for Marvell's 'authorial ambition', which manifests itself via his extraordinary poetic virtuosity. This virtuosity is visible not just in the way Marvell signals his knowledge of literary and intellectual traditions, but in his appropriation and transformation of them in poems that possess inherent complexity and multivalency. Marvell's ability to hybridize and set in productive opposition aspects of religious and profane literary traditions displays his connoisseurship and, relatedly, his aspiration to demonstrate artistic conquest of poetic rivals past and present.

Third, it is all very well to assert Marvell's poetic sophistication, but quite another matter to demonstrate it adequately. Cousins succeeds in this because his knowledge of intellectual history and its literary forms from antiquity to the seventeenth century is impressive in scope and detail. He can demonstrate how Marvell's 'Nymph Complaining' transforms Fanshawe's translation of Guarini's *Il Pastor Fido* at the same time as it sets up an interplay between Ovid's *Heroides*, the Niobe myth, and the tradition of the Marian *hortus conclusus*. The analysis of 'An Horatian Ode' offers an exciting exploration of the disparate influences of Lucan's Caesar and Horace's Octavian, but adds to this reference to Augustus's *Res gestae divi Augusti* and association with Machiavelli, Hobbes, and Marchamont Nedham. Cousins demonstrates the relevance of Petrarch,

Boccaccio, and Sannazaro, but also of Theocritus, Virgil, Horace, and Ovid (among others) to understanding Marvell's Mower figures and enriches this further by illustrating how Reformed theological discourse complicates the renovation of classical pastoral. Each poem addressed enjoys this level of detailed exegesis that shows up competing and often unresolved discourses at play within and between poems at the same time as building a sense of Marvell's persistent, artistic wrestling with forms of loss, aspiration, home, and homeland.

As early modern Literary Studies seeks its post-New Historicist future, we need examples of illuminating scholarly readings that are cognizant of historical contexts and yet able to do justice to the nuances and complexities of literary tropes and traditions evolving through time and across Latin, English, and other European vernaculars. It is no longer sufficient to declare vaguely that Marvell is a Puritan and/or Neoplatonic writer with a penchant for aesthetic precision, elegance, and scepticism. The publication of Nigel Smith's copiously annotated edition of *The Poems of Andrew Marvell* (Longman, 2003; rev. 2007) gave scholars a compendium of literary contexts to work with in analysing Marvell's poems. Cousins's book is an exemplary complement to this archival plenitude because it delivers a convincing thesis by way of embedding the poems in a dynamic mosaic of literary tropes and traditions reaching from the 1650s back to antiquity.

Fourth and finally, although it is not explicitly stated in the book's title, the argument for Marvell's varied poetic engagements with home and loss, homeland and aspiration is bound up with a demonstration of his abilities as a mythmaker in uncertain times. This is a key aspect of the monograph's achievement and the chapter on 'Upon Appleton House' with which the volume ends is a superlative demonstration of everything discussed in this review including, not least, 'Marvell's aspirations as at once a refashioner and inventor of myth, as both connoisseur of myth and virtuosic mythmaker' (p. 212).

LIAM E. SEMLER, *The University of Sydney*

Darby, Peter, and Faith Wallis, eds, *Bede and the Future* (Studies in Early Medieval Britain and Ireland), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 286; 1 b/w illustration; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781409451822.

The Venerable Bede is best known to many for his *Historia ecclesiastica*, and histories, by their nature, are about past time. However, as the editors note in their introduction to *Bede and the Future*, *historia* can also mean 'description', 'and thus histories could be of present conditions' (p. 2). To consider Bede as a historian only is to do a disservice to his wide-ranging mind and the depth of his works. Through his thinking and writing Bede transcended his time.

Faith Wallis and Peter Darby are fitting editors for this volume. Wallis

has published translations of several of Bede's works, including those most explicitly concerned with time: *De temporum ratione* (published as *On the Reckoning of Time*) and *De temporibus* (with Calvin Kendall, published as *On the Nature of Things and on Times*), while Darby's 2012 monograph is titled *Bede and the End of Time*. The other contributors are no less well known in the field of Bede studies. The title of the collection expands on that of Darby's monograph, taking Bede's vision of the future as inclusive of but moving beyond the end of time.

'Bede looked out on many futures', the editors write (p. 3), and his ideas developed over time. The volume thus takes a roughly chronological sequence according to the order in which Bede penned his works, inasmuch as this can be known. This method of ordering means that thematically similar essays are not always grouped, but it demonstrates the ways in which Bede returned to certain topics throughout his life.

The first essay, by Wallis, asks why Bede wrote his commentary on the Book of Revelation, one of his earlier works. As she notes, 'the fact that he *was* selective tends to get lost' (p. 23). Bede did not write commentaries on every book of the Bible, nor on every topic of science or history. The question is not only why did Bede choose Revelation, but why did he make such an ambitious choice at the beginning of his career? Wallis concludes that Bede's choice was intended 'to counter mistaken views about knowledge of the future' as well as to state his own orthodoxy (p. 44). Alan Thacker continues the theme of Bede's anxiety about accusations of heresy and unorthodoxy, which followed him throughout his life in one form or another.

Christopher Grocock discusses Bede's anxieties regarding more domestic matters: the possibility of changes to the Wearmouth–Jarrow monastery amid Northumbrian political upheaval. Grocock's main source text is Bede's *Historia abbatum*, but when Paul C. Hilliard visits a similar theme, Bede's ideas about the future of Northumbria, it is from the later perspective of Bede's *Historia ecclesiastica*.

Calvin B. Kendall writes on 'Bede and Islam', noting that the term Bede actually used was 'Saracens'. Darby's contribution addresses the 'history of the future' presented by Bede in *De temporum ratione*, and in particular the ways in which Bede's eschatology differs from that of Augustine and Jerome. Bede's use of AD dating in the *Historia ecclesiastica* is, Máirín MacCarron argues, a way of confirming the Christian future. James T. Palmer also examines *De temporum ratione* and its vision of the future, but in the context of computistical arguments and controversies, both in England and further afield, arguing that 'Bede was addressing a disunited intellectual landscape in general' (p. 146). Scott Gregorio's essay on Bede's ideas for monastic reform in his final works closes the volume, rounding out Bede's many futures.

ANNA WALLACE, *Western Sydney University*

Eggert, Katherine, *Disknowledge: Literature, Alchemy, and the End of Humanism in Renaissance England*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015; cloth; pp. 368; 11 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$55.00, £36.00; ISBN 9780812247510.

Katherine Eggert's book is a contribution to the study of how at particular times and under certain conditions humans have consciously chosen to not know what they know, or to avow that which they know is not so. Her term 'disknowledge' refers 'the conscious and deliberate setting aside of one compelling mode of understanding the world — one discipline, one theory — in favour of another' (p. 3). Phrased this way, it appears innocuous enough, but the argument of the book is that the promise of Renaissance Humanism rapidly disappeared and during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries the language, strategies, and imagery of alchemy, a discredited and discreditable 'occult science', was increasingly used to signal the failure of Humanism in the absence of a better, subsequent system. Eggert claims the humanistic ideal that classical learning could be integrated into 'a Christian knowledge base' (p. 15) is the second of a three-pronged view of Humanism that also espouses mastery of the Ciceronian rhetorical style, and the commitment to self-betterment and the betterment of society. She notes the anti-humanist sentiments of many humanist-trained figures, such as Luther and Macchiavelli. The next intellectual framework, Baconian empirical science, does not emerge immediately, and Eggert argues that the rhetoric of alchemy fills the gap between Humanism and the rise of Enlightenment science.

This is a large claim, and the book is only a partial success. Three case studies and three associated methods of disknowledge are investigated to demonstrate how alchemical rhetoric facilitated the deliberate business of not knowing. First, the Catholic doctrine of Transubstantiation (which exemplifies forgetting); then Christian readings of Kabbalah (which shows skimming); and last gynaecology (which exemplifies avoiding). The primary method of Eggert's investigation is literary criticism: in Chapter 2, 'How to Forget Transubstantiation', she analyses the poetry of John Donne, concluding that for Donne alchemy is 'an all-purpose disknowledge system [...]. Handy for forgetting about the disputes that were at the heart of the Reformation [...] it is also handy for not allowing the new science to challenge cherished humanist presuppositions, however erroneous they may be' (p. 91). The oeuvre of George Herbert, similarly, wrestles with contemporary matter theory. Whereas Donne is fascinated by 'exceptional matter', Herbert's focus is 'the ordinary things of this world' (p. 101).

Chapter 3, 'How to Skim Kabbalah', traces how Christian writers used alchemy with 'other esoteric disciplines to rewrite Kabbalah as having been Christian all along' (p. 115). Figures including Martin Luther, Pico della Mirandola, John Dee, Johann Reuchlin, Cornelius Agrippa, and others

'skimmed' Kabbalah (taking the useful things and discarding everything else). The literary reflections of this practice that Eggert considers include Caliban in Shakespeare's *The Tempest* as a Jewish figure, more specifically, a *golem*, and Christopher Marlowe's *Dr Faustus*. Chapter 4, 'How to Avoid Gynecology', examines how sexual reproduction became entangled with alchemy in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. This led to the notion that the ultimate achievement of alchemy 'was the creation of the homunculus; a true human, perhaps one that even resembled its maker and was infused with a soul [...] grown from heated male semen alone' (p. 167). Eggert focuses on anatomy books to argue that the reality of female reproductive organs was systematically avoided. This contention is then traced in Edmund Spenser's *The Faerie Queene* and Shakespeare's *Love's Labour's Lost*.

Chapter 5, 'How to Make Fiction', argues that as alchemy became separated from Humanism and is linked to fiction, 'both fiction and alchemy garner, quite paradoxically, more legitimacy and more unqualified endorsement, losing their shared reputation for simply being a bad idea' (p. 208). The proof texts here are *Hamlet*, Ben Jonson's *The Alchemist*, and Margaret Cavendish's *The Blazing World*. For humanists, literature could change the world; Eggert asserts that Jonson posits literature as a sort of parallel universe alongside the world, whereas for the royalist yet radical Cavendish, 'literature is the world' (p. 241). It is unhelpful to imagine the contours of a different book while reviewing one that exists, but it is undeniable that if Eggert's subject matter book was treated by a historian or a scholar of Western Esotericism, the results would likely be more convincing. *Disknowledge: Literature, Alchemy and the End of Humanism in Renaissance England* is well-written, it is intelligent, and it is interesting to read. Yet for this reader at least, the sweeping argument proposed is not effectively vindicated by the evidence adduced to support it, and the term *disknowledge* itself does not seem warranted. However, scholars of early modern English literature may well find the book productive of new readings of well-known texts.

CAROLE M. CUSACK, *The University of Sydney*

Farmer, Sharon, ed., *Approaches to Poverty in Medieval Europe: Complexities, Contradictions, Transformations, c. 1100–1500* (International Medieval Research, 22), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. viii, 252; 4 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503555478.

Poverty is a theme that continues to fascinate scholars of medieval and early modern Europe. As Sharon Farmer explains in her introduction, there is still a sharp tension between the perspectives of Michel Mollat, who emphasized the impact of the Church in promoting concern for the poor, and of Bronislaw Geremek, who emphasized how medieval churchmen re-asserted negative attitudes towards the poor. Farmer traces how both perspectives have had

their influence, even on the different papers within this volume. While there is no doubt that there was a dramatic growth in charitable institutions concerned for the poor in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, there is disagreement about its impact. As always, resolution of a historical problem lies in avoiding too many crass generalizations.

A study by Adam J. Davis of the development of hospitals and what he calls 'a culture of compassion' in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries argues persuasively in favour of a more positive attitude towards the poor being fostered in this period as a consequence of mendicant orders and the charitable bequests they generated. The archival evidence Davis has unearthed complements the inevitably idealistic picture presented by hagiographical accounts. While such charity was more about ensuring personal salvation than resolving endemic structural issues in the medieval economy, it provided avenues of welfare that simply did not exist in previous centuries.

Some papers touch on poverty without engaging so much in a religious dimension. Thus Janice Musson provides a specific analysis of court records of legal dispossession in the thirteenth century. The fact that a range of groups had access to royal justice to protest against such measures itself shows that the poor, if legally free, did have some confidence in a system designed to prevent arbitrary exploitation. From a different perspective, Alyssa M. Gray considers new thinking about the legality of excluding those who violate Jewish law from receiving charity, developed by Rabbi Eliezer of Metz (c. 1115–98). The issue involved resolving conflicting obligations. His resolution was towards greater strictness than had been the case, so as to preserve community values, echoing similar moves in Christian canon law, but undoubtedly influenced by heightened Jewish fear of apostasy from their community.

Allison Edgren focuses on the ambiguous character of mendicancy in the Franciscan Order. While Francis urged his friars to embrace the situation of being poor, there was clearly much reserve about begging, especially in the first half of the thirteenth century. By the 1240s, such advice was certainly attracting criticism from outside the Order. There was always sensitivity within the Order, whether begging might itself encourage greed. Such idealism only served to encourage negative attitudes towards those obliged to beg for a living. There is a similar realism of insight in Jill Moore's study of how Inquisitors in Italy handled the significant funds that came their way as a result of confiscation of heretical goods. Avoiding easy generalization, she offers a range of examples to show how difficult it was for mendicant Inquisitors to avoid making significant profits. Some, like Francesco da Pocapaglia and Thomas de Gerzano, kept their vows, while there were others, like Giovanni dei Pizigotti and Mino da San Quirico, whose extravagance encouraged public suspicion and even formal complaints.

In a masterly survey, Samuel K. Cohn, Jr considers the paradox that characterized Europe in the late fourteenth century: economic conditions for a peasant class seem to have been improving, although in the face of increasing hostility to the popular movements that surfaced during the 1370s. Cohn's analysis offers an eloquent plea for comparative study and recognition of a range of situations. Political developments served to limit the opportunities that economic prosperity might offer. His conclusions are paralleled by the more local study of Pol Serrahima i Balius of the accounts of an almshouse (the *Almoina*) of Barcelona, which shows how civil war in the late fifteenth century led to a dramatic reduction in its offering meals to the poor, although not for its institutional position in the city. Sarah B. Lynch reflects on the diverse situation of teachers in late medieval Lyons, some belonging to a privileged elite, others needing to survive by taking other forms of employment. While most of the papers in this volume are historical, that of Anne M. Scott is literary. She looks at the way female images of poverty could paradoxically also assert female power, whether in the case of Lady Poverty in the Franciscan *Sacrum commercium Beati Francisci cum Domina Paupertate*, Chaucer's *Wyf of Bath's Tale*, or the figure of Glad Poverty defeating Dame Fortune in Lydgate's *Fall of Princes*. In each case, we see how an apparently powerless lady can exercise great power. Scott's contribution elegantly closes a volume that demonstrates how economic inequality reveals much about the tensions within medieval society.

CONSTANT J. MEWS, *Monash University*

Hamburger, Jeffrey F., William P. **Stoneman**, Anne-Marie **Eze**, Lisa Fagin **Davis**, and Nancy **Netzer**, eds, *Beyond Words: Illuminated Manuscripts in Boston Collections*, Boston, McMullen Museum of Art, Boston College, 2016; cloth; pp. 374; 325 colour plates; R.R.P. US\$85.00; ISBN 9781892850263.

The Boston area is rich in collections of medieval and Renaissance illuminated manuscripts. Their contents and treasures were highlighted in the major exhibition, 'Beyond Words', held between 12 September 2016 and 16 January 2017, after more than a decade of planning. No fewer than nineteen different institutions contributed to this exhibition, which brought together more than two hundred and fifty items from these collections. The contributors ranged from the obvious — the Houghton Library at Harvard University and the Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum — to the small and unexpected — the Armenian Museum of America and the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT).

The book, like the exhibition, is arranged thematically, divided between three host institutions: 'Manuscripts from Church and Cloister' (Harvard University, Houghton Library), 'Manuscripts for Pleasure and Piety' (Boston

College, McMullen Museum of Art), and 'Italian Renaissance Books' (Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum). Within each of these themes, the editors contribute a series of short essays introducing each of the nineteen subsections. There is also a longer, introductory essay by William P. Stoneman and Anne-Marie Eze on the history of the various collections, showing how and why, from the later nineteenth century, these institutions came to acquire their rich and varied selection of medieval and Renaissance manuscripts.

There are many fascinating items in this catalogue. Probably the earliest are six leaves from a seventh-century Luxeuil manuscript of the *Moralia* of Gregory the Great, now in the Houghton Library at Harvard University (item 12). From Wellesley College comes one of the leaves from the thirteenth-century Beauvais Missal (item 74); Lisa Fagin Davis provides an authoritative account of the sad history of this manuscript, which was cut up and dispersed in the 1940s and 1950s. She also describes recent exciting work that has identified more than 100 leaves spread across six countries, and has produced a digital reconstruction of the parent manuscript. Item 80 is a 'charming' cutting produced by the so-called Spanish Forger in the early twentieth century, now the object of study in his own right. There are numerous beautiful Renaissance liturgical books and Books of Hours, as well as a handful of important early printed books (pp. 64–66, 235–49).

The entries are contributed by no less than eighty-three international scholars, many of whom are leaders in their field. The space devoted to each manuscript is generous, often running to a whole page in this large-format volume with its two-column page layout. Almost every entry includes a colour facsimile of a representative page, or of initials from cuttings and fragments. The entries are aimed at an educated, but not necessarily specialist, audience, based on the latest research. The extensive bibliography includes some very up-to-date material, including two 2017 items by Bryan C. Keene and recent entries in Peter Kidd's 'Medieval Manuscript Provenance' blog.

On the whole, the entries are relatively consistent in approach, though some are inevitably much longer than others. The only significant area where some inconsistency is noticeable is in the treatment of provenance. Item 194 — an important fifteenth-century copy of Ptolemy's *Geographia* (Harvard University, Houghton Library, Typ 5) — is described as having 'distinguished provenance', for example, and the text of the entry discusses its donation to the convent of San Marco in Florence by Cosimo de' Medici. But its later history, including its ownership by Sir Thomas Phillipps, is not mentioned. Some entries do not mention provenance at all.

This inconsistency flows through into the summary descriptions at the beginning of each entry. A significant number of entries record only the acquisition of the manuscript by the current owner, whereas others give a fuller summary of the provenance history. In neither case, though, does the 'general index' cover this information; only the text of the entry is indexed.

It is impossible to find out from this index that manuscripts owned by a collector like Phillipps were included in the exhibition.

This is only a minor cavil, however. On the whole, this is a fascinating and beautiful account of a marvellous exhibition, with something of interest for everyone from the general public to students to specialist researchers. As an advertisement for, and definitive record of, the riches of Boston's collections, it is a resounding success. The sumptuous printed catalogue is complemented by a website, BeyondWords2016.org.

TOBY BURROWS, *The University of Western Australia*

Harrison, Peter, *The Territories of Science and Religion*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2015; cloth; pp. 320; 14 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$30.00; ISBN 9780226184487.

Science and religion have been constructed as opposing fields of human activity, concerned with the human mind and the soul respectively, and therefore severed from one another: independent at best, incompatible at worst, and in any case openly opposed. A brief look at the history of terms *religio* and *scientia* reveals the inconsistency of this dualistic paradigm: indeed, the cradle of Western philosophical thought in the extant fragments of the pre-Socratic philosophers points out an intimate alliance between close observation of natural phenomena, speculative thought, and spirituality. Likewise, even a cursory glance at the Roman and medieval school curricula reveals what nowadays pundits would call an embodied, holistic approach to knowledge. So where and when does this radical separation emerge? What purposes does it serve? And most importantly, why do science and religion emerge as separate bodies, and how is that separation enforced and carried out?

Peter Harrison offers many answers to these questions in a fascinating, engaging, and wonderfully written book that traces a true archaeology of these two terms (and many others more), as well as a detailed map of their development and constitution. Chapter 1 provides a suitable introduction to some of the historical problems by providing a succinct and accurate survey of the life of these terms in Christian thought, in particular in the works of Augustine of Hippo, Thomas Aquinas, Isidore of Seville, and Jerome. In doing so, Harrison shows how the emergence and history of both terms is essential not only for establishing a genealogy of knowledge, but also to provide us with 'crucial insights into their present relations' (p. 3). Chapters 2 and 3 provide ample examples of the relationships between the book of heavens and the book of scripture, or the word of nature and the word of God, showing the continuity between ancient philosophy and Christian medieval thought, much in the vein of E. R. Curtius's splendid work on the medieval curriculum. Chapter 4 examines the impact of the Reformation in religious practice, as well as the impact of the experimental method in early

modern science. Broadly defined as a shift from internal virtues to external practice, this process affected both science and religion to the same degree, but also shaped them in a dialectical relationship that would ultimately set them apart. However, the emergent new wave of scepticism would affect both areas equally. For instance, the age of discovery and exploration threw religious dogma into disrepute, but also undermined long-standing scientific authorities such as Ptolemy or Aristotle. The defining factor would ultimately come from the practical implications of the new science, as Harrison shows in chapter 5, and from its usefulness much later, during the industrial revolution, as witnessed by the emergence of the term ‘progress’, another concept closely associated with our modern understanding of ‘science’. Finally, in chapter 6 Harrison examines how the plurality of new experimental methods and knowledges were eventually unified during the nineteenth century, for academic, industrial, and professional reasons.

Originally conceived and written as a series of lectures aimed at a non-specialist audience, this wonderful book provides a succinct, highly engaging overview of a growing field of historical research. This book, ultimately, is also a fine example of modern integrated historical research for anyone interested in the history of science, or in early modern European thought. Perhaps this richly textured map — stimulating and clear for both the layperson and the specialist — will be most welcome in these days in which we are advancing towards a better, more nuanced, more culturally aware understanding about the place of faith in contemporary society, and about the ethical and moral challenges of science for better, fuller, more balanced living.

CARLES GUTIÉRREZ-SANFELIU, *The University of Queensland*

Haskell, Ellen D., *Mystical Resistance: Uncovering the Zohar’s Conversations with Christianity*, New York, Oxford University Press, 2016; hardback; pp. xii, 235; 21 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £64.00; ISBN 9780190600433.

Ellen D. Haskell’s *Mystical Resistance: Uncovering the Zohar’s Conversations with Christianity* delineates the nature of the tragic anti-Jewish persecution in medieval Spain, and the manner in which the Kabbalists responded via subtle critiques of Christianity woven into the *Sefer ha-Zohar* (*The Book of Splendour*). The *Sefer ha-Zohar* is a mystical treatise written in Aramaic in thirteenth century Spain by Moses de León as a commentary on the Torah. Amidst the esoteric interpretations of the creation of the world and participation in God — the latter being a true hallmark of any mystical text (one need only glance at the Hindu *Bhagavad Gita* or the Orthodox Christian *Philokalia*) — Haskell’s intention is to explore the impact of the socio-political context on the Zohar’s production, namely ‘the subversive narratives’ that the Kabbalists wove into the text ‘that bolstered Jewish identity by countering Christian claims’ (p. 1).

In her introduction, Haskell addresses ‘The Zohar beyond Theology:

Uncovering a Work of Resistance'. The first chapter, 'Contesting the Kingdom of Heaven: Rachel as Counterpart to Christ', shows that by transferring the attributes of the former — who was a symbol for Israel — to the latter, there was an attempt to devalue Christian claims concerning Christ's messianic significance. In this chapter Haskell describes 'the Kingdom of Heaven' in the Christian interpretation of the New Testament Gospels as 'an exclusively Christian salvific future that comprises a new world of Christian redemption' (p. 21). She also asserts that the Kabbalists responded to the belief in this future eschaton by emphasizing the kingdom's presence among the Old Israel, and by implication its descendants; in other words shifting it to the here and now. The weakness in this argument is that Christians also believed the kingdom to be present in the here and now — the future eschaton constituting the fulfilment of a present experience.

The second chapter, on 'Cleaving to the Other Side: Conversion to Christianity', presents 'Christian missionizing, the threat of religious conversion, and the extraordinary potential for damage to the Jewish community associated with prominent thirteenth century converts' (p. 39). Especially troublesome were mandatory 'public disputations' instigated by former Jews in France and Spain, as well as forced attendance to sermons delivered by mendicant friars meant to bring about conversion by compulsion (pp. 39–40).

The third chapter, 'A Moses for Idolaters: Balaam as Christ', addresses subversions of 'Christian teachings about Christ's death, his ascension, and the fate of his physical body' (p. 66) — which for Christians are particularly difficult to read. In this section, Haskell argues that the Gentile prophet Balaam son of Beor was understood by Christians as a typological prefiguration of Christ (p. 75). This is a misunderstanding: Christians considered Balaam as prophesying about Christ, not as a type. In fact, Christian exegesis, from Hebrews (7. 1–28) onwards, assimilates Christ with the typological figure of Melchizedek, who in Genesis 14. 19 blessed the father of the Jews, Abraham, but never with Balaam. In any case, Balaam is associated by the Kabbalists with Christ for a different purpose: to make of the latter a figure completely foreign to Jewish experience in order to criticize him, which is the focus of chapter four.

The final chapter, 'In the Palace of Images: Responding to Christian Art', tries to show that the deployment of Christian art in thirteenth-century Spain — while primarily directed at 'Western Europe's Christian community' (p. 108) — was nevertheless also aimed at subordinating Jews to Christians. To prove these claims, the author refers to the typological subordination of Jewish figures, such as Abraham and Isaac, to Christ in Christian art that saw in Christ the fulfilment of the Old Testament types (pp. 108–09). However, such interpretations of Old Testament figures, in both literature and art, are as old as the Church itself and need not be interpreted in a polemical manner.

Moreover, the ancient image of ‘Christ in Majesty’ that is the focus of this chapter’s critique (pp. 118–20) depicts Christ giving the benediction or blessing of peace, which contradicts any notion of persecution or dominance.

It is difficult to give a final verdict on this volume. On the one hand, the mistreatment of the Jewish community in Spain is a terrible failure that should be brought to the attention of contemporary Christians in order to learn from the mistakes of the past. On the other hand, I was expecting to find in the pages of this volume the traces of — as its subtitle suggests — a genuine, positive ‘conversation’ between the Zohar and Christianity. Such a task would not have been impossible, given the penchant for mysticism in the Zohar which could be brought into conversation with forms of Christian mysticism, usually exemplified by virtuous persons in both camps who would not lapse into the kind of vitriol represented in this volume; vitriol that does not, in our troubled world, serve the long sought after interests of peace among Jews and Christians that should one day finally prevail.

MARIO BAGHOS, *The Australian Institute for Orthodox Christian Studies*

Jakobsson, Ármann, *A Sense of Belonging: ‘Morkinskinna’ and Icelandic Identity, c. 1220* (Viking Collection, 22), Odense, University Press of Southern Denmark, 2014; cloth; pp. 406; R.R.P. DKK375.00; ISBN 9788776748456.

In 2011, Ármann Jakobsson and Þórður Ingi Guðjónsson presented the academic world with their work on *Morkinskinna*, the thirteenth-century manuscript containing an Icelandic saga depicting the history of Norwegian kings from Magnus I to Sigurdr II. Jakobsson has now extended access to his research on the *Morkinskinna* manuscript to an international audience through the assistance of translator Frederik Heinemann. The result is *A Sense of Belonging: Morkinskinna and Icelandic Identity, c. 1220*, in which Jakobsson successfully meets his goal to explore the saga.

Throughout the book, Jakobsson asserts that scholars of Icelandic sagas have paid little attention to *Morkinskinna*, and he uses it to present his most recent attempt to explore the saga as a whole. He shows that scholars should consider the saga within a historical framework as much as within a literary one, and that the main purpose of the saga is to present the relationships between the early medieval Icelandic people and the kings of Norway. Rather than comparing the saga to others, he concentrates on using the manuscript as the main source material, analysing what little information is known about its origins and its place within medieval narrative structures. How the saga author presents portraits of Icelanders, Norwegian kings and their societies within its pages, and how the saga demonstrates methods of Icelandic storytelling are all addressed, with Jakobsson covering such matters in detail. Jakobsson demonstrates that *Morkinskinna* is not simply a collection of stories

about the past. Rather, it is an exploration of Icelandic identity at the time of its commitment to manuscript. Ideas such as how Icelanders viewed themselves outside Iceland are discussed. Jakobsson also considers how the author makes it clear to the audience that the saga within *Morkinskinna* is historical and based on reliable sources. He asserts that simultaneously, the saga author was aware of the importance of the art of narrative in delivering the stories found within it.

Commendably, Jakobsson has ensured that his primary references are accessible to readers with little or no knowledge of the Icelandic language, or for those readers who do not have easy access to a translation of *Morkinskinna*. All passages from the manuscript have been translated into English within the text. Footnotes are provided where necessary and have not been overdone, as can sometimes be the case in discussions of the sagas. The extensive bibliography demonstrates Jakobsson's exceptional knowledge of previous research on the *Morkinskinna* manuscript, as well as other sagas.

Jakobsson is certainly passionate about *Morkinskinna*, having dedicated over twenty years of research to the manuscript, and it shows in his latest book. His ideas certainly give a fresh view of the saga. This book should inspire others to consider *Morkinskinna* worth a new look. Any reader with an interest in the Icelandic sagas, medieval courtly narratives, or early Norwegian history will find his insights into this under-appreciated manuscript appealing.

JANE-ANNE DENISON, *University of the Highlands and Islands*

Jezierski, Wojtek, Lars **Hermanson**, Hans Jacob **Orning**, and Thomas **Småberg**, eds, *Rituals, Performatives, and Political Order in Northern Europe, c. 650–1350* (Ritus et Artes, 7), Turnhout, Brepols, 2015; hardback; pp. xiv, 366; 7 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503554723.

The twelve substantive essays in this volume represent a shift in the study of ritual in medieval northern Western Europe from a focus on performed religious ritual, to a focus on ritual as a structural function of medieval societies and their governance. In his comprehensive introduction, Lars Hermanson makes this aim explicit: the collection is intended to recast Scandinavian ritual studies as a field focused upon the mechanics of political and social order. His stated hope is that this shift toward secular power will facilitate ongoing comparative analysis with similar work undertaken in recent years in Western European ritual studies. To this end, Hermanson outlines a fundamental shift of underlying theoretical purpose that has occurred more broadly in ritual studies over the past decade: from ritual as a representative veneer of pre-existing power structures, to ritual as performed acts upon which such power structures were based. Though this distinction is not explicitly stated elsewhere in the volume, this premise underlies all the analyses contained

therein: rituals were partners to power, rather than merely superficialities with which power was clothed.

The book is divided into three parts. Parts I and II each comprise only two contributions, while Part III contains seven. Part I is foundational to the following chapters. Essays by Geoffrey Koziol and Gerd Althoff provide theoretical grounding both in the development of ritual studies and in current methodologies in the study of ritual as performed politics. Yet this is unlikely the primary reason for their segregation from the other contributions: while Koziol and Althoff are both authoritative within ritual studies, neither specializes in the religion and politics of the Scandinavian world. As such, both chapters focus exclusively on Western and Central Europe, standing in contrast to the Scandinavian focus of almost every other contribution. Koziol uses a Frankish 'pseudo-diploma' as the nexus for a linguistic analysis of the terms 'performance' and 'performative', a performance being a ritual representation of action, a performative act being a catalyst of consequential change. In his turn, Althoff focuses upon the implications of ritual behaviour for the maintenance of social order in the medieval world. Althoff sees ritual and legislation working hand-in-hand, the former regulating the generalities of societal norms, the latter regulating the details of social order.

Part II, 'Ritual Spatialization in Early Medieval Scandinavia', offers analyses of the ritual spaces of Scandinavian public gatherings. This section is temporally wide-ranging, though its two chapters, by Alexandra Sanmark and Olof Sundqvist, focus most particularly on the pre-Christian period of c. 800–1000. Sanmark grounds her analysis in Sweden, looking to the *thing* assemblies as occasions in which legal and religious interests entwined, and thereby extended to the landscapes in which they occurred. She posits that the rituals of the assemblies inscribed ritual function upon the cultural memory of the places of such public gatherings. Sundqvist's approach, at once complementary to, and contrasting with that of Sanmark, looks to the intertwined legal and religious roles of Scandinavian chieftains, and how their custodianship of ritual space inscribed upon them political and cultic authority.

The contributions to Part III provide a narrower focus to the performance of ritual as political function, and each of the seven chapters takes a unique approach to the study of ritual in Scandinavian society. Several essays are of particular note. Wojtek Jezierski provides the only other contribution with a non-Scandinavian focus, undertaking an analysis of how festive hospitality is portrayed in Helmold of Bosau's *Chronica Slavorum*. Similarly focusing upon tropes of ritual within a single chronicle, Kim Esmark analyses the performative function of political ritual, and the role of the actors therein, found in Saxo Grammaticus's *Gesta Danorum*. Håkon Haugland provides a close reading of late medieval Scandinavian guild statutes, examining the role of the rituals of guild gatherings in establishing a sense of camaraderie and

exclusivity among their members, and the resultant political influence of such organizations. The remaining chapters within Part III focus particularly upon the ritual nature of feasting within various socio-political contexts of the wider Scandinavian world.

Taken as whole, this is a well-structured volume that breaks new ground in both ritual studies and Scandinavian studies. It is to be commended for its efforts to facilitate pan-European comparative analyses of ritual in medieval governance.

MATTHEW FIRTH, *University of New England*

Mackay, Lauren, *Inside the Tudor Court: Henry VIII and his Six Wives through the Writings of the Spanish Ambassador Eustace Chapuys*, Stroud, Amberley, 2014; cloth; pp. 304; 28 colour illustrations; R.R.P. £ 20.00; ISBN 9781445609577.

For just on sixteen years, Eustace Chapuys was the eyes and ears of the Habsburg empire at the Tudor court, writing copious missives on a tumultuous period to Charles V, Mary of Hungary, and, eventually, Charles's son, Philip. Chapuys' two missions, from 1529 to 1545, initially saw him charged with defending, unsuccessfully, the claims of Charles's aunt, Katherine of Aragon, as rightful Queen of England against Henry VIII's planned annulment, and then, as Mackay argues, as lone champion for her daughter Mary, who was abandoned, in practical terms, even by her cousin Charles. The appointment brought Chapuys into close and regular encounter with a changeable monarch, a number of queens, an evolving line-up of administrators, fellow diplomats, ladies-in-waiting, and merchant communities, whom Chapuys appeared to convince to provide a wealth of information for the Imperial cause. Chapuys, a legally-trained man of the middling sort schooled in the humanist tradition, held admiration, it seems, for others regardless of their religious persuasion, and enjoyed sociable relations most notably with Thomas Cromwell.

It seems remarkable that Mackay's is the first study to place Chapuys himself in the spotlight since Garrett Mattingley's 1935 PhD thesis. Framed as a study 'to rescue Chapuys from his relative obscurity among the footnotes' (p. 10), the missions of the Imperial ambassador nonetheless structure Mackay's book. Eustace the man is rather harder to trace in the archives than Chapuys the diplomat, as Mackay distinguishes them. Further, the spotlight is really on the first of these missions, covering the years from the rise of Anne Boleyn through the death of Jane Seymour to the vastly changed political landscape of 1539. Two short chapters consider the nature of Chapuys' relationships with Princess Mary and Thomas Cromwell and two more cover his second mission, when an older Chapuys was distanced from some of the action of the court by ill health and generational change, missing some of his former colleagues and networks.

Mackay writes with a dynamic and confident style, which is lively and engaging. Academic readers, though, are perhaps not her foremost audience. Although well versed in Tudor historiography, Mackay is not concerned with contemporary scholarly questions that surround the new history of diplomacy, gender and masculinities, or the history of emotions, all of which could enrich the work. There is little consideration of the constructed nature of Chapuys' accounts, as potential acts of self-fashioning that occur through the rhetoric of epistolary content, the material apparatus of the letter and in his actions. This descriptive analysis of Tudor court life treats Chapuys' accounts largely at face value. How do we understand his claims to knowledge control through a wide network of informants or accounts to Charles of his evenly-matched verbal jousts with Henry VIII?

Chapuys' epistolary prose provides the thread through the text. It is unclear if Mackay has translated these works afresh; the calendars are cited heavily among other, archival sources and original wording is not provided in the notes. The short introduction is limited to addressing the question of Chapuys' accuracy as an eye-witness, recognizing his biases but rightly defending his importance as a source for the period. The work could certainly have benefitted from a conclusion separate from the last chapter, positioning Chapuys in the wider context of his time, among his fellow ambassadors. This would have made a stronger, analytical argument for his significance and value, beyond repeated assertions about the colour and life that his letters breathe into the court.

The 28 illustrations remain illustrative at best. A number of images of Chapuys' letters require more than the description 'original letter' to make them meaningful, and eighteenth-century copies of his letters and several of Chapuys' home town, Annecy (two of the same building) seem a wasted use of colour plates. There are a number of small spelling infelicities throughout in what is primarily a political narrative provided by the Imperial ambassador — not Spanish as the title suggests — since Chapuys himself was Savoyard and Charles, his master, emperor to vast territories beyond Spain.

Scholars can take much from this work, however. Mackay's close reading reminds us that some of the remarks attached to Chapuys and presented in isolation by no means represented his nuanced and evolving views of individuals whom he came to know over many years. Chapuys' missives provide an opportunity to consider gender relations, alternative masculinities, and the power of emotions in political discourse and action, not least as Chapuys sensitively interpreted Henry's intertwined social, amorous and political relations. Mackay reminds us that Chapuys deserves thorough attention in his own right and her work will be the site for future studies to launch from.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

Marshall, Melanie L., Linda L. **Carroll**, and Katherine A. **McIver**, eds, *Sexualities, Textualities, Art and Music in Early Modern Italy: Playing with Boundaries*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. xv, 241; 22 b/w illustrations, 2 tables, 8 music examples; R.R.P. US\$ 104.95, £75.00; ISBN 9781409464686.

Musicologists, historians, linguists, and art historians contribute their expertise in this engaging exploration of early modern Italian sexuality. The book reveals the ways that expressive arts promoted and subverted the boundaries between ideal and practised behaviours. Its discussion of the production and reception of texts exposes the distinctions and interplay between men and women, spirituality and carnality, sincerity and satire, autonomy and heteronomy, homo- and hetero-sexuality, and patricians and the poor. While the chapters (developed from conference papers) demonstrate inconsistent degrees of framework to align with the book's focus, the introduction and arrangement of the book into three parts artfully accentuates the chapters' conceptual ties and innovations.

'Part I: Performing Sexuality' offers readings of early modern expressions of sexuality that foreground satire and subversion ahead of the Neoplatonic values that tend to dominate scholarly analysis. Katherine A. McIver's opening chapter considers interpretations of the sexual innuendo in two works from Titian's 'Venus with a Musician' series (c. 1550–52) and in so doing establishes the book's themes of satire, sensuality, and subversion. The chapter sets out questions concerning the evocation of the senses and how the imaginative experience of the viewer/voyeur would contribute to a work's meaning. These questions are further explored in Catherine Baxter's chapter that investigates the implications of Boccaccio's claim that his *Decameron* only used 'honest' words and the readers' recognition of sexual metaphors depended on their imaginations. Baxter emphasizes Boccaccio's knowingly subversive approach, evidenced by his rhetorical reference to Galeotto who both shielded and facilitated illicit behaviour. Paul Schleuse's chapter continues to consider the use of metaphor to (un)veil the obscene, through case studies of bawdy songs sung recreationally or as part of lower-class street-performances in the sixteenth century.

'Part II: The Erotics of Religion' follows a chronological trajectory, engaging with sources that threatened the virtuous image of the Church by introducing erotic content in religious contexts. Catherine Lawless discusses the challenges medieval Tuscan artists faced when depicting female martyrs. Lawless, like Baxter and Schleuse, acknowledges the power of the invisibility of language to arouse contemplation. While hagiographies were able to engage the empathy of the reader by evoking the mental image of beautiful (often naked) women being martyred, artists had to select scenes more delicately, representing the beauty of the women as rhetorical evidence of their virtue

without inspiring unchaste voyeuristic responses in devotees. Anthony M. Cummings's chapter presents lengthy accounts of classically inspired and bawdy performances in Rome (largely held during carnivale 1518–21, under Leo X) to consider the kind of behaviour that so offended Luther on his visit to Rome (1510–11, under Julius II) that it spurred him toward reformation. The chapter does not make a case for Luther's having attended such performances, nor does it directly engage with Luther's criticisms of the papacy. Flavio Rurale's chapter picks up on the extended papal community's struggle to practise the chastity it preached in the wake of the Reformation. Rurale supports his argument with reference to the entrenched cultural and behavioural ties between the laity and the clergy with case studies ranging from cardinals' illegitimate children and Jesuits' silk shirts, to the clichéd seduction of nuns by their confessors.

'Part III: Images of Country Life, Realistic and Artistic' considers the ways that artists and composers utilized the trope of the lenient sexual mores of the lower classes as a way of speaking to the subversive desires of the elite. Christopher Brouard challenges and extends art historians' interpretations of pastoral images by considering the ways artists, appealing to Arcadian imagery, evoked the Neoplatonic ideal of love as context for homoerotic expression otherwise condemned in patrician Venice. Moving from privately owned images depicting shepherds as an outlet for suppressed masculine desire, the last two chapters consider the public performance of songs that ventriloquize suppressed female desire. Linda L. Carroll explores the context that informed the creation and reception of Beolco's *Betia* (c. 1517–18), particularly with regard to the choices that personal wealth and limited decorum made uniquely available to women in the agricultural community. Similarly, Melanie L. Marshall discusses challenges to the patriarchal ideals of female chastity, obedience and to the injustices of arranged marriages voiced by lower-class female characters in a sixteenth-century songbook by Castellino dedicated to Duke Ercole II d'Este of Ferrara. Marshall demonstrates that the songs potentially reflected the contemporary political opinion of Ercole's contentious marriage to Renée de France.

This interdisciplinary book contributes to emergent scholarship on historic sexuality by applying art-historical and musicological methodologies to demonstrate how the arts reflected, shaped, and broke boundaries between sexual ideals and practices. It presents a tantalizing selection of case studies that will pique the interest of scholars, students, and non-specialists alike.

ELIZABETH REID, *The University of Western Australia*

Panayotova, Stella, ed., *Colour: The Art and Science of Illuminated Manuscripts* (Studies in Medieval and Early Renaissance Art History), London, Harvey Miller, 2016; cloth; pp. 420; 414 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9781909400566.

The Fitzwilliam Museum in Cambridge has a world-class collection of illuminated manuscripts and fragments, derived from the original bequest by Viscount Fitzwilliam in 1816 as well as from subsequent acquisitions by celebrated directors like Montague Rhodes James and Sydney Cockerell. This catalogue accompanies an exhibition in celebration of the Museum's bicentenary in 2016. The items exhibited were mostly from the Museum itself, but also included manuscripts from various Cambridge colleges, the British Library, and further afield. They are mostly, but not exclusively, Western European in origin.

The catalogue covers more than one hundred and fifty manuscripts grouped into fourteen thematic sections, with introductory essays and catalogue entries contributed by a range of distinguished scholars from Europe and North America. Each entry is given a generous amount of space, with a full description and detailed provenance, and colour illustrations are provided for each item, many of them full-page. The volume is rounded out with a useful glossary, a list of manuscripts cited, and an extensive bibliography. Perhaps the only thing missing is a general index or a provenance index.

The catalogue and the exhibition draw extensively on the findings of the MINIARE project, which has been investigating artists' materials and techniques, using non-invasive scientific analysis. The results of this work are reported in Section 7 ('Masters' Secrets'), comprising much the longest part of the catalogue, amounting to a total of forty-four pages. Using techniques such as near-infrared (NIR) imaging, spectroscopic analysis, and optical microscopy, Stella Panayotova and her colleagues have been able to analyse the colours and binding agents used, and to look under the images to see erased or hidden elements. Among the conclusions drawn from this research are that the artists used a wider range of pigments and binding agents than previously thought, and that their preferences for colourants changed over time.

The project has also contributed to our understanding of the division of labour between different artists, of the extent and methods of making alterations, and of the modes of collaboration involved in making a manuscript. The MINIARE research challenges some long-held assumptions: that manuscript illuminators employed very few pigments; that they only used simple, unmixed pigments; that they used only glair or gums as binding media; and that manuscript illumination was typically static and 'medieval' in nature (unlike panel painting). The group of four manuscripts and fragments analysed for this project, and illustrated in this volume, shows just how vivid, varied, and sophisticated manuscript illumination actually was. This technical

analysis is closely linked to historical research by manuscript experts and art historians.

The other fascinating section in the catalogue ranges from ‘vandalism to reconstruction’. It deals with replicas and forgeries, including the increasingly well-documented ‘Spanish Forger’ of the later nineteenth century, as well as digital and mathematical reconstructions, and restoration and conservation generally. This section also reveals the value and interest — and the beauty — of the Marlay cuttings collection, especially in relation to art history. From the point of view of manuscript history more generally, of course, they are frustrating and ominous witnesses to the effects of prizing the artistic content of illuminations above the value of the manuscripts which used to contain them.

This volume is beautifully produced and well designed. It presents the findings from the MINIARE project in a clear and convincing way, as well as reporting on a range of more general topics in the history of manuscript illumination. The specific thematic focus of the exhibition and the catalogue must be kept in mind; the entries usually focus on the artistic qualities and materials of the illuminations, not on the text or the more general characteristics of the manuscript. Although the theme of ‘colour’ may sound limiting, this catalogue is an impressively wide-ranging guide to the main features of medieval and Renaissance manuscript illumination, accompanied by the results of some truly ground breaking scientific research into the secrets of these beautiful objects.

TOBY BURROWS, *The University of Western Australia*

Payne, Alina, ed., *Vision and Its Instruments: Art, Science, and Technology in Early Modern Europe*, University Park, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2015; hardback; pp. 304; 64 colour, 39 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$89.95; ISBN 9780271063898.

This is a very beautiful book with a generous array of images in both colour and black and white. It includes pictures by significant early modern artists such as Albrecht Dürer as well as familiar and no less spectacular scientific illustrations such as that of the fly in Robert Hooke’s *Micrographia*. The book is on a subject that will engage those interested in the early modern period and the links between science and art.

The introduction begins with a very vivid example of this mix, recounting an experiment by Galileo in Siena in 1633. Described by Teofilo Gallaccini, it allowed Galileo to demonstrate his telescope upon the night sky over a period of six nights. Gallaccini recorded these events not just in words but also in vivid sketches that described the geography of the moon over time. The sketches are vivid, but they also record a moment of crisis when, as Payne recounts, suddenly the testimony of sight is propelled to the centre

of scientific discourse. As she writes, 'sight was objectified, was made visible as an act, and it was made thus by an instrument: the telescope'. The links between art, science and technology are at the heart of this book.

The book resulted from the granting of the Max Planck and Alexander von Humboldt Prize to Alina Payne from Harvard University, and two workshops organized at the Max Planck Institute in Florence and at the Radcliffe Institute for Advanced Study at Harvard. This brought together a group of art historians and historians of science, philosophy, and literature, who were invited to discuss vision in the arts and sciences across objects and instruments. The twelve resulting essays were edited into this collection. Payne herself has published in these areas, including studies on Teofilo Gallaccini (*The Telescope and the Compass: Teofilo Gallaccini and the Dialogue between Architecture and Science in the Age of Galileo*, Olschki, 2012; and *Teofilo Gallaccini: Selected Writings and Library*, Olschki, 2012).

The period under exploration was one where considerable scientific and artistic theoretical and practical experiments were developed. In the visual arts, perspective was explored and expanded. This together with Galileo's telescope and other scientific innovations changed the way the world was perceived. There was a new emphasis placed on sight, and illustration had an important role to play.

The collection is divided into four parts: 'Epistemic Images'; 'Seeing the Unseeable'; 'The Painter's Brush and the Mind's Eye'; and 'Looking Back from Photography and Film to Alberti'. The range of images is wide, as well as that of the approaches taken. In the first section, much of the attention is on scientific botanical images. In Lorraine Daston's essay, she argues that eighteenth-century botanists would correct images to prevent artists representing exactly what they saw. Sachiko Kusukawa examines the case of Conrad Gessner and the integral role line sketches with watercolours played in his investigations of the physical world. He was primarily interested in the medical role of plants and wanted to be comprehensive. He used his network of correspondents to send him not just the most common examples but also the rare or the as yet un-reproduced plants. These fragments were then used to build up a universal history of plants.

Ranging from Leonardo da Vinci to the architecture of Gallaccini or Dante's *Divina Commedia*, writers explore the limitations and the challenges of the visible, with scientists pushing the visual to its limits. In the third section, Karin Leonhard discusses Italian Baroque still life paintings to argue that painters used colour to communicate and enhance unseen qualities, while also pointing out that scientists at the time were arguing that colour could be sensed without being seen. The final two essays also examine more modern instruments of vision, the photo lens and the camera, and the layers of meaning left by the early modern era that continue to inform our own time.

This is a stimulating, if sometimes difficult, series of engagements. I would recommend that anyone interested in the nexus between art and science in the early modern period look at this collection and admire and delight in the challenges these essays provide.

JUDITH COLLARD, *University of Otago*

Pilsworth, Clare, *Healthcare in Early Medieval Northern Italy: More to Life than Leeches* (Studies in the Early Middle Ages, 26), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xiv, 262; 3 b/w illustrations, 4 b/w tables, 1 map; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503528557.

Clare Pilsworth uses the word 'healthcare' in the broadest sense, and this is a good thing. It means that her book deals with medicine, diet, the law, magic, witchcraft, healers, shrines, miracles, dogs, *medici*, life expectancy, the body, herbs, blood letting, the human lifecycle, and many more topics. She examines these matters and concepts via law codes, other legal documents, charters, recipes, saints' lives, and images in manuscripts, printed texts, and reports of archaeological sites, the evidence originating mostly in early medieval northern Italy, as she has signalled in her book title.

Following a preface introducing the reader to the much-practised art of medicine in northern Italy in 500 to 900 CE, the author has structured her research nicely into two parts, 'Illness, Disease, and Treatment' and 'Healing: People and Places'. Each part is divided into three chapters. Part I also includes an introduction entitled 'Blood and Ink: Health, Medicine, and the Body in Early Medieval Northern Italian Books'. The three chapters following in Part I are labelled 'Disease, Medicine, and the Law'; 'Live, Eat, Die: Health, Diet, and Life Expectancy'; and 'Treating Illness: Herbs, Scalpels, and Cupping Vessels'. For Part II the three chapters are named 'Shrines and Healing'; 'The Age of Anxiety? Homes, Hostels, and Unsanctioned Healers'; and 'Doctors: In Search of the Early Medieval 'Medicus''. There is also a conclusion to the whole book.

I was somewhat puzzled by two comments on early facing pages in the book: 'Given the *relative paucity* of surviving sources from this period' (p. 2) and 'a key part of this Roman legacy was the preservation of literally *thousands of original charters and other legal documents* [...] not to mention *hundreds of manuscripts*' (p. 3) [my emphases]. Perhaps Pilsworth meant that the quantity is voluminous but the relevant content is like a needle in a haystack. Other writers have highlighted the difficulty in placing 'healthcare' in context in the early Middle Ages for textual, sociological and conceptual reasons.

There are many strengths to this book. Pilsworth starts most chapters with a fine epigraph that introduces the topic for the chapter. Other strengths include: the weight given to the law and the law codes; the variety of materials accessed; the very detailed analysis of certain manuscripts at source; the

number of examples extracted and used to full advantage. The author is to be complimented on her detailed and wide-ranging research in primary and secondary sources, and the innovative approaches to her source data.

The titles of chapters and sections are reasonably self-explanatory. However, Pilsworth addresses each topic via different material and in different ways. No doubt there is no choice about where the information can be located and what and how much information is available. The difficulty with the data may have contributed to a reservation I have about the structure of parts of this otherwise most useful and interesting book. The conclusion to each chapter varies as to quantity and quality. Two examples will illustrate. First, confusingly there is a section called 'Conclusion' some thirty pages into Chapter 3, and another *Conclusion* (this one in italics) eleven pages later. Having said this, I find the lead-in at the beginning of the chapter helps structure the rest of the reading. Second, the conclusion to Chapter 6 covers some six and a half pages. Its complete title is 'Conclusions: The Origins, Training, and Status of "Medici"' and contains information about doctors not covered in the earlier part of Chapter 6. The change to a different format for this 'Conclusion' is confusing. It makes it more difficult to read the book when each chapter has to be approached by the reader slightly differently because the structure differs. There are also a few typos in the index and especially in the Conclusion to the book that perhaps a production process with tight deadlines missed.

Putting these quibbles aside, I am grateful to the author for revealing many things to me. She has presented a detailed and very worthwhile collection of information gleaned from the thorough examination of a number of sources and come to some useful conclusions: that home remedies were probably important but that our data is limited, that the role of the *medicus* was recognized at the time and that, not surprisingly, lotions and potions of herbal origins were a staple part of healing processes. I would have liked tighter integration within the work and/or I needed leading through the material more. Perhaps the data is such that it cannot be integrated better. The author provides clues, nevertheless, in the italic and non-italic sub-headings within the chapters. The index provides a good supplementary method for finding one's way around.

The author states that 'family and friends [...] have lived longest with "the damn book"' (p. xii). It does read in places like the collection of a number of talks or papers given over a long time and gathered together into a book, and Pilsworth has indeed drawn on fine material that she has published elsewhere. Having said that, however, I have no doubt that scholars and students will find that each of those vignettes presents a fascinating facet on 'healthcare' in early medieval Northern Italy.

PENELOPE NASH, *The University of Sydney*

Randall, Catharine, *The Wisdom of Animals: Creatureliness in Early Modern French Spirituality*, Notre Dame, IN, University of Notre Dame Press, 2014; paperback; pp. 192; R.R.P. US\$28.00; ISBN 9780268040352.

Although it acknowledges the arguments of scholars such as Donna Haraway, Erica Fudge, and Diana Donald in favour of a radical re-centring on animals within a new conceptual framework, Catharine Randall's thought-provoking study is fundamentally concerned to analyse how specific early modern authors, predominantly Catholic, understood the relationship of animals to, primarily theological, authority.

Each chapter focuses on a particular author, or set of debates about animals in sixteenth- to eighteenth-century France. Randall first explores the views of Michel de Montaigne, who drew upon proto-scientific observations to suggest that animals were, on some occasions, morally superior to humans. In a more literary reading, Randall argues that this positive appreciation of animals' wisdom and creativity extended to their constructions, most notably the nesting behaviours of swallows, that in many ways paired with Montaigne's own knowledge and textual structuring. By contrast, Calvinist Guillaume du Bartas considered animals within the framework of a kind of early modern conceptualization of 'dominion theory,' in which the loss of the wonder and beauty of fallen nature only served to echo the paucity of post-lapsarian human experience. As the lone Protestant author in the text, it might have been productive to compare Du Bartas's thought in more depth with that of contemporaries such as fellow Protestant Bernard Palissy, for example, for all his idiosyncrasies. For both Montaigne and du Bartas, Randall contends, animals were 'vehicles for knowing' (p. 11), principally for knowing where and how humans fit in God's hierarchy for the natural world.

With the seventeenth-century Catholic Reformation came the development of new genres such as the devotional manual in which the nature and places of animals could be considered in relation to humans. François de Sales interpreted animals as intimate others whose alterity provided human readers with valuable lessons. Animals were instrumentalized to help humans on their path towards God. Randall thus suggests that this para-ecclesiastical genre opened up key possibilities for exploration of new ideas within Catholicism about animals as 'vehicles for *our* knowing' (p. 12). Two authors who attempted to skirt condemnation for their provocative contributions were Jean de La Fontaine, who addressed his ideas as musings to Madame de la Sablière, and Jesuit Guillaume-Hyacinthe Bougeant putatively to a young lady. However, Bougeant's *Amusement philosophique sur le langage des bêtes* (1730), which considered whether animals had not only language but even souls (specifically, those of devils), was less successful in this strategy; he was condemned for heresy, exiled and forced to publish a retraction. In that sense, Randall's suggestion in the conclusion that had Bougeant composed his

thoughts in the devotional genre he might have been protected (p. 134) seems to run counter to her argument in this chapter about the shocking theological novelty of his thought.

This short work raises many questions and is at times a little uneven in its analysis. Was there something specific about the French intellectual or religious traditions that made animals a particular source of interest? Indeed, how widespread was an interest in animals in the terms analysed here? Certainly, others in France, women and men, were thinking through the value of animals as exemplars and tools for thinking. Were the authors studied representative or unique in their conceptualizations?

Randall argues that many of these authors' ideas were framed using 'sensory, often synesthetic referents' (p. 9) in a world spiritualizing the senses after Trent and the Wars of Religion. The ways in which the corpus 'synesthetically evokes animal existence' (p. 13) are at times a little hard to grasp; in practice, it seems to mostly entail the senses of sight and sound. One might also add that emotions appear present for some authors as a conduit to understanding animal-human relations. Both de Sales and Bougeant appear to explicitly foreground comprehension through the emotions for their intended female readerships.

At times, it seems unclear who comprises the author's 'we', as it seems to slip between Christians, scholars, animal rights activists, and humans at various points. Modern animal ethicists and theologians such as Peter Singer, Stephen Budiansky, and Andrew Linzey are situated both as frameworks for, and interlocutors in, the text, quoted alongside early modern authors at the beginning of chapters. Terms such as 'man' and 'humanity' are used, seemingly interchangeably. The authors selected for study here may all be men, but men were not the only authors interested in animals and some of these authors addressed their works specifically to women or anticipated a female readership for their works. How gendered identities of humans and animals were conceptualized in these works would be yet another perspective that would be intriguing to explore as a result of Catharine Randall's compact and stimulating book.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

Slater, John, Maríaluz López-Terrada, and José Pardo-Tomás, eds, *Medical Cultures of the Early Modern Spanish Empire* (New Hispanisms: Cultural and Literary Studies), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 326; 9 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781472428134.

Whilst there was some consistency of structural authority, stemming from the King, the Spanish Empire was by no means hegemonic. Medicine was ostensibly ordered from the centre, but in reality, local custom and negotiation with different authorities resulted in a medical hierarchy which was the

product of negotiation rather than regal edict. It is against this background that this collection of essays explores medical cultures of the Empire in the early-modern period.

The volume does not cover the whole geographic span of the early modern Spanish Empire; furthermore, the essays cover mostly the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. However, a significant point about this book, set out in the introduction, is that ‘readers may be surprised to find that academic medicine is not the predominant voice in this volume’ (p. 7); rather, the contributors have drawn on a diversity of interdisciplinary sources not normally encountered in a work of this genre, in order to shed light on medical *cultures*.

Part One comprises three chapters which are concerned with ‘New Spain’, the Americas. Angélica Morales Sarabia focuses on the use of peyote and other hallucinogenic herbs, which, perhaps inevitably, became associated with witchcraft, causing offence to Spanish religious authorities. José Pardo-Tomás is concerned with native mortality as recorded in a collection of texts from the middle of the sixteenth century collectively known as *Relaciones geográficas de Indias*. They comprised the responses gathered in Mexico to a standard questionnaire developed to provide detailed information on the conquered territories. The data included demography and the nature of diseases which affected the inhabitants, and the remedies they employed (p. 43). Ralph Bauer aligns the well-known *materia medica* of physician and natural historian Nicolás Monardes with Renaissance alchemy.

In Part Two, the source material is letters, which as Mauricio Sánchez-Menchero points out, give an intimacy which official documents do not (p. 93). He is concerned with transatlantic correspondence. Letters ‘help us assess medical phenomena related to three concepts: distance, scale and novelty’ (p. 92). The first section considers the hazards of the journey from Spain to New Spain (Mexico). In addition to the prospect of disease during the transatlantic crossing, there was the impact of illness encountered on landing and travelling inland. He then turns to the paucity of medical help available from physicians, surgeons and apothecaries, once travellers had reached their destination. Practitioners from the Old World relied on the same Galenic methods they took with them, and which migrants would have expected to be employed. This chapter then turns to the matter of epidemics, which affected the indigenous population more than the Spanish. M. A. Katritzky focuses on the hypertrichosis, excessive hair growth, which affected Pedro Gonzales, ‘The Wild Man of Tenerife’. The condition of Gonzales, who was born in the Canaries, also occurred in his children and grandchildren. Like the satyrs of the classical world and the medieval tradition of wild men, the Gonzales family belonged to the class of ‘marvellous races’ (p. 115), and was moved around various courts of Europe. Elisa Andretta’s contribution is based on the time spent by the humanist and historian Juan Páez de Castro

in Trent and Rome and in particular his 1545–52 correspondence with historian Jerónimo Zurita. Both subsequently returned to Spain to occupy significant court positions. Whilst neither was medically trained, both took an active interest in medicine and natural history, and were in contact with high profile physicians in Italy. The author points out that this resulted in a new medical culture that extended beyond Italy into other parts of the Spanish empire (p. 144).

Part Three explores literary and theatrical influences on Spanish medicine. Enrique García Santo-Tomás examines the place of childbirth in early modern Spanish literature, in particular in the novels of Francesco Santos. María Luz López-Terrada introduces the place of medicine in the theatre. She draws on ‘the theatre of pathology [...] the theatre of therapy [...] and epidemiology’ (p. 187). Tayra M. C. Lanuza-Navarro turns to the occurrence of medical astrology in Spanish theatrical works. On the stage, the boundaries were exploited between academic and popular medicine, both of which engaged in astrology. In the final chapter John Slater draws the reader’s attention to the interchange between medical practitioners and ecclesiastics on the use of chemical medicine as presented on stage.

The book is drawn together in an epilogue by William Eamon. He points out that Spain was different to the rest of Europe, but that Spain also made a difference to the broader scientific revolution that occurred in the Renaissance.

In summary this book encourages readers to explore a wider genre of source materials than is conventionally the case.

ROBERT WESTON, *The University of Western Australia*

Verweij, Sebastiaan, *The Literary Culture of Early Modern Scotland: Manuscript Production and Transmission, 1560–1625*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016; hardback; pp. 336; 6 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9780198757290.

Sebastiaan Verweij introduces his book with William Drummond’s observation, that ‘Brass, Iron and Marble’ will crumble, books merely ‘change Places and Masters’ (p. 2). In seven chapters, Verweij asks questions about the role of manuscripts in the spreading of literary culture; the conditions that allowed the change of ‘Places and Masters’ (especially, where that change occurred, which was not, as in England, the universities, Inns of Court, theatres, and coffee houses); the available modes of publication for Scottish authors; and the importance of Scottish book history for a history of *British* early modern literature and book history (p. 3).

The first three chapters concern writing and manuscript-making at and pertaining to the court of James VI and I. Verweij starts with careful distinctions between material that is ‘courtly’ in style, genre, or trope, and that which

is 'of the court', in conception and provenance traceable to the politically and geographically defined space of the royal household (pp. 26–27). He adds that these distinctions can be fluid, pointing to the evidence (of senior retainers' burgh town houses and estates; of papermakers, bookbinders, printers, scribes) of the 'variedly populated institution, place, and space' of the court of Scotland. Discussion of the bibliographic histories of the works of Alexander Montgomerie, Alexander Hume, and Stewart of Baldynneis further exposes the complexity of courtly circulation and its forms.

This is developed in Chapter 2, on royal holographs and single poems of James VI in the manuscripts of king, servitors, and contemporaries. Verweij draws illuminatingly on references in the Cecil Papers to various versions of a now-lost text by James to highlight the King's attempts to control circulation; and the role, further pursued later in the chapter, played by his household scribes. The gift-culture of this court — pens, paper, ink, and more, such as Lord Ruthven's gift of 'ane letteren' (perhaps not the 'copybook or style-book' Verweij posits, but a lectern, or reading stand?) — is sketched, as is James's 'practice of epistolary exchange' (pp. 70–71).

Verweij's investigation of William Fowler's manuscripts (Chapter 3) contains perceptive work on a textual court community that included men and women (Elizabeth Douglas, Jean Fleming, Mary Beaton) as co-writers and translators, readers and patrons; on the processes of scribal publication in which the courtier-scribe, John Geddie, is the focus, and the ways, such as study of surviving paratextual material associated with Fowler, by which the history of a work can be traced.

In the next two chapters, Verweij pursues manuscript making in the cities, towns, and burghs. The recognition that no local region is like another; that, nonetheless, the civic, courtly, and regional were interdependent, is important, throwing the spotlight on, for instance, the politically edgy writing, fictional and real, of an urban textual community of female stallholders; on the councillors, guildsmen, ministers, and lawyers who were benefactors to town colleges; or the notaries public (priests or secular clerks working in shops, churches, booths), essential to community legal matters but also to various forms of book-making, either for patrons or personal interest. Verweij's study of Glasgow notary, William Hegate, and his linking of George Bannatyne's 'Memoriall Buik' and literary miscellany to similar works across Scotland, are instructive. The detailed investigation and provenance reconstruction of the verse miscellany EUL MS Laing III.44 (Chapter 5) give new prominence to literary and familial interactions of a group of Edinburgh burgesses, the probable compilers, and also provide a rare near-contemporary 'interpretative framework' (p. 173) for Montgomerie's difficult *Cherrie*.

Chapters 6 and 7 examine regional book culture, once again with emphasis on the need for careful and individualized contextualization. Verweij notices books, manuscripts, and library records of noble families (Sinclairs,

Campbells, Gordons, Melvilles); then individual manuscripts from across Scotland, of Margaret Wemyss, Margaret Robertson, the Cathcarts, John Maxwell, and the Maitlands. Verweij studies attentively two verse miscellanies from smaller households for their ‘marks of neighbourhood’ (p. 207) in a separate chapter. That of James Murray of Tibbermuir is found to reflect family textual communities, which are skilfully outlined; that of Margaret Robertson of Lude the musical interests that locate it in an intercultural (Gaelic and Anglo-Scots) zone (p. 231).

Errors, mostly typographical, are few, such as *Eupheus* for *Euphues*, p. 190. Line numbering for the many quotations (for Burel’s ‘discription’, pp. 121–22, or ‘Fresche flureis’, p. 152, for example), and measurements for manuscripts would be useful. The reference (p. 3) to Rickard’s ‘book’ is awry, the title given referring to the article in *Literature Compass*. The rich content, and the fresh connections, skilfully made, make this a landmark study by a ‘maister scholler’.

JANET HADLEY WILLIAMS, *Australian National University*

Williams, Sarah, *Damnably Practises: Witches, Dangerous Women, and Music in Seventeenth-Century English Broadside Ballads*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 240; 9 b/w illustrations, 3 music examples; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472420824.

Historians of gender and witchcraft have long recognized the importance of broadside ballads in disseminating and reinforcing ideas and stereotypes about witches and other so-called transgressive and disorderly women in early modern communities, but little detailed study has been done in this area, no doubt because of the elusive nature of broadside balladry and a deficiency of musicologists amongst early modern historians. As a musicologist of some note, Sarah Williams’s contribution to the field is therefore very welcome. In *Damnably Practises*, she builds upon the work of Amanda Winkler, Frances Dolan, Tessa Watt, Christopher Marsh, and others by applying her extensive knowledge of early modern English broadside ballads and music to demonstrate how witches, scolds, and husband murderers were represented and characterized in broadside ballads and their accompanying music.

Williams is ultimately concerned with the shaping of musical and acoustic stereotypes of female transgression by the London publishers of broadside ballads in the seventeenth century. She provides an excellent overview of the development, printing, promoting, and performance of broadside ballads in early modern England, before focusing on broadside ballads produced in London that deal specifically with witchcraft and female transgression. As broadside ballads were widely circulated as text, and transmitted orally through street and theatre performances, they were indeed an important tool, reflecting and reinforcing female stereotypes, and shaping gender

hierarchies and moral values. Williams considers the ways in which the textual, musical, visual, and performative characteristics of these ballads influenced their reception by early modern audiences and contributed to perceptions of transgressive women in the early modern community. Every aspect of broadside balladry is considered, including the use of fonts in the text, the use and reuse of woodcut imagery to reinforce stereotypes, musical accompaniment and repetition of certain tunes, public display and performance, reception by audiences, and the intersection of broadside balladry and theatre.

There are some problems with Williams's discussion of the cultural and historical context of gender, witchcraft, and female disorder. It is, of course, difficult to come up with new material in this heavily explored area, but Williams's treatment of witchcraft in early modern England is superficial. She draws selectively from secondary sources to demonstrate that pagan rituals and agrarian traditions, ingrained in the English consciousness, contributed to fear of and prejudice against loquacious women in early modern England. While there were certainly remnants of pagan practices and beliefs in early modern witchcraft, her emphasis on witch-cults is misleading, not least because evidence of their existence has been convincingly dismissed by historians. Furthermore, Williams's statement that witchcraft prosecutions increased under James I is mistaken (p. 37), and she conflates the witch hunters of the disruptive Civil War period with King James and the Jacobean period. To advocate her position on gender bias, Williams also neglects to point out the discrepancies between the prevalent depictions of women burned at the stake for witchcraft and domestic crime in broadside ballads and the historical records. Women convicted of witchcraft in early modern England were not burned but hanged, and while it was stated in law that women found guilty of murdering their husbands should be burned at the stake, only a small minority of husband murderers were burned: the majority were hanged, and a small number were pardoned. This discrepancy warrants some discussion, as it surely reveals something significant about the stereotypical depictions of women in the ballads. While there is no doubt that witchcraft was a gendered crime, Williams's argument for gender bias using spurious claims and inadequate discussion detracts from the overall value of her work, as does the misquote from John Boys in the heading for Chapter 4, 'Auditories are like Fairies' (p. 111), which mistakes 'Faires' for 'Fairies'.

Williams's failure to create an accurate historical context for witchcraft beliefs does not detract from her detailed exploration of the ballads and their circulation and reception in early modern England. Her close analysis of specific tunes, texts, and song genres convincingly demonstrates the association of acoustical disorder with female unruliness. She demonstrates how the stigmatization of certain tunes, and the relatively limited number of tunes which were used for broadside ballads associated with dangerous

women, came to be associated with witchcraft and disorderly women. Copies of ballad texts provided in the appendices are particularly valuable here, since they are not readily available elsewhere. Although there is inevitably a high degree of speculation about the reception of broadside ballads by audiences in early modern England, Williams's expertise in music history brings a new and fruitful dimension to the field of gender and performance studies and opens some interesting areas for further investigation.

JUDITH BONZOL, *The University of Sydney*

Zahora, Tomas, *Nature, Virtue, and the Boundaries of Encyclopaedic Knowledge. The Tropological Universe of Alexander Neckam (1157–1217)* (Europa Sacra, 13), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xi, 285; 2 b/w illustrations, 11 b/w tables; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503549583.

Alexander Neckam (1157–1217) occupies a unique position in the history of encyclopaedism, writing at the turn of the thirteenth century when the Aristotelian natural philosophy was still becoming integrated into the Western academic corpus. Despite his importance as a figure in medieval intellectual culture whose influences lasted well into the late fourteenth century, Neckam has not received the full scholarly attention that he deserves. *Nature, Virtue and the Boundaries of Encyclopaedic Knowledge: The Tropological Universe of Alexander Neckam* is a step towards redressing this lack and stimulating future research in Neckam studies.

Tomas Zahora's book provides a comprehensive and up-to-date introduction to Neckam's works in a way that is relevant to scholars from a wide range of disciplinary areas. He begins by differentiating Neckam's attitudes and expectations from those of modern encyclopaedists such as Denis Diderot (Introduction), and later contrasts Neckam's style to thirteenth-century encyclopaedists Vincent of Beauvais and Bartholomaeus Anglicus (Chapter 6). In Chapter 1 Zahora argues that conclusions drawn in historiography to date have been limited in perspective, either focusing predominantly on the prose encyclopaedia *De naturis rerum*, or judging Neckam's achievements in light of the 'scientific' approach of the *physici* and Salernitan Questions. Studies limited in these respects risk overlooking the importance of Neckam's Augustinian outlook, as well as his training in the trivium and twelfth-century exegetical methods. Zahora suggests that we can appreciate Neckam's legacy better if we pay attention to his sophisticated tropological technique, and acknowledge that his primary interest lies in *aedificatio morum* and wisdom through self-knowledge. Emphasis on the tropological method is carried through Chapters 2 to 5, in which Zahora discusses the content of Neckam's works, providing valuable transcriptions and translations of unedited materials. The majority of the discussion concentrates on *De naturis rerum*, *Laus sapientie divinie*, and the *Suppletio*

defectuum, but sections on his *Solatium fidelis anime*, *Commentary on Martianus Cappella*, and Sermon 37 of his unedited sermon collection are included. Discussion extends to Neckam's theological commitments: his stance against Cathar heresies, the Pelagian position on the origin of good works (Neckam holds that dependence on grace is compatible with human freedom), and the Albigensian heresy.

Of particular interest to the present reviewer was the material on Neckam's utilization of classical sources in his little-studied metrical encyclopaedia *Laus sapientie divinie* (Chapter 5), which I believe to be the same work referred to by the fourteenth-century biblical commentator Robert Holcot (rather charmingly) as *Scintillario poetarum*. Note also that Zahora treats some topics with remarkable brevity. For example, on p. 157 Zahora begins to explain the repetition of virtues in *Laus sapientie divinie* as 'an exercise in mores' which works to activate a network of mental images by bringing a concept to mind. Every mention of a virtue 'stimulates the reader's innate mechanism of virtue so that when one internalizes a tropological text one is in fact engaging in a spiritual workout that literally "makes him a better man"'. No further discussion of the psychological structures supporting Neckam's mental gymnasium is offered, raising more questions than are answered. The upside of this is that Zahora's book points the reader towards areas for further research; a fertile field for future possibilities.

CHANTELLE SAVILLE, *University of Auckland*