

## Reviews

**Assonitis**, Alessio, and Brian **Sandberg**, eds, *The Grand Ducal Medici and Their Archive (1537–1543)* (The Medici Archive Project Series, 1), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; cloth; pp. iv, 222; 5 colour, 41 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9781909400344.

**Barker**, Sheila, ed., *Women Artists in Early Modern Italy: Careers, Fame and Collectors* (Medici Archive Project Series, 2), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; cloth; pp. iv, 181; 51 colour, 22 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. € 85.00; ISBN 9781909400351.

These two volumes inaugurate the Medici Archive Project series utilizing the documentary sources, mainly, but not exclusively, of the Grand Ducal Medici Archive, housed in the Florentine State Archive. The series also exploits the material available in the BIA (Building Interactive Archives) database, which is progressively making volumes of Medici correspondence and other Medici documents digitally available at <[www.medic.org](http://www.medic.org)>. The first volume advertises the breadth of riches of the archive by examining a range of topics and individuals, while the second volume demonstrates the depth of the archive by focusing on a single topic, that of women artists. Both volumes are plentifully illustrated, but sadly my copy of Volume 1 had pages incorrectly bound in two chapters (Stoppato, pp. 189–90, and Brownless, pp. 207–08) and they are incomplete. Hopefully, mine is the only copy with this error.

The *Grand Ducal* volume begins with Stefano d'Aglio's chapter on the assassination of Lorenzino de' Medici, the assassin of his cousin, Duke Alessandro de' Medici. This unforeseen event unexpectedly catapulted Cosimo de' Medici to power. D'Aglio argues that contrary to received historical wisdom, King Charles V of Spain, Alessandro's father-in-law, had arranged for Lorenzo's murder rather than Duke Cosimo I. Cosimo's library and early education are the topic of the next chapter, which suggests that the information in his library helped him navigate an increasingly complex and global world (Assonitis). Francesca Funis documents Giorgio Vasari's 'recycling' of older building material into his new architectural projects for Cosimo. Therefore, newer projects are infused with 'hidden' medieval architectural elements. The refusal of a cardinal's hat to enter into an unsuitable marriage by Duchess Eleonora's brother Don Luis of Toledo, a member of the Medici court, is the subject of the next chapter. Cosimo's correspondence with a Portuguese Jewish merchant living in Venice and

the court's positive attitude — for its time — towards Jews, highlight the global nature of the networks and correspondence that the Medici cultivated. The next three chapters deal with the experience of respectively: women in Siena during its war with Florence (Brizio), grand duchesses as medical practitioners (Barker), and Sofonisba Anguissola as a lady-in-waiting and court artist at the Spanish court (Arfaïoli). Apart from Brendan Dooley's chapter on Livia Vernazza's treatment by the Medici because of her unsuitable marriage to Don Giovanni, Cosimo's natural son, and the strategies she used to retain at least some of her possessions, the other chapters focus on broader, global themes. Markey discusses the discovery of the Americas and changing attitudes to its usefulness in the Florentine court from Cosimo's and Eleonora's collecting its new curiosities to Ferdinando's interest in its riches. Cultural exchange between the Medici and Savoy court (Piccinelli), Medici understandings of the Ottoman court as seen through the eyes of a pretender to the Ottoman throne (Rosen), a comparison between the regency governments of Christine de Lorraine in Florence and Maria de' Medici in France and a discussion of the cooperation between the older aunt Christine and her niece Maria (Sandenberg), form the next tranche of studies. Stoppato looks at the use of portraiture as a diplomatic tool in marriage negotiations between the Medici and the Gonzaga. The last two chapters look at diplomatic correspondence from the English court (Kaborycha) and the use of diplomatic newsletters (*avvisi*) to disseminate knowledge to inform the decision making of rulers (Brownless).

The unity of the *Women Artists* volume, with its focus on careers, fame and collectors, enables a more thematic analysis. The experience of a female artist in early modern Italy (and Europe) was decidedly gendered. Female artists were usually trained by their fathers or brothers and sometimes by husbands in family-based workshops (Barker, Stoppato, Modesti). Other women from non-artistic family backgrounds were often noble and painting was a secondary attribute. Their status as noblewomen created opportunities for them to practise their art. Sofonisba Anguissola's role as lady-in-waiting to Elizabeth of Valois at the court of Philip II enabled her to paint (Gamberini). Sofonisba and many other women artists often painted portraits, as this was considered an appropriate art form for them. Their gender enhanced rather than prevented their fame, as Barbara Tramelli's discussion of a young Van Dyck's visit to an elderly Sofonisba for artistic advice suggests. The Medici supported female artists such as Lucrezia Quistelli (Barker), Arcangela Paladini (Stoppato) commissioning individual pieces of work, but it was not until the mid-seventeenth century that the Medici Grandduchess Vittoria delle Rovere appointed a female court artist: Camilla Guerrini Nati (Pflanzer). Artemesia Gentileschi was undoubtedly famous both for her art and for the events surrounding her rape trial. A contemporary painter of candles

for a confraternity frequented by Florentines residing in Rome, Costanza Francini, unusually, for a female painter, of poor origin, was overshadowed by Artemesia. Her life, however, was no less dramatic, as she was accused twice of incest and acquitted. But without noble patrons Francini relied on family during her old age (Vicioso). Collecting the work of female artists was popular, the authors of the last three chapters argue (Modesti, Piccinelli, and Escobedo), including after their deaths. The Medici family was chief among the collectors. This included reigning Medici dukes such as Duke Cosimo III and scions of minor branches of the Medici in the late eighteenth century after the extinction of the main line and the Duchy in 1737 (Modesti). The rarity and quality of female Italian masters made them very popular as collectables in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries and these female artists were certainly not forgotten (Escobedo).

Both volumes contain an abundance of historical riches. They exemplify the potential of what can be learned from the Medici Archive Project and its mining and categorization of the voluminous grand ducal archive. I look forward to future volumes in this series adding to that knowledge.

NATALIE TOMAS, *Monash University*

**Astås**, Reidar, ed., *Stjórn: tekst etter håndskriftene* (Norrøne Tekster, 8), Oslo, Riksarkivet, 2009; hardback; 2 vols, pp. cli, 1324. R.R.P. NOK400.00; ISBN 9788254801086.

During the later Middle Ages a number of Old Testament texts were completely or partially translated from Latin into Old Norse. However, it is unlikely that a complete Norse Bible translation ever existed during the medieval period. The Old Norse texts from the Old Testament have become collectively known as *Stjórn* and are edited in two synoptic volumes by Reidar Astås (d. 2013). Astås devoted his academic career to the study of Church History with a focus on the Old Norse Bible. His main publications include *Et Bibelverk fra middelalderen: studier i Stjórn* (Novus, 1987) and a partial English translation: *An Old Norse Biblical Compilation: Studies in Stjórn* (P. Lang, 1991).

Volume 1 provides a general orientation of the *Stjórn* texts including their content, dating and potential models (pp. xvii–xxxiii). The text has four layers (*Stjórn* I–IV); each differs in terms of source use and the method of compilation (p. xviii). The contents were redrafted or abridged according to the editorial programme of the compiler. The main source for all layers is the Vulgate. *Stjórn* I is the youngest translation of the Bible text Genesis 1.1–Exodus 18.27 and is woven with commentaries, which suggests that the author had access to a fairly extensive library and based the work on historical bibles from Europe (p. xviii). *Stjórn* II contains an abridged version of the Mosaic law while *Stjórn* III is a rendering of the books from Joshua to Kings. *Stjórn* II–III both appear to be expressions of a so-called ‘Dominican project’

in terms of theology and source use (p. xxxii). *Stjórn* IV is a translation of Joshua from Peter Comestor's *Historia Scholastica*.

Astås then provides an overview of the fourteen manuscripts that are used for the edition as well as four additional late medieval manuscript fragments that contain parallel material (pp. liii–lvi). This is followed by a summary of the fourteen early modern manuscripts (c. 1600–1800) that contain *Stjórn* (pp. lvii–lxii) but which were not utilized because they are often based on the medieval manuscript AM 226 fol. and therefore offer little independent text for use in the critical edition (pp. lvii–lviii). Astås then delivers a close examination of the main manuscripts: AM 226, AM 227 fol. (connected to the court of King Hákon Magnusson, d. 1319), AM 228 fol., and AM 229 I fol. The editor also includes an explanatory list of the sources used by the translators/compilers (pp. cxxiii–cxxviii) and a list of further readings (pp. cxxix–cxlvi).

This critical edition is based upon C. R. Unger's version (1853–62), though it does include some additional material. Where Unger used AM 226 fol. and AM 228 fol. as his main sources, Astås also includes AM 227 fol. as the basis for the edition. The principles of translation are clearly presented in the introductory material and the layout of the edited text is reasonably straightforward once the system of markup is understood (p. cxlviii). For example, italics are used for marking suspensions, contractions and truncations, while bold type is used to indicate writing in red in the manuscript. Number references to the Vulgate are also given in bold. In cases where the manuscripts are difficult to read the editor does not infer new readings but instead relies on Unger with supplementary notes. Astås also exercises editorial privilege by selecting when elements like new lines, illustrations, and marginal comments and doodles enlighten the text. The edited text itself is divided between the two volumes. The second half of the first volume includes *Stjórn* I (the prologue, Genesis and Exodus: pp. 1–453), *Stjórn* II (Exodus, Leviticus, Numbers and Deuteronomy: pp. 455–521), and *Stjórn* III and IV (Joshua) are printed in parallel from p. 522 onwards. The second volume is devoted to *Stjórn* III: Judges, Ruth, I Samuel, II Samuel, III Kings and IV Kings. A detailed register (pp. 1231–1324) completes this comprehensive duo.

In the conclusion to the introductory matter, Astås explains that the *Stjórn* texts have a complex history of which we have an inadequate knowledge (p. cxx). These finely produced volumes will surely do much to remedy this lack of understanding. Scholars of Old Norse and medieval Bible studies are certainly indebted to Astås's work in the field.

KIMBERLEY-JOY KNIGHT, *The University of Sydney*

**Balard**, Michel, ed., *The Sea in History: The Medieval World*, Woodbridge, Boydell, 2017; hardback; pp. 1086; 48 b/w, 33 line illustrations; R.R.P. £125.00; ISBN 9781783271597.

This is the second of four massive volumes produced by a French programme — *Océanides*, modestly claiming to be the most significant programme in Social Sciences since the eighteenth century French *Encyclopédie* — that seeks under the general direction of Christian Buchet, director of the *Centre d'études stratégiques de la Marine*, to answer the question of how and in what ways the sea has had an impact on the general evolution of peoples. The general conclusion, presumably for all four volumes and written by Buchet himself, in French and English, goes further, claiming that maritime activities anywhere in any age are 'the single most powerful impetus to create a positive impact on historical trajectories' (p. 102).

Not surprisingly when 260 (72 in this volume) experts in different areas are given a few pages to write about their speciality not all are arguing from the same base. Some have turned Buchet's question on its head by not examining the sea first but rather how it was exploited for internal political struggles and inter-state wars. Nevertheless, most of the articles are worthwhile in themselves and cast some light on one or another aspect of that protean subject, the history of the sea.

Michel Balard in his introduction to this volume offers us, in French and English, a focus on one matter for which the sea was critical, the birth of modern capitalism, which he judges started in the Mediterranean and spread to the rest of the world. This approach explains why the great majority of the entries are concerned with the Mediterranean, four on Venice alone. The studies of the transformation of ship styles, of navigational practices and of maps are tightly focused on particular predominantly European places and times.

What is provided is the important detail of places and practices; what is missing is any systematic attempt to bring together and compare developments in different places which were not in frequent, or perhaps any, contact with one another. One does not, for example, find an explanation for the relative similarity of smaller boats built in different places from different materials. There is no single paper that compares those gripping stories of people who set out onto the unknown in fragile boats and came back with accounts of strange places, even though such tales, some more sophisticated than others, can be found all the way from China, and Xu Jing's *Gaolitjing* analysis of the Korean peninsula, to the Jesuit accounts of South America.

Many readers may find most interesting the minority of accounts that consider the way in which non-European peoples living in other parts of the world went to sea, exploited sea resources and interpreted — some say appropriated — the sea. We are offered an intriguing interpretation of how

the symbolism attributed to the sea, the legends, myths and religious beliefs, affected the world-view of these people. One may hope for more studies in accessible places like that of Jorge Ortiz Sotelo, which provides a summary of the way the people of the Central Andes related to the sea.

Several of the papers offer explanations of when and why some cultures turned their backs on the sea, restricting themselves to fishing and leaving trade to outsiders. The political aspects of this tend to dominate the accounts, particularly where long-term conflict between places like China and Japan are involved. The role the sea played in spreading knowledge and creating a wider sphere of cultural approach is an interesting theme in the papers on the Pacific fringe.

What is surprisingly missing from the coverage is any paper on the thousands of small islands in the Pacific, many inhabited long before the Common Era by Polynesian, Micronesian and Melanesian people who were almost wholly dependent on the sea and who sailed long distances out of sight of land from one island to another. Surely they are critical to our understanding of the role of the sea in human development if we are concerned with more than the development of capitalism?

Another largely unanswered question is whether there were communities that had a long-term existence without any contact with the sea — how did these cultures develop if the sea is an irremovable part of all human culture? One paper by Didier Gazagnadou offers an angle on the landlocked Mongol empire that, he argues, managed with a highly organized and efficient postal service so that a sea-less culture is possible.

*Océanides* should not be satisfied with the research represented in these books but should support further communications that will draw together into a coherent entity the existing but diverse responses to a world-wide phenomenon.

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*

**Black**, Robert, and John E. **Law**, eds, *The Medici: Citizens and Masters*, (Villa I Tatti, 32), Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 2015; paperback; pp. xii, 432; 43 colour plates, 8 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$40, £29.95, €36.00; ISBN 9780674088443.

For historians of fifteenth- and sixteenth-century Florence, the Medici are a persistent conundrum. Their ascent from bankers to grand dukes has fascinated scholars and this interest shows no sign of abating in the future. Above all else, their ability to manipulate and control the city's political system has remained a point of contention for as long as historians have considered the subject.

The primary flashpoint in this debate has been how Cosimo and his successors, chief amongst them Lorenzo 'il *Magnifico*', came to dominate a

city so protective of both its liberty and its republican mores. The collection that is the subject of this review emerged from a late-2011 conference jointly-held at Monash University's Prato Centre and Harvard University's Villa I Tatti, the thematic framework for which, and consequently for this collection, was inspired by the 1960s debate between Nicolai Rubinstein and Phillip Jones over exactly how the period of Medicean ascendancy should be characterized: were they the masters of their city, or merely its most influential citizens? Rubinstein, according to Robert Black's introduction, 'vigorously distinguished the Medici from contemporary Italian despots' (p. 3). For Black, 'the key word to describe early Medicean Florence was oligarchy' (p. 3). Jones, on the other hand, 'wrote about the Medici in terms unthinkable for Rubinstein [that they] were typical examples of despotism' (p. 5).

*Citizens and Masters* is divided into four sections. The first, 'Power and Legitimacy', contains eight essays. The second ('Economic Policy') and third ('Religion and the Church') are far shorter, comprised of just two and three chapters, respectively. The final section, 'The Medici and their Image', is the longest with nine.

Giorgio Chittolini begins by examining the concept of *civitas* and its impact on how the Florentines (amongst others) saw themselves. Gian Maria Varanini looks at the extension of Medicean power into those cities and towns that fell under Florentine control. Andrea Zorzi measures the extent to which we might indeed label Florence a *signoria* rather than a republic, whilst Melissa Meriam Bullard introduces us to her 'rhetorical republic' (p. 53), highlighting the multivalent nature of a polis that, depending on the perspective one adopts, never appeared quite the same. Riccardo Fubini's detailed essay points out the narrowing of the political process under Lorenzo 'il Magnifico'. Jane Black draws a comparison between the Medici and the Sforza, concluding that it was the Medici who 'reaped the benefit' (p. 98) of Florentine success by dominating its (relatively) stable political networks. Marco Gentile draws our attention to the 'real differences of social and political structures between Lombardy and Tuscany' (p. 110), whilst Alison Brown rounds off the first section with an examination of the fleeting period Lorenzo's son, Piero, spent as the 'de facto head of a republican regime' (p. 113).

The two essays in the second section, by Franco Franceschi and Lorenz Böniger, respectively, deal with the Medici and their role in the formulation of Florentine economic policy, as well as Lorenzo's influence over urban immigration. David Peterson, whose essay opens the third section, suggests that 'Medici patronage of the church aimed more narrowly at legitimizing their regime and, particularly, their position as its leaders' (p. 186). Paolo Orvieto's essay looks at the relationship between religious literature and political power in Medicean Florence, whilst David Chambers concludes that

the family's persistent manoeuvring to obtain a cardinal's hat does in fact 'seem to reflect the princely, if not necessarily despotic, pretensions of the family' (p. 217).

Dale Kent opens the final section with an examination of the authority of Cosimo, a subject on which she has long been an authority herself. Francesco Bausi follows up with a discussion of the literary representation of the family as defenders of Florentine *libertas*, whilst the next essay by Paolo Ventrone explores the projection of Medicean image using ceremony and spectacle. Blake Wilson's contribution discusses the family's musical patronage. The next essay by Stephen Milner adopts an interesting and unique approach to the central question that guides the collection; rather than seek an answer he aims to 'chart its genealogy and to place it within the controversial framework of rhetorical argumentation' (p. 282). Alison Wright follows with an examination of Lorenzo's appropriation and use of princely imagery, whilst Amanda Lillie explores Medicean (and Pazzi) use of castellation in the architecture of their country residences. The final two chapters, by John Najemy and Carolyn James, respectively, employ a comparative framework; Najemy by looking at Cosimo and Francesco Sforza as both were represented in Machiavelli's *Florentine Histories*, and James through the differing approaches to marriage adopted by Lorenzo and Ercole d'Este, the duke of Ferrara.

Obviously, a review of this length cannot do justice to twenty-two excellent essays. As a historian interested in religion and its cultural manifestations, I naturally found the third and fourth sections most compelling. However, I would not wish to convey the notion that I found nothing of value in the others. Certainly, I agree wholeheartedly with Black's assertion that 'the controversy is just as much alive today as it was in the second half of the last century' (p. 10). This excellent collection proves that point beyond doubt. In the end the essays brought together here are a rich addition to the historiography, and either as a whole or essay by essay any subsequent reading will no doubt prove to be a rewarding exercise.

LUKE BANCROFT, *Monash University*

**Buchet, Christian, and Gérard Le Bouëdec, eds, *The Sea in History: The Early Modern World*, Woodbridge Boydell, 2017; hardback; pp. 1072; 22 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £125.00; ISBN 9781783271580.**

Editors Christian Buchet and Gérard Le Bouëdec introduce an encyclopedic anthology researching the role of the sea in the early modern period. The seventy-five essays collected in both French and English cover every aspect of maritime activity. With the reviewer not being French-literate, only the thirty-three most notable English contributions will be selected from.

David Hancock examines how Atlantic trading encouraged technological innovation. From the fifteenth to eighteenth centuries, maritime traders

established a global network that unified an oceanic marketplace. Leos Müller attributes rapid early modern trading expansion to the invention of the sailing ship. By studying Scandinavian fleets, Müller argues that shipping grew without the need for technical advancement. Klaus Weber analyses the development of Central Europe through trade. Linen was initially an important export in exchange for African gold. Weber finds in this trading pattern an expansion to metal ware that led to importing sugar, indigo, cotton and coffee.

Om Prakash investigates how Indian commerce was able to adapt and flourish despite early modern colonial control. India's ability to manufacture large amounts of textiles made it an influential trader in the Indian Ocean. Anthony Reid examines how the early modern global expansion in trade relied on interacting with Southeast Asia. He also uncovers hybrid shipbuilding techniques mixing North China and Southeast Asia technologies to compete with Portuguese naval warfare.

Amélia Polónia challenges the popular notion that European seaports are simply economic hubs. She argues convincingly that these seaports were also important political, administrative redistribution centres. Filipa Ribeiro da Silva examines how African ports flourished beyond a trade in gold, ivory and slave labour. The needs of a growing merchant population and an African elite created a fascinating variety in imports and exports.

David J. Starkey's informative essay investigates early modern fisheries. Inês Amorim examines the importance of the early modern trade in salt, known as white gold. International rivalry and exploitation of global salt mines helped establish international trade routes. However, Amorim shows how stockpiling, trade embargoes, and increasing interest in sugar impacted the salt trade. David Eltis analyses how the slave trade affected sugar prices. In an interesting observation, he notes that both European buyers and African sellers viewed the slaves as outsiders to their societies. Eltis argues that on the African coast, there was no notion of a national identity.

Michael Kwass makes notable observations on the rising popularity of tobacco in early modern trading. Not only is it addictive, but tobacco was also viewed as a healthy social product. Maxine Berg investigates how the Asia–Europe trade transformed European culture. Of particular interest, tea drinking became so embedded in European aristocratic society that it lost its Chinese identity. Sheryllynne Haggerty argues for the important recognition of 'sea dogs' for Britain's commercial expansion in Atlantic trade. She claims that early modern Britain's trading and military activity in Ireland provided justification for colonial expansion.

An excellent group of contributions argues how constructing a navy transformed countries and led technological innovations. The Russian navy established Russia's global maritime trade routes. Whenever the Russian navy declined, it was always resurrected in times of need. Dock construction

transformed the Indian kingdom of Maratha by creating innovations in engineering. The British government turned to the Royal Navy in order to revolutionize their bureaucratic departments. Breakthroughs in ocean navigation led to the building of observatories and influenced the Scientific Revolution. Increasing use of maritime routes led to the spread of disease. On-board practitioners were the leaders in medical breakthroughs, particularly in tropical medicine.

Jelle Van Lottum examines how the changing market in the Dutch maritime industry led to a demand for foreign workers. Daniel Baugh investigates the professionalization of the seventeenth-century English navy. These innovations in standards of conduct led to the English navy being the world leader in effectiveness and efficiency. The most exciting essay is Richard Harding's examination of British landing operations. Beginning with describing a dramatic military coup, Harding considers the strategies that make a successful landing operation. The editors' conclusion and especially their general conclusion construct a cohesive narrative summary from all the contributions collected.

*The Sea in History* is an exhaustive volume covering every conceivable topic connected to the early modern sea. Some of the contributions are short and condense long time periods into generic snapshots. However, many are groundbreaking and would benefit from being book-length studies, showing especially how maritime activity necessitated world-changing innovations. The volume is indispensable to anyone interested in early modern maritime history.

FRANK SWANNACK, *University of Salford*

**Cerasano, S. P., and Steven W. May, eds, *In the Prayse of Writing: Early Modern Manuscript Studies*, London, British Library Publishing, 2012; hardback; pp. 320; 50 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £50.00; ISBN 9780712358576.**

This volume contains fourteen essays on subjects relating to early modern manuscripts, composed in honour of Dr Peter Beal, a driving force behind the *English Manuscript Studies 1100–1700* journal, the online *Catalogue of English Literary Manuscripts 1450–1700*, and *A Dictionary of English Manuscript Terminology: 1450 to 2000* (Oxford University Press, 2009). For the most part, the manuscripts discussed in the volume are early modern, in English, and found in either British or American collections. However, the collection reflects the wide-ranging nature of Beal's interests. The manuscripts discussed are connected to a range of traditional literary figures such as Sir Philip Sidney, Lord Henry Howard, Earl of Surrey, John Lane and Milton, as well as female writers including Margaret, Countess of Cumberland, and Anna Cromwell Williams. The essays themselves examine many different

physical elements of the manuscripts as well as a variety of methodological approaches to manuscript studies and different genres including poetry, theatre, correspondence, and notebooks.

The diversity of essays, while making for an eclectic collection, adds value to the volume as a whole. The essays are short and focused, enabling the volume to expose the reader to a wide array of possible approaches to studying manuscripts. Nevertheless, the submissions can be loosely grouped according to their contributions to the following generalized themes.

Boffey, Edwards, Cerasano, Kelliher, and Ezell use close textual analysis of original text, modifications, marginalia and shorthand to great effect and their findings demonstrate the diverse outcomes that these techniques offer. These essays successfully engage with questions surrounding the manuscript author's decision to use the vernacular over Latin, the traditional assumption that the oldest surviving version of a text is necessarily the most accurate (for a contained example see pp. 32–33), the recovery of the historical value of manuscripts tainted by known fraudulent alterations, and our biographical understanding of related figures, and their intentions for the volume they have produced.

Pitcher, Ioppolo, Wolfe, and Nelson broaden the focus by also considering the manuscripts themselves as material objects whose production, collection, and provenance provide significant historical insight through understanding of the non-textual codes of their production. These essays combine textual analysis with considerations of scribal production techniques and the fates of early modern manuscript collections with great effect. This group of essays challenges accepted attributions (pp. 114–15) and shows how additional insight can be gained by considering the life of a collection as a whole. Wolfe's intriguing investigation into the choices made when deciding how to seal a letter conveyed both emotion and intent to the recipient. Overall, these contributions demonstrate the importance of a holistic approach to manuscript studies.

Woudhuysen, Hammer, Duncan-Jones, May, and Marotti explore the genres of manuscript anthologies, notebooks, annotations and autograph poetry. Hammer shows how such ephemeral material, when it does survive, can provide a relatively rare and valuable opportunity to glimpse the political machinations and intrigues that accompanied events of this nature from a first-person perspective. These essays also introduce the reader to several of the new texts and variations contained in the manuscripts discussed. They explore how the shape and nature of such collections reflect the interests and opinions of the collectors themselves and examine both cultural and stylistic trends reflected in the volumes.

Given the diverse array of topics and collections explored in the volume, some attempt at grouping essays together in some way would have made it easier to identify the general themes of the work. Having this level of

focus would have, in turn, helped ameliorate the mildly disruptive sense of swapping back and forth between genres and methodologies that one experiences when reading through.

Nevertheless, the volume is a valuable read for anyone who uses manuscripts in their work, be they early modern British manuscripts or otherwise. The volume offers its readers, whether new to the field or well-experienced, a rich tapestry of techniques and questions that one can apply in different combinations to engage with manuscript sources in innovative and nuanced ways.

JULIE DAVIES, *The University of Melbourne*

**Davis-Secord**, Jonathan, *Joinings: Compound Words in Old English Literature* (Toronto Anglo-Saxon Series, 20), Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2016; cloth; pp. xi, 245, R.R.P. US\$65.00; ISBN 978144263799.

Old English compound words have long been the focus of both linguistic and literary-stylistic study, but in this book Davis-Secord brings to bear new and promising modes of analysis in a wide-ranging and provocative discussion. Key to the approach is the view that compounds are central to understanding the intersection of grammar, style, and culture in Anglo-Saxon literary tradition.

‘As the joining of two words, each compound involves fundamental processes of grammar and semantics, while simultaneously forming an essential stylistic feature of Old English literature that produces meanings in culturally specific ways. No other Old English linguistic feature bridges the supposed divides between basic word formation, rhetorical traditions, and cultural practices’ (p. 4). In his introductory chapter Davis-Secord confronts the problem that we have no direct expression of an Anglo-Saxon theory of vernacular language and literature. He suggests that we can compensate for this gap by examining the Latin grammatical tradition in Anglo-Saxon England, and — more problematically — the rather later Old Norse treatises on grammar and poetics, which, it is claimed, are rooted in earlier traditions transmitted to and known in tenth-century England. We move back to firmer ground with the introductory outline of psycholinguistic and cognitive approaches to the mental processing of compounds. The focus upward to stylistic and cultural issues which this cognitive process entails (of a kind specific to compounds, as opposed to monemes on the one hand and larger syntactic structures on the other) is then examined through the lenses of ‘Oral Theory, historical inquiry, Jakobsonian theory of linguistic functions, theories of Old English metre, translation theory, Bakhtinian genre theory, modern rhetorical theories, and even film theory’ (p. 29). Underpinning the psycholinguistic evidence is that to be derived from the metrical patterns of Old English poetry that indicates the distinct status of compound forms.

For some readers, it may be that Davis-Secord takes too much within his grasp, but if there are gaps and under-studied areas in the book, these are compensated for by fresh and insightful readings of the texts focused upon.

Chapter 2 examines compounds as translation tools through usage in the Alfredian *Boethius* and the Cynewulfian poems *Juliana* and *Elene*. In the use of compounds like *anweald* for Latin *potestas* and *potentia* Alfred reveals his concern to adapt his source for his audience's expectations and world-view. Given Davis-Secord's focus on a small number of illustrative examples, one might probe the evidence further. On the one hand, the orthographically predominant form *anwald* in the text seems a deliberate marking of the word as one of the 'waldend' group (originally identified by E. G. Stanley), where the broken form — *weald* — is the expected one in West Saxon. Furthermore the spelling of the first element as *an-* seems to emphasize its full status as an initial-stressed compound, where scribal spellings as *onwald*/*onweald* in other texts of this widely-attested word suggest that the vowel of the first element was often shortened and nasalized, perhaps disqualifying it as a compound, were it not for Alfred's or his scribes' emphatic spelling. Davis-Secord interestingly continues, demonstrating how compounds in Cynewulf's *Juliana* are markedly prosaic, and underscore a very different approach to the authority and cultural capital of the underlying Latin source. These two texts are further explored in Chapter 4, where Bakhtinian speech genres and the registers of Oral Theory are the primary tools of analysis, supplemented by the methodologies developed by Michael Drouot in his *Tradition and Influence in Anglo-Saxon Literature* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2013). Chapter 3, 'Compound Interest', in the meantime provides stimulating discussion of compounding in *Beowulf*, *The Wanderer*, and *The Seafarer* for the purposes of narrative retardation and foregrounding of key thematic concerns: respectively weapons, the enclosing mind, and the sea-journey. The use of this technique in Wulfstan's prose rounds off the discussion. In the succeeding chapters 5 and 6, the role of compounds in the control of pace is explored first in Wulfstan's homilies, then in *Beowulf*, where Davis-Secord's excursus into the analogies between retardation through compounding in the poem and the slow-motion effects employed in the cinematography of Sam Peckinpah's movies and *The Matrix* (whose directors, the Wachowskis, oddly, are anonymized) certainly breaks new ground.

With psycholinguistics and cognitive science advancing as rapidly as they are, this study presents a preliminary foray into the field and its applicability to the study of Old English literature, with the promise of much yet to be discovered.

GREG WAITE, *University of Otago*

**Dzon**, Mary, *The Quest for the Christ Child in the Later Middle Ages* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2017; cloth; pp. 424; 24 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £56.00; ISBN 9780812248845.

The object of this study is 'the medieval reception of the apocryphal Christ Child and the relationship of the apocryphal legends to other roughly contemporary sources' (p. 21). Its objective, on the other hand, is 'to provide a broad conceptual and categorical map' which can serve as 'a wide-ranging yet focused picture that will help frame future studies' (p. 21). With 251 pages of discussion, and a good 137 pages devoted to endnotes and sources, it is literally a rather weighty guidebook into the territory Mary Dzon traverses. Fortunately, through a lengthy introduction, and three substantive chapters, Dzon covers a lot of relatively under-trodden ground, making this a useful exposition that will be of great interest to those interested in the same historical and theological terrain.

Most of Dzon's book is about textual relationships. After introducing her themes in the first chapter, and the historiographical positioning of her work, in the second chapter Dzon focuses on monastic and mendicant traditions. Opening this section by comparing Aelred of Rievaulx's *De Jesu puero duodenni* with the apocryphal *Infancy Gospel of Thomas*, Dzon argues that an antique tendency to focus on displays of impressive power in Jesus's childhood gave way to a medieval attraction to the everyday elements of Jesus's infancy. The Christ Child, she argues, became a contemplative focal device, particularly in the Cistercian tradition, geared towards encouraging a certain longing for Christ. Dzon touches on connections between the Christ Child and the Eucharist, the rhetorical and imaginative elements of Aelred's approach to the Christ Child, and various Christological issues. Later in the chapter, but picking up some of these same themes, Dzon considers the more performative approaches to the Christ Child in the early Franciscan tradition, including Francis's Nativity at Greccio. Arguing that Francis's search for Christ-like poverty and humility is expressed in the Nativity as well as the Passion, Dzon highlights Francis's focus on a 'continuum, which is accessible to Christians, in various times and places, in a special way through the Eucharist' (p. 77). In both traditions, the apocryphal stories seem to have had a diminished role in informing these writers, even while there are hints of their continued familiarity with the tradition within their writing.

In her third chapter Dzon tackles Thomas Aquinas's treatment of the Christ Child. Noting Aquinas's explicit rejection of the apocryphal stories, Dzon uses his thinking as a structure with which to explore a series of wider discussions about the apocryphal infancy narrative traditions, the paradoxicality of the Incarnate God, and representations of Christ's youth and expressions of anti-Judaism. A wide-ranging section with several

meanders, this part of the guidebook, for example, turns to discuss the role of phantasms in medieval culture and digresses on such cultural waypoints as Merlin's youth and the metaphysics of demonic insemination. Ultimately, Dzon suggests that Aquinas's insistence on the fullness of the humanity of Jesus was paramount in informing his rejection of the veracity and usefulness of the apocryphal infancy traditions, seeing them as a potentially heresy-encouraging distraction.

In the last substantive chapter Dzon looked to a feminine and maternal perspective of the Christ Child, through the lens of the *Revelationes* of Birgitta of Sweden. Continuing her approach of using devotional, theological, and spiritual literature to explore medieval receptions of apocryphal stories, Dzon argues 'that the Swedish saint was aware of apocryphal infancy legends about the birth and childhood of Christ, even though she never explicitly mentions them' (p. 192). As with the previous chapter, this section covers a range of cultural tangents that may interest readers, particularly the influence that Birgitta may have had on Margery Kempe's understandings of the Nativity. Dzon also points to Franciscan influences on Birgitta, and Birgitta's own spiritual musings that seem to derive from wider concerns about the papacy. It is typical of the author's approach to look for multi-directional textual influences. Finally, Dzon moves towards her conclusion in a fitting manner by focusing on the materiality of Christ's clothing, connecting the Virgin Mary with the Christ Child and the crucified Christ, returning to some of her opening themes.

With useful and interesting illustrations to complement a wide-ranging discussion, Dzon offers a volume that will guide and influence future studies into medieval European understandings of and approaches to the Christ Child, both apocryphal and historical.

NICHOLAS D. BRODIE, *Hobart, Tasmania*

**Elmer, Peter**, *Witchcraft, Witch-Hunting, and Politics in Early Modern England*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016; cloth; pp. x, 369; R.R.P. £65.00, ISBN 9780198717720.

New evidence, continuing the formidable research of Stuart Clark, Ian Bostridge, and Jonathan Berry, places Peter Elmer deservedly in this seminal company. Elmer's 'product of over twenty years' labour' bears its significance through conclusions as a result of investigation into 'local and national' archives to redefine witchcraft, and its political persecutions — before, during, and post-Reformation — in England. Elmer sees witchcraft in 'two seemingly contradictory ways' in its 'integrative or consensual' role, while simultaneously acting as a 'subversive force encouraging criticism of those holding the reins of power' (p. 7). This volume, highlighting monarchs, politicians, and clergy, often includes half-page footnotes indicating further

mines of historical evidence. The anti-Catholic tone of Elizabeth I (in contrast to Mary), and the establishment of the Church of England, is accompanied by the archived machinations of key-figures and co-conspirators within and between the deftly researched sects of Baptists, Quakers, Puritans, and each other, which feature more prevalently than ‘alchemy, sorcery, and witchcraft’ ever did in contrast (p. 29). Foreshadowing what could be seen today as hypocritical evangelism, Elmer analyses early Baptists and Quakers to indicate how ‘Early Friends were often charged with using a variety of diabolical practices to ensnare new recruits’ and how ‘their quaking fits readily reconstructed within conventional demonological lore’ (p. 141). This is not to suggest that early witch hunts fail to feature here, or the larger hunts of the late 1640s and 1650s during Elmer’s focus on this ‘Age of Political Uncertainty’. Yet Elmer suggests the ‘urge to persecute witches’ would often indicate those seeking to ‘acquire status and legitimacy in the hanged circumstances of the interregnum’ (p. 142). Elmer’s analysis confirms Reginald Scot’s ‘target’ as being ‘puritan ministers who [...] threatened social, religious, and political anarchy in Church and commonwealth, and not the gentry who misguidedly supported them’ (p. 220). This is introduced throughout his assessment of Elizabethan and Jacobean England, and here Elmer notes that ‘rebellion is as the sin of Witchcraft’ (p. 242). Noting ‘the tendency of loyal Anglicans to view opposition to Church and state as a species of witchcraft and offenders as what [he] term[s] surrogate witches’, Elmer provides an elegant metaphor readily suitable for a variety of interdisciplinary contextualizations. No less than Shakespeare’s worlds of ghosts and spirits centuries earlier, Elmer’s ‘last witchfinders’ of the late seventeenth- and early eighteenth-century England did not suffer from a ‘decline in belief in the reality of witchcraft’ despite the disappearance of witch trials, and the arrival of medicine contributions and madness. Elmer notes ‘godly judge’ Sir Matthew Hale (1609–1676) possessed ‘an avid interest in experimental science with a deep-seated belief in spirits and witches’, and indicates Hale’s ‘remarkably moderate approach [...] arguing that conduct rather than dogma should form the core of a godly church settlement’ (p. 227). In this sense Hale could have inspired the character Reverend John Hale in Arthur Miller’s *The Crucible*, and his complex pursuit of justice in the Puritan colony of Salem, Massachusetts. Guided by those before him, Elmer provides flesh on the skeleton of significant research through insights as they apply not only to witchcraft in early modern England, but to the various contemporary ‘other’ manifesting throughout global phenomenology and material culture today.

JEWELL HOMAD JOHNSON, *The University of Sydney*

**Enders**, Jody, ed. and trans., *Holy Deadlock and Further Ribaldries: Another Dozen Medieval French Plays in Modern English* (Middle English), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2017; cloth; pp. x, 542; 12 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £56.00; ISBN 9780812248746.

Six years ago, Jody Enders published *The Farce of the Fart' and Other Ribaldries: Twelve Medieval French Plays in Modern English* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011). This was the first of three projected editions of fifteenth- and sixteenth-century French farces, each anthology containing plays revolving around a similar subject-matter. *Holy Deadlock* (Volume 2 as it were), as the pun in the title implies, focuses on marriage, for this topic is, Enders declares, a 'cultural obsession' (p. 3). More pointedly than this, however, 'farce was preoccupied with rendering unsacrosanct the sanctity of marriage and the family' (p. 3). The author's contention is vividly illustrated by the twelve plays found in this volume, rigorously selected as they were from over two hundred extant texts. It is clear that the choice of which comedies to include was given a great deal of thought, as was the actual structuring of the material. After considering 'such options as the original order of appearance in the *Recueils* or the date of publication', Enders eventually opts for 'a kind of chronology of marriage itself' (p. 27). In this way, the structure of the anthology is made to mirror its content.

*Holy Deadlock* goes a long way towards helping the reader to understand the centrality of marriage and the popular preoccupation with 'the battle of the sexes' in medieval France, and the variety of ways in which these topics were portrayed on the stage. Indeed, Enders displays a keen awareness of the three-dimensionality of play texts, and she asks the kinds of questions about her material that any director or actor would when approaching it. Where, for example, does the action of each farce take place? What specific props, costumes, and music are needed to lift these stories from the page to the stage? Music in particular looms large in Enders's thinking, and she makes 'a large number of time-sensitive suggestions regarding post medieval songs' (p. 428) that might be suitable to particular farces, a genre in which much singing and dancing is to be found. This in turn is related to the author's larger goals: to persuade her readers of the contemporary relevance of these plays and their potential to be successfully and imaginatively performed on the modern stage. Enders's idea of relevance is, however, perhaps a little too exclusive. When speaking specifically about her feminist approach to translation, for example, the author states that she desires 'to import or hand over (*traduire*) a fifteenth- or sixteenth-century French universe to a contemporary American one' (p. 20). This begs a very big question: where does this leave readers living outside of the United States and, as a consequence, possibly unfamiliar with the legions of references in this volume to American music (Broadway in particular), films, commercials and television shows? One does not expect

to have to take a crash course in American culture in order to understand a collection of medieval French farces in English.

Returning to the plus points of *Holy Deadlock*, of which there are many, it should be said that the volume, like *The Farce of the Fart* before it, is extremely user-friendly (though its sheer size would make it difficult for the collection to be used by actors in rehearsals for a production). The brief plot summaries provided for all twelve of the texts found in the anthology are very helpful, including as they do remarks on how 'stageable' these plays were (and are), as well as indications of the number of actors needed for each farce. It is music to any theatre-practitioner's ears that not one of these comedies requires more than six actors to perform. The small cast numbers (several of the plays contain just two characters), along with minimal costumes and props, show just how portable these farces are and how readily accessible they were, and remain, to a wide variety of audiences. In this way, along with the impressive historical and theoretical reflections contained in this volume, Enders's work on medieval French farce makes an important contribution to the burgeoning field of spectatorship in the theatre of the Middle Ages.

JO GEORGE, *University of Dundee, Scotland*

**Fernández Cuesta**, Julia and Sara **Pons-Sanz**, eds, *The Old English Gloss to the Lindisfarne Gospels: Language, Author and Context* (Anglia Book Series, 51), Berlin, De Gruyter, 2016; cloth; pp. xii, 432, R.R.P. €99.95, US\$140.00, £74.99; ISBN 9783110449105.

This volume contains papers from a 2012 workshop on the Lindisfarne gloss held at the University of Westminster, with the addition of others. The aim is to gather different perspectives (palaeography, glossography, history, linguistics, and philology) to understand better 'the socio-historical context and the cultural and intellectual milieu in which [the gloss] was produced' (p. 1). The Old English (OE) continuous interlinear gloss inserted into the Lindisfarne Gospels by Aldred in the later tenth century, as an act of reverence and devotion, has long attracted the attention of historical linguists and those studying the book's cultural history. It provides key evidence for the Northumbrian dialect of OE, in an era when literary production was dominated by the West Saxon standardized written dialect exemplified in the works of Ælfric, Wulfstan, and others trained in the monastic reform era.

In Part I, 'The Gloss in Context', five papers address wider cultural and historical issues. Michelle Brown further develops ideas advanced in her earlier study *The Lindisfarne Gospels: Society, Spirituality and the Scribe* (British Library, 2003), arguing that Aldred's gloss must be understood against a background of Anglo-Scandinavian political relations, where it was necessary to assert 'Englishness' and Christian character in the North. Jane Roberts investigates Aldred's colophon, and its evidence for the Gospels' origin at Lindisfarne,

revisiting her hypothesis that a vernacular poem served as a source of evidence for Aldred's claims. She also considers points of comparison and contrast between Aldred's glosses to the Gospels, and the Durham Collectar. Philip Rusche's examination of Aldred's glossing indicates that he was influenced mainly by older traditions of Psalter glossing from the ninth century, rather than new developments in the period of monastic reform. Paul Cavill, on the other hand, finds that Aldred's marginalia appear to embody a reforming spirit and a desire for his monastic community to embrace material poverty and purity of heart. Stuart Brookes presents a survey of the varieties of letter-form in the gloss. Aldred's work betrays knowledge of both Square minuscule and Carolingian letter-forms, in addition to his principal script, a somewhat old-fashioned Insular minuscule, and his practice embodies a creative response to the script variety he encountered in the Latin text.

Part II, 'The Language of the Gloss', begins with Robert McColl Millar's examination of noun phrase morphology simplification. This paper, along with some others, shows how developments found in early Middle English are already occurring in Northumbria, in contrast with southern OE dialects. Marcelle Cole's paper on present-tense verb morphology contributes to another important line of enquiry. Building on studies by Brunner, Blakeley, and others, she shows how the distribution of variant forms indicates that Aldred's work does not reflect a uniform idiolect throughout, and must have been based on earlier source materials. Luisa García García examines the use and morphological status of causative (-*jan*) verbs, concluding that the pace of change in inflectional morphology is not paralleled in derivational morphology. María Nieves Rodríguez Ledesma examines morphology and word order for genitive phrases, and George Walkden null subjects as evidence for syntactic variation. Julia Fernández Cuesta compares Skeat's edition with MS Cotton Nero D.iv, highlighting problems of using the print version for linguistic analysis.

Part III, 'Glossing Practice', contains an analysis of multiple glosses to present tense forms of *beon* by Christine Bolze, and another by Sara Pons-Sanz on the principles of ordering of double or multiple semantic glosses. Patrizia Lendinara examines words left unglossed by Aldred, arguing that informed principles are at work here, rather than gaps in his knowledge. Karen Jolly brings her expert knowledge of the Durham Collectar to bear upon Aldred's work in the Gospels, showing how the glosses arose out of a context of oral and written pedagogy at Chester-le-Street, as well as spiritual motivation. Finally, Tadashi Kotake looks at the relationship between the Lindisfarne gloss and Owun's glossing in the latter part of the Rushworth (MacRegol) Gospels. He suggests that the latter was not copied from Lindisfarne, with the occasional incorporation of material from other sources, but rather that both glosses might stem from a lost common source.

In large part, the list of contributors reads as a ‘who’s who’ of experts in their respective fields that look to the Lindisfarne Gospels and gloss as a central focus. The editors have made a splendid job of putting the book together. The introductory survey of papers is lucid; a good abstract heads each chapter; section headers lead the reader through each piece to a clear conclusion; full bibliography and index round off the book. This is a very substantial contribution to study of the Gospel gloss, and an essential guide.

GREG WAITE, *University of Otago*

**Fudge**, Thomas A., *Jan Hus Between Time and Eternity: Reconsidering a Medieval Heretic*, Lanham, Lexington Books, 2016; cloth; pp. xii, 277; R.R.P. US\$99.00, £65.00; ISBN 9781498527507.

Thomas A. Fudge’s collection of essays on Jan Hus is neither a biographical nor a conventional historical study. Rather, Fudge seeks to address issues in Hus’s life and martyrdom, and in the reception of Hus that are generally not considered. Part I, ‘Priest and Reformer in Prague’, contains chapters on possible influence on women’s spirituality in Bohemia, Hus’s sex life (he had no active sex life but did write on sex, for example, accusing Czech priests of living immoral lives, and in a commentary on the Ten Commandments), and apocalyptic dimensions of his thought. Fudge cleverly mines textual evidence (Hus’s own writings, those of his predecessors, like John Wycliffe, and contemporaries) to illuminate his subject. The fourteenth and fifteenth centuries were tumultuous with regard to religious dissent and eschatological expectations, and Hus was no exception; he expected the end of times, and martyrdom made him an inspiration to ‘those left to struggle in “the night of Antichrist” in the shadow of eternity’ (p. 70).

The second part, ‘Martyr at Constance’, contains four investigations by Fudge. Chapter 4, ‘Hus on Trial’, considers the ways that different parties at Hus’ trial regarded him. His accusers ranged from ‘detached’ Jan Železný to Štěpán Pálec, who was a friend of Hus but deemed him as ‘proud, arrogant, truculent, and unable to absorb any critique without recourse to defamatory threats’ (p. 85). This study makes clear that there were nuances between Hus’s opponents, and that some were genuinely enemies where others were not. The next chapter takes up the theme of heresy that dominated the trial at Constance, situating Jan Hus in the late medieval context of heresy hunting. The chapter ‘Friendship and Faith: The Prisoner and the Knight’, which addresses the relationship between Hus and Lord Jan Chlum, is one of the most intriguing and moving in the book. A sizeable correspondence between Hus and Chlum survives (an ‘Appendix’ deals with it), and Chlum challenged Pope John XXIII on Hus’s behalf after he was arrested (a guarantee of safe conduct had been given by the pontiff). The final chapter in this part, “‘The Other Sheep’: Reflections on Heresy by a Suspected Heretic’, analyses Hus’s

writings on simony and other divergent theological views, and probes the idea that he believed that separating ‘the wheat and the tares’ was too dangerous, too difficult, and that there were ‘other sheep’ (p. 153).

Part III, ‘Legacy to the World’, is comprised of three chapters that consider the afterlife of Hus. The first argues that he was not a significant presence (as inspiration or rallying point) of the later Hussite Crusade, and questions whether that might be in part because he was radically opposed to violence and killing. The second considers Hus in the light of heretical predecessors and subsequent Reformation heroes like Martin Luther. The six-hundredth anniversary of Hus’s death at Constance in 1414 was the occasion that sparked many of Fudge’s essays, and a half-millennium has passed since Luther’s ‘Ninety-five Theses or Disputations on the Power of Indulgences’ were nailed to the door of Wittenberg Cathedral, the start of the Reformation, which changed Christianity irrevocably. Chapter 10, ‘The Seven Last Words of Jan Hus’, situates the words Hus uttered as he left the prison and walked to the stake, and leaves readers in no doubt of the great faith Hus possessed, and his absolute trust in God. Fudge’s final chapter, ‘Politicizing the Legend of Jan Hus: Problems and Perspectives’, is a historiographical study that reveals fault-lines and fissures in Hus scholarship that persist to the present day. This is a lively and readable study, filled with surprises (unusual subjects of research, original methods to get close to Hus’s ideas and context, and new conclusions). It will be of interest to scholars of late medieval heresy and Church politics, and those interested in Luther and the Reformation. It is warmly recommended.

CAROLE M. CUSACK, *The University of Sydney*

**Garipzanov**, Ildar, **Caroline Goodson**, and **Henry Maguire**, eds, *Graphic Signs of Identity, Faith, and Power in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages* (Cursor Mundi, 27), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. xviii, 394; 141 b/w illustrations, 2 b/w tables; R.R.P. €110.00; ISBN 9782503567242.

This illuminating collection of essays surveys ‘visual media in Late Antiquity and the early Middle Ages’ (p. 5), from a variety of methodological angles and scholarly disciplines.

Larry Hurtado’s opening chapter reconsiders second- and third-century Christians’ fondness for allegory and symbol. Birthed within the pagan Roman cultural system, early Christian symbols, such as the chi-ro and iota-chi, were adopted and adapted from earlier pre-Christian usage. The author concludes that, by utilizing signs and emblems familiar to believers and non-believers, Christians could construct a community based on a unique, yet recognizable symbolic universe.

The fourth-century poems by Optatian — composed during the reign of the first Christian Roman emperor Constantine (r. 306–337) — serve as a pivot for Chapter 2’s look at the intimate connection between representational art and written texts. Optatian’s fondness for chi-ro emblems offered a newly converted Empire a symbol with a range of cosmological representations — Christian and non-Christian. Constantine indeed wielded christograms primarily as representations of imperial and military power. Yet, foreshadowing a more devout Christian Roman world to come, the authors observe a shift in Optatian’s later poems (according to some scholars, misattributed to Optatian) where the chi-ro functions to signify Christ’s, rather than the emperor’s, omnipotence.

Brent Brenk turns to the images found in the *Notitia dignitatum*, a unique late Roman document, which provides an invaluable outline of the early fifth-century Roman administrative system. While some bemoan the text’s lack of focus on the individuals who operated within this organization, as Brenk explains, ‘the document wanted to eternalize the institutions of the late Roman state, not its staff and servants’ (p. 122).

In an early Christian world, where the barriers between heaven and earth were more porous than today, David Ganz demonstrates that texts were more than just human ideas recorded with ink on parchment. Indeed, letters, words, and colours could act for their devout readers as conduits to the spiritual realm.

James Crow turns his eye to the use of graphic signs on late Roman megastructures, such as walls, bridges, gates, and aqueducts. While the use of Christian symbols on this infrastructure broadcast triumphal imperial and Christian ideologies, some symbols were positioned in places of structural weakness well outside of human eyesight. Therefore, as in the case of Constantinople’s main aqueduct, these hidden symbols of Christian power ensured ‘divine protection to the city’s vital lifeline’ (p. 165).

Ine Jacobs stresses that we should not read cross ‘graffiti’, which adorns many pagan monuments and statues left over from late antiquity, as signs of Christian vandalism and intolerance, but as practical defensive devices. Feeling threatened by menacing spiritual forces, late antique Christians etched their symbols as protection against these pagan objects, which they believed were imbued with hostile spirits.

Following Jacobs’s pathway, Henry Maguire explains that late antique designs and decorative patterns displayed on a wide range of objects, which to the modern eye seem to be merely ornamental, instead offered their ancient owners articles ‘invested with supernatural powers’ (p. 223).

Caroline Goodson narrows her focus to Christian symbols found on mass-produced oil lamps. While some specialized lamps were designed for use by Christian elites in ceremonies, the bulk of lamps adorned with christograms

were purchased by members of the regular population interested in being part of a wider pious community.

Christopher Eger scrutinizes objects bearing Christian symbols with more specific links to imperial power: amulets, clothing, swords, crossbows, and belts. Since these official badges of rank were worn by high-ranking members of the bureaucracy and military, one is not surprised to learn that they offered a reminder to their ancient audience that these individuals served under the auspices of divine and imperial authority. Yet, the author offers a caveat, concluding that competing symbols, without specific Christian significance, remained a powerful alternative throughout late antiquity.

Unsurprisingly, it was during the reign of the monk-like emperor Theodosius II (r. 408–50) that we see the first use of Christian imperial monograms on Roman coinage. Ildar Garipzanov supposes that some may find it more surprising that this trend continued during the reigns of the line of soldier-emperors who followed the Theodosians. However, as Garipzanov explains, appropriating these powerful Christian symbols offered these mostly unpolished soldier-emperors a means to accentuate their civilized Christian *Romanitas*.

The final chapter by Anna Muthesius inspects a wide-range of Hellenistic, imperial, and Christian images and motifs on Byzantine silks from the sixth to the eleventh centuries. Luxury items eagerly sought out by elites from inside and outside of Byzantium, silks offered a perfect medium to broadcast Byzantium's long history and sense of cultural superiority. In an empire that cherished its Hellenistic, Roman, and Christian heritage, it should not surprise that a mixture of Christian and non-Christian images and symbolic metaphors spoke to this historic memory.

To close, as each chapter in this cohesive study reveals so vividly, to understand graphic signs in late antiquity and the early Middle Ages, one must first grasp the mentalities beneath.

MICHAEL EDWARD STEWART, *University of Queensland*

**Garipzanov**, Ildar, with Rosalind **Bonté**, eds, *Conversion and Identity in the Viking Age* (Medieval Identities: Socio-Cultural Spaces, 5), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. x, 256; 36 b/w illustrations, 4 b/w line art; R.R.P. €55.00; ISBN 9782503549248.

This volume brings together ten essays that consider Scandinavia's adoption of Christianity, with a particular focus on its effect on identity. Ildar Garipzanov's introduction interrogates what is meant by 'conversion', discussing 'top-down' and 'bottom-up' models (Cusack, *The Rise of Christianity in Northern Europe, 300–1000*, Cassell, 1999) and the distinction between 'conversion period' and 'conversion moment' made by Foote (in Faulkes and Perkins, *Viking Revaluations*, Viking Society, 1993). Garipzanov points out these models

are not necessarily mutually exclusive, but suggests that ‘official’ conversion moments have been overemphasized in previous scholarship. Taken together, the essays in this book are intended, then, to depict conversion as a ‘long process of cultural and societal transformation’ which was ‘of crucial importance for the changing world of multiple identities in the Viking Age’ (p. 19).

Christopher Abram’s essay mobilizes theories of religion put forward by anthropologist Harvey Whitehouse. Whitehouse polarizes two ‘modes of religiosity’: the doctrinal and the imagistic. While Christianity is a doctrinal system ‘par excellence’ (p. 29), Abram finds paganism not quite to conform to the *a priori* assumption that it, then, is imagistic. Abram’s acknowledged reliance on problematic textual sources to assess the ‘mode’ of Norse pre-Christian religion(s) makes for a thought-provoking but not entirely convincing application of Whitehouse’s theory.

Haki Antonsson provides a ‘critical review’ of recent scholarship in the area. This is an extremely useful contribution which might have been better placed first, for the lucid, nuanced and wide-ranging overview it provides of the state-of-play. Haki concludes by warning that the plurality of approaches to the concept of ‘Christianization’ puts at risk the meaningfulness of the term, but suggests that nuance is already emerging and that self-conscious examination of the ‘borderlands’ between terms such as ‘acculturation, official conversion, and Christianization’ (p. 73) will be illuminating.

Orri Vésteinsson revisits the perennial fascination with medieval Iceland’s remarkable literary output, rejecting as insufficient ‘the preferred explanation — that we Icelanders are amazing’ (p. 75). Instead he tackles the issue via the exploration of the North Atlantic colonies’ relatively homogenous adoption of Norse identity and relatively rapid adoption of Christianity. Rather than viewing conversion as an ‘individual [...] problem of conscience’ (p. 77), he considers archaeological evidence for ‘the social acceptance of Christian materiality’ (p. 77). Whereas symbols of ‘Norseness’ provided cohesion in the colonies, Christianity provided distinctiveness (p. 90), and the combination allowed for a continuing ‘Norse project’ (p. 91). Of the North Atlantic colonies, Rosalind Bonté’s welcome contribution considers the case of the Faroe Islands specifically, examining both textual and material evidence. She argues for a much more complex and long-term ‘bottom-up’ conversion than *Færeyinga saga* suggests, but speculates that the text’s insistence on Óláfr Tryggvason’s importance may reflect an intervention that led to Christianity’s officially-recognized status in the islands.

David M. Wilson reviews burials and memorials on the Isle of Man. The use of Christian symbols appears within a generation of the likely arrival of ‘Viking’ settlers on Man, alongside Scandinavian ornamentation and language, and one quarter of names in runic inscriptions are Celtic, pointing to complex interactions between inhabitants. Garipzanov’s paradigm-busting

second contribution turns to social psychology and sociology to theorize identity as role-based. He argues that the adoption of Christian identity was not a radical replacement of a previous identity, but a 'new dimension' (p. 140) to pre-existing categories of identity such as gender and status that enhanced particular social roles and interactions. The emergence of Christianity as a dominant identity-marker was a long process, he argues.

Søren M. Sindbæk looks diachronically at imagery on oval brooches. He suggests that 'the Carolingian mission in the ninth century did not propagate a new religion to a monolithically pagan north, but rather interrupted a process of cultural reception that had been ongoing for some time' (p. 192), and that the brooches took on the primary role of 'cultural boundary' markers at this time. Anne Pedersen, continuing the discussion into the tenth and eleventh centuries, also problematizes the straightforward interpretation of imagery as primarily expressions of religious identity: 'the hammer and the cross, rather than being two distinct religious symbols worn openly in opposition, may instead reflect a general need for personal reassurance, assistance, and protection' (pp. 221–22).

Finally, Jón Viðar Sigurðsson provides some 'afterthoughts' which both review the preceding chapters and introduce some of his own observations. I really like the idea of such a concluding chapter and hope it may be adopted in more thematic collections. Although it is undoubtedly an extra pressure on publication, attempts to pull threads together and present the new state-of-play would be very valuable following collections of essays. This volume perhaps confirms rather than challenges Lesley Abrams's 2010 observation with which it opens — 'Conversion is a problematic concept' — but the essays brought together here add further nuanced, if not always fully cohesive, perspectives on this period of transformation.

HANNAH BURROWS, *University of Aberdeen*

**Garrison, Jennifer**, *Challenging Communion: The Eucharist and Middle English Literature* (Interventions: New Studies in Medieval Culture), Columbus, University of Ohio Press, 2017; hardback, pp. x, 207; R.R.P. US\$ 119.95; ISBN 9780814213230.

Focusing on 'a broad range of nondramatic literature — penitential manuals, dream visions, religious allegories, mystical literature, devotional treatises, and lyrics' (p. 5) — Jennifer Garrison's *Challenging Communion* argues towards 'identifying a pervasive Middle English literary tradition that rejects simplistic notions of eucharistic promise' (p. 2). At the heart of Garrison's discussion is what she terms 'eucharistic poetics'. Complementing and following on from Sarah Beckwith's work on the relationship between community and Christ's body in medieval drama, Garrison analyses how medieval literary texts 'emphasize both communion with and alienation from Christ in order

to contemplate and question not only their own personal connection with the divine but also the necessity of the institutional church as a mediator between Christ and humanity' (p. 2).

After a thoughtful and detailed introduction, which includes an admirably clear and succinct summary of the 'two basic medieval approaches to the theology of the Eucharist: what modern scholars often identify as the Augustinian approach and the Ambrosian approach' (p. 10), Chapter 1 covers Robert Mannyng's *Handlyng Synne*. Recognizing that scholarship on this text — an 'early fourteenth-century penitential manual' — is scant, Garrison takes the opportunity to address this. She suggests that 'for Mannyng, the fleeting union with Christ that the Eucharist offers believers simultaneously demands they seek a deeper devotion through recognition of their own distance from the divine' (p. 21).

This tension — the Eucharist's simultaneous offering of access to God and the receiver's forced recognition that man can never be like God — is the thread linking the book's six chapters. Chapter 2, 'Devotional Submission', turns to the *Pearl* poem, exploring the text's presentation of 'the importance of inward-looking liturgical piety by troubling the boundaries between literal and figurative meaning' (p. 59). Garrison's discussion of the medieval Eucharist's manipulation of literal and figurative, accident and substance, continues into Chapter 3, 'Christ's Allegorical Bodies and the failure of Community in *Piers Plowman*'. This chapter extends Langland scholarship by linking his well-explored use of allegory with the 'Christian community' (p. 82), taking the Eucharist as 'an allegorical sign of Christ's body, both Christ's historical body and the corporate body of all Christians' (p. 83). Chapter 4, 'Julian of Norwich's Allegory and the Mediation of Salvation', further examines 'devotional reading [...] of both host and written text' (p. 104), arguing that 'an understanding of [medieval] devotional reading as socially transformative is essential to the mystical body of Christ' (p. 104). Julian's 'depict[ion of] the institutional church's role in the formation of a Christian community of readers as powerfully and positively transformative' (p. 131) is countered in Chapter 5, 'The Willful Surrender of Eucharistic Reading in Nicholas Love and Margery Kempe'. Garrison argues that 'both regard the institutional church as systematically limiting the lay believer's contact with and intellectual knowledge of Christ's body' (p. 131). The final chapter, 'John Lydgate and the Eucharistic Poetic Tradition: The Making of Community', is a fascinating study of 'how the Eucharist enables Lydgate to explore the spiritual power of poetic form' (p. 160), and his 'construct[ion of] the Christian community through spiritual and intellectual illumination' (p. 174).

The book's brief conclusion summarizes and reiterates Garrison's thesis that the medieval Eucharist, while apparently offering receivers access to the divine, actually only heightens their awareness of man's distance from

God: 'the Eucharist provides a model for devotional reading practices as always predicated on distance and frustrated meaning' (p. 183). She closes by proposing that all the texts studied 'invite readers to contemplate and question the necessity of the institutional church as mediator between Christ and humanity' (p. 183).

This is a very ambitious book, broad in its literary, temporal and theological sweep. Garrison's skilful handling, however, prevents the argument from becoming too sprawling, and the chapters flow well and smoothly. Nevertheless, the book's wide range, coupled with Garrison's meticulously detailed research, sometimes leads to a certain denseness in the writing and argument. That said, *Challenging Communion* is an exciting, rewarding, and highly valuable addition to the study of medieval literature and its relationship with the Eucharist.

ELEANOR BLOOMFIELD, *The University of Auckland*

**Gascoigne, Alison L., Leonie V. Hicks, and Marianne O'Doherty,** eds, *Journeying along Medieval Routes in Europe and the Middle East* (Medieval Voyaging, 3), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. xii, 296; 15 b/w illustrations, 20 b/w line art; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9782503541730.

This volume has its genesis in a set of 'Journeying along Medieval Routes' sessions at the 2010 International Medieval Congress in Leeds. These examined aspects of medieval travel and exploration, starting with the premises that the journey is important for understanding the way social, cultural and political meaning is produced in the medieval world, and that different societies and cultures have different relationships with both built and natural environments.

The theoretical positioning of this volume is figured around a scholarly baseline that models people and societies as dynamic rather than constrained to specific locations and time periods. Such social dynamism is nowadays familiar to the scholar, even though popular views of periodization and a modern nationalist discourse might wish to frame it. The volume discusses journeys, conquests, and economic expansions that have occurred over millennia, thereby challenging the post-Enlightenment rhetoric of the 'age of exploration' as a modern phenomenon. This volume spans from the fourth-century Christian empire of Constantine, through the Norman migrations into southern Italy and Sicily and Norman interaction with the Arab world of the medieval Mediterranean, to the twelfth- and thirteenth-century northern European movements of elites in both Germany and England.

In Section 1, Ralf Bockmann and E. J. Mylod bookend a millennium of pilgrim practice, paying particular attention to the politics and landscape of medieval pilgrimage routes to Jerusalem. Bockmann explores Emperor Constantine's fourth-century 'programme' establishing pilgrimage culture

and architectural infrastructure for the purpose of consolidating his spiritual and temporal authority. Mylod's contribution focuses on contemporary accounts of twelfth- and thirteenth-century pilgrimage routes in the Holy Land, discussing the political exigencies that affected the important (and lucrative) pilgrimage 'industry' to Jerusalem, focusing on changes following the loss of the Kingdom of Jerusalem in 1187, and its destruction in 1291.

In Section 2, Paul Oldfield, Leonie V. Hicks, and Jean-Charles Ducène turn their attention to medieval Italy, and in the course of their three chapters they examine important issues concerning the Norman settlers in Sicily and southern Italy. These include, as Oldfield discusses, the reminder that our histories commonly mask the true state of affairs, derived as they are from discourse of the elites. For Norman Italy the story is more one of assimilation and convergence of cultures than has often been acknowledged, notwithstanding the fact that powerful Normans retained their status in the spatially connected world of pilgrim, mercantile and mercenary travel. Norman diasporic land-seeking lesser nobility also played an important role in this, but they did not necessarily retain their Norman identities. Hicks explores conquest narratives of Norman Italy through a number of chronicles, noting a clear correlation between the ability of a noble to successfully negotiate landscape challenges and the rightfulness of their conquest and rule over the region: a process that naturalizes political authority as geographic, realized through itinerary, topography and landscape. Ducène then switches focus to the writings of twelfth-century Arab geographer al-Idrīsī, seeking to understand routes, localities and itineraries in southern Italy. He examines oral and written sources (including Norman sources) to find that the routes al-Idrīsī described were realistic and correct, and that his sources align with those used by contemporary western European authors. He also reveals that al-Idrīsī probably used military informants from Roger II's Sicily campaign for important locality information, a useful reflection on the place of Arab geographers in Norman Sicily. Importantly, Ducène assesses al-Idrīsī's description of the road network as reliable for knowledge of contemporary conditions in southern Italy.

Section 3 turns to north-west Europe, with Pierre Fütterer and Christian Oertel reconstructing routes and road systems in medieval Germany. Fütterer examines the tenth- and eleventh-century roadway infrastructure in Saxony, analysing the mechanisms of itinerancy of the Ottonian kings, and identifying a likely location for the palatinate of Dornburg, while Oertel explores travel and communication routes that connected the houses of the Teutonic Order in medieval Thuringia in the context of their colonization of Prussia following the twelfth-century loss of the Kingdom of Jerusalem. The section concludes with Julie E. Crockford and Paul Webster examining the itineraries of the English kings Edward I and John and their retinues. Crockford's chapter examines the record of Edward's journeys, logging and discussing distances

travelled and days spent in various locations, whereas Webster draws a picture of John's extensive spiritual itineration for the purpose of procuring divine support for both his realm and his soul. Webster stops short of suggesting that John might also have been establishing his spirituality in assertion of his temporal authority.

Despite the seemingly disparate nature of its components, this book indeed produces a whole greater than the sum of its parts. It is important that medieval scholars do not overlook the dynamism of the societies we study and the mutual interconnectedness of ideas, cultures and politics, which this book brings to the fore.

RODERICK McDONALD, *University of Nottingham*

**Gibbons**, Daniel R., *Conflicts of Devotion: Liturgical Poetics in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century England*, Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2017; cloth; pp. x, 332; R.R.P. US\$60.00; ISBN 9780268101343.

In Daniel R. Gibbons's wide-ranging study on early modern liturgy and poetics, the question of what it means to participate in a unified spiritual community emerges as a central preoccupation for both English Protestants and Catholics. Gibbons's analysis of the 1559 *Book of Common Prayer* liturgies for the Communion and burial rites provides the historical and cultural foundation for his readings of the poems, which he discusses in individual chapters on Spenser's elegies, Southwell's lyric verse, Donne's divine poems, Herbert's *The Temple*, and Crashaw's English lyrics. Gibbon's central thesis is that the Prayerbook provided a rhetoric that enabled English worshippers to demarcate the boundaries of a unified religious community in post-Reformation England. Through its ambivalent language and prayers that could be interpreted variously to satisfy both traditionalist and Reformed worshippers alike, the Prayerbook's liturgies avoided alienating parishioners who ascribed to a range of religious allegiances — all of whom saw themselves as committed members of the nascent English church. While Gibbons largely moves away from the texts of the liturgies themselves in his readings of the poems, his claim is that the Prayerbook's language of accommodation and exclusion shapes the way poets defined religious identity and sought to include a diversity of religious beliefs in their imagined lyric communities. As a poetic device, this model of rhetorical accommodation allowed the many readers of a single poem — as Gibbons writes in his reading of Donne's Holy Sonnet 'Show me deare Christ' — to 'forge a timeless unified worshipping body' in spite of the 'multiple individual readings of a single prayer-poem' that this body of readers would likely construe (p. 162).

Gibbons's study is a continuation of the kind of historicist work accomplished by recent monographs on the literary influence of the *Book of Common Prayer*, most prominently Ramie Targoff's *Common Prayer: The Language*

of *Public Devotion in Early Modern England* (University of Chicago Press, 2001) and Timothy Rosendale's *Liturgy and Literature in the Making of Protestant England* (Cambridge University Press, 2007). But Gibbons's emphasis on the continuity of Catholic thought in the writing and dissemination of the Prayerbook sets his study apart from the body of recent scholarship on English state worship. Indeed, one of the strengths of Gibbons's book is its inclusion of both Catholic and Protestant poets in its treatment of liturgical poetics. Although Gibbons positions the *Book of Common Prayer* as the central historical text in his interpretations of the poems, his study is equally inflected by a range of Catholic sources — including Augustine, Nicholas of Cusa, the Spanish mystics, and François de Sales. Gibbons's study is rewarding and worthwhile in that it serves as a reminder that the actual religious practices that we tend to label as 'Anglican' or 'Reformed', and even 'Protestant' and 'Catholic', rarely accommodate themselves to such neatly defined categories. In every chapter, Gibbons re-emphasizes the fluidity — and even self-contradictory quality — of post-Reformation English religious identity. This fluidity is what enables Gibbons to undertake parallel readings of poets who seem to write from vastly different theological commitments. For example, Gibbons makes the claim that both Spenser and Southwell respond to and challenge the cultural and psychological rifts left by the Prayerbook's Order for the Burial of the Dead — despite the fact that the former led state-directed anti-Catholic reforms in Ireland, and the latter was a Jesuit priest executed by the English state for his clandestine missionary work. Gibbons's decision to include in his study poets of diverse religious loyalties is testament to the wide-reaching cultural influence of the *Book of Common Prayer*, and the way that its liturgical rhetoric was appropriated and reimagined by those from opposing religious poles in Tudor and Stuart England.

RHEMA HOKAMA, *Singapore University of Technology and Design*

**Green**, Richard Firth, *Elf Queens and Holy Friars: Fairy Beliefs and the Medieval Church* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016; cloth; pp. 304; R.R.P. US\$55.00, GBP 45.00; ISBN 9780812248432.

This engrossing and eminently readable book makes a significant, and original, contribution to scholarship on the medieval Church through its rehabilitation of the lived reality of medieval people with regard to belief in fairy lore. Green thus is able to bring together fields that are usually separated: medieval romance, and attitudes expressed by clerics in the Middle Ages. *Elf Queens and Holy Friars* joins a myriad recent studies that have enriched knowledge of vernacular beliefs and of 'religion' that existed outside of texts, creeds, and official Church doctrines. The brief 'Introduction' suggests that fairy beliefs were fluid and controversial even in the medieval era, and disavows sundry

ideas that have been floated with reference to such beliefs, including the ‘Celtic origins’ (p. 5) hypothesis, and the rituals that people performed to draw on fairy power at dangerous times of life. Green’s interest is political; his study uses Antonio Gramsci and Michel Foucault, and traces the ‘policing’ of fairy beliefs by the ecclesiastical hierarchy in the high Middle Ages. Chapter 1, ‘Believing in Fairies’, addresses C. S. Lewis’s challenge to ‘imagine what it would feel like to witness, or think we had witnessed, or merely to believe in’ fairies (pp. 11–12). Green details the clerical connections between fairies and demons, and notes the learned middle ground that posited ‘neutral angels’ (p. 25). He also sketches the less judgemental treatment of fairyland and fairies in literary texts, and rejects the modern view that ‘the fairy machinery of medieval romance [...] is] a convenient narrative device’ (p. 33). Learned writers including Gervase of Tilbury, Walter Map, and William of Newburgh also gave some support to the ‘popular’ beliefs and practices regarding fairies.

Chapter 2, ‘Policing Vernacular Belief’, demonstrates that the perceived gulf between learned and popular culture in the medieval era does not really work for fairy beliefs. Green summons evidence to show that penalties and penances for fairy beliefs and practices became more severe over the centuries (Burchard of Worms, who died in the early eleventh century, sentenced those who believed in fairy lovers to ten days on bread and water, but the late fifteenth-century *Malleus Maleficarum* condemned them to death). Green traces a ‘campaign of cultural repression’ (p. 66) of fairy lore, which, he contends, makes certain of the claims regarding Celtic elements in romances tenable if not provable. Romances were texts in which half-fairies like the magician Merlin existed, and which resisted the official clerical position. Chapter 3, ‘Incubi Fairies’, opens with an analysis of the various terms for fairies, and explains how clerics consistently express the view that relationships with fairy lovers will end badly, where in vernacular romance ‘liaisons with fairy mistresses are invariably exotic and exciting’ (p. 101). Chapter 4, ‘Christ the Changeling’, is especially interesting in that it makes plain how theologically orthodox Christian dogmas might shade into versions of fairy beliefs. Changelings are usually male, and when examined by the learned the beliefs of peasants are generally dismissed, in favour of a ‘medical’ view. The term for ‘changeling’, *conjoun*, appears in diverse contexts (for example, legal texts and romances), and in the Chester and York play cycles, Christ is called a changeling. Green examines all the ‘uncanny’ terms used for Christ and biblical characters associated with him, such as Abel, and demonstrates that the popular understanding of orthodox doctrine has many connections with fairy beliefs.

Chapter 5, ‘Living in Fairyland’, examines liminal places such as Avalon in the Arthurian legend, and related speculative ideas such as William of Auvergne’s consideration of ‘whether the fairy horde might be made up of those who had been lost in battle’ (p. 158). This segues into a discussion of

the emergence of Purgatory, a term first used around 1170, which begins with Jacques le Goff's account of the subject. Green argues that texts like the *Tractatus de Purgatorio de Sancti Patricii* and the *Owayne Miles* are incorporated into the great tradition but 'the underlying form of the quest romance cannot be suppressed' (p. 183). The otherworld has become 'infernalized' and there is emphasis on paradise as the Christian alternative to it. The 'Postscript' considers the status of fairies in early modern England, draws attention to Geoffrey Chaucer's scepticism about fairies and the high regard in which Elizabethans held him, and identifies how Chaucer lies behind the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century courtly use of the fairy motif. *Elf Queens and Holy Friars* is an elegantly written, cogently argued and highly compelling book. It should be of interest to scholars of medieval romance, folk beliefs and practices, and indeed to all who are interested in European religion during the Middle Ages.

CAROLE M. CUSACK, *The University of Sydney*

**Guasco**, Michael, *Slaves and Englishmen: Human Bondage in the Early Modern Atlantic World* (Early Modern Americas), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 328, 8 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$45.00, £29.50; ISBN 97808122 45783.

Although slavery was not legal in the English-speaking world until 1661 when Barbados and Virginia introduced the necessary legislation, English men, and indeed English women, had long been entangled in the practice. In *Slaves and Englishmen: Human Bondage in the Early Modern Atlantic World*, Michael Guasco sets out to investigate the nature of that entanglement and explore how the English thought, wrote about, and practised slavery from the mid-sixteenth to mid-seventeenth century.

Guasco suggests that 'we have rarely devoted as much attention to the meaning of human bondage as we have to the origins of racial slavery in the early Anglo-Atlantic world' and that his book seeks to 'redress that oversight' (p. 5). He argues that ideas about slavery and a 'willingness to take advantage of human bondage' shaped English colonialism from the beginning (p. 5). This starting point — the beginning of English colonialism — means that Guasco concentrates, for the most part, on the late-sixteenth century onwards. Although he does refer to those English traders who experienced the fluidity of the late fifteenth- and early sixteenth-century Iberian Atlantic, he does not really explore their experiences or their influence back home. Nor does he look at the practices and influences of those slave-holding Genoese, Florentine, and Venetian merchants who resided in Southampton and London during the period and whose influence on local merchants is recorded in the guild and notary archives of England, the Low Countries, and the Iberian Peninsula.

*Slaves and Englishmen* focuses on ideas rather than practices. Guasco expertly illustrates the dichotomy faced by those English citizens willing to find out more about slavery and think through its moral implications. Not only had vestiges of serfdom survived into the sixteenth century, but both Christian and classical texts failed to provide clear-cut guidance. While the Old Testament could be read as ‘a story of liberation’, passages like Leviticus 25.44–46 condoned slavery, as did sections of the New Testament. The classical texts read by learned English men and women were equally confusing: on the one hand extolling individual freedom while, on the other, condoning slavery as a natural state (pp. 15–18). The situation was further clouded by the fact that just as Englishmen were becoming familiar with slavery, and the enslavement of Africans in particular, they realized that they too could be enslaved — particularly in the Mediterranean, seen as an ‘epicentre of bondage and captivity’ (p. 56).

By Elizabeth I’s reign, conflicts between Protestants and Catholics and between England and Spain were increasingly seen as a battle between freedom and slavery. This ‘fed into the notion that the English were, ipso facto, anti-slavery’ (p. 21). However, while such a stance may have been popular in theory, it was hardly convenient in practice. Only those opportunistic Englishmen who demonstrated flexibility survived and prospered in the Atlantic world. This meant that while commentators claimed that England’s invasion of Ireland would ‘liberate the mass of poor, downtrodden Irish from a bondage that was imposed on them by their own lords’ (p. 49), Englishmen sailing, fighting, and trading in the Atlantic were learning about and tolerating the idea of African slavery even before they embraced it (p. 68). They were integrating Africans into their households and businesses through conversion, servitude, and miscegenation, and were among the first to write about Africans in the Americas. Guasco’s comment that these Englishmen were largely ‘smugglers and pirates’ (p. 86) is somewhat simplistic however, for during this period, divisions between merchant, trader, smuggler, and pirate were blurred and constantly shifting. Whatever their status, Englishmen tended to cohere to a smug rhetoric, which invariably characterized the Spanish as cruel colonizers and themselves as liberators. This meant that while Africans and indigenous Americans were being cast as allies, the geographer and writer Richard Hakluyt felt justified in suggesting that Africans be taken to a settlement in the Straits of Magellan and there ‘induced to live subject to the gentle government of the English’ (p. 88).

Although Guasco admits that there is more ‘lumping than splitting going on’ in this book (p. 313), he has, as he acknowledges, taken on a huge subject. This means that while some historians in the field may bemoan the lack of detail and new information, others will appreciate the original and comprehensive approach. What Guasco conveys so well is that the race-based plantation slavery that became ‘a defining characteristic of the English

Empire in the Americas' (p. 227) did not represent a radical shift. It was long in the making and emerged from countless deliberations, adaptations and experiences.

HEATHER DALTON, *University of Melbourne*

**Honkapohja**, Alpo, *Alchemy, Medicine, and Commercial Book Production: A Codicological and Linguistic Study of the Voigts-Sloane Manuscript Group* (Texts and Transitions, 9), Turnhout, Brepols, 2017; hardback; pp. xv, 250; 3 colour, 57 b/w illustrations, 20 b/w tables; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503566474.

The Voigts-Sloane manuscripts are a group of Middle English texts about medicine and alchemy with a remarkable degree of uniformity. The manuscripts, first described by Linda Voigts in 1990, have attracted much scholarly interest and curiosity for two reasons. First, 'the manuscripts are thought to be evidence of co-ordination in the production of medical manuscripts before printing' (p. 2), and second, the texts are all written in English and Latin in a side-by-side fashion during a period when a substantial amount of medical books were made available in vernacular translation. Because of this, the manuscripts have been referred to as 'instances of commercially co-ordinated book production' (p. 3), although neither the context of their production nor their language has been thoroughly analysed.

Honkapohja sets out to cover both these shortcomings in his book, as he aims 'to examine the Group using detailed codicological analysis as well as a linguistic analysis of its dialect and multilingualism' (p. 3). Split into six chapters, the book starts by introducing the reader to the Group and how it will be studied and investigated. Linda Voigts has divided the manuscripts in subgroups based on their physical similarity and overlap in text and illustrations. In his work, Honkapohja uses the same grouping of manuscripts with a few well-substantiated modifications and additions.

Following an extensive description of the sources and some evidence of a possible origin in London, the author gives an account of the commercial book market in England before the age of printing. Doing so, he describes three ways of producing manuscripts and the codicological features of these types of works. In the subsequent chapters, Honkapohja explores whether any of the manuscripts in the Voigts-Sloane Group contains the signs that would expose a foundation in either of these.

Chapters 2 to 4 contain the bulk of Honkapohja's codicological analysis. Starting with the Sibling Group, he dives into manuscript descriptions and attempts to find evidence of co-ordinated book production. The author provides a range of figures, images and tables to illustrate his analysis. The manuscripts in this subgroup are described in tremendous detail and, regardless of its high information density, the impressive study can be

understood without much trouble. The third chapter is dedicated to the Core Group: the description of the manuscripts, the construction of the booklets, and their origin. The chapter contains a similar level of detail to the previous one, presenting the information in an orderly way, substantiated by diagrams of quires and tables. Following this extensive description is an account of the topics covered in the manuscripts and their context. Alchemy in particular requires some explanation, considering its unlawfulness in fifteenth-century England. The fourth chapter discusses the subgroup 'Family Resemblance': manuscripts that display some resemblance but cannot be said to belong to either other subgroup. This subgroup was created by Voigts, just as the others, and Honkapohja discusses them thoroughly. However, while he recognizes that the manuscripts had a shared origin, the author considers all but one source in the subgroup to be irrelevant to the Core Group. He bases this on a lack of textual resemblance and overlap in codicological characteristics.

The last two chapters of the book deal with the language and multilingualism of the Group. Honkapohja determines a clear-cut rift between the English and Latin languages, where the Latin text covers the technical material while the English appears to serve as an aid for those who did not adequately understand Latin. The two languages lack equal sophistication; it would appear the Group's reputation of multilingualism is tenuous at best. Honkapohja ends his book with an impressive dialectological analysis of the language used in the manuscripts, and an appendix containing the full collation of one of the texts.

Honkapohja's *Alchemy, Medicine, and Commercial Book Production: A Codicological and Linguistic Study of the Voigts-Sloane Manuscript Group* offers a comprehensive analysis of the manuscripts through an ambitious combination of codicological and linguistic approaches. While technical at times, the descriptions are detailed and well structured, making it a pleasant read. Ten years well spent, I would say!

FLORA GUIJT, *The Hague, The Netherlands*

**Hoofnagle**, Wendy Marie, *The Continuity of the Conquest: Charlemagne and Anglo-Norman Imperialism*, University Park, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2016; hardback; pp. 208; R.R.P. US\$74.95; ISBN 9780271074016.

Did Norman perceptions of kingship and empire deliberately follow the model set forth by Charlemagne, in both his historical and his literary or legendary forms? Wendy Marie Hoofnagle certainly thinks so and sets out to examine the hypothesis here. Norman attachment to the Charlemagne of the *Chanson de Roland*, as expressed in William of Malmesbury's famous description of the Conqueror's troops bursting forth in song before the Battle of Hastings, is the most obvious example of a cultural link between the two

eras. Other links, however, are harder to find and the impression is of an intellectually appealing conceptual framework not quite able to be rendered complete by the evidence available. Hoofnagle claims that the model of rulership presented by authors such as Dudo of Saint Quentin and Geoffroi Gaimar is 'similar to that developed during Charlemagne's reign' (p. 16). Perhaps so, but any mere resemblance between the Carolingian and Norman practice of rulership is insufficient to establish conclusively that the latter was deliberately modelled on the former in a self-reflective manner, which is the assumption underlying the entire project.

Chapter 1 pursues the intriguing notion of 'Conversion Politics'. Hoofnagle positions Norman engagement with the peoples of the British Isles as an expression of benevolent 'soft power' leading to a 'socio-cultural [...] conversion' (p. 19), just as much as (or rather than) a series of military encounters. In this sense she relates Norman expansion to the Carolingian conversion of pagan Saxons as a form both of military and of cultural imperialism. Chapter 2 examines topographical and architectural examples. The view that Norman castle-building took its cue from Carolingian precedents is based on tenuous evidence, though William of Malmesbury claimed that Hereford Cathedral's design was modelled on its counterpart in Aachen (pp. 57 and 81). Some interesting literary echoes are apparent in Henry of Huntingdon's descriptions of Charlemagne and William the Conqueror (pp. 68 and 70). These are slim pickings on which to base a comparative study and it is harder to see how discussions of Britain's Roman roads or Geoffrey of Monmouth's revisionist history of the White Tower, innovative as they are on their own terms, can truly reinforce the central theme of imperial continuity.

The third chapter, 'Taming the Wild Beast: A New Look at the New Forest', encapsulates these contrasting strengths and weaknesses. Hoofnagle admits that '[t]racing the influence of Carolingian kingship on Norman ducal practices is not, unfortunately, a clear-cut exercise that reveals a definitive paper trail' (p. 91). The note of caution might stand as an epigraph for the whole volume. Sections on Norman forest law, on literary responses to the death of William Rufus and on forest imagery in the *lais* of Marie de France all contain fascinating and thoughtful insights. Yet while, in the case of Marie's *lais*, the section offers new readings of familiar texts, it is not entirely clear how these are intended to inform the volume's overarching theme. I am readily persuaded that Marie 'has reinforced the notion of the forest as a locus of kingly authority' (p. 111); but I am not sure what this tells us about the Normans' views of their reliance on Carolingian precedents. Hoofnagle's position, presented almost as an afterthought, is that Marie 'manipulat[ed] the image of the king as lawgiver and peacemaker that Charlemagne and subsequent kings capitalized on' (p. 111), but this is an argument which relies on an assumption that Marie was responding deliberately to Carolingian

models of kingship. Further, in order to sustain the book's central thesis about Norman (and Angevin) continuity and identity the section must also assume that Marie's complex literary creations can be equated directly to perceptions of political heritage at Henry II's court, though this is not spelled out. In short, what the chapter offers is a series of original and perceptive but loosely related studies which struggle to cohere into a persuasive overall argument.

Despite these criticisms there is much to admire in the volume's wide-ranging, ambitious and multi-disciplinary approach to its material. Landscape and architecture; mythmaking and historical writing; imperial expansion and the ideology of kingship: all of these themes are addressed in ways which will offer new perspectives and which are sure to be thought-provoking to scholars of the Anglo-Norman era. With that in mind Hoofnagle's *The Continuity of the Conquest* deserves to take its place alongside other studies of Norman cultural and political identity, though with the proviso that its successes lie more at the level of detailed readings of key texts, rather than in the persuasiveness of its central thematic contentions.

LINDSAY DIGGELMANN, *University of Auckland*

**Howard**, Peter, and Cecilia **Hewlett**, eds, *Studies on Florence and the Italian Renaissance in Honour of F. W. Kent* (Europa Sacra, 20), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. xvi, 524; 50 colour, 5 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €120.00; ISBN 9782503552767.

The breadth and richness of this *festschrift* is a fitting testament to the impact and influence of F. W. (Bill) Kent. As one would expect, the majority of the twenty-six essays presented in the volume focus on fifteenth-century Florence — the centre of Kent's own scholarly concerns — but Carolyn James, Clare Monagle, and Constant Mews take us back to the 1300s, and Natalie Tomas and David Rosenthal extend the chronological scope to the sixteenth century, while the contributions of Amanda Lillie, Ersie Burke, and Cynthia Troup range to Naples, Venice, and Rome, respectively. Fittingly, the majority of the contributors to the volume are Australian, several of them past students of Kent, but it also includes essays from prominent North American and European scholars.

The volume opens with an illuminating introductory chapter by Peter Howard that situates Kent's historical interests and methods within the contexts of his upbringing in Footscray (at the time a working-class neighbourhood of Melbourne), and his education first at the University of Melbourne and then at the University of London under the supervision of Nicolai Rubinstein. In the course of this introduction Howard highlights key themes and ideas in Kent's thinking and scholarship around which the rest of the volume is arranged: power and agency in Medicean Florence; family, friends, and networks; spirituality and patronage; and the consumption of

culture. It is a truism that a short review of an edited volume, particularly one as lengthy as this, cannot hope to do justice to its contents. I will instead attempt to sketch out the breadth and range of the contributions, highlighting a handful to give a sense of the texture of the book.

The cumulative contribution of the volume lies both in the way it highlights the continuing vitality and dynamism of Renaissance studies (particularly in Australia) and in how it demonstrates a central concern of Kent's own scholarship: the complexity of Renaissance Italian society, the way that it resists simple explanatory models and ready quantification. The chapters present a range of methods and analyses that reflect changes in historical practice over the past two generations. Not surprisingly, many of the authors pursue, to effective ends, the sort of cultural historical analysis that has come to dominate historiography. Dale Kent, for example, reads a variety of sources to demonstrate the way Cosimo il Vecchio de' Medici exemplified and utilized the dual, mutually reinforcing ideals of patriarchy and patronage in the early fifteenth century, while Gary Ianziti explores how Leonardo Bruni's *History of the Florentine People* provided a usable past for the political culture of the emergent Florentine oligarchy. Several other contributions reflect more recent turns toward the consideration of space and material culture. Alison Brown examines the shifting, contested spaces of power in the late fifteenth century, Amanda Lillie demonstrates how a garden in Naples served as a material representation of Filippo Strozzi's ties to the city, and Sandra Weddle examines the way female convents used architectural space to extend and retreat from public gaze, and to offer privileged access to patrons and benefactors. Other essays give voice to the sort of historical actors that Kent consistently promoted — 'the unheard voices' of the past — such as the Savonarolan tailor Bastiano Arditì, the humble priest and counterfeiter ser Giovanni di Francesco, anonymous peasant pilgrims, women from a myriad of social estates, and even a long-dead, prophetic Carmelite bishop.

Whatever their method or focus, all of the contributions are united in an approach that emphasizes the careful, even subtle, reading of historical traces — visual, textual, material — teasing out meaning in order to give sense to past experience. The revelations of Howard's introduction include the detail that Kent himself, shortly before his death in 2010, consented to the production of the *festschrift*, appointed the editors, and determined the criteria by which contributors should be chosen. One cannot help but think that Lorenzo de' Medici would have approved. But one is also left profoundly grateful for this final act of intellectual influence and leadership in shaping such a richly textured and rewarding volume.

NICHOLAS SCOTT BAKER, *Macquarie University*

**Huebert**, Ronald, *Privacy in the Age of Shakespeare*, Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2016; cloth; pp. 352; 11 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. CA\$65.00; ISBN 9781442647916.

Ronald Huebert begins the introduction with Sir John Harington's *The Praise of Private Life*. He argues Harington's prose treatise reveals that privacy has renewed importance in 'the age of Shakespeare', which he defines as the period 1516–1667 (p. 4). This range refers to Sir Thomas More's challenge to privacy in *Utopia*, and John Milton's spiritual privacy in *Paradise Lost*.

In Chapter 1, Huebert investigates what privacy means to Shakespeare. In *Hamlet*, Huebert finds a dichotomy between private and public spaces. He examines the invasion of private thoughts through overhearing Hamlet's soliloquies, and of space such as Ophelia's closet. In *Twelfth Night*, Huebert analyses the anxiety of misinterpreting the inner self, in particular, Olivia's veil and Malvolio's attempt to protect his privacy from Feste, Sir Toby Belch and Sir Andrew Aguecheek.

Chapter 2 charts a spiritual interiority for both Protestants and Catholics. Huebert examines the prayer closet to argue that the dichotomies of 'Protestant and Catholic, male and female, body and soul' are dissolved (p. 61). He shows this through a close analysis of Christ's agony in the garden, and the spiritual allegory positing Christian souls as Christ's bride. The chapter ends with an investigation of John Saltmarsh's private devotions. Saltmarsh privileges the soul to the point where his flesh is superfluous to private spiritual needs.

Chapter 3 focuses on voyeurism. Through the story of Diana and Actaeon in Ovid's *Metamorphoses* and the *History of Susanna* in the Apocrypha, Huebert demonstrates how the male voyeur's intrusion of female privacy ends in his death. After examining poetic striptease, Huebert delivers an inspired reading of *Much Ado About Nothing*. He argues persuasively that Claudio is a voyeur through the way he observes and discusses Hero. Huebert reads Beatrice's passionate command to Benedick to kill Claudio as following the same pattern.

Chapter 4 has an experimental, even voyeuristic, tone as Huebert analyses commonplace books. His fascinating rationale is that texts in manuscript form reveal more of the private self than their published counterparts. These less well known works capture a sense of undisturbed private thoughts, as they are not shaped by a history of critical reading in the public domain.

With Chapter 5, Huebert investigates whether early modern men and women share a similar understanding of privacy. Lady Anne Clifford's diary reveals a woman who endured a privacy of isolation. Her husband is frequently absent and, when at home, he often retreats into his private study. In contrast to her husband, Clifford's reading of literature and needlework are constantly monitored and interrupted. In a diary by John Ramsey, he is always on the

move and rarely with his family. He only mentions one of his eight children. Huebert concludes that early modern women occupy a shadowy exposed privacy, while men enjoy travelling and private meditative retreats.

Chapter 6 examines utopic privacy. In More's *Utopia*, Huebert discovers an exposed society where privacy is seen as encouraging abusive practices. He then examines Adam and Eve's bower in Milton's *Paradise Lost*. The Garden of Eden allows intimate privacy for a sexual relationship free from the sin of voyeurism.

Chapter 7 investigates if privacy protected early modern heterodoxy. Christopher Marlowe's *Edward II* reveals the king's desire for privacy to spend time alone with Piers Gaveston. Huebert then examines how Galileo's discovery of a heliocentric universe led to enforced privacy. John Donne's Roman Catholic background and public position as Anglican priest are scrutinized. His poetry published posthumously reveals he considered God's love universal, not subject to affiliation. Huebert establishes that early modern privacy meant cooperating superficially with authority through textual ambiguity.

Chapter 8 examines privacy in Andrew Marvell's poetry and prose. Huebert argues that Marvell needed privacy for his dubious erotic tastes, though he finds complexity in Marvell's poetry he terms 'the grammar of supposition and surmise', in which the poetic language creates speculative scenarios (p. 286). Marvell protects his privacy through his work having no definitive reading, except the pleasure of indulging in its fictions. Huebert concludes his study by reflecting on the elusive nature of privacy.

*Privacy in the Age of Shakespeare* is a convincing portrayal of early modern privacy. Aided by thorough research, Huebert provides meaningful examples. As such, the book has many standout moments. It also shows how privacy became a poetic and dramatic conceit.

FRANK SWANNACK, *University of Salford*

**Iurilli**, Antonio, *Quinto Orazio Flacco. Annali delle edizioni a stampa (secoli XV–XVIII)* (Travaux d'Humanisme et Renaissance, 574), 2 vols, Geneva, Droz, 2017; paperback; pp. 1540; 89 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. CHF148; ISBN 9782600047302.

More than ten years ago I reviewed Antonio Iurilli's fascinating *Orazio nella letteratura italiana. Commentatori, traduttori, editori italiani di Quinto Orazio Flacco dal XV al XVIII secolo* (Vecchiarelli Editore, 2004) in this journal (*Parergon*, 22.2, 2005). This new work, in which the subject has been expanded to a global scale, follows a similar pattern. Volume 1 contains a rich interpretative 'Introduction' and the bibliographical 'Annali', that is, a registry of 2372 items (see the 'Criteri di registrazione bibliografica', p. 307). This is divided into

the four centuries covered, each further subdivided by year, the last being 1800, with a final list of uncertain or not securely dated editions.

Volume 2 contains the bibliography and indexes. It is worth listing some of these last as they give a glimpse of the book's scope: '*Indice biografico degli autori secondari*'; '*Indice biografico degli editori, dei librai, dei tipografi*'; '*Indice dei luoghi di stampa*'; '*Indice per autore delle imitazioni, delle parafrasi, delle parodie, delle traduzioni*'; '*Indice per lingua nazionale delle traduzioni*'; '*Indice per autore delle edizioni musicali*'; '*Indice cronologico delle edizioni musicali*'. There is also a general index of names of persons and places and a list of illustrations. Some of the indexes provide summary results of the research. For example, the '*Indice cronologico delle edizioni musicali*' interestingly shows at a glance that the two most fecund periods for musical settings of Horace were the sixteenth century and the second half of the eighteenth century, there being none between 1607 and 1757 (for a comment see 1, 141). It takes a bit longer to peruse the '*Indice dei luoghi di stampa*' but that too generates insights into the spread of publishing (from Aboa, the old name for Turku, to Zwolle) and the dominance of some centres (London, Paris and Venice).

The heart of the book is in Volume 1. 'Introduction' is a bit of a misnomer for the nearly 300 pages, a book in itself, in which are discussed important aspects of the printing and reception history of Horace's works over four centuries. Iurilli's method is to follow the book: that is, he selects significant books from his chronological list, the '*Annali*', and discusses whatever it is that makes them important and interesting, weaving them together into themes. Each book so selected opens a window onto its intellectual and cultural context. Part 1, on the fifteenth century, deals mainly with Italy; the first complete edition of Horace north of the Alps did not appear until 1492 (p. 55) or 1498 (p. 79). Even so, of the fifty-four items that precede the 1492 edition in the combined list, about twenty come from northern Europe. A theme that unifies the sections on '*protoeditoria*' in Italy and north of the Alps is the return of Horace as a favoured lyric poet after the medieval preference for moralizing/didactic hexameter poems. Before this comes the fascinating treatment of 'Horatian "ghosts"', suitably starting the book with a look at the beginnings of the whole bibliographical enterprise.

With the sixteenth century other themes come to the fore: critical editions, commentaries other than Italian, translations (in Italy, France, England, the Netherlands, Hungary, Poland, Spain) and the French hegemony (Lambinus, Muret, and the Estienne family). Christophe Plantin took his Horatian interests to Antwerp, where he produced a number of editions in collaboration with noted scholars in the second half of the century. A substantial sub-section is devoted to the separate story of the *Ars poetica*, editions, versions and interpretations of which burgeoned from the beginning of the century. Lastly, the absence of literary translations in Germany finds

compensation in the number of musical versions there. Horace held his own in a different way with the advent of the Baroque and anti-classicism in the seventeenth century, particularly through lyric poetry. A new fashion for pastiches/parodies, especially in central Europe, warrants a sub-section, as do the printing firm Elzevier and the use of Horace (suitably expurgated) in schools.

One of the epigraphs to Iurilli's eighteenth century section reads: 'Horace is quoted in the Senate, at the Bar, in elegant Books, and in elegant Society' (I, 189). The eighteenth century, '*il secolo d'Orazio*', confronts us with an ever-more complex panorama of the responses to Horace in different cultural settings. Is he a moral exemplar, a libertine or a modern? Casanova's friend or the arbiter of taste? Giuseppe Baretti proposed Horace's 'harmonious verses' to the English musical public, and Pope's imitations of the *Satires* and *Epistles* answered to a shared appetite for such satiric adaptations. The century's watchword of taste extended to book production too: publishers (Baskerville, Didot, Bodoni) competed to produce 'the handsomest Horace'.

This book is a monument of patient, thorough and erudite scholarship. It will be of great value to anyone interested in the book as a transmitter of culture in the early modern, baroque and Enlightenment periods, both for the research it contains and for the further research it facilitates.

FRANCES MUECKE, *The University of Sydney*

**Kambasković**, Danijela, ed, *Conjunctions of Mind, Soul and Body from Plato to the Enlightenment* (Studies in the History of Philosophy of the Mind, 15) Heidelberg, Springer, 2014; hardback; pp. xviii, 421; 22 b/w images; R.R.P. €129,99 ; ISBN 978940179010.

*Conjunctions of Mind, Soul and Body from Plato to the Enlightenment* offers eighteen essays by both seasoned scholars and younger members of academe. They take historical perspectives on the relationship between the body and our more ethereal qualities. The foreword is written by Andrew Lynch, then Deputy Director of the Australian Research Council Centre for the History of Emotions, drawing attention to the importance of emotions as a framework for the contributors. The book is published within the Springer series on the history of the philosophy of the mind, which hopes to encompass a variety of disciplines in its intellectual peregrinations of the mind, being both historically accurate and accessible to the contemporary reader. I do not think many contemporary readers would read this volume cover to cover, due to the range of topics and periods addressed; however, there are so many excellent essays that it will be a volume referred to constantly.

The book is structured around four sections, each containing four to six essays. The first section, 'Text and Self-Perception', ranges from the eleventh century with an analysis of the body/soul nexus in the writings of

the Byzantine Michael Psellos (Graeme Miles) to post-Enlightenment, with a comparison of Renaissance and modern self-portraits (Richard Read). I was fascinated by the analysis of the first-person intrusions into a chronicle, read through a geopolitical context as a narrator solicits readers' pity (Alicia Marchant). The highlight of this section for me, however, was the essay by the late Philippa Maddern on why slander was considered as bad as murder in late medieval England; the basis for this was the importance of the soul as being more essential to our essence than our bodies. It is fitting that this book is dedicated to her memory.

The second section was on 'Emotion' and dealt with topics like tears (Michael W. Champion); mixed or conflicting emotions (R. S. White); the use of bodily memories to tap into emotions in persuading an audience (Daniel Derrin); and the relationship between music and love, especially in an educational setting (Katherine Wallace). Like the previous section, these essays traversed several centuries, ensuring excellent material for a variety of readers.

The largest section of the book is entitled 'Sex'. The opening essay takes us further back into history, presenting the nexus of bodies and souls in a Carolingian context (William Schipper). It is followed by an excellent essay on the conflicted status of Héloïse as a 'chaste whore' (Laura French) and then by an interpretation of the writings of Jean LeFèvre de Ressons (Karen Pratt) based on his use of humour: it is a detailed analysis of LeFèvre's approach to the body and soul across his works and in relation to contemporary texts. The medieval/scriptural ambivalence toward sex cannot be ignored in such a volume, and is tackled by Wim François as he approaches Paul, Augustine and Guilielmus Estius. A section dedicated to 'sex' also requires something on love, and the book's editor, Danijela Kambasković, asserts that love was allowed greater authority in the past; the renown of love poets like Dante and Petrarch is contrasted with the modern attachment to science and the lesser importance of desire for the 'process of creative endeavour' (p. 274).

In the final section, 'Material Souls', the idea of tears reappears as Manfred Horstmanshoff explores historic approaches to the physiology of crying. Thereafter, Kambasković offers a second essay, this time mapping the senses to varied emotions, using a Shakespearian lens. The final essay of the book fittingly discusses the idea of the material soul, with a focus on the eighteenth-century philosophic discourse on how the soul relates to various elements of the body.

This volume does not offer light reading, but each essay offers something to consider in the varied historical approaches to the fundamental aspect of being human. It would be an excellent book for dipping into, but this is hampered by the absence of an index. Structurally, the book works well, although there are some minor issues with editing. Beyond some minor

typographical errors, the introductory notes, which consistently refer to the essays by a chapter number, do not gel with how the essays are presented in the table of contents where each essay is listed without a chapter number. Nor are the chapter numbers used in the book. There is also an odd moment where an author's name is inserted into an essay in bold text when perhaps a subtitle was intended. These issues do not detract from the quality of the essays, which propose interesting perspectives on the human condition.

NATASHA AMENDOLA, *Monash University*

**Kerby-Fulton**, Kathryn, John J. **Thompson**, and Sarah **Baechle**, eds, *New Directions in Medieval Manuscript Studies and Reading Practices: Essays in Honor of Derek Pearsall*, Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 576; R.R.P. US\$66.00; ISBN 9780268033279.

In 2012, at the International Medieval Studies Congress in Kalamazoo, I accepted a lift to the annual Chaucer Review dinner with illustrious and highly appropriate company: Martha Driver was in the driver's seat; Derek Pearsall was giving directions. This was not my first meeting with Derek, but it was the perfect showcase of the intelligence, warmth, humour, and passion that often comes across in his writing and is still more striking on encountering him in person: my fellow passenger was preparing a translation of *Beowulf* into Turkish, which Derek quizzed him on so enthusiastically that his dedication to reaching our destination lapsed. The route we finally took to our destination may not have been the most direct, but the experience was as entertaining as it was educative.

Derek Pearsall's reputation as a scholar in the field of medieval English literary and manuscript studies is well established. This collection, edited by Kathryn Kerby-Fulton, John J. Thompson and Sarah Baechle, is the second assemblage of essays to have been published 'in honor' of Derek's work: the first was a collection titled *Middle English Poetry: Texts and Traditions*, edited by A. J. Minnis for York Medieval Press in 2001. The editors of this new collection have clearly attempted not only to do justice to Pearsall's long and important career, but to produce the definitive celebration of its achievements: in over 500 pages and 7 'parts', 24 chapters consider various aspects of medieval English literary studies, from Chaucer, Langland and Lydgate, to studies of manuscript culture and audience reception, both medieval and modern. Martha Driver's analytical portrait of 'Derek Pearsall, Secret Shakespearean', emphasizes the 'remarkable breadth' of Pearsall's knowledge, and pulls the reader into what he himself has long recognized as the inherent medievalness of Shakespeare's world. Chapters by A. C. Spearing, A. I. Doyle, Julia Boffey, A. S. G. Edwards, Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, Jill Mann, and others, further reinforce not only Pearsall's status within the field, but the volume's own contribution to it.

That this tome is intended not just as a celebration of Pearsall's career but as a contribution to the field whose current form he himself helped shape is clearly indicated in the 'new directions' of the title. In this sense, the book looks forward, at the same time as it looks back. Like any good *festschrift*, this balance between the idea of a legacy — and of what has been accomplished within a given individual's field — and the future — where the same field might now be headed — is carefully maintained. The names of more familiar and well established scholars — Susan Powell, Sarah McNamer, Carol M. Meale, to name but a few — appear alongside those of a next generation of critics. This is a book which is about influence: Pearsall's own influence on criticism in the field in general, but also his influence on individual scholars, their subjects, and their scholarly methods. It addresses some of the crucial issues with which students and researchers work, such as scribal and reception practices, including the copying and handling of specific manuscripts, as well as the legacy and influence of certain texts and authors on both the field and its objects.

A problem with the genre of *festschrift* writing is that it can tend to celebrate and perpetuate a particular intellectual and scholarly history uncritically, without reflecting on a field's gaps and inadequacies. *New Directions* clearly aims to respond to that concern with essays on very contemporary concerns in manuscript studies, including scribal and reading cultures, multilingualism, and various forms of medievalism and medievalist reception. While the collection still doesn't offer the reader a clear sense of where these 'new directions' might be headed, it represents succinctly enough how the field has reached its present state and emphasizes the many ways in which it has changed. Kerby-Fulton's reference to Pearsall in her Preface as a 'founding father' (p. xvii) may have a slightly fusty, if Chaucerian, ring; but she extends the metaphor — perhaps unwittingly — at the Preface's end, quoting the view of an anonymous reader that the present volume also showcases 'a whole new generation of manuscript scholars', whose contributions represent, in turn, a 'young[,] dynamic and developing field' (p. xix). Not unlike Pearsall's practical navigation skills, it is not entirely clear from the collection where these new directions will lead. But, given the quality and variety of the company, the reader's promise that the volume itself will be widely esteemed by established and emerging researchers alike — whether because or in spite of the long-standing esteem in which its dedicatee has been held — seems assured.

STEPHANIE DOWNES, *The University of Melbourne*

**Klápště**, Jan, *The Archaeology of Prague and the Medieval Czech Lands, 1100–1600* (Studies in the Archaeology of Medieval Europe), Sheffield, Equinox, 2016; cloth; pp. xviii, 254; 110 b/w illustrations, 29 colour plates; R.R.P. US\$ 110, £75.00; ISBN 9781845536336.

This groundbreaking study will attract those interested in the history, material culture, religion and archaeology of the Czech lands. The book avoids technical discourse with a specialist audience. For example, the author does not describe archaeological method. Instead, Klápště seeks to introduce the subject to a broad audience, and it should be noted that a synoptic survey does not exist for the subject or the period even in Czech. This makes this study particularly valuable. For the neophyte, the book defines the historic Czech lands as Bohemia, Moravia, and the southern part of historical Silesia. Today this is mainly in the Czech Republic.

Especially important for the general reader is an introductory essay delineating the context of the study, the history of the region, and the history of archaeology in Czech lands (p. 1–14). Klápště elaborates the archaeological dimensions by developing concise treatments of the rural milieu, secular power, the religious landscape (churches, monasteries, cemeteries), urban settlements, domestic issues related to heat and light, technology, crafts and industry, artefacts, communication and symbols. The book concludes with an overview of medieval archaeology present and future.

The reader may be interested to know that there are several thousand deserted medieval villages (DMVs) in the Czech lands forming essential context for understanding the rural milieu. Whereas these DMVs used to be thought of as ‘time capsules of medieval rural occupation’ (p. 20), Klápště adds considerable nuance pointing out that DMVs were not static but were products of long term development (p. 33). While archaeological work has revealed much of a vanished past, there are important areas of the Czech lands which have been irretrievably lost. Klápště underscores the negative impact of the protracted Hussite wars in the fifteenth century and the destruction of the medieval town of Most in the twentieth century as a result of opencast brown-coal mining. Parts of medieval Prague disappeared with the establishment of housing estates and new infrastructure.

Up until the end of the twentieth century, Czech archaeology was dominated by investigations into settlement sites with a fortification (i.e. stronghold). This approach has broadened in the past two decades. We learn that Prague castle was reconstructed in stone and that dendrochronology is important for dating the foundations of castles and towns. Archaeological discoveries indicate a weak ecclesiastical structure (p. 75), definite connections between the ‘worlds of the living and the dead’ (p. 79) and the certainty of Prague’s uniqueness (p. 143). Klápště reveals the details of the discovery of

a fortified *suburbia* below Prague castle unknown prior to 1994 spanning 25 hectares (p. 100).

Excavation finds at Most and contamination in wells and cesspits bring remnants of the murky past into the light of day. These include ceramic and wooden toys, decorated stove tiles, pilgrim shells from Santiago de Compostela, pottery, glassware, animal skeletons, and general household goods. Excavations of medieval wells provide evidence to explain disease. With the discovery of contamination associated with the eggs of intestinal parasites, causal connections between disease, epidemics and water supplies is underscored (p. 136). At Tábor, 3959 silver coins were found in two ceramic vessels under a floor (p. 141), while a cesspit in the same town yielded a wooden book cover, wooden seal boxes and a leather spectacles rim. At the important mining town of Kutná Hora, 51,000 fragments of fourteenth-century lamps, essential in the lucrative silver mines, have been unearthed. Conditions preventing the chemical destruction of glass were provided by the cesspits and filled-up wells (p. 179–84). Klápště argues for an unparalleled density of evidence for urban archaeology anywhere in Europe (p. 145).

The book draws attention to stove tiles as important items of Czech material culture. One can identify religious influence on the tiles (both Catholic and Hussite) and classical motifs can be found on Romanesque floor tiles featuring relief decoration. There are striking examples at Vyšehrad, the St Wenceslas rotunda in Prague, and the Ostrov monastery (p. 93–94). Inscriptions on several categories of artefacts reveal mirrored inscriptions of Emperor Nero in numerous churches and religious houses. The floor tiles appear to have been turned deliberately. The mirror inscriptions were not unintentional (p. 191–92).

Archaeology supplements textual-based historical inquiry. For example, excavations in the Czech lands provide evidence that faith was affected both by pre-Christian and contemporary influences. The several divisions of medieval archaeology bear this out (p. 209). Microhistory is enhanced by discoveries which explain how heating systems functioned in medieval dwellings, and this sheds valuable light on how people lived (p. 147). Further, in 1420 the town of Sezimovo Ústí abruptly ceased to exist. Written sources tell us why but archaeology reveals the particulars of the forgotten realities of life which once existed there.

This book not only states but demonstrates that preventative excavations are now *de rigueur* in the Czech lands. For those who do not read Czech, the bibliography (pp. 227–48) lists forty-six items relating to topics in English and the book features 139 useful figures. Jan Klápště has produced a study without antecedent or peer.

THOMAS A. FUDGE, *University of New England*

**Krafl**, Pavel, *Synody a statuta olomoucké diecéze období středověku / Medieval Synods and Statutes of the Diocese of Olomouc* (Series B Editiones, 10), 2nd edn, Prague, The Institute of History of the Czech Academy of Sciences, 2014; hardback; pp. 435; 14 tables; R.R.P. CZK210; ISBN 9788072862207.

When, in 1349, the efforts of Emperor Charles IV were finally rewarded and Prague, his capital, was at last raised to the status of archbishopric, the neighbouring Moravian diocese of Olomouc, hitherto part of the Mainz province, came within the embrace of the newly established Prague Province. The Bishop of Olomouc became suffragan to the Metropolitan. Papal bestowal of archiepiscopal status set in train a process of administrative consolidation and ecclesiastical control emanating from Prague throughout the new province. The most obvious evidence of this were the bi-annual synodial deliberations. They proved to be short-lived, though, put paid to by the upheavals associated with the Hussite revolution. Authorities within the Olomouc diocese, however, were not easily deterred. Right through to the end of the fifteenth century, they continued to hold synods, albeit irregularly, that addressed a wide range of issues of concern to the Church in Moravia and the adjoining Czech-controlled Silesian territories to the north-west.

The volume at hand is an expanded, lightly revised edition of Pavel Krafl's publication of the same title which appeared in a small print run in 2003. The main changes are to be found in the chapter on legatine and provincial statutes, the cataloguing of those statutes, and the inclusion of three chapters in English: 'Medieval Synods of the Diocese of Olomouc', 'Medieval Statutes of the Olomouc Diocese. Review and Comprehensible Description', and 'Manuscripts with Copies of Moravian Statutes and the Usage of the Statutes'. Readers may have come across an earlier combined translation of these chapters that appeared in a collection entitled *Partikularsynoden im späten Mittelalter* (ed. by Nathalie Kruppa and Leszek Zyger, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2006).

The balance of the book remains essentially the same: catalogues of legatine and provincial statutes, lists of medieval synods, statutes, manuscripts and manuscript references to statutes, and a fully annotated diplomatic edition of extant statutes (ten in total covering the period 1253–1498) together with six documents directly pertinent to them (1386–1498). Preceding the catalogues is a 120-page monograph reviewing the literature on synods and synodical legislation in East-Central Europe, and covering canon law in Moravia, legatine and provincial statutes and medieval synods in Litomyšl, Wrocław and Prague, in addition to the Czech version of the aforementioned chapters in translation.

One of the great strengths of this handsome edition is the extensive critical apparatus that makes the material readily accessible to those without

a knowledge of Czech. The bibliography of printed editions and secondary literature runs to twenty-eight pages and includes no fewer than forty-eight items by Krafl himself, attesting to his command of every aspect of this material. There is an extensive subject-person-place index and a detailed thematic-topical catalogue for the critical edition. The subject entry on clerical behaviour, for example (*de vita et honestate clericorum*), takes us to the specific paragraph appearing in both the 1349 and 1413 statutes. Textual annotations then distinguish which reading is preferred from the multiple available sources (manuscript and printed) transmitting this paragraph. If we wish to find more general coverage of clerical respectability, we can turn to the index under ‘*honestas clericorum, clericalis*’ and there we find an additional five references to this topic across another sixteen documents in the edition.

Equally as impressive as his scrupulously prepared critical edition are Krafl’s detailed cross-referencing and emendations of the many (error-strewn) pre-existing published editions of this material, many of which date from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. In every respect, Krafl’s monograph and edition is a splendid publication, to be welcomed afresh in its revised edition.

ROBERT CURRY, *The University of Sydney*

**Kreiner, Jamie, and Helmut Reimitz**, eds, *Motions of Late Antiquity: Essays on Religion, Politics, and Society in Honour of Peter Brown* (Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages, 20), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; pp. x, 353; 2 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503549118.

It has been nearly fifty years since the publication of Peter Brown’s trailblazing *The World of Late Antiquity* (1971). It is fair to say that this work — which emphasized cultural germination in a period (200–800) long remembered for decay — played an essential part in establishing late antiquity as its own unique historical epoch. Yet, late antiquity has experienced some recent growing pains. Detractors have countered Brown’s more optimistic vision of the break-up of the Western Roman Empire. Establishing clear spatial and temporal boundaries for the field also continues to spark debate. Into this contested arena arrives a second *festschrift* for Brown. Based on a conference held at Princeton to honour Brown in 2011, the seventeen essays in this volume offer readers keen insights into an assortment of regions, time-periods, and methodological approaches.

Following an Introduction by the editors recounting Brown’s vast contributions to the field, the opening chapters respond to some of the criticisms discussed above. Ian Wood maintains that late antique scholars should focus less on the ‘creation’ of modern Europe, and take a global approach by turning their attentions eastward to developments in Byzantium,

Persia and the Muslim world. Leaning heavily upon Brown's *Through the Eye of the Needle*, Walter Pohl downplays the economic and political ramifications of 'Rome's fall', positing instead that economic decline and social transformation in the period is better explained by shifting attitudes amongst Roman and non-Roman Christians towards wealth. In the post-imperial West, money flowed away from the secular elites and into the coffers of a Church more interested in salvation than finance.

As is to be expected in a volume dedicated to Brown, numerous contributions deal with late antique religions. Philippa Townsend uses Brown's *The Body and Society* as a pivot to question the standard contention that the Manichaeans' cosmological dualism was matched by their 'social dualism'. Utilizing the fifth-century *Life of Hypatius* by Callinicus as a window into late antique views on class, Jaclyn Maxwell scrutinizes the author's attitudes towards a wide social spectrum of guests who visited his rural monastery. Callinicus, Maxwell concludes, did not favour rich or poor, but judged people as distinct individuals. Daniel Schwartz uncovers a similarly even-handed approach in his source, the metrical homily *On the Fall of Idols* by Jacob of Sarug (c. 451–521). Schwartz concludes that Jacob preferred 'persuasive and moral approaches to Christianization', rather than the violent approach frequently condoned by more rigorous Christians. Volker Menz, however, focuses on the more violent *Vita* of the mid fifth-century presbyter and Miaphysite, Barsuma. As a member of a threatened sect, the author of the life was far less interested in presenting Barsuma as a converter of 'Jews, pagans, and Samaritans, but as someone who purified the Holy Land by eliminating his enemies' (p. 244). David Michelson resituates the Syriac writings of the late fifth-century Roman Monophysite Philoxenos of Mabbug within an older tradition of Cappadocian theologians. Ariel López applies modern knowledge about the Nile's seasonal currents and flooding patterns to shed light on the core 'truths' concerning voyages, famine and premature death to be found in late antique Egyptian hagiography.

Michael Maas turns to the complicated rivalry between two late antique agrarian empires, Byzantium and Persia. Rather than highlight discord, Maas examines instead three cases of potential collaboration. Bucking standard consensus, he takes seriously the mid sixth-century Byzantine historian Procopius's claim that the Roman emperor Arcadius (r. 395–408) had on his deathbed asked the Persian emperor Yazdgerd I (r. 399–420) to act as guardian for his young son, Theodosius II (r. 408–450).

Several chapters examine the shadowy rise of post-imperial worlds in the East and the West. Drawing on a letter by Sidonius Apollinaris (476) and a later inscription from a lesser-known bishop, Zeno of Mérida (483), Damián Fernández highlights how these authors' portraits of the Visigothic king Euric (c. 440–478) offer insights into these authors' attitudes towards the Eurican monarchy, but, just as importantly, offer glimpses of how Euric and his

backers saw themselves in a post-Roman Iberia. Philip Rousseau posits that while Gregory of Tours inhabited a ‘new’ age, his thought-world and moral compass — both as a historian and as a bishop — remained firmly rooted in the ‘ancient practices and edifices’ of a vanished Roman world. Shifting to the late antique Muslim East, Jack Tannous’s chapter on the *Life of Simeon of the Olives* (c. 750) highlights the difficulties of uncovering accurate details about Christians living under Muslim rule when our sources are limited and defective. Yannis Papadogiannakis, on the other hand, sees in the seventh-century *erotapokriseis* by Anastasius of Sinai a revealing day-to-day guidebook for Christians in a freshly Muslim world. Stefan Elders argues provocatively that Amandus of Maastricht’s (c. 584–676) missionary activity in the region of Ghent in the 620s and 630s must be understood from the wider vantage of late antique politics at a time when the Merovingian and Byzantine courts allied. Stressing the similarities between Amandus’s forced baptisms with East Roman imperial tradition, Elders proposes that the missionary worked under the auspices of the Merovingian king Dagobert I (r. 623–638), rather than the papacy in Rome as is commonly supposed. Janet Nelson concludes the study by revisiting the contested notion of a Carolingian renaissance through the historiographical lens of law.

Overall, the disparate approaches found in this stimulating volume reveal the fresh perspectives that late antique scholars can offer. Yet, their somewhat disjointed vision of the age also points to some continuing challenges. This study clearly exhibits Peter Brown’s unique gifts as a linguist, writer, and historian. Some of late antiquity’s current malaise may indeed be attributed to the difficulty for the new guard to match Brown’s brilliance as both a synthesizer and story-teller.

MICHAEL EDWARD STEWART, *University of Queensland*

**LaGuardia**, David P., and Cathy **Yandell**, eds, *Memory and Community in Sixteenth-Century France*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. xiii, 267; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781472453372.

This substantial volume brings together both new and leading literary specialists of sixteenth-century France to consider questions of memory and community. They skilfully apply innovative reading strategies to poems, essays, prose works, trial records, letters, and memoirs. There are now strong historiographies attached both to early modern communities, their formation and practices, and to early modern memory cultures and their consequences. Disappointingly, however, the introduction says little about the intellectual impetus for the collection in the context of that wider literature or about this volume’s contribution to forging new lines of enquiry. Yet the collection as a whole does contribute. The intellectual quality of the essays is consistently high and they offer many new insights and interpretative techniques that might

fruitfully be applied to further sources. The essays demonstrate the relational authorial subjectivities of writers whose diverse acts of remembering and forgetting were constituted through identities forged in, and responding to, concepts and practices of community.

David LaGuardia's chapter opens the collection with an analysis of the significance of politically-situated memory in epistolary practices, with a case study of texts exchanged, described, and discovered between Catherine de' Medici and Jeanne d'Albret. Brooke Di Lauro explores counterpoints of remembering and forgetting of the beloved in Maurice Scève's *Délie*, through which the poet constructs his sense of self and his creative process.

Amy C. Graves-Munroe investigates the creation of traumatic sonic geographies through memories of weaponized sound in martyrologies by Bèze, Crespin and Goulart. In exploring Jean de Léry's history of the siege of Sancerre of 1573 and incidents of cannibalism experienced there, Hope Glidden argues that Léry, who had himself experienced the trauma of starvation while returning from Brazil, attempts to reframe anthropophagy neutrally in terms of legal necessity. Kathleen P. Long's focused examination of memory and narrative techniques in Aubigné's history-writing practices demonstrates how he supplemented a highly personal account with the memorial authority of his father's anecdotes. Andrea Frisch continues the focus on Aubigné through analysis of the demands made of readers of his *Les Tragiques* to be engaged witnesses whose act of remembering kept shocking acts alive and present for subsequent generations.

George Hoffman reads satirical compilations by Bèze and Goulart to explore how these practices of communication transformed Huguenot ideas of a close community to a more abstract, imagined cohort of believers who were connected through shared reading material. Dora Polachek argues for another community forged through literature, assessing Pierre de Brantôme's select remembering of the religious life of Marguerite de Navarre in the *Dames illustres*, in order to ensure her memory as a pious Catholic.

Nicolas Russell analyses ideas of community in Louis Le Roy's colossal project to document a history of the world, which in practice retained the collective memory of elites whose knowledge was deemed worthy to subsequent generations, and which was safeguarded by a series of sophisticated, active (and activating) mnemonic techniques. Elisabeth Hodges, studying Montaigne, offers a complex interpretation of the writer's distinction between not forgetting and remembering as a corporeal process involving the senses and/in the construction of the self.

Marian Rothstein returns to Louis Le Roy with an analysis of his translation of Plato's *Symposium*, arguing that processes of selective memory are operative in an attempt to situate the text's meanings appropriately for its intended dedicatees, the dauphin François and his wife, Mary Queen of Scots, so that the pagan text could transmit Christian truths. Cathy Yandell

reprises a focus on cannibalism and meanings of family and community in her study of Jean de Léry's history of his voyage to Brazil, in which he forced readers to compare practices across time and place, from Catholic eating of the Eucharist and the anthropophagy of varied Brazilian tribes to ancient Roman sacrifices.

Marcus Keller reads meanings of national identity through Pierre de Ronsard's discourse on the miseries of the age. Here, the Catholic poet created a particular and personal notion of 'French' that was dependent on attachment to homelands, a faculty for remembrance he did not attribute to Huguenots. His own notion of cultural memory and history was constructed by and for Ronsard. Virginia Krause closes the collection with a reprinted essay that examines processes of memory of victims and witnesses, and the subjective and commemorative capacity of witches in their words and bodies, as seen through the records of a trial that took place at Sancerre in 1582–83.

These rich and complex essays demand and reward careful scrutiny. Some are far more sharply focused on one or both topics than are others, but key themes emerge across the whole. The purposeful memorial practices of minority Huguenot communities emerge far more visibly than do those of the dominant Catholic population. However, horrific moments of anguish and distress clearly generated many of the accounts studied here and were a significant influence on the memory- and community-formation practices forged in this century.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

**Lake, Peter, *Bad Queen Bess? Libels, Secret Histories, and the Politics of Publicity in the Reign of Queen Elizabeth I*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016; hardback; pp. 512; R.R.P. £35.00; ISBN 9780198753995.**

Peter Lake argues that *Bad Queen Bess?* fills a neglected historical gap by focusing on Catholic propaganda in the Elizabethan period. Key historical moments are given renewed significance through the dialogue between Catholic dissenters and the Elizabethan government.

Chapters 1 to 3 analyse the defence and condemnation of Mary Queen of Scots. Lake reveals in a narrative by John Leslie a predicted marriage between the Duke of Norfolk and Mary. When the marriage negotiations failed, the Northern Earls revolted. Lake analyses the response to the rebellion in Thomas Norton's pamphlets. Initially defending Queen Elizabeth from evil Catholics, Norton calls for the queen to act against the Duke of Norfolk and Mary. With the Ridolfi conspiracy seeking to replace Elizabeth with Mary, Lake notes how pamphlet activity increased. Although these pamphlets claim to officially represent the Catholics or Queen Elizabeth, Lake finds them nothing more than spurious gossip. Furthermore, their various authors use print to create a version of events that appealed to popular fantasies. Despite the threat to

Elizabeth from Mary, the Spanish and the Scots, Lake remarks that she is still queen in 1572. By then a Marian conspiracy is being spread claiming that the Queen of Scots is set on world domination. Meanwhile a Catholic treatise pushes anti-monarchical plotting within Elizabeth's government, claiming Mary's condemnation is simply part of a strategy by the queen's closest aides to stop Queen Elizabeth marrying, then replace her with a king.

Chapters 4 to 6 tackle Queen Elizabeth's proposed marriage to the duke of Anjou. Catholic propaganda presented a successful marriage to Anjou, and a treaty between Mary and Elizabeth. Lake also examines John Stubbs's concern in *The Gaping Gulf* that if Elizabeth married Anjou she might die in childbirth with her baby. Lake comments that the marriage became 'an assassination attempt by gynaecological means' (p. 101). Furthermore, Stubbs's apparent paranoia extended to Anjou marrying Mary following Elizabeth's death. Lord Henry Howard pens the Catholic response. Lake remarks Howard uses similar arguments to Stubbs, though Howard casts suspicion on those who oppose the marriage. Lake then considers the Catholic tract *Leicester's Commonwealth* as exemplary political writing in a battle for truth. It reimagines the Anjou marriage as solving all of England's problems both at home and abroad.

Chapters 7 to 9 investigate 'monarchical republicanism' (p. 155), a response to Catholic criticism of the Elizabethan counsellors who plotted England's future without the queen's assent or even knowledge. Lake argues persuasively that both sides endeavoured to make a distinction between religion and politics. He states that recognizing and not blurring that distinction gave the arguments for each side the greater authenticity. Lake investigates the Catholic spy Dr William Parry. His apparent plot to kill the queen allowed the government to insist that tolerating Catholics placed Elizabeth's safety at risk. Lake then examines two texts that respond to John Leslie's defence of Mary. These texts confirm Lake's argument that the Elizabethan government's actions are largely influenced by Catholic activity.

Chapters 10 and 11 examine pamphlets published in 1585. Lake notes these texts begin a genre of ostensibly translated works ventriloquizing the opposition. Within these tracts, Lake identifies the new discursive strategy he terms 'the trope of the whistleblower' (p. 236). Edward Rishton's continuation of the staunch Catholic Robert Parson's historical narrative of the English Reformation is evaluated. Lake identifies that previous arguments in Catholic tracts are rehashed in response to changing contemporary circumstances.

Lake deals with Mary's execution and its aftermath in Chapters 12 and 13. He shows how Elizabeth is eventually convinced to deal directly with Mary. God's judgement and her long-suffering Protestant subjects are used to bend the queen's ear. Lake also reveals in Elizabeth's first speech at Richmond how she is aware of the libellous texts criticizing her and the government. The final four chapters chart how, in the 1590s, English Catholic tracts re-emphasized the distinction between religion and politics.

*Bad Queen Bess?* is an important study revealing the extremes of Elizabethan religious and political debate. With a satirical tone, Lake demonstrates successfully how Catholic propaganda helped shaped the Elizabethan political and religious landscape. My main criticism is that the book is overlong. Although well researched, much of the material simply links quotes reiterating previous points. Furthermore, Lake's commentary is often over-zealous. The book could have been condensed into a more succinct read. Despite these concerns, *Bad Queen Bess?* is essential towards an understanding of the Elizabethan period. It will appeal to undergraduates and academics interested in early modern religion and politics.

FRANK SWANNACK, *University of Salford*

**Lochrie**, Karma, *Nowhere in the Middle Ages* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016; cloth; pp. 280; 4 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £42.50; ISBN 9780812248111.

*Nowhere in the Middle Ages* begins with the premise that modern scholars believe that Thomas More's *Utopia* emerged from nowhere and that utopianism was the pure invention of More. In other words it had no past and the conception of utopianism, except for the medieval idea of New Jerusalem, did not exist before the early sixteenth century. Lochrie states that the boundaries of utopian studies in modern scholarship have been limited by this lack of a past for *Utopia*, and sets out to demonstrate that utopianism was 'somewhere' in the Middle Ages.

Instead of looking backwards from More to the Middle Ages Lochrie reads forward from the medieval utopian texts to More's *Utopia*. To establish the existence of utopian thought in the Middle Ages she believes that there is a need to establish a set of historical and theoretical questions other than those that are traditionally set for the study of utopianism after the sixteenth century. In short, there is a need to set new parameters to define utopianism. She first establishes four principles: (1) there is no need for utopianism to be concerned with the ideal society or a place; (2) it is not to be restricted to a single expression or genre, (3) it must be perceived to be located in productive dialogue with More's *Utopia*; and (4) the texts that she has chosen in this monograph are not intended to be exhaustive of medieval utopianism.

The main body of the monograph consists of five chapters, the first four looking at different aspects of utopianism from the Middle Ages and the last revealing how these aspects are embodied in More's text. Chapter 1 examines Cicero's *Dream of Scipio*, as known through Macrobius's *Commentary*, and Kepler's *Somnium*. Both of these texts involve travelling through other worlds, lunar and celestial, but neither defines a social blueprint for reform. After his death Scipio travels the celestial spheres and reflects back at the Earth. *The Dream of Scipio* offers the 'capacious philosophical parameters

for a cosmographic perspective on humanity's place in the world and the ethical placement' (p. 17). In a footnote Kepler states that he had Macrobius in mind when writing in *Somnium* of travels to an island named Levania (the moon). Both texts might or might not actually have a 'place'. Both texts share a utopian optic which stimulates philosophical and self-reflection that resemble scientific principles of cosmology. The texts should be considered as being utopianist without Utopia. Chapter 2 considers the fourteenth-century Middle English version of *The Land of Cokaygne* and the early thirteenth-century French version *Le fabliau de Cocagne*. The land is an island defined by its abundance of food, drink, leisure, and the absence of work. There is no need for class disparities and the island is dedicated to pleasure. Lochrie demonstrates how enduring the concepts in *The Land of Cokaygne* are and remain a point of focus in the twentieth century. Chapter 3 examines the fourteenth-century text *Mandeville's Travels*, a travel story of the journey from Europe to Jerusalem and into Asia, and it considers the monstrous people and practices of the East. It acts as a mirror to invert worlds yet remains intact. It aspires to utopian possibilities in society. Chapter 4 considers William Langland's fourteenth-century poem *Piers Plowman* as describing a quest for the true Christian life. Its utopianism lies in its consciousness that embraces a social form of collective will. Chapter 5 reveals how these texts are related to *Utopia*.

Many Utopian scholars may be surprised at the initial premise of *Nowhere in the Middle Ages* that *Utopia* has no past. More was a humanist and most definitely was more interested in reviving ancient Greek and Roman thought, but he did not turn his back on medieval scholarship. More worked with Erasmus on his translations of the Greek satirist Lucian, which had a profound effect on *Utopia*. The revival of ancient texts was significant to him. More was very familiar with Cicero's *Republic* and *The Dream of Scipio*, and there are over fifty possible references and allusions to Cicero in More's *Utopia*. Plato was an important influence to More not only through the *Republic* but also in *Timaeus* and *Critias*. The Neoplatonist Plotinus's *Enneads* were carried through into the Middle Ages by Augustine of Hippo and Pseudo-Dionysius, increasing in popularity throughout the period. Virgil and Hesiod also incorporated concepts of 'utopianism' and were highly influential in the Middle Ages. Thomas More's philosophy on pleasure as betrayed in *Utopia* is an amalgamation of the views of Stoic and Epicurean tradition. All these works and traditions and many others were carried through into the 'utopianism' of the Middle Ages.

Notwithstanding these ancient precedents, in *Nowhere in the Middle Ages* Lochrie has given the utopianism of the Middle Ages no past. She attempts to redefine the 'utopianism' of the Middle Ages as an invention of the period; however, no satisfactory definition is established. Nevertheless there

is some interesting discussion on the medieval texts cited above and their later influence.

TESSA MORRISON, *The University of Newcastle*

**McGavin, John J., and Greg Walker**, *Imagining Spectatorship: From the Mysteries to the Shakespearean Stage* (Oxford Textual Perspectives), Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016; paperback; pp. 224; R.R.P. £18.99; ISBN 9780198768623.

John McGavin's and Greg Walker's *Imagining Spectatorship*, from the Oxford Textual Perspectives series, presents a novel approach to the subject of medieval and early modern theatrics. Building on the recent scholarship surrounding the 'cognitive turn' in theatrical reception, and the work of academics such as Gary Taylor, Bruce McConachie, and Guy McAuley in addressing notions of spectatorship, this text seeks to further explore the physical and cultural conditions under which dramatic and theatrical performances were witnessed. McGavin and Walker identify a gap in the scholarship concerning the experiences of the spectator and the relationship that the 'two aspects of affect and space' (p. 4) played in shaping this experience. The primary contention of *Imagining Spectatorship* is that by considering these aspects in relation to cognitive theory methodologies, new insights into the spectatorial experiences of the past can be made.

*Imagining Spectatorship* is conscious of its own historical and theoretical challenges as it presents 'speculation and imagination' (p. 42) as necessary analytical tools. The lack of tangible historical evidence for audience responses emerges as a considerable issue, so McGavin and Walker are forced to implement a more theoretical approach. Indeed, one of the motivations of this study is to offer alternative routes in which to understand medieval and early modern spectatorship. The authors thus attempt to explore audience activity through the lens of cognitive theory and the behavioural sciences, embedding these approaches within a larger framework of spectator and performance methodologies. McGavin and Walker acknowledge that this theoretical approach cannot totally capture the many complexities of theatrical spectatorship, or the experiences of individual audience members, but posit that this method is one possible means in which to overcome the scarcity of source material.

This text presents a number of case studies, emphasizing different theatrical forms and the spectator responses that they elicited over the space of 150 years. The focus of *Imagining Spectatorship* is quite broad in this regard, with McGavin and Walker attempting to present overarching commonalities in spectator experiences during this period. Their case studies range from morality plays, to pageants, tourneys, street processions, and more conventional forms of scripted drama. Furthermore, this text is not

only concerned with the playhouses of this period but also with the manorial halls, palaces, and city streets where public spectacles were held. Each of these locations held its own unique spatial configuration and social tradition, shaping the responses of the audience. It is in these case studies that the strengths of this text's methodology are really illustrated, demonstrating that the lack of personal testimony for this period can be addressed through the careful application of critical and cognitive theory.

McGavin and Walker construct the spectator — either real or imagined — as active participants in the dramatic process. This characterization leads into one of the core themes of this study: the symbiotic relationship between playwright, actor, and audience, within the performative space of the 'theatre'. Within this space, the players and audience interacted in unique ways, shaped by the spatial and socio-economic characteristics of the playhouse, manor hall, or street where this drama was taking place. These interactions are also tempered by how playwrights 'variously imagined, pre-empted, and constructed' (p. 69) their audience. *Imagining Spectatorship* highlights how playwrights wrote drama in anticipation of audience reaction, reversing the usual focus of the scholarship by illustrating the spectator's influence on the construction of drama. McGavin and Walker thus attribute far more mobility to the spectator than has traditionally been the case, further posing questions to the current scholarship.

While the efficacy of this cognitive theoretical approach to early modern spectatorship is consistently demonstrated, it is in the last case study where this text encounters some complications. In this final chapter, McGavin and Walker shift their analysis to their own personal experiences in an attempt to join their 'spectatorship with that of sixteenth-century witnesses' (p. 147), reflecting on their engagement with the 2014 theatrical production of the 1552 *A Satire of the Three Estates*, staged in the grounds of Linlithgow Palace, Scotland. The primary issue with this chapter is that its inclusion in this study is not exactly justified. Throughout this text, McGavin and Walker emphasize just how important cultural and contextual factors are to the experiences of spectators, yet still attempt to present clear links between modern and past audiences. While this chapter was indeed interesting, it was poorer in quality than the preceding case studies in *Imagining Spectatorship*.

*Imagining Spectatorship* amounts to an innovative contribution to the scholarship on medieval and early modern theatrics. McGavin's and Walker's use of cognitive science within a broader framework of cultural, historical, and spatial theoretical methodologies allows us to gain further insight into a particular historical experience that has largely been inaccessible up until now. The critique of the cognitive turn in theatrical studies is also well-measured, offering challenges to the current trends of this scholarship. Like all exemplary critical studies, *Imagining Spectatorship* opens up a number of

possible theoretical approaches, prompting further work to be undertaken in this area.

BRENDAN WALSH, *University of Queensland*

**Meylan**, Nicolas, *Magic and Kingship in Medieval Iceland: The Construction of a Discourse of Political Resistance* (Studies in Viking and Medieval Scandinavia, 3), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. x, 233; 1 b/w table; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503551579.

Nicolas Meylan's first monograph is intriguingly titled: settled in the late ninth and early tenth centuries, medieval Iceland was famously king-less, administered instead by a chieftaincy and legal system that allows its current parliament, the Alþingi, to claim status as the oldest in the world. Almost as famously, however, Iceland was of interest to a series of Norwegian monarchs, leading to its acceptance of Hákon Hákonarson of Norway as king across the water in 1262–64. This thirteenth- and early fourteenth-century political situation provides the context for Meylan's study, which argues that magic, 'mobilized narratively', gave Icelanders 'the power to rival a king' (p. 4).

Meylan is quick and clear to point out that this magic 'was not put into actual practice but remained a purely textual phenomenon' (p. 4). He is not looking at evidence for rituals, then, but at how magic was used discursively to demonstrate and explore (rather than actually achieve) particular outcomes. As well as providing a review of scholarship and introducing the sources, Chapter 1, 'Theorizing Magic', explains the choice of the Modern English word 'magic' as a convenient umbrella term and defines it inclusively as 'a socially constructed object of knowledge, actualized as a set of discourses that predicates powers and knowledges construed as extraordinary and illegitimate on particular individuals' (p. 18). To counter the risks of anachronism or generalization that these choices entail, Chapter 2 is dedicated to an examination of vernacular words for concepts and phenomena covered by the study, including terms commonly translated as 'magic' or 'witchcraft' such as *ffjólkyngi*, *fordæða*, *trolldom*, *galdr*, *gandr*, and *seiðr*. This is a very useful survey, though as Meylan notes, the use of these words in Christian-era texts tends to be vague and interchangeable.

Chapters 3 and 4 present two alternative 'discourses' of magic: as invective and as power respectively. Chapter 3 highlights the moral condemnation that accompanies magic, and traces the various social outsiders associated with it. Inside Iceland, Meylan argues that laws against magic favoured the social elite, consolidating and protecting the status quo. Turning to the Norwegian court, he analyses passages from kings' sagas to suggest that magic could be used to explain away failure while 'recod[ing] successful opponents as dangerous and antisocial troublemakers' (pp. 90–91). Chapter 4 tackles the problem that despite the textual opprobrium of pagan magic, there are instances where

forms of magic seem to be used by saga heroes for positive ends. Meylan suggests magic could be seen as a desirable means to power, albeit within a pagan context, in texts like *Hávamál*, and is redefined as an *íþrótt* (skill) free of religious connotations in texts like *Ynglinga saga* and *Qrvar-Odds saga*, in the latter of which it sits comfortably beside explicitly Christian behaviour. Here the argument begins to emerge that ‘the foregrounding of magic used to create a new, desirable socio-political order at the expense of powerful leaders [...] may reflect the preoccupations of [...] the text-producing elite, faced with a social order that did not satisfy them [...] and which did not allow them access to [...] means such as military force to do something about it’ (p. 122).

The scene thus set, Chapters 5 and 6 focus on the key hypothesis that magic gave ‘disenfranchised Icelanders’ (p. 123) a way of dealing with Norwegian kings. Chapter 5 examines *Snorra Edda*, *Egils saga*, and *Þorleifs þáttr jarlsskálds*. Meylan suggests these texts create circumstances where magic is acceptable — outside Iceland, for one, and when ‘the king stops behaving according to custom and law’ (p. 154). Chapter 6 analyses the L-version of the saga of native Icelandic St Jón, who resurrects a man wrongfully hanged by the Norwegian king. Meylan draws compelling parallels between the depiction of the miracle in *Jóns saga* and depictions of magic elsewhere.

This book is a welcome addition to scholarship of early Scandinavian magic for its focus on understanding textual sources in their thirteenth- and fourteenth-century context rather than trying to uncover actual practices. The first part of the book, Chapters 1 to 4, is perhaps more successful than the second, where I find the argument somewhat overstated. The premise of widely-held ‘Icelandic interests’ (p. 166) could be further interrogated, and the notion that the Icelandic elite rewrote magic as a source of power ‘in order to convince themselves that, should they choose to do something about it, they had the means at their disposal’ (p. 193) feels unsatisfactory: it seems a lot of effort to go to for something that could not be actually acted upon. Nonetheless, the book is filled with interesting close analyses and solid scholarship that should prove useful to historians of religion and textual scholars alike.

HANNAH BURROWS, *University of Aberdeen*

**Mooney**, Catherine M., *Clare of Assisi and the Thirteenth-Century Church: Religious Women, Rules, and Resistance* (Middle Ages), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016; cloth; pp. 312; 2 b/w illustrations, 2 tables; R.R.P. US\$65.00, £56.00; ISBN 9780812248173.

Many have been the attempts to penetrate the mists of misunderstanding and confusion surrounding the origins of the Franciscan women’s order since Herbert Grundmann’s pioneering work in the mid-1930s. Over the past

decade, research into the Clarist order has never been livelier, but whatever the new interpretative insights, the fundamental questions addressed by Catherine Mooney inevitably crop up, one way or another. As it happens, the appearance of her carefully argued monograph coincides with the publication of a (complementary) detailed archival study by Olga Miriam Przybyłowicz: *Reguła zakonna jest wozem do nieba* [*The Order's Rule is the Vehicle to Heaven*] (Instytut Archeologii i Etnologii PAN, 2016), and both works come on the heels of major contributions by Lezlie Knox and Bert Roest. The titles of the latter's books — *Creating Clare of Assisi* (Brill, 2008) and *Order and Disorder* (Brill, 2013) — allude to the sort of historiographic challenges that await the reader of the book under review.

Mooney proceeds chronologically, and necessarily so. She sets herself the task of investigating every skerrick of factual information, every hue of received interpretation, to scrutinize afresh the process whereby the pious aspirations of young Chiara Offreduccio to follow the charismatic preacher, Francis of Assisi, led to her being styled his female correlate, a founder of a religious order and author of one of its rules. In this forensic undertaking Mooney seeks to 'illuminat[e] a larger landscape including Francis of Assisi's Order of Lesser Brothers, Clare's community of San Damiano, and, importantly, penitent and religious women beyond San Damiano engaged in similar struggles to retain features of their religious life threatened by papal regularization' (p. 212). She brings to the task a refreshing scepticism and scrupulous objectivity. From material that has been gone over and over, she teases out overlooked details and identifies as speculative many points that, for generations, have gone unchallenged as fact. Even giants in Franciscan scholarship like Luke Wadding and the erudite Vatican savant, Giuseppe Cozza-Luzi, were not impervious to subliminal biases swaying the accuracy of their readings.

Of particular note is the new light Mooney sheds (Chapter 7) on one of the most puzzling episodes in the Clarist story, namely, Innocent IV's ill-fated *forma vitae* that he intended should sweep away the confusion abounding from numerous dispensations granted to the rule by his predecessor, Gregory IX. What Innocent IV promulgated on 6 August 1247, he torpedoed less than three years later on 6 June 1250. Charged with the responsibility of overseeing the implementation of this new *forma vitae* was the order's cardinal protector and future pope, Rainaldo of Jenne. Mooney draws attention to a document dated 17 July 1250, addressed to the abbess and sisters of Ascoli Piceno (Latin text reproduced as Appendix B), which exposes Rainaldo's duplicity. '[His] lengthy no-holds-barred letter, in contrast to the silence of Clare of Assisi and the — to date — more cryptic complaints of some sisters in the order, suggests that the most adamant and effective opponent of Innocent IV's *forma vitae* was the cardinal protector himself' (p. 160).

Occasionally, we get a glimpse of the slippage between ideal and reality — Mooney touches on it lightly in an extended footnote (p. 246 n. 57). No less real than the strictures of the rule was the capacity of some houses for conceptual sleight-of-hand. Cases in point are the manifestly rich Clarist double-monasteries like those of the Bohemian Přemyslid princesses, Agnes and Anna (Prague, 1233; Wrocław, 1257). These foundations were able to follow Clare's rule with its uncompromising commitment to *altissima paupertatis* by having their physical needs provided for by an adjoining hospital, control over which was vested in the Knights Crosier of the Red Star, an order the Přemyslids founded specifically for the purpose. One thing for sure, whatever rule or *forma vitae* the Vatican held to be in force, the reality of what was actually obtained amongst communities of women who thought of themselves as followers of St Francis could be very far from optimal. As Bert Roest reminds us (*Order and Disorder*, p. 10 n. 100), 'for a community without in-depth knowledge of the different rules used in the Clarissan order, the "rule of Saint Clare" could have been anything'.

Catherine Mooney has provided not only an invaluable handbook for the study of the Clarist rules but also a thought-provoking reappraisal of the traditional portrait of St Clare and the origins of the order that bears her name.

ROBERT CURRY, *The University of Sydney*

**Munns**, Jessica, Penny **Richards**, and Jonathan **Spangler**, eds, *Aspiration, Representation and Memory: The Guise in Europe, 1506–1688*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. xv, 201; 9 colour illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 978747219347.

It is fitting that a striking portrait of Henri II de Lorraine, fifth duke of Guise, graces the cover of this work. Although the title of this volume suggests broad coverage across two centuries, the exploits of the fifth duke are at the heart of this collection's analyses.

Attention to the spirited adventures of this prince of Europe is indeed fitting. He capitalized on his dynasty's unusual position as a princely family who moved among Europe's elites in order to seize opportunities to advance the dynasty's status and his own as a monarch in his own right. In this sense, he encapsulates the aspirations, self-representations and memorializing narratives of this significant family.

Moreover, the fifth duke has received less scholarly analysis or international, popular attention than his predecessors who were so central to the machinations of the religious wars of the sixteenth century in France, perhaps especially Mary Queen of Scots. This fact might have provided a strong rationale to devote the study to a particular analysis of his activities. The introduction instead situates the collection within the scholarship on

transnational dynastic structures, and highlights three contributions: the dynasty's dream of royal status, the activities of the fifth duke, and memory and legacies of the family. These disparate foci are reflected in the essays. Each is fascinating in its own right and provides new insights into its chosen field. This is particularly the case for authors whose translated chapters present research that is less well-known in English. However, they do not quite cohere around a central question that drives the field forward and their ordering, largely chronological, does not draw out conceptual connections between them. Moreover, some are far more robust analytically than others, making efforts to situate their findings in wider scholarly conversations (Spangler's own chapter is a high point).

The first two chapters contextualize the self-representation of the Guises. Robert S. Sturges emphasizes how the Crusades were still very much present as a political and spiritual ambition for the sixteenth-century Guise family and examines their political, textual, and material productions that made civil-war Paris the new Jerusalem. Marjorie Meiss-Even offers a detailed account of the dynasty's taste for luxury goods and personnel from Italy, and the political and cultural significance of these connections at the late sixteenth-century French court.

Michèle Benaiteau examines how the fifth duke of Guise fashioned a politically resonant image of celebrity through theatrical visual, cultural, and even marriage manoeuvres, which aided his rise to power in Naples during 1647–48. Benaiteau's argument for personality as politics is complemented by David A. H. B. Taylor's study of Anthony Van Dyck's portrait of the duke as an ambitious young man. This image, produced while the duke was exiled at the Brussels court, depicts the magnificence, swagger, and martial hopes and dreams of the displaced duke. Silvana D'Alessio's chapter returns us to the political intrigues of the Naples revolt in 1647–48 and his return in 1654, creating a narrative of support and criticism of the duke through pamphlets circulating at the time.

Spangler's chapter considers the perspective of the duke's mother, Henriette-Catherine de Joyeuse, who had to support her son's enterprises financially and conceptually whilst juggling the wider reputation of, and consequences of his actions for, the dynasty. These challenges and her achievements, Spangler argues, warrant her consideration 'amongst the greatest of the dukes of Guise' (p. 146) or, perhaps, a re-conceptualization of our ideas about duchesses. Charles Gregory investigates the fifth duke's last major military attempt at political leadership in Naples, in 1564, and the changing interventions of international powers in these activities.

With Chapters 8 and 9, the focus turns to memory and legacy. Penny Richards considers the dynasty's self-projection through literary, ceremonial, and material creations, especially funeral monuments commissioned by the dynasty's women, which encapsulated the family's religious fervour and

military achievements. This essay examines a large number of examples rather briefly, where a more sustained analysis of fewer might have elucidated the key themes and arguments more powerfully. Finally, Jessica Munns investigates the largely negative reputation of Guise men in British drama as fanatical Catholics and the development of a historiography of Mary Queen of Scots as a romantic heroine. Interestingly, the fifth duke is absent from this analysis, whether because he did not captivate later storytellers and playwrights or because Munns's interests lie with the sixteenth-century protagonists is less clear.

In sum, there is much to learn from these essays about an influential princely dynasty close to the heart of political power across generations and international contexts. The essays bring forth findings less known to English-language readers; it is a pity then that all French sources have not been translated, as it would help to situate this important family more centrally in early modern scholarship.

SUSAN BROOMHALL, *The University of Western Australia*

**Oertel**, Christian, *The Cult of St Erik in Medieval Sweden: Veneration of a Royal Saint, Twelfth–Sixteenth Centuries* (Acta Scandinavica, 5), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. xiii, 398; 48 b/w illustrations; R.R. P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503555072.

Most of the research on St Erik has focused on his early veneration up to the end of the thirteenth century, while largely ignoring the time of the Kalmar Union during which this veneration prospered. With his book, Christian Oertel aims to change that and provide 'a picture of the cult of St Erik which is as complete as possible concerning its spatial and social dispersal and concerning its supporters and their strategies of promoting the cult' (p. 15). He looks to accomplish this by investigating a wide range of edited and unedited sources associated with St Erik and his cult as 'an interdisciplinary approach is vital in order to create a comprehensive description of the cult of St Erik' (p. 15). While he admits that he is inexperienced with some of the types of sources, this does not stop him from including coins, seals, church paintings, sculptures, embroideries, and carvings in his research. Adequately discussing the possible benefits and difficulties of these diverse sources, Oertel makes a strong case for the inclusion of source material which was considered to be of low value in earlier research on the topic.

Although the level of historical detail might seem daunting, the structure of the book ensures readers do not get lost in the abundance of information. While the first three chapters serve as an introduction to the study, discussing the sources and the role of saints in the conversion of Scandinavia to Christianity, chapters 4 to 7 provide the core of Oertel's research. These contain a summary of political developments, insight into several important

influences in society, and a comprehensive examination of the emergence and growth of the cult of St Erik. The author contests the widely accepted assumption that Erik's son Knut endeavoured to spread the cult of his father to gain an advantage over the Sverker dynasty. He does so by calling attention to the sparse evidence, consisting only of a coin of King Knut and a wall painting. On top of that, Oertel points out that Erik's descendants would have named their holy ancestor in their charters if they wanted to propagate the cult. As there are only two existing charters in which Erik is named, he asserts this theory does not seem likely. Oertel also rejects the idea of St Erik as a *rex perpetuus*, or eternal king, in the early years of the cult; instead, he considers him 'a parochial saint without the potential to legitimise a claim to power over the kingdom' (p. 95).

Oertel goes on to discuss the intensification of the cult through the establishment of secular cathedral chapters and the arrival of the mendicant orders in Sweden, of which the Dominicans were especially influential. Combined with the 'privileges given to aristocracy and clergy, and the strengthening of royal power' (p. 146), the cult of St Erik thrived and two distinct forms of veneration arose: private and institutional. The latter, so argues Oertel, was furthered and transformed by the efforts of King Magnus Eriksson to make St Erik the *patronus Sveciae*, or patron saint of the developing country. The author continues to describe the rise, fall, and re-emergence of the cult of St Erik, and compares the saint with the broader canon of saints. Based on the sources, he argues that the cult was largely restricted to Sweden, with the exception of an altar dedicated to St Erik in a church in Gdansk in the early fifteenth century.

The conclusion, presented in both English and German, reasserts Oertel's conviction that 'the rise of the cult of St Erik was not a linear progression with mild fluctuations in degrees of ascent, as earlier research has indicated. Rather, it appears to have been a development that experienced stagnations and even relapses, as well as rapid increase' (p. 276). He ascribes a large role to external factors but also remains sensitive to internal influences, using the sources to guide him when appraising their impact. This appears to be distinctive of the book: Oertel re-examines widely accepted theories and assumptions, and is not afraid to discard these if the sources do not support them. The interdisciplinary approach ensures his analysis is thorough and centred around the source material. The result is a well thought-out book with a wealth of information that will be of interest to a wide range of disciplines.

FLORA GUIJT, *The Hague, The Netherlands*

**Olsen**, Karin E., *Conceptualizing the Enemy in Early Northwest Europe: Metaphors of Conflict and Alterity in Anglo-Saxon, Old Norse, and Early Irish Poetry* (Medieval Identities: Socio-Cultural Spaces, 6), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. viii, 252; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503552279.

Karin E. Olsen's project is to review three distinct corpora of medieval poetry for indications of cultural specificity of metaphor, and she sets out to do this with a theoretical framework based in cognitive psychology. The focus of her project is broadly described as 'an examination of the relationship between conceptual metaphor and culture', including 'both the ways in which metaphorical language of [...] poetic discourse is culture-sensitive, and the extent to which such sensitivity can be detected' (p. 2) in the poetry. This is an ambitious undertaking to fit into a scant 200-odd pages of analysis, for two main reasons. Firstly, the scope of the poetic material under examination is potentially vast, and she is perforce only able to examine a small selection. Her choices are mostly from a number of Old Norse Skaldic and Eddic verses, from Old English charms and heroic poetry such as *Deor*, *Beowulf*, *Maldon*, and *Brunanburh*, and select pieces of Early Irish heroic and historiographic poetry, including *Lebor Gabála Éirenn*, *Cath Maige Tuired*, and the Ulster Cycle. Secondly, given her theoretical orientation in cognitive psychology, a case for the applicability of her chosen method needs to be made, for this is not a common approach in medieval literary circles, and this could extend to many more pages than is available in a monograph such as this.

Olsen indeed draws perceptive observations regarding the poetic material and metaphorical concepts across the different traditions. Unfortunately, however, it is not readily apparent whether she has fully achieved her aim across each of the three thematic fields she discusses: heathen gods and their enemies, marginalizing the enemy, and defaming the enemy. Certainly in some places, and with some examples, her quest to demonstrate cultural sensitivity appears to be more successful than in others. There appear to be noteworthy schematic differences in select metaphors used in the Irish Ulster Cycle (as discussed in Chapter 3) with metaphors of fire and poison employed to convey anger, and warriors being likened to carrion birds, neither of which metaphorical collocations is identified as appearing in Old Norse or Old English heroic texts. This is perhaps the most productive aspect of Olsen's work, and a useful and interesting approach for scholarship in this field. This reinforced the reviewer's expectation that a search for cultural sensitivity would seek out differences that may be attributable to the different contexts in which the poetics came into being.

But as often as not, her comparisons seem to identify similarities rather than differences: similar metaphors involving wolves, coldness, and serpents, for example, appear across all three bodies of literature. Perhaps such an apparently counter-productive outcome, identifying similarities rather than

specificities, may in fact be an artefact of the methodology Olsen employs. She acknowledges an explicit debt to Antonina Harbus's 'conceptual metaphor theory' (which she renames 'cognitive metaphor theory' but elsewhere in the book refers to in Harbus's terms) and aligns her approach with cognitive psychologists who over recent decades have turned their attention to literary studies. Certainly there appears to be a substantial body of work in this field analysing cultural production as indicative of cognitive processes, but Olsen notes that this approach is more commonly used by cognitive scientists and anthropologists who can conduct empirical research with language users, and rare in medieval literature studies. In comparison, medievalists need to reconstruct cultural contexts for the often fragmentary available evidence, which for such disparate poetic sources is an especially difficult task. Perhaps without such empirical support available, a quest for cultural specificity and difference will be highly disadvantaged, for how can such variation in metaphor be ascribed to cultural relevance without access to the writer, redactor, speaker, or interlocutor, and knowledge of their conditions of production? Olsen herself acknowledges such uncertainties surrounding the attribution of cultural embeddedness of medieval metaphors, recognizing the possibility that they might simply be poetic idiosyncracies and therefore not necessarily explanatory of cultural specificity.

There is much in this volume to stimulate further discussion, in particular regarding methodological approaches that Olsen uses, but also in terms of her textual selections. Given the topics covered this volume — conflict, alterity, marginalization — and current interests in intersectional approaches to literature that embrace a number of disciplines, including linguistics, psychology, anthropology, literary criticism, and semiotics (to name just a few), this work is a useful contribution, and while it may in places appear overly ambitious, the approach is worthy of scholarly attention and anticipates future debate on methodologies for critical analysis of medieval texts.

RODERICK McDONALD, *University of Nottingham*

**Preston**, Claire, *The Poetics of Scientific Investigation in Seventeenth-Century England*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2015; hardback; pp. 320; 25 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9780198704805.

As soon as science had become, for some, an all-consuming passion, scientists became the butt of satire. Partly for this reason, it is often assumed that poetic and scientific instincts are as distinct from each other as emotion is from reason. Claire Preston's monograph pulls the rug out from beneath this seductive but simplistic assumption. Invaluable for its knowledge (both of history and of all manner of primary texts), for its insight, and for its compelling textual analyses, it serves to show that C. P. Snow's notion of 'two

cultures' is inappropriate to the seventeenth-century phase of the so-called 'scientific revolution' in England.

I say 'in England', but the dust-jacket reproduces a detail from the depiction of a piece of turf by the great early sixteenth-century German artist Albrecht Dürer. Although it looks like a botanical illustration, it was (as far as we know) innocent of any overtly scientific purpose. But it is difficult to collapse the distinction between poetry (or art) and science without somehow admitting it in the first place. Preston avoids this trap. Her strategy is to investigate the 'poetics' of a range of texts, focusing on forms rather than themes. She acknowledges the standard prejudicial binaries only implicitly, by choosing works that by one route or another have a bearing upon what we think of as science.

She begins by debunking the standard accounts, derived from Thomas Sprat's *History of the Royal Society*, according to which Bacon and his followers rejected metaphor. As she observes, metaphor was essential not only to the communication of scientific results, but also to the thought processes of the scientist (raising, it seems to me, the exceedingly important question as to whether these two functions could ever be independent). Preston goes on to observe that experiments proceed as narratives, while the dialogue between scientists that gave meaning to their work was incipiently dramatic. The subject of the first chapter is Thomas Browne's *Garden of Cyrus*, a fascinating work that in its near-collapsing of natural and cultural realms (in both of which the 'quincunx' principle is displayed), epitomizes the period as Preston views it. Preston focuses not on Browne's content, however (she evidently expects her readers to be familiar with every work she discusses), but on his propensity for linguistic innovation, a propensity dictated by 'the philological and rhetorical difficulties arising from expanding knowledge and specification' (p. 46), difficulties that could otherwise be addressed only by the display of things in themselves. She follows in her second chapter with a study of Robert Boyle, focusing not so much on his equal productivity in the distinct (or supposedly distinct) fields of moral reflection and scientific investigation as on the 'established literary formats' (p. 81) and 'fictional self-consciousness' (p. 84) that characterize all his writing. Chapter 3 begins with the supposed spatial requirements of empirical work. Preston observes how the laboratory, even for one as wealthy and as well-connected as Boyle, tended to double as domestic space, and how the private and (quasi-theatrical) public functions of that space collided. She identifies what she calls the 'closet poem' as a generic product of this ambiguous context. But Preston is impressively alert to the precedents that determine literary forms — even where the subjects at stake seem to be novel. Preston moves from the image of the scientist home alone to the question of scientific collegiality. She points out it was only at Wadham College under John Wilkins that such collegiality was to be embodied (more or less literally) in her period. The reader is led inevitably

into the subject of Chapter 4, scientific correspondence and its specialized style whose supposed informality was governed by unstated rules designed to preserve harmony where disagreements could be of the essence.

Preston turns, finally, to what she calls the ‘Scientific Georgic’ — tracts on bees (the subject, of course, of the fourth book of Virgil’s *Georgics*), on drainage, silk production, and horticulture. What she isolates above all are the ways in which these manuals (Preston, whose fondness for unfamiliar vocabulary can be faintly reminiscent of Thomas Browne’s own, calls them ‘banausic’) are positioned by their authors in what we would see as an essentially poetic tradition: ‘For [every writer on fruit] the labour of planting and tending is explicitly or latently an act of worship, the respectful stewardly task of tending God’s creation’ (p. 232). Having shown how unscientific (from our point of view) such writers could be, Preston nevertheless draws a sharp distinction between them and her first subject, Thomas Browne. For Browne, she observes, gardening was redundant: “‘Gardens were before gardeners’ [...] we are already tenants of Elysium’.

KATHRYN WALLS, *Victoria University of Wellington*

**Prosperi**, Adriano, *Infanticide, Secular Justice, and Religious Debate in Early Modern Europe*, trans. by Hilary Siddons (Europa Sacra, 10), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. viii, 407; R.R.P. €110.00; ISBN 9782503531748.

By Adriano Prosperi’s own admission, ‘no other crime has been studied, analysed and described more’ than infanticide (p. 49). It is difficult then to offer an original argument or to advance the already abundant scholarship on this offence. Prosperi’s text engages in a fine-grained analysis of the 1709 trial and conviction of Bolognese singlewoman Lucia Cremonini for the murder of her newborn son. The author’s choice of Cremonini as the focus of this work is predicated on the richness of the archival material on her trial, and the fact that Cremonini is representative of the archetypal early modern infanticidal mother. That Cremonini committed an infanticide is tangential though to how Prosperi uses the extant court documents on her case to reconstruct the greater cultural processes at play in early modern Europe. Indeed, Lucia’s act of infanticide is merely a vehicle through which Prosperi can illustrate how the extraction of material from her trial can provide valuable insights into early modern European culture, law, and theology. This text also queries ‘whether these obscure inhabitants of the criminal archives are truly knowable in their concrete reality’ (p. 369).

Prosperi’s work is divided into four parts. Each part revolves around a key component or character from Lucia Cremonini’s trial. Part 1 provides a retelling and contextualization of the ‘words set down in the trial documents’ (p. 15). We learn the circumstances surrounding Lucia’s commission of this

‘unspeakable crime’, and how Lucia conformed, from her marital status to her purported motives, to the early modern template of the infanticidal mother (p. 8). There is also a discussion of the other early modern stereotypes that were propagated about infanticide, with reference to Jewish ritualistic practices, witches, ‘*donne malefiche*’ (evil women), and the impecunious midwife (p. 43).

Part 2 is entitled ‘The Mother’. Here, Prosperi dissects key phrases from Cremonini’s 1709 testimony in an attempt to distinguish Lucia from ‘the crowd of women convicted of infanticide’ (p. 85). Her reference to ‘a young priest’ as the putative father, for example, is expanded upon to expose how the sexual transgressions of the clergy were typically concealed by the ecclesiastical courts, and to highlight how the paternal figure was largely excluded from early modern investigations of infanticides (p. 93). Lucia’s declaration that ‘he robbed me of my honour and took my virginity’, meanwhile, is found to be consistent with narratives of rape in the early modern Bologna court records, and reflective of the unequal power relations between early modern men and women (p. 113). Although, as Prosperi acknowledges, these court documents contain ‘no expression of any feelings’, the contextualization of these key phrases allows the reader to make some inferences about Lucia’s experiential mindset (p. 114).

Part 3 explores the early modern theological and cultural beliefs superimposed on the body of Lucia’s deceased male infant. In his discussion of the early modern theological dogma on the unbaptized infant and the question of ensoulment, Prosperi thought-provokingly contends that ‘even the unborn is not absent from the historical process just because it is devoid of speech’ (p. 136). The final part of this text, perhaps fittingly, ends with a description of Lucia’s execution on the scaffold. From the absence of irons on her wrists to the imprisonment of the hangman for ‘keeping her in agony for a while’, even Lucia’s death functions as a commentary on the cultural beliefs ingrained in the spectacle of early modern executions (p. 328).

This analysis was motivated by Prosperi’s desire ‘to understand the story of a mother who committed infanticide’ (p. 372). Following the example of scholars Carlo Ginzburg and Natalie Zemon Davis, Prosperi showcases how fine-grained contextual analysis can enrich our understanding of historical individuals whose names are only discoverable due to their appearance in the court records. The value of Prosperi’s work lies in his ability to discern the multifaceted layers of cultural meaning embedded in a single line of text from the criminal archives. This text succeeds as an illustration of how the historian can breathe life and colour into the seemingly emotionless and formulaic literary composition of archival legal documents.

JANE BITOMSKY, *The University of Queensland*

**Ramírez-Weaver**, Eric M., *A Saving Science: Capturing the Heavens in Carolingian Manuscripts*, University Park, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2017; hardback; pp. 312; 35 colour, 75 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$89.95; ISBN 9780271071268.

In *A Saving Science: Capturing the Heavens in Carolingian Manuscripts*, Eric Ramírez-Weaver has focused his study on a deluxe copy of the *Handbook of 809* produced for the ninth-century Bishop Drogo of Metz, one of Charlemagne's sons. This was one of several versions of this important text and Ramírez-Weaver offers a comparative study that also highlights the text's significance for the daily celebration of the liturgy as it provides necessary charts and information used at that time for dating.

The *Handbook of 809* was a large astronomical encyclopedia that took the form of a compilation of astronomical and computistical material collected in seven books. It was derived from Charlemagne's synod of 809. This synod included several Frankish prelates who were interested in questions of *computus*, a subject of great interest throughout the Middle Ages, and the manuscript was prepared for the youthful prelate in about 820. It now resides in Madrid in the Biblioteca Nacional de España, MS 3307. At least four artists from Metz were involved in its illustration. It brought together an array of texts including Bede's *De natura rerum* that made up Book vii of the collection. As well, it presented a Carolingian interpretation of astronomy, built on such works as Isidore of Seville's *Etymologies* and other teachings. The compilation had been guided by prelates such as Adalhard of Corbie who used their books to advance pedagogy and encourage a robust and intellectual brand of spiritual renewal through the studying of the liberal art of astronomy. The miniatures and charts found within were crucial both to this agenda and to make meaningful the contents. They highlight the link between art, religion and science.

The use of illustrations that took the form both of diagrams and representations of particular constellations has been familiar to art historians through publications of Carolingian art and science. Equally familiar is the *Aratus* from Leiden (Bibliotheek der Rijksuniversiteit, MS Voss. lat. Q79) from 816, that has close parallels in how such constellations were recorded and preserved forms from an older classical tradition. These manuscripts also demonstrate the importance of art to astronomy in this period. Ramírez-Weaver has had an ongoing interest in this question and from his earliest publications has explored this connection between science and art in his work on astronomical and philosophical texts from the Carolingian and late Gothic Bohemian manuscripts. He does this across two parts consisting of four chapters in total. In his discussions Ramírez-Weaver reveals a very thorough grasp of German historiography, in particular, which is fortunate, as discussions of medieval science and its diagrammatic representations have

received most substantial attention from German scholars. His work also provides some of the clearest writing on *computus* in English, a topic that eludes many writers, including myself, despite the presence of tables of *concurrentes* appearing in manuscripts throughout the Middle Ages. He provides this very useful account in the first chapter along with a discussion of the classical legacy of the writings on constellations that led to the development of this handbook. He also looks at the manuscript's subsequent history. Chapter 2 is a history of celestial iconography as it relates to Drogo's manuscript, while Chapter 3 provides evidence to support the idea of itinerant teams of artists that spread ideas and styles through different regions. The final chapter covers such matters as the Carolingian image debate, following the Iconoclasm crisis in Byzantium, and the ways the Carolingians conceived of the spiritual benefits that awaited those who grappled with such celestial compilations. Studying astronomy was seen as a pathway to salvation and, as the title suggests, astronomy was perceived as 'a saving science'.

Ramírez-Weaver has written a difficult work that occasionally gets lost in his elaborate, sometimes obscure language. At the same time, the material he discusses is difficult and gives weight to the idea that this is a real compilation of important material. This is one of the first extended discussions of this type of Carolingian manuscript and there is much to recommend in it, even if at times I found myself a little lost in the technicalities of *computus*. It highlights also the central role rediscovering classical antiquity played in the Carolingian imagination.

JUDITH COLLARD, *University of Otago*

**Rice**, Nicole R., and Margaret Aziza **Pappano**, *The Civic Cycles: Artisan Drama and Identity in Premodern England* (Reformations: Medieval and Early Modern), Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2015; paperback; pp. 384; 4 b/w illustrations, 9 colour plates, 2 maps; R.R.P. US\$42.00; ISBN 9780268039004.

*The Civic Cycles* offers a fresh and valuable perspective on the role, identity and self-representation of medieval artisan guilds within both the York and Chester play cycles and the two cities' civic structures. The book's introduction, co-written by the authors, offers a clear and succinct overview of how the medieval cycles functioned as displays of civic honour, local pride, and religious feeling. This is approached through what Rice and Pappano see as 'the crucial lens for comparative analysis of the cycles' (p. 4) — the exploration of artisan identity. Introduced here, and explored much more fully in the ensuing chapters, is a study of the artisan guilds' place within the civic hierarchy, their relations with other guilds and civic governance, and the way in which the cycle pageants 'not only represented but also performed artisan identity' (p. 4). Rice and Pappano claim — justifiably — that this

‘offers a new perspective on the relation between continuity and change in social, dramatic and religious practice’ (p. 5).

Although discussion is weighted towards the political and religious upheavals of the sixteenth century, the book’s five chapters range across the entire performance history of the cycles rather than focusing on one particular period — an uncommon approach, but a welcome one. In a pleasing symmetry with the cycles themselves, the study begins with the fall of the angels, moving through the arc of salvation history to Doomsday. Chapter 1, ‘New Beginnings’, explores the ‘light imagery’ (p. 41) pervading the York *Fall of the Angels* and Chester *Fall of Lucifer* in the context of the feasts of Corpus Christi and Pentecost. Following Sarah Beckwith, Erik Paul Weissengruber and others to ‘articulate an expanded understanding of [...] “artisanal ideology”’ (p. 42), the pageants are examined in relation to the Corpus Christi religious procession, its engrained hierarchy of guilds and civic governance, and the tensions attendant on this hierarchy. Rice and Pappano then break new ground by suggesting that ‘[b]oth pageants are engaged in a process of reform and renovation, seeking to find new modes of organisation and expressions of ceremonial relations’ (p. 73).

Chapter 2, ‘Whom Seek Ye, Sirs?’, covers the ‘artisan concerns’ (p. 83) of York’s *Herod and the Magi*. The play’s ‘seeking’ for Christ is linked to ‘the multifaceted role of the craft searcher’ (p. 85), a guild officer appointed to the ‘inspection of workshops and products [...] for violations of quality standards or infringement of monopolies’ (p. 84). The concept of the pageant’s dramatic seeking as a representation of craft searching is thoroughly explored, judiciously evidenced with material from guild and civic records (as throughout the book), and convincingly presented.

Continuing the discussion of power relations and tensions introduced in Chapter 1 and inherent in the role of Chapter 2’s craft searcher, the third and fourth chapters (‘Fair Trade’ and ‘Spinsters, Labourers and Alewives: Women’s Work in Chester’) examine the ‘threefold nexus of identity and power encompassing merchants, artisans, and servants/journeymen/apprentices’ (p. 123) before turning to the discrepancy between the perception of women’s work and men’s. Chapter 3 is centred on the York Judas plays and their ‘process of differentiating servants and masters and work toward subordinating the servant in the hierarchical [...] social body, simultaneously Corpus Christi, a divine body of Christian fellowship’ (p. 159). Chapter 4 looks back to the *Adam and Eve* and *Noah* plays before introducing the Alewife figure of Chester’s *Harrowing of Hell* in terms of work as punishment for sin, good- and poor-quality work, and the regulation of women’s labour by men.

With Chapter 5 the book, like the play cycle, comes full circle, exploring the *Doomsday* and *Last Judgement* pageants as performances of civic charity. Refreshingly, a case is made for the interaction of artisanal and mercantile charity, revealing a much more complicated interplay of guild interests

and self-representations than the more usual mercantile-focused approach. Following on from the cycles' dramatic endings, the Epilogue discusses their literal ones amid the religious upheavals of the late sixteenth century — or, as the authors argue for the Chester cycle, its reworking into the Midsummer Show.

The text is complemented with relevant photographs and the two maps, of medieval York and Chester, are clear and helpful. Meticulously researched and documented, yet engaging and highly readable throughout, *The Civic Cycles* is of value both to established scholars and the more general reader.

ELEANOR BLOOMFIELD, *The University of Auckland*

**Shemek**, Deanna, ed. and trans., *Isabella d'Este: Selected Letters* (The Other Voice in Early Modern Europe: The Toronto Series, 54; Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies, 516), Tempe, ACMRS, Toronto, Iter Press, 2017; paperback; pp. xv, 691; 5 genealogical charts; R.R.P. US\$64.95; ISBN 978-0866985727.

This collection speaks not only to the career and agency of Isabella d'Este, *marchesa di Mantova*, but also provides evidence of the activities and influence of other powerful and influential women who formed part of her extensive networks of news-gathering and correspondence.

Elite and royal women such as Isabella d'Este might not have led armies in person, but they certainly had a considerable role to play in the organization and provisioning of military campaigns. Such women were not cloistered away from the main game of both secular and ecclesiastical politics and diplomacy — we fall into error if we assume that the public and the private in all of this existed as discrete spheres of influence and agency, with the domestic or private sphere held to be somehow less important. With this selection of 830 letters from some 16,000 extant letters preserved in the Archivio di Stato di Mantova, Shemek contributes to the accumulating body of evidence of the *sans frontières* un-exceptionality of elite and royal female agency, authority and influence during the pre-modern and early modern periods.

Shemek has arranged her almost 700-page volume coherently with a view to ease of access. She commences proceedings with a targeted Introduction, 'Isabella d'Este: Princess, Collector, Correspondent', which gives the reader ample background information regarding her protagonist as well as laying out her aims in selecting the letters she has included from the some 16,000 available to her. Shemek offers us a broad selection of Isabella's correspondence, the first of its kind and 'the most voluminous documentary record of her "voice" in many spheres' (pp. 2–3) and the first such selection to be translated into English. In offering up such a catholic selection, Shemek seeks both to 'entice new readers to explore the rich landscape of early modern Europe and bring new material to bear on discussions of the period among

experts in the field' (p. 3). In this she succeeds to an admirable extent, and I am convinced that she will likewise manage to unsettle 'comfortable notions of Isabella's character that derive from partial or prejudicial views' (p. 3).

The letters are organized chronologically across five decades of Isabella's highly productive and influential life. Section 1, Letters 1–200, covers the period 1479–99, taking in the first decade of her reign as *marchesa* of Mantua. It opens with a charming letter addressed to her father (23) recording the injustice she felt upon being held by her mother's lady-in-waiting Sirvia while being spanked by *Madama*, her mother Eleonora d'Este, having been first scolded by her governess Colonna. Shemek emphasizes that such letters give a rare glimpse of a princess in formation (21). Isabella's correspondence here testifies to her work on many fronts as a governing consort, and sheds light upon the urgency for the production of a male heir.

Section 2, 1500–1509, Letters 201–420, provides us with a rich tapestry of Isabella's second decade as *marchesa*. Moments of domestic intimacy share the pages with politics, luxury consumption, and the tricky business of court management. They show her hard at work on behalf of her subjects, and emphasize the importance of having trusted networks. With the capture of Francesco Gonzaga by Venetian forces, 1510 would prove to be Isabella's personal *annus horribilis*.

Section 3, 1510–1519, Letters 421–608, opens with Francesco's capture, then release, and closes with his death in 1519. Isabella strove mightily to keep their state solvent during Francesco's captivity: there was famine to complicate matters, and a schism developed between the couple as Francesco sought his freedom by suggesting that he exchange their young son and heir Federico as a hostage to obtain it. The couple emerged from this experience 'hardened, wiser, and somewhat estranged from one another' (p. 307).

Sections 4 and 5, 1520–1539, Letters 609–830, illustrate Isabella, widowed at 46 years of age, holding things together 'for the good of the firm' and keeping up with her correspondence and diverse activities. In the final decade of her life, family affairs became more settled, but the fevers and headaches from which Isabella had suffered all her life took on a new intensity and stomach problems led to a steady decline in her health and her eventual death on 13 February 1539.

Shemek makes a considerable contribution to the field. I, for one, am thrilled to have it within arm's reach — it is an invaluable resource for any scholar seeking to drill more deeply into what it meant to be any early modern governing consort, and the reality of elite pre-modern female agency and influence.

ZITA EVA ROHR, *Macquarie University*

**Shoham-Steiner**, Ephraim, ed., *Intricate Interfaith Networks in the Middle Ages: Quotidian Jewish-Christian Contacts* (Studies in the History of Daily Life (800–1600), 5), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. xii, 352; 6 colour, 21 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €95.00; ISBN 9782503544298.

Those who wonder what daily problems may have arisen in small towns in Europe when a Christian household found itself next door to a Jewish or even a Muslim one will need to wait longer for a possible account. As several papers show, it is easier to find material relating to business partnerships between Jew, Christian, and Muslim than it is to discern what was expected of adjacent families from documents written for other purposes.

The various papers in this volume approach the issues from different angles and different historiographical traditions but even Flocel Sabaté, exploring the question of Jewish neighbourhoods in late medieval Catalanian towns and concerned with the way in which people experienced the religious difference, is finally more interested in the dominant world view and the economic aspects that categorized interrelationships. Whether his view that the growing negative popular perception was spontaneous and not the result of propaganda may be questioned, Sabaté provides a valuable insight into how the social problems were created. Eveline Brugger also approaches the issue of neighbours and neighbourhoods indirectly, by working from the repeated requirements that Christian and Jews live separately to the idea that this was unenforceable. Her attempts to disentangle the mundane from the more purely financial problems of the elite, however, drives her back to stories of persecution where the possible support neighbours provided is complicated by the nature of the available records.

Katalin Szende enlarges our understanding of the Jewish diaspora in an area generally neglected, by illuminating the establishment of Jews in Hungary in a period when there were major overall changes to government and society. All the authors make it clear that the experiences of Jewish-Christian relationships vary considerably from place to place. In investigating sexual relations between Jews and Christians, Carsten L. Wilke reveals not only that they were massively disapproved of by both religions but that actual encounters and unions were much more common in the Iberian Peninsula than they were in the more northerly parts of Europe.

There are a number of papers on side issues that intrigue the reader — Lilach Assaf investigates the use of given names in both Sephardi and Ashkenazi Jewish society in the thirteenth and fourteenth century with some surprising results; Zsofia Buda teases out the use of Jewish terms in iconography of the time, mainly in art, but also in architecture. The contribution of Jewish artists is also the subject of Katrin Kogman-Appel's paper.

The bulk of the papers are related to intellectual history, however. They are novel in that the possibility of common ideas and approaches between Christian and Jewish theologians is examined and Piero Capelli suggests that the boundaries dividing them are created by views on the Talmud rather than the position of Christ. Tamas Visi, looking at the Ashkenazi Jews in Bohemia, also shows how and when Jews adopted ideas developed by Christians in areas such as medicine.

Although only touched on in one or two papers the identification of Muslim residents as a significant and rarely considered aspect of multi-religious settlements opens up a line of research that may, as Shoham-Steiner suggests, yield benefits in the future. The great importance of this volume, and the promise of future volumes, is the identification of differences — differences over time, differences from place to place and differences from one theological tradition to another.

A surprising omission, however, and perhaps a subject for another volume, is any clarification of the way law was structured in the different countries, and affected the ability of Jews and in some areas Muslims to integrate. After all, there was an underlying assumption in most of medieval Europe that all the people in one country would submit to the courts in that country, and the system was binary. Some things came under the secular courts but many, perhaps most, of the accusations an individual was required to face came under the jurisdiction of the Church courts over which the Crown had no explicit control. While it is well known that Jews and Muslims were particularly protected by the Crown this does not elucidate how the day-to-day issues of inter-faith were managed. A volume on this would be valuable.

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*

**Shoval, Ilan**, *King John's Delegation to the Almohad Court (1212): Medieval Interreligious Interactions and Modern Historiography* (Cursor Mundi, 23), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. xviii, 215; 4 maps; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503555775.

When one thinks of King John of England, the man who lost the vast Angevin Empire to Philippe II Auguste of France and sealed the end of regnal supremacy via Magna Carta, one generally does not consider him an ally of Saracens and an active player in Iberian politics. Yet such a possibility is implied by an episode in the *Chronica majora* by the medieval chronicler Matthew Paris, who states that John sent a delegation to the Almohad Caliph, al-Nāṣir, in 1212 in order to form a political alliance. It is an isolated and controversial narrative thread and one that many historians have dismissed over the previous two centuries for myriad reasons, but Ilan Shoval believes it should not be discounted wholesale and, indeed, reveals through his book the political cunning and diplomatic finesse of the oft-reviled English

king. Through his forensic analysis of Paris's account, Shoval adopts a new perspective on Almohad–Angevin relations, including how John intended to use an Almohad victory in Iberia to cement his grand alliance against France in the years prior to the battle of Bouvines.

What Shoval's study lacks in straightforward organization it makes up for in innovation and interpretation. The historian begins with a brief history of the *Chronica majora* followed by an English translation of the Almohad story (a transcription of the Latin version is available in an appendix). He then immediately begins analysing the historical problems with the passage, forgetting that most of his audience does not yet have sufficient contextual knowledge to understand most of the issues he addresses. That being said, Shoval categorically responds to a plethora of historiographical problems here, leaving little doubt in the mind of this reader that previous historians have failed to comprehend the true importance of John's probable delegation to the Almohad court.

It is with mild frustration, therefore, that much of the remaining two-thirds of the book feels relatively unimportant compared to the implications of the first chapter. The long second chapter, ostensibly focused on the interreligious and theological aspects of the study, in reality is more of a series of biographies of the diplomats, especially Robert of London, who was partially villainized by Matthew Paris but also purportedly the chronicler's source for the story. The chapter ends with a needlessly long discussion of Islamic interpretations of Pauline Christianity and al-Nāṣir's possible Christian upbringing prompted by a single sentence from Matthew Paris's account. What the chapter does not include is any in-depth discussion of religious issues or contemporary Christian or Islamic theology.

The remaining three chapters all focus primarily on Anglo-Iberian politics. Chapter 3 provides a rather thorough history of English relations with Navarre and the other Christian kingdoms in Iberia, generally in relation to John's duchies of Aquitaine and Gascony. Discussion of the Almohad embassy appears briefly in the middle of this chapter, but the focus is primarily on the battle of Las Navas in July 1212, which saw the end of Almohad power in Iberia and ended any relationship the Almohad had formed with the English. The short fourth chapter provides further context by discussing the feudal relationship between the Angevins and the kings of France. Meanwhile, the equally short final chapter explores the historiography surrounding John and reveals how Shoval's reinterpretation of the Almohad-Angevin relationship lends further evidence to the argument that John should be considered a skilled diplomat and politician.

Organizationally, this book feels backwards. The five chapters, bookended by an introduction and epilogue, are structured in a way that undoubtedly helped the author in his research but labours the reader. Most of the historical context should have been placed before the translation and analysis of

Paris's account to provide the reader with the necessary foundation to fully understand the implications of the account. More problematic, though, is that some of Shoval's interpretations appear unsubstantiated or ill-informed. Even though he admits repeatedly that some portions of the account are clearly fabricated by Paris, Shoval insists that Robert of London was probably a converted Jew, although he provides little supporting evidence; he lacks convincing proof that al-Nāsir was partially raised by his Christian mother; and he does not seem to understand the feudal relationship, or lack thereof, between the English and French kings regarding Gascony prior to 1259. In addition, Shoval is light on his footnotes, often mentioning historic details or providing quotes without accompanying citations. Thus, while this study of an Almohad-Angevin cooperative relationship is certainly revelatory and Shoval's arguments seem overwhelmingly valid, this book leaves much to be desired.

DEREK R. WHALEY, *University of Canterbury*

**Sokolov**, Danila, *Renaissance Texts, Medieval Subjectivities: Rethinking Petrarchan Desire from Wyatt to Shakespeare*, Pittsburgh, Duquesne University Press, 2017; cloth; pp. 350; R.R.P. US\$70.00; ISBN 9780820704975.

Danila Sokolov argues that early modern texts are indebted to 'medieval structures of discourse and selfhood' (p. 5). His study rereads Renaissance Petrarchism as English medievalism. Sokolov begins by examining the notion of meed as reward, payment, and gift to reconceptualize Petrarchan desire in the sonnets of Thomas Wyatt, Edmund Spenser, Barnabe Barnes, and E. C.'s *Emaricdulfe* (1595). He challenges Wyatt scholarship by not reading his sonnets as a reflection of Henry VIII's court. In 'What Vaileth Truth?', Sokolov unpacks meed as the male Lover's unrelenting generosity when confronted by unrequited love. In the sonnet, Sokolov notes that pain begins as a metonym for rewarding work, to end up becoming a reflection of the Lady's cruelty.

In Spenser's economic, erotic, poetic, and religious ambitions, Sokolov finds meed as patronage and spiritual fulfilment, whereas for E. C., meed becomes the male Lover's divine servitude to his Lady as salvation. In Barnabe Barnes's work, Sokolov discovers meed as the male Lover's unashamed desire for economic and sexual gain.

Chapter 2 analyses Geoffrey Chaucer's notion of the melancholic self in Henry Howard, Earl of Surrey and Sir Philip Sidney. Following an impressive overview, Sokolov too readily conflates the early modern notion of melancholy and lovesickness. By confining early modern melancholy to the beginning of a single chapter, Sokolov simplifies a complex medical and philosophical

condition. It may have been more appropriate to focus on Chaucer's notion of melancholy, rather than delving into early modern medical treatises.

In order to construct a challenging melancholic identity, Surrey's poetic Lover adopts an anti-Petrarchan stance by modifying Petrarchan language. With Sidney's *Astrophil and Stella*, Astrophil's Chaucerian melancholy fragments his identity. Astrophil's theatrical transformation from a tragic to a comic identity is usually considered a melancholic characteristic associated with English Petrarchism, though Sokolov argues that Astrophil's melancholy is based on its medieval roots.

Sokolov reads the casket sonnets by Mary Stuart, Queen of Scots, as opposing marriage. In the sonnets, the marriage between Mary and the Earl of Bothwell is consummated as rape. Sokolov argues that the pleasure and pain of Petrarchism are collapsed by sexual violence. The medieval influence in the casket sonnets is traced to *The Kingis Quair*, a Chaucerian prison poem dated 1420–1430. The poem, thought to be written by the fifteenth-century James I, passionately depicts his marriage to the English princess Joan Beaufort. Sokolov unpacks in these texts sovereign marriage as forging political and erotic identities.

In Chapter 4, Sokolov tackles the legal system in Samuel Daniel's *Delia* and Michael Drayton's *Idea*. Rather than reflecting Elizabethan legal practices, he argues the sonnet sequences contain 'recognizable permutations' (p. 177) of the laws of love in medieval poetry. In Daniel's *Delia*, the Lover's failure to act in love is rooted in erotic legality and the common law. These legal aspects are tracked by Sokolov to medieval courtly love. Drayton's *Idea* reimagines the laws of love as a murder trial with the Lady and Cupid representing the law of erotic love. Sokolov finds similar legal proceedings in John Lydgate's *Complaynte of a Louers Lyfe*, where the dead Lover testifies against his own murder.

Chapter 5 appears to be a reworking of Joel Fineman's *Shakespeare's Perjured Eye*. Sokolov acknowledges Fineman's thesis that Shakespeare's modernity is forged from medieval poetic praise. He then emphasizes the division of Shakespeare's sonnets into the young man and dark lady sonnets. The articulation of poverty, fleshly disease, and erotic desire in the young man sonnets originates from medieval begging poems, whereas in the dark lady sonnets, the lady herself causes both disease and sexual perversity. What Sokolov refers to as a 'poetics of disgust' (p. 254) is traced to Robert Henryson's *The Testament of Cresseid* (1494). The dark lady is found in Cresseid's beauty becoming repulsively leprous.

Sokolov concludes his study by restating that early modern Petrarchan poetry is founded on medieval structures. By identifying these remnants, Sokolov argues that Petrarchan identities resonate between the medieval and early modern periods.

Sokolov's ambitious book establishes a previously overlooked medieval influence on early modern Petrarchan poets. Although fascinating, the poetic link often appears tenuous. With each chapter starting with a fresh area of in-depth research, Sokolov goes to great lengths to make his thesis convincing. Despite this criticism, *Renaissance Texts, Medieval Subjectivities: Rethinking Petrarchan Desire from Wyatt to Shakespeare* is a thought-provoking and entertaining study with many important insights. Therefore, the wide-ranging research will stimulate fresh debate on early modern Petrarchan poetry. It is also valuable to students and academics interested in early modern religion, economy, melancholy, Anglo-Scottish sovereignty, legal practices, pathology, and the notion of a medieval Shakespeare.

FRANK SWANNACK, *University of Salford*

**Taylor**, Craig, and Jane H. M. **Taylor**, trans, *The Chivalric Biography of Boucicaut, Jean II le Meingre*, Woodbridge, Boydell, 2016; hardback; pp. 244; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781783271665.

'Chivalric biographies were a flourishing genre', the translators and editors note in their introduction, which 'often echoed chivalric romance' (p. 7). This volume is a welcome addition to the available in-translation literature of the European Middle Ages, not only for what it offers English readers about the life and times of its continental subject, but also by serving as a pointed reminder that the ideology of chivalry went beyond fantasy and ideal. The life described and translated by Craig Taylor and Jane Taylor, that of Boucicaut, Jean II Le Meingre, is not that of some mere medieval cosplayer, inhabiting a fantastical society overlaying his own, but a complex document about 'a colourful, sympathetic figure who was central to the chivalric world of the later Middle Ages' (p. 19). As far as readable documents go, it cuts to the heart of many of the nuances that make the medieval world both foreign and familiar. It makes for fascinating reading, and is to be recommended for personal edification or educational deployment.

Boucicaut's life was framed in chivalric tropes. His childhood was reportedly filled with signs of leadership, amorous potential, martial skill, and physical aptitude. His adulthood seemed to affirm these hints, as he fought and crusaded throughout great swathes of territory in the service of the King of France, jostled with and for honour, and even helped found a knightly order for the assistance and protection of ladies in need. If Boucicaut sounds like something of knightly Jack-of-all-trades, this is probably what the author intended, and the editors suggest it is 'highly likely that the biography was written as a very careful defence of the actions and policies of Boucicaut, and a response to his critics' (p. 9). But rather than becoming worthless for being such a contrived text, Boucicaut's life is made more fascinating for being written while its subject still lived, and for highlighting the blending

of narrative conventions with lived realities. Here the literary and the literal Middle Ages overlap and interplay, making this text useful for the study of both.

Literary and political elements aside, the text also offers much historical material worthy of attention. It particularly highlights the mobility of a medieval military career, and goes some way to illuminating battle tactics and strategies. The protagonist tours with Englishmen, fights Turkish galleys, besieges castles, and so on. Boucicault's life offers vignettes of crusading in Hungary, captivity in Damascus, strategizing in Cyprus, and the pitfalls of governing Genoa, among other activities and contexts. When read through the perspective of a single character, the interplay between Western Europe and the Eastern Mediterranean that was such an important feature of the medieval world comes through nicely and in a nuanced and unforced fashion, as does the interplay with the deeper past and then present. This alone means that this volume carries enormous teaching potential, made more so when coupled with the methodologically useful tensions around questions of authorship, bias, argument, and readership that make for a good primary source analysis. Ditch the heavy burden of teaching through context-laying secondary scholarship, build a unit around Boucicault!

This text also offers material for the more spiritually-minded. The grief over the papal schism, the virtuous example of giving alms to poor people and hospitals, and other conventional pieties of a man of his position serve as entry points into analysis of the uniquely religious flavour of medieval chivalry. Even the everyday analogies used to illuminate the narrative highlight religious ubiquity, like the author's reference to paintings of Herod on church walls as a way of commenting on the brutalities of Bayezid (p. 69). This sort of passing comment helps put colour back in the everyday environment, not just in the big banner-filled set piece scenes.

The editors are to be commended for an introduction that is useful and instructive without being wearying, and for including useful but not excessive explanatory information throughout the text itself. As with the best translations, the text is left largely to speak for itself, on its own terms, telling us of Tamerlane and Tripoli and the Venetians and other great figures, places, and peoples that made Boucicault's world so interesting. Boucicault may not be an impartial guide for a tour of the chivalric highlights of the medieval world, but he is certainly an entertaining one.

NICHOLAS D. BRODIE, *Hobart, Tasmania*

**Thomson**, Rodney M., *A Descriptive Catalogue of the Medieval Manuscripts in the Library of Peterhouse, Cambridge*, Cambridge, Brewer, 2016; hardback; pp. xliv, 250; 130 colour illustrations; R.R.P. £95.00; ISBN 9781843844419.

The manuscript catalogues of Oxford and Cambridge colleges produced by Rodney Thomson have the same stature as those produced by Montague Rhodes James, but consistently introduce a level of analytic accuracy demanded by the passage of time. This is particularly true of this volume on the manuscripts of Peterhouse, the oldest of the Cambridge colleges, which James described in 1899, but which have now been freshly described by Thomson. The labour that goes into such a volume often passes in silence, as so many minor details will be relevant only to the rare scholar who needs to know about the content of a particular manuscript. In this case, the antiquity of Peterhouse makes its manuscript collection potentially valuable for the insights it might give into intellectual life in the early centuries of the University at Cambridge. In fact, as Thomson warns, we know little for certain about its library before its earliest library catalogue from 1418. As with most such college libraries, its collection was formed from donations by individual scholars over the centuries, sometimes long after the foundation of Peterhouse by Hugh of Balsam, bishop of Ely, in 1284. Nonetheless, enough interesting books survive for us to gain some insights into Cambridge intellectual life (often overshadowed by that of Oxford) in the earliest centuries of the university. Even when the early history of a manuscript is uncertain, there are still items that demand attention. Thomson's analysis, following in the tradition of James and R. A. B. Mynors (whose annotations on the James 1899 catalogue assisted Thomson in this task) focuses more on the historical than intellectual significance of the texts preserved in the library. Nonetheless, there are many treasures at Peterhouse worthy of note.

Occasionally the significance of the date of a particular manuscript is passed over. For example, Thomson describes MS 150, containing parts of the *Conflatus* of Francis of Meyronnes, in the introduction as pre-dating the College's foundation (p. xviii), but more accurately describes it as early fourteenth-century in the Catalogue itself (p. 90). It might have been helpful to add that this must be an exceptionally early MS of the work, as Meyronnes (c. 1288–1328), a French Franciscan, an independently minded follower of Scotus, only lectured on the sentences in 1320–21. He does observe, however, that, like two other MSS (109 containing Odo of Cheriton's sermons; and 178, a fourteenth-century copy of many medical texts, including some by Ricardus Anglicus), it has annotations in English as well as Latin, a revealing insight into the developing use of English within a scholastic context. Similarly, Thomson notes that MS 82 is a late thirteenth-century manuscript containing Giles of Rome on *De bona fortuna* and Aristotle's *Rhetorica*, and

Aquinas with the continuation by Peter of Auvergne on Aristotle's *Politics*. Given that Moerbeke only translated *De bona fortuna* (derived from Aristotle's *Ethica* and the *Magna moralia*) in 1270, and that Peter of Auvergne (d. 1304) completed the Aquinas commentary on the *Politics* sometime before the 1290s, the extraordinary intellectual importance of this manuscript deserves to be signalled.

There are many other treasures in this collection, whose early history is not known, including late eleventh-century copies of the *Collectio canonum Lanfranci* (MS 40), annotated before 1130 by Symeon of Durham, and of a glossed Boethius *De arithmetica* and Cicero on rhetoric (MS 248). Among later scholastic manuscripts, the reviewer observes that there are late thirteenth- or early fourteenth-century copies from England, not just of Aquinas (MSS 47, 48, 76) but also (MS 152) of Siger of Brabant and Albert the Great. For understanding the diversity of intellectual perspectives within England in a period which generated both Scotus and Ockham, this is of great importance. Only by browsing this catalogue, magnificently supplemented by over a hundred images, can the significance of this collection be properly appreciated.

CONSTANT J. MEWS, *Monash University*

**Thomson**, Simon, and Michael **Bintley**, eds, *Sensory Perception in the Medieval West* (Utrecht Studies in Medieval Literacy, 34), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; hardback; pp. ix, 254; 11 colour, 15 b/w illustrations, 3 b/w tables; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9782503567143.

The topic of sensory perception has become of increasing interest to scholars over the last thirty years. Having moved away from the notion that perception is a purely mental process, the present challenge is to engage a historical sensory experience beyond 'simpler descriptions of understanding or interpretation' (p. 3). This collection of essays seeks to explore the two cruxes, as they are described, connected to this subject: 'how an audience's sensory perception could be exploited or piqued by objects and experiences in the medieval world; [and] how scholars can attempt to bridge the gap between present and past sensory engagements' (pp. 1–2).

This is achieved through an interdisciplinary approach to the topic of sensory perception, going beyond the study of literature by including other material matters that have proven their worth in previous discussions on physical and sensory experience. The result is an impressive collection of essays investigating a wide range of aspects of this comprehensive and difficult theme through exploring textual and material products of the medieval period. A broad range of methodologies, from linguistic investigation to surveys, and from conventional considerations to statistical analysis, is used to cover these diverse aspects. The following is a discussion of but a few of the essays included in the work.

Author Jonathan Wilcox explores the second ‘cruX’ of the book by raising questions about our own sensory engagement with medieval manuscript studies. He points out that with the turn from traditional print to digital media, we might lose sight of what is ‘missing’. He concludes his contribution to the book with the paradoxical statement that ‘the digital revolution and a new-found respect for the academic study of craft may be the perfect combination’ (p. 51) to engage all our senses when dealing with these manuscripts.

The use of more modern technologies becomes clear in the next essay, where Mariana López explores the aural experience in the medieval York Mystery Plays. The relevance of acoustics in these dramas ‘highlights the importance of sound in the period’ (p. 73). The fact that the staging of the plays was designed to make the most of the acoustic characteristics, possibly through rigorous trial-and-error, suggests an approach based on hearing over sight in their performances.

The emphasis on the primacy of hearing is continued in the next chapter, where Eric Lacey considers the significance of sound in the naming of birds in the oral society of the Anglo-Saxons. Through two impressive case studies he illustrates the differing ways in which aurality was of importance for bird naming, without trivializing the influence of visual means. Pointing out the correlation between the names of the birds and the sensory motivation that inspired them, Lacey identifies hearing and sight as complementary senses. Aurality remains superior, however, as ‘hearing can both supplement the visual and supersede it, granting knowledge where the visual cannot’ (p. 98).

Meg Boulton’s consideration of Anglo-Saxon decor and structures provides us with a means of comprehending the differences and commonalities between modern and medieval notions of perception. She emphasizes the need to understand how a work of art, for example, may have been perceived in the medieval period, engaging the viewer through symbolism and a shared identity, and how it is viewed today. This way, ‘we may see not just a world [...], but a world beyond the world’ (p. 226).

These, and the other essays included in *Sensory Perception in the Medieval West*, attempt to explore many complex aspects of sensory perception and their implications for further inquiry. Regardless of the vastly diverse topics, the collection of articles is a pleasure to read and gives the reader a glimpse of the staggering complexity of the subject of sensory perception. Its interdisciplinary approach and the wide range of different methodologies make the book indubitably useful for the ongoing debates on how meaning was crafted and shaped in the Middle Ages, and how we may adequately approach it.

FLORA GUIJT, *The Hague, The Netherlands*

**Tonry**, Kathleen, *Agency and Intention in English Print, 1476–1526* (Texts and Transitions, 7), Turnhout, Brepols, 2016; pp. xv, 241; 15 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503535760.

Kathleen Tonry argues that the first fifty years of early print in England is a neglected field of study, as it has been regarded by most scholars primarily as a prelude to the Reformation. In this book she offers a new reading of early print based on the individual agencies of the makers of books, such as printers. In so doing she takes issue with determinist approaches, such as Elizabeth Eisenstein's influential thesis that the printing press itself was the agent of change, a necessary precondition for the Reformation, as well as the view that the press developed primarily in response to economic or commercial imperatives. Rather, Tonry regards print as 'merely an instrument of agencies, and one among many' (p. 213).

Tonry's interpretation of the press during these years is nuanced and complex. She suggests that by recasting early print from the perspective of the agency, intentions, and personalities of the book producers — the printers — unexpected cultural structures are revealed, such as the emergence of usury as a crucial subject in religious literature for mercantile readers. As she notes, agency or the 'capacity for responsible individual action' (p. 13) is not usually used in describing early printed books, for there is a modern assumption that early printers had limited intellectual investment in the books they published. So how were agency and intention (the strategic action of agency) expressed by printers?

Tonry describes ethical discourses of book production within a not-for-profit framework, specifically the important concept of common profit or the common good, which she traces from Augustine to Thomas Aquinas, Reginald Pecock, and Robert Copland. Emerging from monastic practice where common profit was related to non-remunerative book production, in the era of print it acts as a legitimization of commercial exchange. A book printed for purposes of common profit relied on the moral purpose of a declared producer, identified in the colophon. A declaration of both the moral and technological responsibility of the printer for the book, the colophon became a standard and necessary feature. The personality of the printer was also stressed through added prologues and interpolated passages.

William Caxton was the first printer to state common profit intentions, declared in his prologue to the allegory *The Game and Playe of the Chesse* (1474). This was followed by similar statements by others such as Wynkyn de Worde in *Orchard of Syon* (1519), who emphasized spiritual common profits, which of course could be effectively promulgated through the dissemination of books. While a stated intention of profit for the common good served to justify commercial profit, it also deflected any accusations of usury or idleness directed at the mercantile class to which printers belonged. This was

in a political and social environment not always sympathetic to merchant autonomy, as attested by the Usury Act 1487, the Alien Merchants Act 1487 and other rulings.

While the Crown attempted to assert authority over the merchant community by control of the press, Tonry describes how printers demonstrated ethical agency through the production of religious books. Devotional works such as Caxton's translation and edition of the *Golden Legend* (1484) and Pynson's *Kalendar of Shepherds* (1506) were used to legitimize the merchant community. In the same vein, Caxton added a chapter to his 1487 translation and edition of the *Book of Good Maners*, which in emphasizing spiritual conduct and profits addressed the social state of merchants (including printers) and valorized trust between the merchants and the community. Tonry argues that this indicates the text was deliberately shaped for mercantile reading. Similarly, the prologue to the 1493 edition of *Dives and Pauper*, printed by Richard Pynson and the merchant John Russhe, indicates a mercantile readership. Translated French material, such as the *Floure of the Ten Commandements* (1521), was also deliberately shaped within the preface to represent the good intentions of English merchant readers.

Agency in relation to printers and readers of the chronicle form is also analysed. Tonry describes how the two current historiographical modes, diachronic and synchronic, found different limitations and capabilities in manuscript and print; for example, in manuscript form the *Polychronicon* was a diachronic, open-ended text that invited the reader to continue the narrative. In his printed version of 1482 Caxton completed the book with his *Liber ultimis* chapter, based in part on the synchronically arranged *Fasciculus temporum*, which relied on a diagrammatic *mise-en-page* that because it required precise replication was more suited to print than manuscript. While giving agency to printers, it also gave readers a different agency, as the synchronic mode meant that readers could theoretically complete it in unpredictable ways.

Tonry's arguments are sometimes diffuse and speculative; however, in the main, her book is original and insightful and a valuable contribution to the study of early print.

HILARY MADDOCKS, *University of Melbourne*

**Waddell**, Mark A., *Jesuit Science and the End of Nature's Secrets*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2015; hardback; pp. 224; 16 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781472449726.

AMDG, *Ad maiorem Dei gloriam*, the Jesuit mantra, begins (p. 4, with the words oddly permuted) and ends this work (p. 191), but God gets scant mention otherwise: its concern is the seventeenth-century treatment of the 'mysterious' events of nature. This book looks at the problems the Jesuits

faced in reconciling the mysterious forces of what we now call nature with the strengthening Aristotelian approach bequeathed by Aquinas.

What is magic? Or what was it? In the seventeenth century magic was a close neighbour of science, witness Isaac Newton's long interest in alchemy as well as in the theory of motion. The differences between science and magic were, to say the least, blurred. Waddell's book explores the intellectual boundaries through the work of three Jesuits: Niccolò Cabeo, Gaspar Schott, and the well-known Athanasius Kircher. Countless books and papers have been written about Kircher, even in the last few years, so Waddell does not go into detailed analysis but looks rather at Kircher's methodology.

The central thesis is that seventeenth-century Jesuits initially had problems about ontology. Rather than analyse the ontology they presented ways of imitating nature, in particular by constructing marvellous and mysterious machines. Waddell's simple writing splendidly recreates the intellectual atmosphere that surrounded the Jesuits of the period.

Magnetism was a great ally in this process of imitation and much discussion of the change in its ontological status is used to provide a specific example, apart from the fact that one of Waddell's protagonists wrote many tomes on the subject (Kircher, *Magnes: sive, De arte magnetica*, Rome, 1641). The mysteriousness of nature was thereby, pardon the pun, denatured and brought into the realm of what we now call science. However, in the process, the Aristotelian dependence on sense data for information about the world was juxtaposed with the fallibility of those very senses. For example, Kircher would construct, or depict, models that exploited visual effects and thereby increased understanding of the mysteries of nature. In one instance he invited the viewers to peer into his model and see the distance through mirrors, while at the same time deceiving the observers into believing they were seeing infinity (pp. 111–15). The arguments led the reader to a probable view of the world, or part of it, rather than a view that had a ring of certainty (note that this does not mean a probabilistic view). The use of analogy (barely commented on by Waddell) seems also to have been important and prevalent.

The contrasts between the Jesuits' expositions and those of the Royal Society of London are deftly treated: both sought attention and were trying to popularize science by magical spectacles. Even today the Royal Society lectures for the general public employ spectacle as an attractor.

O'Malley and his co-editors' *The Jesuits: Cultures, Sciences and the Arts, 1540–1773* (Toronto University Press, 1999), was one of the earlier, but still fairly recent, books to tackle Waddell's concerns, but a literature review in the present book would have been useful for the non-specialist reader. It would also have been good to see more evidence of the seventeenth-century readers' responses to these three authors, though the existence of up to three editions of some of their huge works clearly indicates a significant degree of interest.

As adumbrated above, the language Waddell uses is a breath of fresh air, since it is purged of jargon, unlike that in many books of our era on theoretical history. My only complaint is with the publication's odd use of capital letters on random occasions in names such as del Rio or della Porta.

In this book Waddell has managed to convey the dilemmas facing seventeenth-century religious trying to reconcile emerging science — the legacy of Aristotle — with the mysteries of nature. He is to be commended on the clarity of his language in presenting the development of thought where there was much obfuscation. It may be salutary to point out that there are still mysteries of nature: gravity waves have only just been identified and even some distinguished physicists still believe, surely erroneously, that they are close to a theory of everything. In the end the aim of the seventeenth-century Jesuits was clearly, as Waddell says on his last page (p. 191), to present knowledge (and of course education also) *ad maiorem Dei gloriam*.

JOHN N. CROSSLEY, *Monash University*

**Webster**, Paul, and Marie-Pierre **Gelin**, eds, *The Cult of St Thomas Becket in the Plantagenet World, c. 1170 – c. 1220*, Woodbridge, Boydell, 2016; hardback; pp. xviii, 252; 10 colour, 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781783271610.

The nine chapters in this edited volume examine the reception and impact of Thomas Becket as a saint within the Plantagenet world during the century after his murder. As the eight-hundredth anniversary of the 1220 translation of his relics at Canterbury approaches, the editors and authors of this collection have approached the Becket phenomenon within the contemporary context that created it. The attention to context in this volume illustrates the wide range of meanings contemporaries and near-contemporaries found in the martyred archbishop as well as the varied uses to which the new saint could be put. The volume seeks to add to the conversations surrounding Thomas by displaying scholarship based upon a diverse assemblage of sources, drawn from texts and from material culture.

As a result of the diversity of its authors' approaches and subject matter, this volume will be of interest to scholars of multiple specialities, including history, literature, and art history, along with others. The collection also speaks to regions beyond England and northern France, particularly Spain and Germany. The contributors themselves come from varied backgrounds, specialties and positions, including established experts on Becket, such as Anne J. Duggan, and scholars at an earlier stage of their career. This range adds to the collection's appeal. Anyone undertaking research on Becket can profit from the overview of the current historiography by Paul Webster in the first chapter. Webster's summary is thorough and extremely valuable, although its very comprehensiveness, paired with its necessary brevity in

exposition, makes it somewhat unwieldy. In her chapter, Anne J. Duggan studies the development and dissemination of Becket's martyrdom narratives and his new liturgy, along with the Plantagenet embrace of the new saint. In her consideration of these topics, Duggan raises issues upon which later chapters elaborate. Marie-Pierre Gelin examines how Becket as a new saint fit into the existing saintly community at Canterbury, and how the structure of the cathedral and its windows were redesigned to present St Dunstan and St Alphege as prefigurations of him. Far from eclipsing the cults of these earlier Canterbury saints, Thomas's veneration reinvigorated them. Elma Brenner uncovers the motivations and relationships behind the dedication of leper houses to the new saint in Normandy. Michael Staunton guides readers through representations of St Thomas in twelfth- and thirteenth-century historical writing. Expanding the collection's geographical range, Colette Bowie and José Manuel Cerda analyse the spread and patronage of Becket's cult in Saxony and Castile. In both places, Angevin dynastic connections through marriage played a substantial role.

Repeatedly, the chapters return to issues of appropriation and accommodation, or how the Becket phenomenon came to serve different agendas. Multiple essays explore the transformation of the archbishop from a Plantagenet dynastic enemy into a patron. Likewise, Becket became a far mightier and more appreciated patron for the monks at Canterbury after his death than he could have ever been in life. Far from a cynical presentation, the authors strive to present these appropriations as sincere results of historical actors' beliefs and the exigencies in which these beliefs were articulated, and how the reception and application of Becket's legacy was subject to continuous development and often overlapping meanings. In his second chapter in the volume, Webster describes how the Angevin association with Thomas Becket acted as 'a "ghost of Christmas past"', in the conflict between King John and Innocent III over Stephen Langton (p. 153). This examination of the meanings found within Becket's legacy during the reign of John illustrates again how the exact meaning of that legacy was situationally negotiable. The collection ends with Alyce A. Jordan's conceptually ambitious exploration of the Becket stained glass windows at Angers and Coutances as manifestations of the 'sly civility' described by Homi Bhabha within postcolonial theory (pp. 199, 204). Jordan's application of approaches drawn from border studies and postcolonial theory continues the collection's emphasis on multiplicity and forms a fitting ending for the collection.

Variety in the case of this collection is a strength, but it might, nonetheless, have benefitted from a larger and more synthetic introduction, laying out more clearly the larger, unified, contributions it as a whole provides to the field. As it stands, the volume is like the huntsman described by Walter Map (*De nugis curialium*, 2.32): it brings readers much useful game from which they can make the dishes they desire.

MICHAEL D. BARBEZAT, *The University of Western Australia*

**Yale**, Elizabeth, *Sociable Knowledge: Natural History and the Nation in Early Modern Britain* (Material Texts), Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016; cloth; pp. 384; 9 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US \$69.95, £45.50; ISBN 9780812247817.

Unfortunately the title of Elizabeth Yale's book will not attract the attention of most scholars who would find its contents illuminating. It is a specialist work that provides little background for newcomers to the field of scientific development in the late seventeenth century but is full of valuable insights into how the contemporary publications that scholars now take for granted came into being, what their philosophical background was, and what are the limitations of their discoveries. Her focus is on the ways in which a topographical concept of Britain was created and in what ways those whose interests in nature were moving beyond the local both relied on, and at the same time disassociated themselves from, the studies of precise localities.

Yale's sources derive from a group of men who would one way or another have described themselves as naturalists, loosely connected by their very different associations with Oxford University and in particular the Ashmolean. Men of rather different social origins and standing (that Yale does not discuss), they were drawn together by a common interest in the nature of the world and of the kingdom they belonged to. Vital to her study are Elias Ashmole and Anthony Wood, John Aubrey, Joshua Childrey, Samuel Hartlib, John Ray, and Edward Lhuyd. Yale draws on their letters to claim that the purpose which drove them to research the nature and basis of the land and how it informed the people who called themselves Britons or who were committed to their more local origins was often moved by religious aspirations.

Yale has studied the marginalia in their manuscripts and letters to demonstrate how a composite view that added together the different perspectives of these men, produced by various methods of 'correspondence', resulted in published descriptions of Britain available to all who could access books. In doing so, she perhaps underplays the work of their predecessors. The only sixteenth-century author she quotes is Leland, whose survey of England, made at Henry VIII's request, was well known. Lambarde is referred to in passing and William Camden's work on the topic seen only as his model. Christopher Sexton's maps, the tapestry maps Ralph Sheldon produced, and the reports to Burghley that were critical to government, and others, are ignored. The work of those such as the apothecaries who were, like John Ray but with a rather more practical purpose, seeking to establish a clear identification and distinctions between the plants sold to them by a common name, is not included.

Yale's investigation makes clear aspects of the subject that have been largely assumed and not carefully demonstrated. Preserving the relevant

material — physical as well as written — collected by researchers, in institutions where they could be available to later workers in the field, was a serious problem. Such a problem was addressed especially by those who established the Ashmolean, where the managers worked on the best methods of making archives clear and accessible to those permitted to use them. As Yale shows, a structure to effect this by the particular means of cataloguing adopted had long term implications.

She also discusses how the costs of publishing elaborate books with complex images — which was very expensive — were met. The ways in which subscriptions were employed to ensure that such volumes could be produced involved considerable time, care, and the exploitation of social relations. And the prestige of inclusion of the monarch and the titled on subscription lists is illustrated.

In conclusion, she reflects on the extent to which the objective of establishing and maintaining a unified vision of Britain was achieved and suggests that each book was in fact a different edition of the nation. The correspondence within which the naturalists worked, which drew in many local individuals in the assembling of the knowledge on which each was based, however, was the common context that enabled these editions to be created, and the dissemination of the books that resulted across the country helped maintain the idea of collaboration. The university was less committed to maintaining the body of the archives, selling much of Lhuyd's Celtic manuscripts to pay off the outstanding costs of his *Archæologia Britannica*. Yale's final suggestion is that in the eighteenth century much of this was set aside as the religious ideas that had infused them were abandoned.

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*