Reviews

Statement of Retraction

We, the Editors and Publisher of the journal *Parergon*, have retracted the following article:

Cusack, Carole M., review of James Simpson, *Permanent Revolution: The Reformation and the Illiberal Roots of Liberalism*, *Parergon*, 39.1 (2022), 264–66.

Since publication of *Parergon*, 39.1 (2022), the Editors and Publisher have been informed that due to an error on the part of the author, the article had already been published at an earlier date in another journal. All parties have agreed to retract the article to comply with both journals' policy on submissions.

We have been informed in our decision-making by both the *Parergon* submission policy, which states the journal does not accept submissions that have already been published or are currently under consideration elsewhere, and the COPE guidelines on retractions.

The retracted article will remain online to maintain the scholarly record, but it will be digitally watermarked on each page as 'Retracted'.

Adams, Tracy, and Christine **Adams**, *The Creation of the French Royal Mistress: From Agnès Sorel to Madame Du Barry*, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2020; hardback; pp. xii, 236; R.R.P. US$89.95; ISBN 9780271085975.

Notwithstanding its somewhat unpromising opening words—'Semiformalized extraconjugal relationships' (p. ix)—this work is written in a highly readable style, rendering it accessible, as well as of potential interest, to non-scholarly individuals, not only academics. That said, its aims are squarely academic. France's 'official' royal mistresses have received attention to date mostly from popular historians, whose aim has been titillation, not serious scrutiny. Tracy Adams and Christine Adams set out, by examining nine of the most prominent, to determine how the phenomenon of the French royal mistress came about. As they stress, though rulers' concubines were nothing new, in France they developed into something unique: not just the king's lover, they had a recognized position at court, and might be influential political advisors. How did this happen?

The analytical framework adopted is that of Fernand Braudel's time cycles. While this approach has explanatory power regarding the mistresses themselves, it stresses the connections their history has with things evolving concurrently. The authors argue that the French royal mistress took on her peculiar character when longstanding medieval attitudes to women (that they were as capable as

men, though legally inferior) aligned with the fifteenth-century rise of male royal favourites, who had no claim to power through birth but wielded influence via the king's favour, plus the growing theatricalization of the court in the sixteenth century. With these key criteria satisfied, the stage was set for female favourites who, without formal status, were nonetheless thought competent to offer the monarch advice. To come into being, the role still awaited the right woman and the right king. As can be seen, this book inserts itself into existing scholarship on a range of topics. While the nature of the subject would always have made it relevant to fields such as court history, women's history, and so on, the approach highlights such interconnections.

Having foreshadowed their line of attack in a valuable introduction, the authors' development of the role of mistress is then pursued by means of a series of chapters devoted to individuals, beginning with Agnès Sorel, who, they contend, pre-dated the coalescence of factors that brought into being the 'official' royal mistress. The lives and fates of the individuals treated in these chapters, Sorel not least, present their own interest. However, the broader argument commences in the sixteenth century, when court behaviour became more artificial and theatrical in the wake of Castiglione's *Book of the Courtier*. The authors trace the 'official' mistress's history, from its inception with Anne de Pisseleu d'Heilly and Diane de Poitiers, mistresses of François I and Henri II, through the ill-fated Gabrielle d'Estrées (Henri IV), then the mistresses of Louis XIV and Louis XV, to the Revolution.

Essential to the position of mistress, the authors argue—and this will be the volume's main contribution to scholarly debate—was the fact she represented an 'open secret', whereby everybody knew of her presence, and drew on her patronage or influence as needed, but nobody formally acknowledged she existed. That could happen because of the dissimulation now characteristic of the court; it meant that alongside the foreign-born queens, whose loyalties were always suspect, might live another woman, capable of giving the king political advice since her primary devotion was always to him and to France. The mistress therefore became the centre of cultural and political activity at court, with the queen the centre of virtue and propriety. This open secret, however, depended on the mistress having some pre-existing reason for attendance at court: she might herself be an aristocrat or belong to a family of royal officials. Nobody then needed to explain why she was there. Part of the authors' case is that if this 'open secret' came under strain the system underpinning the mistresses' role would break down. Henri IV's desire to marry Gabrielle d'Estrées threatened to collapse the distance between mistress and queen, provoking resistance. Louis XIV married Madame de Maintenon secretly; to all appearance she remained his mistress. Louis XV's recruitment of mistresses from the non-aristocratic classes brought about the delegitimization of the position. The authors end by suggesting that Marie Antoinette's attempt to take over the roles previously occupied by both queen and mistress helped precipitate her downfall.

The volume seems well balanced in its conclusions, perhaps owing to the many discussions from which the 'Acknowledgments' say it arose. The writing, as noted, is clear, and the production values are good. The authorial approach ensures this is not a history narrowly confined to the lives of the women themselves, but draws connections with developments in wider French history, something that renders it useful to scholars in other areas.

Patrick Ball, *Hobart, Tasmania*

Andersen, Kasper H., Jeppe **Büchert Netterstrøm**, Lisbeth **Imer**, Bjorn **Poulsen**, and Rikke **Steenholt Olesen**, eds, *Urban Literacy in the Nordic Middle Ages* (Utrecht Studies in Medieval Literacy, 53), Turnhout, Brepols, 2021; hardback; pp. xv, 465; 46 b/w illustrations, 2 b/w maps; R.R.P. €120.00; ISBN 9782503596747.

This is a landmark volume in an expanding research field devoted to developments across a range of social, cultural, and intellectual institutions in the medieval North. As its title indicates, this volume grapples with literacy in an urban context, and the vexed issues around its definition, identification, and analysis. There are many ways to construe medieval literacy across a range of theoretical axes—literacy versus orality, urban versus rural, full/coherent versus partial—and according to use and purpose (for example, narrative, ecclesiastical, administrative, or pragmatic), and these are all usefully mapped out in the introductory chapter, which scopes the current state of scholarship and identifies cruces and critical issues. These include such topics as script as an urban phenomenon, the definition of literacy in its many and varied instantiations, understanding medieval Scandinavian towns and urbanization as compared with non-urban social structures, and describing the array of discourses in which literacy played a role: the church, schools, markets, trade and accounting, administration and law, public epigraphy, and personal use. Curiously, at times the research reveals the urban/non-urban divide might not be the most suitable for explaining the development of literacy, and this issue arises in a number of places in this volume.

The geography of this book extends across the continental/peninsular Nordic countries of Finland, Sweden, Norway, and Denmark, and many of the thirteen chapters provide comprehesnive overviews of the current state of knowledge in its given subfield. A brief summary here will reveal the scope. The first two chapters examine runic writing in Denmark, Lisbeth M. Imer opening with a survey chapter, and Rikke Steenholt Olesen examining the use of runic script for Latin text. The two succeeding chapters shift focus to Norway, Eliese Kleivane dealing with urban exemplars of roman epigraphic text, while Kristel Zilmer, using case studies, surveys runic artefacts as evidence for types of medieval literacy. The volume then shifts gear, with Gitte Tarnow Ingvardsen considering the literacy—or lack thereof over time—to be found in Scandinavian coins, and what this might indicate, and then Janne Harjula, Visa Immonen and Kirsi Salonen jointly contributing an overview and analysis of markers of literacy in the multilingual

medieval Finnish town of Turku. Next, Marten Søvso provides a chronological survey of evidence for literacy in the archaeology of the Danish market town of Ribe. Three further chapters follow on Danish 'civic' literacy: two, by Jeppe Büchert Netterstrøm and Kasper H. Andersen, examine the functions and use of elite administrative and legal literacy; and the third, by Bjørn Poulsen, explores the development, status, roles, and responsibilities of medieval Danish town scribes. Theressia Pettersson then examines civic literacy in Stockholm, looking to minute books for the 'voice' of the literate urban community. The penultimate chapter, by Johnny Grandjean Gøgsig Jakobsen, provides a thorough and useful treatment of the Dominicans' influence in Scandinavian institutional literacy, and the volume ends with a detailed examination of archaeological evidence for literacy from Lund Cathedral, revealing the cultural reach of medieval ecclesiastical literacy.

Throughout the volume, key points are well-supported with monochrome illustrations, although in places the lack of colour leaves some illustrations wanting. Likewise, the presentation of runic text could have benefited from the consistent use of transcription and transliteration, alongside translation, and only a minimum of actual runic examples are illustrated. Moreover, the non-English-speaking background of this book's production has resulted in a curious and mistaken usage—in a number of places the term 'literalization' has been used for the processes involved in a society becoming literate, whereas the relevant English word is 'literacization'.

But leaving these minor points aside, this volume argues a strong basis for recognizing the divergent cultures of medieval Scandinavia, revealing that literacy (and literacization) are multifaceted social and cultural activities that can be quite geographically distinct, and yet share much. In cultures with competing script systems and different languages being put to different purposes, and in cultures where different social domains have different literacy, scholarship needs specificity and precision. This volume offers both, delivers a solid grounding in the current state of knowledge in this field, and provides an ideal introductory yet detailed base for both experts and non-experts alike.

Roderick McDonald, *Emu Forge, Sheffield, UK*

Antenhofer, Christina, and Mark **Mersiowsky**, eds, *The Roles of Medieval Chanceries: Negotiating Rules of Political Communication* (Utrecht Studies in Medieval Literacy, 51), Turnhout, Brepols, 2021; hardback; pp. ix, 198; 24 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €70.00; ISBN 9782503589640.

The extensive 'Utrecht Studies in Medieval Literacy' series has been a leader in the study of pragmatic literacy and its intersections with power, law, language, and identity since its first volume (1999). In this instalment, editors Christina Antenhofer and Mark Mersiowsky present eight essays exploring the offices, officials, and rules by which pragmatic documents were produced, focused mainly on the lands of the late medieval empire. The collection's central hypothesis is that chanceries were 'field[s] of experimentation where different solutions were

tested, passed on, or wiped out' (p. 7). This is the chief, but not only, meaning of 'negotiation' promised in the title that the contributors explore. The volume is organized in three parts, moving outwards from documents themselves, through the organization of chanceries and their work, to chanceries in communication with each other and other parties.

Part I opens with Sébastien Barret on the linguistic and visual norms of *sancitones* in 'private deeds' among early Cluniac charters. Prima facie, such documents operate outside an institutional framework, but Barret's analysis reveals a 'negotiation' between institutional norms and external users, who sometimes borrow them for their authoritative aesthetic, irrespective of legal force. Arnold Otto also examines *sanctiones*—this time in the reign of Charles IV—, particularly their penal clauses. He shows that the value of fines varied by category of transgression rather than over time, and there is curiously little evidence for their enforcement. By drawing attention to the remarkably stable signification of the severity of offences he asks whether fines, too, were chiefly symbolic statements.

Part II features three chapters examining chancery personnel and practices. Ellen Widder discusses three fifteenth-century chancery ordinances, interrogating their common and peculiar features in relation to context. It is not surprising to find matters such as secrecy, loyalty, and trustworthiness among the recurring issues regulated in these documents, but, as Widder points out, it is dangerous to extrapolate too confidently from rules responding to specific crises and intended for restricted use. We might ask, rather, why certain crises generated certain kinds of regulation. Julia Hörmann-Thurn und Taxis takes a different route to practice, examining annotations on internal registers as a means of accessing the workflow and internal organization of chanceries in fourteenth-century Bavaria and Tyrol. Here, too, we find that even successful practices rarely persist and develop in linear ways: their adoption or abandonment seem to relate more to the habits and presence of individual clerks than to absolute rationalities. Klaus Brandstätter then examines the urban chanceries of the Holy Roman Empire, and finds once again that idiosyncrasies of clerical training, experience, and personality shaped the structure and organization of chanceries, and the format of town books, although economic and demographic issues were also significant. This chapter forms an interesting comparison with that of Michaela Marini on the development of the chancery and office of chancellor in the fifteenth-century Tyrolean Diet, where political forces seem to have been as significant as personal and economic ones in shaping change.

Administrative 'fiction' is a recurring theme throughout the collection, most prominently in Isabella Lazzarini's contribution on late medieval Italian chanceries, in Part III. These chanceries were charged with generating fictions of authority 'on behalf of regimes that were in fact barely legitimate and only partially autonomous' (p. 128). Meanwhile, they excused their novel experimentation by recourse to fictions of tradition. Finally, Lazzarini shows how the proliferation of rules, and rules about observing the rules, was not reflected in reality. Rather, such

texts represent fictions of enforcement. These fictions enabled, while obscuring, the flexibility that was essential for chanceries to meet the administrative challenges of new situations. Antenhofer's chapter discusses an example of such challenges and unsettles an easy assumption of administrative progress by focusing on the work of a chancery in a territory that failed to develop coherence or proceed to modern statehood. In Antenhofer's view, the troubled negotiations for a marriage between the Gorizian count and a Gonzaga heiress expose both attempts at and limits of diplomatic experimentation. Neither side properly understands the other, and differences of practice are judged as moral and political failings, despite the successfully 'hybrid' format of the documents agreed between them.

This volume illustrates the dynamic—even surprisingly chaotic—processes by which the structure, personnel, and practices of later medieval chanceries evolved. Far from being fixed, or developing along predictable lines, norms of communication were negotiated through the local interaction of issuing authorities, documents, and users, and by exposure to unfamiliar habits through scribal mobility and diplomatic encounter. Sometimes diverse chanceries converged on common solutions to common challenges, but this was not an automatic or unidirectional development; there were many false starts. The volume is a powerful corrective to the narrative of rational progress in administration towards the formation of the modern state that often, if only implicitly, underpins studies of medieval documentary production.

Kathleen B. Neal, *Monash University*

Bladen, Victoria, *The Tree of Life and Arboreal Aesthetics in Early Modern Literature* (Routledge Studies in World Literature and the Environment), New York, Routledge, 2021; hardback; pp. 246; 20 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US$160.00; ISBN 9781032017860.

Dr Victoria Bladen has published extensively on aesthetic concepts in the visual arts and literature. In this exciting new work, she establishes further perceptions, making the concept of 'arboreal aesthetics' her basis for a fresh approach to deeper cultural understandings. Concerned primarily with interconnections between art and poetry in the early modern period, Bladen illuminates her argument with substantial instances from the work of William Shakespeare, George Herbert, Henry Vaughan, Aemilia Lanyer, and Andrew Marvell. Drawing attention to the phenomenon of the tree of life motif in both religious and secular understanding of the natural world, she examines diverse poetic forms, finding that aesthetic considerations embrace changing political realities through the seventeenth century. This book is admirably unified as a set of six extended essays, each deriving from foundational aspects of 'arboreal aesthetics' as a historical phenomenon. Bladen offers five discrete, though inter-linked, studies of early modern writers. Each discussion has its distinctive identity in developing the overall concept and contributing to the effectiveness of the book as a whole. There is a lucid progression from the still almost medieval to the definitively modern.

In Chapter 1, 'Arboreal Aesthetics: The Language of Trees', Bladen outlines the thematic parameters for what is to follow. We are bidden to share in a sense of progression from ancient European forms of arboreal consciousness, and thence from northern and ancient Egyptian instances, leading us toward classical Greek manifestations of the tree of life. Concomitantly, she reviews the early biblical tradition as leading toward the figure of Christ at the centre of medieval tree-reference. Historically, representation of the tree of life in art is seen to become increasingly identified with Christ in medieval and early modern iconography. As practices of gardening were to be developed culturally, Christ would become both the garden and the gardener (pp. 32–33). We are offered a sense of progress from Eden lamented as a lost paradise to the vision of a new paradise recreated through gardening.

In Chapter 2, 'The Garden of the Soul: George Herbert, Henry Vaughan and the Tree of Life', two prominent seventeenth-century poets are seen as following in a tradition already established by John Donne. All three poets derive understandings of the natural world through the rich biblical tradition of scriptural interpretation. Their work is shown to be grounded in interpretation of arboreal references from within the Bible and later subsequent medieval commentary, finding (for instance) that 'Herbert's work evidences his deep interest in tree of life typology' (p. 55).

The next study, entitled 'Political Gardens: Shakespeare and the Tree of Life', is particularly persuasive. It comprises an evocative pairing of two very different plays, the brutal early *Titus Andronicus* (*c.* 1593) and the serenely later *Cymbeline* (*c.* 1610). At the centre is *Titus*, which is obsessed with obscene and extreme violence; the mutilated body of Lavinia presents a horrific literal description of demonic gardening in a motif of lopping human limbs (p. 89). Conversely, in *Cymbeline*, recovery from evil forces is conveyed through imagery of arboreal regrowth in a benevolent spiritual world where Christ becomes the divine gardener.

In Chapter 4, 'The Tree of Life in the Country Estate: Aemilia Lanyer', there is a first intimation of a new and inspirational genre that would soon become known as the 'country house poem'. Often associated primarily with male poets, in Lanyer's great foundation poem, 'The Description of Cookham' is revealed not in customary masculine terms but as a meditation shared by a small group of women.

In Chapter 5, 'Andrew Marvell and the Forest of the Mind', Bladen revisits some her outstanding published work from earlier years. Through two of Marvell's most significant poems, the rich iconographic meditation of 'The Garden' and the extended narrative of 'Upon Appleton House', we are transported into a deeply contemplative understanding: sensory impression gained from the natural landscape leads toward an 'imagined connection with the divine' (p. 166). Here, as elsewhere in this fine volume, the argument is both elegant and persuasive.

The final study, 'The Sacred Orchard: Ralph Austen and the Tree of Life', offers an enterprising excursion into transcultural perceptions. Here, some of

the more speculative forms of traditional theory about gardens in general and trees in particular are given value and drawn together in an identifiably modern world. Within an instructively witty exposition of gardening practice in the late seventeenth century, Bladen shows how Austen's work manages to negotiate 'a fusion of husbandry manual and sermon' (p. 189).

Victoria Bladen has provided us with an elegant and important contribution to the Routledge series 'World Literature and the Environment'.

Christopher Wortham, *The University of Western Australia*

Blakeway, Amy, *Parliament and Convention in the Personal Rule of James V of Scotland, 1528–1542*, London, Palgrave Macmillan, 2022; hardback; pp. xiv, 361; R.R.P. €99.99; ISBN 9783030893767.

As a capable administrative historian, Dr Blakeway wastes no time: 'At its heart, this book argues that specialized and expert advice was a central factor in governing Scotland in the reign of James V' (p. vii). Her study of consultation and decision-making during James's personal rule, drawing constantly on primary sources, bears this out, the resulting rich body of material greatly modifying and enlivening the accepted narrative.

Blakeway first discusses earlier misconceptions about personal as opposed to minority monarchical rule, showing that, contrary to the old assumption that 'strong adult kings ruled free from the constraints of Parliaments, councils and the like' (pp. 2–3), in the case of James V the opposite is apparent in much of the evidence. This is obscured, she notes, by changes in record-keeping practices, and the creation in 1537 of a 'secret council register' no longer extant. Blakeway concedes that the king could sometimes overrule these central advisory committees, but she shows too that he did on occasion incorporate consultation when he might have bypassed it.

Blakeway establishes the nature of each of the bodies operating during James's personal rule—parliament, court of session, and committees, including the lords of council, 'secret council', lords of articles; conventions of the burghs; and the hybrid 'lords of articles and council'—examining the parts each played (occasionally across multiple meetings), and the ways in which they might sometimes interact. Parliament, for example, had distinct roles as court (although one willing to negotiate for a high price), and as legislator; the conventions could plan for warfare and grant a tax, yet could not enact a permanent law, or try traitors, distinctions that eliminated them as rivals to parliament.

She considers, too, the limitations of sources, and the need, despite modern editions, to consult the manuscripts. The register of the lords of council and session, Blakeway observes, does not present original notes, but those compiled after meetings; actual manuscript entries are sometimes incomplete, awaiting, and not always receiving, information. She cautions that the lack of sederunt lists inhibits conclusions about who was involved in particular decisions; that council and convention records have 'wildly differing levels of detail' (p. 65); and that,

to some foreign reporters, the Scottish conventions were unfamiliar, thus not always accurately described. She addresses the period's linguistic flexibility—the elasticity of the terms 'lords' (p. 12) or 'tax' (p. 215), for example—and its usefulness in singling out the unusual meeting from others.

Chapters 2–4 examine in more depth the various relationships between councils and conventions, and the development of each during the reign. Chapter 2 charts the complex course by which the lords of articles became more than a body simply drafting laws. Chapter 3 considers the types of specialized meeting that preceded three significant events: domestic campaigns (borders; Hebrides, 1530–31); a foreign campaign (Anglo-Scottish War, 1532–33); and the royal marriage (1528–36). For both chapters, Blakeway looks at the size, type, and reasons for each meeting, and at how information was withheld or communicated—sometimes taking the ritual form of public counsel to the king, sometimes tightly controlled by secret council. New details emerge, on the concern for the king's heirless state (p. 92); in the conduct of the case of Mac Dhòmhnaill of the Isles (pp. 103–05); and on the use of differently constituted meetings to address several types of activity, all, however, relating to the broader concern of the larger meeting(s) (p. 126). Chapter 4 studies the role of the third estate (burgesses) in central government, particularly in matters of international trade and choice of staple port, and how local interests could vary responses. This less powerful estate developed alternative ways of operation—discarding royal officialdom; collective bargaining; engaging directly with the king—, the study of them hampered by loss of some records of burgh meetings before 1552.

Blakeway highlights taxation, an area hitherto less accurately reported, in Chapter 5's reappraisal of taxation's relationship to parliament and the conventions (burghs, lords of council, and the three estates, especially the clergy). The fresh appraisal is expanded in Chapters *6 and* 7 with attention to parliament's roles as civil court (especially for trying treason cases), as lawmaker (ratifying revocations, repassing laws), and as the voice of royal authority. Again, attention to the manuscript evidence—what the marginal notes of James Foulis, for instance, reveal—is of real value.

This exploration of state development during the reign is illustrated in appended tables. Attendance at the conventions is broken down by hierarchy; named individuals; and type of meeting. A second set of tables shows the history of legislation up to its recent repassing, showing that James's personal reign was more concerned with updating earlier legislation than with anti-heretical measures. A good bibliography and index support a study that few specialists would wish to be without.

Janet Hadley Williams, *The Australian National University*

Brennan, Robert, *Painting as a Modern Art in Early Renaissance Italy* (Renovatio Artium, 3), Turnhout, Brepols, 2019; hardback; pp. 366; 11 b/w, 115 colour illustrations, 1 b/w table; R.R.P. €125.00; ISBN 9781912554003.

This is a fabulous read that, while not exhausting its overarching theme—what constitutes modernity in painting in the early Renaissance—certainly exhausts its chosen textual examples through minute, focused analysis and multiple tangential excursions.

The book comprises an essay into a concept of modernity that acknowledges the relativity and complexity of the term, its evanescent nature. Robert Brennan structures his argument around statements from fourteenth-century writers Cennino Cennini and Franco Sacchetti, and Michele Savonarola of the fifteenth century. The approach is primarily textual and philological. Brennan retrieves the cultural context in which these views were current and examines their reception. Giorgio Vasari's description of Giotto in his *Lives of the Artists* provides the hinge—that 'the modern' was revived by Giotto, who 'banished completely that rude Greek manner' (p. 6).

In Chapter 1, Cennini's comment from his *Libro dell'arte* that Giotto 'changed the art of painting from Greek into Latin, and made it modern, and had the art more complete that anyone since', is examined (p. 17). Brennan analyses each of these phrases—what comprises 'the art of painting', what this progress 'from Greek into Latin' entails, what was Cennini's concept of modernization, and what 'complete' means. The author draws on multiple sources to illuminate this change and concludes that it is the scientific basis on which Giotto placed his art that 'made it modern'.

Chapter 2 draws on Sacchetti's *Trecentonovelle* of the 1390s. During a discussion among Florentine artists about the decay of painting, the question is asked 'Which master of painting was the greatest of all, aside from Giotto?' (p. 93). The sculptor Alberto contends that the greatest artists are the ladies of Florence, whose application of cosmetics 'could make white out of black' or make a pale figure resemble a rose (p. 9). The ambiguity in the chapter is that this 'retouching' of a God-given figure, here considered frivolous, is made to also comment on contemporary painting. After Giotto, who brought 'the art into conformity with nature' (p. 102), advancement was meant to be towards an art that enables the practitioner to 'restore things where nature is deficient'. This leads to a discussion of the emulation of nature, the concept of beauty, and the effects of fashion. Changes are driven by ideas of beauty, for instance replacing the 'yellow' skin of Byzantine figures with a more attractive pink and white, or incorporating contemporary modes of dress (p. 162). When the author moves into visual analysis there are some beautifully navigated passages, for instance on the representation of head coverings (pp. 133–47). Sacchetti's ironic and implicitly critical comment on how far fashion and cosmetics, both in people and paintings, takes art from its foundations is not entirely resolved, as reflected in the final

sentence of the chapter, suggesting that Sacchetti could only 'faintly recognize the power dynamics' driving change (p. 180).

In the third chapter, the author jumps to the 1440s and the physician Michele Savonarola, who, writing about the 'ideal canon of human proportion', laments the failure of painters to adhere to this classical ideal, relying too much on their imaginative perceptions (p. 183). This included Giotto, who, nevertheless, 'first modernized ancient and mosaic figures' (p. 181). The rational application of proportion, light (perspective), and colour theory produces beauty. A relative version of modernity is tucked into the discourse—the modern apprehended as 'of the now', 'ephemeral', prone to decay and dissolution (p. 215). Visual analyses offer welcome demonstrations of changes in facial schemas, such as the leap from the stylized 'V' between eyebrows, and oblong eye pouches, to more realistic representations. This movement is attributed to classicizing and rationalizing impulses to correct defects in the prototype, remaking the icon in the guise of reality and producing a version of beauty that was more appealing to a contemporary audience. It is a little puzzling that there should be no in-depth discussion of philosophical or religious threads in the rejection of the otherworldly nature of Byzantine and medieval hieratical representations.

At times one wonders if the statements that form the starting point for each chapter can bear the weight of so much analysis, but it is a measure of the author's wide-ranging research that the reader remains captivated. Given the title, it is surprising that it is only towards the end of the book that questions such as the reception of the paintings, the responses of painters, and the work of artists such as Masaccio are addressed. Perhaps the title could have given a clearer signal that the book is weighted more towards a textual exploration of observations made between the 1390s and 1440 than an overview of early Renaissance painting.

This beautifully produced, hefty, dense, and handsome book is a lively and rewarding excursion into early Renaissance concepts of modernity in art.

Esther Theiler, *La Trobe University*

Campion, Louise, *Cushions, Kitchens and Christ: Mapping the Domestic in Late Medieval Religious Writing* (Religion and Culture in the Middle Ages), Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 2022; hardback; pp. xvii, 180; 1 b/w illustration; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781786838308.

In his 1354 *Book of Holy Medicines*, Henry, Duke of Lancaster, deploys the image of a poor man readying his home for the overnight stay of a great lord, to allegorize his own soul's cleansing ahead of Holy Week. With the aid of servants sent on by the lord himself, efforts are made at housecleaning; the cat (the Devil) abandons the best chair, where it likes to sleep, and hides. Then, once the lord has passed on, everything reverts to normal; the cat resumes position, and so forth (*Le Livre de seyntz medicines / The Book of Holy Medicines*, ed. and trans. by Catherine Batt, ACMRS, 2014, pp. 161–66). This sort of homely image is what Campion considers in this short but dense volume; indeed, the allegory of preparing a house for the

Lord's visit features in several of her texts. As she remarks, 'The potential corpus for this study is vast' (p. 2). She focuses on four books, fifteenth-century English translations of earlier Latin works. Under the heading 'domestic' she examines housework, household interactions, and the furnishings and architecture of homes, to decipher how such imagery furthered the authors' or translators' message.

A pertinent question is to what extent these translations reflected contemporary opinion: the originals dated from past centuries. In several respects, Campion asserts in a helpful introduction, social change was lending the household new prominence; references to domestic matters in earlier works acquired new resonances. A household's ability to offer privacy and intimacy was becoming valued, the public hall ceding ground to private chambers; greater commerce meant homes were gaining more furnishings, for ostentation as well as use—hence the cushions of the volume's title; such furnishings were used, besides, for domestic devotion, whose role was likewise increasing.

Campion's four works are *The Doctrine of the Hert*, a guidance text of apparently Cistercian origin, intended for a community of enclosed female religious; the respective visions of Mechthild of Hackeborn and Bridget of Sweden; and Nicholas Love's *Mirror of the Blessed Life of Jesus Christ*. The first of these conceives the heart as a home: the reader is instructed how to prepare it for Christ's arrival (reception of the sacrament). Whereas the *Doctrine*'s 'heart-home' is sparsely furnished, in Mechthild's visions it is sumptuously appointed, demonstrating the abundance of God's grace. Bridget's visions, more apocalyptic, deploy domestic themes differently: to criticize ecclesiastical corruption, for example, she uses the common trope of the Church as besieged castle—but one already breached. Christ is typically homeless, liable to be rejected by those whose doors he knocks on. In Love's *Mirror*, Christ's visits to friends and family are important in framing the story of his life. Campion contends that Love used domestic scenes to make readers identify with Jesus (showing him setting the table, making the bed)—up to the moment of his Passion: after the Wycliffite controversy it was important to emphasize that the Eucharist was a matter for church, not home.

To my mind, the chapter on Love is the most interesting. This reflects the fact Campion has more to work with. She bases her arguments not just on the texts themselves but on what is known of their owners, what annotations reveal about their reception, and so on. Love's *Mirror*, with sixty-four extant copies, offers greater opportunity for this approach. We know that in some copies readers marked passages referring to domestic furnishings, while in another a censor has specified that certain passages (including one domestic scene) should be disregarded. Fewer surviving manuscripts mean Campion's other works are less amenable to such treatment. The chapter on Bridget is possibly the least successful, reflecting the somewhat sprawling corpus of visions it deals with; the two other chapters, more limited in scope, are more effectively handled.

Campion's approach is generally nuanced, though occasionally she jumps from citing a scholar's suggestion to treating it as certain. She emphasizes how her works' various readerships—aristocratic and bourgeois lay audiences; enclosed religious communities—must have responded differently to domestic imagery, given their diverse backgrounds. Unsurprisingly, she argues that investigating the works' domestic aspect casts them in a new light. The recording of Bridget's visions has a complex history, for instance, often understood as having effaced her authorial voice. Not so: that voice emerges in the visions' domestic illustrations, which reflect Bridget's experiences as wife and mother, and of running a large household. Love's translation, used to help damp down Wycliffism, is typically understood as stultifyingly orthodox but emerges as more complex than supposed. While sometimes, perhaps, these claims are overstated, Campion makes an effective case for closer examination of the domestic and its implications in late medieval religious literature.

Patrick Ball, *Hobart, Tasmania*

Etheridge, Christian, and Michele **Campopiano**, eds, *Medieval Science in the North: Travelling Wisdom, 1000–1500* (Knowledge, Scholarship, and Science in the Middle Ages, 2), Turnhout, Brepols, 2021; hardback; pp. 232; 10 b/w, 5 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503588049.

This collection has much to recommend it. It introduces what was, to me, the previously unknown yet in many ways familiar story of Scandinavian science and technology. The Protestant removal of manuscripts from monasteries and cathedrals is similar to what also occurred in Great Britain. This is well documented in Christian Etheridge's essay on the book fragments held in Swedish and Finnish archives. While local universities, such as Uppsala, did receive manuscripts, at least 30,000 fragments have also survived in various collections that preserve what were once substantial collections of scientific treatises.

The collection has nine essays mostly focused on scandinavia but bookended by four essays on English material. It comes from a conference held in 2015 sponsored by the Centre for Medieval Literature based in Odense and York.

The first four essays deal with individuals who were important in the spread of scientific knowledge beyond France and Italy. The first is by C. Philipp E. Nothaft and focuses on Roger of Hereford, who wrote on the *computus*. Nothaft outlines three different approaches—the *computus usualis*, *computus naturalis*, and *astronomia*—and explores their convergence and differences, bringing a nuanced, critical reading to medieval ecclesiastical lunar reckoning. In doing so, Nothaft brings a clarity to what is often a confusing account of what was an important field in this period. Robert Grosseteste and his work on optics and the rainbow is focus of a study by Giles E. M. Gasper, Brian K. Tanner, Sigbjørn Sønnesyn and Nader El-Bizri. Robert, like Roger of Hereford and Roger Bacon, reveal in his work the influences not only of Paris, but also of Jewish and Arabic thinkers. Roger Bacon, the subject of Michele Campopiano's essay, shows this

in his edition of the *Secretum secretorum*, which was based on an Arabic text. Bacon was well acquainted with Arabic scientific treatises and was interested in the translation of these works and Jewish philosophy into Latin. The influence of translations of Arabic scientific work was also found in medieval Sweden, as shown by Christian Etheridge. These translations included works on astronomy by scholars such as Al-Zarqālī and Ibn Rushd, and medicine by Ibn Sina (Avicenna), as well Greek works that had been preserved in translation by Arabic scholars. Sten Ebbesen has also briefly outlined the careers of several men who studied in Paris in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries and returned to Denmark, although some stayed in France. Some students travelled to Constantinople and brought back manuscripts of Aristotle and Aristotelian commentaries that were translated into Latin for teaching purposes. In his essay Ebbesen explores the impact of such mobile students on Denmark's intellectual life, discussing their subsequent careers. Johnny Grandjean Gøgsig Jakobsen looks at the influence Friar Preachers of the Dominican order had in spreading scientific knowledge in Scandinavia through preaching and teaching, and through the deeper exploration of scientific fields by other intellectuals—including Dr Nicolaus de Dacia, who was a noted monastic reformer, a theologian, astronomer, and geographer who was expelled from the University of Greifswald because he was practising medicine for cash.

The final three essays look at quite different material. Marteinn Helgi Sigurðsson and Florian Schreck focus on literature, particularly Icelandic sagas, whilst the last essay, by Brad Kirkland, examines the role of immigration and trade routes in the networks of London armourers. Kirkland's study looks at both metal and cloth armour, and the importance of a variety of trades—some unexpected, such as whaling—in the creation of these goods. He explores both the import and export of such materials as iron and outlines their impact on English and international trading networks. In contrast, Sigurðsson looks at a fictional character found in an Icelandic medieval romance concerning Master Perus of Arabia, who was invited to teach Prince Clarus, the learned and fair son of the Emperor Tiberius of Saxony, and who becomes involved in the prince's pursuit of the beautiful but haughty Serena, who governed France with her father, King Alexander. Schreck looks more generally at the place of science in fiction, and how the two fields cross-fertilized each other, focusing finally on the example of *Konráðs saga keisarasonar.*

These final chapters sit uncomfortably with the other essays, but highlight how nations that sit on the edge of Europe all participated in a wider European culture. Together all chapters show how even on the periphery scientific learning played an important role in the development of these societies, which were not only the recipients of but also contributors to broader culture. These essays are invaluable in expanding our understanding of the place of science in the Middle Ages.

Judith Collard, *The University of Melbourne*

Franganillo Álvarez, Alejandra, *A la sombra de la reina. Poder, patronazgo y servicio en la corte de la Monarquía Hispánica (1615–1644)*, Madrid, Centro Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 2020; paperback, pp. 322; R.R.P. €27.55; ISBN 9788400106263.

On 18 October 1615, Isabel de Borbón (1602–1644) married Prince Felipe, heir to the Spanish throne and first son of late Queen Margarita of Austria and Felipe III. Isabel was twelve years old, Felipe only ten. The wedding concluded years of arduous diplomatic negotiations between the Spanish and the French courts and relied upon a second union between Isabel's elder brother, Louis XIII of France, and Ana Mauricia of Austria, Felipe's younger sister. The exchange of princesses, immortalized by Peter Paul Rubens a decade later, would forge an alliance between the Habsburgs and the Bourbons. By mid-1621, Isabel had become Queen of Spain and given birth to her first child, who barely lived a day. This would be the first of many tragedies. During her twenty-three-year-long queenship, she endured eleven difficult pregnancies, from which only two children survived into adulthood. Isabel of Bourbon accomplished what Margarita of Austria had never been able to do: Isabel ruled the Hispanic monarchy as regent from 1640 to 1644 while Felipe attended to revolts in Catalonia and Portugal.

Franganillo Álvarez's *A la sombra de la reina* examines Queen Isabel's household in great detail, providing a useful point of reference for those intrigued by the inner workings of royal households. Courtly life, the author demonstrates, was a cultural and professional space where family alliances, strategic marriages, and patronage networks triggered a chain of effects within the royal palace. Franganillo begins by providing a comprehensive portrayal of the queen's *ménage*, its formation, and its members. The commitment to identify the members of the household and their ambitions is truly admirable. Recognizing those cast aside by official histories attests to the researcher's archival skill. But it is not only courtiers who find themselves reawakened by Franganillo's research. In Chapter 2, we embark on a revealing investigation of financial transactions, earnings, expenses, and donations, which allows the reader to build a clear picture of how the palace operated.

In charge of the queen's household, the *camarera mayor* enjoyed the highest authority and remuneration. This was a highly sought-after position. Chapter 3 explains that the *camarera mayor* defined both the culture around the consort as well as her public image. Further proof of the immense power held by the queen's household is revealed in Chapter 4, where we learn about the effort to oversee it. Gaspar de Guzmán, Count-Duke of Olivares and the king's *favorito*, appointed his wife as *camarera mayor.* The Count-Duke was not original in his political tactics. Francisco de Sandoval y Rojas, the infamous Duke of Lerma and Felipe III's *favorito*, had in 1599 appointed his wife, Catalina de la Cerdato, to control Margarita of Austria, followed by his sister, Catalina de Zúñiga y Sandoval. It is no surprise to find the whole of Chapter 5 dedicated to the political and financial benefits that connections with the royal household could bring to one's family, and the subsequent aspirations.

While the book is mainly a study of the queen's household, the last third of the book welcomes Isabel as its protagonist. The public had cherished Isabel's beauty and kindness; Felipe IV was aware of Isabel's political acumen and trusted her judgement. In Chapter 6, the author explores the queen's development as a ruler during the rebellions in Catalonia and Portugal and her interdependent relationship with García de Haro, leader of the Junta de Gobierno (p. 221). Chapter 7 considers the contentious relationship between Isabel and the Count-Duke of Olivares, offering a re-examination of the queen's potential intervention in his fall as part of the 'conspiración de las mujeres' (p. 247).

A la sombra de la reina establishes definitively that Isabel of Bourbon and the members of her household amassed and exercised great power. Some scholars, including Franganillo herself, have argued that the queen's household embodied a subsidiary space of power (pp. 19, 25, 27). I would contend that this monograph anchors its substantial contribution to the field precisely because of its accomplished account of a female elite at the centre of power in the first half of the seventeenth century. Franganillo Álvarez allows us to dive into a world yet to be fully unravelled and grants us the chance to dismiss gender-based assumptions when it comes to studying the role of powerful early modern women (and men).

Paula Plastić, *Adelaide, South Australia*

Ghosh, Kantik, and Pavel **Soukup**, eds, *Wycliffism and Hussitism: Methods of Thinking, Writing, and Persuasion, c. 1360–c. 1460* (Medieval Church Studies, 47), Turnhout, Brepols, 2021; cloth; pp. 443; R.R.P. €115.00; ISBN 9782503583822.

Scholars have been occupied with the meaning of John Wyclif and Jan Hus (and their disciples) for generations. The Germanic and anglophone worlds have grappled, sometimes exhibiting vitriolic fury, with origins, connections, implications and other factors, since the nineteenth century. Johann Loserth (*Huss und Wiclif*, Oldenbourg, 1884) reset the historiographical clock and prompted a veritable river of ink, mostly solving little, but elaborating exegetical traditions, personal preferences, nationalist agendas whilst creating fodder for research projects, PhD theses, and various publications. This handsome and impressive volume takes a different tack. No one (rightly) cares about Loserth anymore and it is past time to look at the question afresh. Kantik Ghosh and Pavel Soukup are scholars of note, the former an authority on Wyclif and late medieval English literature within a time of European-wide religious conflict, the latter having earned his mettle with a series of solid studies on the Hussite period. They suggest that old problems might best be approached by exploring methods governing thinking, writing, and persuasion. This is all set forth in a short introduction marred by convoluted expression, pretentious prose peppered with the usual Latin phrases now de rigueur in scholarship, and a narrative that tends to obfuscate more than illuminate. The philosophy of the volume could have been more simply put. Still, in the midst of it all there is plenty of erudition, good ideas, and suggestions

that promise much. I found this hope more than fulfilled in the seventeen chapters that followed.

Seeking to achieve their aims, the editors assembled a mainly European/British coterie of scholars (sixteen out of eighteen contributors) who have produced a collection that will be an essential reference. The level of achievement is uniformly high and cutting-edge research is evident pretty well across the board. This is no mean feat and speaks adroitly of the quality of emerging scholarship in this area. It is unfair to focus only on parts of the text, but I am constrained by space limitations. I was especially impressed by Dušan Coufal's elaboration of the late medieval 'proclamation of faith' that increasingly marked theological faculties (his publishing profile is exceptionally promising), and Petra Mutlová's re-evaluation of Wyclif and Hus at Constance wherein she sheds new light on old concerns and reminds the reader that there is more nuance than hitherto imagined. The essays comprising Part III, especially those by Soukup, Pavlína Rychterová, Christina Traxler, and Thomas Woelki, can be firmly recommended. What emerges from the dusty archives, hitherto unknown or overlooked manuscripts, and the dimness of the shadows that cover so much of the late medieval world, are topics and synergies pregnant with possibility for broad applicability. Context is everything, and the period is characterized by debates in an environment elaborated by Maarten Hoenen as 'cultural crystallization'.

The volume usefully interrogates lay involvement in intellectual debates and explores the feasibility of discarding the binary assumptions around university discourse and currents of social stress and response. Some aspects of Wycliffite and Hussite scholarship are amalgamated into the broader religious and intellectual histories of the late medieval period. Other approaches are excluded, minimised, or ignored. Presumably this is because those other approaches fail to endorse more recent trends, fads, and research modalities. As Howard Kaminsky used to say, 'who cares?' None of this matters, because the book is a good one—useful, helpful, and stimulating—and one need not agree with arguments, methodologies, or conclusions to recognize and appreciate value. It is knavish to insist on making anything inviolable, for this runs the risk of having to abide uniformity, which is the 'mother of all weariness', as Abelard put it.

It is good to see that the 'heresy' and 'Hussite' nomenclature has not been completely sacrificed on the altar of academic expediency and political correctness. For those readers who find it important, the essays almost uniformly close the gap between scholastic intellectual themes, vernacular polemics, and the transmission of ideas. By adopting a programmatic triangular approach, wherein methods of thinking, writing, and persuasion are applied, the editors have succeeded in focusing a disparate and complex group of thinkers, ideas, and events to suggest high-level impact that remains to be more properly elaborated and explored. None of this praise intends to exclude the possibility of exegetical gymnastics and interpretive contortions here and there, along with the confusing of theory with reality, but these are quibbles for others to deliberate.

Perhaps the value of a book like this can be judged by the fact that I found a series of signposts and suggestions therein applicable to a current research project, not on Hussites or the late medieval world, but theological and religious conflicts in the modern world.

Thomas A. Fudge, *University of New England*

Giraud, Eleanor J., and Christian T. **Leitmeir**, eds, *The Medieval Dominicans: Books, Buildings, Music, and Liturgy* (Medieval Monastic Studies, 7), Turnhout, Brepols, 2021; hardback; pp. 405; 27 b/w, 17 colour illustrations, 15 b/w tables; R.R.P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503569031.

The Order of Preachers may be well known for producing some of the most brilliant intellectuals of the medieval period, but Dominican books, buildings, music, and liturgy have attracted much less attention. This solid volume seeks to remedy this deficiency. Whereas the Franciscans have generated a considerable literature relating to the heated questions provoked within their Order, the Dominicans convey, at least outwardly, an impression that they were from the outset more organized as an Order, more concerned to establish a cohesive culture that followed orthodoxy. The papers here do not claim to cover every aspect of the Dominican contribution to medieval culture. Nonetheless, they offer many valuable new insights that deserve attention.

The opening chapter, by Richard and Mary Rouse on the impact of Dominicans on book culture at the University of Paris, draws on their immense knowledge of the transformation of books in general during the thirteenth century. Above all, Hugh of Saint-Cher is rightly identified as a key figure in helping generate not just mass production of the Parisian Bible, but two key tools to assist in biblical exegesis, namely a concordance to its entire text and *correctoria* that identify for scholars significant variants in the biblical text. The introduction of chapter divisions also transformed the way preachers could access the sacred text, not just through memory, but through a reference system invaluable for promoting further research. They rightly point out that this was a product not just of the friars, but of booksellers like William and Marguerite of Sens, whose shop was immediately outside Saint-Jacques. Laura Albiero's study of Dominican pocket breviaries completes their study and indicates that Dominican breviaries are not as numerous as those of the Franciscan Order. The chapter by Alison Stones on illustrated Dominican books brings out their quality and sophistication, raising the question of the impact of royal and noble patronage on their production.

The Dominican emphasis on preaching also had a profound effect on notions of sacred space. The chapter by Panayota Volti on the Dominican artistic and spiritual impact in the eastern Mediterranean (especially Greece) emphasizes the fruitful nature of Greek–Latin interaction during the later medieval period, even if power was firmly in Latin hands. The study by Haude Morvath on the evolution of interior space within Dominican churches, in particular of placing the choir behind the main altar, highlights a desire to use the altar, rather than a rood screen,

to differentiate clerical from lay space. One key element in this transformation could be heightened importance of devotion to the blessed sacrament as the core element in binding the wider community. Morvath demonstrates that this was a particularly Italian phenomenon in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, although it did have some influence in France, as at Lyon. The chapter by Emily Guerry about Dominican involvement in the bringing of the relic of the crown of thorns from Constantinople to Sainte-Chapelle in 1241/42 powerfully illustrates how Dominicans shaped religious devotion far outside a university setting.

Perhaps the most important way in which Dominicans shaped medieval devotion was through the feast of Corpus Christi, for which Thomas Aquinas wrote a new office in 1264, replacing that commissioned by Juliana of Cornillon two decades earlier. M. Michèle Mulcahey's chapter on the subject is important for confirming not just Thomas's authorship of the Office (not widely acknowledged until the 1320s), but also many subtle features of his presentation of the feast. Thomas moved away from crude imagery about Christ's corporeal presence. While he was always intellectually original as a thinker, his version of the Office reached a far wider audience than did his theological writings. The chapter by Barbara R. Walters on eschatological themes in the Office is particularly helpful in reinforcing how Thomas saw the Eucharist as a *viaticum*, an aid in the journey to the life to come. Two studies by Innocent Smith on Dominican prayers and on female communities, coupled with that of Eleanor Giraud on early mass books, hint at the capacity of liturgical texts to elucidate the gradual process by which the Order sought to establish a common ritual practice across many different regions of the Latin West. The volume closes with two chapters on Jerome of Moravia, whose *Tractatus de musica* provides perhaps the single most important guide to evolving musical theory and practice in thirteenth-century Paris. Christian Leitmeir, who argues that Moravia refers to the duchy in Eastern Europe rather than the diocese in Scotland, brings out Jerome's occasional debt to Thomas Aquinas. Blażej Matusiak brings out the originality and practicality of Jerome's interest in sound. While more could be said about Jerome's debt to existing music theory, we can be grateful to Leitmeir and Giraud for assembling a volume that certainly offers new angles into understanding medieval Dominican culture.

Constant J. Mews, *Monash University*

Green, Karen, *Joan of Arc and Christine de Pizan's Ditié*, Lanham, Lexington Books, 2021; hardback; pp. 241; 11 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US$100.00; ISBN 9781793613165.

In this book Karen Green constructs an argument that connects Christine de Pisan's beliefs and Joan of Arc's actions. She begins with the premise that the accepted history of Joan of Arc is incoherent: first, it is unbelievable; second, it disregards the numerous demonstrable and plausible connections between Christin and Joan. She suggests that there is 'tangible, albeit circumstantial' (p. 4) evidence that Joan's appearance was the result of purposeful political manoeuvring, and that

Christine de Pisan was central to this as a writer, an interpreter of prophecies, and a teacher.

Green's key idea is that Joan was trained for her role. Green provides a brief outline of the life and writings of Christine and looks closely at Christine's *Le Ditié de Jehanne d'Arc* (1429), Martin le Franc's *The Ladies' Champion* (*Le Champion des dames*, 1441–42), and Alain Chartier's *The Book of Hope* (*Le Traité de l'espérance*, *c*. 1428–30). She explores the representation of Joan by her contemporaries, and the anticipation of this image by Christine some thirty years earlier, and examines the trial and rehabilitation records, noting references to 'voices' and 'secrets' in these documents—but not in prior accounts of Joan. Drawing on le Franc's poem, Green discusses evidence of a group of royal women as influential in Joan's appearance, using tropes of Amazons, sybils and the Virgin Mary. She ties together her thinking by analysing the prophetic imagery that anticipates the arrival of Joan, asking whether Joan's appearance was God's fulfilment of such imagery, or whether motivated women seeking peace set about training Joan to fulfil prophecies. Finally, she examines the question of where Christine was between 1418 and 1429. Green carefully deconstructs the common belief that she was at Poissy and posits an alternative argument for Christine being at the Abbey of Mureau, close to Domrémy.

Green asks the reader to constantly reassess the Joan story, and to bring a critical reading to both texts and events. She undertakes a detailed and thorough analysis of the interconnections between noble families and between Christine and the women of these families. She meticulously untangles relationships of manuscript ownership and family and political connections and identifies when these family members are near Joan. In so doing, she constructs a significant argument that Joan was trained by Christine and supported by her affiliates to fulfill the prophecies.

I am open to the hypothesis that Joan may have been instructed to fulfil the Charlemagne prophecy and was guided and supported by Christine's associates. I can also accept that Christine was not at Poissy, and that she continued to write while in another convent, perhaps Mureau. Green's argument is detailed and thorough, and she is quick to identify those times when her account, by necessity, must move into speculation. However, such a hypothesis opens further questions. The first of these concerns the familial relationships upon which Green places such emphasis. She has done an excellent job at identifying these interconnections. However, recognizing that people knew each other, shared texts, and worked together does not necessarily mean they were conspiring together. Secondly, Joan's religious observance means that we cannot disregard the possibility that she genuinely believed she had heard 'voices' of saints that instructed her. Green rejects Joan's instruction by 'voices'; instead, she suggests Joan had human instructors. There is a lack of clarity about how this instruction took place—did Joan 'hear' the instruction and therefore interpret it as voices of saints? Or did Joan receive instruction face to face from her instructors—in which case, why identify them as her voices? Further, Green suggests that Joan must have been

instructed regarding prophecies, biblical women, and the political flux around her. I question this. Although Domrémy was a small village, it was not a backwater. There is plenty of evidence of news travelling through the area, and of Joan's intellectual engagement with the world.

More troubling is identifying the nature of the interface of faith, motivation, and action. Green argues that Joan was selected from village life (possibly because of her age, piety, and virginal status) and was instructed how to behave to fulfil the Charlemagne prophecy. She was perhaps deceived into thinking saints did this, or perhaps fully knew her instructors did this. Either way, she was identified as an appropriate pawn to attempt to shift the balance of power. Green does not explore how it ended for Joan. The story, as she reconstructs it, has Joan abandoned by those who had plucked her from obscurity and trained her to their own ends. If this is truly what happened, we can only assume that Joan was willing and deeply committed, as she does not name, or even mention, instructors other than her voices. However, with twenty-first-century eyes, it is yet another sad tale of the exploitation of a young woman by older, more powerful people.

Mary-Rose McLaren, *Victoria University, Melbourne*

Parker, Eleanor, *Conquered: The Last Children of Anglo-Saxon England*, London, Bloomsbury Academic, 2022; hardback; pp. 272; R.R.P. £20.00; ISBN 9781350287068.

Conquered recounts the unique stories of Anglo-Saxon men and women situated in the explosive aftermath of 1066. In the wake of these events, a new Anglo-Norman elite class was cultivated, ushering in a plethora of diverse cultural exchanges. Eleanor Parker navigates through this world of negative and positive cultural exchanges, with some of the protagonists succumbing to ill-fame or -fortune. Drawing from Latin saint's lives to Old Norse sagas, and Norman and Old English chronicles, her comprehensive understanding of the literature demonstrates the intriguing historical processes of literary and cultural syncretism. Parker endorses the significance of such exchanges; in particular, the development of a new hybrid literary culture which would flourish decades later. Individual life stories are at the heart of this volume, with each chapter dedicated to a particular individual and their lineage.

Chapter 1 begins with the legend of Hereward the Wake—an English hero who led a guerrilla-style campaign against the Normans in the Fens. Parker explores how cultural memory can diversify our knowledge of events. Because Hereward was a local hero of the Fenland, the narrative of his deeds was ultimately shaped by his environment. Parker often stresses that identity plays a significant role in the creation of our sources, with regional and national identities often intersecting. Such multilayered underpinnings are also significant in relation to the hybridity of our main source for Hereward: The *Gesta Herwardi*. As Parker reminds us, this text is an examination of 'ethnic and national conflict', and thus it is an exploration of 'culture and identity' (p. 27).

These themes carry on into the subsequent chapters which examine surviving literature about royal Anglo-Saxon dynasties. These chapters contextualise popular and unpopular transmission into Anglo-Norman literature. Reflecting comparatively, Parker demonstrates why some lives were important to chroniclers and why others were less so. An eye-opening example which exemplifies this is applied to Saint Margaret of Scotland. Her story often reminds us of the significance ecclesiastics placed on divine providence. Whilst her story remained significant in the British Isles, the opposite was true for Edgar 'the ætheling', the true heir to the West-Saxon dynasty, whose story seemingly remains in obscurity. Following this trend, Parker investigates why the grandchildren of Earl Godwine and Gytha failed to grab the attention of biographers as well. Here, she does well to point out that often legitimation was an important propaganda device to assert a dominant narrative. Naturally, this presents difficulties for scholars when discerning 'hagiographical' hyperbole.

Conflicting interpretations are further exacerbated when examining the life of the Earl of Northumbria, Waltheof. There are many different interpretations of Earl Waltheof. From lamented warrior to penitent martyr, any single categorisation is too simplistic, Parker argues. As with many of our protagonists, Waltheof's legacy is dependent on which account we choose to believe. But, as Parker rightfully points out, many of our sources intersect, so it is possible to paint a fuller account of the life of each individual. At least, for the most part, we can now perhaps better understand the rhetoric used by the chroniclers. Finally, this leads us to the life of Eadmer of Canterbury, whose experience presents itself as a sizeable shift away from political dynasties. Parker endorses the subject of memory through the works of Eadmer, who reconciled both past and present events. Eadmer, unlike many of our other chroniclers, was in a unique position to interpret events that he had experienced firsthand.

Overall, Parker has produced a very good guide which explores subaltern realities one may not always be accustomed to reading. It is both extensive and accessible. As such, it will appeal to a broad audience. It is hard to criticise such a welcome addition to the literature. It remains an excellent book. Parker has managed to retell a story which has been told and retold many times before with inspiring nuance.

Julian Calcagno, *Flinders University*

Preisinger, Raphaèle, ed., *Medieval Art at the Intersection of Visuality and Material Culture: Studies in the 'Semantics of Vision'* (Disputatio, 32), Turnhout, Brepols, 2021; hardback; pp. 247; 25 b/w, 7 colour illustrations, 1 b/w table; R.R.P. €80.00; ISBN 9782503581538.

The editor's short introduction is her only contribution to the volume, but it is a very focused one which both presents the theoretical justification for the project and references particular artworks. The book seeks to reconcile art history's traditional focus on sight and the visual as a cultural construction with

the recent emphasis on materiality and a multisensory approach to medieval art. These perspectives are crucial to an understanding of late medieval religiosity which combines an emphasis on interior piety and visualization with an intense concentration on devotional objects. Raphaèle Preisinger uses *The Seven Deadly Sins* by Hieronymous Bosch, with its ocular design featuring Christ as the pupil, to interrogate the relationship between sacramental vision and bodily participation through the view of the elevated Host. A manuscript illumination of a nun's mystical progress moves from initial inspiration by a painted sculpture through Eucharistic devotion to an ecstatic vision of the Trinity.

If Preisinger's introduction is notable for its restraint, Berthold Hub's article fully redresses any imbalance, weighing in at fifty-three pages, albeit fourteen of them being bibliography. Indeed, none of the articles in this collection could be accused of lacking bibliographical support. Hub devotes the first section of his paper to savaging all previous scholars of medieval vision. They had rashly assumed that, with the introduction of Aristotle and his Arabic commentators in the twelfth century, the extramission theory of vision, by which rays went out from the eyes to make physical contact with the object seen, had been displaced by the intromission theory, which we currently hold, in which rays travel from the object to the beholding eye. As with other elements of pagan learning, the accommodation was far more complicated, especially where it touched on religion. A hybrid model, adopted by the perspectivists, became dominant, as it was necessary for the maintenance of beliefs such as the evil eye, which relied on a concept of the performative—that is, active—gaze. Even physicians continued with the perspectivist model, which, moreover, had no connection at all with the development of linear perspective. The persistence of the extramission theory is fundamental to an understanding of both late medieval religious practices and witchcraft beliefs. Hub's argument is convincing, and he provides an excellent overview of the various visual theories and their supporters.

Wendy M. K. Shaw's article points to the lack of any Quranic basis for either the veiling of women or the prohibition on representation which have become emblematic of Islam in modern Western consciousness. Through mystical and literary texts, she traces the dialectical play around worldly vision, which impedes vision of the divine, and veiling, which, in concealing, points both to significance and the need for transcendence to access what is concealed. My only concern with this interesting paper is that it is arguably slightly out of place in a volume on late medieval Christian visualizing and so may fail to reach the readership it deserves.

Shaw's article does, however, connect nicely with Jens Rüffer's contribution. Mistrusting 'the concupiscence of the eyes', the Cistercians favoured an aesthetic of utter simplicity. As in Islam, Cistercian rejection of representational images led them to a preference for complex geometric designs, seen in both floors and windows, and serving as aids to contemplation.

Bissera V. Pentcheva draws attention to the conditions in which medieval worshippers experienced religious images. Our use of electric lighting misleads

us into perceiving these images as static. To a medieval worshipper, watching flickering candlelight reflected from silver and gold sheathing and glittering jewelled eyes, and the changing shadows from the illumination filtered through stained glass windows, these statues would have appeared to move. Pentcheva supports her argument with texts from Latin and Byzantine sources.

Silke Tammen focuses on jewellery, exploring the emotional and symbolic implications of clasps in religious contexts—ecclesiastical copes and depictions of the Virgin's cloak. Cynthia Hahn raises the paradox that while relics exercised their power through being seen, they were usually not actually visible, being generally tiny objects covered with rock crystal. Here again the viewer was enjoined to see 'through a glass darkly'. Tina Bawden's concluding essay on squints continues the examination of the conditions of observation. Squints are holes drilled in chancel screens through which the kneeling worshipper could view the devotional objects in a restricted focus while making themselves an object of observation at the head of the congregation.

This is a fascinating and enjoyable book, full of stimulating insights. I would recommend it to anyone seeking to understand the nature of late medieval religiosity.

Lola Sharon Davidson, *University of Technology Sydney*

Scase, Wendy, Laura **Ashe**, Philip **Knox**, and Kellie **Robertson**, eds, *New Medieval Literatures 21*, Cambridge, D. S. Brewer, 2021; hardback; pp. 219; 30 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00, ISBN 9781843845867.

The seven essays in this collection maintain the high standard of scholarship that typifies the series (see the review of *New Medieval Literatures 18* in *Parergon*, 38.1 (2021), 179–80). Three deal with medieval romances; two with specific manuscripts and approaches to manuscript study; one with Richard Rolle; and the last with 'the role of visual culture in constructing both the medieval idea of antiquity and the modern idea of the Middle Ages' (p. 190). All the contributions support their arguments with judicious analyses of texts, manuscripts, and pre-existing scholarship, though some of the outcomes are inevitably more substantial and convincing than others.

In the first of the romance studies, Geneviève Young applies Michel Foucault's theories to the interaction between truth, power, and individual conduct in Chrétien de Troyes's *Conte du Graal*. She shows how Chrétien 'establishes a new version of knighthood' (p. 5) through Perceval, whose ancestry is troubled by the suggestion of incest, and whose path is subject to many false starts and reversals. Based an analysis of the conventional truth claims that pervade Middle English popular romance, Lucy Brookes's contribution reveals 'truthiness' (a term with considerable humorous appeal) to be 'an essential aspect of a romance's literary framework' (p. 165). Thirdly, Casey Ireland's erudite essay contextualizes the deer hunt in *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*, the details of which appear to modern readers as both gruesome and excessive, in an account of pre-Conquest and

later hunting methods. While the poet's object, to raise suspense about Gawain's fate by emphasizing Bertilak's aristocratic ruthlessness and prowess as a hunter, is obvious, his purpose in so graphically narrating the butchering of the deer, except as supplementary entertainment for a courtly audience, remains obscure.

Among the essays that base important discoveries on minutely detailed scholarship, Matthew Aiello's fifty-page analyses, with tables, of scripts extant in more than seventy thirteenth-century English and Latin manuscripts in Oxford libraries is an outstanding contribution to a neglected field. Scholars of well-known works in these manuscripts, such as 'Candet nudatum pectus' and *The Owl and the Nightingale*, will support the plea for a precise labelling of medial and hybrid scripts, such as 'Textualis + Anglicana' and 'English vernacular minuscule + Protogothic'. Fourteen photographs of manuscript pages and extracts support Aeillo's classifications. His conclusion, that texts and marginalia in English are of equal and sometimes higher quality than Latin ones, is among several correctives to pre-existing views. Focusing, by contrast, on a single manuscript, the lavishly illuminated London, British Library MS 15268, made in Acre in 1285–86, Johannes Junge Ruhland proposes that despite their obduracy as objects, manuscripts are 'agents precisely because they bring new situations into existence' (p. 83). He bases this argument on an analysis of the manuscript's aural and visual praxis; on a proposed identification between its syncretic style and the collective identity achieved by Acre's diverse cultures; and on incongruities in illuminations and marginalia that are signs of a divergent reception.

Adin E. Lears argues that, in accordance with Hugh of St Victor's rehabilitation of craft knowledge (*scientia*) as an aspect of divine wisdom (*sapientia*), Richard Rolle's *Incendium Amoris* embraces *scientia* and the bodily labour that accompanies it as informing his mystical experience and his practice of meditation. Some conclusions seem to me to be contentious. For example, Rolle surely writes of heat, sweetness, and song, his experiences while repeating the psalms, as a divine gift, rather than as an 'aesthetic experience' or a 'work'. Moreover, like 'steryng of loue', 'work' is used in *The Cloud of Unknowing* to mean actual mental labour rather than (as claimed) in a 'fully metaphorical' sense (p. 129). It seems strange also to say that Rolle sees his 'own chant' as 'adulterate' and 'at a distance from heavenly *canor*' (p. 132), when his *Melos Amoris* is an attempt to reproduce it in words for the use of aspiring contemplatives.

All the essays in this collection are the fruit of meticulous textual study and intense intellectual engagement. Most demand an equivalent effort from readers, who will, however, be generously rewarded. Jessica Berenbeim's closing essay is broader in scope and more abstract than the average, seeking to illuminate 'problems of historical distance' and 'the role of vision in historical knowledge' (p. 194). Arguments are grounded in analyses of three manuscripts, made *c*. 1400, of Pierre Bersuire's French translation of Livy's Roman history.

This book will be of equal interest to students of European history, art buffs, textual and literary critics, and manuscript historians. It would have been helpful

for readers at a distance if brief biographies of the contributing authors were included—an addition that future volumes in this excellent series might include.

Cheryl Taylor, *James Cook University*

Symcox, Geoffrey, *Jerusalem in the Alps: The Sacro Monte of Varallo and the Sanctuaries of North-Western Italy* (Cursor Mundi, 37), Turnhout, Brepols, 2019; hardback; pp. xii, 310; 7 b/w, 50 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9782503580579.

As its subtitle suggests, this book surveys the history of the Sacro Monte of Varallo and other similar sanctuaries, or hilltop religious complexes, in north-western Italy, nine of which are UNESCO World Heritage sites. While this work is a mostly study of the history of the Sacro Monte of Varallo, the sanctuaries of Orta, Crea, Oropa, Ghiffa, Varese, Domodossola, Ossuccio, Belmonte, Graglia, and Arona are described in sequence in a final chapter that relates them to each other and the Varallo exemplar, which, the author argues, inspired a regional wave of sanctuary building. Although some of those other sanctuaries had greater claim to antiquity as sites of religious devotion than Varallo, their early modern reconfigurations were undoubtedly influenced by the Varallo experience.

Symcox's argument and method is framed by the work of traveller-scholar Samuel Butler, who in the later nineteenth century promoted the sanctuaries as sites of artistic value rooted in the distinctive social and cultural environment of the north Italian alpine valleys. Ultimately, Symcox affirms the general correctness of Butler's proposition, albeit with some caveats and clarifications. More than an argumentative conceit, however, Symcox's use of Butler serves as an engaging narrative means of addressing the historiography of the sanctuaries in the book's first chapter. Then, in Chapter 2, Symcox offers a detailed treatment of the historical context in which the Varallo project emerged, especially the role of seasonal migratory labour as a regional phenomenon which allowed for the flow of artistic skills and ideas into what might otherwise be dismissed as an economic and cultural backwater.

Chapter 3 is focused on the foundation of Varallo's Sacro Monte under the inspiration and initial guidance of the Observant Franciscan Friar Bernadino Caimi, who 'conceived the Sacro Monte as a replica of Jerusalem' (p. 41), a sort of substitute pilgrimage site. The plan was for a hilltop site, modelled on the Holy Sites of Jerusalem, replete with lifelike figures designed to 'appeal directly to the emotions of the onlookers' (p. 59). A monastery was founded beneath the hill, enabling oversight of the sanctuary, but also setting the scene for many of the twists and turns of the complex's later history, where concerns about ownership, income, and authority repeatedly emerge as issues of contention. As Symcox argues, the original conception of the Sacro Monte as a substitute Jerusalem soon gave way to a more narrative conception of the pilgrim experience at this location.

As Chapter 4 relates, there were significant developments during the early 1500s in the administration of the Sacro Monte, including the appointment

of *fabbricieri*. In this context, the artistic influences of Gaudenzio Ferrari and Galeazzo Alessi each came to play significant roles in the site's subsequent history, further shifting the sanctuary experience away from Caimi's originally topographical approach to a more fully emotive, narratively organized, and theologically didactic one. Then, as shown in Chapter 5, this process essentially continued into the seventeenth century, facilitating a growing Marian focus in the eighteenth century that is related in Chapter 6. Meanwhile, as Symcox discusses, there were regular contemporary arguments about the distribution of income derived from pilgrim donations, some shifts in administrative responsibility, and various levels of episcopal intervention and influence, all influenced by wider forces like the Counter-Reformation and the rise of Savoyard absolutism.

Not unlike Butler a century and a half earlier, this book is valuable for bringing the scholarship of the Italian alpine sanctuaries to a wider audience in an accessible format. Those interested in the history of emotive spiritualities, and proxy pilgrimage experiences, will find much of value here. Moreover, in demonstrating that the sanctuaries developed through more organic processes than sometimes asserted, Symcox also helps put to rest outdated ideas of the sanctuaries as a Counter-Reformation chain of spiritual forts designed to protect Catholic Italy from a Protestant north. Clearly rooted in localized late medieval spirituality and influenced by early modern trends which found expression from below as often as from above, Symcox's work offers a useful contribution to the history of the Reformation and Counter-Reformation, with implications that reach beyond these alpine Italian valleys and their regionally distinct sanctuaries.

Nicholas Dean Brodie, *Hobart, Tasmania*

Thomas, Sarah E., ed., *Bishops' Identities, Careers, and Networks in Medieval Europe* (Medieval Church Studies, 44), Turnhout, Brepols, 2021; hardback; pp. ix, 312; 6 b/w illustrations, 10 b/w tables, 3 b/w maps; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9782503579108.

This volume joins several recent works that call attention to the importance of bishops in medieval society. It stems from the May 2017 conference 'Bishops' Identities, Careers and Networks', held at the University of Aberdeen, which was part of the British Arts and Humanities Research Council funded project 'A Prosopographical Study of Bishops' Careers in Northern Europe'. This volume differs from others in that it focuses on how families, backgrounds, networks, and careers impacted on how ecclesiastics became bishops. Its key question is: how did someone become a bishop in medieval Europe? The excellent introduction, provided by the editor Sarah E. Thomas, summarizes the chapters in the volume and explains the methodologies used—very useful for those who may be unfamiliar with them—and the reasoning for the four groupings of chapters. It provides a very clear picture of the volume's objectives.

The four parts of the volume are entitled 'Cohorts of Bishops', 'Episcopal Networks', 'Individual Bishops', and 'Bishops and the Papacy'. The first three

parts are grouped by methodology, prosopography, social network analysis, and historical biography respectively, while the fourth is thematic. Part I, 'Cohorts of Bishops', analyses groups of bishops prosopographically to determine the reasons behind their appointments. Katherine Harvey investigates why cathedral chapters elected so many royal servants as bishops in thirteenth-century England. Hermínia Vasconcelos Vilar also argues for the importance of royal service for near-contemporary Portuguese episcopal appointees. The next paper, by Stefano G. Magni, takes an alternative approach, considering how nepotism aided clerical careers in fourteenth-century northern and central Italy. The section concludes by reasserting the importance of royal service in Christine Barralis's examination of episcopal appointments at Meaux between 1197 and 1510.

Part II, 'Episcopal Networks', uses network analysis to the same end as Part I. Jacek Maciejewski's examination of the medieval episcopate in Poland shows the importance of family in preparing clerics for episcopal office. The composition of the cathedral chapter at Sigüenza in Castile is analysed by Aída Portilla González, who asserts that many chapter members had close links to those in power. Steinar Imsen moves the discussion to Scandinavia, considering the archbishops of Nidaros and their ecclesiastical networks in relation to the further-flung parts of their province. Part III, 'Individual Bishops', contains three chapters that 'delv[e] into one individual's family, career, and actions during their episcopate' (p. 7). Jacopo Paganelli examines how Alberto Scolari, bishop of Volterra in Tuscany, and his family 'consolidated their power' (p. 7) around Volterra, particularly by associating themselves with the Ghibellines. Fernando Gutiérrez Baños considers the connections of the fourteenth-century bishop of Salamanca, Pedro Pérez de Monroy, and identifies his tomb within Salamanca Old Cathedral. The methodological side of the volume ends with Susanna Guijarro's analysis of the importance of family, clientelism, and patronage for Luis de Acuña's attainment of the bishopric of Burgos in the fifteenth century.

The final part of the volume, 'Bishops and the Papacy', switches to a thematic focus, namely, the rise of papal involvement in episcopal appointments. Some of the previous chapters in the volume, such as Magni's, do touch on papal relations with bishops; however, here it is the sole focus. The three chapters in this section 'consider what impact the growth of papal power had on bishops' (p. 8) in the regions under consideration. Fabrizio Pagnoni looks at how Pope John XXII appointed many bishops in Italy who had previous careers in papal service, thus changing the composition of the Italian episcopate. Contrastingly, Mišo Petrović demonstrates that the archbishops of Split came from a variety of backgrounds, and that papal connections were tangential to their appointments. Papal involvement was similarly limited in fifteenth-century Sweden, as demonstrated by Kirsi Salonen's analysis, and Swedish bishops rarely visited the papal curia.

The volume covers a wide geographical spread, from England, France, Iberia, and Italy to Poland, Croatia, and Scandinavia. The time period is also broad, ranging from the thirteenth century to the cusp of the early modern period. This allows for comparison between regions, and clear themes emerge

regarding medieval pathways to the episcopacy. It could be argued that many of the conclusions of these papers are obvious—for example, that royal service was a major route to the episcopate—, but what this volume does is to demonstrate that certain factors were common across all medieval western Europe. Familial involvement was important in Italy and Spain; the papacy became important later in the medieval period; and royal service was always a consideration. Nepotism crops up several times throughout the volume as well.

My only quibble about the volume is that one of the maps in the chapter on Sigüenza by Aída Portilla González is difficult to read due to the dark shading of the diocese in question. Otherwise, this is an eminently readable collection that demonstrates the importance of connections for any medieval cleric seeking high office.

Kyly Walker, *University of Leeds*

Torello-Hill, Giulia, and Andrew J. **Turner**, *The Lyon Terence: Its Tradition and Legacy* (Dance and Theatre in Early Modern Europe, 11), Leiden, Brill, 2020; hardback; pp. xv, 296; 26 colour plates; R.R.P. €115.00; ISBN 9789004362451.

Why the Lyon Terence? One of the finest of French illustrated books, this edition, published in 1493, was the first of a Latin classical text to appear in the original language with woodcut illustrations. Furthermore, it contains not just the text of the six plays but also the first new commentary to accompany Terence in print (earlier editors had resorted to that of the fourth-century grammarian Donatus).

Building on their edited collection *Terence between Late Antiquity and the Age of Printing. Illustration, Commentary, and Performance* (Brill, 2015), Giulia Torello-Hill and Andrew J. Turner take up topics explored there to illustrate the diverse aspects of this groundbreaking moment in the history of the book. Consciously interdisciplinary, their book brings a number of specialized fields of study, such as the manuscript tradition of Terence and the Carolingian miniatures, the humanist commentary industry, the history of printing and woodcut illustration, and the revival of classical theatre in fifteenth-century Italy. the Lyon Terence has been noticed, but the authors argue, unduly neglected owing to a failure to recognize its contribution to the understanding of Terence's theatre and Terence as theatre.

Hence the book sets the Lyon Terence in a broad context and long tradition. As well, it offers a close analysis of the interaction in it of the text, commentaries, and illustrations, comparing it with its predecessors and followers. Central to the book are the two chapters on its editor Jodocus Badius Ascensius or Josse Bade (1461/2–1535) and his three editions of Terence, all published in Lyon with different printers (1492, 1493, 1502). A humanist, teacher, and later printer in his own right, he travelled in Italy and spent time in Ferrara, one of the centres of the revival of classical comedy in performance. The authors argue that he engaged closely with the poet's text and that of the Donatus commentary, paying attention

to variant readings and to the act and scene divisions. The 1493 and 1502 editions incorporate Guy Jouenneaux (Guido Juvenalis)'s fairly scholastic commentary (1492). This was to accompany Terence's text for many years, along with Badius's own additional notes, and the *Praenotamenta*, a mini treatise on drama that Badius wrote for the 1502 edition.

At this point, I have a few niggles. On the frontispiece of the 1493 edition (Figure 1.1) Guy Jouenneaux's commentary is advertised as *familiarissima interpretatio,* translated as 'a most trustworthy interpretation' (p. 10). Similarly, the authors translate as 'trustworthiness' the *familiaritas* Badius attributes to Terence's language (or style) in the 1491 edition (pp. 102–03, 123). The implication of *familiaris* (intimate, domestic) instead seems to me to be 'approachability'. Again, to translate *elucidamenta* (explanations, clarifications) as 'deep insights' (p. 13) claims too much. On page 71 the authors quote a snippet from Badius on his early education at Ghent in which his teachers are said to have come forth in great numbers 'like armed warriors from the Trojan horse'. His use of the simile is not original, as it is common in early modern writers (ultimately it derives from Cicero, *De oratore*, 2.90).

Naturally the illustrations are another major focus: who was responsible for them; how far they interact with the text and commentary; what they owe to the manuscript tradition, and what to contemporary dress and performance. Gestures are particularly important here (see the thorough appendix to Chapter 5), and it is a pity that the reader must do without illustrations of most of those discussed. The volume does contain high-quality colour plates, but not all scenes integral to the argument are reproduced.

Packed with detail and meticulous scholarship, the book succeeds in showing how the Lyon Terence 'transform[ed] the Renaissance visualization and understanding of Terence's theatre' (p. 23). That said, it is not an easy read. It does not always manage to balance background information, covering of the bases, foreshadowing, and cross-referencing. For example, when one has got to page 212 it is important but hard to remember the significance of 'the Ulm edition' introduced earlier on pages 64–65.

The book's last topic is legacy. The Lyon Terence was not reprinted in France, though some of its illustrations resurfaced in a bilingual edition published in Paris in 1539, after Badius's death, by Jean Petit, one of Badius's collaborators after he moved to Paris from Lyon. Its main influence was in Italy, where a series of illustrated Terences appeared from 1497 to 1545. It is interesting, though not mentioned, that the first discussed of the Italian printers, Lazzaro de' Soardi (pp. 196–206), was also responsible for the first ever illustrated Plautus (Venice, 1511). Like de' Soardi's Terence (Venice, 1497), his Plautus contains a remarkable and fairly well-known view of the interior of a theatre from the viewpoint of the actors, labelled 'Coliseus sive theatrum' (see pp. 174, 176, 197). It updates the view of the 'Theatrum' in *The Lyon Terence* (Figure 1.2), largely based on Isidore.

Frances Muecke, *The University of Sydney*

Traub, Valerie, Patricia **Badir**, and Peggy **McCracken**, eds, *Ovidian Transversions: 'Iphis and Ianthe', 1300–1650*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2019; Ebook (ePub); pp. 344; R.R.P. £25.99; ISBN 9781474448925.

Ovid's *Metamorphoses* was a staple educational text in premodern Europe, but there are distinct disparities as to which tales have attracted the most modern scholarly attention. *Ovidian Transversions* fills one significant gap, the lack of interest paid to the tale of Iphis and Ianthe. A particularly useful component of the book is the inclusion of appendices translating several versions into modern English, which will allow for comparative classroom use. However, I have reservations about the volume as a whole, due to its treatment of issues of gender and especially its negligent deployment of transgender theory.

Valerie Traub, in her introduction, provides a thorough introduction to the tale of Iphis and Ianthe and to its premodern reception. She then sets the parameters for a capacious critical volume, offering the little-used term 'transversion' as an 'overarching rubric' for the tale's medieval and early modern reception. Her discussion of the analytical possibilities offered by the concepts trans, trans-, and trans* cites intra-community trans debates about orthography, but does not acknowledge trans people's specific, lived experience as something which produces the analytical perspective of trans studies. The publisher's copy blurb, in describing the volume's breadth as addressing 'gender and transgender, sexuality and gallantry, anatomy and alchemy, fable and history, youth and pedagogy, language and climate change', represents with unfortunate accuracy the volume's overall approach to 'transgender' as somehow distinct from 'gender'—a novel supplement, if not in actual opposition.

The volume's consistent strength is in the historicist contributions, particularly those interested in scholastic context or in the generic context of particular adaptations. Katherine Eggert's essay on *Galatea* offers, in relation to the status of alchemy, the stimulating concept of 'disknowledge' as a framework approaching paradox. Kathleen Perry Long offers early modern French texts concerning intersex bodies as a context to Benserade's representation of Iphis's gender in his play *Iphis et Iante* (1634), while Susan Lanser's reading of 'sex, youth and modernity' in the same play places it in the context of comedies of misdirected love.

Nevertheless, there are significant weaknesses in the treatment of medieval Iphis texts. Miranda Griffin's piece on Christine de Pisan's use of Iphis as a metaphor for the gender transition which the narrator asserts in widowhood is one of the stronger chapters. In addition to a detailed close reading of the *Mutacion de Fortune*, Griffin's work is the only contribution that foregrounds transgender experience and consistently deploys pronouns other than 'she' for a character (Christine-the-narrator) after a gender-transformative experience. However, Griffin's chapter shares with other essays a striking lack of engagement with the field of premodern trans studies. Essays in the medieval section do engage with

contemporary theoretical work, mostly from *TSQ: Transgender Studies Quarterly*, and with Robert Mill's work on medieval gender; but I believe Gabrielle Bychowski is the only trans scholar of premodern literature to be cited (although Blake Gutt contributed to one of the appendix translations; and of course, I may be unaware of some contributors or cited authors' specific identities). Moreover, Karma Lochrie's paraphrase of Bychowski's work misrepresents the latter's commentary on the lack of agency afforded to trans youth today, furnishing instead a claim about the 'medicalization' of children that echoes reactionary talking points.

Given her earlier work questioning the hetero/homosexual binary, Lochrie's essay is also strikingly lacking in rigour in its engagement with gender. Speaking from my own standpoint as a nonbinary trans person, her offhand description of Ovid's androgynous Iphis as 'genuinely non-binary' was promising, but the essay (and indeed the book) exhibits no engagement with current nonbinary perspectives. At the time this book went to press, 'nonbinary' was well established as a term, and perhaps the *only* uniting feature among the nonbinary community is agreement that physical features read as androgynous are not the same as nonbinary gender (see for instance C. N. Lester, *Trans Like Me*, Virago, 2017). I am not calling for a transposition of a specific 'felt' gender (or lack thereof) onto fictions of the past, but a genuine engagement with nonbinary perspectives would take into account the material concerns, and specific perspectives on the workings of gender, which result from living one's life as neither, both, or outside of 'man or woman'—much as Valerie Traub's work of a decade ago called for insight-based rather than essentialist work in lesbian studies.

In fact, as well as a lack of engagement with trans studies across the volume, I found the essays explicitly or implicitly framed as lesbian readings are disappointingly lacking in nuance: multiple chapters reference Iphis's assertion, in Benserade, that she almost 'forgot I was a girl' on her wedding night; one even describes Iphis as butch, without interrogating that in relation to the text, or the specific arguments concerning early modern culture. Lesbian thought has a wealth of perspectives on gender, embodiment, and erotic roles that could have been brought to bear here. In all, this volume fails to deliver the queer and trans readings its blurb promises, despite its strength in historicist research and comparative source studies.

A. E. Brown, *University of Bern*

Winkler, Emily A., and Liam **Fitzgerald**, eds, *The Normans in the Mediterranean* (Medieval Identities: Socio-Cultural Spaces, 9), Turnhout, Brepols, 2021; hardback; pp. 268; 11 b/w, 5 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503590578.

Examinations of Norman activity in Italy and the wider Mediterranean region are numerous, but this volume of essays has much to add to our understanding of the effect of the northerners' arrival in the south. From their first appearance as

missionaries and pilgrims in the early eleventh century, through to the creation of Roger II's multicultural kingdom in the twelfth, Norman immigrants and their descendants conquered, reshaped, and amalgamated with the existing Latin, Greek, and Islamic societies in Italy and Sicily.

The introduction provides a useful thematic overview, placing the narrowly focused individual essays within the broader context of scholarship on the Mediterranean going back to Braudel. The general aim is to provide micro-studies, often dealing with evidence at the local or personal level, which can balance the well-known 'grand narrative' of Norman expansion. Above all, the editors and authors are keen to demonstrate how the changing circumstances brought by new Norman ruling powers affected prevailing social conditions. Essays are grouped into three parts with individual contributions loosely connected around the themes of 'Motivations', 'Implications', and 'Perceptions'. While the subjects and sources are diverse, there is a pleasing coherence to the collection, perhaps more than is often the case in volumes of this nature.

Part I on 'Motivations and Strategies' opens with Matthew Bennett's survey of the current state of the field and key narrative sources for the idea of *normanitas* and Norman relations with those peoples they encountered in Italy. Aurélie Thomas looks at marriage strategies, discerning variance in the success of Norman newcomers in marrying into established powerful families. Differing outcomes, she argues, can be linked to the differing inheritance practices of Italian elites, thus placing agency in the decisions on whether to pursue dynastic alliances back on to local families, rather than seeing it all rest with ambitious Norman lords. In the final chapter of the section, Lucas Villegas-Aristizábal broadens our horizons by examining Norman incursions into Iberia up until the time of the Third Crusade. Themes of Norman expansion and ambition played out equally in Iberia, although geographically distant from the areas looked at by other contributions, adding a valuable comparative element to the collection.

Five chapters in Part II deal with social realities and the 'Implications of Conquest' in the wake of the Normans' arrival in Italy. Architectural, archaeological, and documentary evidence sits alongside investigation of the more familiar narrative sources. Sandro Carocci argues for the importance of 'micro-lordships', suggesting that these were much more influential in determining the outcome of local affairs compared with the efforts of the great territorial lords. Graham Loud uses charter evidence to establish the role of Norman kin groups in the nobility of southern Italy between 1085 and 1127, a period for which the narrative sources are extremely sparse. By focusing on the specific example of Salerno, Maddalena Vaccaro shows how a deliberate ecclesiastical building programme could promote Norman integration into a city they now ruled. Theresa Jäckh also undertakes the case study of a single city, Roger II's capital Palermo in Sicily, to question the nature of the transition from Islamic to Norman rule. Using Latin texts and Arabic documents, Jäckh contests the consensus view that the city's importance had significantly weakened under Islamic authority in the

period before the Normans' conquest of the island. Finally in Part II, Nicole Mölk examines material evidence from a hilltop village in Sicily which suggests the possibility of Christian and Muslim communities living side by side. Despite this positive conclusion, the archaeological record also indicates the difficulties which ordinary members of Sicilian society faced in their day-to-day lives.

Two excellent essays on 'Perceptions and Memories' round out the collection in the shorter Part III. Matt King discusses Roger II's temporary conquest of Africa (roughly equivalent to modern Tunisia). Although its aims were largely secular, expansionary, and commercial, King shows how it was perceived in later Islamic sources as a form of religious campaign contemporaneous with the Second Crusade. Kalina Yamboliev engages with themes of memory and forgetting to demonstrate how Norman patrons successfully inserted themselves into existing hagiographical traditions, solidifying their own legitimacy by cultivating spurious links with important Latin and Greek religious figures. Because of the range of themes, variety of forms of evidence, and differing scholarly approaches, there will be a great deal of interest in this volume for readers across a wide range of topics in medieval studies. Yet the volume also maintains internal coherence and the editors have succeeded in crafting a collection which is at once diverse and yet closely focused on the social resonance of Norman activities in Italy and the Mediterranean region.

Lindsay Diggelmann, *The University of Auckland*

Yarn, Molly G., *Shakespeare's 'Lady Editors': A New History of the Shakespearean Text*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2021; hardback; pp. 352; R.R.P. £29.99; ISBN 9781316518359.

Early modern literary studies are experiencing an especially fruitful period, despite attacks on the humanities, and dire working conditions (or no work) for young and aspiring academics. Molly Yarn's new book is an excellent example of the kind of new, historicist, theoretically inflected research that makes this field so exciting at the moment. In this witty and thoroughly researched revaluation, Yarn offers a telling riposte to an unfortunate remark by Gary Taylor, an editor of Shakespeare's works (admittedly in 1988): 'Women may read Shakespeare, but men edit him. So, it has been from the beginning, and so it remains' (p. 15). Well, no, neither 'from the beginning' nor now, and Yarn offers some sixty-nine examples from 1800 to 1950. Those examples fit into two basic categories: the majority are women most of us, even those of us interested in the history of editing, have never heard of; the second group, in some respects the most interesting, are those who are quite well known, but have been treated as unworthy or even risible.

Perhaps the most interesting example of this is Henrietta Bowdler, whose expurgated edition (later expanded by her husband Thomas) is notorious, and the idea of bowdlerization has taken on the stigma of censorship and mockery of Victorian prudishness. But Yarn places Henrietta Bowdler's edition within the tradition of what she calls domestic editions, which played an important role in

the increasing democratization of access to Shakespeare. At the same time, Yarn is able to counter the extraordinary misogyny implicit, and often explicit, within the fraternity of male editors, and their policing of editorial legitimacy/respectability.

Yarn has an unerring ability to anticipate issues with the scope of this book, offering an illuminating, albeit brief, admission that women edited many early modern authors other than Shakespeare. In the case of this particular study, though, the focus on Shakespeare, so often an absurd process of the separation of a single author from his rich literary and cultural context, is justified because the book is an intervention into a field dominated by the editing of Shakespeare.

One of the most interesting and original aspects of Yarn's study is her examination of the selected area of student editions of Shakespeare. Of course, not only women edited student editions, but Yarn's meticulous scholarship has unearthed some especially interesting examples where women took a highly original approach to this field. For example, Katherine Lee Bates was a significant poet, and Professor and later Head of English at Wellesley College. Bates edited *The Merchant of Venice*, *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, and *As You Like It* for a student Shakespeare series. Not only did Bates prepare a thorough, collated text, but she trialled a system of textual notes which not only set out differences between quarto and folio texts but offered questions for students to consider in relation to possible editorial choices, often after setting out two different readings, and asking 'Which is better?'. Yarn reproduces a page from Bates's notes to *Merchant* illustrating this innovative approach to pedagogy and Shakespeare editing. Through her careful examination of a large range of student editions, Yarn is able to break down the dichotomy between the prestigious scholarly edition, and the utilitarian student edition. This runs parallel to recasting the (past) dominant paradigm of the male authoritative edition, which was previously undermined by the 'un-editing' move in the 1990s exemplified by Leah Marcus's *Unediting the Renaissance: Shakespeare, Marlowe and Milton* (Routledge, 1996). But here, Yarn is using a finely-honed historicist perspective to reshape our sense of how editions are created, and what their influence has been.

Yarn also offers a perceptive and again revisionist account of New Bibliography through a feminist lens. Once again, while there have been a considerable number of critical accounts of New Bibliography in recent years, Yarn brings to the table her focus on women's engagement in the editorial tradition at a point in time when their production of student editions was slowing, and when English as a discipline embraced quasi-scientific approaches like textual scholarship. Accordingly, Yarn offers new insights into the work of the reasonably well-known Evelyn Spearing Simpson (co-editor of Ben Jonson's works, and editor of John Donne's sermons) and Alice Walker, and the less well-known Grace Trenery and Una Ellis-Fermor (General Editor of the second series of the Arden Shakespeare).

Yarn's groundbreaking study ends at 1950; after that point, it is certainly the case that women scholars and editors of Shakespeare have played a more than

equal part and perhaps their contribution from that point on does not need such advocacy—though I am far from sure that that is true. As Yarn notes, her study points to how 'editorial history still contains many undiscovered treasures, many stories yet untold' (p. 203). To assist with this, Yarn includes a detailed reference guide to women editors, and a comprehensive list of their editions. Yarn's book is a pleasure to read, and the production standard by Cambridge University Press is high. This is the kind of scholarship that we need at the moment, and that is being produced by a new generation of scholars: original, thoughtful, and accessible.

Paul Salzman, *La Trobe University* and *Newcastle University*