Reviews

Atherton, Mark, Kazutomo **Karasawa**, and Francis **Leneghan**, eds, *Ideas of the World in Early Medieval English Literature* (Studies in Old English Literature, 1), Turnhout, Brepols, 2022; hardback; pp. 442; 17 b/w, 4 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €115.00; ISBN 9782503599571.

Ideas of the World in Early Medieval English Literature was awarded the 'Best Book' prize at the biennial conference of the International Society for the Study of Early Medieval England (2023). It is the first book in the Brepols series 'Studies in Old English Literature', centred on Old English literature and its contexts. The book stems from an international collaborative research project between scholars associated with the Department of Letters, Rikkyo University, Tokyo, and the Faculty of English, University of Oxford. The central enquiry of that project (and therefore these essays) is how the pre-Conquest English thought and wrote about the world and their place in it, from the time when Old English was establishing itself as an authoritative language through to the eleventh century. There are fifteen contributors.

The essays are arranged thematically. The first strand looks outward, exploring the relationships between the pre-Conquest English and other peoples and English ideas about the world, particularly those parts of the world considered faraway and alien. The second strand turns inward, considering how the English conceptualised and situated themselves. The essays in this section use the modern theory of landscape as an inhabited space to analyse their sources, acknowledging the agency of the physical environment to shape and reflect mental states and understandings. The third strand pivots from an analysis of how the pre-Conquest English understood themselves to chart the connection between situatedness and concepts of collective identity, of a unified people. This section traces the deployment of the new communal identity of the English to legitimise expanding claims of overlordship outside traditional English boundaries and fuel aspirations of empire.

A wide range of documentary sources is considered: theological texts, maps, Old English prose and poetry, as well as historical sources such as annals and *vitae*. Those sources deal with diverse topics: travel and culture contact, migration and conversion, and the grounding of identity in the experience of landscape/seascape/soundscape. Given the diversity of both the genres and the subject matters of the material considered, this collection sits on a spectrum between a handbook and a comprehensive 'last-word' analysis. Some essays focus on an individual text and use a close reading of language: Eleni Ponirakis's contribution 'The Place of Stillness: Greek Patristic Thought in Cynewulf's *Juliana*' is an example of that approach: a fine-grained analysis of Cynewulf's alterations to his

source text. Others take a text as a starting point—Hannah Bailey's 'St Rumwold in the Borderland' reads a puzzling eleventh-century *vita* through the evidence of contemporary cultural and social geographies to reveal a narrative about kings and kingdoms. Kazutomo Karasawa explains through an analysis of map-making conventions a confusing passage in Ælfric's *Homilies* which describes Christ's posture on the cross, demonstrating English ideas of the tripartite world ('Christ Embracing the World: Ælfric's Description of the Crucifixion in *De Passione Domini*'). Francis Leneghan's essay 'End of Empire? Reading *The Death of Edward* in MS Cotton Tiberius B I' analyses an often-overlooked panegyric on Edward the Elder through the lens of the apparently disparate prose and verse texts of the codex in which it is preserved. Reading the poem through its manuscript context brings important political themes to the foreground. Embedded in these individual texts was an imperialist mindset, a claim of *translatio imperii* made by the West Saxon royal house.

Other essays take the reverse approach—starting with a broad proposition or an established area of controversy rather than a specific text. Daniel Anlezark's essay ('Alfred and the East') examines the intriguing evidence for Alfred the Great's economic and political links with Asia. Ryan Lavelle's contribution, 'From (North-)East to West: Geographical Identities and Political Communities in the Ninth- to Eleventh-Century Anglo-Scandinavian World', takes up the contested issue of 'otherness' in relation to Scandinavian incomers. He traces the changes in geographical identifiers to demonstrate how concepts of identity evolved, and political realities shifted between the late ninth and early eleventh centuries.

It follows that this collection is capable of being used in a variety of ways. At its narrowest, this volume adds to existing scholarship on an extensive range of individual Old English sources. More generally, the collection as a whole shows the value of reading a text through different sources and using other theories. It is exciting to see theories from outside traditional literary/historical scholarship being used to re-examine and broaden our understanding of Old English texts. Using the modern theory of landscape to tease out pre-Conquest notions of identity, of being in the landscape, demonstrably has real merit. I do not mean to suggest that old ways should be discarded; part of the value of this book as a collection lies in its demonstration of the value of flexibility of approach—one size does not fit all. Individual essays will be valuable to scholars examining similar issues or using similar approaches; reading across the collection will doubtless spark fresh interest in the connections and anomalies between pre-Conquest ideas of the world at home and the world at large. The breadth of material and approaches in this collection also makes it possible to use this book to introduce students to different ways of asking questions about pre-Conquest English and Old English literature.

Georgina Pitt, *The University of Western Australia*

Barry, Lording, *The Family of Love*, edited by Sophie **Tomlinson** (The Revels Plays), Manchester, Manchester University Press, 2022; hardcover; pp. xxvi, 227; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £90.00; ISBN 9780719088629.

Sophie Tomlinson's Revels Plays edition of *The Family of Love* (Children of the King's Revels, *c*. 1605–06) addresses an important editorial need, presenting the anonymously published city comedy as the work of Lording Barry: the first scholarly edition to do so. It is a superb contribution to the study of early modern drama and will hopefully stimulate interest in a play that is simultaneously peripheral yet intimately connected to social, political, and theatrical concerns regarded by scholars as absolutely central to Barry's London. Although the text has been printed a handful of times since the early nineteenth century, it has not (until now) received the kind of rigorous scholarly editing that Tomlinson provides, nor has it been properly understood as the work of Barry rather than as that of Thomas Middleton (to whom it has sometimes been ascribed). Despite its previous appearances in print (lightly edited; in anthologies; presented as Middleton's; and as an unpublished dissertation), *The Family of Love* has eluded most scholars and remained obscure. One of Tomlinson's numerous achievements here is to reframe the play as 'experimental' (p. 34) and deserving of fresh attention. As might be expected of an edition that consciously seeks to understand the play in relation to Barry as author, the boy company that performed it, and the historical milieu in which it was performed, a particular strength of Tomlinson's work is her attention to its distinctive language and style.

The play itself is a riot, still capable of drawing laughter and entertaining a crowd, as evidenced by the first contemporary performances of the play by drama students from the University of Auckland in September 2023 (directed by Benjamin Kilby-Henson). Bawdy doesn't begin to describe the plot of this 'scatological farce' (p. 34), which includes standard early modern comedic fare such as a ring trick, mistaken identities, and a lover concealed in a trunk to gain access to his beloved; but also, the depiction of a radical Anabaptist sect—the 'Family of Love'—whose meetings (restricted only to the password-knowing few) serve implicitly as a sex party for women. In a particularly memorable sequence, Mistress Purge's suspicious husband Peter follows her to 'Familist' meetings until he eventually overhears the password and gains admission; just as his wife seems poised to have sex with the unmarried masters Lipsalve and Gudgeon, she is led away in the dark to have sex with another man who—unbeknownst to her—is none other than her husband. Since she sleeps with him without knowing his true identity, it's a rather hollow victory for Master Purge: 'I have made myself a plain cuckold', he laments (4.4.43–44). Meanwhile, in another plotline, Doctor Glister forbids his niece and ward Maria to see Master Gerardine, but the lovers overcome the hindrance via the device of a forged tip-off note to Glister's wife, alleging that he incestuously impregnated Maria—an allegation which is held up in a mock-trial where Glister is found guilty and only redeems himself by allowing Maria to marry Gerardine after all (thus providing the child with a guardian:

its actual father!) and supplying a generous dowry to boot. The student whose knowledge of love and marriage in early modern comedy derives exclusively from Shakespeare's handling of these themes will be in for quite the surprise upon reading Barry's play.

Tomlinson adds helpful detail to our understanding of the quarto's printing process, noting previously unobserved textual variants and scribal annotations, adducing additional evidence of Richard Bradock's printing of the playbook (which connects it to two other plays Bradock printed in 1607–08), reconsidering the possibility of censorship, and reassessing the quality of the printing—including a defence of perceived imperfection in terms of Barry 'struggling, or experimenting, with literary form' (p. 3) rather than compositor error. As the first Barry play to appear in the Revels Plays series (hopefully they will soon complete the Barry canon with an edition of *Ram Alley*!), Tomlinson's edition includes helpful biographical information about the pirate–gentleman playwright ('pirate' in the dual sense of adventurer and in terms of 'Barry's predilection for pastiche', p. 27) paying particular attention to the boy company he established at the Whitefriars with Michael Drayton and others.

Tomlinson's judicious editing and erudite glosses give every reason for optimism that her 'hope that this edition will provoke and enable modern productions that afford Barry's comedy a fresh hearing' will prove prophetic. The Blackfriars Playhouse in Staunton, Virginia, and the Sam Wanamaker Playhouse in London would do well to take on this delightful and salacious Jacobean comedy.

David McInnis, *The University of Melbourne*

Boillet, Élise, and Ian **Johnson**, eds, *Religious Transformations in New Communities of Interpretation in Europe (1350–1570): Bridging the Historiographical Divides* (New Communities of Interpretation, 3), Turnhout, Brepols, 2023; hardback; pp. 275; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9782503601779.

This book, jointly edited by Élise Boillet and Ian Johnson, comprises eleven essays examining various religious transformations over Europe's long fifteenth century (1350–1570). In the 'Introduction', Johnson observes that medieval and early modern scholars, most especially scholars of religious history, often find their respective fields of research divided by the jubilee year of 1500. The purpose of this collection is to reassess this historiographical fracture. Indeed, while this turn of the century has traditionally been described as one of sharp rifts and discontinuity, each contributor uncovers abundant evidence of continuum: 'familiar yet strange composites of continuity and transformation' (p. 19). Johnson proposes that such familiar echoes present throughout the long fifteenth century require the period to be 're-understood as junctures, joins, and meeting points' (p. 19). This observation highlights the need for (and value of) ongoing collaborative engagement between scholars of the medieval and early modern world.

The collection opens with Mareen Cré's fascinating examination of Gertrude More's contemplative work, *Confessiones Amantis.* Gertrude, an ardent recusant and great-great-granddaughter of Sir Thomas More, crossed the Channel to help establish an English Benedictine monastery in Cambrai. Cré highlights that the very existence of religious communities like that of Cambrai was one way that devout English recusants sustained the memory of a pre-Reformation Catholic Europe. Indeed, having gained complete freedom to perform the religious offices of the medieval church, More and her sisters in religion became extensions of it and ensured its survival for future generations (p. 22). More's transition to monastic life was not seamless. The newly professed nun struggled to observe the Ignatian prayer method adopted by her convent. She struggled too with her monastery's confessor, Augustine Baker. But it was through Baker that More was introduced to the works of Constantin de Barbanson, whose contemplative writings provided not only a source of spiritual consolation and encouragement to the disconsolate nun but also prompted her to embark on her own literary pursuits (p. 22). The *Confessiones Amantis* is one example, comprising fifty confessions with topics ranging from her sinful struggles as a young novice to her gratitude for Baker's spiritual counsel. Just as her monastic vocation situated More in a rich tradition of medieval Catholic piety, so too would her literary writings. Alongside that of St Augustine's *Confessions*, More's devotional writings took inspiration from famed medieval mystics such as Julian of Norwich (p. 36). Cré's essay makes a convincing argument, providing countless examples where *Confessiones Amantis* can be seen to appropriate Julian's *A Revelation.* And in doing so, Cré contends that More helped 'bridge a historical divide' for both her and her sisters in religion, enabling them to live out an 'enclosed spirituality continuous with medieval traditions' (p. 26).

Daniela Solfaroli Camillocci, meanwhile, examines how Catholic popular piety and devotion suffered criticism and censorship in French propaganda. This essay uses the reformist works of Pierre Viret as its case study. It begins by outlining the Lausanne reformers' scathing textual attacks against the Catholic worship of the mother of God. In one such attack, Viret drew comparisons between praying the rosary and witchcraft and referred to the Hail Mary as food poisoned by Satan's henchmen (pp. 75–76). However, Camillocci notes that despite Viret's more zealous condemnations of what he perceived to be cultish veneration of the Virgin Mary, his later writings reveal a greater lean towards finding accord with the sustained popularity of traditional Marian devotion. Camillocci observes that this softer and more moderate approach was in all likelihood prompted by concerns surrounding the honour and dignity owed to Mary's special status as the mother of Christ—not to mention the fear concerning how demoting her might pose theological implications amongst the more evangelical of his reformist circle. For example, could denigrating Marian devotional practice and belief encourage much more radical and dangerous views on Christ's immaculate conception? (pp. 71–72) Such controversies risked turning reformers into 'Turks and Jews, or

into unbelievers' who questioned even the most basic tenets of the Christian faith, such as the Incarnation (p. 79).

The theme of finding accord with those of differing religious persuasions continues throughout. Daniela Rywiková contributes a thought-provoking essay on the existence of a multiconfessional community in sixteenth-century Moravian Ostrava. Thanks to its occupation by the Hussites in the fifteenth century and its proximity to lively trade routes, Ostrava developed what Rywiková describes as a chaotic but 'liberal' religious landscape (p. 243). So much so, that it was 'typical for subjects and villeins in a single domain to profess multiple denominations' (p. 243). Rywiková's analysis of the Ostrava Allegory in St Wenceslas's parish church provides a fascinating case in point, where, despite, the best efforts of the bishops of Olomouc to enforce Catholic orthodoxy, there existed murals filled with cross-confessional motifs and iconography. Rywiková argues that by incorporating holy scenes and figures typical of all Christian confessions and employing 'confessionally neutral texts' paraphrasing the Bible, its creator(s) devised a mural that could be enjoyed by Catholics, Protestants, and Utraquists alike (pp. 253–55). At the same time, its theological subtlety protected the Ostrava Allegory from garnering unwanted attention during unannounced visitations by the bishops of Olomouc, with each motif easily proclaimed to be Catholic (p. 254). To quote Johnson, 'it is fitting that the book should end with a complex divide bridged so intriguingly' (p. 19).

A particular strength of this collection of essays is its sense of cohesion despite the expansive source material and subject matter. Indeed, Johnson notes that while the book is arranged into five categories, each essay possesses thematic or methodological similarities with its 'cousins' that fall outside its group, a harmony befitting its remit to bridge historiographical divides. It is this cohesive breadth that lends it to be a valuable and fascinating study for medieval and early modern scholars alike. However, this reviewer believes that the collection might have benefited from more concise and clear prose. Long-drawn-out and hard-to-read sentences and paragraphs sometimes obfuscate the contributors' findings and arguments. This took away from the overall quality of the volume. It is also worth noting that, saving Cré's opening essay, which examines the contemplative writings of an expatriate nun who helped establish an English Benedictine monastery in Cambrai, the collective studies of this volume are limited to continental Europe. This geographical focus might not be immediately obvious, owing to its title, and, while interesting and valuable, is surprising given its chronology and subject matter. These minor points aside, *Religious Transformations* is recommended for scholars with interests ranging from recusancy and exile, the Hussites and the Bogomils, to evangelism in Lesser Poland, as well as medievalists or early modernists hoping to become more acquainted with each other's research.

Grace May Howe, *The University of Adelaide*

Burgess, Glyn S., and Douglas **Kelly**, trans. and intro., *The 'Roman de Thèbes' and the 'Roman d'Eneas'* (Exeter Studies in Medieval Europe), Liverpool, Liverpool University Press, 2021; hardback; pp. 440; R.R.P. £126.00; ISBN 9781800348615.

As famously described by French medieval poet Jean Bodel, there are only three subject matters for the discerning man—France, Britain, and Rome the Great. It is on the last that Glyn S. Burgess and Douglas Kelly focus their book. Building on their expertise in the translation of French medieval texts into English, the authors present here the *Roman de Thèbes* (*c.* 1150) and the *Roman d'Eneas* (*c.* 1160) to be read 'in conjunction with [their] translation of the *Roman de Troie* by Benoît de Sainte-Maure (D. S. Brewer, 2017)' (p. ix). Burgess and Kelly are to be congratulated for having made available to modern English readers the complete trilogy of the *romans d'antiquité,* or protoromances, dealing with themes from antiquity, which announced a genre that would later flourish with Chrétien de Troyes.

The 'Introduction' (pp. 1–23), organised by themes, gives the necessary historical and literary information while focusing on topics such as 'Poetics from Latin into French'. Burgess and Kelly do not elaborate on the affiliation of the medieval authors with 'the Plantagenet courts of Henry II and Eleanor of Aquitaine' (p. 3), which is still critical to understanding the cultural context of this period 'often called the twelfth century Renaissance' (p. 3). Indeed, these romances, born at the English court, were marked by the political intention of linking the Anglo-Norman monarchy to the great heroes of antiquity, therefore asserting their power and legitimacy. And while Burgess and Kelly state 'the crucial aim of the authors of these early narrative poems: to make available in French works that were written in Latin' (p. 4), they could have further elaborated on the importance of the *translatio studii* at this period. As Emmanuéle Baumgartner reminds us, the authors of *romans d'antiquité* aimed to make available texts 'whose knowledge was previously restricted to the world of the clergy, who alone had access to the original texts or their Latin and Medio-Latin adaptations, glosses and commentaries' (*Le Récit médiéval,* Hachette, 1995, p. 19). The presence, at the threshold of the *Roman de Thèbes*, of 'lord Homer and lord Plato, and Virgil and Cicero' (p. 28) attests to the crucial mission of the author: passing on multifaceted knowledge—be it about love, its importance, its nature, its consequences; or about the universe. Descriptions in particular are essential, which demonstrate 'the bookish knowledge of clerics as much as their ability to represent the history of the world, to stage human activities, to celebrate all those [...] who create a universe where beauty is first and foremost the product of human intelligence, knowledge and skill, (*Le Récit médiéval,* p. 24). The ekphrastic description of Amphiaraus's chariot in *Thèbes* (ll. 4949–5016, pp. 105–07) perfectly illustrates this phenomenon. These romances offer a reflection on knowledge, its acquisition and transmission, which reflects the debates in the intellectual milieu in which they were composed.

The translation of each *roman* includes a short outline of the plot, with an appendix offering the alternative ending taken from Manuscript D of *Eneas* (pp. 353–57). A rich forty-six-page 'Bibliography' (pp. 359–404) concludes the volume, together with two very useful indexes of personal and geographical names (pp. 405–16 and pp. 416–22). The brief overview of the existing editions and translations (pp. xv–xvii), however, omits Jane Bliss's translation of the *Thèbes* episodes dedicated to Amphiaraus (*An Anglo-Norman Reader*, Open Book Publishers, 2018, pp. 80–89 [ll. 2055–80 and ll. 4950–5080]—in our book p. 60 and pp. 105–08), as well as Míceàl F. Vaughan's partial translation (1999) of *Eneas* (ll. 263–844, 1197–2154—in our book pp. 202–10 and pp. 216–32) (available online http://faculty.washington.edu/miceal/lgw/dido/Eneas%28trans%29.html).

For the *Roman de Thèbes*, preserved in five completed manuscripts, the authors have translated the edition published in 1966–68 by Guy Raynaud de Lage, based on Manuscript C. The translation of the *Roman d'Eneas*, which survives in nine manuscripts, is based on Jean-Jacques Salverda de Grave's edition (M. Neimeyer, 1891), which chose Manuscript A. Both texts, which do not include the original octosyllabic couplets in Old French, are rendered in clear prose, with a very light apparatus, and 'in the past tense with the aim of maximising the readability of the translations' (p. ix).

These two *romans d'antiquité* put Latin epics to the test in translation themselves: Statius's *Thebaid* and Virgil's *Aeneid* were considered masterpieces in the twelfth century. But the medieval 'translators' adapt freely the Latin text, from literal translation to complete revision, from omission to addition of episodes, from abridgement to redistribution of content. While the anonymous author of *Eneas* never names Virgil, Statius is mentioned (once only) in *Thèbes*: 'As Statius's book states, the knob on [the cup's] cover was made of topaz' (p. 145). A footnote on this page briefly mentions 'this is in fact an authorial invention', without picking up on the irony—the only mention of the source is in an episode that is entirely the author's own invention, and which is found in all the manuscripts.

Burgess's and Kelly's translation is certainly more reliable and meticulous. As an example, the challenging opening lines of *Thèbes*,

> Qui sages est nel doit celer,
> ainz doit por ce son senz moutrer
> que quant il ert du siecle alez
> touz jors en soit mes ramenbrez.
> (ll. 1–4, MS C)

Sages and *senz* are particularly difficult words to translate, rendered in modern French by 'savant'and 'science' (Guy Raynaud de Lage), 'sage' and 'sagesse' (Aimé Petit), 'habile' and 'savoir-faire' (Charles Brucker), or 'sage' and 'savoir' (Francine Mora-Lebrun). Burgess and Kelly have here opted for 'wise' and 'intelligence': 'Anyone who is wise should not conceal it, rather should they, for this reason, display their intelligence, so that once they have departed from this world they may be remembered for all time' (*Thèbes*, p. 28). A great metaphor for the book under review!

In sum, this volume is a welcome contribution to French medieval studies. It will certainly fulfil the hopes of the authors to 'stimulate further research on these texts and help scholars and students to evaluate and appreciate the contribution they make as a whole to the birth of romance' (p. ix).

Véronique Duché, *The University of Melbourne*

Čapeta Rakić, Ivana, and Giuseppe **Capriotti**, eds, *Images in the Borderlands: The Mediterranean between Christian and Muslim Worlds in the Early Modern Period* (Medieval and Early Modern Europe and the World, 1), Turnhout, Brepols, 2022; hardback; pp. 310; 21 b/w, 58 colour illustrations, 1 map; R.R.P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503595085.

To the well-trodden field of early modern Christian–Muslim relations in the Mediterranean, Ivana Čapeta Rakić and Giuseppe Capriotti provide an interesting and timely collection of essays structured around depictions in images and artworks, rather than the more conventional diplomacy, trade, warfare, and slavery. Considering the Mediterranean as a 'borderland'—a dynamic site where societies and cultures overlap and bleed into one another, rather than a hard border or limit—the collection's central strength is a genuinely interdisciplinary and multinational approach. Several rich illustrations (fifty-eight colour images), an impressive diversity of scholars (from Italy, Spain, Croatia, UK, USA, and Turkey, including tenured academics, graduate students, and independent researchers) and wide-ranging subject areas (outlined below) are represented.

The book is divided into three parts, preceded by Čapeta Rakić and Capriotti's 'Introduction', which summarises the critical issues surrounding borderlands and image-based history. The first part, 'Borderland', begins with Peter Burke's brief but wide-ranging account of the legacies of Islamic art and culture across Europe, provoking the highly detailed studies that follow. Chapters by Ivan Alduk, Ferenc Tóth, and Ana Echevarria explore images and imprints of borderland in the tiny, highly strategic Dalmatian village of Zadvarje/Duara, which changed hands repeatedly between Venetian and Ottoman empires and developed a hybrid culture; the towering fortresses of the Dardanelles and Bosporus as a symbol of encroaching French military power in the eighteenth-century Ottoman Empire; and elite military corps from Al-Andalus to Lepanto, provide an interlocking picture of both reception and reality in spaces of conflict. Echavarria's chapter, in particular, will be of broader interest for its rich and nuanced account of 'military conversion' (p. 77)—the widespread practice in Islamic–Christian borderlands of capturing or recruiting soldiers who then voluntarily or involuntarily changed their religion as they rose to high military office—and its cultural impacts, particularly for individual royal prestige and the iconography of warfare.

The second part, 'Lepanto', focuses closely on contemporary echoes of this strategically insignificant but culturally iconic 1571 battle in Ligurian and Piedmontese religious art (Laura Stagno), classically-flavoured portraits of Christian military and political leaders (Chiara Giulia Morandi), a book of

imaginary triumphal monuments from Antwerp (Juan Chiva and Víctor Mínguez) and a series of Ottoman naval manuscript drawings (Naz Defne Kut). Stagno's chapter deserves notice for its surprising exploration of Lepanto's repeated incorporation in rosary altarpieces dedicated to the Virgin Mary, envisioned as the battle's patron and ongoing protector against the Ottoman threat, incorporating the battle into the devotional life of communities far from 'the great epicentres of propaganda' in Madrid, Rome, and Venice. Kut's chapter presents a refreshingly original account of the historical events leading up to and immediately following Lepanto, integrating existing and newly translated Ottoman sources into the well-known story and illuminating longer-term legacies in Turkish historical memory.

The third part, 'Circulation', draws our focus out again, considering how early modern artists imagined both contemporary, historical, and fictional conflicts between Europe, Africa, and the Eastern Mediterranean: in portraits of Ottoman Sultan Mehmed II (Angelo Maria Monaco), the funeral rites of Spanish emperor Philip II (Cristelle Baskins and Borja Franco Llopis), paintings commissioned by the Knights of Saint John in Malta (Maria Luisa Ricci), frescoes in Florence's Palazzo Pitti (Francesco Sorce), and Iberian public sculptures (Iván Rega Castro). Each of these chapters is exhaustively researched and elegantly written and taken together they provide outstandingly detailed interrogations of images, suitable for undergraduate teaching on European depictions of the Islamic Mediterranean and research. Monaco's chapter introduces the concept of 'rhetorical index' (a measure of the layers of meaning and reference stratified in an image) to analyse the increasingly grotesque, aberrant, and fearsome portraits of Mehmed II and eight hundred heads severed from the contemporary 'martyrs' of Otranto, is particularly evocative and elegant, and includes several useful translated primary texts.

As this developed out of a European Cooperation in Science and Technology COST Action 'Islamic Legacy: Narratives East, West, South, North of the Mediterranean (1350–1750)' and a complementary grant from the Spanish Ministry of Science and Innovation, readers will recognise an affinity with the image-focused works in *Lepanto and Beyond: Images of Religious Alterity from Genoa and the Christian Mediterranean* (Leuven University Press, 2021), also funded by the Spanish Ministry, which features chapters by contributors Stagno, Franco Llopis, and Mínguez. Without neglecting the substantial cultural event that was Lepanto, this new book expands *Lepanto and Beyond*'s geographical and temporal coverage to provide a usefully complementary collection. This reviewer would have liked to see more examples of cross-cultural collaboration or pollination, including positive or willing encounters, as most essays focused on the iconographies of conflict and/or the specific artistic heritage of one cultural group. In a problem perennial among publications on Christian–Muslim relations in the Mediterranean, just one chapter of thirteen draws substantially on Ottoman sources and none on Arabic. Nevertheless, the book represents a solid contribution to the history of artistic depictions of early modern Christian–Muslim relations, with several outstanding chapters, and the exhaustive work of translation makes

it a particular boon for anglophone scholars. This collection is recommended to scholars and students of early modern Christian–Muslim relations, Mediterranean history, and art history.

Nat Cutter, *The University of Melbourne*

Cohen, Jeffrey J., and Julian **Yates**, *Noah's Arkive*, Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 2023; paperback; pp. 416; 39 b/w photos, 9 colour plates; R.R.P. US$29.95; ISBN 9781517904241.

Jeffrey J. Cohen and Julian Yates's *Noah's Arkive* repurposes the biblical story of the Flood (Genesis 6–9) to explore potential habits of thought that could arise from the story and have dire social and ecological effects. The authors argue that salvific arks are never an end in themselves; rather, they are part of a story that perpetuates a seemingly endless sequence of (often ill-fated) rebeginnings. Cohen and Yates convincingly urge readers to question the challenges of ark-building, to consider the problems of inclusion and exclusion from that ark, and to engage counter-perspectives about such objects and events. *Noah's Arkive* is a wide-ranging survey of depictions, adaptations, and recreations of the Flood story from the Vienna Genesis manuscript to Playmobil's toy 'My Take Along 1.2.3 Noah's Ark'.

Rather than providing an in-depth study of any one period's representations of the Flood, the chapters thematically collect centuries of representations of the story, demonstrating how we can rethink its events and choices to make them more socially and environmentally prosperous for our futures. 'How to Think Like an Ark' follows Cohen and Yates's experiences of visiting physical ark reconstructions in the US, demonstrating why the story of the ark perpetuates itself even though arks have the potential to close off thinking, sympathy, or resources. The chapter introduces the admonishing refrain that 'the worst thing you can do, we have learned, is to imagine that you are no longer on an ark' (p. 3). 'No More Rainbows' takes the rainbow as a reminder that the events do not end with the polychromatic covenant but are simply a part of a larger story that continues to end and begin over and over. 'Outside the Ark' looks at the various depictions of those excluded from the ark and therefore exposed to catastrophe, reminding readers that arks that seemingly preserve for better times beg the question, 'better for whom?' 'Inside the Ark' discusses arks as salvific repositories, but questions what gets saved, how, and at what cost, recognising that 'all containers are cruel, no matter how apparently welcoming. Arks are no different' (p. 159). 'Stow Away!' posits that while communities by their nature sort and exclude, those same communities struggle with that exclusivity. The chapter aims to question the exclusion inherent to arks so that we can see them as possible locations of encounter and interaction. 'Ravens and Doves' considers the two animals playing more than passive parts in the Flood story, delving into the potentials of both obediently reliable and unpredictably progressive roles. Readers follow the raven towards the improvisatory and 'un-inevitable' possibilities that can come

with abandoning an ark (Chapter 7, 'Abandon Ark!') because, 'in its worst manifestations, the ark is like all symbolic and material architectures that preserve a chosen few while enacting violence on and against many and may function as a vessel for the conveyance of white-supremacist fantasies and histories, privileging the superiority of an imagined European West over any concept of shared human dignity' (p. 278). 'Abandon Ark!' considers conserving life by never boarding a vessel built for refusal rather than affirmation.

At its core, *Noah's Arkive* argues for figurative arks of inclusion, and the book itself conceptually supports that argument. It is impressive in its coverage, making centuries of textual and visual adaptations of the Flood story easily accessible to a general readership. As with many cross-over books, and because of the thematic approach of *Noah's Arkive*, readers cannot expect a concentrated exploration of any one period, and the texts under discussion are described in (often pages-long) summary for readers who have not (or might not) read the texts in question. Stitched in among contemporary depictions, its many references to medieval and early modern works will nevertheless be of interest to medievalists and early modernists who wish to make their scholarship pertinent to contemporary audiences. For example, readers will not find the Flood as represented by the many shorter biblical paraphrases from William Hunnis's *A Hive Full of Honey* (1578) to Josiah Chorley's *A Brief Memorial of the Bible* (1688), where the Flood story plays a smaller part in a bigger work, thematic trend, or habit of thought. There is also only a brief mention of references to the Flood in the works of William Shakespeare, and the discussion of Michael Drayton's poem "Noah's Flood" and Edward Ecclestone's opera *Noah's Flood* receive roughly the same brief treatment as John Milton's much shorter account in Book XI of *Paradise Lost*. By contrast, when Cohen and Yates explore 'ark-thinking' more deeply in relation to John Wilkins's *An Essay towards a Real Character*, and a *Philosophical Language* (1668) and narratives about the slave trade, readers are treated to the inspired type of writing needed to keep early modern scholarship pertinent and practical—a tool for critical thinking and redressing inequality.

This approach points to the strength of *Noah's Arkive* rather than its weakness. *Noah's Arkive* is a book that scholars—those at universities in particular—should read attentively. *Noah's Arkive* carries the most important reminder for the survival of our studies: recreation of relevance. As numerous articles have recently pointed out, such as Nathan Heller's article in *The New Yorker* 'The End of the English Major' (March 2023), the humanities have long seemed poised on the brink of extinction. While Heller does not discuss *Noah's Arkive*, he does recall an interview with Cohen that suggests how this approach might help maintain the humanities moving forward: when Cohen became Dean of Humanities at Arizona State University, he hired a marketing firm to sell the humanities more effectively. *Noah's Archive* is an example of such selling. The book is an ark of inclusion, preserving medieval and early modern works side-by-side with much more recent works and thereby allowing our field to evolve with more contemporary texts.

Noah's Arkive is erudite without being inaccessibly scholarly, and it demonstrates how close attention to older texts can benefit our present and our future.

Michael Cop, *University of Otago*

Edbury, Peter, and Massimiliano **Gaggero**, eds, *The Chronique d'Ernoul and the Colbert-Fontainebleau Continuation of William of Tyre*, I (The Medieval Mediterranean, 135/1), Leiden and Boston, Brill, 2023; hardback, pp. ix, 569; R.R.P. €124.00; ISBN 9789004209930.

Edbury, Peter, and Massimiliano **Gaggero**, eds, *The Chronique d'Ernoul and the Colbert-Fontainebleau Continuation of William of Tyre*, II (The Medieval Mediterranean, 135/2), Leiden and Boston, Brill, 2023; hardback, pp. x, 409; R.R.P. €124.00; ISBN 9789004547582.

Few, if any, sources about the Crusades and the Latin East have a textual tradition as complex as that of the various Old French narratives associated with the enormous history of the First Crusade and the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem written by Archbishop William of Tyre, who died in obscure circumstances in the period leading up to Saladin's conquest of Jerusalem in 1187. William's Latin text was later rendered into the vernacular, most likely during the reign of King Louis VIII of France (r. 1223–26). Not long afterwards, an anonymous compiler took a separate vernacular narrative of events in the Latin East known to scholars as the *Chronique d'Ernoul et de Bernard le Trésorier* ('Chronicle of Ernoul and of Bernard the Treasurer'), excised that text's material from the period before 1184 (where William's original account breaks off), and then welded its post-1184 content onto the end of the Old French translation of William of Tyre. The product of this textual fusion underlays a rich series of entangled continuations that extend into the final decades of the thirteenth century and are attested in various forms across dozens of surviving manuscripts from before 1500.

These two volumes, eagerly anticipated by scholars of crusading history ever since the plan to produce them was first signalled fifteen years ago, offer new critical editions of two key texts in the 'Old French William of Tyre' tradition: the aforementioned *Chronique d'Ernoul* (I), and the so-called *Colbert-Fontainebleau Continuation*, an extensive revision of the post-1184 text that was probably carried out at Acre in the late 1240s (II). Although both texts have been edited before, by Louis de Mas Latrie (1871) and the editors of the *Recueil des historiens des croisades* (1859), respectively, the major advances in scholarly understanding of the textual tradition made in the past half-century are more than sufficient to justify the 'need for fresh editions' (I, 5). The majority of those advances have been due to the editors themselves, Peter Edbury and Massimiliano Gaggero, whose patient scholarship on this subject over more than a quarter-century (in Edbury's case) has fundamentally reshaped our knowledge of these texts, their connections, and their

significance. It therefore comes as no surprise that the editions of both texts are superb.

While the editors have opted to select the same base manuscripts as their nineteenth-century predecessors (Brussels, Bibliothèque royale de Belgique, MS. 11142 for *Ernoul*; Paris. Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS. Fr. 2628 for *Colbert-Fontainebleau* as far as 1266), the texts they have produced are far superior to those of the earlier editions, not least because they are furnished with a more ample critical apparatus. Though undeniably dense, as acknowledged by the editors themselves (I, 62–63), the meticulous noting of significant variants—supported throughout by relevant historical notes—reflects the editors' diligence in collating the key extant manuscripts and ensures that scholars are now supplied with texts of *Ernoul* and *Colbert-Fontainebleau* that adhere even more fully to modern academic conventions. Their edition of *Ernoul* is also supplemented by four appendices providing editions of unique passages and texts from manuscripts other than the base, which are treated with the same editorial care. In addition, both volumes are furnished with extensive Old French–English glossaries that should enable readers with at least a loose grasp of modern French (and perhaps even those with none) to parse some of the text for themselves. The editors are to be commended for their generosity in including this resource in lieu of translations of both texts, which would have been a monumental undertaking in their own right.

The quality of the editorial work on display here extends to the detailed introductions to both volumes, which do much to illuminate the texts' backgrounds, stemmata, relationships, and processes of composition. Among the many important insights to be gained from these analyses is that the original *Ernoul* represented 'an exceptionally early example of a French vernacular prose history', likely predating Geoffrey of Villehardouin's *Conquête de Constantinople* (I, 13–14), and that the person responsible for *Colbert-Fontainebleau* was 'representing the standpoint of the baronial clique who dominated the political setup in Acre at the time of writing [...] [and] directing attention away from the idea that the fall of Jerusalem [in 1187] occurred thanks to the collective culpability of the nobility' (p. 17). Even expert readers may not always find the discussion of specific aspects of the manuscript tradition easy to follow, but both introductions will repay careful consideration by those who wish to comprehend the genesis of the texts properly.

Needless to say, these editions are nothing short of magisterial. I do not doubt that they will remain indispensable to historians of the Crusades and take their place alongside other editorial milestones from the past twenty years, such as Susan Edgington's celebrated edition and translation of Albert of Aachen's *Historia Ierosolimitana* (Oxford University Press, 2007) and Hans Eberhard Mayer's monumental *Urkunden der lateinischen Könige von Jerusalem* (Harrassowitz, 2010). It is to be hoped that Edbury and Gaggero's outstanding work will inspire others to realise a key desideratum that they highlight in their introduction (I, 5): a new critical edition of the unique version of the Old French

text for the period covering 1231–61 known as the *Rothelin Continuation*. Even if this implicit invitation remains unanswered, Edbury and Gaggero deserve the gratitude of all scholars in the field for what they have produced here.

James H. Kane, *Flinders University*

Gheeraert-Graffeuille, Claire, *Lucy Hutchinson and the English Revolution: Gender, Genre, and History Writing*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2022; hardback; pp. 368; R.R.P. £76.00; ISBN 9780192857538.

Early modern women's writing has been experiencing a golden era over the last decade, with increasing numbers of fine critical studies, editions, and (with the occasional hiccup) a steep rise in general interest. While a growing acknowledgement of the variety of early modern women's writing has been especially important, with attention being given to everything from recipes to advice manuals, to women's libraries and book use, there has also been a growing sense of the canonisation of some of the writers who fit clearly into established literary and historical categories of worth. Three that I think are especially notable in this regard are Mary Wroth, Lucy Hutchinson, and Aphra Behn, with perhaps Margaret Cavendish and Katherine Philips following closely. Scholarly editions remain a marker of literary merit, however arbitrary that might seem. In the case of Wroth, thanks to Josephine Roberts's pioneering editorial work we have editions of both parts of *Urania* and of her poetry, with the *oeuvre* completed by the recent Revels edition of *Loves Victory* by Alison Findlay and others. Following on from Janet Todd's *The Secret Life of Aphra Behn* (Rutgers University Press, 1997) we are now seeing a Cambridge University Press edition of Behn's complete works, headed up by Elaine Hobby. Hutchinson's *Memoir* of her husband was well known in the nineteenth century, where it went through several editions, and was edited by James Sutherland in the 1970s and by N. H. Keeble in the mid-1990s.

With the attribution of Hutchinson's epic *Order and Disorder* by David Norbrook, and his subsequent edition (Wiley-Blackwell, 2001), and the attention paid to her remarkable translation of Lucretius, she is now an indispensable example of the entanglement of seventeenth-century literature with the momentous events of the Civil War and its aftermath. Oxford University Press is now halfway through an authoritative edition of Hutchinson's work under the general editorship of David Norbrook. It is in this context that Claire Gheeraert-Graffeuille's detailed study of Hutchinson's *Memoir* and its multiple contexts makes an extremely important contribution to our understanding of her as a writer, and of late seventeenth-century historiography in general. This is a very clever book because it manages to make a narrow focus on a single text into a wide-ranging account of Hutchinson, of early modern women's writing, and of the way that the idea of history in the later seventeenth century was an amalgam of what to a modern reader might seem like irreconcilable genres (for example, history/fiction).

In the first chapter, Gheeraert-Graffeuille relates the *Memoir* to life writing and the idea of exemplarity, as well as the refinement of that idea in the seventeenth century, to take into account more modern notions of biography and history. The second chapter expands this account of theories of history and explores seventeenth-century tensions between what might be called exemplary history and critical history. Here Gheeraert-Graffeuille clarifies how the *Memoir*, as a blend 'of several genres of writing' (p. 109), allows Hutchinson to encompass the personal and ideological responses to the events of the Civil War. In the third chapter, Gheeraert-Graffeuille analyses the way that Hutchinson draws on her own direct experience of the Civil War, centred in Nottingham, and a variety of sources that Hutchinson also uses to flesh out her account.

Hutchinson pieced together her account of the Civil War from a combination of personal experience and information provided by others—notably, in a remarkable but not unusual ideological balance, from her husband and her Royalist brother Sir Allen Apsley. In particular, Gheeraert-Graffeuille notes that 'Lucy Hutchinson's local point of view, anchored in Nottinghamshire affairs, allows her to write a history of the Civil War in which the local and national are tightly intertwined, as well as to give the reader an exceptional insight into the anthropological realities of war' (p. 148). In Chapter 4, Gheeraert-Graffeuille turns to Hutchinson's period of what might be termed more direct political engagement, from 1661 to 1664. As recounted in the *Memoir*, this involved her considerable efforts on behalf of her husband, who was imprisoned and in danger of execution for his part in the trial and execution of Charles I. This part of the *Memoir* is related to 'the testimonies of Lucy Hutchinson's contemporaries, Ann Fanshawe and Anne Halkett, or of the French *Frondeuses*' (p. 166). In this chapter, Gheeraert-Graffeuille examines the way that Hutchinson 'writes herself into history and ultimately emerges as a fully-fledged historian, whose work must be considered on a par with the other histories of the English Revolution' (pp. 168–69). Gheeraert-Graffeuille explores in some detail the ambiguity surrounding Hutchinson's involvement in her husband's Restoration settlement, which leads to her lengthy consideration of Hutchinson's historical methodology in Chapters 5 and 6.

This book is not only a meticulous and detailed analysis of Hutchinson's *Memoir*, but it provides a complex, revisionary account of seventeenth-century historiography, and of Hutchinson's place within a tradition that in the past has been dominated by male writers.

Paul Salzman, *La Trobe University*

Gray, Douglas, *From Fingal's Cave to Camelot*, edited by Jane **Bliss**, Oxford, Independent Publishing Network, 2020; paperback; pp. 252; R.R.P. £22.00; ISBN 9781838537838.

Douglas Gray, the author of *From Fingal's Cave to Camelot*, died in 2017. A brief death notice on the website of the Faculty of English, University of Oxford, rightly described him as 'a giant of his field' who continued to publish 'deep into

retirement'—and as this recent book indicates, Gray has continued to 'publish' not only in retirement but posthumously as well. One other affectionate remark from the death notice is worth quoting here too: 'Douglas had not only read everything but had seemingly remembered everything he had read'. Those familiar with his rooms in Norham Gardens, Oxford, might also reflect that he seemingly remembered where he had put everything, however much the state of the rooms suggested otherwise! I quote that second remark because it seems appropriate to the book under review, which is the product not just of a giant of a scholar but of someone who gives every appearance of having read and remembered everything. Equally, one suspects that the vast array of learning on display here is not the product of a search engine (how Google doth make scholars of us all) but of a lifetime's generous reading, a capacious memory, and an indefatigable interest in his subject. And how typical of Douglas (and typically Chaucerian) to describe himself in the Prologue as 'a simple practitioner of the history of medieval English literature' (p. 3).

This work is anything but the product of a 'simple practitioner', as is immediately apparent. Ambitious in scope—in the best sense of that word—it is a wide-ranging and vastly learned exploration of its subject. The editor's preface speaks of intervening as little as possible in the extant text 'so as not to destroy the flow of Gray's argument' (p. ix), but in truth (and the quibble is only a minor one) this book does not really present an argument, and in some respects is the more attractive for not doing so.

What it does do is set out for us in a section appropriately headed 'The Quest'. At first glance, Gray seems to make a modest claim, offering a 'selective and simple' account of 'the strange afterlife of medieval literature': a small contribution to a larger investigation (p. 3). Two images recur throughout this section—of story and of the journey—and it is those ideas, rather than an argument as such, that sit behind the book and its largely chronological narrative of the 'rediscovery' of medieval literature by succeeding generations of readers, writers, scholars, and critics—the servants, as Gray notes a little later, of Mercury and of Philology. A largely chronological narrative, but in a characteristic touch, Gray sidles up to his topic via Felix Mendelssohn's visit to Fingal's Cave on the island of Staffa, and Joseph Banks's visit to the same place some fifty years earlier.

It marks a splendid starting point, for Banks is writing just a few years after James Macpherson published his 'translations'—*Fingal* in 1762 and *The Collected Works of Ossian* in 1765. The image of the careful scientist, Joseph Banks, responding with something approaching awe to a sublime natural marvel, and linking that natural phenomenon to the literary phenomenon engendered by Macpherson's much-disputed translations is somehow a wonderful emblem of the whole quest that Gray embarks on. Worth noting, too, from the Prologue, is the deliberate inclusiveness of the plural pronoun. While Gray may be the narrator or storyteller, we undertake the journey with him. We are all engaged in what is rapidly turned into 'our quest'.

Something of the wide coverage of the topic might be noted (jestingly) through an inspection of the Index, which ranges from 'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles Lettres' to 'Zupitza, Julius'—a literal A–Z of Gray's subject. More seriously, though, the 'Index' does allow us to see some of the emphases of the quest, and to note some of the material that recurs with particular frequency.

As one would expect, personal names are among the most frequent things that recur, whether of the mythological figures such as Fingal and Arthur, medieval writers such as Chaucer and Langland, or the rich number of those who effected the rediscovery and gave breath to the *Nachleben*. These are the antiquarians and (later) the scholars who carefully preserved the literature and made it available to other readers, together with the writers whose own imaginative work took something of its inspiration from older texts, especially from ballads and romance literature.

At the outset, Gray suggests why medieval literature tended to be 'forgotten by the literate elite of later centuries', citing 'changes in society, in taste, and changes in the language over the centuries' (p. 7). It is somewhat surprising to see no mention there of the impact of the Reformation (unless it is implied in the first) which rendered so much medieval material not only difficult to access but dangerous at the same time. However, this 'Introduction to Part 1' is one of a small number of sections that seem pretty clearly unfinished and would surely have been revised had Gray lived to see it through to publication. Where the impact of the Reformation is acknowledged, somewhat ironically, is through the dissolution of the monasteries and the effect that that had on the 'liberation' of manuscripts. While much was undoubtedly destroyed in that process, it did have what Gray calls 'an unintended positive result, that medieval manuscripts became available for collectors' (p. 46). The importance of those collectors can be seen, for example, in the great library assembled by Sir Robert Cotton, and later antiquaries who sought to preserve a national cultural heritage.

There is a further clue to be followed up through Gray's comment about the literature having been forgotten 'by the literate elite', for one of the other aspects that we can see through the index is the importance of something to which Douglas Gray gave a great deal of scholarly attention, namely, what is generally called 'popular' literature (although he himself did much to challenge some of the usual implications of that term). Thus, we see how frequently he mentions popular culture and folklore, how central are ballads, carols, and particularly romances—which Helen Cooper in *The English Romance in Time* (Oxford University Press, 2004, p. 2) described as the 'major genre of secular fiction for five hundred years […] a half millennium of literature in which men and women of the Middle Ages and Renaissance fashioned themselves, their culture and their ideals'.

Alongside people and genres, Gray's narrative regularly returns to the matter of language, of the importance in different periods of dialect and regionalisms, of debates about linguistic purity (however that term be conceived), of attempts to recover some knowledge of Old English, of attitudes towards Chaucer's language

and metre, of the emergence of dictionaries, and the great philological endeavours of the nineteenth century. And there is space, too, to note the strange, doomed efforts of William Barnes, the Dorset clergyman, who wished to 'restore' Old English. Gerard Manley Hopkins knew of his work, and wrote to Robert Bridges in 1882: 'He does not see the utter hopelessness of the thing. It makes one weep to think what English might have been; for despite all that Shakespeare and Milton have done with the compound, I cannot doubt that no beauty in a language can make up for want of purity […] the madness of an almost unknown man trying to do what the three estates of the realm together could never accomplish! He calls degrees of comparison "pitches of suchness": we ought to call them so, but alas!' (*The Collected Works of Gerard Manley Hopkins*, II: *Correspondence 1882–1889*, ed. by R. K. R. Thornton and Catherine Phillips, Oxford University Press, 2013, p. 551).

There is much in the quest that Gray embarks upon that is a record of things lost, much to occasion, with Hopkins, a sense of 'alas'. But there is, at the same time, much to celebrate. For the narrative is one of survivals, continuities, and imitations—three more repeated terms from the 'Index' that point us to where Gray has been heading. If some of those imitations are occasionally passed off as the real thing, if the extant material is now and then salted with forgeries, that seems to be embraced as part of the *Nachleben*. It is all witness, of a sort, to the multitude of stopping points and milestones on the journey that Gray has taken us on.

It is greatly to be regretted that Douglas Gray did not live to complete this work, for it is such a pleasure to travel with him on the journey or to listen in on the story he tells. There are, inevitably, some weaknesses and omissions, some infelicities of style, and some repetition of material, all of which would no doubt have been attended to in a final revision. But we should nevertheless be very grateful to Jane Bliss, who has edited the near-finished manuscript, and equally to Douglas's son, Dr Nick Gray, who allowed the work to see the light of day.

Peter Whiteford, *University of Victoria*

Hoogvliet, Margriet, Manuel F. **Fernández Chaves**, and Rafael M. **Pérez García**, eds, *Networking Europe and New Communities of Interpretation (1400–1600)* (New Communities of Interpretation, 4), Turnhout, Brepols, 2023; hardcover; pp. 247; 6 b/w illustrations; RRP €75.00; ISBN 9782503606217.

Networking Europe aims to reconstruct how religious reform was transported throughout diaspora communities across Europe and the role that these informal communications had in the metamorphosis of spiritual belief throughout the medieval and early modern eras. Interestingly, the editors' goal was deliberately shifted away from intellectual or social elites, or formal religious institutions. Rather, attention is drawn to the layperson's communities of interest throughout Europe, where information was spread not so much by institutional or political

affiliation as by cultural, social, or commercial ties. The work also consciously moves away from existing ideological forms to describe the continuous challenges and transformations of medieval Christianity. *Networking Europe* 'reconstruct[s] European networks of knowledge exchange, exploring how religious ideas and strategies of transformation "travelled"' (p. 11).

Woven throughout the work is the theme of interconnectivity: the influences on the material and spiritual relationship of lay communities and new environments, new practices, and even new geographies. The volume is divided into three sections: 'European Connections' focuses on influences on lay communities, such as in Rafael M. Pérez García's contribution, which examines the influence of Northern European Christian mystical literature on sixteenth-century Spanish spiritual literature. 'Exiles, Diasporas, and Migrants' considers the relationship between diaspora communities, material or economic identities, and spiritual connectivity. Manuel F. Fernández Chaves's work centres on the establishment of Flemish institutions in Seville, whereas Ignacio García Pinilla's examines the impact of Protestantism on Spanish merchants residing in the Low Countries. Finally, 'Mobility and Merchants' investigates more material forms of interconnectivity. The relationship between book merchants, printers, and the Spanish Inquisition is addressed by Natalia Maillard Álvarez. Maillard's study moves beyond Europe to the New World, examining the Inquisition's reach into the Mexican bookselling market. Margriet Hoogvliet closes the volume with an investigation of the tangible objects of travel: itineraries, maps, and other guides to merchant and pilgrimage routes. Described by Hoogvliet as 'the tangible materialisation of connections between people over long distances' (p. 217), this chapter examines the relationship between trade, spiritual practice, and the spread of religious knowledge.

The volume does move beyond Western Europe: Miroslawa Hanusiewicz-Lavallee examines how earlier Latin martyrologies by Foxe or Crespin influenced Polish Protestant martyrologies, and how these works 'became a tool of regaining the ecclesiastical past [...] and for erasing the troublesome stigma of "novelty"' (p. 58). Similarly, Marcin Polkowski's contribution discusses the social interconnectivity of lay communities in Delft, and how lay religious affiliation overlaid and intertwined with other forms of social connectivity such as craft guilds. While it is a fascinating insight into Delft printers as a vehicle for religious knowledge, I feel that the discussion of illustrations for illiterate members of the community might have been strengthened by the inclusion of some of the images in question. Finally, Vladimir Abramovic's contribution discusses life for Ragusan merchants in the Ottoman Empire. This is the only work in the volume to move beyond Christian Europe.

Networking Europe's focus on lay communities as a vehicle of change is a refreshing take on the religious and spiritual metamorphosis in the medieval and early modern eras. Unfortunately, I feel that the volume's stated goals fall slightly short in two respects. The emphasis on the male members of the lay

communities in question leaves the twenty-first-century reader wondering how women in these communities communicated with other female members, how these communities may have differed from those of their husbands, and how this manifested in practice. A more conscious decision to include the material productions of women would have strengthened the sense of community that the book was attempting to establish. As to the former implied criticism, despite the editors' expressed desire to examine 'the long-distance social ties connecting Europeans from all geographic corners of the continent' (p. 11), the volume's compass is firmly pointed due west. Admittedly, Abramovic's work examines Christian communities in the Ottoman Empire, along with Polkowski's chapter on Delft printers, and Hanusiewicz-Lavalee's contribution on Polish martyrologies. However, the remainder of the book centres on Western Europe, particularly Spain or the Spanish diasporas. This composition feels like a missed opportunity and results in a work that, although absorbing, does feel slightly imbalanced in its treatment of 'European' spiritual communities.

Ines Jahudka, *The University of Melbourne*

Klement, Sascha R., *Representations of Global Civility: English Travellers in the Ottoman Empire and the South Pacific, 1636–1863*, Bielefeld, Transcript Publishing, 2021; paperback; pp. 270; R.R.P. €45.00; ISBN 9783837655834.

Sascha R. Klement's book presents a compelling argument for a framework of 'global civility' in British travel writing about the Ottoman Empire and South Pacific: a 'discursive formation' characterised by 'cultural cross-fertilisation, respect for the organisational structures and social differences of foreign polities, and the representation of mutually improving encounters in intercultural contact zones' (p. 11). Travelling Britons, prompted by 'situational exigencies' that required improvisation and cross-cultural cooperation, came to, at least temporarily, surrender their superiority and respond to the agency and subjectivity of the other (pp. 18–20). In so doing, Klement's travel narratives present a more constructive version of cross-cultural engagement than many postcolonial critiques which assume Britain's 'civilising mission and military power' as a 'historical constant' (pp. 11, 14).

Klement's first chapter considers Henry Blount's *A Voyage into the Levant* (1636), a mainstay of scholarship on English travel into the Islamic Mediterranean in the early seventeenth century, which has problematised, if not entirely overturned, the assumption of continuous British superiority. Blount's account presents the Ottoman Empire as a developed and powerful state with the capacity to match or even surpass European power, a society from which to learn. Klement distinctively argues that Blount also embodies a methodology of engagement for 'a citizen of a nation with imperial ambitions' to learn from those around them: a specific set of civilities, neither detestable to him or them (p. 42). Challenging

'those who catechise the world by their own home', Blount divests his Englishness to observe a powerful empire (p. 42).

Klement's second and third chapters contrast two late eighteenth-century encounters with the Ottomans and Pacific Islanders to expose both important distinctions in knowledge and power and the shared production of global civility. Framed by Enlightenment sensibility, George Keate's *Account of the Pelew Islands* (1788) presents to an audience gripped by tales of the exotic and 'barbarous' a humanised tale of survival and mutual society through privation (p. 70). As the Palauans grant permission to East India Company sailors to build a new ship in exchange for armed support against neighbouring communities, they form a mutually beneficial arrangement without the usual flood of European goods and erosion of Pacific culture. Keate and Blount resonate with Klement's richly contextualised account of Henry Abbott's little-known *A Trip […] Across the Grand Desart of Arabia* (1789), the third chapter's focus, in a praise for the hospitality, courtesy, and friendship of the cultures they encounter, by their small but important exclusions (Blount derides the Ottoman Jews, and Keate the Malay Chinese, even as they praise their principal subjects), and by their unexpected and even anomalous nature—Blount rejects 'entrenched stereotypes' and 'religious propaganda', Keate 'goes further than most of his contemporaries', and Abbott disavows his stereotyped and ill-informed predecessors. Taken together, these three accounts provide a robust case for Klement's argument—global civility may be unusual, but it was certainly present.

As Klement traces subsequent developments in global civility, he runs into more contestable waters. In an abrupt shift from apparently conventional global civility in Keate and Abbott (1788–89), Klement points to George Barrington and Mary Ann Parker's accounts of Botany Bay (1793–95) as the moment when 'global civility starts to crack' (p. 13), followed by the 'representational ambivalence [and] colonialism' inherent in F. E. Maning's *Old New Zealand* (1863). But why is this principally a chronological difference, rather than a geographical one in which Indigenous Australians were generally perceived, and treated, distinctly from Pacific Islanders and Māori, or a literary one between the remediated dialogues of Keate (who did not participate in the voyage he describes) and Maning's fictionalised autobiography, against the more first-hand accounts found in Barrington and Parker? Klement draws heavily on edited editions and existing focused studies of all his Pacific texts, which renders his inattention to the vast historiography of regional differences even more glaring. Components of the Botany Bay chapter also rest on the claim, astonishing for an author familiar with the early modern Mediterranean captivity economy, let alone the convict transportation and indentured servitude practised in British America, that 'the Botany Bay decision for the first time subjected white Europeans to [the] heinous practices' of human trafficking (p. 169). Klement is on more solid and original ground in the Middle East, as he argues for Charles Coville Frankland's *Travels to and from Constantinople* (1829) as a transition point between incipient European

incursions into Ottoman lands and later full-scale dominating Orientalism. In close dialogue with Edward Saïd, Klement shows that Frankland's numerous 'citational discourses' obscure some more positive first-hand experiences, particularly how 'sensory experiences can dismantle popular myths about the East' (p. 208). Ironically, though he calls for 'regionally specific and historically nuanced analyses', Klement's strength is in his cross-regional comparisons, and his historical work on Australia and New Zealand is insufficient.

More broadly, I find it problematic that Klement's chronological progression leaps from 1636 to 1788 without substantial consideration of anything in between (except three hostile accounts of Arabian desert travel around 1750, construed as stereotyped generalisations against Abbott's positive realism: pp. 115–31). While Blount may have 'set the stage for successive generations of English travels in both the Islamic world and the South Pacific' (p. 58), Klement offers no concrete lineage between them, potentially supplied by Lancelot Addison (1632–1703), Joseph Morgan (*fl.* 1706–33), or Thomas Shaw (1672–1751). I also note the lack of a final narrative for the Middle East to parallel Maning; certainly, in both the Middle East and the Pacific, global civility 'evaporates' in 'the age of empire' (p. 14), but Klement only shows us one side.

Nevertheless, Klement has provided a distinctive and fascinating reading of cross-cultural encounters across regions, showing a common thread in some British travel narratives of the necessity and desire to suspend their cultural background, cooperate across boundaries, and be impressed by foreign cultures. This book is commended to those theorising British cross-cultural encounters, particularly with the Ottomans, who wish to go beyond regionalism and imperialism; it will prompt a range of studies in other texts as scholars consider its theoretical implications.

Nat Cutter, *The University of Melbourne*

Luis-Martínez, Zenón, ed., *Poetic Theory and Practice in Early Modern Verse: Unwritten Arts*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2023; hardback; pp. 352; R.R.P. £95.00; ISBN 9781399507820.

Zenón Luis-Martínez's useful volume brings together an international team of scholars—recognised and emerging experts in the field of Renaissance poetry—in a series of essays offering fresh readings of canonical, and lesser-known, poets of early modern England. Poets discussed in this book include Philip Sidney, Edmund Spenser, Christopher Marlowe, William Shakespeare, George Puttenham, and John Dryden, as well as those less often studied, such as Henry Constable, Barnabe Barnes, Thomas Lodge, Aemilia Lanyer, Fulke Greville, and George Chapman.

The volume follows other outputs of a 'Project of Excellence' funded by the Spanish government, broadly constituted to reassess works and examine a new aesthetic of English Renaissance poetry. Focusing on the interactions between historical practice and period theory, the various essays are well situated within a broader international movement concerned with re-examining issues in early

modern poetics, in an endeavour to unearth new insights into what may have been previously overlooked. For this volume, it is a concern with unwritten principles governing the poetic practice of the period, addressing the dialogue between literary practice and the Renaissance theories upon which they were based. The editor's introduction quotes Rosalie Colie, defining the process as a quest to discover the 'unwritten poetics by which writers worked and which they themselves created', which can be discovered from 'real' literature, as opposed to the conscious principles that can be gleaned from criticism and theory (p. 2). A worthy aim. Yet, as in many of the projects in this field, there is a slant towards modern preoccupations, such as the body, matter, and emotions: all of which we find usefully addressed in the volume as popular scholarly themes of late.

The book is loosely divided into three parts which organise its content in a non-prescriptive manner, endeavouring to relate papers thematically, and to one another, in various ways. The three essays in Part I, 'Origen: Poetic Aetiologies', variously investigate ideas of causation and origin in poetry, narratives that might be seen as alternative, or complementary, to those in the formal theory of period treatises. Those examined are, first, principles of divine grace; Joan Curbet Soler's 'Justified by Whose Grace? Poetic Worth and Transcendent Doubt in Late Elizabethan and Early Jacobean Poetry' looks at the principle of grace as the origin of poetics and its complexities in Sidney, Spenser, Greville, and Lanyer. Second, efficient cause: Emma Annette Wilson's 'The Logical Cause of an Early Modern Poetics of Action' traces the changing meanings and roles of cause, with particular attention to the efficient cause in Renaissance logic and its impact in English works by Sidney, Spenser, and Marlowe. Third, variants of materialism are reconsidered in Cassandra Gorman's fascinating 'Atomies of Love: Material (Mis)interpretations of Cupid's Origin in Elizabethan Poetry', analysing the poetic mythography of Cupid in Sidney and Drayton in light of the period's materialist philosophies' growing interest in atomic motion.

The second set of essays in Part II, 'Style: Outgrowing the Arts', gives attention to questions of poetic form arising at the intersections of theory and practice, where poetic style extends beyond the strictures of theory. Rocío G. Sumillera's 'Bloody Poetics: Towards a Physiology of the Epic Poem' addresses the semantic role of blood as 'a fundamental style indicator' in a poetics of epic style, particularly in the work of the early English translators of Homer: George Chapman and John Dryden. David J. Amelang's 'Figuring Ineloquence in Late Sixteenth Century Poetry' navigates between rhetorical theory and a selection of texts, including poems by Sidney, Spenser, Marlowe, and Drayton, as well as dramatic pieces by Shakespeare, in search of a 'theory of the unpoetic' and a 'praxis of ineloquence' (p. 19). Sonia Hernández-Santano's 'Eloquent Bodies: Rhetoricising the Symptoms of Love in the English Epyllion', is concerned with performative poetics and the relations between eloquence and the emotions in Thomas Lodge's *Scillaes Metamorphosis* along with Shakespeare's *Venus and Adonis* and *The Rape of Lucrece*.

The final essays in Part III, 'Poesis: Art's Prisoners', emerge from a line of Thomas Lodge's *Phillis* that depicts art's conventional constraints on the poet's creative activity. As a process, poesis features in dialogue with the theoretical. Jonathan P. A. Sell's 'Philip Sidney's Sublime Self Authorship: Authenticity, Ecstasy and Energy in *The Defence of Poesy* and *Astrophil and Stella*' reads a poetics of the sublime in the language of 'authenticity', 'ecstasy', and 'energy' in Sidney's works, to extend beyond his written theory of poetry. María Jesús Pérez-Jáuregui's 'From Favour to Eternal Life: Trajectories of Grace and the Poetic Career in the Sonnets of Henry Constable and Barnaby Barnes' considers the 'polysemy of grace' as a poetic keyword applied in the parallel trajectories of the two poets, marking, in contrasting ways, a transition from the secular to the religious lyric. Cinta Zunino-Garrido's 'Thomas Lodge's "Supple Muse": Imitation, Inspiration and Imagination in *Phillis*' assesses these period themes in Lodge's jointly-published sonnet sequence, *Phillis*, and the narrative poem *The Complaynt of Elstred*, in ways which assert the importance of experience over imitation. Sarah Knight's 'The Worthy Knots of Fulke Greville' takes the centrality of 'difficulty' in influential post-Renaissance discussions of Greville in the figurative language of his critical writings, and in his tragedies *Alaham* and *Mustapha*, as an aesthetic and didactic quality that presupposes its being worth the readers' efforts to unravel. Finally, Luis-Martínez's 'George Chapman's "Habit of Poesie"' looks at Chapman's poetic habit as a mediator between inspiration and labour in the processes of the composition of his poems, translations of Homer and critical writing, comprising a complex array of 'creative, intellective and interpretative qualities upon which the figures of poet, philosopher, translator, and reader converge' (p. 21).

Overall, the collection shows the value of edited volumes for bringing timely and topical research to their audiences, with proper attention to important contemporary foci. As such, it is a welcome addition to a field that continues to generate fascinating scholarly work.

Jane Vaughan, *The University of Western Australia*

Meylan, Nicholas, *The Pagan Earl: Hákon Sigurðarson and the Medieval Construction of Old Norse Religion* (The Viking Collection, 26), Odense, University Press of Southern Denmark, 2022; paperback; pp. 264; R.R.P US$30.00; ISBN 9788740834246.

The earls of Lade (Old Norse Hlaðir), the area now comprising Trøndelag and Hålogaland, were one of the strongest dynasties in medieval Norway, which produced several well-known figures associated with the Norwegian court. One of these, Hákon Sigurðarson, who ruled Norway from 975 until he died in 995, is the principal subject of Nicolas Meylan's book *The Pagan Earl*. Meylan charts the arc of Hákon's political life through an examination of many texts, mostly kings' sagas (*konungasögur*) that mention him, emphasising the ways his well-known belief in the old gods informs and frames his depiction. As such, *The Pagan Earl* not only

increases our knowledge of one of Norway's seminal rulers but also reflects on the use of the category 'pagan/heathen' as a discursive tool by thirteenth-century Christian authors for whom Hákon was a divisive figure.

Meylan begins with an intriguing explanation of his methodology. After discussing the usual source-critical problems associated with the recording and transmission of Old Norse religion, he introduces the relatively new concept of memory studies, which has proven to be quite fruitful, promulgated chiefly by Danish scholar Pernille Hermann. At this point Meylan asserts his independence from traditional memory studies theories, instead choosing to focus on individual sources as discourses or what he calls, quoting Deborah Schiffrin, 'language in use' (p. 19). The other major methodological consideration Meylan highlights is the use of comparison: in this case of the same story or phenomenon by multiple authors. According to Meylan, such an approach can reveal intriguing insights at a subaltern or subtextual level of a society or individual's conflicting agendas. Finally, Meylan also discusses the kings' sagas' use of skaldic poetry and accords it no special status in terms of veracity, which is an interesting position given that is typically regarded as a comparatively reliable source.

Many of the chapters focus biographically on a central aspect of Hákon's life. These include his divine genealogy, birth, and upbringing (Chapter 1); his father Earl Sigurð's life and subsequent murder and the family's custom of human/animal sacrifice (Chapter 2); and the aggressive campaign to rebuild pagan temples following Hákon's revenge killing of Harald Greycloak (Chapter 4), to name a few. In each of these chapters and others, Meylan carefully examines the key elements that define a version of the event or story, noting any political or religious agenda that the author may be harbouring. For example, on the subject of temple-raising in 'conversion era' Norway, Meylan discusses four medieval histories that mention Hákon, frequently in the context of Olaf Tryggvason's efforts to convert the population to Christianity. As we would expect, texts that lionise Olaf tend to play up Hákon's pagan qualities, while others, such as the Kringla transcripts of *Heimskringla*, emphasise the materialistic subtext of Olaf's destruction of pagan temples, hardly mentioning the diabolic nature of the old religion at all. According to Meylan, while both types of texts stand roundly against paganism, they convey different messages regarding 'the nature of the state, what it should be and how it should work' (p. 101). By using the comparative method in this way, a more nuanced view of the thirteenth-century political landscape begins to emerge, one in which the ideology of kingship comes to the fore.

In Chapter 7, in a rare foray into literary analysis, Meylan analyses the poetic formula *vargr í véum* ('wolf in the sanctuaries'), applied to Hákon by a Swedish ruler following his invasion of Gautland. Meylan contextualises *vargr í véum* in the well-known story of the binding of Fenrir, the wolfish son of the god Loki. The comparison between Hákon and a wolf 'in the sanctuaries', let alone a chaotic figure such as Fenrir, could well be construed as a defamatory comment towards Hákon. However, Meylan brilliantly shows that by utilising the trifunctional

concept developed by Georges Dumézil, this statement can be viewed in terms of the upholding of a fundamental tenet of traditional Scandinavian hierarchy, a subaltern reading that has not been noticed previously.

I believe that *The Pagan Earl* achieves its major aims and, in many ways, probably exceeds them. On the one hand, our knowledge of Earl Hákon is greatly improved; not so much for the revelation of new material but for the way it can be interpreted and given new meaning when looked at under a certain microscope. Similarly, the different manuscripts of the histories and chronicles that include writings about this period have been given a new lease of life by Meylan, who I think has persuaded his audience that the ideology of kingship seen through the guise of Old Norse paganism was of greater concern than has been previously acknowledged. Unfortunately, the unique source situation for Hákon means that we are unlikely to see this kind of study repeated in the future, though this should not detract from *The Pagan Earl*'s considerable value to Old Norse studies.

Manu Braithwaite-Westoby, *The University of Sydney*

Monagle, Clare, and Neslihan **Şenocak**, eds, *Lateran IV: Theology and Care of Souls* (Disputatio, 34), Turnhout, Brepols, 2023; hardback; pp. 219; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503596808.

This volume, edited by two scholars interested in the interaction between theology and pastoral care, provides a helpful collection of perspectives both on the Fourth Lateran Council and the dynamic pope who drove its agenda. The Council was only one of several transformative happenings taking place in that year. Yet, as the editors describe in the 'Introduction', the Fourth Lateran Council would wield an immense impact over every dimension of Christian life in the Latin West. In the 'Introduction', Clare Monagle and Neslihan Şenocak also offer a cogent survey of the range of perspectives that have been taken on the Council. In one way, the Council can be seen as marking the apogee of papal ambition to reform pastoral care within the Church. Yet they also observe its concern to reinforce the power and privileges of the clergy within the Church, as well as their right to teach. The various chapters in this volume tend to position themselves somewhere along this spectrum between the poles of authority and reform. They combine to reinforce a message about the importance of this Council in defining both orthodoxy and the direction of pastoral care.

Monagle tackles the tension between these two perspectives in a paper boldly exploring the tension between theology and pastoral care in the official edicts of Lateran IV. The Council was unlike any that preceded it in singling out a single theologian, namely Peter Lombard, as the voice of orthodoxy, defending him against criticisms of his theology that had been made over two decades earlier by Joachim of Fiore. This was a decision with immense consequences for the future of theology; its effect was to marginalise those who sympathised with Joachite criticism of the rising tide of academic theology. Monagle argues that its deeper concern was to define the discourse of orthodoxy within an institution

in which competing perspectives were perceived as potentially undermining the authority of the Church. Her focus on the definition of orthodoxy is complemented by that of Marcia Colish, who seeks to unpack the intellectual tradition that underpinned the official vindication of Lombard's Trinitarian orthodoxy against the criticisms made by Joachim. Her sympathies are with the admirers rather than the critics of Lombard, whom she accuses of misreading his text. The most valuable part of her contribution is to unpack the debt of the official defence of Lombard's theology to the teaching of Stephen Langton about terms applied to God. Pope Innocent III appointed Langton to the cardinalate in 1206. His interest in distinguishing between signification and supposition provided a much more effective way of discussing theological terms than anything offered by Prepositinus of Cremona, chancellor of the emerging University of Paris in the years 1206–09. In this perspective, Lateran IV deserves attention as providing an authoritative justification for orthodoxy against incorrect arguments rather than against critics from outside the Parisian schools.

Juanita Feros Ruys offers a less traditional angle on the Council by picking up a small, but significant, detail, namely about the devil and other demons rather than the devil and his demons. She argues that while it was a long-established tradition to imagine the devil as in charge of his demons, the Council introduced a subtly different perspective that might have been influenced by Alan of Lille writing against heresy. She offers a close reading of Alan's demonology as that of a community rather than a hierarchy of demons. By contrast, William of Auvergne would reinstate a more traditional demonic hierarchy. While the implications of the Council's terminology are not fully laid out, its terminology perhaps reflects a more astute awareness of the great diversity of challenges then facing the Church.

Şenocak's paper, on the pastor as teacher, argues that Lateran IV produced a new model of pastoral care, in which emphasis was increasingly centred on the role of pastors as teachers. Its major contribution is to make us aware of the very different ways in which pastoral care was being imagined at the time of the Council. Perhaps the most telling is the concurrent development of the statuary of Christ the Teacher. The strength of her study relies on its attentiveness to the process of pastoral activity, at least as imagined in theory. It raises the question of how the precepts of the Council were interpreted in practice. One suspects that pastoral care would be interpreted in very different ways both within and outside the mendicant orders. Similar issues are raised by the contribution of Jessalynn L. Bird in looking at synodal sermons from this period as vectors of reform. Its strength lies in its close attention to individual sermons, including those of Langton, that demonstrate how much clerical preachers were disturbed by the malpractice of other clerics. While theorists might focus on the ambitions of Lateran IV, these sermons reveal the messy reality of the structures which the Council sought to regulate.

At a more specific level, Pier Virginio Aimone Brada, an authority on canon law, offers a precise breakdown of the actual dispositions of Lateran IV,

highlighting just how far-reaching were its ambitions. He demonstrates that the Council endeavoured to address many specific problems. Another Italian scholar whose work is introduced here in English is Tommaso di Carpegna Falconieri, writing on the role of the Roman clergy (as distinct from the pontifical clergy around the Pope). At a practical level, the Council provided a focus for many otherwise disparate communities in Rome through liturgical performance as much as through edicts. A final paper by Anne E. Lester about the prayers of Pope Innocent III prompted by devotion to Veronica's image of Christ within a breviary from the Abbey of Corbie reminds us that his impact was in shaping not just doctrine, but devotion. The strength of this volume lies in the diversity of its perspectives on a Council and a pope of undeniable importance.

Constant J. Mews, *Monash University*

Nederman, Cary J., *The Rope and the Chains: Machiavelli's Early Thought and its Transformations*, New York, Lexington Books, 2023; hardback; pp. 168; R.R.P. US$95.00; ISBN 9781793617248.

'*Another* book about Machiavelli? Really?' (p. ix) is Cary J. Nederman's opening quip to this brief, very readable exploration of how Niccolò di Bernardo dei Machiavelli 'became' Machiavelli. This interests Nederman because, in his view, while there has been so much written about Machiavelli, significant lacunae exist concerning a particular body of his important and substantial writings. According to Nederman, Machiavelli's pre-1513 writing and thought remain largely unexplored, investigated, and not even acknowledged by most authors of secondary literature and biographies of this most singular of Renaissance political practitioners and thinkers. Nederman's central thesis rests upon a substantial analytical comparison of Machiavelli's writings *ante res perditas* and *post res perditas*, and how a comparison of these demonstrates his journey from ignorance to comprehension via a very steep learning curve and hard-won self-education based upon bitter experience, study, and close personal observation of the mechanisms of politics and the machinations of political players of both sexes—the foundations of his intellectual toolbox. Nederman observes moreover that 'Machiavelli's signal contributions to political theory may be conceived of as serious self-criticism of his own faulty naivete in the years before his downfall' (p. 134). His political theory and granular understanding of human nature did not spring fully formed from their progenitor sometime in mid-1513 but instead represented the hard-earned harvest of his pre-1513 thought, lived sociopolitical experience, and gimlet-eyed observations. For Nederman, *The Prince*, commenced very soon after his release from prison and the work for which Machiavelli is best known, marks his definitive 'transformation from politico to author' (p. 3).

Having assured the Medici regime that he posed no direct threat to their reasserted ascendancy, Machiavelli was eventually liberated during a general amnesty about a month after his arrest. He refers to this time as one of 'disgrace', observing to his friend Francesco Vettori that 'Fate has done everything to cause

me this abuse' (p. 2). Despite this, Machiavelli managed to move on, focusing on his intellectual pursuits with greater determination to produce the works for which he would become most famous. The whole experience of his vertiginous downfall, and the part played in it by *Fortuna*/Fate, was a watershed moment for Machiavelli, informing the subsequent development and ripening of his political theory and his 'warts and all' understanding of human nature in all its vices and virtues. This transformation, as Nederman ably demonstrates, can be unpicked and tracked by attending closely not only to his *post res perditas* writings but more importantly to those of his lesser-studied *ante res perditas* period.

Nederman commences his study with an informative introductory chapter, 'The Rope and the Chains', providing the reader with a brief yet essential sketch of the circumstances and significance of Machiavelli's arrest and incarceration. He then moves on, outlining his 'Method of Inquiry', concluding with 'The Path Forward' offering the reader a concise roadmap of the direction taken by the five interconnected chapters that make up his study.

Chapter 1, 'Before Virtù', discusses how Machiavellian *virtù*—'a morally unrestrained range of personal qualities essential to leaders, and most especially to a prince who seeks to achieve great things', parts company with earlier pagan and Christian concepts of virtue that conflated 'moral goodness with the effective use of power' (p. 15). This moral flexibility, or ethical adaptability, characterising the *virtuoso* prince imagined by Machiavelli, chimes with the earlier understanding of a proven *virtuoso* prince, Louis XI of France (d. 1483), whose advice manual, *Le Rosier des guerres*, dedicated to his adolescent son the dauphin Charles, should be appreciated both for what it is not and what it claims to be, embodying as it does a decent accounting of the audacious indecencies demanded by political necessity.

Chapter 2, 'The Road to *Vivere Libero*', examines how Machiavelli believed that the endgame of political order was to promote and enhance 'the freedom of the community (*vivere libero*)'—to live free—and that this was best achieved by the 'active participation of, and contention between, the nobility and the people' (p. 37). Here, Machiavelli pushes back against the late medieval mania for peace and the total rejection of divisiveness that had been argued for by fourteenth-century political thinkers. Nederman concludes that, while the idea of *vivere libero* was strikingly absent in Machiavelli's *ante res perditas* output, it extends throughout his *post res perditas* writings.

Chapter 3, 'Say Your Prayers', deals with Machiavelli's reputation for impiety by highlighting that before 1513, his distaste for religion was barely perceivable. Nederman argues that focusing upon Machiavelli's ideas concerning prayer and prayerfulness in both periods reveals that it is 'bogus Christianity' and a passive worldview that are the actual targets of Machiavelli's supposed impiety.

Chapter 4, 'The Medicine Man', offers a fascinating analysis of Machiavelli's respect for medical science and how elements of Galenic humoral theory (but not Galen's physiological system in its entirety) played an important part, adding value and weight to his *ante res perditas* thinking and its expressions.

Chapter 5, 'Facing the Twin Furies', tackles the development of the themes of *avarizia* (avarice) and *ambizione* (ambition) in Machiavelli's thought. While *ambizione* played an important part in his pre-1513 writing, *avarizia* was barely there. Nederman moves seamlessly from 'mild ambition' to 'wild ambition', underpinned by 'sins of ambition', before moving to the central thesis of this chapter, 'dual natures and twin furies'—these ideas lead us to the crux of Nederman's discussion, Machiavelli's 'new ambition', 'ambition and power', and 'noble ambition', and how ambition for Machiavelli was 'quintessentially political', pervading people, cities/nations, and classes' (p. 129).

Nederman rounds out his clearly articulated, engaging, and erudite study with a concluding chapter, 'Conclusion: Bruised but not Broken', arguing that, in his pre-1513 thought, Machiavelli himself 'provides us with his own context for the Machiavelli who would follow' (p. 135).

Zita Eva Rohr, *Macquarie University*

Poppe, Erich, Simon **Rodway**, and Jenny **Rowland**, eds, *Celts, Gaels, and Britons: Studies in Language and Literature from Antiquity to the Middle Ages in Honour of Patrick Sims-Williams*, (Medieval Texts and Cultures of Northern Europe, 35), Turnhout, Brepols, 2022; hardback; pp. xviii, 362; 2 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90,00; ISBN 9782503598642.

When this reviewer had the opportunity to sit next to Patrick Sims-Williams at an International Celtic Congress dinner more than a decade ago he met a personable, encouraging, and erudite conversationalist, a character entirely consistent with the attributes highlighted by editor Simon Rodway in his 'Introduction' to this Festschrift. A highly respected and knowledgeable scholar in command of a wide field, Sims-Williams is now Emeritus Professor of Celtic Studies at Aberystwyth University, Fellow of the British Academy, President of the International Congress of Celtic Studies, and Honorary Member of the Royal Irish Academy. Rodway also notes Sims-Williams being unafraid of the fiercest of debates in the discipline, and his careful negotiation of the 'cautious road between the Celtomaniacs and the Celtosceptics' (p. xvi). Indeed, Celtic studies are prone to wilful popular misappropriation, and the wide range of contributions in this volume emphasises the ongoing scholarly work in the discipline necessary to further the field and, along the way, help address this. In this context, Sims-Williams stands exemplary, and many of the contributions take his work as a starting point.

In eighteen chapters this volume incorporates a wide array of topics typical of the scope of the field, from many prominent established scholars in Celtic linguistics and literature. As might be expected, these contributions are thorough, detailed, and occasionally very technical. Many also deal with *cruces* of scholarly debate at the margins of current knowledge, and these tend to offer theoretical possibilities, rather than conclusive certainties. For example, Máire Herbert titles her work 'Some Thoughts on the Life of Saint Ailbe' (p. 71), Jenny Rowland's exploration of the romanisation of British bards is 'more of an essay intended

to provoke discussion' (p. 113), William Mahon's chapter is 'A Note' on the medieval Welsh poem *Echrys Ynys* (pp. 131–38), Paul Russell's examination of late medieval Welsh scribal practice is characterised as a 'preliminary survey' (p. 270), and David Willis's syntactic analysis of conditional clauses in Welsh is a 'preliminary attempt' (p. 289). Scholarly work usually commences with a thought, a note, or a survey, and these often surface as conference papers, but it is unusual to see them in a final published form. Perhaps this is a perk reserved for the established scholar?

As suggested by the title, the works here range widely across geographic, linguistic, and social groupings, and over a wide timespan. Javier de Hoz and Alexander Falileyev each analyse Proto-Celtic inscriptions in, respectively, early Roman Iberia and the Roman province of Pannonia. Also working in an early time frame, Peter Schriver and Stefan Schumacher both discuss specific linguistic developments of Proto-Celtic speech sounds in British Celtic: Schriver focusing on the consonant cluster **st*, Schumacher the diphthong **au*.

Only three chapters are concerned with the Goidelic branch of the Celtic languages (and even one of these draws links with British): Liam Breatnach produces an edition and translation of a previously unedited Old Irish text on kingship, Máire Herbert's contribution speculates on the relationship between British and Irish Christian practice suggested through parallels in the hagiographies of Saints Ailbe and David, and Máire Ní Mhaonaigh reassesses assumptions about possible Irish influences on Old Norse literature.

Aside from these three, the rest of the volume is concerned with Brittonic, mostly Welsh. In addition to those chapters already mentioned, Simon Rodway revisits the question as to whether the early (British) Celts would have self-identified as Celts, Bleddyn Owen Huws (in the volume's only article in Welsh) transcribes an early modern Welsh letter from Siôn Phylip (*c*. 1540–1620) and contextualises this in terms of contemporary learnings in humanist rhetoric. The only appearance of Cornish in this volume is courtesy of Oliver Padel, who identifies and discusses the corpus of Old Cornish texts. Thomas Charles Edwards provides a highly specific examination of the treatment of syllables in medieval Welsh Bardic grammars, and Richard Glyn Roberts (another article characterised as 'a contribution') discusses the importance of embracing 'subaltern' linguistics from below and paying due attention to Welsh language use that might fall outside the hegemonic 'centres of learning/power' (p. 321). In the penultimate chapter, Erich Poppe examines the evidence for markers of translation in the Middle Welsh text *Buchedd Beuno*, and the volume closes with Dafydd Johnston exploring signs of language contact in the semantics of Middle Welsh *hoyw*, when its meanings expanded under the influence of courtly culture.

Much of this volume is highly technical and specific and it is not a generalist publication pitched at an undergraduate readership that the broad title 'Celts, Gaels and Britons' might imply. Rather, the specificities, the technicalities and (at times) density of prose anticipate an experienced scholarly readership, one that

already possesses considerable expertise in the subject matter. But there are indeed many important observations and sound analyses in this volume that lead the field forward into future avenues of research.

Roderick McDonald, *Emu Forge, Sheffield, UK*

Rundell, Katherine, *Super-Infinite: The Transformations of John Donne*, New York, Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2022; hardcover; pp. viii, 343; R.R.P. US$30.00; ISBN 9780374607401.

In *Super-Infinite: The Transformations of John Donne*, Katherine Rundell has produced an exuberant account of John Donne's life, catechising on sometimes ugly facts of faith, love, sex, and—ultimately—death. She refines his private experiences and the *sui generis* poetry, 'where his words can be […] galvanic' (p. 1), by describing him in his strangeness. The resulting study is of a most singular individual. His life was 'super-autapomorphic', a scientific usage denoting extreme uniqueness (the 'super' is Rundell's; p. 297). Rich in anomalous qualities, Donne's poetry drew others' attention: 'even those who disliked [it] acknowledged that he was a writer who had erupted through the old into the new' (p. 142). Baroque excess, or irregular shaping, played a part, although Rundell does not deploy the term. 'The world was harsh and he needed a harsh language' is her formulation (p. 49). Certainly, life was harsh: 'to be born a Catholic [as Donne was] was to live with a constant […] terror' notes Rundell (p. 23).

A biography's greatest strength lies in its structure. Exhaustingly researched and cleverly capsulised, *Super-Infinite*'s chapters make superbly organised scene depictions. A childhood and youth vexed by persecution, with recusant deaths accruing. An Oxford formation—'incurably bookish' (p. 28). A residence at Lincoln's Inn, a foot up for 'rich, sharp-witted young men [not intending] to become lawyers' (p. 43). Adventure: the siege of Cadiz, where Robert Devereux, second Earl of Essex's, rashness is mentioned. If 'voyaging had got into his blood' (p. 83) as cited, Donne's return to London was into employment as secretary to Sir Thomas Egerton, Elizabeth I's Lord Keeper of the Great Seal. In this employ, Donne met Anne More, Egerton's fourteen-year-old niece and ward. This love match proved decisive both for Donne and his poetry (think of 'A Valediction, Forbidding Morning', 'The Good-Morrow' or 'The Sun Rising', to name but three). Yet, following elopement it set him back grievously, for his furious employer dismissed him.

Super-Infinite registers all stages in Donne's life; 'murky' gaps are skilfully threaded with plausibility (see p. 182). However, those chapters that track Donne's domestic life drag in the telling. After his great *faux pas*, Donne's unpredictable 'route to preferment' (p. 193) saw him generally in dispiriting unemployment. Conversely, it is revealed that his swelling family—ten children survived childbirth—were billeted both hospitably and obligingly by kind friends. From 1607 to 1611, Donne took lodging in the Strand to often escape Mitcham, the family dwelling place.

Domestic matters aside, the name-dropping glamour is coated in nonchalance. Oxford certainly, yet Cambridge perhaps, too, educated Donne—Ben Jonson carped; court revels hosted William Shakespeare (suggested if not sighted); James I personally bestowed the Deanship of St Pauls; The Savoy occasioned the wedding of poet and muse; Donne attended the Synod of Dort. He conversed with Thomas Kepler (their topics 'all in doubt', alas); Donne purchased a Titian, preached at The Hague; and became, eventually, a celebrity clergyman. Although the glamour has faded unceremoniously with the centuries, the indefeasibly great poetry breathes life yet. And, Rundell proves this *exempli gratia*.

Later poetic taste would reject Donne. Samuel Johnson, to give a typical response, thought Donne's work 'improper and ugly and broken' (p. 51). '[A]rt had rules', Rundell explains. '[P]oetry was […] monovocal' (p. 51) for Johnson and Pope. Donne's *oeuvre* could not be more alien to them. 'Why should we all sound the same?' (p. 52), Rundell proposes, setting up a central theme of originality. Each poet must invent his own language. It is necessary for us all to do so; owning one's language is not an optional extra. The human soul is so ruthlessly original (p. 52). Complimenting her stridency is Rundell's admission: 'this is […] an act of evangelism' (p. 11).

The audacity of interpretation has quite rightly won Rundell admirers and awards. On occasion, her expression is unabashed; 'social distancing' (p. 63) or 'arty rich women' (p. 138) decontextualise freely. Elsewhere, the Baroque, large-themed concentrations of our own day lurch into view: 'trans' (p. 5), 'gender binary' (p. 18), 'pandemic' (p. 61), and 'war' (pp. 231–33).

While Izaak Walton's biography (1640) presented Donne uncritically, Rundell's *Super-Infinite* reads postcritically. 'To read him,' Rundell avows, 'is to feel yourself change [and to] acknowledge the strangeness you are born with' (p. 140). Donne's poems quasi-mystically energise our language, here. If the New Critic's task is to harmonise discordant properties into wholes—to unify the text—Rundell frets that restriction. *Per contra*, here there is unity, but unity through Donne's adaptative plurality. There are 'dozens of Donnes' (p. 287) and *Super-Infinite* majors on the 'transformations' of the book's subtitle. A consequence is that her portrait depends upon terminological or categorical shifts which levy patience from the reader (viz., the abstract use of 'super' and 'infinity' (pp. 13–14), or women's 'besouledness' (p. 133).

Rundell closes *Super-Infinite* with a word on death, a topic suggested almost passim. In the famous 'No man is an island' devotion, humanity's 'interconnectedness' is 'a great project'—'our interwoven lives draw […] meaning only from each other' (p. 297). On the surface, such a humanist position is quite reasonable. Death as termination foreclosing the afterlife (see, for example, Robert N. Watson's *The Rest Is Silence*, University of California Press, 1994) fits into Donne scholarship. Nevertheless, Donne's avowal of his creed (regard his much-anthologised verdict on 'proud' death in 'Holy Sonnet 10'), his sermons collected between 1615 and 1631, and other variations on this theme, earmark the reading

as a 'flat ontology', in modern philosophy's term. Yet, Rundell's expatiation of the topic of Donne and death strikes one as right. Death's meaning is the wager we make.

Nathanael Lambert, *Christian Heritage College*

Tarsi, Matteo, *Loanwords and Native Words in Old and Middle Icelandic: A Study in the History and Dynamics of the Icelandic Medieval Lexicon from the Twelfth Century to 1550* (Studies in Viking and Medieval Scandinavia, 4), Turnhout, Brepols, 2022; hardback; pp. 332, 1 b/w, 5 colour illustrations, 36 b/w tables; R.R.P. €85.00; ISBN 9782503598154.

Matteo Tarsi delivers a thorough and well-wrought linguistic examination of word pairs in Old and Middle Icelandic: word pairs that are comprised of a native Icelandic term and a foreign-derived loanword, where both words have closely related semantics, and where they both appear in close company within the same manuscript. The explicit purpose of this study is to enhance our understanding of the dynamics of the interplay between loanwords and native words in premodern Icelandic, and the part these word pairs play in expanding linguistic creativity in a period before the modern hegemony of linguistic purism, which can be tied to the work of Bishop Guðbrandur Þórlaksson and his publication of the first Icelandic Bible in the late sixteenth century. Tarsi is interested in finding out why the linguistic evidence reveals such multiple terms for the same or similar objects. He analyses word pairs found across a representative selection of manuscripts dating from the twelfth to the sixteenth centuries and across ten different generic typologies: religious texts, law texts, treatises, historiography, hagiography, and five different categories of saga (*Íslendingasögur*, kings' sagas, translated and indigenous chivalric sagas, and legendary sagas). Each of these different text types is dealt with in a separate chapter, except for the last three of the five saga categories, analyses of which are incorporated into one chapter, due to their typological affinity. The analyses are thorough and detailed. Representative manuscripts are selected under each text type category, where possible over a temporal range from the twelfth through to the sixteenth centuries, although in some categories this range is limited. For example, available manuscripts for religious texts range from the early twelfth to the sixteenth, whereas manuscripts for the chivalric and legendary sagas range from the thirteenth to the fifteenth, while the three selected historiographical texts are restricted to the twelfth and thirteenth. The six sagas examined in the chapter devoted to *Íslendingasögur* date from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, and yet these are nevertheless categorised as early (first half of the thirteenth century), classical (second half of the thirteenth century), and late (the fourteenth century).

The scope of Tarsi's project is impressive, cataloguing lexical material from forty sample texts, some of which are by no means short, and has been undertaken primarily with published editions, with reference to manuscripts when necessary. A total of 267 synonymous word pairs classified across 41 different semantic fields

are examined. A description of all of the words and their occurrences is included in the volume, but sadly, the URL given in the text for the detailed appendices containing 'complete overviews' was not functional when tried. Each identified word pair is discussed, and the words are assessed as to both their origin and status in usage. Loanwords examined come from a wide variety of source languages, including Old and Middle English, Old Saxon/Middle Low German, Latin, Greek, Old French, Old Irish, Old Frisian, and Slavic. Tarsi explains that there are a variety of means by which a word might be borrowed, including 'necessity borrowings' and 'prestige borrowings'. For example, the loanword might arise due to trade with the Hanseatic League, with the appearance of an object for which there is no direct equivalent in the borrowing language; it might be borrowed due to the influence and administration of the Christian church; or it might be associated with the rise in chivalric and courtly culture and ideals, as represented through courtly and didactic literature. Also explained is the fact that there is a variety of reasons for the appearance of these words explicitly in pairs in the texts examined: most commonly these will be either in the form of 'explicative insertion' of the native word following the loan, to explain the foreign, newly adopted term, or as 'synonymic dittology', a stylistic form of redundancy or tautology where the two terms are joined either by the conjunction 'and' or 'or'. Interestingly, Tarsi found in three of his text categories ('Religious Texts', 'Law Texts and Diplomata', and 'Chivalric and Legendary Sagas') the loanword pairs typically belonged to semantic fields directly related to the contents of the text, whereas in the other five categories, the loanword pairs tended not to be so specifically related to the subject of the text, but comprised more common lexical items.

This is a detailed and technical publication, and it sheds fresh light on ways of reading this important corpus of medieval texts. Tarsi highlights the coexistence of loanwords and native words in historical Icelandic across all genres and in many semantic fields, and emphasises the importance of understanding this coexistence as dynamic and productive for language change in a broader context. This work is an important resource in itself and offers an excellent basis for further research into the dynamics of medieval and early modern Nordic contact linguistics.

Roderick McDonald, *Emu Forge, Sheffield, UK*

Whittington, Karl, *Trecento Pictoriality: Diagrammatic Painting in Late Medieval Italy* (Renovatio Artium, 13), Turnhout, Brepols, 2023; hardback; pp. xvi, 352; 115 colour illustrations; R.R.P. €150.00; ISBN 9781915487049.

This is a beautiful book. It is richly illustrated with a variety of familiar, and less well-known works, including Andrea di Boniauto's Spanish Chapel, Ambrogio Lorenzetti's *Good and Bad Government*, and work by Pietro di Puccio di Orvieto in Pisa's Camposanto depicting the *Creation of the Universe*, as well as a fine, contextualising work by Leo von Klenze from 1898, *The Camposanto in Pisa*, which gives a better sense of the fresco's former colour. This painting

also features on the book's dustjacket. This very generously illustrated work also includes pictures of illuminated manuscripts, panel paintings, and murals, many photographed by the author. It also includes a substantial, up-to-date bibliography.

The book is divided into three parts: 'Reassessing Surface, Space, and Body in Trecento Painting'; 'Painted Diagrams from Page to Wall'; and 'Diagrammatic Painting: Narrative and Allegory'. Each chapter within these three sections, as well as the 'Introduction' and 'Conclusion', has at least one case study, where works such as depictions of the cosmos or Bonaventura's *Lignum vitae* are analysed. Karl Whittington places a lot of importance on his historiographical contextualisation, noting particularly the importance of German and Italian scholars to his project. Sometimes, however, this can overwhelm his account of a work's significance.

The Spanish Chapel by Andrea di Boniauto in Santa Maria Novella in Florence bookends this study, appearing in both the 'Introduction' and the final chapter. Whittington uses the analysis of the frescoes that adorn this chapterhouse to illustrate his approach. He contrasts the *Calvary* scenes with their strong narrative accounts with the *Via Veritas* and *Triumph of Thomas Aquinas*. These two walls are quite different in tone, being, he would argue, more diagrammatic. The *Triumph* represents a complex array of figures surrounding an enthroned Thomas Aquinas, including biblical figures, cardinal virtues, and female personifications of the seven Liberal Arts and the Theological Sciences, together with historical characters. The *Via Veritas* shows a triumphant representation of the Dominican order laying out its crucial role in the path to salvation, through such activities as preaching, while also anchoring them in a local Florentine context through the presence of the distinctive cathedral. In these two frescoes, Whittington highlights the often-overlooked use of strategies found in Trecento work, where narrative and allegory might also meet the diagram. While this is less obvious in the Spanish Chapel than the example found in Pisa's Camposanto, these more layered works contrast dramatically with the depictions found in the Calvary scenes that emphasise telling familiar New Testament stories. Whittington reminds us that even Giotto, normally acclaimed for his affective storytelling, was also producing non-narrative work, citing as examples his now-lost frescos in Padua's Palazzo della Ragione and Florence's Palazzo della Signoria. As he points out throughout the book, what he is intent on doing is expanding the understanding of Italian Trecento art to incorporate a wider range of visual approaches.

As part of this interest in different explorations of pictorial modes, the second chapter looks at painted crosses. Whittington himself points out that this is a non-diagrammatic genre of painting, even though it was a key form during the Trecento. Important though such crucifixes were in the development of Italian art, I am not sure that this chapter fits into this study as currently constituted, being so different to anything else discussed here.

The third chapter, where medieval diagrams are discussed, also sits uneasily in its current position. It contains a good overview of the scholarly literature around the medieval diagrams found in manuscripts, citing Faith Wallis, Michael

Evans, Jeffrey Hamburger, Bianca Kühnel, and Barbara Obrist, amongst others. It is well illustrated with examples and begins by discussing the large mural of the Florentine *Misericordia Domini* from Bernardo Daddi's circle, which is then connected to these manuscripts. He provides a compelling and convincing case for this connection. I cannot help thinking that this chapter should have occurred much earlier in the book, strengthening as it does the argument that diagrammatic paintings were a significant form in the Trecento. It is less clear why he includes works like Ambrogio Lorenzetti's *Good and Bad Government* as diagrammatic. Most diagrams in manuscripts are generally dependent on text to provide meaning, while this is not necessarily the case with large-scale paintings. The Lorenzetti works do not conform to narrative paintings, but they are more allegorical than diagrammatic. Indeed, some discussion about what is meant by allegorical paintings might be useful here. Lorenzetti's paintings do, however, reflect the complexities found in Trecento works.

What Whittington does demonstrate is that Trecento paintings are more varied and complex than has been sometimes acknowledged. The work generously reproduces many unfamiliar works and discusses them in detail. It is controversial and thought-provoking, even when one perhaps disagrees with the author.

Judith Collard, *The University of Melbourne*